

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 12 June 2023

CDDG(2023)11

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE
(CDDG)**

REPORT OF THE 17th PLENARY MEETING

27-28 April 2023, Strasbourg

Secretariat Memorandum
prepared by the
Directorate General of Democracy
Democratic Governance Division

1. Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda

1. Mr Paul Rowsell (United Kingdom), Chair of the CDDG, opened the meeting and welcomed members – including new ones from Denmark, Germany and Ukraine - and other participants and encouraged all to participate in the discussions. The list of participants appears in Appendix 1. The Committee adopted its agenda (document CDDG(2023)OJ1) as it appears in Appendix 2. The Chair then gave an overview of the 25th meeting of the Bureau (Strasbourg, 23-24 March 2023) and the related report (doc. [\[CDDG-Bu\(2023\)6\]](#)). The CDDG took note of the information.

2. Council of Europe Fourth Summit and impact on the CDDG's terms of reference

2. The CDDG **held an exchange of views on the – then in preparation - Fourth Summit of the Council of Europe** (Reykjavík, Iceland, 16-17 May)¹, with Ambassador Svetlana Geleva, Chair of the Committee of Ministers' Rapporteur Group on Democracy (GR-DEM), and Claudia Luciani, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance. The Committee was informed about the intended outcomes of the Summit, which would include a final declaration, setting-up a register of damage for Ukraine and the "Reykjavík Principles for democracy". The latter was of particular importance as it would impact the new terms of reference for the CDDG.

3. New terms of reference of intergovernmental committees would need to be prepared for the period 2024-2027 and it was mentioned that although committees were not expected to formally prepare and/adopt these terms, CDDG members were given an opportunity to comment. In the ensuing discussions, it was made clear that important on-going work (on multilevel government, deliberative democracy, governance in times of emergencies) would be carried forward and the CDDG would obviously continue to deal with administrative reforms and such topical matters as the use of artificial intelligence and cooperation with civil society. The ensuing comments and questions referred to the democratic backsliding and how to reflect it in the future terms of reference, the intended purposes of the "Reykjavík Principles" and a possible checklist, whether the creation of a Commissioner for Democracy was still considered.

4. The CDDG also held an **exchange on the outcomes of the recent second edition of the Summit for Democracy**, held on 29-30 March and co-hosted by the United States with the governments of Costa Rica, the Netherlands, Republic of Korea, and Republic of Zambia². Tanja Gonggrijp, Ambassador of the Netherlands, and Olimar Maisonet-Guzman, human rights councillor at the U.S Embassy in Paris, provided an overview of the format and thematic segments used for the event, which were: 1) supporting a free and independent media; 2) fighting corruption; 3) bolstering democratic reformers; 4) advancing technology for democracy; and 5) defending free and fair

¹ For further information, see <https://www.coe.int/en/web/portal/-/heads-of-state-and-government-agree-to-strengthen-council-of-europe-ensure-accountability-for-russia-s-war-of-aggression-against-ukraine-and-support-victims>

² For a rapid overview, see <https://www.government.nl/ministries/ministry-of-foreign-affairs/activiteiten/summit-for-democracy>; for an overview of substance discussed <https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/statements-releases/2021/12/23/summit-for-democracy-summary-of-proceedings/>

elections and political processes. Overall, the summit had given an opportunity to take stock of efforts to promote democracy and to renew commitments to democratic values.

5. Ambassador Geleva referred to the thematic [Round Table "Is Democracy key to ensuring peace"](#), a contribution to the Second Summit on Democracy which she co-moderated together with Paul Rowsell on 27 March, a recording of which was available on-line. She and other participants referred to various possible causes of occasional preferences for authoritarian regimes, which would deserve to be further analysed.

6. In the ensuing discussion, participants *inter alia* stressed that the way the private sector had been involved at the Summit for Democracy could provide some inspiration for the Council of Europe's own modus operandi; that principles of democracy should also have a practical dimension; that the preservation of democracy required global collective action and that duplication of initiatives should be avoided. Clarification was also sought on the outcome and implications of the US case "Dominion Voting Systems v. Fox News Network". At the closure of discussions, it was agreed to continue support and contribute to the Summit for Democracy's third edition in 2024.

