Bureau of the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society -CDMSI-BU



CDMSI-BU(2024)04 27 November 2024

Bureau of the Steering Committee on Media and Information 27th meeting (30-31 October 2024) *Hybrid meeting*

Report

1. Opening of the meeting

The Bureau members met in a hybrid mode (in Strasbourg and online); the gender distribution was four women (57%) and three men (43%). The list of participants appears in Appendix 1.

Irena Guidikova, Head of the Democratic Institutions and Freedoms Department, Directorate for Democracy, Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity, welcomed the members of the Bureau of the CDMSI. She expressed satisfaction with the progress of the 'Journalists' Matter Campaign, highlighting the positive feedback received from the contributing organisations to the Platform for the Protection of Journalism and the Safety of Journalists, as well as from other sources, including colleagues and experts involved in assistance and cooperation activities on freedom of expression. She provided updates on the opening for signature of the Council of Europe Framework Convention on Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law and the sectorial and intersectoral AI initiatives being undertaken at the Organisation level. She also informed the Bureau members of the Secretary General's proposal for an action plan for promoting democracy, expected to contribute to revitalising of the democratic processes and strengthening the protection of democratic values and principles in member states. She invited reflections and further discussions on this topic, encouraging ideas to boost awareness on freedom of expression standards developed under the authority of the CDMSI. She stressed that particular attention should be given to ensuring these standards are effectively implemented, including through regular review of the measures taken by member states in the concerned area.

2. Adoption of the agenda and order of business

The Bureau members adopted the agenda of the meeting, in Appendix 2, and agreed on minor changes in the order of business.

3. Ongoing standard-setting work

3.1. CDMSI expert committees' work progress

3.1.1. Committee of Experts on online safety and empowerment of content creators and users (<u>MSI-eSEC</u>)

The MSI-eSEC Secretary informed the Bureau about the second meeting of the MSI-eSEC, held on 24-25 September 2024 (in person). The MSI-eSEC was tasked with elaborating a draft recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to member states on online safety and empowerment of content creators and users, by the end of 2025.

The discussion during the second meeting was focused on clarifying the approach, scope, and structure of the future recommendation rather than on drafting specific provisions. It was agreed that an explanatory memorandum would support a concise, principled appendix. A new section will summarise and elaborate on existing Council of Europe principles and standards that also apply to on online safety, including a focus on the systemic approach to platform regulation. Terminology and definitions and the need of consistency in the use of main concepts in Council of Europe instruments were widely discussed, in particular the definition of "platforms". Feedback by the CDMSI members on their expectations about the type of services to be covered by the future instrument may guide a clearer definition. The notion of empowerment was widely discussed both, regarding its scope and the way to reflect it in the draft. It was the view of the expert committee that empowerment needs to extend, beyond recognising rights to platform users, to enabling effective and safe exercise of those rights, particularly for marginalised groups. Offline empowerment provisions, including on media literacy and education, will also be strengthened. Platform empowerment elements, including decentralised moderation, data access, and equal service access, were emphasised.

The Committee of Experts further agreed on the future work roadmap; the third meeting of the MSI-eSEC will be held on 26-27 March 2025 in the premises of the Council of Europe in Paris, France (in person). The Committee proposed that a revised outline of the future recommendation will be presented to the CDMSI at its 26th Plenary. A complete first draft of the future recommendation during the third meeting of the committee.

3.1.2. Committee of Experts on the implications of Generative Artificial Intelligence for Freedom of Expression (<u>MSI-AI</u>)

The MSI-AI Secretary informed about outcome of the second meeting of the Committee of Experts, held on 17-18 October 2024 (in person). The MSI-AI was tasked to draft a Guidance Note on the implications of generative artificial intelligence for freedom of expression, by the end of 2025.

