

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 17 May 2021

CDDG(2021)12

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE  
(CDDG)**

**REPORT OF THE 13<sup>th</sup> PLENARY MEETING**

**15-16 April 2021, by videoconference**

Secretariat Memorandum  
prepared by the  
Directorate General of Democracy  
Democratic Governance Division

## **1. Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda**

The meeting was opened with Mr Markku Mölläri (Finland) in the Chair. He welcomed members and other participants. The list of participants appears in Appendix I. The Committee adopted its agenda as it appears in Appendix II.

## **2. Information on recent activities and developments**

The Committee heard a statement by the Chair, in which he stressed *inter alia* the impact of the lack of personal contacts caused by on-line meetings, the importance of topics to be debated at this meeting and the need for active participation. He gave an overview of discussions held in the last meeting of the Bureau in its new composition and referred to document [CDDG-Bu\(2021\)10](#) for further information.

### ***Exchange of views with Ms Claudia Luciani, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance***

Ms Luciani informed the Committee that other bodies of the Council of Europe were also experiencing frustration for not being able to hold meetings in-person and she encouraged CDDG members and participants, notwithstanding this, to take the floor. She was delighted to see that the CDDG was dealing with an increasing variety and complexity of topics which required a broad range of inputs and expertise.

Referring to the recent introduction of a quadrennial planning of activities by the Secretary General, Ms Luciani acknowledged the difficulty of such an exercise and stressed the importance of setting priorities with sharp and pertinent deliverables. As regards in particular the Committee's work on new technologies, the CDDG needed both to maintain a good horizontal cooperation, for instance with the Ad Hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAHAI), and to be able to work itself on such subject-matters given their potential, specific impact on the working methods of public bodies and, ultimately, on democratic governance. She recalled the importance of knowledge and experience sharing on the ground, especially through a close cooperation with the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance, the European Label of Governance Excellence (ELoGE), the Rapid Response Service and other activities. As regards the Centre in particular, Ms Luciani updated the Committee on on-going negotiations with donors and possible funding opportunities.

### ***Information by the Secretariat***

The Secretariat presented the order of business and referred members and participants to the working documents available on the webpage of the 13<sup>th</sup> meeting and on the KUDO platform. The importance of active participation of all attendees was reiterated.

The CDDG took note of the above information and the order of business.

### **3. State of implementation of the CDDG activities according to its terms of reference 2020-2021**

The Secretariat presented the state of implementation of activities with regard to the terms of reference for 2020-2021, as outlined in document [CDDG\(2021\)1](#). In respect of the general tasks, it was worth underlining the success of the Rapid Response Service, the work on the interplay between technology and democracy, the fostering of interactions with the Centre of Expertise and the ability of the Committee to assert itself in relation to the subject of democratic governance, especially through the work on Covid-19. Regarding the specific tasks, the work in progress would allow the Committee to complete the first specific task during this meeting, and the second and third ones at its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting. It was also important for the Committee to give more visibility to its earlier work such as the Committee of Ministers' Recommendation on Guidelines on public ethics, for instance by means of dissemination and translation into various national languages.

The Secretariat presented a draft revised work plan for 2021 (document [CDDG\(2021\)2](#)), which provided for an additional meeting of each working group before the summer, thanks to savings generated by the on-line meetings. The Bureau had also agreed to holding additional on-line informal consultations between its meetings.

The Committee took note with satisfaction of the progress made in the implementation of its terms of reference 2020-2021. It approved the modified work plan for 2021 and took note of the revised provisional calendar of meetings.

#### ***Democracy and technology***

The Committee heard an oral presentation by Mr Almir Šahović, Chair of the Working Group on democracy and technology (GT-DT) on the overall progress of work and the outcome of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the GT-DT (document [GT-DT\(2021\)3](#)).

