

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 7 December / décembre 2023

REVISED/REVISE

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE
/
COMITE EUROPEEN SUR LA DEMOCRATIE ET LA GOUVERNANCE
(CDDG)**

**Results of the questionnaire circulated for the work of the GT-A
on green public administration (via RRS n°55)**

***Résultats du questionnaire diffusé pour les travaux du GT-A
sur l'administration publique verte (via le SRR n°55)***

Secretariat Memorandum
prepared by the
Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity
Democratic Governance Division

/
Note du Secrétariat
établie par la
Direction générale de la démocratie et de la dignité humaine
Division de la gouvernance démocratique

Context

The terms of reference for the CDDG provide for the following specific tasks to be implemented by the end of 2023: "Prepare a report on green public administration aimed at collecting and disseminating good practice and case studies and identifying guidance for administrations at local, regional and national level, taking into account the proceedings of the 2020-2021 edition of the World Forum for Democracy and its previous work on digitalisation of the public administration" (specific task 3).

The Working Group on Green Public Administration (GT-A) was entrusted with the task of preparing the above work for the CDDG. It decided at its first meeting on 2-3 March 2023 to solicit CDDG members with a questionnaire (rapid response No. 55) to assist it in its work and collect case studies for possible inclusion in the Report.

The following countries have submitted a response and agreed to these being published / *les pays suivants ont soumis des réponses et accepté que celles-ci soient publiées*:

Belgium (Flanders) / *Belgique (Flandre)*
 Czech Republic / *République tchèque*
 Denmark / *Danemark*
 Finland / *Finlande*
 Germany / *Allemagne*
 Germany (Saarland) / *Allemagne (Saarland)*
 Greece / *Grèce*
 Hungary / *Hongrie*
 Iceland / *Islande*
 Republic of Moldova / *République de Moldova*
 Poland
 Slovak Republic / *République slovaque*
 Slovenia / *Slovénie*
 Ukraine

For action

Take into consideration for the Draft report on green public administration

CONTENTS

| | |
|---------------------------|----|
| BELGIUM (FLANDERS) | 4 |
| CZECH REPUBLIC | 9 |
| DENMARK | 13 |
| FINLAND | 24 |
| GERMANY (SAARLAND) | 28 |
| GREECE | 30 |
| HUNGARY | 34 |
| ICELAND | 37 |
| REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA | 40 |
| POLAND | 44 |
| SLOVAK REPUBLIC | 46 |
| SLOVENIA | 48 |
| UKRAINE | 54 |
| APPENDIX | 66 |

BELGIUM (FLANDERS)

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Preliminary note: in Belgium, powers with regard to the environment are nearly all devolved to the Regions. The **powers** of the Federal government relate only to: product standards, protection against ionising radiation, the import, export and transit of alien plant and animal species and the protection of the marine environment. All the other powers with regard to the environment are regional powers.

1) The Region of Flanders, Belgium, has launched a Local Energy and Climate Pact, which focuses on four areas (greening, participatory energy, sustainable mobility, and rainwater) which set concrete objectives for its nearly 300 signatories – local governments – to tackle the global climate challenge from the local level.

a) Why a Local Energy and Climate Pact?

The Government of Flanders created in 2021 the Flemish Energy and Climate Pact. The initiative currently involves 293 municipalities and is based on 4 main pillars:

- nature-based solutions with a focus on urban greening;
- mitigation policies centered on collective residential renovations and cooperative energy projects;
- mobility and the development of sustainable solutions;
- water management, including re-use and up-use.

The Pact has brought together 98% of the municipalities of Flanders and aims at reducing the CO₂ emissions of its' territory from 35% - the initial milestone – to 55%.

Eighteen measures have already been established. Some of these include:

- the planting of one tree per inhabitant;
- 50 collective renovations per 1,000 housing units, 25 of which must reduce to zero the operational use of carbon;
- one charging point per 100 inhabitants;
- one m² of water softening per inhabitant. Each signatory is allowed to choose which objectives to tackle first.

b) Cooperation

The aim of the Climate Pact is to include all actors in the process towards climate neutrality. To ensure a good cooperation, the Agency of Home Affairs of the Government of Flanders, the coordinator of the Pact, works very closely with the association of Flemish cities and municipalities.

Apart from this collaboration between regional and local authorities, the Government of Flanders also includes citizens and organisations to the dialogue every two years,. The aim is to co-design the climate objectives and the specific actions with representation from all sectors of society.

One of the main tools to keep track of the achieved objectives is the "[Local Climate Pact Portal](#)". This portal allows all signatories to follow up on the actions taken by their peers, and the advances they make.

c) The role of the actors involved

The coordinator – the Agency of Home Affairs – allocates resources to the signatories. These make up for 50%, since the regional funding leverages the same amount to be invested by the local governments.

The Association of Flemish Cities and Municipalities, in turn, leads on the dissemination of best practices amongst the municipalities through a separate network within the umbrella organisation.

This Association has also created a databank of good practices.

The Government of Flanders will launch in 2023 a platform to help local authorities overcome the barriers they encounter during the implementation of the Climate and Energy Plan.

2) Government of Flanders focuses on sustainable and innovative public procurement

Sustainable public procurement is public procurement in which the contracting authority integrates environmental, social and economic criteria at all stages of its public contract. In the case of innovative public procurement, the contracting authority develops new innovation or includes smart requirements in the specifications that stimulate the provision of existing innovative solutions.

Within the Department of Economics, Science and Innovation of the Flemish Authority there is an Innovative Public Procurement Programme (Programma Innovatieve Overheidsopdrachten, PIO). Project proposals with sufficient relevance and potential innovation impact can count on guidance and co-financing from this programme.

What does PIO offer?

➔ Information and advice:

PIO offers information and advice on innovative procurement projects to all Flemish public actors. Through its newsletter, the PIO team informs about all relevant activities and initiatives in Flanders and Europe. At the same time, the PIO team is working on a guide with the ambition to become the Flemish knowledge platform for innovative public procurement.

➔ Guidance and co-financing:

In addition, PIO closely supervises a number of PIO projects throughout the entire purchase process and also provides co-financing for these projects. The projects are selected through open calls that PIO launches annually with a submission date in the spring and one in the autumn. The calls are open to all themes and domains.

In total, PIO has € 5 million annually. The specific needs of each trajectory determine the extent of the possible co-financing. In order to provide some guidance, PIO provides the following indicative amounts for an 'average' project:

1. Preliminary stage: **up to € 30,000** for the use of external expertise, execution of market consultations, organization of user surveys, etc. to prepare the tender;

2. Tender:

1. **up to € 1,000,000** for the co-financing of the purchase of research and development services, validation and testing services, prototyping;
2. **up to € 1,000,000** for the co-financing of living labs and pilot projects.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

The Act of the Flemish Parliament on the environmental permit and its implementing executive orders were intended to modernize the outdated and fragmented environmental regulation and to integrate it into a single regulation, including that of the environmental permit. The environmental permit replaced both the previous operating permit and the discharge permit, the permit to protect groundwater against pollution, the permit for the disposal of waste, the permit for the extraction of groundwater. The environmental permit act is a framework act, which lays down a number of general principles.

Every classified establishment or activity that is operated in Flanders must have an environmental permit or a notification deed. These establishments and activities are divided into 3 classes. The establishments or activities with the most nuisance are classified in class 1, the establishments or activities with the least nuisance in class 3. Class 1 and 2 are subject to a prior authorisation requirement. For the class 3 activities, a notification must be given. When several nuisance activities are operated together, the highest class applies.

The applications are submitted to an online Environment Desk, after which one public inquiry and one advisory round are organized. The competent authority comes to a single decision, taking into account both urban planning and environmental aspects.

The environmental permit for class 1 establishments or activities is provided by the Executive Board of the province. Appeal is possible to the Flemish Minister for the Environment. The Minister's decision can be challenged before the Council of State or its illegality can be invoked in a court of law.

The Board of Mayor and Aldermen makes the decision for environmental permits for class 2 establishments or activities. Appeals are possible to the Executive Board of the province. The decision of the Executive Board of the province can be challenged before the Council of State or its illegality can be invoked in a court of law.

Class 3 projects are reported to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen.

The environmental permit is linked to the building permit. A building permit for an establishment remains suspended as long as no environmental permit has been granted and vice versa. If the environmental permit is refused, the building permit also expires.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

A lack of long-term vision with regard to public procurement: environmental criteria can sometimes mean higher initial purchasing costs, but the overall costs can decrease since the higher purchasing prices of green goods and services are compensated for by lower operating, maintenance or disposal costs. The full life-cycle cost of green products and services can thus be cheaper than non-green products and services.

A lack of legal expertise in applying environmental criteria: difficult to know (all) the environmental and social impacts of purchasing particular products or services. It may also be difficult to define what an environmentally “preferable” product or service is. Related to this is the difficulty how to assess and verify information provided by tenderers.

Lack of practical tools and information.

The challenges with regard to a lack of legal expertise in applying environmental criteria and the lack of practical tools and information occur more with small(er) municipalities who don’t have the capacity to deal as efficient and as effective as possible with these challenges.

Nimby (Not in my backyard): self-interest versus the collective interest.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regard to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Creating broad support by amongst others looking for matching opportunities with other societal challenges.

Coaching, provide information and tools.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

Municipal environment council

A municipal environmental council is mandatory if the municipality draws up an environmental policy plan, which is not mandatory in itself.

The municipal council may adopt a municipal environmental policy plan during the second half of the year following the municipal elections.

The Board of Mayor and Aldermen ensures a say in the design of the environmental policy plan. It does this by involving what it considers to be the most interested public bodies, institutions and private law organisations. It unites these bodies in a municipal environmental council. The Environment Council issues an opinion on the draft environmental policy plan. If the Board of Mayor and Aldermen deviates from the advice, it will have to justify this in an accompanying note to this plan.

The Flemish Minister for the Environment can exempt a municipality with fewer than 5,000 inhabitants from having an environmental council.

As for other municipal advisory councils, councillors cannot be voting members and maximum two thirds may be members of the same gender. For the rest, the municipal council is responsible for the organization of the environmental council.

In practice, the municipal environmental council is composed of representatives of the various nature and environmental associations in the broadest sense of the word, representatives of the various educational networks, socio-cultural organisations, professional associations, a representative of the Youth and Senior Councils and interested citizens.

Update sent via mail:

“The Flemish Local Energy and Climate Pact encompasses nearly all 300 Flemish municipalities and revolves around four key pillars: nature-based solutions, with a focus on urban greening; Mitigation policies, with a focus on energy efficiency and participatory renewable energy sources; Mobility and development of shared, active, and sustainable solutions; and Water management, including re-use and up-use.

The Flemish Climate Pact envisions to hold a stakeholders’ climate dialogues on a regular basis to co-design climate objectives and actions, thus facilitating inclusivity at a grassroots level and keeping the debate on climate neutrality alive and relevant. This culminates in a two-yearly event, the Local Climate Pact Congress, where good practices are shared and potential solutions to barriers are discussed.

The Agency for Home Affairs of the Government of Flanders has also made it its business to collect appropriate data that allows the pact’s progress to be tracked. This information is subsequently translated into tailor-made climate reports which the municipalities can use to discuss approaches and milestones before the municipality council.”.

CZECH REPUBLIC

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

There are many examples that could be mentioned in this part at all levels of governance.

At national level, Ministry of Environment successfully raised topic of light pollution to the European level as priority of the Czech EU Presidency in 2022. Most recently, it called public to participate in a questionnaire to assess public opinion on strategic plan of climate protection policy. According to Ministry, the participation tool, very rare practice on national level, was opted to guarantee a wide consensus as public opinion polls show that most of the population perceives climate change as a major threat. Ministry of Environment is also in charge of Strategic environmental assessment (SEA) process described in Question 2.

At local and regional level, we present an example of Mayor of municipality Trojanovice, Jiří Novotný:

Jiří Novotný has been a mayor of Trojanovice since 2006, starting his fifth term in 2023. Trojanovice is a municipality of 2 thousand inhabitants surrounded by nature at the foothills of Beskydy mountains. Thanks to its unique position as a gateway to popular local touristic destinations it welcomes thousands of tourists every year. Jiří Novotný has set a vision of the village as a base for local community that should serve its inhabitants for generations. He gives it a modern twist trying to preserve genius loci and historical values while maintaining clean and modest character and proportions. Leading the way, he started a podcast called „mayor“ where he invites experts to share their knowledge and experience on emerging topics like energy communities, how to build a city for different generations, challenges of digitalisation or how to cope with developers.

He works long term closely with a trusted architect, giving up public architectural tenders and competitions claiming that the proven cooperation is the most efficient in this case. He suggests that mayor should be a visionnaire, not an administrative clerk, he should know the city by heart and it is his responsibility to do his best to prepare it for challenges of future generations.

Municipality of Trojanovice is also at a hearth of project “Cérka”¹ (project schedule 2022-2027). Its objective is to revitalize a vast area of former mine site with adjacent brownfields that is now inaccessible to public. Project uses progressive approach of smart village: modern technologies, sustainable construction within EU taxonomy regulation, sustainable mobility and community-based energy. Unique value of the project lies in complexity of the solution – sustainable ecological and environmental aspects are combined with full range of public facilities, all of this located in a relatively small distant village. “Cérka” should become a “Living lab” of modern technologies and approaches to inspire other cities and villages. Project is/will be financed by municipality, regional authority, the Plan for Regionally Fair Transformation and private funding. It is developed in close cooperation with central authorities, universities and private sector.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

As the topic is really wide, we select the most relevant strategic documents, legal structure, policy instruments and central bodies and institutions although there is much more to be presented.

¹ Cérka is translated as young woman in local dialect.

Council for sustainable development

The most significant body at the government level responsible for coordination and monitoring of green transition is **Council for sustainable development**, subordinate to Ministry of Environment, presided over by Minister of Environment and Minister of regional development. The Council is in charge of conception, implementation and evaluation of Agenda 2030, and its promotion (annual events Forum for sustainable development and Week of sustainable development). It is the main advisory body of the government regarding sustainable development, strategic planning and long-term objectives.

Right to a healthy environment

Right to a healthy environment is anchored in the Constitution (1993) and mentioned in the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. The convention later states that the right is to be claimed solely within the limit of relevant transposition law. The act contained in the Convention is not enforceable per se. Lawmaker is free to set the law defining the subject.

Regulatory impact assessment

Regulatory impact assessment, part of a legislation process since 2007 based on OECD recommendation, is identified in context of Agenda 2030 as an opportunity to integrate sustainable development approach at national level. Analysis called "Integration of sustainable development perspective into system of regulators impact assessment in the Czech Republic"² (2020) mentions that RIA process should be improved indirectly by introduction of new tools available to policy officers (proposers of new legislation) like practical guidelines including recommendations and best practices of sustainable development approach.

RIA, in general, is a formalized decision-making process obligatory for new legislation projects submitted by central authorities. It assesses impact of new legislation on f. e. specific social groups, gender equality, environment, long term perspective, generation gap, policy coherency, policy receivers' perspective, assessment of negative side impact and impact on cross border cooperation, although not all of these areas are mentioned explicitly in the form.

