

Strasbourg, 22 August 2017 [files17e_2017.docx] **T-PVS/Files (2017) 17**

CONVENTION ON THE CONSERVATION OF EUROPEAN WILDLIFE AND NATURAL HABITATS

Standing Committee

37th meeting Strasbourg, 5-8 December 2017

Complaints on stand-by

Presumed large-scale exploitation and marketing of protected marine shelled molluscs in Greece

- REPORT BY THE COMPLAINANT -

Document prepared by the University of the Aegean, Department of Marine Sciences, Greece

SUBJECT: RESPONSE TO THE LETTER OF 11-04-2017 OF THE BERN CONVENTION SECRETARIAT IN RELATION TO THE COMPLAINT N° 2014/6 ON LARGE-SCALE EXPLOITATION AND MARKETING OF PROTECTED MARINE SHELLED MOLLUSCS IN GREECE

Dear Mrs Obretenova,

In response to your letter of 11-04-2017 and taking into account the response of the Greek Ministry of Rural Development and Food, Directorate for Fisheries Control, signed by Mrs Marina Petrou – Director General – I would like to provide some updated information on the large-scale exploitation and marketing of the protected species *Lithophaga lithophaga* (date mussels) in Greece, and to react to the claims of the Greek Ministries so far.

It is evident from the three responses of the Greek Ministries (Ministry of Environment & Energy, Ministry of Rural Development and Food) that the documented large-scale exploitation and marketing of date mussels (and other "protected" shelled molluscs) has not been adequately confronted by the Greek government:

- In the first governmental response to the Complaint (21 July 2015), the existing legislative provisions in Greece for the protection of the specific species were listed as a proof of the "pioneering" actions of Greece to stop the illegal exploitation of the species. This official response precisely highlighted the problem. Greek administration considers that by passing legislation, illegal exploitation is automatically eliminated. However, the problem is the lack of adequate enforcement and control mechanisms. In the same response, it was stated that the Ministry "firmly disagrees" with the conclusion of widespread exploitation and marketing of date mussels in Greece but they provided no data and evidence to support such a disagreement.
- In the second governmental response to the Complaint (15 March 2016), it was only stated that the trade of date mussels requires a CITES permit and that "based on the information available to our office and screening through the archives of the past decade, neither import or export permits for specimens of the species have ever been issued by any of the Greek CITES Management Authorities, nor has corresponding request been submitted" [!!!]. This response was totally incomprehensible and out of focus. Obviously, the illegal exploitation, trading and serving in restaurants will not be visible in any official archive and those involved in the illegal trade of date mussels will not ask for a CITES permit! Furthermore, most of the date mussels served in the Greek restaurants have been exploited locally.
- In the third governmental response to the Complaint (7 March 2017), the Ministry provided an account of all administrative penalties issued by local Port Authorities for the years 2014, 2015, 2016. This account is the strongest possible evidence of the insufficiency of control and enforcement regarding the illegal exploitation and marketing of date mussels in Greece. Within three years, penalties have been issued in only seven localities (Chalkida, Mytilene, Aidipsos, Preveza, Kavala, Piraeus, Mesologgi) despite evidence of large-scale illegal exploitation and marketing all over Greece. Furthermore, the Ministry's list included only two (!) cases of penalties in restaurants in three years despite the fact that: (i) in the initial complaint and the relevant publication (Katsanevakis et al. 2011), date mussels were found to be served in 50 restaurants (systematically in 25 of them) all over Greece; (ii) in our response letter of 25 February 2016 to the Council of Europe we provided a list of tenths of restaurants in 33 localities in Greece, advertising their dishes with date mussels or fan mussels (Pinna nobilis) through the internet (see updated list in the current report). The Ministry ignored our list and issued no penalties in any of the restaurants that advertise their illegal goods through the internet. In July 2016, we (S. Katsanevakis, M. Sini) visited Chalkida for field work in the framework of a research project. During a half hour walk along the coastal street of Chalkida we spotted six

restaurants that served date mussels. According to the official list provided by the Ministry, it took three years to the port authority of Chalkida to put fines in two restaurants!