3. Presidency of the Committee of ministers

7. The Committee heard a presentation by Jānis Kārkliņš, Ambassador of Latvia, on the possible priorities of the Latvian presidency of the Committee of Ministers (May-November 2023 – see also <https://www.coe.int/en/web/presidency>). These would include a) a series of actions in support of the current and new priorities stemming from the summit concerning human rights (especially the way national judiciaries could support the implementation of rulings of the European Court of Human Rights), democracy and the rule of law, as well as support to Ukraine; b) work on the digital environment (completion of the draft Convention on artificial intelligence, the impact of ICTs on our societies, how to regulate social media); c) reform and improvement of the Council of Europe (e.g. increasing transparency and participation, improving visibility), including through the new terms of reference for the intergovernmental work in the period 2024-2027.

8. In the exchange of views, reference was made to the [International Conference on Good Governance at the local level \(26 May, Riga\)](#), co-organised with the Centre of Expertise, and which would be concluded with the ceremony for the award of the ELoGE distinction to Latvian municipalities. Participants sought views on the possible role of the CDDG in supporting the priorities of the Latvian Presidency. The CDDG took note of the call to all CDDG delegations interested to participate (at their own expenses) in the conference in Riga.

4. CDDG's work in 2023

Principles of good democratic governance

9. The Chair of the CDDG and Peter Andre (Austria), chair of the working group on governance (GT-G), referred to the draft Recommendation of the Committee of ministers to member States on the Principles of Good Democratic Governance (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)1\]](#)) and to its explanatory memorandum (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)2\]](#)), stressing the importance of this new instrument, and providing information on the latest drafting work at the GT-G's meeting of 2-3 February 2023.

10. The CDDG gave final consideration to, and approved the texts in principle. It agreed that this approval was subject to the confirmation of appropriate wording in the preamble, relating to the Summit, which would be circulated for final approval by written procedure immediately after the Fourth Summit.

Deliberative democracy

11. The Chair and Markku Mölläri (Finland), vice-chair of the working group on deliberative democracy (GT-DD), recalled the context of work leading to the draft Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to member States on Deliberative Democracy, and referred to the GT-DD's last meeting of 1st March 2023 (report in document [\[GT-DD\(2023\)2\]](#)) as well as to the recent publication of the [Report on Deliberative Democracy \(2023\)](#) which had prepared the ground for the preparation of the Recommendation. The [public consultation](#) on the draft between October and December 2022 had generated some good input and similar consultations could be used more broadly in future. The Secretariat indicated that the EU was also working at present on the subject of deliberative democracy.

12. The CDDG took note of the above, gave final consideration to, and approved the draft Recommendation on deliberative democracy.

Multilevel governance

13. Peter Andre (Austria), Chair of the new working group on governance (GT-G), presented the work of the GT-G as outlined in the report of its 1st meeting of 2-3 February (document [\[GT-G\(2023\)5\]](#)). The Secretariat presented the preliminary outcome of the questionnaire circulated through the Rapid Response Service to support the GT-G and its expert-consultant, Olivier Terrien (France) in their task of preparing a report on multilevel governance.

14. The Committee then considered and discussed a preliminary draft structure for a report on multilevel governance (document [\[CDDG\(2023\)5\]](#) prepared by the GT-G's consultant-expert. It was important that the future report highlights in particular:

- the challenges of political differences between communities and level of governance in a given multilevel governance (MLG) system;

- addressing further essential questions such as: when there is MLG, how can one achieve effective efficient administration, how can accountability and transparency be ensured; why there is MLG (history, identity, language etc); criteria to determine the distribution of responsibilities between levels of government, and the important subject of subsidiarity; although the EU level was important, the report should not go into addressing it in detail;
- the conclusion should prepare the ground for the recommendation.

15. The Committee then agreed to extend to 22 May 2023 the deadline for responses to the questionnaire on MLG to collect information from member States.

Green public administration

16. Markku Mölläri (Finland), Chair of the new working group on green public administration (GT-A) presented the results of its 1st meeting of 2-3 March 2023 (report [\[GT-A\(2023\)4\]](#)) and referred to the conference on green public administration held on 26 April in cooperation with the Icelandic presidency of the Committee of Ministers. Highlights and a summary of the event were presented in greater detail by Anna Gunnhildur Ólafsdóttir (Iceland). The Secretariat referred to the preliminary results of the questionnaire which had been circulated via the Rapid Response Service to support the GT-A in its task of preparing a report on green public administration.

17. In the discussion, CDDG members recalled that the report should give practical guidance without repeating what was said elsewhere; and that guidance could be given in the form of a checklist of good practices, focusing on selected issues of practical value for governments to make policies greener. At the closure of discussions, the Committee agreed to extend the deadline for responses to the questionnaire to 15 June 2023.