RIA Committee, advisory body of the Legislative Council of the Government is directly responsible for qualitative evaluation of RIAs submitted by central government. It is an independent watchdog and also one of eight members of RegWatchEurope³.

Strategic environmental assessment

Consideration of impact on environment of strategic or conception plans and goals is a formal process anchored in Czech law⁴. It defines cases where the formal process is required (plans or plans transformation f.e. in waste management, spatial planning, power industry, ground and surface water, environment incl. nature conservation, or tourism).

Agenda 2030

Agenda 2030 was adopted in 2017 and transposed into Strategic framework Czech Republic 2030. Implementation of Agenda 2030 for sustainable development was adopted in 2018. It transposes SDGs into strategic tools of central authorities and link them to Strategic framework CR 2030. It also identifies subordinate goals of Agenda 2030 for sustainable development that Czech Republic doesn't cover. 17 goals relevant to Czech Republic are

² https://www.cr2030.cz/zavazky/wp-content/uploads/sites/4/2021/03/Moz%CC%8Cnosti-zahrnuti%CC%81-perspektivy-udrz%CC%8Citelne%CC%81ho-rozvoje-do-syste%CC%81mu-hodnocen%C3%AD-dopadu%CC%8A-v-%C4%8CR_final.pdf

³ RegWatchEurope is a network of independent European advisory bodies that play a significant role in scrutiny of the impacts of new legislation. Official website: <https://www.regwatcheurope.eu/>

⁴ Law 100/2001 Sb., environmental impact assessment

selected. In 2021, Second Voluntary National Review of the 2030 Agenda in the Czech Republic was released (available in English).⁵ It summarizes achievements, but also gaps and next steps.

Establishment of an independent Digital and information agency (DIA)

Agenda of digitalization subordinate to Ministry of interior has been transformed into DIA in the begging of 2023, an independent authority. It is expected to accelerate digitalization process considerably and provide space for progressive solutions.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

Since 2007, regulatory impact assessment process formalized and considerably augmented quality of new legislation projects. Despite this fact, RIA doesn't cover most of the non-legislative governmental proposals and even the legislative ones are often granted a dispensation. There are also deficiencies in formal processing of RIA. In many cases proposer considers RIA only as a formal obligation and administrative burden (legislative and bureaucratic resistance). In other cases proposers are convinced that a political assignment is a sufficient authorization to avoid RIA entirely (this leads to omission of principle of participation and deliberation, decreasing probability of revealing latent bias of the proposal). In many cases, vague definitions and descriptions of the proposal and lack of data lead to poor quality of presented RIAs. Obligation of submitting material for evaluation to the RIA Committee is seen as critique rather than a tool to maximize efficiency of the new legislation projects. Last but not least, political unconcern decreases significance of the tool.

Evaluation process as a subsequent activity that compares estimated impact with achievement of the implemented measure is rather scarce in Czech public administration. Ministry of Regional Development holds an annual evaluation conference since 2015 to support and disseminate the practice. It is also considered to be a cornerstone of implementation of evidence-based (evidence-informed) policy.

Evidence informed policy is one of the goals set by strategic concept "Client-oriented public administration 2030" that focuses on regional and local governance level. As it progresses slowly, there are many obstacles to achieve the goal. There is a lack of quality data, infrastructure, experts who would efficiently process them and those who would interpret them clearly, one of the major challenges being a competition in the job market for highly skilled professionals in this sector.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

According to Second voluntary national review of the 2030 agenda in the Czech Republic (available in English)⁶ (2021): "The European Framework is crucial for the Czech Republic as a medium sized country in the heart of Europe from the aspect of sustainability. It is the EU that is the global leader in sustainable development. This means that the Czech Republic, as a member state, has the opportunity to prepare an ambitious *National Recovery Plan* focusing on digitalisation, environmentally friendly solutions, healthcare, modern education and the improved function of the public administration system in the 21st century. Thanks to the *Modernisation Fund* it is preparing the transformation of the power industry, of which more than half is currently based on coal, and the *Plan for Regionally Fair Transformation* will help it breathe life into the coal regions, which have experienced an attenuation of heavy industry. The *European Pillar of Social Rights* and its

⁵ https://www.cr2030.cz/strategie/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2021/07/VNR_ENG.pdf

⁶ https://www.cr2030.cz/strategie/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2021/07/VNR_ENG.pdf

Action Plan are an opportunity for the overall transformation to take place so that it guarantees everyone a fair and dignified existence.”

It further summarizes that despite the fact that the Czech Republic has a solid legal base, some of the sustainable goals are fulfilled only formally. The most difficult part of the transition is a change of mind set of individuals and implementation of approach to everyday life (whole of society approach).

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

As mentioned above, there could many examples found in this section. We believe that some of the cases described in the rapid questionnaire already answer the question.

DENMARK



Klima-, Energi- og
Forsyningsministeriet

CDDG RAPID RESPONSE SERVICE No. 55 ON EXPERIENCE WITH GREEN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

Center
Center for tværgående
politik og sektorumstilling

Kontor
Kontor for tværgående politik

Dato
8. juni 2023

J nr. xx

/ NAEGN

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Examples of decision-making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional, and national levels, are evident in Denmark's public administration. Denmark has developed tools and mechanisms to supervise and ensure the integration of environmental and climate change goals, including those aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Paris Agreement.

At the local level, the *Municipal Climate Barometer*, established by Local Government Denmark, plays a crucial role. This initiative encompasses various aspects, such as organizing climate work within municipalities, prioritizing efforts, implementing measures for climate adaptation and prevention, and conducting independent studies on green procurement. The first barometer was published in 2022 and is continuously updated.

At the regional level, emphasis has been placed on transforming Danish hospitals into "green hospitals". This entails revising energy efficiency in public buildings, developing an updated strategy for a circular economy, promoting green public procurement practices, and encouraging sustainable mobility solutions.

At the national level, Denmark has set one of the most ambitious climate goals globally, aiming for a 70 percent reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by 2030 compared to the level of emissions in 1990. This goal has influenced a significant portion of public administration, as the Danish Minister of Climate, Energy, and Utilities is legally obliged to outline annual strategies for achieving the 2030 target. Consequently, the Danish government has integrated the green transition across various aspects of national legislation. Since the adoption of the Climate Act in 2020, policies have been implemented to reduce Danish greenhouse gas emissions, resulting in a remaining gap of 5.4 tons of greenhouse gas emissions by 2030.



Question 2: *What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?*

As previously noted, the Danish Climate Act obligates the sitting minister to annually formulate strategies aimed at attaining the target set for 2030. Apart from the 2030 reduction target, the Act also ensures that Denmark is on track to achieve climate neutrality by 2050. This includes an indicative target for 2025 of a 50-54 pct. reductions of emissions compared to 1990-levels.

The Climate Act also stipulates the manner in which public administration should consider climate goals to ensure their achievement. This ensures that decision-making incorporates considerations of sustainability, long-term focus, and climate/environmental issues. Key elements include:

Milestone targets:

- The Climate Act contains a mechanism for setting milestone targets. Every five years the government must set a legally binding target with a ten-year perspective.

Annual Climate Action Plans

- The Danish Government will develop annual Climate Action Plans that will outline concrete policies to reduce emissions for all sectors: energy, housing, industry, transportation, energy efficiency, agriculture, and land use change and forestry.

The Danish Council on Climate Change (Klimarådet)

- The Danish Council on Climate Change will present their professional assessment of whether the initiatives in the Climate Action Plan are sufficient to reduce emissions.
- The Danish Council on Climate Change provides recommendations on climate initiatives.
- The Council's budget will be more than doubled with the annual budget and more experts are added to the Council. Furthermore, the Council's political independence is strengthened as it can now elect its own chairperson and members.

Global reporting and strategy

- The Climate Act commits the government to separately report on Denmark's impact on international emissions, including those pertaining to international shipping and aviation. Furthermore, reductions from electricity produced from renewable sources and the effect of Denmark's bilateral energy cooperation with 15 countries can be taken into account. Finally, it will shed light on the impacts of consumption.

The Danish Climate Act is available in English at this link: https://en.kefm.dk/Media/1/B/Climate%20Act_Denmark%20-%20WEBTILG%C3%86NGELIG-A.pdf

Question 3: *What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?*

Firstly, the initial costs of implementing green technologies and practices can be high. Denmark has sought to overcome this by leveraging public-private partnerships and making sure to establish a Green Fund (Grøn Fond) which enables the government to provide funding for unforeseen costs associated with transition initiatives.

Further, integrating green practices requires coordination across different sectors and levels of government, which can be complex. Denmark has made use of frameworks and strategies to guide this process, such as the Danish Climate Act, which obligates the current sitting minister to outline annual strategies for achieving the country's climate goals. In addition, the Green Committee secures coordination between different ministries on policies regarding the green transition, and the Green Business Forum constitute a partnership with the Danish businesses (see description in the answer to Question 5).

Question 4: *What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?*

Denmark remains a global frontrunner with a strong track record with multiple renewable energy sources, including on offshore wind, district heating and energy efficiency. Additionally, Denmark has a long history of sharing our knowhow and experiences with the rest of the world. The key takeaway from Danish transition processes is that even a small nation can significantly influence global sustainable transition dynamics through investment, development, and export of new technologies.

By and large, the green policies and sustainable transition processes has resulted in a radical restructuring of the electricity and heating sector. Both sectors were primarily based on fossil fuels but are now dominantly driven by renewable energy sources. Since the 1990's Denmark has gradually phased out fossil fuels from the energy mix, while scaling up renewables, particularly wind energy on land and at sea. Denmark has also taken ambitious steps towards a green heating sector through two major developments. First, an expansion of the district heating network and secondly – in those areas where district heating is not feasible – conversion from oil and gas boilers to fix individual heat pumps. Likewise, Denmark has



supported the transition from coal and gas fired district heating plants to green energy sources, such as biomass, biogas and heat pumps.

Question 5: *If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?*

The Danish government has instituted various forums to ensure citizen participation in the development of the Danish climate policies. These forums encompass:

- The Citizens' Parliament (Borgertinget), where citizens are formally involved.
- The Climate Partnerships (Klimapartnerskaberne) and The Green Business Forum (Grønt Erhvervsforum), where the business sector is formally involved.

The Climate Partnerships have provided the Government with more than 400 recommendations for the green transition. The Green Business Forum must continually monitor the work of 14 climate partnerships within the various sectors of the business world. The aim is to strengthen the dialogue between the government, business community, and labor movement about opportunities and barriers in the green transition of the business sector.

Internationally Denmark currently has bilateral energy partnerships with 24 countries representing more than 70 pct. of global greenhouse gas emissions where Danish experts support partner countries' achievement of the Paris Agreement objectives. Based on decades of work on the green transition of the Danish energy sector, Denmark supports an acceleration of the global transition towards low carbon energy in the 24 partner countries.

Furthermore, together with the G7 countries and Norway, Denmark is part of the "Just Energy Transition Partnerships" with Viet Nam and Indonesia, which establish long-term partnerships to help these countries pursue an accelerated and ambitious just energy transition, whilst engaging in discussions on further potential partnerships.



Case: Cross-border cooperation with the Netherlands

16. juni 2023
/
J.nr. 2023 - 2622

SAG (SI): Bestilling fra Indenrigs- og Sundhedsministeriet vedr. CDDG RRS no. 55 - request for input on green public administration

Question 1: *Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.*

N/A

Question 2: *What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?*

N/A

Question 3: *What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?*

N/A

Question 4: *What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?*

N/A

Question 5: *If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?*

Denmark is currently involved in cross border cooperation with the Netherlands on greening of public administration. The cooperation is funded by the EU Commission under the TSI Flagship PACE – Public Administration Cooperation Exchange.

The purpose of the cooperation is learning. As such, it consists of a number of exchanges between civil servants in the Netherlands and Denmark, focusing on various topics concerning green public administration – such as green procurement, green budgeting and state carbon footprint. The goal is to share best practices and foster a network between civil servants working with greening public administration.



Case: The implementation of the UN SDGs across agencies and state institutions

15. juni 2023
/
J.nr. 2023 - 2622

SAG (SI): Bestilling fra Indenrigs- og Sundhedsministeriet vedr. CDDG RRS no. 55 - request for input on green public administration

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

N/A

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

As part of the implementation of UNs SDG, the Danish Government decided in 2022 that all agencies and state institutions, from January 1st 2023 must set at least one sustainable development goal for their tasks. The rules include:

- The ministries/institutions can decide themselves which target(s) they want to work with
 - The ministries/institutions can choose themselves how they want to implement sustainable goals in their work
 - The goals must support the realization of the UN's Global Goals
 - Fulfillment of the requirement must be documented in a publicly available format that is up to the individual institution. This can be, for example, in a strategy, target and results plan, framework agreement or the like
- <https://oes.dk/oekonomi-og-it-styring/klar-strategisk-retning/baeredygtige-maal/>

This policy instrument covers SDG and sustainability in general and not only green initiatives.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

In relation to the implementation of requirements for sustainable goals in the government agencies and institutions, there is a general challenge with lack of experience and skills in relation to working with sustainability, e.g. in relation to defining what sustainability is practically, set targets, and reporting on targets. However, there is a desire to work with sustainability in the institutions, and a general positive approach to the area that compensates for the challenges.

Question 4: *What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?*

The experiences with the implementation of sustainable objectives in the state are few, as the requirement has only been in force for approx. 6 months. We are following the implementation and will gather experience during 2023, also particularly with a focus on objectives regarding climate initiatives.

See also the answers for question 3 above.

Question 5: *If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?*

N/A



Case: The Green Public Procurement Strategy

12. juni 2023
SI/AMALYK
J.nr. 2023 - 2622

SAG (SI): Bestilling fra Indenrigs- og Sundhedsministeriet vedr.
CDDG RRS no. 55 - request for input on green public
administration

Question 1: *Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.*

The previous Danish government (governing from June 2019 – December 2022) launched the strategy for green public procurement (the GPP strategy) in October 2020. The GPP strategy comprised 30 different initiatives aimed at ensuring that the public procurement at state-level would contribute to the national target of reducing Denmark's greenhouse gas emissions by 70 percent in 2030. In addition to the governmental state-level strategy, several Danish municipalities and regions have published GPP strategies of their own that they are pursuing. The following answers will focus on the governmental state-level strategy.

The work related to 10 of the 30 initiatives has been completed. These include:

1. The joint-state food policy
2. All governmental flights are subject to climate compensation
3. LED lighting is the standard
4. Recommendations for green data centers
5. Energy savings in governmental buildings
6. Competence development for procurement officers
7. Digital solution for finding the right tools
8. Guidelines in the green possibilities of the Public Procurement Act
9. Guidelines on the requirements for life extension
10. Charter for Good and Green Procurement

Furthermore, the work related to two other initiatives continues under the current government. These initiatives include

1. Emission free car park
2. Monitoring of green public procurement

Question 2: *What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?*

The above-mentioned initiatives can be categorized as follows in Table 1.