The Committee heard an oral report by Mr Peter Andre, Rapporteur on democracy and technology, on the work of the Ad Hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAHAI) and its working groups (document [CDDG\(2021\)3](#)), in which he participated as the representative of the CDDG. He pointed out that the CAHAI had adopted in the beginning of the year the study on the feasibility of adopting a set of legal standards on artificial intelligence. It was important for the CDDG to keep the subject under consideration to fill any important gaps in its own area of work in future.

The CDDG took note of the information.

As regards **task i "Preparation of a study on the impact of digital transformation on democracy and good governance"**, Mr Šahović presented the final draft prepared by the GT-DT based on contributions of members, hearings with experts and the expert contribution by Prof. Ines Mergel (University of Konstanz). The Secretariat explained the latest changes which had been made following the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the GT-DT. CDDG members were invited to check the accuracy of information and to give further consideration to the conclusions in particular.

During the ensuing discussion, proposals for amendment were made and the Committee approved in substance the study. It agreed that it should be submitted for final approval by written procedure so as to allow members to submit additional amendments by 25 April 2021 at the latest.

As regards **task ii “Developing standards on new technologies and the different stages of the electoral process (including voter registration, transmission and tabulation of results, etc.) in the form of a Committee of Ministers’ recommendation or guidelines”**, the Committee held an exchange of views with Mr José Luis Vargas Valdez, Judge at the Federal Electoral Tribunal, and member of the Venice Commission, following his presentation of the Study of the Venice Commission on [“Principles for a fundamental rights-compliant use of digital technologies in electoral processes”](#). The study, which had been adopted by the Venice Commission in December 2020, concluded a four-year work, and confirmed that digital technologies pose a series of challenges in the context of elections. The result of the work was a set of eight fundamental principles, that needed to be translated into concrete provisions and requirements. In the discussion, participants sought additional clarification on some of the principles.

Furthermore, the Chair and the Secretariat introduced the on-going work of the CDDG on task ii, recalling that the CDDG had agreed to prepare a set of guidelines, rather than a draft recommendation. To prepare this work a questionnaire had been sent to CDDG members. The technicality of the subject had required to hold informal consultations with election management bodies (EMBs) and the involvement of three expert consultants assisting the GT-DT.

Ms Ardita Driza Maurer, University of Zurich, Switzerland, gave a presentation on the results of the work done so far, the answers to the questionnaire provided by 24 countries (document [CDDG\(2021\)5](#)), the preliminary structure of the guidelines and their scope (which would not cover e-campaigning, e-voting and e-counting as these subjects were dealt with by other Council of Europe bodies and/or texts), as outlined in document [CDDG\(2021\)6](#).

Mr Robert Krimmer, University of Tartu, Estonia, pointed out that the use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) in elections and by EMBs was often the result of their active promotion by the industry, with ICT businesses thus becoming a new important actor in the field. This could lead to a dilution of responsibilities and accountability of public bodies. Therefore, EMBs needed to remain in control of this evolution by developing their own expertise, instead of relying on the business sector.

Ms Melanie Volkamer, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Germany, stressed in her presentation the importance of security and usability / user-centred approaches of ICT technologies in electoral matters, and the need to adopt adequate methodologies when preparing for the introduction of a new technology based on risk assessments and security objectives.

In the ensuing discussion, participants echoed the challenges and questions raised by the involvement of leading businesses in the management of elections (transparency, access of civil society to information, public trust). Comments emphasised *inter alia* the need for clear regulations and commitments in relation to the use of ICTs and the involvement of actors from the industry and the need for risk/benefit assessments from a general interest perspective. Participants also sought clarification on various matters such as the use of artificial intelligence in elections including by social media. The document under discussion was welcomed as a good working basis and the Committee agreed to examine a more developed version of the document at its 14th meeting, in view of its final approval.

### **Democratic accountability**

In the absence, for medical reasons, of Mr Paul-Henri Philips, Chair of the Working Group on accountability (GT-RE), the Secretariat informed the Committee on the progress of work of the GT-RE at its last meeting (document [GT-RE\(2021\)2](#)). The Working Group had discussed a first draft of the recommendation for the Committee of Ministers on the accountability of elected officials and bodies at local and regional level (document [CDDG\(2021\)7](#) and [Addendum](#) compiling earlier responses from delegations to a questionnaire). A revised version would be prepared and discussed at the additional meeting of the Working Group in June.