Conference on e-voting and the use of information and communication technologies (ICTs)

18. The Chair presented the proposal to hold on 16 June 2023 in Strasbourg, a conference which would support the CDDG's biennial review of the implementation of [Recommendation CM/ Rec\(2017\)5 on standards for e-voting](#) and the [Guidelines on the use of ICTs in electoral processes](#), which was organised together with the Division of Elections and Participatory Democracy. The Secretariat provided further details and an update regarding the practical preparation (including the dissemination of a questionnaire to collect information to be presented at the event), and a draft programme of the conference, outlined in document [\[CDDG\(2023\)8\]](#). Participants would have to attend at their own costs as the CDDG's budget only made it possible to cover some organisational expenditures. Members and representatives of electoral management bodies could be invited by CDDG members. The CDDG took note of, and agreed to the proposed steps.

Remaining items of the workplan

19. The Secretariat referred to the [calendar of CDDG activities](#) available on the CDDG website and summed up the various events to come between April and December 2023, which included – besides the conference in Latvia and the e-voting conference in Strasbourg (see above) - informal, on-line working group meetings of the GT-A and GT-G in June and regular in-person meetings in the early autumn. The CDDG took note of the work plan and scheduled dates until the end of the year.

5. Information from the CDDG rapporteurs

20. Edwin Lefebre (Belgium), co-rapporteur on gender equality, provided an update on the reviews done or to be done, from a gender-inclusive perspective, of the texts prepared by the Committee. Peter Andre (Austria), rapporteur on democracy and technology, provided an update on his participation in recent work of the Committee on artificial intelligence and the state of preparation of the draft convention on the subject, which was now [available on-line](#) to facilitate consultations. Markku Mölläri (Finland), rapporteur on social matters, referred to the importance of addressing the situation of disadvantaged groups in the CDDG documents, illustrating this with the case of disabled persons when it comes to voting or their use of information technologies.

6. Sharing experience to promote good democratic governance

Exchange of views with high level officials

21. Oleksandra Azarkhina, Deputy Minister for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine, gave an update on reforms in the context of war and the preparations for the post-war recovery. The current difficulties facing local authorities included the mass exodus of inhabitants; the displacement of businesses and loss of jobs; and the destruction of infrastructures (residential, social, economic). Reconstruction will be based on three main pillars: good governance, transparency and digitalisation, and people-centred development. She was grateful for the support extended by the Council of Europe to Ukraine, particularly for the assistance provided on the decentralisation reform through the project with the Centre of expertise. The CDDG reiterated its readiness to continue support Ukraine, in cooperation with the Centre of Expertise and possibly through a specific task in its terms of reference for 2024-2027.

22. Mzia Giorgobani, Deputy Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure, Georgia, indicated that striving for EU-candidate status had contributed to good governance and local self-government being on top of the agenda of reforms. She provided an update on the state of the process of decentralisation in her country and the implementation of the related strategy for 2020-2025. Participants inquired *inter alia* about the Georgian experience with the mobilisation of stakeholders and people to make such reforms successful, possible difficulties encountered (aging population in need of additional local services, growing urbanisation to the detriment of remote areas etc) and possible incentives and conditions attached to the State subsidisation of local services.

23. Vache Terteryan, Deputy Minister of Territorial Administration and infrastructure, Armenia welcomed the mutual exchange of experience on the occasion of the conference on green public administration of 26 April. He referred to on-going decentralisation and territorial administrative reforms, including the conclusion of intercommunal agreements, cooperation in the field of waste management, updating of the legal framework, the preparation of a concept note on the process of decentralisation based on the European Charter (to ensure in particular effective cooperation between various authorities and multilevel governance approaches), the sustainability of outcomes etc. In the ensuing discussion, the Secretariat recalled the broad range of support available to member States through activities run by the Department of Democracy and Governance.

24. Agnese Geduseva, Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development of Latvia referred to current efforts to foster good democratic governance through territorial reforms. After the local elections of 1 July 2021, the reforms implemented had made it possible to decrease considerably the number of municipalities, to increase investment capacities, to reduce disparities between communities (to avoid exodus toward larger cities) and to increase the quality of services through regional administrative centres. Likewise, the total number of municipal elected officials had been divided by three and this had made it easier to increase the level of qualifications. The new law on municipalities entered into force in October 2022. A number of initiatives were also developed to support community involvement in various ways. In the ensuing discussion, participants sought further information on the criteria applied for the merger of municipalities, and how the opposition from local elected officials and the population to aspects of the Latvian reforms was addressed. Additional information was also provided on the planned conference in Riga of 26 May and the concluding ELoGE ceremony for Latvia (see also item 3 above).