Table 1
Categorization of initiatives

| National framework | Legal structure | Policy instrument |
|--|--|--|
| <p>Charter for Good and Green Procurement</p> <p>Statewide standards that each ministry must implement. Each ministry is different, thus the standards contain a necessary degree of flexibility and leaves room for the ministries to adapt the implementation to their own specific organizational structure, their primary procurement categories, available resources, etc. The charter can be found here (in Danish).</p> | <p>The joint-state food policy</p> <p>The policy has been integrated in the official budgetary guidelines. The guidelines can be found here, cf. section 2.14.15 (the guidelines are in Danish).</p> | <p>All governmental flights are subject to climate compensation</p> <p>The climate compensation is included in the National Budget each year. The climate compensation accounts for flights from 2019 through 2022. The flights from 2023 will be compensated in the 2024 National Budget.</p> |
| | <p>LED lighting is the standard</p> <p>The standard has been integrated in the revised circular letter on energy efficiency in the state, which can be found here (in Danish).</p> | <p>Recommendations for green data centers</p> <p>In 2022, the Agency for Digital Government published their recommendations for public procurement of green datacenters. The report can be found here (in Danish). The recommendations follow the EU GPP criteria for data centres, server rooms and cloud services. The recommendations are currently being tested in several pilot projects.</p> |
| | <p>Energy savings in governmental buildings</p> <p>The standards have been integrated in the revised circular letter on energy efficiency in the state, which can be found here (in Danish).</p> | <p>Competence development for procurement officers</p> <p>All relevant state employees must complete the courses on public procurement; cf. the Charter for Good and Green Procurement.</p> |
| | | <p>Zero-emission car park.</p> <p>To reduce the climate footprint of the transport sector the vehicle park in the public sector must be emission free by 2030.</p> |
| | | <p>Digital solution for finding the right tools</p> <p>To create an easily accessible overview of relevant procurement requirements, tools, helpful networks, etc., all relevant information has been made available on this website (the website is in Danish).</p> |
| | | <p>Guidelines in the green possibilities of the Public Procurement Act</p> <p>In 2023, the Danish Competition and Consumer Authority published its guidelines vis-à-vis the possibilities of the Public Procurement Act concerning the integration of green considerations related to the procurement of both goods and services. The guidelines can be found here.</p> |
| | | <p>Guidelines on the requirements for life extension</p> |

In 2023, the Danish Environmental Protection Agency published its guidelines vis-à-vis how public procurement officers can set requirements for extended warranties and repair options. The guidelines can be found [here](#) (in Danish).

Question 3: *What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?*

There are a number of challenges to take into account when implementing GPA initiatives. These can be summarized as challenges related to *financing, legal barriers, insufficient data, and support among the employees affected by the changes.*

Financing comprises the challenges related to price differences between 'conventional procurement' and 'green procurement', as well as the price of necessary skill development and the necessary allocation of employee resources when preparing and managing the new tasks, e.g. running the digital information solution. Unforeseen expenses might necessitate revised/slimmed down project descriptions.

Legal barriers refer to the need to remove legal barriers in existing legislation. This might entail revising circular letters and budgetary guidelines. Such processes are long and require the balancing of many and potentially conflicting political interests. However, in some cases larger pieces of legislation, such as the Public Procurement Act, which might complicate simple solutions for the implementation of initiatives, e.g. requiring eco-labels, due to competition considerations. This might require developing extensive guidelines for how to set such requirements whilst still ensuring the principle of equal treatment and restricting the requirements to the contractual item.

Insufficient data covers a variation of challenges related to the data quality being too low in some cases when assessing the carbon footprint, e.g. that emission factor data dates back to 2011, and the lack of information reflected in invoices, such as the weight of products, etc. To address these challenges, Denmark has initiated projects related to developing updated and/or product-specific emission factors, employing machine learning to facilitate easier data dissemination, and ensuring better, relevant data via the procurement process, including efficient, digital exchanges of data between the suppliers and the public contracting entities.

Employee support entails challenges related to both acceptance and understanding of the change; several of the GPP initiatives require especially the public procurement officers to accept and understand new and/or altered tasks. To mitigate such challenges consistent communication aimed at, as well as involvement of, the relevant employees is necessary.

Question 4: *What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?*

See the answers for question 3 above; the mitigation of the above-mentioned challenges is related to the lessons learned.

Question 5: *If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GP.4?*

Participation in the project Circular and Climate Friendly Public Procurement

The Agency of Public Finance and Management participates in a Nordic project funded by the Nordic Council of Ministers. The purpose of the project is to improve the quality, consistency and availability of product related carbon footprint information with an emphasis on getting harmonized carbon footprint data more efficiently into procurement processes.

Visit in Brazil, May 2023; two civil servants from The Agency of Public Finance and Management of Denmark visited the Ministry of Innovation and Management of Brazil on public procurement for a week. The purpose of the trip was to share knowledge and best practices on public procurement with a special focus on how to use public procurement as a strategic tool for sustainable development.

Participation in The Greening Government Initiative (GGI), which is an international community of practice that was launched in 2021. GGI is a new initiative that enables countries to exchange information, promote innovation, and share best practices in order to green government operations and help meet Paris Agreement commitments.

Participation in the DN Sustainable Digital Government Thematic Group; Denmark has been a member of the group since it was formed in 2021. The purpose of the group is to share best practices related to the green procurement of information technology (IT), including data centers, computers, electronic waste, IT equipment packaging, and toxic materials. The group conducts bimonthly virtual meetings to discuss best practices and lessons learned in the process, etc.

FINLAND

Macroeconomic impact of climate change on public finances

https://julkaisut.valtioneuvosto.fi/bitstream/handle/10024/164786/VNTEAS_2023_17.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

This project provided an overall picture of the effects of climate change and mitigation on the sustainability and risks of public finances. With the help of literature and macroeconomic general equilibrium models, the project examined global effects as well as direct and spillover effects on Finland. Challenges related to modeling and the best methods of modeling were also evaluated.

The literature shows that there are still rather few studies on the effects of climate change, preparedness, and adaptation on the public economy, and that the information about the subject is uncertain. Research requires a perspicuous view of the effects of climate change as well as mitigation and adaptation policies on the national economy and public finances. The chain of influence is long and uncertain. The best starting point for modeling is the combining of details from different sources at the level of the national economy.

Based on the analysis, the physical consequences of climate change are likely to affect the national economy and public finances of Finland less than in most other countries, especially if the adaptation policy is successful. Country-specific differences emphasize the importance of being prepared for international spillover effects, and on the other hand the fact that Finland's competitiveness may improve. The spillover effects reduce exports, but increase investments, and their combined effect on production remains small.

Industry-specific and regional differences are also large in Finland. The accelerating growth of negative effects as temperatures rise will increase the already high uncertainty associated with impact calculations.

For the next decade, the green transition will be more important for the Finnish economy than climate change. It is driven not only by Finnish and EU policy measures, but also by global technology and behavioral changes. An active and successful policy promoting the green transition is central to determining the kind of economic effects the public finances will experience during the transition phase.

Regional risks and impacts

A policy related to curbing and adapting to climate change together with the consequences of local and global direct effects caused by climate change will affect the municipalities' economy directly and indirectly in the coming decades. Preventing and minimizing negative economic impacts depends about how well the steering and politics of the transition phase are also successful at the regional level.

Among the risks of climate change identified by municipalities, the biggest are related to water management and the unpredictability of energy security. In addition, causing climate policy among the risks to the municipal economy, at least the weakening of the competitiveness of industry, a general increase in costs and a possible decrease in tax revenues as a result of the decisions made have been identified. At the same time, climate policy is also recognized in some municipalities as an opportunity for improving competitiveness and renewing the economic structure or for diversification.

Digitalization and urbanization – improvements and investments

Climate change interacts with social trends other than demographic changes. The time course of the optimal mitigation and adaptation policy depends, among other factors, on the development of environmental technology, which is linked partly to other technical developments. For example, digitalization has promoted measurement and the development of control systems that facilitate the improvement of energy efficiency.

Urbanization has also been considered so important that it has been taken as one variable to socio-economic paths, which are used to outline future development options for society. Urbanization is expected to increase heat islands and weaken the absorption of flood waters. At the global level, the share of cities of carbon dioxide emissions is significant. The reduction of emissions in cities can be influenced especially through the electrification of transport, the development of public transport, energy efficiency improvement work (buildings) and the increase of emission-free forms of energy production while reducing energy production based on fossil fuels.

Conclusions from the local level

Based on analysis at the municipal level, there is a significant regional risk in general unpreparedness and lack of knowledge. Many municipalities lack a large-scale understanding and overall picture of and the economic effects of climate change about preparation. However, some municipalities have already carried out risk assessments, and the risks have started to be taken into account, for example, in various existing strategies, planning and construction activities, as well as in the development of municipal technology, and energy security has also been sought and aims to improve within the framework of regional characteristics. Municipalities also give a weak signal that climate change and climate policy can also be expected to potentially bring positive economic effects on income and even wealth, through increase, if the policy actions of the green transition are successful.

The issue of energy production is highlighted in both statistical and survey analysis: both the current economic structure (industry) and the identified contingency measures emphasize the effects of energy production. However, they vary significantly between different municipalities. Forecasting the economic effects of climate change and climate policy also on the economic structure offers an opportunity for municipalities to intensify the green transition and minimize the negative effects.

In addition to the direct effects of climate change, climate policy also affects the economy of municipalities indirectly through the economic structure and wealth of municipalities. Diversifying the business structure and developing it greener are identified as ways to improve competitiveness and thereby strengthen the possible positive economic effects of climate policy. An active and successful policy promoting the green transition plays a central role in what kind and magnitude of economic effects on the municipal economy will occur during the transition phase.

Overall, the uncertainty of the estimates is high. For example, about sudden extreme events the resulting short-term ripple effects can be clearly greater, in particular for individual regions and their production. In addition, e.g. migration caused by climate change can cause considerable permanent economic effects, which are not taken into account in the calculations.

New ideas from circular economy audits for Riihimäki's resource wisdom work

In addition to expanding the circular economy vision, the aim of the audit was to gather information on the circular economy work carried out by different administrations and units and to come up with new measures together. The circular economy audits were carried out in workshops to which representatives of the management team and all areas of the municipality were invited. The workshops promoted wide-ranging and cross-administrative interaction between the different industries of the municipality. Different sectors were able to comment on each other's sections and bring a varying perspective on the implementation of the measures. Ideas were also drawn from other municipalities.

More information: [https://www.materiaalitkiertoon.fi/en-US/Current/New_ideas_from_circular_economy_audits_f\(57644\)](https://www.materiaalitkiertoon.fi/en-US/Current/New_ideas_from_circular_economy_audits_f(57644))

GERMANY

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

With the adoption of the German Resource Efficiency Program (ProgRess) in February 2012, Germany was one of the first countries to commit to goals, guiding principles and approaches to protecting and reducing the use of natural resources.

The Federal government is obliged to report to the German Bundestag every four years on the development of resource efficiency in Germany and to update the resource efficiency program. This was first done on March 2, 2016 with ProgRess II. ProgRess III was published on June 17, 2019.

The federal states (Bundesländer, the regional level in Germany), associations, SMEs, NGOs, and citizens were also involved in the drafting process.

ProgRessI and II are available in English: <https://www.bmuv.de/en/topics/water-resources-waste/resource-efficiency/german-resource-efficiency-programme-progress-an-overview>

The German Resource Efficiency Program should be seen as part of a greater framework, the German Sustainable Development strategy:
<https://www.bundesregierung.de/resource/blob/998220/1941044/2e8480a6b93910b347e647814ff59a7f/2021-07-09-kurzpapier-n-englisch-data.pdf?download=1>).

It provides a frame for all activities of the German government, it is its guiding principle. The national Sustainable Development Strategy of Germany was first adopted in 2002 by the Federal government and has, since then, been regularly evaluated and revised based on indicators since 2010. Resource consumption is one of the indicators surveyed in it. The 2030 Agenda with its 17 SDGs, as well as the foremost principles of People, Planet, Prosperity, Peace and Partnership – the 5 Ps – form the common thread for the German Government's work. Since 2016, the German sustainability strategy has been structured along the 17 United Nations Sustainable Development Goals, one of which is climate change. On March 10, 2021, the German cabinet again approved the revised Sustainable Development Strategy.

In order to achieve the goals of the German Sustainability Strategy and the 2030 Agenda, the path of ambitious transformation must be followed. In the 2021 update to the strategy, in reference to the Global Sustainable Development Report (GSDR), it emphasizes the need to set high ambitions when tackling key areas of transformation to allow more coherent political action. The key areas for transformation identified are: (1) Human well-being and capabilities; social justice (2) Energy transition and climate (3) Circular economy (4) Sustainable building and the transformation of transportation (5) Sustainable agricultural and food systems (6) Pollutant-free environment.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

The indicators of the above mentioned German sustainability strategy provide information on the status of what has been achieved in each case. There are indicators and, in most cases, quantified targets, for every SDG.

Additionally, ProgRess describes measures, most of them voluntarily, for increasing material efficiency along the entire value chain – from raw material extraction and product design to production, use and circular economy. With the implementation of these measures, an important contribution is made to sustainability, climate and environmental protection.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

There are already numerous regulations in public procurement. These enable the contracting authorities to use sustainability criteria in procurement at different levels of the procurement processes taken into account. ProgRess emphasizes that the acceptance and importance of resource efficiency requirements in public procurement will be strengthened, not least to contribute to the harmonization of resource efficiency requirements.

In order to achieve the Federal Government's decision to make the federal administration climate-neutral by 2030, the Federal Government is offering support through the Competence Center for Sustainable Procurement. This competence center also facilitates the implementation of sustainability and resource efficiency requirements for public authorities in the context of procurement processes. It is also being examined whether administrative regulations can make climate-friendly procurement mandatory for products and services that are particularly relevant to the climate obligate.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

The acceptance of green politics / sustainable transformation processes is growing in all areas and at all administration levels. Nevertheless, the implementation of sustainability requirements is not a matter of the federal government alone, but must be supported at all levels if it is to be successful.

In addition, a respective education must be provided at all levels, from kindergarten to all levels of education and professional training.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

In the development of the "German Resource Efficiency Program", there was broad participation by stakeholders, associations and a public dialogue with a total of 229 randomly selected citizens.

GERMANY (SAARLAND)

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Environmental and climate protection aspects can have quite a large influence (regionally, nationally to Europe-wide) on the decision-making process in tendering procedures. For example, certain requirements are already set out in the specifications and weightings/scoring for environmental aspects are defined for the comparison of bids, such as:

- Building and maintenance cleaning (environmental impact of cleaning agents/concentrates or cleaning procedures),
- Construction/refurbishment projects (achievement of energy standards, use of certain operating materials,
- Maintenance of facilities (replacement of coolants, etc.)

For the (state-wide) procurement of supplies and services, the Saarland Procurement Guideline sets out procurement principles that define environmentally sound procurement. For example, No. 4.3 of the procurement guideline restricts the procurement of paper to recycled paper with the "Blue Angel" eco-label. This decision stems from a decision by the state secretaries in 2019. Such a decision by the state secretaries or the draft submitted to the Council of Ministers are also examples of decision-making processes in which environmental and climate protection issues are increasingly addressed.

