

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 18 December 2023

CDDG(2023)22

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE
(CDDG)**

REPORT OF THE 18th PLENARY MEETING

23-24 November 2023, Strasbourg

Secretariat Memorandum
prepared by the
Directorate General of Democracy
Democratic Governance Division

I. Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda

1. Paul Rowsell (United Kingdom), Chair of the CDDG, opened the meeting and welcomed new members from Austria, Belgium and Malta. The list of participants appears in Appendix 1. The Committee adopted its agenda (document CDDG(2023)OJ2) as it appears in Appendix 2.

2. The Chair referred to the letter he had recently sent to all CDDG members, drawing attention to the possibility that the 18th meeting could be the last one.

II. Follow-up to the Fourth Summit

3. The CDDG held an exchange of views with Ambassador Svetlana Geleva, Chair of GR-DEM; Mathieu Mori, Secretary General of the Congress; and Claudia Luciani, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, on the follow-up decisions being taken following the Fourth Summit of the Council of Europe and their impact on activities and internal Secretariat structures;

4. Ambassador Geleva explained that following the Fourth Summit, a series of changes were being planned both with regard to intergovernmental activities and the Secretariat structures. A new committee – the Steering Committee on Democracy (CDDEM) – would be established as from next year, with the adoption by the Committee of Ministers of the programme and budget for 2024-2027 at its 1481st (budget) meeting of 21-23 November, including the CDDEM's terms of reference which included references to the subject of governance and a number of deliverables which would allow the new committee to build on the work of the CDDG, which will cease to exist.¹

5. Claudia Luciani and Mathieu Mori indicated that the internal administrative reform would include a transfer of the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance (CEGG) to the Congress Secretariat structure, whilst continuing to work with the intergovernmental structures. Mr Mori assured the CDDG members that the CEGG would maintain its independence and that it will continue to perform its tasks and implement its cooperation programmes. The reform was aimed at streamlining activities related to local governance and improving the visibility for stakeholders and project countries. In the ensuing discussion, members sought clarification on specific aspects of these reforms and renewed appreciation for the support provided through projects and programmes.

6. The CDDG took note of the information and at the closure of discussions on this item, it expressed hope, that the CDDEM will be able to build on the CDDG's legacy and that activities which had proven successful, such as the ELoGE Label and peer reviews – run until now in close cooperation between the CDDG and the Centre of Expertise - will be pursued.

¹ See <https://rm.coe.int/0900001680ac229e> and for the CDDEM's terms of reference: https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=0900001680ad763d

III. Information from the Chair

7. The Chair gave an overview of the 26th meeting of the Bureau (Strasbourg, 19-20 October 2023), referring to the report of the meeting regarding the content of its discussions on the intended reforms, the consideration of working documents, the CDDG's contribution to this year's edition to the World Forum for Democracy (document [\[CDDG-Bu\(2023\)10\]](#)). The CDDG took note of the information.

IV. Workplan 2023

Final reports on multilevel governance and green public administration

8. Peter Andre (Austria), Chair of the working group on governance (GT-G) and Markku Mölläri (Finland), Chair of the working group on green public administration (GT-A), provided a retrospective overview of the work done since the 17th plenary meeting in respect of the drafting of the report on multilevel governance and the report on green public administration. Additional informal meetings had been held in the summer in order to achieve progress and to finalise the drafts for their possible adoption at the 18th meeting. The working groups had been assisted by two expert consultants, Mr Louis Meuleman and Ms Ingeborg Niestroy, co-directors of www.ps4sd.eu.

9. Following consideration of the draft report on multilevel governance (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)12\]](#)) and the draft report on green public administration (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)13\]](#)), the CDDG adopted these, with some minor amendments. The Chair underlined that the report on multilevel governance needed to be seen as a first stream of work in this area and that the terms of reference of the future CDDEM referred to the preparation of a Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers on the subject, thus carrying over a task of the CDDG which it won't have had the possibility to implement.

10. The CDDG also agreed to make the compendiums of replies to the questionnaires used for both reports accessible online, and invited members who did not wish that their responses be included, or who wished to submit corrections, to inform the Secretariat by 1st December 2023.