Congress of Local and Regional Authorities

25. Mathieu Mori, Secretary General of the Congress, gave an overview of recent texts adopted in the field of the environment, upcoming work on artificial intelligence and fake news, including a conference to be held on 2 June in the Netherlands on digital inclusion and artificial intelligence. The Congress had adopted a position paper with proposals for the Fourth Summit, which addressed *inter alia* ways to strengthen the Council of Europe and the support to Ukraine. In the subsequent exchange, members sought further views on the risk of redundancies regarding a Council of Europe damage registry for Ukraine (given that the country had established its own), cooperation between the Congress and other organisations, upcoming work in the field of monitoring. At the closure of discussions, the Chair emphasised the complementarity of work between the CDDG and Congress and invited it to participate actively in the CDDG's working groups.

Administrative Modernisation across Europe, current trends

26. Professor Joachim Beck, Dean of the University of Applied Sciences of Kehl (Germany), gave an update on his research regarding trends in [administrative management in Europe](#) which was being prepared with contributions from CDDG members collected through the Rapid Response Service. The study showed *inter alia* that specific subject areas were in the focus of a majority of countries irrespective of their individual background and context, e.g. territorial reforms, development of impact-assessment in policy-making, digitalisation of the administration, new approaches to promote transparency and participation of citizens in policy-making. Professor Beck underlined that more regular studies (e.g. every 2-3 years), also on specific aspects, could be envisaged to support discussions on challenges in the implementation of administrative reforms. The Committee reiterated its interest in contributing further to the study and seeing the overall results, once it nears completion in 2024 (the study will be available as an open access document).

Current developments in member States

27. Edwin Lefebre (Belgium, Flanders) provided information on the establishment of a commission on decentralisation in Flanders in 2022 (composed of an equal number of members of government and association of local authorities). Its task is to work out proposals for actions in the field of decentralisation. According to its activity report for 2022, out of 61 proposals which had been made, 52 were retained.

28. Mihai Adrian Groşan (Romania) provided information on the implementation of the ELoGE process in Romania with a total number of 58 municipalities registering to take part. He also referred to the second wave of codification work concerning local administration legislation, aimed at unifying and updating as necessary the legislation; five codes have been prepared between 2018 up until now: administrative code; code of administrative procedure, code of local public finances, code of community and commodity services; code of spatial planning, urbanism and construction. Reference was also made to new mechanisms of cooperation between local governments, including associations of communities, aimed at increasing the quality of services and raising the level of qualification of public staff concerned, among other aspects.

7. Cooperation with partner organisations

29. The CDDG heard presentations by Magnus Öhman, Director of the Europe Office at the International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES); Ken Godfrey, Executive Director, European Partnership for Democracy (EPD) and Adina Trunk, chief of staff, Secretary-General's Office, International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (International IDEA). They provided an overview about priorities and working areas of common interest in the field of democracy and governance, particular challenges connected with the backslide of democracy (e.g. disinformation, disengagement of citizens), the importance of combining forces between actors involved in the promotion of democracy etc. Opportunities for cooperation were noted.

30. Sarah Kups, Senior economist, Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs (OECD) briefed participants about the OECD report *Building trust to reinforce democracy* released in July 2022. It was based on the Survey on Drivers of Trust in Public Institutions carried out the year before, to measure government performance across five drivers of trust – reliability, responsiveness, integrity, openness, and fairness. The report provides insights for future policy reforms.

8. Centre of Expertise for Good Governance (CEGG)

31. The Secretariat provided updated information on the state of projects and activities managed by the [Centre of Expertise](#) in various countries and the implementation of the [European Label of Governance Excellence \(ELoGE\)](#). The ELoGE accreditation platform had held its 8th meeting on 24 March 2023, at which accreditations were renewed in respect of bodies running the label in North Macedonia, Kosovo*, Malta, Poland, Portugal and Türkiye. New accreditations were awarded for 3 years in respect of Finland and Lithuania.

32. A process had been initiated for the revision of the ELoGE Benchmark, with the involvement of CEGG experts and a dozen of countries where the label was run. The resulting document would then be presented to the CDDG at its 18th meeting. CDDG members were further encouraged to support the introduction of ELoGE in their countries. The CDDG took note of the above information.