Due to the lack of funding, it was not possible to repeat a large-scale survey to update our 2011 results. However, we managed to collect relevant updated information mainly through the web and by our own opportunistic records. Hence, we did the following:

- 1. We updated our previously submitted list (25 February 2016) by checking if the web pages of restaurants, trip advisors, restaurant reviews, blogs etc that advertise the marketing of date mussels and fan mussels remain valid and we also added some new records (Fig. 1; Table 1). We reached the same conclusion as before: surveillance and enforcement is so weak that many restaurants do not hesitate to promote online a variety of dishes with date mussels.
- 2. We have conducted a Facebook survey asking those that participated if they had recently encountered date mussels or fan mussels in a seafood restaurant or fish market. Despite the low participation in the survey (only 17 responses), 9 localities have been reported (Fig. 1) for date mussels (Corinth, Athens, Leros, Alexandroupolis, Chalkida, Kefalonia, Aigina, Artaki, Mytilene) and 7 localities for fan mussels (Chalkida, Kefalonia, Aigina, Artaki, Syros, Kaloni, Gera). In one case (Syros), fan mussels were openly sold in the central fish market (27 February 2017; documented by video available upon request).
- 3. We have mapped our own (limited) records during underwater surveys of destroyed reefs due to date mussel fisheries (Fig. 2). These records are opportunistic and highly underestimate the actual situation in Greece as they are not based on a systematic dedicated survey. No targeted study on the level of impact of date mussel fisheries in Greece has been conducted yet.

Nothing has improved since our initial large-scale survey in 2011 (Katsanevakis et al. 2011). Protected marine shelled molluscs are still widely exploited and marketed in Greece. The account of all administrative penalties of the last three years, provided by the Ministry, further emphasizes the non-implementation of the related legislation and the malfunction of competent structures/authorities for the fisheries control and enforcement. The total amount of fines placed on seafood restaurants within three years was 1,300 Euros. This is comparable to the daily revenues of a single medium-sized seafood restaurant! It is obvious that such low penalties will not contribute to adverse the bad mentality of non-compliance that is widespread in Greece.

Stelios Katsanevakis (Associate Professor, Department of Marine Sciences, University of the Aegean)

Irene Chaldaiou (NGO Archipelagos – environment and development, Strofiliou 26, GR 14562, Kifissia)

Aliki Panou (NGO Archipelagos - environment and development, Strofiliou 26, GR 14562, Kifissia)

Dimitris Poursanidis (Postdoctoral researcher, Foundation for Research and Technology – FORTH, Heraklion, Greece)

Maria Sini (Phd in Marine Ecology, Postdoctoral researcher, Department of Marine Sciences, University of the Aegean)

Yiannis Issaris (Postdoctoral researcher, Hellenic Centre for Marine Research, Anavyssos, Greece)

Maria Salomidi (Researcher, Institute of Oceanography, Hellenic Centre for Marine Research, Anavyssos, Greece)



Figure 1: Localities in Greece, where there are recent records of seafood restaurants serving date mussels (data retrieved from the internet and personal communications). Note that this map is not based on an exhaustive search, and thus it underestimates the geographical range of illegal marketing and serving of date mussels in restaurants.



Figure 2: Sites where extensive destruction of rocky reefs due to date mussel fisheries has been observed by the authors of this document and by members of the NGO 'Archipelagos – environment and development'. These records are opportunistic and highly underestimate the actual situation in Greece as they are not based on a systematic survey.

Comm	Source	source (2017)
ents		
date	https://www.e-table.gr/restaurant/kritamo	
mussels		
are		
	http://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50/17	https://www.ask4food.gr/estiatoria/15564-paramalo
serveu		
date	http://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50717	
mussels		
are		
served		
date	http://www.culinarybackstreets.com/athens/2013/strofi/	
are		
	1	
	nttp://www.iiio.gr/team/taste/50/17	http://www.psariston.gr/index.php?option=com_content&view=article
		<u>&id=24&Itemid=175⟨=el</u>
SUIVEU		
	ents late nussels ire served late nussels ire served late nussels ire served late nussels ire	entsentslate nussels rre ervedhttps://www.e-table.gr/restaurant/kritamohttps://www.e-table.gr/restaurant/kritamohttp://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50717late nussels rre ervedhttp://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50717late nussels rre ervedhttp://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50717late nussels rre ervedhttp://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50717late nussels rre ervedhttp://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50717http://www.lifo.gr/team/taste/50717