Other activities

11. The Secretariat then presented a memorandum (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)14\]](#)) taking stock of all CDDG activities conducted and which would have been completed at the end of the first half of the current [quadrennium 2022-2025](#). The CDDG noted with satisfaction that most of the general tasks have been addressed and that five of the eight specific deliverables will have been implemented at the closure of the meeting with the adoption of the two reports on multilevel governance (deliverable 6) and on green public administration (deliverable 3).

12. The Secretariat presented a further document ([\[CDDG\(2023\)14 Addendum\]](#)) listing the achievements of the CDDG since its inception in 2014. The CDDG took note of the information and agreed that this document would be submitted for information to the Rapporteur Group on Democracy, together with the abridged meeting report, the recent letter of the Chair to all CDDG members and other documents.

13. The CDDG also heard information from members regarding the use, implementation, dissemination and translation of the recently adopted Recommendation (2023)⁵ on the Principles of Good Democratic Governance (and its Explanatory Memorandum) and Recommendation (2023)⁶ on Deliberative Democracy, which had both been adopted by the Committee of Ministers at the 1473rd meeting of the Ministers' Deputies on 6 September 2023. The Secretariat reminded that any additional (unofficial) translations provided by member States will be collected on the website of the Committee of Ministers and linked for future reference on other Council of Europe webpages (those of the CEGG and possibly the CDDEM in future). The Chair stressed that the adoption of these two instruments, finalised in 2023 by the CDDG, was timely given that the focus of the Reykjavik Summit included ways to address the democratic backsliding and the proclamation of benchmarks of democracy: "Reykjavík Principles for Democracy declaration", as an appendix III to the final declaration².

V. Activities on democracy and governance - Committee of Ministers and other Council of Europe bodies

14. The CDDG heard a presentation by Jānis Kārklīņš, the Ambassador of Latvia, and information provided by the Latvian delegation, on the activities and achievements under the recent Latvian presidency of the Committee of Ministers (May-November 2023). The three priorities had been Rule of Law, freedom of expression and reforms as a result of the Fourth Summit. The 20 events or so held under this presidency included a Conference on Good Democratic Governance, held in May in Riga, coupled with the first ceremony in Latvia for the award of the ELoGE distinction in cooperation with the Centre of Expertise. Informal meetings were also held by the Committee of Ministers on the potential impact on human rights, the rule of law and democracy of immersive realities (such as the Metaverse), and on the root causes of the democratic backsliding. The latter, in particular, prompted comments and questions in the ensuing exchange of views. The Dutch delegation indicated that research had been launched on the subject in the Netherlands and that it would report back on the findings when these are available.

15. The Secretariat provided further information on the priorities of Lichtenstein's current Presidency (November 2023-May 2024) and the Lithuanian member gave early information on some future plans, which included the holding of a conference in Vilnius on multilevel governance and resilience in September 2024.

² Link to the file and final declaration: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/portal/fourth-council-of-europe-summit>

16. The Secretariat provided feedback on the recent 11th edition of the World Forum for Democracy (6-8 November 2023), which the CDDG had supported by sponsoring with France's Region Grand Est a forum talk on the contribution of cross-border cooperation to the building of peace and democracy. The overall conclusions of the Forum will soon be available and pending this, the debates could be viewed in replay at <https://www.coe.int/en/web/world-forum-democracy>. The topic of the 2024 edition would be determined in February 2024 by the Forum's steering group.

17. The CDDG held an exchange of views with Gerhard Ermischer, President of CINGO on achievements in 2023 and current general Council of Europe priorities regarding the participation and role of civil society after the Fourth Summit. The Secretariat referred to the recently held first consultation of the Secretary General with civil society, on 15 September. The results would feed into a roadmap for future action to be taken by the Council of Europe to strengthen interactions between the organisation's activities and civil society. The CDDG took note of the information.