Internally, decisions can also be made through regular monitoring/reviews by independent bodies. This is the case, for example, with the annual reports of the environmental verifier within the framework of the environmental management audits according to EMAS. Findings made there are usually environmentally relevant and lead to remedial measures or new programmes or goals, which can also affect Saarland's environmental and climate policy. Through an environmental handbook within the framework of EMAS, the Ministry for the Environment, Climate, Mobility, Agriculture and Consumer Protection (MUKMAV) also has, for example, a strict requirement for the procurement of official vehicles (with regard to CO_{2e}) or also the priority procurement of consumables from recycled material, beyond the requirements of the Procurement Directive.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

German (and Saarland) sustainability strategy.

Examples are:

- Legal norms (Climate Protection Act, immission control, etc.),
- Supplementary ordinances and concepts,
- Internal administrative guidelines such as procurement guidelines,
- national or regional action and strategy papers such as the Sustainability Strategy or the paper on the Climate Protection Act,
- Alliances of various actors such as the "Saar Environment and Climate Pact" (alliance of the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Innovation, Digital Affairs and Energy

(MWIDE), MUKMAV, Chamber of labour - AK, Federation of Saarland Business Associations - VSU, Chamber of Commerce and Industry - IHK and Chamber of Crafts - HWK).

Within the framework of EMAS, the MUKMAV maintains a legal directory listing all standards that affect environmental aspects in administrative operations. This can be made available on request.

At present, further conceptualisation and tenders are underway within the framework of the Climate Protection Act, which, however, can be presented concretely or conclusively in 2024 at the earliest.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

Challenge: Raise awareness of environmental relevance, reduce energy consumption of properties, investment planning for renovation backlogs, etc. - Approach: Introduce an environmental management system according to EMAS in all business areas for long-term monitoring, (investment) planning and continuous improvement.

For the topic of climate protection, reference should be made to the Saarland Climate Protection Act and the measures and strategy paper on the Climate Protection Act. As the project is still quite young, it is unfortunately not yet possible to provide any information on possible solutions (climate protection concept in progress, enquiries may be directed to the climate protection coordinator of the Saarland state government).

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

See question 3

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

Within the framework of the update of the sustainability strategy, there was broad-based citizen participation.

Within the framework of the Saar Environmental and Climate Pact, participating companies have the opportunity to communicate directly with representatives of the business community and the state administration.

GREECE

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Our country, as a predominantly Mediterranean-coastal country, has given high priority to issues of Sustainable Development and Environmental Protection. The Ministry of Interior, responsible for, among other things, the issues of Local Government, cooperates closely with the local Authorities, Municipalities and Regions to highlight the relevant challenges related to the region, in direct and good cooperation with the relevant bodies of the European Union.

It should also be noted that the promotion of Sustainable Development is not limited to the level of Central / National Government, but is a key priority of all bodies exercising state power and administration. A typical example is the Local Government Organizations, which work closely with the competent Ministry of Interior to take measures and actions that will implement at the local level the requirement for sustainable, sustainable and green development.

1st Example: Green Public Procurement

For the transition towards the Sustainable Development Goals, the Public Initiative through Green Public Procurement (GPP) is important. In order to promote GPP, the "Committee on Green Public Procurement" was set up, in which the Ministry of Interior is represented. Joint Ministerial Decision No 14900/8-2-2021 of the Ministers for Development and Investment and Environment & Energy (Government Gazette 466 B'/08.02.2021) has approved the "National Action Plan (NAP) for Green Public Procurement", which gradually sets quantitative targets for contracting authorities and contracting entities to carry out green public procurement in defined categories of goods, services and public works, i.e. contracts with lower environmental impacts throughout their life cycle, compared to goods, services and works performing the same primary function, which would otherwise be the subject of a contract under different conditions.

The national quantitative targets for the year 2021 concern the Central Government Authorities, which are set out in Law 4412/2016.

The Municipalities and Regions of the country are bound by quantitative targets from 1-1-2022.

In the framework of the implementation of the National Action Plan for Green Public Procurement and for the need of monitoring and evaluation of its implementation, the organisational units responsible for public procurement of the contracting authorities were asked to complete a relevant questionnaire indicating the contracts which took into account green criteria according to the NAP for GPP.

2nd Example: Energy efficiency improvement and energy saving in buildings and installations owned or used by public sector bodies

In the context of the implementation of Joint Ministerial Decision (Government Gazette B' 3424/02.07.2022) of the Ministers for Finance, the Environment and Energy, the Interior and the State on "Measures to improve energy efficiency and save energy in buildings and installations owned or used by public sector bodies" and the related of our Ministry, public bodies must take all necessary steps to limit energy consumption in buildings and installations in their area of responsibility.

The Ministry of Interior, by document with ref. 80395/30-11-2022 of the Coordination Service, has appointed the Administrative Officers, those responsible for compliance with

the measures to improve energy efficiency and energy saving in the workplaces of its buildings.

3rd Example: Energy Communities (ECs)

Law 4513/2018 lays down the institutional framework for the establishment, setting-up and operation of energy communities.

Ecs are urban cooperatives and have as their basic principle the diffusion of the benefits to the members of the energy community, as well as the local community. The ECs provide a huge potential to local communities, individuals-citizens, Local Government Organisations, as well as other legal entities to develop investment projects in the fields of promotion of the social and solidarity economy and innovation in the energy sector, tackling energy poverty, promotion of energy sustainability, production, storage, self-consumption, distribution and supply of energy, enhancement of energy self-sufficiency and security in island municipalities, as well as improvement of energy efficiency in the final use at local and regional level.

ECs are expected to enable the transition to decentralised, more efficient and innovative energy production and use solutions based on local level.

ECs are expected to enable the transition to decentralised, more efficient and innovative energy production and use solutions based on local participation and initiative.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

Green Public Procurement

The relevant regulatory framework for green contracts is Joint Ministerial Decision No 14900/8-2-2021 of the Ministers for Development & Investment and the Environment & Energy (Government Gazette, B' 466/8.2.2021) regarding the approval of the "National Action Plan for Green Public Procurement".

In this regard, an important priority of the Ministry is the monitoring and implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals and especially the No. 11 Goal for Sustainable Cities and Communities, which can be achieved through the cooperation of all stakeholders, but especially the citizens. In particular, in order to achieve the above, the cooperation that has been developed and is constantly evolving between the bodies of the Central Administration and the Local Self-Government is important.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

Greece, like many other countries, has faced a number of challenges when implementing green public administration have made it difficult to invest in renewable energy, energy efficiency, and other environmental initiatives. To overcome these challenges, Greece has taken several approaches, including:

- EU funding: Greece has accessed European Union funding to support green public administration initiatives. This funding has supported the development of renewable energy projects, sustainable transport infrastructure, and energy efficiency measures.
- Public-private partnerships: The Greek government has encouraged public-private partnerships to support green public administration. This has involved working with private companies to develop renewable energy projects and other environmental initiatives.

- Awareness-raising campaigns: To address the lack of political will and resistance to change, Greece has launched awareness-raising campaigns to educate the public and decision-makers about the importance of environmental issues and the benefits of sustainable policies.
- With regard to measures to improve the energy efficiency of buildings, it is a challenge to achieve the objective of reducing electricity consumption in buildings and installations owned or used by public sector bodies, which may not be less than ten per cent (10 %) compared to the consumption in the same/corresponding period of 2019 for the first year of application of Joint Ministerial Decision (Government Gazette, B' 3424/02.07.2022).

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Greece has learned several lessons with regards to green policies and sustainable transition processes, including:

- The protection of life and public health and safety. This includes any action - intervention to address the coronavirus pandemic. Also, projects and important civil protection interventions with special emphasis on flood protection throughout the country.
- The quality of life and the proper functioning of cities, rural areas, settlements (construction of basic infrastructure projects in critical areas such as water supply and sewerage, and strengthening the administrative capacity of local authorities, for the direct benefit of citizens).
- The environment (sustainable development with a strong environmental footprint, strengthening of recycling programs at source, energy saving actions, water, liquid and solid waste management, etc.),
- Digital convergence [information and communication technologies (ICT), Internet of Things applications (Internet of Things), smart digital technologies, with application in local government practice and everyday life of citizens and the goal of transforming cities into "smart cities"], education, culture, tourism and sports (construction of schools, utilization of municipal property, alternative tourism),
- Social cohesion and solidarity with social protection actions and special programs for vulnerable social groups. This includes projects such as the construction and modernization of nurseries, because we support the family and young couples, but also programs with the main goal of removing social exclusion,
- Technical assistance actions of the beneficiaries for the implementation of the Program.

With regard to green public procurement according to the conclusions of the Assessment Report on the implementation of the National Action Plan 2021-2023, the percentage of contracting authorities incorporating green criteria in the total number of contracts is less than 10 %. This demonstrates that the requirements of the NAP, but also the importance of GPP are not widely taken into account by the country's various entities. It is therefore necessary to strengthen educational and information activities in order to communicate the objectives and methods of the National Action Plan for GPP to a wider range of actors, as well as to draft and provide Uniform Technical Specifications to the entities, including green features, in order to facilitate them. Moreover, the low performance of contracting authorities in integrating green solutions into the contracts also reflects to a certain extent the lack of supply on the market.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

In this context, good cooperation between the State and Local Government includes the funding from the State of Local Communities for the development of relevant actions aimed at promoting the above objectives. In particular, in Greece the Ministry of Interior

implements a relevant program under the name "Antonis Tritsis", which has followed the previous funding program, called "Philodimos II". Through the Program "Philodimos II", that was established in 2018, the Ministry aims at strengthening balanced development of the Municipalities of the country, improving infrastructures and enhancing competitiveness of the local economy. Though it also had an ecological dimension, the new program, "A. Tritsis", especially promotes the environmental issues, such as the issue of sustainability and climate change. It is worth mentioning that the design of the program enshrines the legal framework that lies on EU Directives, as well as that it aims to achieve the UN Sustainable Development Goals, with a view, at the same time, to promoting these issues to the local government entities, so that they could adapt their local policies to the requirements of the new area.

HUNGARY

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

*An important legislative development in recent years is that, with the amendment of Government Decree 314/2005 (XII. 25.) on the environmental impact assessment and the integrated environmental permitting process, **environmental impact assessment (EIA) must also cover the climate effects of public and private investments** from June 2017. With this, Hungary transposed Directive 2014/52/EU into national law. Carrying out EIAs is the responsibility of county government offices (regional level).*

*There are several **aspects to be presented and analysed** during EIA in relation to climate change:*

- *climate-sensitivity of the project alternatives;*
- *exposure of the installation space and the assumed area of impact to natural hazards;*
- *potential impacts related to certain climate factors and risk assessment concerning the potential climate impacts;*
- *climate change adaptation of the planned activity and how the planned activity influences the adapting capacity of the assumed area of impact;*
- *expected yearly GHG emissions.*

*The conditions of the environmental permit may include **measures to reduce greenhouse gas emissions or increase energy efficiency** and measures to **adapt to climate change**.*

*At the local level, an Operational Programme call in 2016 supported the development of a methodology for **municipal climate strategies**, on the basis of which a number of municipal climate strategies have been developed (municipal climate strategies are not legally required, but voluntary). These strategies can serve as a basis for local decision-making.*

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

*Our national regulations regarding climate policy **complement and implement our international and EU commitments**. The most important rules are laid down in the following three acts by the Parliament:*

- **Act LX of 2007** on the implementation framework of the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Kyoto Protocol;
- **Act CCXVII of 2012** on Participation in the Community Emission Trading System and the implementation of the Effort Sharing Decision;
- **Act CLIV of 2020** on Climate Protection.

*According to Act LX of 2007, it is mandatory to prepare and regularly review and then update a national climate change strategy in Hungary. Following the adoption of the first National Climate Change Strategy (NCCS1) in 2008, **the second National Climate Change Strategy (NCCS2) for the period of 2018-2030 (with an outlook until 2050)** was prepared and adopted by the Hungarian Parliament in 2018. The implementation of the strategic objectives set out in the NCCS2 is to be supported by four consecutive **three-year Climate Change Action Plans**.*

*The **strategic framework** by the Hungarian Government for our contribution to the fight against climate change was adopted in 2020-2021 in the following **documents: Scientific***

Report on the Effects of Climate Change on the Carpathian Basin, National Energy and Climate Plan, National Energy Strategy 2030, with a view to 2040, National Clean Development Strategy. Additionally, the Prime Minister of Hungary announced the **Climate and Nature Protection Action Plan** in February 2020, which includes 8 specific measures with the ultimate goal to protect our climate and preserve our natural resources.

At the national level, **Hungary has set emission reductions of at least 40% by 2030 compared to 1990**, while it has committed itself to **becoming climate-neutral by 2050**. It should be emphasized that Hungary has not set these targets only at the strategic level, but **enshrined national emission reduction targets in law (Act CLIV of 2020 on Climate Protection)**.

There are no formal legal mechanisms specifically concerning the enforcement of climate policy considerations during law-making or decision-making. However, **the general rules of legislation and the hierarchy of the sources of law ensure that climate policy considerations prevail in legislation, as set in the Fundamental Law of Hungary and Act CXXX of 2010 on law-making.**

The Fundamental Law (constitution) of Hungary recognizes sustainability (thus, indirectly, climate safety) to be of paramount value. No law shall conflict with the Fundamental Law, including its sustainability related norms. The first part of the Fundamental Law, the National Creed lays down the commitment to nurturing and protecting our heritage, including all man-made and natural assets of the Carpathian Basin. The Fundamental Law emphasizes that we bear responsibility for our descendants and therefore we shall protect the living conditions of future generations by making prudent use of our material, intellectual and natural resources.

Similarly, **Article P)** of the Fundamental Law establishes that natural resources (in particular arable land, forests and water reserves, biodiversity, especially native plant and animal species) and cultural artefacts form the common heritage of the nation, and it is the obligation of the State and everyone to protect and maintain them, and to preserve them for future generations. **Article Q)** recognizes that in order to achieve the sustainable development of humankind, Hungary must strive for cooperation with all the peoples and countries of the world. Furthermore, **Article XXI** recognizes **everyone's right to a healthy environment** and the obligation of the State to endorse this right. Finally, **Article 38** states that the purpose of the management and protection of national assets (the property of the State and local governments) is to serve the public interest, satisfy common needs, preserve natural resources and take the needs of future generations into account.

Act CXXX of 2010 on law-making contains a specific rule on environmental considerations during legislation. According to Section 17, those preparing a law shall assess the expected consequences of the regulation by carrying out a **preliminary impact assessment** to the level of detail required by the assumed impact of the law. The results of preliminary impact assessments related to legislative proposals to be submitted by the Government or to government decrees shall be provided to the Government, while those related to local government decrees shall be provided to the representative body of the local government.

When carrying out an impact assessment, all impacts of the draft law that are deemed significant shall be examined, especially – among others – **its environmental and health consequences, which implicitly involve the possible climate related effects of legislation.** Those preparing a law are responsible for evaluating the results of the preliminary impact assessment and for proposing the adoption of a law only if it is necessary for achieving the regulatory objective.