The Committee heard a presentation by Mr Jorge Valladares, Research and Policy Expert, Political Integrity, Transparency International (international secretariat) in which he referred to what should be seen as important elements for a framework on accountability (e.g. links between the various stakeholders and actors irrespective of elections, the importance of transparency also in the light of recent developments and best practice). The focus of the recommendation on the local and regional level was running the risk of dissimulating the importance and possibly problematic nature of interactions with the central level given the variety of national contexts. Mr Valladares also made suggestions for more specific guidelines on such issues as the importance of checks and balance mechanisms prior to the triggering of sanctions and remedial measures, and of infrastructures for engaging citizens.

In the ensuing discussion of the draft recommendation, participants commented on the need to look at the various stages of the accountability process and to the issue of trust and accountability broadly (beyond the local and regional level), the current crisis of confidence between voters and elected officials in many countries, the accessibility and understandability of information available to stakeholders including preparatory work such as impact studies (at least in larger communities), the relevance of the sanction of ineligibility, the need to involve more closely the Congress in the drafting work. The Committee agreed to examine a revised version of the document at its 14th meeting, in view of its final approval.

#### **4. Promoting democratic governance through shared experience**

##### ***Exchange of views with Mr Viacheslav Nehoda, Deputy Minister for Communities and Territories Development, Ukraine***

Mr Viacheslav Nehoda gave a presentation on the accomplishments of the decentralisation reforms implemented in his country and the objectives for 2021-2024.

Before 2014 Ukraine had to deal with the consequences of a problematic administrative and territorial structure, e.g. too many entities of limited size and capacity, authorities with limited autonomy, absence of executive bodies at regional and district level, limited participation of citizens. After enacting various reforms, which appeared to receive increasing popular support in opinion polls done at regular interval by the Council of Europe, improvements had been achieved and local budget revenues had quadrupled between 2014 and 2020.

By 2020, the number of local communities in Ukraine had decreased to 1470 (11 520 before the reform). The goals for the period 2021-2024 included financial decentralisation, the establishment of centres for administrative services in each community and the introduction of a modern system of statistical data collection. Overall, the reforms in Ukraine were considered by many as an inspiring example. Mr Nehoda also praised the cooperation with the Council of Europe in support of these reforms. During the ensuing questions and answers session, the digitalisation in local administrations, the criteria applied for the amalgamation process and the popularity of the reforms were discussed, among other matters.

##### ***Exchange of views with Mr Frederic Vallier, Secretary General of the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR)***

In his presentation, Mr Frederic Vallier focused on the CEMR's work with regard to democratic governance in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic and the experience of its national associations.

In April 2020, a Covid-19 task force was set-up to provide a platform where CEMR's members could regularly discuss their handling of the crisis and its consequences at the subnational level. CEMR's website and information bulletins were an important means to support exchanges of experience across Europe. Over time there was an evolution in the way the crisis was managed. Early on in the pandemic, there was the increasing role of central authorities (with the imposition of State-led initiatives and where at times, these initiatives were not accompanied by the necessary funding to local governments), however in recent months, this has given way to a more decentralised approach in several countries.

In its work, the CEMR had confirmed the importance of multilevel governance, as did the Council of Europe and the OECD. The EU even had made it a criterion – albeit not a strict requirement - for the awarding of European aid but it had met significant resistance from member States.

In the ensuing discussions, participants sought additional information on any benchmarking used by the CEMR (for instance on how public funds had supported the recovery) and whether variations had been observed in the quality of multi-level governance depending on the number of territorial levels. Mr Valier in conclusion reiterated the importance of partnership in governance, including between entities of the same territorial level, for the delivery of services, the management of resources, the implementation of vaccination campaigns etc.