9. Activities on democracy and governance

CINGO

33. As the Conference of International Non-Governmental Organisations would be consulted on the preparation of the Fourth Council of Europe Summit, Gerhard Ermischer, President of CINGO, referred to the preparation of a common position by the Conference. Current concerns of the CINGO included the need for strong statements on the subject of Democracy, including Good democratic governance and democratic participation. CINGO was equally involved in the work of the committee on artificial intelligence and took the view that it was not acceptable that certain sectors would be left out such as security, defence, certain economic sectors.

* All references to Kosovo, whether to the territory, institutions or population, in this text shall be understood in full compliance with United Nations' Security Council Resolution 1244 and without prejudice to the status of Kosovo.

34. It was recalled that CINGO had participated in the launching of the [BePart](#) interactive on-line platform and Mr Ermischer encouraged CDDG members to feed it with further examples of initiatives for civil participation. In his opinion, the current phenomenon observed was an onslaught on democracy (and this had consequences for human rights), not an onslaught on human rights. In the discussion, it was pointed out that the Fourth Summit was an initiative to be taken to better promote and protect Democracy as the third and most neglected pillar of activities. Mr Ermischer also took the view that more needed to be done to promote, implement and follow-up on texts adopted by the Committee of Ministers.

World Forum for Democracy

35. The Secretariat provided information on the 2023 edition of the [World Forum for Democracy](#) (6-8 November 2023), which would focus on links between democracy and peace. A deadline had been set at 15 June for candidates to come forward with proposals of initiatives and CDDG members were encouraged to spread the word in their countries. The Committee agreed to support the event and to contribute to it by co-organising a Forum Talk on cross-border cooperation.

Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI)

36. Kristian Bartholin, Secretary of the CAI, provided an update on the current state of work on a draft convention on artificial intelligence as the CAI was holding its 5th meeting (Strasbourg, 19-21 April) and would hold its 6th quite soon (31 May-2 June). The draft was now available on-line on [CAI's website](#) and although the intention was to have the text completed in September this year, this could be very difficult to achieve given the complexity of the exercise and matters at stake. In the ensuing discussion, members inquired about some of the wording employed by the current draft, as well as whether consideration had been given to granting rights to an artificial intelligence, and how private sector users of AI would be adequately taken into account by the text. The CDDG agreed that further comments would be submitted in writing to the CAI on the latest version of the draft Convention.

Advisory Council on Youth

37. The Committee held an exchange of views with Spyros Papadatos, Chair of the Council of Europe's Advisory Council on Youth, after he presented its role and activities which included advising the Committee of ministers and the Council of Europe as a whole and co-managing the youth sector of the organisation together with the intergovernmental committee responsible – which was something rather unique. In the discussion, he stressed that young people did not feel represented adequately, especially in the light of mainstream rhetoric associating the youth with the future (and not their concerns in the present); more participation was thus important.

10. Other business

38. The Chair pointed to the need to hold Bureau elections at the next meeting of the CDDG and he encouraged potential candidacies.

11 and 12. Date of the next meeting; adoption of the abridged report

39. The CDDG agreed to hold its 18th plenary meeting on 23-24 November 2023 in Strasbourg. It also considered and adopted the draft abridged report. The Chair then thanked all participants for the fruitful discussions, the Secretariat and interpreters for their support, and closed the meeting.

APPENDIX 1
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MEMBERS / MEMBRES

CHAIR / PRESIDENT

Mr Paul ROWSELL, Head of Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

ALBANIA / ALBANIE

Apologised for absence / Excusé

ARMENIA / ARMENIE

Mr Vache TERTERYAN, Deputy Minister of Territorial Administration and Infrastructure,

Ms Armine HOVHANNISYAN, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Armenia

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Mr Peter ANDRE, Ministry of Interior, Senior Expert for Legal Affairs

Mag. Stefan GÖLLER, Legal expert, Office of the Vienna Provincial Government, Department for European Affairs

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Mr Vugar ALIYEV, Head Adviser of the Foreign Policy Department of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Azerbaijan

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Mr Edwin LEFEBRE, Deputy Director, Ministry of the Flemish Community, Agency for Home Affairs

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

Ambassador Almir ŠAHOVIĆ, Ambassador of Bosnia and Herzegovina to the Netherlands, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Bosnia and Herzegovina