Committee's members and participants discussed a working document containing preliminary elements of the future draft Guidance Note, elaborated by the MSI-AI drafting co-rapporteurs. The discussion focused on the scope, structure and main elements of the future instrument. The MSI-AI agreed that the Guidance Note should include an introduction, followed by a general description of the technology stack model. The MSI-AI shared the view that the implications of Generative AI on freedom of expression should be analysed in the light of Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights, focusing on "freedom to hold opinions and to receive and to impart information and ideas". Members also agreed to cover other transversal issues, such as loss of attribution, loss of identity, loss of agency, standardisation of expression, scaling and amplification, and loss of pluralism. Finally, the Expert Committee agreed that a final section should provide guidance on mitigation strategies. The Committee of Experts also discussed the potential for including supporting materials, such as appendices and a glossary.

The MSI-AI agreed on the roadmap for future work. The third meeting will be held on 24-25

March 2025 in the premises of the Council of Europe in Paris, France. A first draft guidance note will be provided to MSI-AI members ahead of their third meeting.

3.2. Work progress related to the further expected deliverables under <u>CDMSI Terms of</u> <u>Reference</u>

The Secretariat provided information on the progress made on the other deliverables under the CDMSI Terms of Reference for 2024-2025.

3.2.1. Feasibility study on immersive realities applications and their implication from freedom of expression

The Bureau was informed that an external consultant with significant experience in law, technology (including AI) and international human rights is currently carrying out research and drafting a feasibility study on immersive reality applications and their implications for freedom of expression. Building on the Council of Europe and IEEE's report on <u>The Metaverse and its</u> <u>Impact on Human Rights, Rule of Law, and Democracy</u>, the study aims to address the adequacy of existing protections under existing Council of Europe standards, and whether additional safeguards are needed to navigate human rights and rule of law challenges in immersive realities. A first draft will be presented at the 4-6 December CDMSI plenary meeting for input from the members. After integrating the inputs, a revised version of the study should be presented at the following plenary meeting in June 2025.

3.2.2. Indicators for Media and Information Literacy (MIL) strategies at national level

The Secretariat reported on the progress of the media and information literacy deliverable, highlighting the involvement of a consultant with a strong experience and connection with the community of media education. The deliverable is expected to provide guiding principles and actionable strategies encompassing means to translate these in measurable progress. The Secretariat informed about the participation of the consultant at the Plenary and that a questionnaire will be distributed among CDMSI representatives inviting them to report on practices and challenges faced in member States in implementing media and information literacy initiatives. The Bureau shared existing initiatives at domestic and regional level, exchanged on the cross-cutting aspect of the matter, and highlighted the need of coordination with related ongoing work in the Council of Europe.

3.2.3. 10 steps to counter disinformation – Strategy and practical tools based on existing Council of Europe standards and other instruments

The Secretariat reported on progress of the deliverable on disinformation which is meant to present in coherent and accessible form existing standards and provide elements of good practices for implementation. Elements for the questionnaire to be distributed to CDMSI members were presented. The Bureau members underlined the importance of giving member states sufficient time to prepare answers the questionnaires.

3.3. Council of Europe work towards a legal mechanism to support European drama series production under <u>CDCPP</u> authority – CDMSI consultation process

The Bureau was informed of the latest developments related to the development of a legal mechanism on European drama series co-production. It acknowledged the opportunity provided to the CDMSI for consultation and noted with appreciation that the timeframe for feedback aligned with that of the CDCPP. Bureau members noted however that the timeframe for consultation was relatively short, considering the significance of the instrument and its potential impact on the media sector. The Bureau expressed its expectation to be kept informed on the document's progress and decisions taken during the CDCPP Plenary. The Secretariat was invited to keep the item on the agenda of the next CDMSI Plenary, as a point for information and

discussion, and to invite a CDCPP representative to exchange with the CDMSI.

4. Council of Europe 'Journalists matter' Campaign for the Safety of Journalists

Bureau members had the opportunity to attend the <u>Annual Thematic Conference: Protection of</u> <u>Journalists- a multistakeholder dialogue (29-30 October, Strasbourg, France)</u>, where an update had been provided on the progress of the Campaign during its first year. With 38 national focal points nominated and 22 national committees/ coordination structures/platforms of dialogue (formal or informal) established (14 of which under the Campaign), the first year of the 'Journalists Matter' campaign has set the basis for further work.