### ***Presentation of current developments or ongoing reforms by members of the CDDG***

During the meeting, delegations were given various opportunities under the present item and in-between others, to inform the Committee about developments or ongoing reforms in their respective countries. The delegations of Belgium (Flanders), Finland, Latvia and the United Kingdom took the floor and referred *inter alia* to: the government's plans to support economic recovery and growth through initiatives at local and a regional level, aspects of the current reorganisation of governmental services, the state of play as regards the territorial reforms and the creation of new territorial divisions (Latvia) or administrative regions as a third territorial level (Finland), trends as regards cooperation between public authorities and the organisation of elections in the current context.

## **5. Introduction of a 4-year Strategic Framework**

Mr Daniel Popescu, Head of the Democracy and Governance Department, and the Secretariat of the CDDG, briefed the members and participants about the implications of the future 4-year approach and strategic priorities outlined by the Secretary General in her document SG/Inf(2020)34. This was particularly important for the definition of the terms of reference of the CDDG for the period 2022-2025, the identification of deliverables and the setting of priorities.

The Secretariat presented document [CDDG\(2021\)8](#) which contained draft terms of reference.

Participants then discussed the opportunity of merging certain tasks (which a majority rejected), and highlighted the importance of activities on the ground and of the drafting of a recommendation for the Committee of Ministers based on the 12 Principles of Democratic Governance, which would also refer to the central level, as well as a recommendation and guidelines on multilevel governance, not just in relation to the management of the consequences of the health crisis.

Participants also agreed on the importance of pursuing work in relation to the management of the health crisis and lessons learnt in that context (including measures and policies to emerge from the crisis), the green agenda and "greening public administrations" (including the implications for democracy and governance of pursuing such an agenda), the social agenda, information technologies and artificial intelligence.

The Secretariat provided further explanations and clarification concerning the now-standard item in all terms of reference of steering committees on reviewing progress towards the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (UNSDGs), and how constraints regarding resources made it difficult to embark on frequent reviews of the implementation of Committee of Ministers' Recommendation (2017)5 on e-voting.

## **6. Activities of the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance**

The Committee heard a presentation by Ms Alina Tatarenko, Head of the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance, on cooperation activities of the Centre regarding Armenia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Estonia, Greece, Lithuania, Malta, Poland, the Slovak Republic, Serbia, Ukraine. She also referred to the European Label of Governance Excellence (ELoGE), including recent decisions of the European Stakeholders' Platform to renew and grant new ELoGE accreditations. Participants took note of the information provided and expressed appreciation for the work of the Centre of Expertise.

## **7. Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers**

Due to lack of time, the item was postponed and the Chair asked the German and the Hungarian delegations to submit material in writing about the activities of the German Presidency (November 2020-May 2021) and the priorities of the forthcoming Hungarian Presidency (May-November 2021), for their dissemination to all CDDG members after the meeting.

## **8. Activities of the Committee of Ministers and other Council of Europe bodies**

The Secretariat presented a memorandum on activities of particular interest to the CDDG carried out by other Council of Europe bodies since the 12<sup>th</sup> meeting (document [CDDG\(2021\)9](#)). The Committee took note of the information contained therein.

### ***Exchange of views with Ambassador Mårten Ehnberg, Permanent Representative of Sweden, Chair of the Committee of Ministers' Rapporteur Group on Democracy (GR-DEM).***

Ambassador Ehnberg, who has been chairing the GR-DEM since 2020, provided general information on the tasks of the rapporteur groups (there were seven in total), and the GR-DEM specifically. He stressed that the Committee was seeing the CDDG as an important contributor and forum to discuss such matters as administrative reforms including at local and regional level, and governance-related issues in general. In response to questions from participants, Ambassador Ehnberg emphasised the importance of maintaining trust in new technologies, electoral processes, the dialogue with civil society, and he referred to the added value of peer reviews at national and local level. Important links existed between the green agenda and good governance, for instance in relation to the good practice of environmental impact assessments and environment mainstreaming in public policy-making. At the suggestion of CDDG members, Ambassador Ehnberg expressed interest in and readiness to further raise awareness in the Committee of Ministers about the potentialities of the 12 Principles of Democratic Governance.