*Within the framework of general governmental coordination, it is also ensured that **the minister responsible for climate policy can give an opinion from a climate policy point of view on draft legislation prepared by other members of the Government** (or proposals submitted by other bodies and persons).*

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

The public administration has a long-established system, so the practical application of new greening measures and directives can often be difficult (e.g. printing, recycling). To overcome these challenges, a change in attitude is needed alongside the measures adopted. In order to achieve this, trainings and incentives can provide support.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

*One of the most important lessons with regards to the transition process is the necessity to map and involve local stakeholders as early as possible in case of planning and implementation of support schemes like the **EU Just Transition Fund (JTF)** which are directed to support subnational regions (NUTS-3 regions in case of JTF), while the management of financial resources lies at the national government.*

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

For the planning of the JTF, the national government organized several workshops for local stakeholders, civil society organizations and a dedicated workshop to the youth. The outcome of the discussions were channelled in the planning process.

ICELAND

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

- All five policies of the ministry of infrastructure, i.e., in the field of municipalities, regional development, transport, planning, and housing, contain environmental and climatic actions. This has led to a special action within the new strategic action plan in municipal affairs to map out all defined actions of municipalities leading to improvements in the field of the environment and climate issues. This action will not only give a better overview of ongoing projects, but also lead us to more opportunities to achieve even better results in the field of environment and climate issues.
- A fundamental action within the strategic plan in municipal affairs is analyzing criteria for sustainability in the fields of environment, society, and finance in accordance with the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals. Experience has taught us how lack of common criteria can cause confusion when working towards a common goal. For example, 4-5 definitions are behind our understanding of financial sustainability of municipalities within the public sector. No wonder, people get confused in reaching a common ground. By clearing this matter, we hope to lay the foundations for the joint efforts of state and local authorities towards sustainability in these three indispensable areas.
- An important goal of the authorities is to ensure no municipality in Iceland has fewer than 1,000 inhabitants. Initially, the aim was to legalize the 1,000-population goal. Since consensus could not be reached in the parliament, a "gentler approach" is in action providing inhabitants with sufficient information for them to be able to evaluate the advantages and disadvantages of merging with other municipalities.
- With mergers of municipalities and other actions within the strategic action plan in municipal affairs, the sustainability of municipalities is promoted. Another improvement within green administration is rooted in the Covid-lesson of the advantage of online communication. This lesson reflects in many positive ways within the municipalities, e.g., in the increased flexibility of holding local government meetings online, which can be practical in a sparsely populated country like Iceland.
- Digital transformation has in some areas overturned our criteria for approaching various projects. The location of jobs is a good example. Previously, we assumed all jobs were local unless otherwise specifically stated. Now, we assume all jobs are non-local unless they need to be processed in a certain place. The next step is to implement the government's decision that all meetings organized by the governing council and state institutions will be held online, unless otherwise specifically stated. These changes in focus will strengthen the settlements in the country as well as decrease pollution due to unnecessary travel.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

- The Icelandic Presidency of the Council of Europe prioritizes the environment – where the interrelationship between human rights and the environment is highlighted. We also promote innovative solutions in green government. In Iceland all governmental institutions are encouraged to take steps to limit their environmental impact. These steps are called the green steps and the organisations

can receive governmental vetting of their progress, increasing awareness both among staff but also the public.

- Icelanders take their responsibility of reducing greenhouse gas emissions seriously. Iceland's Climate action plan is the main instrument to reach the commitments under the Paris agreement. It is also the main instrument to reach Iceland's stated goal of carbon neutrality by 2040. Our aim is to reduce emission under Iceland's direct responsibility by 55% compared to emission in 2005. Projects in progress will deliver between 40 and 46% reduction in greenhouse gases. Our next step is to update the plan with more ambitious goals for each sector in consultation with local authorities and the business community. This way we are optimistic about reaching our goal.
- The Agreement on the Platform for the Coalition Government emphasize the will of the government to work in a close cooperation with local authorities to ensure the success of actions in the field of climate and environmental issues. It refers to the introduction of a circular economy, actions in the field of sewage, pollution control, water conservation, nature conservation and biodiversity protection.
- Municipalities play a key role in the fight against climate change and adapting society to the changes that will inevitably occur because of global warming. Environmental issues are constantly rising on municipalities priorities list. Emphasis is placed on the need to better integrate municipal and regional planning policy to promote better utilization of infrastructure and services, support climate goals and adaptation to climate change, create a better overview of the supply of land and housing and support planning administration.
- All municipalities are obliged to adopt a climate policy according to the Act on Climate Matters. The purpose of the policy is to make it easier for local authorities to systematically reduce the impact of greenhouse gas emissions from their activities and to set an example with direct and indirect effects on Iceland's climate commitments. The strategy must contain quantitative goals for the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and the municipality's carbon offset, along with an action plan on how to reach those goals. A toolbox for municipalities has been developed to promote and support Icelandic municipalities in preparing an action orientated policy in climate matters.
- The current legal provision covers direct greenhouse gas emissions from activities controlled by the municipalities. Leading municipalities have taken a step further and included all activities within the municipality. More municipalities will undoubtedly follow in their steps soon. In some cases, this work has been done at the level of regional associations. Some municipalities are members of the Covenant of Mayors for Climate & Energy.
- It is also worth mentioning that the first Icelandic climate action which aims to increase societies resilience and adaptation to climate change will soon be published.
- The national policy on biodiversity is currently being update. Iceland is a member of the UN Convention on Biological Diversity which entered into force in Iceland in 1994. The objective of protecting biodiversity is to preserve the species that have created Icelandic nature and thrived in this country for millennia and prevent species from going extinct. The provisions of the agreement have been implemented to laws, and this is largely done in the law on nature conservation, the law on the Icelandic Natural History Institute and nature centers and several other laws.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

- All policymaking must consider present status, public policy, and the uniqueness of Icelandic living condition in a sparsely populated country. Thanks to the foresight of our ancestors, 97% of space heating in Iceland is done using renewable energy sources and a rising rate of vehicles are powered by renewable electricity. Because of our decarbonized electricity grid, based on hydropower and geothermal energy there are great opportunities to be successful in the upcoming energy transition, that is the shift from fossil fuels to renewable energy. Work is currently underway to facilitate and accelerate the energy transition in transportation, on land, sea and air. Our goal is to be carbon neutral and independent of fossil fuels by 2040. We have experience of being self-sufficient in terms of energy used for space heating and electricity. We envision our future where we have also achieved that goal in terms of transportation.
- Challenges identified specifically for the energy transition include cost and infrastructure development. There are challenges regarding electric generation, distribution and transmission of electrical energy and production of domestic renewable fuels, e.g. hydrogen. Work is underway on various fronts to solve these challenges and that work is mostly under the responsibility of the Ministry of the Environment, Energy and Climate.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

- A steering group on adaptation to climate change is working on the preparation of a proposal of a national adaptation plan. The group is to submit a proposal to the Minister of the environment, energy, and climate at the end of August 2023 as a basis for decision-making. The work includes extensive consultation using specialized workshops, to which stakeholders from different sectors are invited to participate. Specialized workshops are held for each sector: Natural hazards, transport, planning, insurance, water and wastewater, agriculture, construction industry, public health, and energy. Results from the consultation process are publicly available [online](#).
- A team is working for the Ministry of Environment, Energy and Climate, with representative association of businesses to define Climate Roadmaps for all business sectors. The roadmaps are intended to give a holistic view of projects the sectors are willing to undertake in order to reduce the emission of greenhouse gases and how the government can support their progress.

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

CDDG RAPID RESPONSE SERVICE No. 55 **ON EXPERIENCE WITH GREEN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

**Questionnaire submitted at the request of
the Working Group on Green Public Administration (GT-A)**

NOTE from the CDDG Secretariat to responding delegations:

Please, tick the box below if applicable

☐ we oppose communication of our responses to a third party not involved in this work of the CDDG

Context

The terms of reference for the CDDG provide for the following specific tasks to be implemented by the end of 2023: "Prepare a report on green public administration aimed at collecting and disseminating good practice and case studies and identifying guidance for administrations at local, regional and national level, taking into account the proceedings of the 2020-2021 edition of the World Forum for Democracy and its previous work on digitalisation of the public administration" (specific task 3).

The newly established Working Group on Green Public Administration (GT-A) was entrusted with the task of preparing the above work for the CDDG. It held its first meeting on 2-3 March 2023, at which it decided to solicit CDDG members with the present questionnaire to assist it in its work and collect case studies for possible inclusion in the Report.

The GT-A would be very grateful for receiving your responses no later than **21 April 2023** at the address cddg@coe.int.

For any question, feel free to contact in the Secretariat Judith Orland (Judith.orland@coe.int; tel +33 3 90 21 62 43).

Introduction

- For the purposes of this questionnaire, “green public administration” (GPA) refers to decision-making processes at all levels of government (international, supranational, national, and subnational), that integrate environmental and climate change considerations, such as those stemming from the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Paris Agreement among others.
- Responses should ideally be no longer than 1 page per case study and not too detailed. Synthetical and explanatory responses should be privileged over the quoting of long extracts from the legislation and other official texts.
- Links to national documents, studies, reports and further resources are welcome.
- Please note that it would be useful to have the cases entered into the [EDEN platform](#), too.

QUESTIONS

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Answer 1: *At the local level, the city of Chisinau has implemented several initiatives to promote sustainability and reduce greenhouse gas emissions. For example, in 2019, the city launched a bike-sharing program to encourage residents to use bikes instead of cars for short trips, and in 2020, it introduced a fleet of electric buses to improve air quality.*

At the regional level, the Eastern Partnership Territorial Cooperation program has supported initiatives such as a pilot project to develop sustainable tourism in the region of Cahul, which aims to promote local economic development while preserving the natural environment.

At the national level, the government of Moldova has adopted the National Climate Change Adaptation Strategy for the period 2021-2030, which outlines priority actions to reduce the country's vulnerability to climate change impacts.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

Answer 2: *Moldova has established a number of national frameworks, legal structures, and policy instruments to ensure that decision-making takes into account sustainability, long-term orientation, and climate/environmental issues. These include:*

The National Environmental Strategy 2020: This is a national policy document that outlines Moldova's environmental objectives and priorities, as well as the strategies and actions needed to achieve them.

The Law on Environmental Protection: This law provides the legal framework for environmental protection in Moldova, and sets out the rights and responsibilities of individuals, organizations, and government bodies in relation to environmental issues.

The National Strategy for Sustainable Development: This is a comprehensive strategy that aims to promote sustainable development across all sectors of the economy, and to integrate environmental and social considerations into decision-making processes.

The Law on Waste Management: This law establishes the legal framework for waste management in Moldova, and outlines the responsibilities of government bodies, businesses, and individuals in relation to waste management.

The Ministry Environment: This government ministry is responsible for developing and implementing environmental policies and promoting sustainable development across the country.

The National Climate Change Adaptation Strategy: This strategy outlines the priority actions needed to reduce Moldova's vulnerability to climate change impacts, and to build resilience to climate-related risks.

Overall, Moldova has established a range of legal and policy instruments to ensure that sustainability, long-term orientation, and climate/environmental issues are taken into account in decision-making processes.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

Answer 3: *One of the main challenges faced by Moldova in implementing green public administration has been a lack of funding and resources. To overcome this challenge, the government has sought to leverage external funding from international organizations such as the European Union and the World Bank. Additionally, the government has been working to raise awareness among citizens and businesses about the importance of sustainability, and has been promoting public-private partnerships to fund green initiatives.*

Another challenge has been a lack of capacity and expertise within government institutions. To address this, the government has been providing training and support to public officials to help them develop the skills and knowledge needed to implement green policies and programs.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Answer 4: *Moldova has learned several important lessons from its efforts to promote sustainable development and transition to a green economy. One of the most important is*

the need for strong political will and leadership to drive change. Another key lesson is the importance of stakeholder engagement and collaboration, particularly between the government, civil society, and the private sector.

Moldova has also recognized the importance of integrating sustainability considerations across all sectors and levels of government, rather than treating it as a separate issue. Finally, the country has learned that successful sustainable development requires a long-term perspective and a commitment to ongoing monitoring and evaluation of progress.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

Answer 5: *Moldova has demonstrated a commitment to citizen participation and multi-level governance in its efforts to promote sustainability. For example, the country has established a National Council for Sustainable Development, which brings together representatives from government, civil society, and the private sector to coordinate efforts to promote sustainable development.*

In addition, Moldova has launched several initiatives to promote cross-border cooperation on environmental issues, including the Eastern Partnership Territorial Cooperation program, which supports sustainable development and environmental protection in the region. Finally, the country has encouraged citizen participation in environmental decision-making through public consultations and other forms of engagement.

POLAND

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Numerous examples of decision-making processes at various levels are provided by the investment process in the construction industry, which is subject to legal and administrative regulation (mainly by authoritative terms in the form of administrative decisions). In particular, administrative decisions issued on the basis of the Act of 3 October 2008 on the provision of information on the environment and its protection, public participation in environmental protection and environmental impact assessments, which are, for example, a decision on environmental conditions, a decision establishing a remediation plan for historical contamination of the earth's surface, decision on fees for the use of the environment, decision ordering the waste holder to remove waste from a place not intended for storage or storage, decision specifying the detailed conditions for mineral extraction, decision specifying the estimated amount of emissions in the year of the settlement period to which it relates emissions report. Decisions in this regard are issued by bodies at various levels, including executive bodies of local government units (commune heads, mayors, presidents of cities, starosts), government administration bodies (voivodes, competent ministers) and specialized bodies operating throughout the country (e.g. General Director for Environmental Protection).

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

Provided in response to the question. 1 example of an investment process in construction perfectly illustrates the consideration of the principle of sustainable development as well as climate and environmental issues. The above is ensured by the system of legal acts concerning spatial planning and development and construction law, and currently these issues are taken into account in a special way in the planned (currently at the stage of parliamentary works) systemic reform of the law in this respect. However, even without taking the above change into account, numerous statutory requirements can be pointed out regarding both the first stage of the investment process (local plans, decisions specifying development conditions, decisions determining the location of public purpose investments) and the second stage (decisions on building permits). The current and future (projected) national frameworks ensure that climate and environmental issues are taken into account by investors on the one hand, and by public administration bodies conducting administrative proceedings at various stages of the construction investment process on the other.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

National Institute of Local Government cannot take a position on this matter.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

National Institute of Local Government cannot take a position on this matter.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

The participation of citizens in decision-making processes concerning environmental protection has been directly guaranteed in Poland by the aforementioned Act of 3 October 2008 on the provision of information on the environment and its protection, public participation in environmental protection and environmental impact assessments. This regulation in Art. Articles 4 and 5 of the Act provide for the right of everyone, without limiting this category to citizens only, to obtain from public administration bodies information on the environment and participation in decision-making processes relating to the environment. Examples of specific powers include: participation in the preparation of draft documents and decisions (Article 30 of the Act) and special participation in the decision-making processes of ecological organizations (Articles 44-45 of the Act). Public participation is also ensured at various stages of the planning processes that determine the purpose and directions of land development within local government units, which was guaranteed by the Act of 27 March 2003 on spatial planning and development. An example of exercising this type of power as part of planning activities is the right to submit applications before the development of planning documents (e.g. Article 11(1-2) of the Act), public discussions (see Article 11(7) of the Act), submit comments to the developed planning projects (e.g. Article 11(8) of the Act).

Regardless of the special guarantees of public participation in ecology and environmental matters guaranteed by special acts, an important instrument of a general nature used in such cases is also the right of a social organization to join any administrative proceedings, which is guaranteed by Art. 31 of the Code of Administrative Procedure. In practice, this right is often used by environmental organizations.