7 countries are implementing National Action Plans, while others are planning to do so. Under the "Protection pillar" of the <u>Recommendation CM/Rec(2016)4 on the protection of journalism</u> and safety of journalists and other media actors several events took place in 2024 in addition to the <u>Second meeting of the National Focal Points (20-21 June, Strasbourg, France)</u>. The <u>Seminar: The Role of the Police in the Protection of the Safety of Journalists (26-27 September,</u> <u>Strasbourg, France)</u> addressed challenges in public awareness, stakeholder engagement, and fostering trust between journalists and the law enforcement authorities. Discussions emphasised collaborative measures such as joint training programs and formal agreements between police and media. Good practices and examples shared by national police representatives will be integrated into the Campaign's online resources for broader use.

The Campaign's focus in 2025 will shift to the "Prosecution pillar", with the next Annual Thematic Conference set for April 29-30 in Luxembourg, under the Luxembourg's Presidency of the Committee of Ministers. This conference will be followed by the annual National Focal Points meeting. Initiatives to engage prosecutors' networks and develop synergies with relevant Council of Europe bodies, such as the Consultative Council of European Prosecutors (<u>CCPE</u>) and the European Commission for the Efficiency in Justice (<u>CEPEJ</u>), are underway.

5. Follow-up to the CDMSI's previous work

The Secretariat provided updated information with regards to steps taken following the adoption of Recommendation <u>CM/Rec(2024)2 on countering the use of strategic lawsuits against public participation</u> (SLAPPs), adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on 5 April 2024, including the <u>second Council of Europe anti-SLAPP Conference</u>, co-organised with the ECPMF and the CASE Coalition, and to be held in Strasbourg on 14 November 2024. The Bureau members were informed that the Conference will take place back-to-back with the Regional Exchange on "Countering the use of SLAPPs in the Western Balkans", organised under "Protecting freedom of expression and of the media in Bosnia and Herzegovina (PRO-FREX)".

The <u>Declaration by the Committee of Ministers on the World Summit on the Information Society</u> (WSIS) +20 review and the extension of the mandate of the Internet Governance Forum (IGF), elaborated by the CDMSI and approved by it at its 25th plenary meeting in June 2024, was adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 25 September 2024. The Bureau discussed the opportunities presented by next year's WISIS + 20 review process, which will provide a platform for to assess the outcomes of this digital governance wide-world initiative. The Council of Europe's active engagement over the past two decades was highlighted.

6. Latest developments in the work of the Council of Europe and its partner institutions that are of relevance to CDMSI

6.1. Council of Europe

The Secretariat informed about the follow-up provided on behalf of the CDMSI to the Committee of Ministers in response to two relevant PACE recommendations, respectively on <u>Countering</u> <u>SLAPPs: an Imperative for a democratic society</u>, <u>Guaranteeing media freedom and the safety of journalists</u>, and on <u>The protection of children against online violence</u>.

Bureau members were also informed about the PACE recent adoption of a <u>Resolution on</u> <u>Propaganda and freedom of information in Europe</u>, as well as of further resolutions on <u>The</u> <u>detention and conviction of Julian Assange and their chilling effects on human rights</u>, and on the <u>Risks and opportunities of the metaverse</u> and related reports.

Bureau members discussed potential cooperation with the Council of Europe <u>Partnership with</u> <u>Digital Companies</u>. The Bureau welcomed Meta's participation in the Campaign's Seminar: The Role of the Police in the Protection of the Safety of Journalists (26-27 September, Strasbourg, France), and of Cloudflare at the Annual Thematic Conference: Protection of Journalists- a multistakeholder dialogue (29-30 October, Strasbourg, France). On both occasions, companies provided input on their policies related to journalists' safety via specific programs and products. Future collaboration with selected companies within the Partnership is envisaged to facilitate their meaningful engagement in the CDMSI's standard-setting activities.