***Presentation by Ms Sibel Arslan, General Rapporteur on local and regional authorities, member of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development of the Parliamentary Assembly.***

In her presentation, Ms Arslan gave an update on the Europe Prize and on events planned by the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development during the June part-session of the Assembly. She welcomed cooperation opportunities with the CDDG in the context of the World Forum for Democracy. The CDDG took note of the information provided.

***Presentation by Mr Andreas Kiefer, Secretary General of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities***

In his presentation, Mr Kiefer pointed to the recent adoption of new rules by the Congress in its new composition, and the election of its new President and chairpersons of the chambers and committees.

At its 40<sup>th</sup> session in March 2021, the Congress adopted a set of five priorities for the years 2021-2026. Mr Kiefer gave an update on the status of country evaluations and the monitoring of elections done by the Congress, mostly remotely. He also commented on the work of the GT-RE and GT-DT. He pointed out that the CDDG should take a broad approach as regards accountability (looking beyond the regional and local level) and that many reports of the Congress in relation to integrity (handbook, toolkits) could provide further inspiration and deserved to be translated by member States. He welcomed the interactions and the complementarity between the CDDG and the Congress and indicated that the new President, Mr Leendert Verbeek, was available for an exchange of views later in the year.

In the ensuing discussion, the need to pursue a close cooperation and the continued involvement of the Congress in the CDDG's work were highlighted. The CDDG took note of the information provided on the activities of the Congress.

***World Forum for Democracy (WFD)***

Ms Mary Ann Hennessey, Head of the Democratic Innovation Division, provided an update on the current status of this year's edition (the ninth) of the WFD. She showed a promotional videoclip for the subject of the 5<sup>th</sup> month of the campaign "Environmental action at local level". Ms Hennessey and the Secretariat referred to the additional background information and possible contributions of the CDDG to the WFD outlined in document [CDDG\(2021\)10](#), in the form of webinars on "the concept of 15-minutes cities" (April 2021), "public private partnerships for green city solutions (July 2021) and "green public administrations" (September 2021).

Mr Niall Sheerin of the Secretariat of the Democratic Governance Division gave further information on the webinar in April.

The CDDG subsequently endorsed the proposals for the CDDG to contribute to the WFD 12 months campaign by means of short webinars and it took note of the call to CDDG members to provide input for these events.

### ***Conference of international non-governmental organisations (CINGO)***

Mr Gerhard Ermischer, Vice-President of the Conference, gave a presentation about recent developments concerning the CINGO. The Conference was undergoing a reform process, with the adoption of new rules and the preparation of a new strategy and programme of activities. Mr Ermischer took stock of the interactions between CINGO and the CDDG, which he valued very positively. He also referred to emerging challenges for civil society, including the impact of new legal restrictions on NGO activities in some member States, as well as the worries of many NGOs with regard to increasing backlash against the Istanbul Convention in a context of health crisis that affected women particularly. Mr Ermischer called for the support of the Committee to counter this trend. The Committee took note of the information provided.

### ***Recent activities of other Council of Europe bodies***

The Secretariat provided the CDDG with an update on the main events and activities of relevance for the work of the CDDG, which had taken place since the last meeting of the CDDG, and which had been summarised in document [CDDG\(2021\)9](#). The Committee's attention was drawn in particular to the fact that the Committee of Ministers had not yet made a decision on possible follow-up action to the two recommendations of the Parliamentary Assembly for which the CDDG had been asked by the Committee to provide elements for a response (appended in the document).

The CDDG took note of the information contained in the Secretariat memorandum.

## **9. Gender mainstreaming in the work of the CDDG**

Due to lack of time, consideration of this item was postponed and the Committee agreed that the guidelines on gender mainstreaming in the work of the CDDG (document [CDDG\(2021\)11](#)) would be approved by written procedure.