Table 1: Information retrieved from the web and from personal communications on the serving of date mussels and fan mussels inGreek restaurants (updated: July 2017)

restauran	date	http://foodforthoughtathens.blogspot.gr/2010/07/blog-	
t	mussels	post_19.html	
"Psaristo	are		
n", Neo	served		
Irakleio			
Nea	date	http://www.culinarybackstreets.com/athens/2015/cb-on-the-	
Artaki	mussels	<u>road-6/</u>	
	are		
	served		
Barbaros	date	http://www.greeka.com/cyclades/paros/island/paros-	http://paros.barbarossagr.com/en/restaurant-catering/menu/pasta-risoto
sa	mussels	restaurants/naoussa-restaurants/barbarossa.htm	
restauran	are		
t in Paros	served		
In	date	http://www.europeandestinations.com/cms/4052/Web_Content	
Rhodes	mussels	<pre>.aspx?CMS&wh=0&wf=0</pre>	
Town	are		
Alexis	served		
taverna			
Nea	date	https://www.instagram.com/p/9yGqFHRfiJ/	
Artaki	mussels		
	are		
	served		
Kyani	date	https://foursquare.com/v/%CE%BA%CF%85%CE%B1%CE%	
Akti,	mussels	BD%CE%AE-	
Argostoli	are	<u>%CE%B1%CE%BA%CF%84%CE%AE/4be55b252457a593f</u>	
,	served	<u>e5aab15</u>	
Kefaloni			
a			
restauran	date	https://foursquare.com/v/barkoules/4b094520f964a520191523	
t	mussels	<u>e3</u>	
"Varkoul	are		
es",	served		
Metamor			
fosi			
restauran		http://pieria-gr.blogspot.gr/2011/08/blog-post_4973.html	
t "Batis",			
Nea			

Lampsak			
OS			
Lampsak	date	Nikos Katsiaras, personal communication	
OS	mussels	Trikos Katsiaras, personar communication	
03	are		
	served		
	in many		
	restaura		
	nts		
Nea	date	Nikos Katsiaras, personal communication	
Artaki	mussels	Trikos Ratsiaras, personal communication	
7 ii tuki	are		
	served		
	in many		
	restaura		
	nts		
restauran	date	https://panathinaeos.wordpress.com/2009/06/28/dourambeis-	
t	mussels	fish-restaurant/	
Dourabei	are		
s	served		
Microlim			
ano			
(Piraeus)			
restauran	date	https://www.facebook.com/pages/Dourabeis-	fb page
t	and fan	Estiatorio/409519999143637	
Dourabei	mussels		
s	are		
Microlim	served		
ano			
(Piraeus)			
restauran	date	http://www.clickatlife.gr/geusi/story/30166	fb page
t	and fan		
Dourabei	mussels		
s (Neo	are		
Psychiko	served		
)			

restauran	date	http://www.arttable.gr/estiatoria_ellada_athhna/article/8057/at	fb page
t	and fan	hhna-pou-tha-fate-to-kalutero-psari	is high
Dourabei	mussels		
s (Neo	are		
Psychiko	served		
	bervea		
restauran	date	http://www.arttable.gr/estiatoria_ellada_athhna/article/8057/at	http://www.arttable.gr/estiatoria_ellada_athhna/article/8057/athhna-
t Argoura	mussels	hhna-pou-tha-fate-to-kalutero-psari	pou-tha-fate-to-kalutero-psari
-	are	FFFF	
Tzitzifies	served		
restauran	date	http://popaganda.gr/argoura/	
t Argoura	mussels		
-	are		
Tzitzifies	served -		
	the chef		
	mention		
	s in this		
	intervie		
	w that		
	date		
	mussels		
	are		
	fished		
	by		
	Kalymn		
	ian		
	fisherm		
	en		
restauran		http://www.greecessence.com/wp-	
t Argoura		content/uploads/2014/11/2012_02_17_AN-Simply-divine-	
-		treasures-of-the-sea.pdf	
Tzitzifies			
restauran	date	http://www.clickatlife.gr/geusi/story/26350	
t Argoura	mussels		
-	are		
Tzitzifies	served		