18. The CDDG heard an update, followed by an exchange of views, by Kristian Bartholin, Secretary of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI) on progress regarding the drafting of a framework convention on artificial intelligence. After a few more meetings, the draft would be finalised in March 2024, and be open to signature on the occasion of the 75th Council of Europe anniversary, to be held in London in May 2024. The information provided referred to the recent inclusion of some of the CDDG's suggestions to give i.a. more importance to the impact of AI on the democratic functioning of institutions. The CDDG took note of this with satisfaction.

VI. Sharing experience to promote good democratic governance

19. The CDDG held an exchange of views with Arbjan Mazniku, Minister of State for Local Government of Albania about the local governance and decentralisation reforms conducted in the last 10 years with the support of the CEGG and the future changes planned for the multilevel governance relationship between central and local government. The drivers for these changes included EU integration, the impact of increased tourism on municipal infrastructures, and the need for better services at local level; they also included the need to address growing urbanisation and improve the capacity and capability of municipal employees.

20. The CDDG also held an exchange of views, via videoconference, with Vitaliy Bezhin, Member of the Parliament of Ukraine, Chair of the Subcommittee on administrative and territorial set-up and local self-government (Parliamentary Committee on Local Self-Government, Regional Development and Urban Planning). He referred to recent developments of the territorial and administrative reforms in the context of war, including cooperation with the CEGG. At the closure of the exchange, the Committee reiterated its support for Ukraine.

21. Bianca Brétéché, Deputy Head of the OECD-SIGMA Programme, gave a [presentation](#) on the recent revision and updating of the [Principles of Public Administration](#) (first published in 2014), which were launched and promoted at a recent high-level conference on 6 November 2023 in Paris. The update had allowed to integrate new EU and OECD standards, new realities and implementation experience, and a greater focus on emerging topics such as innovation, digitalisation, open data, flexible work arrangements. The subject of multi-level governance was included in the updated edition. In the ensuing discussion, participants pointed to the relevance of the publication for some of their national reforms and activities, and provided information on projects run in cooperation with SIGMA.

22. The Secretariat recalled similar updating work which was currently conducted by the Council of Europe's Committee on Legal Cooperation (CDCJ) regarding the [Handbook "The administration and you"](#), a document which sets out and explains the substantive and procedural principles of administrative law concerning relations between individuals and public authorities with commentary backed up by references to the Council of Europe legal instruments

23. Further oral reports on topical developments and reforms were made by the Deputy Minister of territorial administration and infrastructure of Armenia as well as delegates from Belgium (Flanders), Cyprus, Finland, Italy and Lithuania. These concerned in particular the current state of territorial and administrative reforms (amalgamations of municipalities, decentralisation), the operation of multilevel governance, and projects implemented in cooperation with the Centre of Expertise, including with regard to the European Label of Governance Excellence (ELoGE).

24. Professor Alexander Balthasar, Vice-President for Western Europe of the International Institute of Administrative Sciences (IIAS, based in Brussels) gave a [presentation](#) on the IIAS and its activities by, including areas of possible cooperation with Council of Europe activities in the field of democracy and governance. This international association under Belgian law was founded in 1930 and comprised national sections / associations (composed of practitioners and members of academia). The objectives are to facilitate i) cooperation between practitioners from the public sector and academia and ii) a global exchange of views involving also States/systems not adhering to the classical models of democracy. The scope of activities, originally European, was now global, with the main purpose being the promotion of administrative science generally, including in relation to subject of particular relevance to the CDDG such as public administration; the functioning of governments and good governance; participatory and deliberative forms of democracy. Recent work on the principles of good democratic governance and deliberative democracy were of particular importance to the IIAS. In the ensuing exchange, participants sought additional information and views on experience with green public administration and multilevel governance, how the IIAS saw the potential for the evolution of far right ideas and movements in Europe, among other subjects.

VII. Review of implementation of Recommendation CM/Rec(2017)5 on e-voting and the Committee of Ministers' guidelines on the use of ICTs

25. Rasto Kuzel, Council of Europe expert, gave a [presentation](#) on the results of the questionnaire and the main takeaways of the conference on "E-voting and use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) in elections: taking stock and moving forward" of 16 June 2023³. A majority of respondent countries was still not using nor considering the introduction of e-voting – despite potential benefits in terms of financial savings, access to vote of remote voters, countering high levels of abstentions, among others. This was mostly because of concerns related to cybersecurity and manipulation, voting secrecy, costs, the maintenance of public trust.