## **10. Other business**

None.

## **11. Adoption of the abridged meeting report**

The Committee considered and adopted the draft abridged report. CDDG members would receive in the following days the full version of the meeting report.

The Chair thanked participants, the Secretariat and the interpreters and closed the meeting.

**APPENDIX I****LIST OF PARTICIPANTS****MEMBERS / MEMBRES****CHAIR / PRESIDENT**

Mr Markku MÖLLÄRI, Ministerial adviser, Department for Local Affairs and Regional Administration, Ministry of Finance, Helsinki

**ALBANIA / ALBANIE**

Ms Albana KOÇIU, Director of the Department of Public Administration

Ms Arvena DEDA

**AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE**

Mr Peter ANDRE, Ministry of Interior, Senior Expert for Legal Affairs, Wien, Austria,

Mag. Stefan GÖLLER, Legal expert, Office of the Vienna Provincial Government, Department for European Affairs, Wien

**AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN**

Mr Seymour NAGHIYEV, Chief Advisor, Ministry of Justice, Centre for Work with Municipalities, Baku

**BELGIUM / BELGIQUE**

Mr Edwin LEFEBRE, Deputy Director, Ministry of the Flemish Community, Agency for Home Affairs, Brussels, Belgium

**BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE**

Ambassador Almir ŠAHOVIĆ, Assistant Minister for Multilateral Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Bosnia and Herzegovina, SARAJEVO

**BULGARIA / BULGARIE**

Apologised for absence/Excusé

**CYPRUS / CHYPRE**

Mr Antonis ECONOMIDES, Head of Local Government Directorate, Ministry of the Interior, NICOSIA

**CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE**

Mr Petr FEJTEK, Senior Administrative Advisor, Department for Strategic Development and Coordination of Public Administration, Ministry of Interior of the Czech Republic, Praha

**CROATIA / CROATIE**

Ms Željka VRANKOVEČKI CELEGIN, Head of Service for the Modernization of Business Processes

**DENMARK / DANEMARK**

Mr Mads HOLT, Administrative Officer, Department of Public Administrative Law, Ministry of Social Affairs and the Interior, COPENHAGEN

**ESTONIA / ESTONIE**

Ms Ave VIKS, Adviser, Regional Administration Policy Department, Ministry of Finance

**FRANCE**

Ms Mathilde CISOWSKI, Chargée d'études juridiques, Direction générale des collectivités locales, Ministère de la cohésion des territoires et des relations avec les collectivités territoriales, PARIS

**GEORGIA / GEORGIE**

Mr Giorgi DIDIDZE, Head of Department of Regional and Mountainous Areas Development, Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure, TBILISI

Mr David KALATOZISHVILI, Deputy Head of European Integration Department

**GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE**

Ms Kristina SCHADE, Federal Ministry of the Interior, BERLIN

Ms Ruth GRUNE, Federal Ministry of the Interior, BERLIN

Ms Anna WASSENBERG, Representative of the German Länder, Ministry of the Interior and for Sport Rheinland-Pfalz, MAINZ

**GREECE / GRECE**

Mr Georgios CHRYSAFIS, Directorate of Organising and Functioning of Local Government, Ministry of the Interior, Athens

Ms Eleni KALLINIKOU, Head of the Bureau of the Permanent General Secretary & Expert within the independent department of International and European relations, Ministry of Interior of the Hellenic Republic, Athens

Mr Athanasios ATHANASIADIS, Civil servant, Directorate of Organising and Functioning of Local Government, Ministry of the Interior, Athens

**HUNGARY / HONGRIE**

Mr David KOJSZA, Government Officer for International Relations, Prime Minister's Office, Cabinet of the State Secretariat for Public Service, Budapest

**ICELAND / ISLANDE**

Ms Stefanía TRAUSTADÓTTIR, Senior Advisor, Local Government, Department of Local Government and Regional Policy, Ministry of Transport and Local Government, REYKJAVÍK