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Mr Penyo DYAKOV, Chief expert, Department "Administrative-territorial structure", Directorate "Spatial Development and Administrative-territorial Structure", Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works

Mr Mihail VASILEV, State expert, Department "Administrative-territorial structure", Directorate "Spatial Development and Administrative-territorial Structure", Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works

CROATIA / CROATIE

Apologised for absence / Excusé

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Ms Emily ARGYROU, Trainee, Permanent Representation of the Republic of Cyprus to the Council of Europe

CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Mr Petr FEJTEK, Senior Administrative Advisor, Department for Strategic Development and Coordination of Public Administration, Ministry of Interior of the Czech Republic,

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Ms Natasha VOSS PLUM, Senior Advisor, Ministry of the Interior and Health, Department of Public Administrative Law

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Mr Kaur KAASIK-AASLAV, Head of Harju Region, Ministry of Finance, Local Government Policy Department

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Mr Markku MÖLLÄRI, Ministerial adviser, Department for Local Affairs and Regional Administration, Ministry of Finance

FRANCE

Ms Camille VALENTIN, Rédactrice juridique, Bureau des structures territoriales, Direction générale des collectivités locales, Ministère de la cohésion des territoires et des relations avec les collectivités territoriales

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Ms Mzia GIORGOBANI, Deputy Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia

Mr Giorgi DIDIDZE, Head of Department of Regional and Mountainous Areas Development, Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Ms Alexandra BURCK, Desk Officer, Federal Ministry of the Interior and Community, Division H III 1- Resilient Democracy and Prevention of Extremism

GREECE / GRECE

Mr Dimitrios PONTIKAKIS, Directorate of Organising and Functioning of Local Government, Ministry of the Interior

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Mr Barnabás SALLAI, Government Officer for International Relations

ICELAND / ISLANDE

Ms Anna Gunnhildur ÓLAFSDÓTTIR, Specialist at the Ministry of Infrastructure

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Francesco GIUSTINO, Policy Analyst and statistics at Presidency of Council of the Ministers

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Mr Jānis KĀRKLIŅŠ, Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of Latvia, Permanent Representation of Latvia to the Council of Europe

Ms Agnese GEDUŠEVA, Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development

Ms Agnese PABERZA DRAUDINA, senior expert, Local Government Department, Local Governments Supervision Division, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development

Ms Fatma FRIDENGERGA, Deputy Director, Legal Department, Riga City Council

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Mr Paulius SKARDŽIUS, Senior Adviser, Public Administration and Local Government Policy Group, Ministry of the Interior

LUXEMBOURG

Ms Mireille CRUCHTEN, Conseillère, Chargée de direction, Ministère de l'Intérieur, Direction des Affaires communales

MALTA / MALTE

Mr Vincent VELLA, Assistant Director, Local Government Division, Ministry for National Heritage, Arts and Local Government

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Mr Igor PȘENICINÎI, Deputy Secretary General of the Government

MONTENEGRO

Ms Zorana POPOVIC, Head of Department for eGovernment, Directorate for Local Self-Government, Ministry of Public Administration, digital society and media

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Ms Tanja GONGGRIJP, Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary, Permanent Representative of the Netherlands to the Council of Europe

Ms Puck GORRISSEN, Policy Officer Democracy, Democracy and Governance Division, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

Mr Rob STEENKAMER, Democracy and Governance Division, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

NORTH MACEDONIA / MACEDOINE DU NORD

Ms Gordana GAPIKJ-DIMITROVSKA, State Advisor, the Ministry of Information Society and Administration

NORWAY / NORVEGE

Ms Nina Britt BERGE, Senior Adviser, Norwegian Ministry of Local Government and Regional Development

POLAND / POLOGNE

Ms Iwona WIECZOREK, Director, National Institute of local self-government

Mr Grzegorz NAWROT, Chief Specialist, National Institute of local self-government

PORTUGAL

Ms Tânia MOURATO JERONIMO, Head of Department for Cooperation and Financial Affairs, Directorate-General for Local Authorities, LISBOA

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Mr Mihai Adrian GROȘAN, Head of Department, Ministry of Public Labor, Development and Administration, BUCHAREST

SAN MARINO / SAINT-MARIN

Ms Carlotta ANTONELLI, National Expert

SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Ms Nad'ľa FIRÁK KURILOVÁ, Director, Self-Government and Foreign Relations Department, Public Administration Section, Ministry of Interior of the Slovak Republic

SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

Mr Roman LAVTAR, Head of the Sector of Local self-government, Local self-government, non-governmental organisations and political system directorate, Ministry of public administration