The Secretariat informed that the "<u>Freedom of Expression in 2023, Report on trends in freedom</u> of expression in Council of Europe member states," prepared for the Democratic Institutions and Freedoms Department by Peter Noorlander, Independent Consultant and Startup Director, Reporters Shield, will be presented at the CDMSI plenary meeting in December.

Regarding the Council of Europe <u>Framework Convention on Artificial Intelligence and Human</u> <u>Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law</u>, Thomas Schneider, in his capacity as vice-Chair of the Council of Europe Committee on Artificial Intelligence (<u>CAI</u>), provided information on the status of signatures and ratification of the instrument. Bureau members were also updated on the future work of the CAI, especially regarding the elaboration of a legally non-binding methodology for the Risk and Impact Assessment of AI Systems from the point of view of Human Rights, Democracy and Rule of Law (HUDERIA). This methodology is expected to support the implementation of the Framework Convention on AI and will be finalised in the next months.

6.2. External partners

The Secretariat provided information about participation in past and future events of relevance for the CDMSI mandate, including the 28th Legal and Policy Assembly of the European Broadcasting Union (<u>EBU</u>), 10-11 October 2024, Strasbourg; the European Platform of Regulatory Authorities (<u>EPRA</u>), Limassol, Cyprus, 13-15 October 2024; and the <u>RightsCon</u> Summit, to be held in Taipei, on 24-27 February 2025.

7. Preparation for the 26th CDMSI Plenary meeting (4-6 December, Strasbourg)

The Secretariat reminded that a mid-term review of the Terms of Reference for the CDMSI for 2024-2027 would take place on 2025, with focus on the tasks preliminarily approved for the biennium 2026-2027. The Secretariat encouraged the Bureau to initiate an internal reflection in preparation of possible related exchanges in the first part of 2025.

The Secretariat informed the Bureau that the CDMSI will need to elect the Chair (for one year), vice-Chair (for one year) and one Bureau member (for two years). To this scope, the Bureau invited the Secretariat to circulate information on the applicable rules/eligibility of CDMSI

members.

8. Recent country-specific developments in the field of freedom of expression – *tour de table*

Members of the Bureau shared information about the following country-specific developments of relevance for the CDMSI:

- In Greece: a conference on media literacy was held in Kefalonia with the participation of high school students. On the occasion, the Council of Europe <u>Digital Rights Quiz</u> was translated and shared among participants to raise awareness. Its distribution in schools at large scale is currently under discussion.
- In Estonia: following the adoption of the European Media Freedom Act, a revision of relevant national legislation was necessary, leading to the drafting of a new law on national broadcasting. Exchanges with other member states to share experiences could prove valuable in addressing some outstanding issues. Additional details regarding ongoing co-operation activities will be provided during the CDMSI plenary meeting.
- In the Republic of Moldova: the State signed the Council of Europe Framework Convention on Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law, the next step being its ratification. A Media and Information Literacy <u>Strategy</u> was launched by the Moldovan Audiovisual Council in September 2024, in the presence of several national and European broadcasters.

9. Participation in events of Relevance for the CDMSI

The Secretariat provided information on its planned participation in the Internet Governance Forum (<u>IGF</u>) in Riyadh, Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (15-19 December), which includes active involvement in a session organised by Switzerland, also focusing on SLAPPs and the Campaign Journalists Matter.

10. Any other business

The members of the Bureau were informed that the European Digital Media Observatory (<u>EDMO</u>) shared with the Secretariat, for their attention, the recent "<u>EDMO Guidelines for</u> <u>Effective Media Literacy Initiatives</u>", developed with extensive input from members of the EDMO hubs, media literacy experts, and practitioners from different countries, and offering clear and practical principles that should underline new and existing initiatives. Bureau members discussed the document and entrusted the CDMSI Chair to send a reply letter highlighting the document's relevance and added value for the current CDMSI work on MIL under the Committee's terms of reference. The Bureau also agreed to share the document with all CDMSI members and observers.