SLOVAK REPUBLIC

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

One of interesting examples was establishing of mandatory separate collection of biodegradable waste in Slovakia. The biodegradable waste from households is more than 500,000 tons produced annually in our country, i.e. around 100 kilograms per capita. It became mandatory for all municipalities (based on Law drawn by Ministry of Environment) in 2021 to separately collect bio waste, but the execution was crucial in success of this measure. In municipalities (for example in Capital city Bratislava) that have introduced sorted collection by distribution of special containers directly to households (to every house/every apartment) 17 kg per inhabitant was collected in first year. On the other hand, municipalities that introduced collection without distribution of baskets or bags to citizens, they only managed to sort in the amount of 5 kg per inhabitant in first year. It is still long way to collect all biodegradable waste from households, but the investment in the beginning seems like better way. To change of the habits of citizens as well as public administration institution is very important aspect of green public administration and its success in elimination of climate change.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

Several instruments are established to ensure that environmental aspect is taken into account in decision making process. For example in any change of the law, or in preparation of non-legislative documents (strategies etc.) the respected ministry, who is preparing the law/document has to develop an impact clause. One of the impacts that has to be evaluated is the impact on the environment.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

Probably one of the biggest challenges on this matter is persuade generally all stakeholders to change their long lasting habits in favor of environment aspects and to persuade them, that also small steps and small changes that may seem as not that important are also crucial in green public administration approach. On this matter Ministry of Environment of the Slovak Republic developed the manual for public administration bodies (it is called Public administration as a leader) how with small changes public administration bodies can save at least 15% of its energies. The document was also adopted by Slovak Government. Link: https://www.minzp.sk/files/iep/ brozura_riesenia_v11.pdf

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Slovakia is currently facing many environmental challenges. Slovakia has problems with air quality, low levels of waste recycling, but also with the protection of ecosystems. Air

pollution alone causes more than 5,000 premature deaths a year in Slovakia. Environmental problems have had an increasing impact on the economy, employment and comfort of the population. In addition, as all over the world, Slovakia has already been affected by the climate change with visible impacts, which will be seriously demonstrated in the future in the form of environmental, economic and health problems. According to estimates, in 2013 alone the economic losses from climate change extremes in Slovakia were worth more than EUR 1.3 billion. The environmental challenges in Slovakia require a long-term vision and strategic direction. The need for a new, modern environmental policy strategy, which will reflect the actual situation and urgent problems of the environment, stresses the fact that the valid Strategy - Principles and Priorities of the State Environmental Policy was approved in 1993 and has not been updated until 2018. The presented Strategy of the Environmental Policy of the Slovak Republic until 2030 (hereinafter referred to as 'Envirostrategy 2030') defines a vision until 2030, which takes into account a possible, probable, and the desired future development, identifies the fundamental systemic problems, sets the objectives until 2030 and proposes a framework for measures to improve the current situation, and it also contains basic result indicators that will enable a verification of achieved results. The basic vision of Envirostrategy 2030 is to achieve better environmental quality and sustainable circulation of the economy, which is based on rigorous protection of environmental compartments and using as little non-renewable natural resources and hazardous substances as possible, which will lead to an improvement in health of the population. Environmental protection and sustainable consumption will be part of the general awareness of citizens and policy makers. Through the prevention and adaptation to climate change, the consequences will be as subdued as possible in Slovakia.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA

SLOVENIA

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Slovenia actively participates in the formulation and implementation of the environmental policies at the international, regional, European and global levels. As a member of major international organizations, it is committed to the implementation of adopted policies, programs and projects and ensures the compliance of national development planning documents with the development documents of the European Union and international organizations.

In 2017, the Government of the Republic of Slovenia adopted the **Development Strategy of Slovenia 2030**⁷, an overarching development document. It laid down new long-term development foundations of Slovenia with an emphasis on quality of life and includes five strategic objectives and twelve interconnected development goals. It recognized the importance of global responsibility towards the environment and society by including the goals of the sustainable development agenda of the United Nations. The strategy thus includes the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) agreed at global level, five strategic orientations and twelve interlinked development goals, thus setting a long-term development foundation for Slovenia. It also takes into account internationally adopted commitments. All this requires an integrated approach at different levels and the involvement of key stakeholders in the process of planning, implementing and monitoring of policies. The Strategy aims to achieve the objectives through actions to decouple resource use and economic growth and GHG emission, decision-making concerning fossil fuels, infrastructure and energy use in transport, physical planning, promotion of innovation, the use of design and information and communication technology to develop new business models and products for efficient use of raw materials, energy for adaptation to climate change.

The **Strategic Framework for Adaptation to Climate Change**⁸ is a strategic framework with guidelines for adaptation to climate change that outline horizontal measures or activities for adaptation to climate change, thereby reducing Slovenia's exposure, sensitivity and vulnerability to climate change impacts and increasing its climate resilience and adaptive capacity at the national and municipal levels.

In accordance with the EU Regulation 2018/1999 on the Governance of the Energy Union and Climate Action Slovenia submitted the **National Energy and Climate Plan (NEPN) for 2020 - 2030**⁹. The NEPN is a strategic document that must set goals, policies and actions for the five dimensions of the Energy Union by 2030 (with a view to 2040): decarbonisation and renewable energy, energy efficiency, energy security, the internal energy market, and research, innovation and competitiveness. NEPN preparation was set up by the Ministry of Infrastructure Slovenia and prepared with close cooperation with the inter-service working group.

⁷ <https://www.gov.si/assets/ministrstva/MKRR/Strategija-razvoja-Slovenije-2030/Slovenian-Development-Strategy-2030.pdf>

⁸ https://www.gov.si/assets/ministrstva/MOP/Dokumenti/Podnebne-spremembe/SOzP_ang.pdf

⁹ https://energy.ec.europa.eu/system/files/2020-06/si_final_necp_main_en_0.pdf

The Resolution on the **National Environmental Protection Program for the period 2020-2030 from 2020**¹⁰ (supplemented in 2022) addresses the challenges of future environmental protection or the environmental boundary conditions of the development of Slovenia, which has a long tradition and established administrative organization of environmental protection and the support of non-governmental organizations and other professional institutions and individuals.

The **Resolution on the Long-term Climate Strategy of Slovenia 2050**¹¹ adopted in 2021 sets the goal of achieving net zero emissions or climate neutrality by 2050. Strategic sectoral goals for the years 2040 and 2050 are also set, which individual sectors must consistently follow and incorporate into their sectoral documents and plans.

The **Recovery and Resilience Plan** prepared in 2021, a national program of reforms and investments to mitigate the economic and social consequences of the covid-19 pandemic, defines measures that also address the challenges of the green transition (see Figure 3), i.e. j. transition to a low-carbon circular economy and which:

- support the achievement of the goals of the Comprehensive National Energy and Climate Plan of the Republic of Slovenia (which recognizes the role of introducing economic models in achieving climate goals), and
- contribute to the implementation of the European Green Deal.

In achieving the set climate goals, it is absolutely necessary to green the budget planning.

In 2012 Slovenia adopted a comprehensive strategic development project, **Green Budget Reform**, which combines environmental objectives with economic incentives and opportunities for fiscal consolidation. Goals of this reform were to improve the efficiency and transparency of the use of public financial resources intended for the protection of the environment, and to support the creation of incentives that will contribute to achieving positive effects on the environment.

Slovenia's public authorities seek to purchase goods, services and works with a reduced environmental impact throughout their life-cycle. Green public procurement is defined in more detail by the Regulation on Green Public Procurement Act, which has been in force since 2018. Green public procurement is mandatory for 22 items. Examples of environmental requirements and criteria are updated at least every two years based on technological development, market conditions and the legislation and guidelines of the European Union and the Republic of Slovenia.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

Slovenia has a long tradition of environmental protection, and an administrative organization of protection has been established, along with the support provided by NGO's, other professional institutions and individuals.

The Constitution of the Republic of Slovenia contains a number of provisions concerning the protection of the environment. The State is responsible for protecting nature and maintaining a healthy environment. The environment is integrated into physical

¹⁰ https://www.gov.si/assets/ministrstva/MOP/Dokumenti/ReNPVO2020_2030_ang.doc

¹¹ https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/LTS1_SLOVENIA_EN.pdf

planning and into any other planning of activities affecting the environment. In order to reduce adverse environmental impact, economic instruments have been introduced, such as an environmental tax based on the polluter pays principle. A very important instrument for stimulating polluters to reduce pollution is an environmental tax exemption or reduction in the case of investment in environmental protection. Environmental legislation in Slovenia¹² is based on existing EU legislation. The **Environmental Protection Act** is a framework legislation that covers the protection of land, water and air, flora and fauna and the use of natural resources, establishes objectives, principles and instruments for the practical and effective protection of the environment and allocates decision-making powers amongst the various authorities. It provides for a National Environmental Action Programme to be drawn up and for environmental impact assessments to be carried out for all projects which could have adverse effects on the environment.

The National Environmental Action Programme for the period 2020–2030¹³ has been drafted in accordance with the Environmental Protection Act, the Nature Conservation Act and the Waters Act and combines the National Environmental Action Programme, National Nature Protection Programme and National Water Management Programme.

It defines the guidelines, goals, tasks and measures of environmental protection stakeholders, namely:

- long-term guidelines, goals, tasks and measures in environmental protection,
- long-term guidelines, goals, tasks and measures in the conservation of biodiversity and protection of valuable natural features (National Nature Protection Programme),
- national water management policy (National Water Management Programme),
- measures to achieve the goals of the Development Strategy of Slovenia 2030, which recognises the preservation of a healthy natural environment among the strategic orientations for achieving a high quality of life,
- guidelines for the planning and implementation of policies of other sectors that also affect the environment,
- guidelines and measures for compliance with international development commitments (especially the 2030 Agenda),
- guidelines and measures for compliance with international commitments in environmental protection, nature conservation and water management.

Environmental efforts are moving in the direction of low-carbon society, the circular economy, resilient ecosystems, and sustainable macroeconomic development models. To achieve the 2050 vision, environmental protection policy cannot be implemented in isolation from policies in other sectors such as agriculture, transport, energy, tourism. It is inextricably linked to the broader economic and social development.

It is also important to raise awareness about the need to address climate change and other environmental threats through preparing **impact assessments of regulations on different areas**, especially in the field of the environment. When preparing the regulations, the Ministry of Public Administration steers the drafters through appropriate questions and raises awareness of the importance of including climate change and other environmental threats, by having them consider whether the regulation affects a certain

¹² <https://www.gov.si/en/state-authorities/ministries/ministry-of-the-environment-climate-and-energy/legislation/>

¹³ https://www.gov.si/assets/ministrstva/MOP/Dokumenti/ReNPVO2020_2030_ang.doc

area or not. Activities are currently underway in the framework of one of the actions of the Action Plan to improve the regulatory drafting process, namely the project on the development of methodologies for the impact assessment of regulations or so-called e-regulations. The project aims at introducing impact assessments of regulations in other societal areas (social, environment, IT solutions, administrative implications, public finances, introduction of a module for ex-post evaluations of regulations). The final draft of the methodology is in the process of inter-service ministerial coordination and it will be soon submitted to the Government of the Republic of Slovenia for adoption. The methodology will be further supported through an application and embedded in the MOPED system. A wide range of public officials will be trained to implement the methodology in practice.

Slovenia is partnering with EIT Climate KIC in implementing the project **Deep Demonstration of a Circular, Regenerative and Low-Carbon Economy in Slovenia – coordination for systemic transformation**¹⁴. Through the project, as the name indicates, we are aiming at a systems approach to transform five key value chains and to increase the capacity of civil servants and to integrate transformative practices in four horizontal areas: education, entrepreneurship, finance and policy. In the later area, we are taking first steps towards establishing a Policy lab which will initially focus on climate/circularity issues. With this we are aiming to set up a system and the knowledge on how to generate climate/environmental policies/legislation, etc. in a participatory manner and based on evidence and that could lead towards a decision-making process that is consistent with climate objectives.

A sustainable public administration plays an important role in guiding society towards sustainability. Public administrations perform activities with significant environmental impacts. Those that take the lead in transition to sustainability can encourage others to follow. Slovenia has identified the need for new models of governance to effectively develop solutions in the area of green public administration which include the need to approach and redefine governance and the organizational models of the public administration. To address this, Slovenia is currently preparing the **Strategy for Sustainable Public Administration**. We aim to integrate principles of sustainable development into the institutional structure of the public administration. This approach is also directed at building capacity at the level of employees, so they are capable of developing solutions in the changing social and other circumstances.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

In Slovenia, in recent decades, we have seen an improvement in the quality of water and air, waste management, and an increase in the awareness of the importance of conserved biodiversity and valuable natural features. The level of knowledge and understanding of the connections between environmental pressures and the state of the environment have improved as well. However, the **transformation of Slovenia to a sustainable economy has been slow and there have also been insufficient efforts in the direction of the transition to a low-carbon circular economy**. Progress in decoupling economic growth

¹⁴ <https://www.climate-kic.org/circularslovenia-2/>

from resource use and emissions has also been too slow. The lag behind the EU average in terms of energy, emissions and material productivity has not decreased over a long period, and the increase in the use of renewable energy sources in Slovenia has been the smallest in the EU since 2005. In dealing with the challenges of the green transition, there have been some changes in the recent period. Thus, more funds will be available for these purposes in the future than in the past medium-term period, and the reform part of the Recovery and Resilience Plan, which may help to reduce part of the implementation deficit in these areas, also brings encouragement. Nevertheless, the ambitious goals for the implementation of the double transition indicate that their achievement will need to be further supported by systemic measures and resources.¹⁵

The challenges Slovenia identified could be particularly listed as: lack of adequate capacity/knowledge and silo working mode among the actors in public administration which prevents creating more coherent actions. As mentioned above, the projects we are implementing aim to address the challenges identified.

Due to the scale, speed, and unpredictability of changes, governments are now forced to introduce new governance models that will be able to successfully and timely design viable solutions to climate change, pandemic risks, rapid technological change, depletion of natural resources, large-scale environmental damage, war and violent conflict, extreme poverty, demographic change, and global migration flows. In order to achieve this, new approaches to management and organization in public administration are necessary, and sustainability must be incorporated into the institutional structure of public administration, so that it can generate cooperative and feasible solutions. Therefore, transformative management is focused on building the capacity of employees in public administration to be able to develop and codesign initiatives and solution that can keep in step with constantly changing circumstances.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Slovenia must continue to develop and implement the following supporting measures that will help to achieve substantive goals: inclusion of protection goals into the policies of other sectors, strengthening dialogue and cooperation between environmental protection actors, education for environmental protection, research, development and innovation for environmental protection, management of environmental crimes, economic and financial instruments of environmental protection and the implementation of international commitment and contribution to international environmental policy planning.