Ms Urška REMIC, Sector of Local self-government, Local self-government, non-governmental organisations and political system directorate, Ministry of public administration

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Ms Raquel TABARA ANTON, technical councillor, Ministry for Territorial Policy, Subdirección General de Relaciones Internacionales y Europeas

SWEDEN / SUEDE

Mr Lars KARLANDER, Desk Officer, Local Government Division, Ministry of Finance

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Mr Bertrand BISE, Chef suppléant de l'unité Projets législatifs I, Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Domaine de direction Droit public,

UKRAINE

Ms Alexandra AZARKHINA, Deputy Minister for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine

Ms Oksana PAVLIUK, Head of the Unit for local self-government development and cooperation with Council of Europe institutions of the Department for local self-government development, territorial organisation of power and administrative-territorial structure Ministry for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine

Ms Oleksandra FURSAI, Private assistant to the Ms Azarkhina

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Ms Siobhan SMYTH, Co-Deputy Head of Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

Mr Mark CORAM, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

PARTICIPANTS**COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS / COMITE DES MINISTRES**

Ambassador Svetlana GELEVA, Chair of the GR-DEM (Rapporteur Group of the Ministers' Deputies on Democracy), Permanent Representative of North Macedonia to the Council of Europe

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE

Mr Armen GEVORGYAN, General Rapporteur on Local and Regional Authorities, Member of the Social, Health and Sustainable Development Committee

CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES / CONGRES DES POUVOIRS LOCAUX ET REGIONAUX

Mr Mathieu MORI, Secretary General of the Congress

Mr Roman CHLAPAK, Secretary of the Governance Committee

CONFERENCE OF INGOS / CONFERENCE DES OING

Mr Gerhard ERMISCHER, Chair of the INGOs Conference

Mr Christoph SPRENG, Representative of the INGOs Conference to the CDDG, Initiatives of Change-International

OTHER PARTICIPANT / AUTRE PARTICIPANT**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA / ETATS-UNIS D'AMERIQUE**

Ms Olimar MAISONET-GUZMAN, Human Rights Councillor at the US embassy in Paris

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS**ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT (OECD) /
ORGANISATION DE COOPERATION ET DE DEVELOPPEMENT ECONOMIQUES (OCDE)**

Mr Sean DOUGHERTY, Senior adviser, OECD Network on Fiscal Relations

Ms Sarah KUPS, Senior economist, Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs

**COUNCIL OF EUROPEAN MUNICIPALITIES AND REGIONS (CEMR) /
CONSEIL DES COMMUNES ET REGIONS D'EUROPE (CCRE)**

Apologised for absence / Excusé

GUEST SPEAKERS / INTERVENANTS

Prof. Joachim BECK, President of the University of Applied Sciences Kehl (Germany)

Mr Magnus ÖHMAN, Director, Regional Europe Office, [International Foundation for Electoral Systems \(IFES\)](#)

Mr Ken GODFREY, Executive Director, [European Partnership for Democracy \(EPD\)](#)

Ms Adina TRUNK, chief of staff, Secretary-General's Office, [International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance \(International IDEA\)](#)

Mr Spyros PAPADATOS, Chair of the Advisory Council of Youth

SECRETARIAT**Secretariat of the CDDG / Secrétariat du CDDG**

Ms Alina TATARENKO – Head of the Democratic Governance Division / Secretary of the CDDG / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Christophe SPECKBACHER, Administrator – Democratic Governance Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Ms Judith ORLAND, Democratic Governance Division – Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance - Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Ms Isabelle ETTER, Assistant

Other Secretariat participating in the meeting /Autre Secrétariat participant à la réunion

Ms Claudia LUCIANI, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Daniel POPESCU, Head of Democracy and Governance Department / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Niall SHEERIN, Administrator – Democratic Governance Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Ms Mary Ann HENNESSEY, Head of the Democratic Innovation Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity

Mr Kristian BARTHOLIN, Secretary of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence, Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law