26. The Conference had discussed those fears and pointed i.a. to the need for the gradual introduction of ICTs, with pre-election testing, awareness-raising and voter education and evaluations of the processes. Regular review meetings of the implementation of the current Recommendation CM/Rec(2017)5 remained necessary to adapt standards to evolving technologies and facilitate the exchange of experience and good practices.

27. The Secretariat from the Division on Elections and Participatory Democracy provided information on recent and upcoming events related to elections, such as the conference "Role of Electoral Training Centres" (Strasbourg, 28-29 November), with the participation of experts and the Council of Europe actors dealing with electoral matters [note by the CDDG Secretariat: see also the recently created single entry portal to all elections-related Council of Europe activities: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/elections/home>]

28. In the ensuing discussion, the delegation of Estonia referred to the successful experience and broad use of e-voting by the country, since 2005 and the fact that more than 50% of voters were now using it (voting with the cell phone was being developed at the moment). The delegation of Cyprus confirmed that the reasons mentioned in the presentation and at the conference in June had also prevailed in that Cyprus was not considering the introduction of e-voting, especially particular concerns and risks with regard to foreign interference.

29. The Dutch delegation recalled that voting was possible in their country in a number of locations outside the classical polling stations including bus stations and hotels, something which could be problematic in other countries where pressure on voters (outside the polling stations) was a reality.

30. At the closure of discussions, it was considered that future reviews should possibly use more case studies and look at specific challenges connected with artificial intelligence, for instance in relation to AI-assisted deep fake messages and campaign material. The Secretariat also recalled that Recommendation CM/Rec (2017)5 provided for guidelines to be followed only insofar as a country decided to introduce e-voting, depending on national specificities.

³ [Link to the conference, programme and conclusions](#)

31. The CDDG took note of the information provided under this item.

VIII. Accreditation Platform of the European Label of Governance Excellence (ELoGE)

32. The Chair and the Secretariat provided information on the 9th meeting of the ELoGE Accreditation Platform (20 October 2023), as documented in the meeting report (document [\[DG-AP\(2023\)9\]](#)). New or renewed accreditations had been granted to run ELoGE country wide or regionally in Bulgaria, Croatia, Cyprus, Hungary, Italy (Friuli, Venezia-Giulia), Spain (Basque Community). The platform had also adopted an updated set of regulations on that occasion, aimed at more consistent and simpler internal procedures. The CDDG took note of the information.

33. The Secretariat provided an update on the state of implementation of ELoGE in 2023 (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)16\]](#)), which was now run in about 20 countries. It also presented a first version of the updated benchmark (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)18\]](#)) reflecting the adoption of Recommendation (2023)5 on the principles of good democratic governance, a new draft ELoGE Guide (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)20\]](#)), and a new online [ELoGE e-tool](#) that simplifies the self-assessment process, allowing to explore and evaluate the local authorities' governance practices more easily. The CDDG took note of the information and noted with satisfaction the continuing increase in the number of participating States in the ELoGE programme.

34. The Secretariat also introduced a set of draft amended Rules of Procedure prepared by the Platform (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)19\]](#)), for approval by the CDDG, which reflected the changes made to the Platform's (internal) regulations and increased flexibility in the attribution of accreditations, i.e. for a period of "up to three years". The CDDG examined and approved the revised Rules of Procedure.⁴

IX. Activities of the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance

35. The Secretariat provided a general update on the activities of the CEGG, its current set of toolkits (which had reached the number of 25 at present⁵ – see and the various cooperation projects and presented the annual activity report of the Centre for 2023 (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)21\]](#)). The CDDG took note of the information and was pleased to hear from delegations intervening in the subsequent exchange that the support of the CEGG was greatly valued and praised.