	1.4.		https://fammericane.com/a/0/ CE0/ 840/ CE0/ AD0/ CE0/ 920/ CE0/ DA0/ CE
restauran	date		https://foursquare.com/v/%CF%84%CE%AD%CF%83%CE%BA%CE
t	mussels		<u>%BF%CF%82/4c83fc3d51ada1cd4eea2a10</u>
"Teskos"	are		
- Nea	served		
Artaki			
restauran	date	http://www.culinarybackstreets.com/athens/2015/cb-on-the-	
t	mussels	<u>road-6/</u>	
"Teskos"	are		
- Nea	served		
Artaki			
Kavos,		https://www.tripadvisor.co.uk/LocationPhotoDirectLink-	
Isthmia,		g1188932-d3583339-i159093958-Kavos Fish Tavern-	
Loutraki		Isthmia_Loutraki_Corinthia_Region_Peloponnese.html	
20100,			
Greece			
Mykonos	date	K. Demiropoulos, personal communication	
WIYKOIIOS	mussels	K. Denniopoulos, personal communication	
	are		
	served	1.4	
restauran	date	http://www.regroup.gr/default/388/city/1/deals/381/to-	https://www.facebook.com/allokototsipouradiko/photos/a.46132550068
t	mussels	allokoto-tsipouradiko/	0554.1073741828.460312034115234/754595608020207/?type=3&thea
"Alokoto	are		ter
-	served		
Vrilissia			
restauran	date	http://www.athensmagazine.gr/restaurants/articles/1613	CLOSED permanently
t	mussels		
"Fishalid	are		
a" -	served		
Athens			
center			
restauran	date	http://www.athensmagazine.gr/restaurants/articles/1613	
t	mussels		
"Mpalko	are		
ni stis	served		
Kyklades			
".			
, Vyronas			
* yronas	1		1

(Athens)			
restauran t "Mikres Kyklades ", Ilioupoli (Athens)	date mussels are served	http://www.athensmagazine.gr/restaurants/articles/1613	
restauran t "Aigaio", Ano Vrilissia (Athens)	date mussels are served	http://www.athensmagazine.gr/restaurants/articles/1613	
restauran t "Monem vasia" Nea Kifisia (Athens)	date mussels are served	http://www.athensmagazine.gr/restaurants/articles/1613	
restauran t "Paramal o", Nea Kifisia (Athens)	date mussels are served	http://www.pirouni.gr/2014/03/%CF%80%CE%B1%CF%81% CE%AC%CE%BC%CE%B1%CE%BB%CE%BF/	
Syros	date mussels are served	Yiannis Issaris, personal communication	
restauran t "Asterias ", Nea Makri	date mussels are served	http://www.in2life.gr/delight/eat/article/281999/10-tavernes- kai-mezedopoleia-dipla-sth-thalassa.html	

restauran	date	http://www.estiatoria.gr/estiatorio/83/%CE%BA%CE%BF%C	
t	mussels		
"Koursar	are	<u>82</u>	
os",	served		
Drosia	Sciveu		
(Athens)			
restauran	date	http://www.clickatlife.gr/geusi/story/26350	
	mussels		
t "Mouria"	are		
, Nea	served		
Artaki	date		
restauran		http://www.athinorama.gr/restaurants/article/xrusoi_skoufoi_2 011-10245.html	
t IIT 1 - 1'''	mussels	<u>011-10245.ntml</u>	
"Edodi",	are		
Koukaki	served		
Kapetani	e-food,	https://www.e-food.gr/delivery/chalkida/kapetanios	
OS,	delivery		
Chalkida	of		
	seafood		
	- two		
	dishes		
	of date		
	mussels		
	(8.50		
	Euros)		
	are		
	include		
	d in the		
	catalog		
	ue		
restauran	date	http://toagistri.gr/?p=61	
t	mussels		
"Agkistri	are		
",	mention		
Glyfada	ed in		
	the		
	catalog		