Interpreters / Interprètes

Mr Grégoire DEVICTOR

Ms Rémy JAIN

Ms Pascale MICHLIN

APPENDIX 2

AGENDA

1.	Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda
2.	<p>Council of Europe Fourth Summit & impact on the CDDG's terms of reference</p> <p>Exchange of views on the Reykjavik Summit with: Ambassador Svetlana GELEVA, Chair of GR-DEM and Claudia LUCIANI, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Views of CDDG members on 2024-2027 Terms of Reference <p>2nd Summit for Democracy <i>Hosted by the USA, the Netherlands and other partners</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Outcomes of the 2nd Summit for Democracy: Loek TEN HAGEN, Deputy Permanent Representative of the Netherlands; Olimar MAISONET-GUZMAN, US Department of State • Results of the online thematic Roundtable "Is Democracy key to ensuring peace"? (27 March) • Decision on possible future action
3.	<p>Presidency of the Committee of ministers</p> <p>Priorities of the Latvian presidency: presentation by Jānis KĀRKLIŅŠ, Ambassador of Latvia</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exchange of views
4.	<p>CDDG workplan 2023</p> <p>Principles of good democratic governance</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For approval: Draft Recommendation on the Principles of Good Democratic Governance and its Explanatory Memorandum <p>Deliberative democracy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For approval: Draft Recommendation on Deliberative Democracy • Report on the 4th meeting (1 March 2023) of the GT-DD: Markku MÖLLÄRI, Vice-Chair (Finland) <p>Multilevel governance</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report on the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Governance (GT-G), 2-3 February: Peter ANDRE, Chair (Austria). Results of the MLG questionnaire • Views from members on a draft report on multilevel governance, and subsequent draft recommendation <p>Green public administration</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report on the 1st meeting (2-3 March 2023) of the GT-A: Markku MÖLLÄRI, Chair (Finland). Results of the GPA questionnaire • Highlights and summary of the Conference on Green Public Administration (26 April): Anna Gunnhildur ÓLAFSDÓTTIR, Icelandic CDDG member • Views from members on the scope of the draft Report on Green Public Administration

	<p>Conference on e-voting and use of ICT 16 June 2023, Strasbourg</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update on preparation of the Conference on the implementation of CM Rec(2017)5 on e-voting and CM Guidelines on ICT in the electoral process • To note and agree proposed actions by CDDG members <p>Remaining items of the workplan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Confirmation of activities April-December 2023 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Information by the Secretariat
5.	<p>CDDG rapporteurs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information on gender mainstreaming; democracy and technology; social matters
6.	<p>Sharing experience to promote good democratic governance</p> <p>Exchange of views with high level officials:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Oleksandra AZARKHINA, Deputy Minister for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development, Ukraine • Mzia GIORGOBANI, Deputy Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure, Georgia • Vache TERTERYAN, Deputy Minister of Territorial Administration and infrastructure, Armenia • Agnese GEDUŠEVA, Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development, Latvia <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and comments from CDDG members <p>Congress of Local and Regional Authorities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exchange of views with Mathieu MORI, Secretary General <p>Administrative Modernisation across Europe, current trends</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation by Prof. Joachim BECK, President of the University of Applied Sciences Kehl (Germany) • Discussion <p>Current developments in member States</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contributions by CDDG members (throughout the meeting)
7.	<p>Cooperation with partner organisations</p> <p>Exchanges of views with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Magnus ÖHMAN, Director, Regional Europe Office, International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES) • Ken GODFREY, Executive Director, European Partnership for Democracy (EPD) • Adina TRUNK, chief of staff, Secretary-General's Office, International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (International IDEA) • Sarah KUPS: OECD report <i>Building trust to reinforce democracy</i>; Sean DOUGHERTY: update on OECD work

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Questions and comments from CDDG members
8.	<p>Centre of expertise for good governance</p> <p>Cooperation projects</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update on cooperation projects <p>ELoGE (European Label of Governance Excellence)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input from the 8th meeting of the ELoGE Accreditation Platform (24 March 2023) and other recent developments • Discussion and decision on actions by CDDG members to promote ELoGE
9.	<p>Activities on democracy and governance</p> <p>CINGO</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exchange of views with Gerhard ERMISCHER, President of CINGO; CINGO's contribution to the Fourth Summit <p>World Forum for Democracy (6-8 November 2023)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion on a possible CDDG contribution <p>Committee of ministers and other Council of Europe bodies</p> <p>Committee on Artificial Intelligence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion with Mr Kristian BARTHOLIN, Secretary of the CAI • Questions, comments, and decision on inputs from CDDG into the Framework Convention on Artificial Intelligence, Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law <p>Advisory Council on Youth</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exchange of views with Spyros PAPADATOS, Chair
10.	Any other business
11.	Date of the next meeting - Proposed dates: 7-8 December
12.	<p>Adoption of the abridged report</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision by CDDG