The next CDMSI plenary meeting will be held on 4-6 December 2024 in Strasbourg, in the Palais de l'Europe.

The Bureau agreed to hold its next meeting in the spring of 2025, on a date to be determined.

Appendix 1

List of participants

Bureau of the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society 27th meeting (30-31 October 2024) *Hybrid format*

SERBIA/SERBIE	Maja ZARIC (Chair/Présidente) Head of Division for International Cooperation in the Field of Media, Ministry of Information and Telecommunications/ Chef de la division de la coopération internationale dans le domaine des médias, ministère de l'Information et des Télécommunications
ESTONIA/ESTONIE	Taavo LUMISTE (Vice-Chair/Vice-Président) Ministry of Foreign Affairs/ ministère des Affaires étrangers
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA/BOSNIE- HERZEGOVINE	Emir POVLAKIC Head of Audiovisual and Media Services, Communications Regulatory Agency / Chef des services audiovisuels et médias, Agence de régulation des communications
GREECE/GRECE	Aikaterini POLYZOU Head of Department for Audiovisual Media & Internet, Secretariat General for Communication & Media / Chef du département Médias audiovisuels et Internet, Direction des médias, Secrétariat général pour la communication et les média
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA/ REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA	Aneta GONTA Vice-president of the Republic of Moldova Audiovisual Council / Vice- Présidente du Conseil de l'audiovisuel de la République de Moldova
NETHERLANDS/PAYS-BAS	Inge WELBERGEN (Vice-Chair/ Vice-présidente) Legal officer Media, Ministry of Education, Culture and Science, Directorate-General of Culture and Media, Media and Creative Industries / Conseiller juridique Médias, ministère de l'Éducation, de la Culture et des Sciences, Direction générale de la Culture et des Médias, Médias et Industries créatives
SWITZERLAND/SUISSE	Thomas SCHNEIDER Ambassador, Director of International Affairs, Federal Department of the Environment, Transport, Energy and Communication DETEC, Federal Office of Communications OFCOM / Ambassadeur, Directeur des affaires internationales, Service fédéral de l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication DETEC, Office fédéral de la communication OFCOM

27th Meeting Thursday 30 October (14:00 – 17:00) - Friday 31 October 2024 (9:30 – 12:30) *Palais de l'Europe, Room 17, Hybrid*

AGENDA

	30 OCTOBER – Afternoon session 14:00 – 17:00
Irena GU	of the meeting IIDIKOVA, Head of Democratic Institutions and Freedoms Department, Directorate for acy, Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity
2. Adoption	n of the agenda and order of business
3. Ongoing	ı standard setting work
3.1 E	Expert committees of the CDMSI - work progress
) 0 (<u>6</u>	Committee of Experts online safety and empowerment of content creators and users <u>MSI-eSEC</u>) Committee of Experts on the Implications of Generative Artificial Intelligence for Freedom of Expression (MSI-AI)
	Nork progress related to the further expected deliverables under CDMSI Terms of Reference
e o I o T	Feasibility study on immersive reality applications and their implications for freedom of expression ndicators for media and information literacy (MIL) strategies at national level Fen steps to counter disinformation - Strategy and practical tools based on existing Council of Europe standards and other instruments
	Council of Europe work towards a legal mechanism to support European drama series production under <u>CDCPP</u> authority – CDMSI consultation process
Information	provided by the Secretariat and discussion.
4. Council	of Europe 'Journalists matter' <u>Campaign for the Safety of Journalists</u>
o F	Progress report on most recent developments and forthcoming work
Information	provided by the Secretariat and discussion.