**ITALY / ITALIE**

Mr Francesco GIUSTINO, Presidenza del Consiglio dei Ministri, Ufficio Attività Internazionali, ROMA

**LATVIA / LETTONIE**

Ms Agnese PABERZA DRAUDINA, senior expert, Local Governments Department, Local Governments Supervision Division, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development, RIGA

**LITHUANIA / LITUANIE**

Mr Paulius SKARDŽIUS, Senior Adviser, Public Administration and Self-Government Policy Group, Ministry of the Interior, VILNIUS

**LUXEMBOURG**

M. Pol HENROTTE, Conseiller de Gouvernement, adjoint, Ministère de l'Intérieur, Direction de la sécurité civile

M. Carlo GAMBUCCI, Directeur du SIGI

M. Gautier LETHEURE, Stagiaire

**MALTA / MALTE**

Mr Natalino ATTARD, Director General (Local Government), Local Government Division, Ministry for Justice, Culture and Local Government, VALLETTA

**REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA**

Mr Adrian ERMURACHI, Deputy Secretary General of the Government, CHISINAU

Ms Daniela SORAHMETOV

**MONTENEGRO**

Ms Zorana POPOVIC, Senior Adviser, Directorate for Local Self-Government, Ministry of Public Administration, PODGORICA

**NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS**

Mr Jan Willem KOOISTRA, Deputy Head Section Democracy, Democracy and Citizenship Department, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

**NORWAY / NORVEGE**

Ms Nina Britt BERGE, Senior Adviser, Department for Local Government, Ministry of Local Government and Modernisation, OSLO

**POLAND / POLOGNE**

Ms Magda SADLAK, National Institute of Local Government

**PORTUGAL**

Mr Andra NIKOLIC, Head of Department, General Directorate for Local Authorities, LISBOA

Ms Tânia MOURATO, Department Director, Directorate-General for Local Administration (DGAL)

Mr Marco AMARAL, Head of Division, Directorate-General for Local Administration (DGAL)

**ROMANIA / ROUMANIE**

Mr Mihai Adrian GROȘAN, Head of Department, Ministry of Public Works, Development and Administration, Directorate General of Public Administration, Romanian Government, BUCHAREST, Romania

Ms Catana PARASCHIVA, Senior Counsellor, Open Government Service, General Secretariat of Government

**SAN MARINO / SAINT-MARIN**

Ms Carlotta ANTONELLI, National Expert

**SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE**

Ms Nad'a KURILOVÁ, Director, Local State Administration, Self-Government and Foreign Relations Department, Public Administration Section, Ministry of Interior of the Slovak Republic

**SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE**

Mr Jurij MEZEK, Senior Advisor, Ministry of Public Administration, Local Self-Government Service, LJUBLJANA

Ms Helena KAVČIČ, Senior Advisor, Ministry of Public Administration, Local Self-Government Service, LJUBLJANA

**SPAIN / ESPAGNE**

Ms Ana Cristina LÓPEZ LÓPEZ, Subdirectora General Adjunta de Relaciones Europeas e Internacionales, Secretaría General de Coordinación Territorial, Secretaría de Estado de Política Territorial y Función Pública, MADRID

**SWEDEN / SUEDE**

Ms Saskia BODIN, Desk Officer, Department for Public Administration, Local Government Division, Ministry of Finance

Mr Lars KARLANDER, Desk Officer, Local Government Unit, Ministry of Finance

Ms Lina LUNDGREN, Legal advisor, Department for Public Administration, Division for local government, financial and legislative matters, Ministry of Finance

**SWITZERLAND / SUISSE**

Mr Bertrand BISE, Chef suppléant de l'unité Projets législatifs I, Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Domaine de direction Droit public, BERNE

Mr Beat KUONI, Chancellerie Fédérale

Mr Oliver SPYCHER, Chancellerie Fédérale

**TURKEY / TURQUIE**

Mr Sertac SEZGIN, Controller of Municipalities, General Directorate of Provincial Administrations, Ministry of Interior