X. CDDG Rapporteurs

36. Siobhan Smyth (UK), one of the two rapporteurs on gender mainstreaming referred to the fact that multilevel governance was of particular importance for the promotion of gender equality and that when the report on this subject (see item IV.), particular attention had been paid by the rapporteurs on gender mainstreaming to include references to this.

⁴ See <https://rm.coe.int/eloge-regulations-2776-4265-9848-v-1/1680ad4b8c>

⁵ See [https://www.coe.int/en/web/good-governance/toolkits#%22127630145%22:\[\]](https://www.coe.int/en/web/good-governance/toolkits#%22127630145%22:[])

XI. Other business; XII. Adoption of the abridged report

37. At the closure of discussions, the CDDG extended its gratitude to all those, in particular ministers from member States who have addressed the Committee, States' ambassadors, delegations, and officials, and the Secretariat, who have over these ten years supported and contributed to the work of the Committee. This had enabled it to successfully deliver significant results in the field of democracy and governance at the national, regional and local level.

38. This was to be mentioned also in the abridged report, which the CDDG adopted subsequently, instructing the Secretariat to append the list of CDDG achievements since its creation (see above, item V. "other activities") to the documents for consideration by the Committee of Ministers' Rapporteur Group on Democracy (GR-DEM) at its meeting of 18 January 2024.

APPENDIX 1
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MEMBERS / MEMBRES

CHAIR / PRESIDENT

Mr Paul ROWSELL, Head of Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

ALBANIA / ALBANIE

Mr Arbjan MAZNIKU, Minister of State for Local Government

Mr Aldo MERKOÇI, Advisor of the Minister

ARMENIA / ARMENIE

Mr Vache TERTERYAN, Deputy Minister of Territorial Administration and Infrastructure, YEREVAN

Ms Armine HOVHANNISYAN, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Armenia

Ms Monika SIMONYAN, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Armenia

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Mr Peter ANDRE, Ministry of Interior, Senior Expert for Legal Affairs

Ms Alberina MULAJ, Office of the Vienna Provincial Government, Department for European Affairs

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Mr Vugar ALIYEV, Head Adviser of the Foreign Policy Department of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Azerbaijan

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Mr Grégory STERCK, Attaché, Région de Bruxelles-Capitale, Service public régional de Bruxelles, Bruxelles Pouvoirs Locaux

Mr Edwin LEFEBRE, Deputy Director, Ministry of the Flemish Community, Agency for Home Affairs

M. Xavier KALBUSCH, Ministerium der Deutschsprachigen Gemeinschaft

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

Ambassador Almir ŠAHOVIĆ, Ambassador of Bosnia and Herzegovina to the Netherlands, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Bosnia and Herzegovina

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Mr Penyo DYAKOV, Chief expert, Department "Administrative-territorial structure", Directorate "Spatial Development and Administrative-territorial Structure", Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works

Mr Mihail VASILEV, State expert, Department "Administrative-territorial structure", Directorate "Spatial Development and Administrative-territorial Structure", Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works

CROATIA / CROATIE

Ms Laura HORVAT, Expert Associate, Ministry of Justice and Public Administration / Directorate for Political System and General Administration, Local and Regional Self-Government Sector, Local and Regional Self-Government Supervisory Division

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Mr Antonis ECONOMIDES, Head of the Local Government Directorate, Ministry of Interior

Ms Kyriaki DEMETRIOU, Senior Officer, Local Government Directorate, Ministry of Interior

CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Mr Petr FEJTEK, Senior Administrative Advisor, Department for Strategic Development and Coordination of Public Administration, Ministry of Interior

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Ms Natasha VOSS PLUM, Senior Advisor, Ministry of the Interior and Health, Department of Public Administrative Law

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Mr Mart UUSJÄRV, Head of Local Government Policy Department, Ministry of Regional Affairs and Agriculture

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Mr Markku MÖLLÄRI, Ministerial adviser, Department for Local Affairs and Regional Administration, Ministry of Finance

FRANCE

Ms Camille VALENTIN, Rédactrice juridique, Bureau des structures territoriales, Direction générale des collectivités locales, Ministère de la cohésion des territoires et des relations avec les collectivités territoriales