	ue but it		
	could		
	be a		
	differen		
	t		
	bivalve		
	species		
restauran	date	https://www.tripadvisor.com.gr/ShowUserReviews-g189400-	
t "Trata",	mussels	d2580508-r247008163-Trata_Fish_Tavern-Athens_Attica.html	
Athens	are		
	served		
restauran	date	https://www.facebook.com/102833059754151/photos/pb.1028	
t	mussels	33059754151	
"Ladokol	are	2207520000.1454671111./902249433145839/?type=3&theater	
a",	served		
Irakleio,			
Crete			
restauran	date	https://www.facebook.com/102833059754151/photos/pb.1028	
t	mussels	<u>33059754151</u>	
"Ladokol	are	<u>2207520000.1454671150./752798861424231/?type=3&theater</u>	
a",	served		
Irakleio,			
Crete			
restauran	date	https://www.e-table.gr/restaurant/manolas-o	
t	mussels		
"Manolas	are		
", Trikeri	served		
restauran	date	http://maistraliloutraki.gr/downloads/menu_gr.pdf	
t	mussels		
"Maistral	are		
i",	served		
Loutraki			
restauran	date	http://www.saronicmagazine.com/?page_id=608	
t	mussels		
"Palaioka	are		
stro",	served		
Methana			

restauran	date	http://www.tovima.gr/vimagourmet/restaurants/article/?aid=46	
t "Takis",	mussels	1016	
Lechaio	are		
(Korinthi	served		
a)	serveu		
restauran	date	https://www.e-table.gr/restaurant/kakias-o	
t	mussels	https://www.e-table.gl/lestaulant/Kakias-0	
"Kakias",	and fan		
Salamina	mussels		
, Athens	are		
77 1	served		
Kavala,	seafood	http://newharpas.blogspot.gr/2013/08/blog-post_29.html	
Nea	restaura		
Peramos	nt		
	serving		
	fan		
X7 1	mussels		
Volos	seafood	http://www.tsipouradikavolou.gr/?project=%CF%84%CE%BF	
	restaura	<u>-%CF%80%CE%B1%CE%B8%CE%B9%CE%BF-</u>	
	nt	<u>%CE%BB%CE%B9%CE%BC%CE%B1%CE%BD%CE%B9</u>	
	serving		
	fan		
	mussels		
restauran	seafood	Panayotis Anastopoulos, personal communication	
t "The	restaura		
Sea	nt		
Star",	serving		
Rhodes	fan		
	mussels		
restauran	date		https://www.e-table.gr/restaurant/manolas-o
t	mussels		
"Manolas	are		
", Agia	served		
Kyriaki			
Pelion			

Recipes/	Commen	nts	Source	
images/other				
recipes	online		http://www.letscook.gr/recipes/psarika/ostrakoeidh/petrosolhnes/spaggeti-me-	
	recipes	for	petrosolines.htm	
	date muss	sels		
recipes	online		http://www.mytaste.gr/a/%CF%80%CE%B5%CF%84%CF%81%CE%BF%CF%83%CF	
	recipes	for	%89%CE%BB%CE%AE%CE%BD%CE%B5%CF%82.html	
	date muss	sels		
recipes	online		http://www.athinorama.gr/umami/food/articles/?id=2005070	
	recipes	for		
	date muss	sels		
recipes	online		http://www.tastefull.gr/freska-ostraka-neraki-loutropyrgos	
	recipes	for		
	date muss	sels		
recipes	online		http://syntageskardias.blogspot.gr/2011/07/blog-post_06.html	
	recipes	for		
	date muss	sels		
Social media			https://www.instagram.com/p/BBM-z3ERfgd/	
images				
used as bait			http://www.otithess.gr/katastimata1-	
			b.php?big=1&katigoria=467&fotomeg=9&katastima=3283	