31 OCTOBER – Morning session 09:30 – 12:30

- 5. Follow-up to the CDMSI's previous work
 - Update on follow-up to <u>Recommendation CM/Rec(2024)2 on countering the use of</u> <u>strategic lawsuits against public participation (SLAPPs)</u>, adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on 5 April 2024, and in particular on the organisation of the <u>second European Anti-SLAPP Conference</u>, taking place on 14 November 2024

	Follow-up on the Declaration by the Committee of Ministers on the World Summit on
	the Information Society (WSIS) +20 review and the extension of the mandate of the
	Internet Governance Forum (IGF)
Informa	ation provided by the Secretariat and discussion.
6 Latest	developments in the work of the Council of Europe and its partner institution
	e of relevance to CDMSI
0	Council of Europe
	 Committee of Ministers responses to PACE recommendations
	 <u>PACE</u> - recent relevant documents, including adopted Resolutions on <u>The</u>
	detention and conviction of Julian Assange and their chilling effects on huma
	rights, the Risks and opportunities of the metaverse and related report, and the
	Resolution on Propaganda and freedom of information in Europe.
	<u>Council of Europe Partnership with Digital Companies</u>
	 Freedom of Expression in 2023, Report on trends in freedom of expression Council of Europe member states, prepared for the Democratic Institutions an
	Freedoms Department by Peter Noorlander, Independent Consultant ar
	Startup Director, Reporters Shield
	 Council of Europe Framework Convention on Artificial Intelligence and Huma
	Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law
0	External partners
C C	 <u>28th Legal and Policy Assembly</u> of the European Broadcasting Union (EBU
	10-11 October 2024, Strasbourg
	 <u>RightsCon</u> Summit, Taipei, 24-27 February 2025 European Distance of Regulatory Authorities (ERRA), Lineapold Commun. 22.2
	 <u>European Platform of Regulatory Authorities</u> (EPRA), Limassol, Cyprus, 23-2 October 2024
Informa	ation provided by the Secretariat and discussion.
7 Propa	intian for the 26th CDMSI Planary meeting (4-6 December in Strasbourg)
7. Prepa	ration for the 26 th CDMSI Plenary meeting (4-6 December in Strasbourg)
7. Prepa	ration for the 26 th CDMSI Plenary meeting (4-6 December in Strasbourg) Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027
	Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views Michael O'Flaherty, Council of Europe <u>Commissioner for Human Rights</u>
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views Michael O'Flaherty, Council of Europe <u>Commissioner for Human Rights</u> European Court of Human Rights, Registry Human Rights and artificial intelligence (CDDH-IA) PACE <u>Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media</u>
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views Michael O'Flaherty, Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights European Court of Human Rights, Registry Human Rights and artificial intelligence (CDDH-IA) PACE Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media Council of Europe Cooperation activities on freedom of expression – Alir
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views Michael O'Flaherty, Council of Europe <u>Commissioner for Human Rights</u> European Court of Human Rights, Registry Human Rights and artificial intelligence (<u>CDDH-IA</u>) PACE <u>Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media</u> Council of Europe Cooperation activities on freedom of expression – Alir Tatarenko, Head of <u>Division for Cooperation on Freedom of Expression</u>,
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views Michael O'Flaherty, Council of Europe <u>Commissioner for Human Rights</u> European Court of Human Rights, Registry Human Rights and artificial intelligence (<u>CDDH-IA</u>) PACE <u>Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media</u> Council of Europe Cooperation activities on freedom of expression – Alir Tatarenko, Head of <u>Division for Cooperation on Freedom of Expression</u>, Platform to promote the protection of journalism and safety of journalists
0	 Mid-term Review ToRs 2024-2027 Preparatory discussion for the second biennium Planned and potential exchange of views Michael O'Flaherty, Council of Europe <u>Commissioner for Human Rights</u> European Court of Human Rights, Registry Human Rights and artificial intelligence (<u>CDDH-IA</u>) PACE <u>Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media</u> Council of Europe Cooperation activities on freedom of expression – Alir Tatarenko, Head of <u>Division for Cooperation on Freedom of Expression</u>,

9. Participation in events of relevance for the CDMSI

Information provided by the Bureau members and by the Secretariat.

10. Any other business

Date and place of next meeting.