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Mr Giorgi DIDIDZE, Head of Department of Regional and Mountainous Areas Development, Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Apologised for absence / Excusé

GREECE / GRECE

Mr Georgios CHRYSAFIS, Directorate of Organising and Functioning of Local Government, Ministry of the Interior

Mr Ioannis MATHIOUDAKIS, Head of the Coordination Service, Ministry of Interior

Mr Dimitrios PONTIKAKIS, Directorate of Organising and Functioning of Local Government, Ministry of the Interior

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Mr Barnabás SALLAI, Government Officer for International Relations

ICELAND / ISLANDE

Ms Anna Gunnhildur ÓLAFSDÓTTIR, Specialist at the Ministry of Infrastructure, REYKJAVÍK

IRELAND / IRLANDE

Ms Louise PURCELL, Assistant Principal, Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Pierluigi TROMBETTA, Conseiller Diplomatique du Ministre des Affaires régionales et des Autonomies

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Ms Agnese PABERZA DRAUDINA, senior expert, Local Government Department, Local Governments Supervision Division, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development

Ms Fatma FRIDENGERGA, Deputy Director, Legal Department, Riga City Council

Mr Jānis KĀRKLIŅŠ, Ambassador of Latvia

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Mr Paulius SKARDŽIUS, Senior Adviser, Public Administration and Local Government Policy Group, Ministry of the Interior

LUXEMBOURG

Ms Mireille CRUCHTEN, Conseillère, Chargée de direction, Ministère de l'Intérieur, Direction des Affaires communales

MALTA / MALTE

Mr Emil VASSALO, Local Government Division, Ministry for National Heritage, Arts and Local Government

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Mr Igor PȘENICINÎI, Deputy Secretary General of the Government

MONTENEGRO

Ms Zorana POPOVIC, Head of Department for eGovernment, Directorate for Local Self-Government, Ministry of Public Administration, digital society and media

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Mr Thomas ZANDSTRA, Head of the Democracy Department, Democracy and Governance Division, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

Ms Elze WIERTZ, Democracy Department, Democracy and Governance Division, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

NORTH MACEDONIA / MACEDOINE DU NORD

Ms Gordana GAPIKJ-DIMITROVSKA, State Advisor, the Ministry of Information Society and Administration

NORWAY / NORVEGE

Ms Nina Britt BERGE, Senior Adviser, Norwegian Ministry of Local Government and Regional Development

PORTUGAL

Ms Tânia MOURATO JERONIMO, Head of Department for Cooperation and Financial Affairs, Directorate-General for Local Authorities

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Mr Mihai Adrian GROȘAN, Head of Department, Ministry of Public Labor, Development and Administration

SAN MARINO / SAINT-MARIN

Apologised for absence / Excusé

SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Ms Nad'a FIRÁK KURILOVÁ, Director, Self-Government and Foreign Relations Department, Public Administration Section, Ministry of Interior

SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

Mr Jurij MEZEK, Senior Advisor, Ministry of Public Administration, Local Self-Government Service

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Ms Raquel TABARA ANTON, technical councillor, Ministry for Territorial Policy, Subdirección General de Relaciones Internacionales y Europeas

SWEDEN / SUEDE

Mr Lars KARLANDER, Desk Officer, Local Government Division, Ministry of Finance

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Mr Bertrand BISE, Chef suppléant de l'unité Projets législatifs I, Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Domaine de direction Droit public

UKRAINE

Mr Vitaliy BEZHIN, Member of the Parliament of Ukraine, Chair of the Subcommittee on administrative and territorial set-up and local self-government of the Parliamentary Committee on Organisation of State Power, Local Self-Government, Regional Development and Urban Planning

Ms Oksana PAVLIUK, Head of the Unit for local self-government development and cooperation with Council of Europe institutions of the Department for local self-government development, territorial organisation of power and administrative-territorial structure Ministry for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Ms Siobhan SMYTH, Co-Deputy Head of Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

Ms Kirsty BROWN, Policy Advisor, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

PARTICIPANTS**COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS / COMITE DES MINISTRES**