To successfully address the gaps to be overcome in the green policies and sustainable transition processes, Slovenia must:

- Improve legislation and the implementation of legislation, access to environmental data, improvement of knowledge and data collection for environmental policy,
- Improve management of environmental crimes, economic and financial instruments of environmental protection and the implementation of international commitments and contribution to international environmental policy planning,

¹⁵ https://www.umar.gov.si/fileadmin/user_upload/razvoj_slovenije/2022/slovenski/POR2022_splet2.pdf

- Ensure broader cooperation, integration and the exchange of experience and examples of good practice,
- Strengthen dialogue and cooperation between actors,
- Support continuous improvement of knowledge on climate change impacts and climate change adaptation methods,
- Provide an appropriate level and quality of education, research, development and innovation for environmental protection
- Support competence awareness, communication on the impacts of climate change in general and the impacts of climate change on society,
- Become more agile and develop adaptable policies,
- Design and implement coherent policies by considering interlinkages between economic, social and environmental policy areas,
- Apply a systemic approach and ensure environmental compliance of the operation of all sectors of society and include the environment into the policies of other sectors,
- Support policies, especially those of key systems such as mobility, energy, nutrition, and housing, which will be achieved by their decarbonisation, increase of resource efficiency and adaptation to the limits of ecosystems,
- Adopt a whole of government approach, put into action fully functioning coordination mechanisms, build up capacity to resolve possible policy conflicts, and break siloes,
- Build partnerships, create and reinforce ownership and
- Secure adequate and sufficient financial and human resources.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

The Ministry of Infrastructure and the Ministry of Environment were responsible for the preparation of the National Energy and Climate Plan for 2020 – 2030. Professional and technical support in the preparation of the NEPN is provided by a consortium of professional institutions. The extensive process involved numerous stakeholders (non-governmental organizations, professional organizations, sectors, interested individuals) and the public. On the basis of their input, the consortium prepared updated drafts and the environmental report, which was also publicly disclosed. During the process of public disclosure, the public had the opportunity to express opinions and submit comments. The Government of the Republic of Slovenia also established an inter-ministerial working group for the preparation of the plan, which included, in addition to the two ministries already mentioned, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Education, Science and Sports, the Ministry of Economic Development and Technology, the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Food, the Office for Macroeconomic Analyses and Development and the Government Office for Development and European Cohesion Policy. In accordance with Regulation (EU) 2018/1999, all interested stakeholders and the general public were able to participate in the process of preparing the NEPN.

UKRAINE

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Ukraine conducts reforms and gradually approximates to substantial elements of the EU acquis to advance towards future European Union membership.

In line with the policy objective “a greener, low carbon transitioning towards a net zero carbon economy” of the 2021-2027 EU Cohesion policy the Government of Ukraine adopted **the 2030 National Action Plan for Energy Efficiency**. The national energy efficiency target by 2030 sets primary energy consumption at no more than 91.5 million toe, and final energy consumption – 50.5 million toe.

That is, the reduction in energy consumption relative to the baseline is: – by 22.3% (primary energy consumption); – by 17.1% (final energy consumption).

The National Waste Management Strategy 2030 and Action Plan for its implementation were approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. The main state body responsible for its implementation is the Ministry for Environmental Protection and Natural Resources of Ukraine. The Strategy envisages establishment of regional waste disposal centers, introduction of circular economy principles and extended manufacturer’s liability to encourage businesses to minimize waste generation and get interested in waste recycling, as well as establishment of the 5-step waste management hierarchy introduced in the European Union.

The Ministry for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine (*hereinafter – the Ministry for Restoration*) is implementing the Law of Ukraine on Energy Efficiency of Buildings. The policy of the Ministry is formed due to the approved 2030 National Plan for energy efficiency to increase the number of near zero energy buildings, as well as the energy management systems for public buildings started to be introduced.

The Ministry for Restoration ensures the implementation of the National Transport Strategy of Ukraine 2030 laying out the foundation and directions for greening the transport.

The public entities, responsible for implementation these documents are ministries, the State Agency for Energy Efficiency and Energy Saving of Ukraine, other state authorities, local state administrations, as well as local self-governments and business enterprises (by agreement).

The Law of Ukraine “On strategic environmental assessment” (№ 2354-VIII, 2018, hereinafter – the Law № 2354) sets up as mandatory strategic environmental assessment of the drafts state planning documents.

Strategic environmental assessment (the SEA) is a procedure for defining, describing and evaluating the consequences of the implementation of state environmental planning,

including consequences for public health, justifying alternatives, developing prevention measures, reducing and mitigating possible negative impacts.

The SEA includes:

- determination of the extension of strategic environmental assessment,
- the preparation of a report on the strategic environmental assessment,
- conducting public discussions and consultations (if necessary, cross-border consultations),
- taking into account in the document of state planning of the report on strategic environmental assessment, results of public discussion and consultations,
- informing about approval of the document of state planning and implementation thereof in accordance with the procedure defined by this Law.

This Law № 2354 regulates relations in the field of environmental impact assessment, including assessment of impact on public health, implementation of state planning documentation and comprises government planning documents related to agriculture, forestry, fisheries, energy sector, industry, transport, waste management, water resources management, environmental protection, telecommunications, tourism, urban planning or land management (schemes) and implementation of which will involve activities, which are subject to environmental impact assessment, or may entail consequences for the protected territories and objects of the nature reserve fund and ecological network, except those that concern constitution of new, or expansion of existing protected territories and objects of the nature reserve fund.

The purpose of the SEA shall be to promote sustainable development through ensuring environmental protection, safety and protection of human life and health, integration of environmental requirements in the process of development and approval of state planning documentation. The SEA is based on the principles of legality and objectivity, transparency, public participation, scientific substantiation, balance of interests, complexity, prevention of environmental damage, long-term forecasting, reliability and completeness of information in the draft document, international environmental cooperation.

For instance, the 2021-2027 State Strategy for Regional Development and regional development strategies (*more about strategies is provided in the answer to the next question*) were assessed according to the Law of Ukraine "On strategic environmental assessment" and respective reports on strategic environmental assessment were prepared.

The State Agency for Energy Efficiency and Energy Saving of Ukraine (the SAE) is the central executive body whose activities are directed and coordinated by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine through the Deputy Prime Minister for Restoration of Ukraine - Minister for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine, and which implements state policy in the spheres of energy efficiency, energy saving, renewable energy sources and alternative fuels.

The mission of SAE is to implement the policy of energy transformation of Ukraine, decarbonization of Ukraine, green transition in accordance with the principles of European policy.

The SAE priorities are to ensure national interests regarding:

- energy independence and energy security;
- decreasing energy intensity indicators of Ukraine's economy, increasing its competitiveness;
- preventing energy poverty;
- decarbonization and reduction of environmental pollution;
- obtaining full membership in the EU.

The Energy Efficiency Fund (the Fund) is a government institution providing instruments for thermal innovations in multi-family buildings where homeowners associations were established.

The Fund provides support in the form of grants to homeowners associations and comprehensive technical solutions for energy-efficiency renovations in multi-family buildings in line with the best European practices. Once implemented, these solutions will not only enable multi-family building co-owners to save on their utility bills, but also to increase their standard of living.

According **to the Law of Ukraine "On Energy Efficiency Fund"** the Fund is established to support the initiatives on energy efficiency, implement tools for stimulation and support of implementation of energy efficiency of buildings and energy saving measures, particularly, in residential sector taking into consideration the national plan on energy efficiency, on reduction of carbon dioxide emissions for the purpose of implementation of the Paris Agreement, implementation of *acquis communautaire* of the European Union and the Energy Community Treaty and to ensure compliance of Ukraine with its international obligations and commitments in the energy efficiency area.

An environmental tax, ecotax, or green tax is a tax levied on activities which are considered to be harmful to the environment and is intended to promote environmentally friendly activities via economic incentives.

The Tax Code of Ukraine introduces an 'environmental tax' that takes the form of "a national-level statutory fee payable on the volume of the emissions of contaminants into the atmosphere, the discharge of contaminants into water pools, the placement of the waste, the actual amount of radioactive waste temporarily stored by their producers, the actual amount of produced radioactive waste, and the actual amount of radioactive waste amassed by April 1, 2009".

Funds from the environmental tax are directed through special funds at the local level exclusively for the purposes of financing, implementation of programs and measures of environmental importance and resource conservation measures, including scientific research on these issues, measures to reduce the negative impact of environmental pollution in the relevant territories and eliminate its harm to public health.

On April 19, 2020, the **new version of the Law of Ukraine "On Public Procurement"** was enacted. The legal framework for relations in public procurement underwent significant changes, mainly due to Ukraine's fulfilling its commitments under the Association Agreement.

The new version of the law provides significant opportunities for developing green public procurement. For example, the life-cycle cost of procured items was introduced among the tender assessment criteria. This means that, when determining the cost of a procured item, the contracting authority has a right to take into account not only the item's asking price but also the costs during its use, including those relating to the environmental impact.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

The Law of Ukraine “On the Principles of State Regional Policy” (hereinafter – the Law № 156) defines the basic legal, economic, social, environmental, humanitarian and organisational principles of state regional policy as part of domestic policy of Ukraine, establishes the specifics of the restoration of regions and territories, affected by armed aggression against Ukraine.

According to the Law № 156 the state regional policy is a system of goals, measures, means and concerted actions of central and local executive bodies, local self-governments, and their officials to ensure high quality of life throughout Ukraine, taking into account the natural, historical, ecological, economic, geographical, demographic, and other features of the regions, their ethnic and cultural identity.

The Law № 156 determines a system of interconnected documents that define state regional policy. **There is a three-level regional development strategic planning system** that includes *national, regional, and local levels*.

The main regional development strategic planning document at the national level is the State Strategy for Regional Development, prepared every 7 years. The structure, development procedure, and implementation mechanism for it is determined by the Law № 156. Two stages are provided for its implementation: action plans for three and four years.

At the regional level regional state administrations prepare regional development strategies which must be in line with State Strategy for Regional Development, but take into account regional social, economic, environmental, and other features. These documents are also implemented through regional action plans that provide measures, amounts, and sources of funding with the definition of indicators of the effectiveness of their implementation. These action plans and those contained therein terms of reference for regional development projects are a prerequisite for financing projects from the State Fund for Regional Development.

The structure, development procedure, and implementation mechanism for it are also determined by the Law № 156. As for now, regional development strategies for 2021-2027, were developed with using a smart-specialization approach. The smart-specialization approach has been applied in all 24 regions of Ukraine. Action plans for the implementation of regional development strategies for 2021-2023 have been approved as well.

Territorial communities also design their own development strategies which have to take into account priorities of state and regional strategies. As of July 2023, 89% of territorial communities have had their own development strategies approved by local councils or are in process of development.

Not only top-down approach is used, but also a mechanism for the bottom-up approach exists. Local interests are taken into account while regional development strategies are being designed, and regional authorities take part while the state strategy for regional development is being designed. All-Ukrainian associations of local self-government bodies have been involved into the State Strategy for regional Development designing process.

The 2021-2027 State Strategy for Regional Development (the SSRD) was approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine in 2020.

The SSRD outlines the trends and main problems behind the socio-economic development of the regions in the context of national challenges as for the beginning of 2020.

The SSRD defines how the state will develop and maintain territories, including urban agglomerations, monofunctional cities, rural areas in unfavorable conditions, mountainous areas, the Azov/Black Sea macro-region, border areas and other territories of our state.

According to the document, 2021-2027 regional policy is strategically aimed at development and unity, targeted to a human being – a decent life in a united, decentralized, competitive and democratic Ukraine. Main goals of the SSRD are:

- formation of a united state in social, humanitarian, economic, ecological, security and spatial dimensions;
- increasing the level of competitiveness of regions;
- development of effective multi-level governance.

Taking into account the strategic goals of the SSRD, regional development strategies of each 24 region of Ukraine for the period up to 2027 and the action plans for its implementation for 2021-2023 were drafted by region state administrations and approved by the regional councils.

In line with the Law of Ukraine "On strategic environmental assessment" the report on strategic environmental assessment of each regional development strategy must be prepared and published. Strategic development must take place on the basis of a circular economy and in compliance with environmental legislation.

According to the Budget Code of Ukraine, compliance of investment programs and regional development projects with the priorities set by the State Strategy for Regional Development and relevant regional development strategies is a prerequisite for financing projects from the State Fund for Regional Development.

The State Fund for Regional Development (hereinafter – the SFRD) is determined annually in the amount of not less than 1.5 percent of the projected revenue of the general fund of the draft State Budget of Ukraine for the relevant budget period.

The SFRD has become an effective tool for implementing state policy of regional development. The fund is divided into 2 parts:

- 1) 30%, which will finance exclusively projects of national importance for the implementation of the State Strategy for Regional Development until 2027. These are airports, seaports, bridges, modernization of railway connections and other state and development infrastructure projects. As well as complex projects for the transformation of coal regions, projects for the transformation of production facilities, etc.
- 2) 70% - for the implementation of regional strategies, subject to funding of projects aimed at socio-economic development of the regions.

The Funds for state support for territorial development are directed to:

- regional development (including the development of innovative economy and investment, human development, rural development, tourism development, all-

Ukrainian solidarity, development of problem areas, effective management of regional development),

- road and transport development infrastructure,
- rural development,
- energy efficiency,
- environmental security and sustainable development,
- sports infrastructure development, educational, cultural, healthcare, social security development, administrative services infrastructure development.

The creation of the Fund allows to move away from the practice of financing low-cost objects of the budget sphere from the state budget and to start financing regional development projects in Ukraine on a competitive basis, by development strategies and action plans for their implementation. Each project submitted for funding must pass a transparent competitive selection, prove its economic and social efficiency.

There is co-financing from the local budget (not less than 10%) of the projects financed by the Fund.

All-Ukrainian participatory budgeting

The All-Ukrainian participatory budgeting is an initiative of the Ministry for Restoration and the Budget Committee of the Verkhovna Rada Ukraine aimed to improve the quality of public decision-making through the mechanisms of participatory democracy.

This initiative became possible after adopting by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine the Law № 3166-IX as for 29 June 2023.

The Law gives Ukrainians the opportunity to choose and vote for development projects of their regions, which will be financed from the State Fund for Regional Development.

The Law preserves the principles of competition, that is, the best of the best projects will be selected. At the final stage, voting will be held among community residents through "Diia" platform. Based on the results of the open survey, lists of the winning projects will be formed, and the Ministry for Restoration submits relevant proposals to the Government for the distribution of the Fund.

In accordance with the Law № 156 and the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine "On Approval of the Model Regulations on the Regional Development Agency" dated 11.02.2016 № 258 **Regional Development Agencies** were established in the regions.

The main tasks of the Regional Development Agencies:

- promoting the development of entrepreneurship (small and medium business) in the region;
- establishing an effective system of project activities, development of quality regional development projects;
- promoting investment activities and increasing the investment attractiveness of the region;
- participation in the development of draft regional development strategy and action plan for its implementation;
- assistance to local self-government bodies of territorial communities in preparation of community development strategies and relevant action plans;
- participation in the development of regional development projects;

- participation in the organization and carrying out of educational actions and trainings for representatives of local governments.

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

Green public administration is a new definition for Ukrainian legislation. **There is no legal framework** for its regulation and implementation.

There are **different ministries in Ukraine responsible** for forming and implementation of state policies in the area of public administration, regional development and environmental protection, ecological safety and perform state ecological expertise.

Therefore, can be identified **lack of effective coordination** tools in implementation of green public administration approach.

There is **lack of knowledge and awareness** of population, public servants about the economic effects of climate change, the importance of the environmental issues in development long-term, sustainable state and local policies.

Can be identified a **problem in collecting relevant data** which can be used for a comprehensive analysis and assessments current situation in different areas of life and providing effective green policies to ensure inclusive growth (balance between environmental, economic and social dimension).

Russia's war of aggression against Ukraine has led to the catastrophic destruction of social, critical energy and industrial infrastructure, caused irreparable damage to the environment and the ecological situation in Ukraine and Europe as a whole, including the waters of the Black and Azov Seas.

Russia's deliberate regular attacks on residential areas provoked large internal and external migration of citizens from their normal place of residence. Nearly 8 million people were displaced across the world, more than 5 million people displaced within Ukraine.

Among those who have left Ukraine, a significant proportion are women of childbearing age and children, their return is necessary for the future of Ukraine.

Countering ecocide is another challenge caused by Russia's war against Ukraine. The detonation of the Kakhovka Hydroelectric Power Plant (the KHPP) by the Russian occupiers is heinous war crime of ecocide, an environmental weapon of mass destruction. Nearly 80 settlements were within the flood zone, and nearly 40,000 people - at risk of flooding.

Before the disaster at the KHPP, environmental damage in Ukraine caused by Russia's war was estimated at >46 bln USD. More than 2,300 instances of environmental damage caused by the fighting were recorded. Almost 500,000 hectares, including 10 national natural parks, 8 reserves, 2 biosphere reserves, are currently under Russia's occupation.

Pollution and poison from the flooded area quickly gets into the groundwater, poisons the rivers, and from there it enters the Black Sea.

That is, there is no destruction of nature "somewhere out there" – everything in the world is very interconnected.

Currently Ukraine is one of the most mined countries in the world: ~174,000 square km (about 30% of Ukraine's territory) remain dangerous because of enemy mines and UXO.

Russia continues its nuclear blackmailing. Russia holds the Zaporizhzhya Nuclear Power Plant (the ZNPP) hostage, violating all principles of nuclear and radiation safety. The Russian invaders installed fortifications on at least three reactors of the ZNPP and suspended the operation of reactors. An additional potential threat to the ZNPP is the uncontrolled decrease in the water level in the reservoir, caused by the detonation of the dam of the Kakhovka dam by Russian occupiers.

The war is not only the current loss of people and the economy, but also has long-term negative consequences for years. That's why public authorities have to revise state, regional and local policies taken into account new objective reality and steps should be taken to minimize the negative impact of these challenges on development of the state.

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Ukraine is in the unique situation in Europe today to have to complete a successful process of reforms, particularly, the decentralisation reform and territorial consolidation, under the severe circumstances of external aggression by the Russian Federation.

The development of described above regional development policy requires a comprehensive analysis and assessment of the current situation related to Russia's war against Ukraine and its impact on the situation in Ukraine in general and in the regions and territorial communities of the country.

During the war, Russia destroyed thousands of infrastructure facilities (destruction is still ongoing, so the exact and final amount of destroyed infrastructure is currently impossible to estimate), including very important for the restoration of regions and their development – airports, bridge crossings, energy system, housing, and social facilities vital for the return of people.

We need a new re-assessment of existing state and local planning documents, including the 2021-2027 State Strategy for Regional Development, as well as regional and local development strategies. A review of our new constraints caused by the war and new opportunities related to the expected EU member status, and develop realistic but ambitious plans for recovery and development of the country.

Recovery of Ukraine is not only and not so much about reconstructing of buildings and roads destroyed by the enemy, it is the full recovery of life in cities and villages, formation of a new economy in view of new realities.

The guiding principles for local and regional reconstruction process from the consequences of the war are:

- to develop a joint vision of sustainable local and regional development, based on the build-back-better principle, which will ensure the promotion of the creation of green, safe, energy-efficient, inclusive, prosperous, comfortable cities, towns, and villages in the process of reconstruction, where equal rights will be ensured for all residents;
- to ensure compliance with the principle of the rule of law by ensuring transparency of cooperation between partner communities;

- to promote the role of self-government, support for developing the potential of regions and cities, towns and villages, building on decentralization and completing the process;
- to involve citizens, local small and medium-sized enterprises, civil society and all other interested parties in the reconstruction process, take into account their aspirations for local development and ensure the principles of equality and people-centeredness, which are key to the post-war reconstruction of a democratic society;
- to support Ukrainian communities and regions on the path of reconstruction and recovery and prepare them for accession to the European Union.

As a result of Russia's attacks on Ukraine's energy system generation facilities (mostly power plants), about half of the transmission system substations, and trunk power grids were affected.

Ukrainian Government strategic goal is to minimize gas imports to Ukraine by increasing our own gas production as well as to increase the possibilities of exporting and importing electricity with the EU, decentralized Ukraine's energy system. Ukraine seeks to increase resilience of our energy grid, in particular through its decentralization, development of distributed generation, increase of the system flexibility and strengthening the physical protection of energy infrastructure facilities. Restoration of damaged electricity and gas supply networks, maximum reorientation from traditional gas supply to electricity – green energy.

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?

The existing legal framework of Ukraine allows local authorities to take part in common projects implemented across national borders but also describes local authorities and communities as the main actors in cross-border cooperation.

The Law of Ukraine "On local self-government in Ukraine" provides that local councils decide on the approval of agreements on the unification of Euroregional cooperation, decision-making on the formation association of Euroregional cooperation, on joining or leaving such an association.

According to the Law of Ukraine "On Cross-Border Cooperation", territorial communities, their representative bodies and their associations, local executive bodies of Ukraine, cooperating with territorial communities and relevant authorities of neighbouring states within their competence established by the current legislation of Ukraine and agreements on cross-border cooperation are subjects of cross-border cooperation. The law allows the implementation of joint cross-border cooperation projects aimed at solving specific joint tasks and meeting the interests of territorial communities.

Ukraine also has a State Program for the Development of Cross-Border Cooperation for 2021-2027, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of April 14, 2021 № 408, which also defines the possibility of implementing cross-border cooperation projects, including within the framework of cross-border cooperation programs within the framework of the European Territorial Cooperation for 2021-2027 and the Danube Transnational Programme.

Approaches for planning of recovery process in Ukraine

One of the key tasks of the Ministry for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine is to support the development of municipalities and regions (oblast) as well as to continue the reform of decentralization, despite the war. Certainly, taking into account the war realities and losses faced by municipalities.

Restoration of municipalities involves not only reconstruction of destroyed buildings and infrastructure, but also creation of appropriate environment for Ukrainians to return home.

The Ministry for Restoration develops and implements a number of digital tools, solutions and mechanisms to administrate and fund restoration projects to ensure transparency of the recovery process.

The Register of Damaged and Destroyed Property (RDP) – a single database that will contain information about all residential, transport and social infrastructure that was damaged as a result of the military aggression of the Russian federation.

The register will be used to provide citizens with compensation for damaged housing, as well as to plan and manage the reconstruction process.

Special commissions created by local self-government bodies and military administrations will enter the results of the damage inspection into the register. The commissions will verify the data already entered by citizens, in particular through the Diia application.

The task of the Register is to form a single official source of destruction data. In the future, these data will be used to substantiate the reparations that Ukraine will demand from the Russian federation.

The Geographic Information System (GIS) system allows for the real situation of damage, recovery needs and development opportunities to be mapped using geospatial data.

The GIS will consist of three blocks: municipality information collection, reconstruction planning, and national, regional and local assessment.

The interactive map will show the extent and location of destroyed property, municipalities with limited access to medical or educational services, and changes in the number of people in various oblasts during the war.

The key point is that GIS will allow assessing the recovery needs of municipalities and monitoring the implementation of recovery plans and comprehensive development programmes to form the basis for an updated state regional development strategy. Some GIS layers are already in operation.

The RDP and the GIS are the components of **the Digital Restoration Ecosystem for Accountable Management (the DREAM ecosystem)**, which forms the basis for large-scale reconstruction of municipalities and oblasts.

DREAM provides a digital route for each reconstruction project, and enables management and control at all stages. It covers all stages of reconstruction and manages investments in development and modernisation.

The DREAM ecosystem implements the highest integrity, accountability, efficiency, and transparency standards in Ukraine's recovery to build trust between the government, citizens, businesses, and financial institutions. The ecosystem is built on the principle of "everyone sees everything". It provides access to open data and creates an atmosphere of trust on the part of all participants in the reconstruction.

The eDem module is one of the key components of the DREAM system, which was initiated by the Innovation Development Center with the assistance of the Coalition of Civil Society Organizations RISE Ukraine together with the developers of the DREAM system – Open Contracting Partnership, with effective interaction with international partners and authorities, in particular with the support of the Ministry of Reconstruction of Ukraine.

The following link provides more information about the DREAM ecosystem, in English: <https://dream.gov.ua/>

Adopted by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine Resolution dated 30.05.2023 № 600 (hereinafter – the Resolution) regulates a procedure of compensation for damage and destruction of real estate objects as a result of hostilities, acts of terrorism, sabotage caused by the military aggression of the Russian Federation.

The Resolution defines and recommends for local self-governments and local military administrations to ensure arrangements for waste management in line with:

The list of activities aimed for minimization of the negative impact on human health and the natural environment during construction work and

The procedure for management of waste generated in connection with the damage (destruction) of buildings and structures as a result of hostilities, terrorist acts, sabotage or liquidation works (Resolution № 1073 as for 27.09.2022).

International “horizontal” municipal partnership

From the first days of the Russian's unprovoked full-scale military invasion of Ukraine Ukrainian communities have gotten support from foreign municipalities as a humanitarian aid, hosting displaced women and children, sending communal transport, power generators, another equipment for providing public services in urgent circumstance.

In November 2022, the Ministry for Communities and Territories of Ukraine in partnership with the Council of Europe Program “Enhancing Decentralization and Public Administration Reform in Ukraine” developed the “Methodical recommendations on international municipal partnership” guide, based on the Council of Europe methodology of City to City Cooperation.

The “Partnership for Recovery and Development” is online-section of the National Portal “Decentralization” contains practical recommendations for municipalities how to choose international partners and establish cooperation with them, how to organize the work of the relevant specialist or division of local self-government, as well as information on financing international cooperation, accounting and reporting, registration of departure of delegations, examples of successful practices and much other useful information.

More information about this initiative is following the link: <https://decentralization.gov.ua/en/twincities> .

The international inter-municipal partnership has reached unprecedented proportions. More than 350 municipalities of Ukraine have concluded 1,500 partnership agreements. Almost 60 countries are helping Ukrainian communities to survive and recover from deadly enemy attacks.

International “horizontal” municipal partnership has become one of the fastest and most efficient tool for solving urgent issues in crisis time, support of de-occupied communities in the process of restoration, reconstruction from the consequences of the war.

The International Summit of Cities and Regions

The International Summit of Cities and Regions conducted in Kyiv in April 2023 and included a discussion of reintegrating Ukrainian territories, overcoming humanitarian challenges and restoring municipal life with the participation of international governmental and non-governmental organisations, in partnership of regional authorities and local self-government of other countries. The event participants focused on sustainable local and regional development based on the build-back-better principle, which will ensure the promotion of the creation of green, safe, energy-efficient, barrier-free, inclusive, prosperous, comfortable cities, towns and villages in the process of reconstruction.

At the Summit, representatives of the local self-government of Ukraine and about 30 other countries, as well as the highest officials of Ukraine, witnessed by high-ranking officials of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe, the European Committee of the Regions, declared their readiness to join efforts to help in building a peaceful, democratic and prosperous future, to contribute to the establishment of a comprehensive, just and sustainable peace in Ukraine to ensure international security and stability of the entire world.

Declaration of the International Summit of Cities and Regions is available in English: <https://decentralization.gov.ua/en/news/16443?page=2>

Twining

All-Ukrainian association of the local self-government bodies "Association of Ukrainian Cities" and the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR) in support of international partners have been organized twinning-related events – online meetings representatives of European municipalities and Ukrainian communities as well as case-study visits of the delegation of Ukrainian communities to the twinning municipalities of the European countries.

The objectives of these case-study events are establishment international partnership at the levels of self-government for the reconstruction of Ukraine in the post-war period, ensure adequate EU funding for twinning through its special relationship with the relevant European institutions. The participants discussed establishing a high-quality long-term partnership aimed the integration and development of Ukrainian territorial communities, international cooperation based on bilateral experience and partnership interaction. European municipalities of Italian Republic, Czech Republic, the Republic of Slovenia, Federal Republic of Germany, French Republic, the Kingdom of Spain etc disseminate its experience of the preparing a project application that can be submitted to international tenders to attract funding for post war reconstruction of Ukrainian communities.

The most relevant topics for disseminating good practice and case studies are:

- energy efficiency and energy independence – using of renewable energy sources (heat pumps, solar panels in communal facilities);
- using of environmental energy for heating or cooling systems (heat and water supply);
- waste management and water recourse management.

APPENDIX**CDDG RAPID RESPONSE SERVICE No. 55****ON EXPERIENCE WITH GREEN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

**Questionnaire submitted at the request of
the Working Group on Green Public Administration (GT-A)**

NOTE from the CDDG Secretariat to responding delegations:

Please, tick the box below if applicable

☐ we oppose communication of our responses to a third party not involved in this work of the CDDG

Context

The terms of reference for the CDDG provide for the following specific tasks to be implemented by the end of 2023: "Prepare a report on green public administration aimed at collecting and disseminating good practice and case studies and identifying guidance for administrations at local, regional and national level, taking into account the proceedings of the 2020-2021 edition of the World Forum for Democracy and its previous work on digitalisation of the public administration" (specific task 3).

The newly established Working Group on Green Public Administration (GT-A) was entrusted with the task of preparing the above work for the CDDG. It held its first meeting on 2-3 March 2023, at which it decided to solicit CDDG members with the present questionnaire to assist it in its work and collect case studies for possible inclusion in the Report.

The GT-A would be very grateful for receiving your responses no later than **21 April 2023** at the address cddg@coe.int.

For any question, feel free to contact in the Secretariat Judith Orland (Judith.orland@coe.int; tel +33 3 90 21 62 43).

Introduction

- For the purposes of this questionnaire, “green public administration” (GPA) refers to decision-making processes at all levels of government (international, supranational, national, and subnational), that integrate environmental and climate change considerations, such as those stemming from the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Paris Agreement and others.
- Responses should ideally be no longer than 1 page per case study and not too detailed. Synthetical and explanatory responses should be privileged over the quoting of long extracts from the legislation and other official texts.
- Links to national documents, studies, reports and further resources are welcome.
- Please note that it would be useful to have the cases entered into the [EDEN platform](#), too.

QUESTIONS

Question 1: Please provide examples of decision making where environmental and climate change considerations are taken into account, at the local, regional and national level.

Question 2: What are the national frameworks, legal structure, or policy instruments to ensure that the decision-making takes into account sustainability, long term orientation, climate/environmental issues?

Question 3: What particular challenges have been identified by your country when implementing green public administration and what have been possible approaches to overcome those?

Question 4: What were the lessons drawn so far by your country with regards to the green policies / sustainable transition processes?

Question 5: If applicable, please also provide examples of citizen participation, leadership, cross border cooperation or multi-level governance in GPA?