Ambassador Svetlana GELEVA, Chair of the GR-DEM (Rapporteur Group of the Ministers' Deputies on Democracy), Permanent Representative of North Macedonia to the Council of Europe

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Mr Armen GEVORGYAN, General Rapporteur on Local and Regional Authorities, Member of the Social, Health and Sustainable Development Committee

CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONGRES DES POUVOIRS LOCAUX ET REGIONAUX DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Mr Mathieu MORI, Secretary General of the Congress

Mr Roman CHLPAK, Secretary of the Governance Committee

**CONFERENCE OF INGOS OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONFERENCE DES OING
DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Gerhard ERMISCHER, Chair of the INGOS Conference

Mr Christoph SPRENG, Representative of the INGOS Conference to the CDDG, Initiatives
of Change-International

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS

HOLY SEE / SAINT-SIEGE

Mr Thierry RAMBAUD, Professeur des Universités/Avocat à la Cour, Mission du Saint-
Siège auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

**ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT (OECD) /
ORGANISATION DE COOPERATION ET DE DEVELOPPEMENT ECONOMIQUES
(OCDE)**

Ms Bianca BRETECHE, Deputy Head of Programme, OECD/SIGMA

**COUNCIL OF EUROPEAN MUNICIPALITIES AND REGIONS (CEMR) /
CONSEIL DES COMMUNES ET REGIONS D'EUROPE (CCRE)**

Apologised for absence / Excusé

GUEST SPEAKERS / INTERVENANTS

Mr Rastislav KUŽEL, MEMO 98, Slovakia

Prof. Dr. Alexander BALTHASAR, Vice-President Western Europe, International Institute
of Administrative Sciences, Austria

SECRETARIAT

Secretariat of the CDDG / Secrétariat du CDDG

Ms Alina TATARENKO – Head of the Democratic Governance Division / Secretary of the
CDDG / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of
Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Christophe SPECKBACHER, Administrator – Democratic Governance Division /
Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of
Democracy and Human Dignity

Ms Isabelle ETTER, Assistant

Other Secretariat participating in the meeting / Autre Secrétariat participant à la réunion

Ms Claudia LUCIANI, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Daniel POPESCU, Head of Democracy and Governance Department / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Niall SHEERIN, Administrator – Democratic Governance Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Ms Mary Ann HENNESSEY, Head of the Democratic Innovation Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Kristian BARTHOLIN, Secretary of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence, Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law

Interpreters / Interprètes

Mr Jean-Jacques PEDUSSAUD

Ms Clarissa WORDSDALE

Ms Remy JAIN

APPENDIX 2

AGENDA

| | |
|-----------|---|
| 1. | OPENING OF THE MEETING AND ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA |
| 2. | <p>FOLLOW UP TO THE 4th SUMMIT</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ambassador Svetlana GELEVA, Chair of the Rapporteur Group on Democracy of the Committee of Ministers • Claudia LUCIANI, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance • Mathieu MORI, Secretary General of the Congress Resolution 493(2023) - Revised Congress priorities, working procedures and structures • Exchange of views |
| 3. | <p>INFORMATION FROM THE CHAIR 26th Bureau meeting (19-20 October 2023)</p> |
| 4. | <p>CDDG WORKPLAN 2023</p> <p>MULTILEVEL GOVERNANCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OECD-SIGMA Principles of public administration: Bianca BRÉTÉCHÉ, Deputy Head of the SIGMA Programme Principles of Public Administration Presentation • Revision of the CDCJ Handbook "The administration and you" • Report on the informal meeting (28 June) and the 3e meeting (21-22 September) of the Working Group on Governance (GT-G); results of the GT-G questionnaire and draft Report on Multilevel Governance: Peter ANDRE (Austria), Chair • Discussion, with a view to final approval, of the draft Report on Multilevel Governance <p>GREEN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report on the informal meeting (27 June) and 3e meeting (2-3 October) of the Working Group on Green Public Administration (GT-A); results of the GT-A questionnaire and the draft Report on Green Public Administration: Markku MÖLLÄRI (Finland), Chair • Discussion, with a view to final approval, of the draft Report on Green Public Administration <p>Exchange and proposals from members on ways to promote the above reports</p> <p>OTHER ITEMS OF THE WORKPLAN 2023</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information by the Secretariat |

| | |
|----|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Work during the biennium 2022-2023 and overview of the achievements (April 2014- November 2023) - Recommendation on the Principles of Good Democratic Governance (and its Explanatory Memorandum) - Recommendation on Deliberative Democracy, both adopted at the 1473rd meeting of the Ministers' Deputies, 6 September 2023 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tour de table - information from the members on action planned to support implementation of these new instruments (translation, dissemination) • Discussion and views from the members on the implementation of activities |
| 5. | <p>ACTIVITIES ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE</p> <p>COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS AND OTHER COUNCIL OF EUROPE BODIES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activities under the Latvian Presidency (May-November 2023): Conference on Good Democratic Governance (May 2023 in Riga); informal meeting of 14 September on the potential impact of immersive realities such as the Metaverse, on human rights, the rule of law and democracy. Presentation by Jānis KĀRKLIŅŠ, Ambassador of Latvia • Priorities of the Liechtenstein Presidency (November 2023 – May 2024): presentation by the Permanent Representative or Secretariat • Exchange of views <p>Committee on Artificial Intelligence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exchange of views with the representative of the CAI on the State of work on the draft Convention on AI and its relevance for good democratic governance and the functioning of democratic institutions • Comments of the CDDG on the consolidated working draft for the framework convention on artificial intelligence prepared by the CAI <p>CINGO</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exchange of views with Gerhard ERMISCHER, President of CINGO <p>Conclusions of the 11th edition of the World Forum for Democracy 2023 (6-8 November) and the CDDG's contribution; information on the first consultation of the Secretary General with civil society (15 September)</p> |
| 6. | <p>SHARING EXPERIENCE TO PROMOTE GOOD DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE</p> <p>Exchange of views with high level officials</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arbjan MAZNIKU, Minister of State for Local Government, Albania • Vitaliy BEZHIN, Member of the Parliament of Ukraine, Chair of the Subcommittee on administrative and territorial set-up and local self-government of the Parliamentary Committee on Organisation of State Power, Local Self-Government, Regional Development and urban Planning, Ukraine <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and comments from CDDG members |

| | |
|-----|---|
| | <p>Current developments in member States: contributions by the CDDG members (throughout the meeting)</p> <p>Activities of the International Institute of Administrative Sciences: Prof. Dr. Alexander BALTHASAR, Vice-President Western Europe</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation • Questions and comments from CDDG members |
| 7. | <p>REVIEW OF IMPLEMENTATION OF CM/Rec (2017)5 ON E-VOTING AND CM GUIDELINES ON ICT IN THE ELECTORAL PROCESS, CONFERENCE ON E-VOTING AND USE OF ICT: results of the Conference of 16 June 2023, Strasbourg</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation of the results of the questionnaire and the conference on “E-voting and use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) in elections: taking stock and moving forward” of 16 June 2023: Rastó KUŽEL, Council of Europe expert • Comments and additional information from the CDDG delegations, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - on the state of use of electronic voting and ICT means - challenges and solutions to implement CM/Rec(2017)5 - views on next steps and possible initiatives |
| 8. | <p>ACCREDITATION PLATFORM OF THE EUROPEAN LABEL OF GOVERNANCE EXCELLENCE (ELoGE)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report on the 9th meeting of the ELoGE Accreditation Platform (20 October 2023) • ELoGE progress and implementation in 2023 • Updated regulations and updated ELoGE benchmark 2023: for information • Draft ELoGE Guide: for information • Revised Rules of Procedure of the ELoGE platform: for adoption |
| 9. | <p>CENTRE OF EXPERTISE FOR GOOD GOVERNANCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CEGG activities, toolkits, and cooperation projects Annual Activity Report |
| 10. | <p>CDDG RAPPORTEURS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information on gender mainstreaming; democracy and technology; social matters |
| 11. | <p>ANY OTHER BUSINESS</p> |
| 12. | <p>ADOPTION OF THE ABRIDGED REPORT</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision by the CDDG |