Mr Ege ERENEL

**UKRAINE**

Mr Viacheslav NEHODA, Deputy Minister for Communities and Territories Development

Ms Olha KAVUN, First Secretary, Permanent Representation of Ukraine to the Council of Europe

Mr Ruslan POPIUK, Acting Head of the Expert Group for Interaction with the Council of Europe Institutions of the Directorate for the Development of Local Self-Government, Territorial Organization of Power and Administrative-Territorial Structure, Ministry for Communities and Territories Development of Ukraine

**UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI**

Mr Paul ROWSELL, Head of Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government, LONDON

Ms Siobhan SMYTH, Senior Policy Adviser, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government, LONDON

Ms Gurpal CHEEMA, Policy Adviser, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government, LONDON

**PARTICIPANTS****COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS / COMITE DES MINISTRES**

Ambassador Mårten EHNBERG, Permanent Representative of Sweden, Chair of the Committee of Ministers' Rapporteur Group on Democracy (GR-DEM)

**PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Ms Sibel ARSLAN, General Rapporteur on local and regional authorities, member of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Ms Yulia PERERVA, Secretary of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

**CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONGRES DES POUVOIRS LOCAUX ET REGIONAUX DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Andreas KIEFER, Secretary General / Secrétaire Général

Mr Roman CHLAPAK, Secretary of the Governance Committee / Secrétaire de la Commission de la Gouvernance

Mr Adam DRNOVSKY, Co-Secretary of the Governance Committee / Co-Secrétaire de la Commission de la gouvernance

Ms Stéphanie POIREL, Secretary of the Monitoring Committee and Observation of local and regional elections

**CONFERENCE OF INGOS OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONFERENCE DES OING DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Gerhard ERMISCHER, CIVILSCAPE, Representative of the INGOs Conference to the CDDG, ASCHAFFENBURG, Germany

**VENICE COMMISSION / COMMISSION DE VENISE**

Mr José Luis VARGAS VALDEZ, Judge at the Federal Electoral Tribunal, Mexico

Mr Alberto GUEVARA CASTRO

Mr Michael JANSSEN, Secretariat of the Venice Commission

**OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS****EUROPEAN UNION TO THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / UNION EUROPEENNE AUPRES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Efthymios TZIOKAS, Political & Legal Affairs

Mr Cedric LOMBAERTS

Ms Vassia VOZIKI



**HOLY SEE / SAINT-SIEGE**

Mr Thierry RAMBAUD, professeur des Universités et avocat à la Cour, expert pour le Saint-Siège auprès du Conseil de l'Europe, Strasbourg

**BENELUX UNION/UNION BENELUX**

Mr Hans MOOREN, Team Interne Market and Economie, Brussels

**OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS****COUNCIL OF EUROPEAN MUNICIPALITIES AND REGIONS (CEMR) / CONSEIL DES COMMUNES ET REGIONS D'EUROPE (CCRE)**

Mr Frédéric VALLIER, Secretary General

Ms Carol THOMAS, Advisor, Governance and Institutional Relations

M. Martin REVAULT, Attaché to the Secretary General

**CONSULTANTS EXPERTS / EXPERTS CONSULTANTS**

Ms Ardita DRIZA MAURER, Juriste, LL.M., Consultante indépendante, Droits politiques et nouvelles technologies de vote, Suisse

Mr Robert KRIMMER, ERA-Chair Full Professorship of e-Governance, Skytte Institute, University of Tartu, Estonia

Ms Melanie VOLKAMER, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Germany

Mr Jorge VALLADARES, Research and Policy Expert, Political Integrity, Transparency International (international secretariat)

**SECRETARIAT****Secretariat of the CDDG / Secrétariat du CDDG**

Ms Sonia SIRTORI, Head of the Democratic Governance Division / Cheffe de la Division de la gouvernance démocratique – Secretary of the CDDG / Secrétaire du CDDG - Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance, Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Christophe SPECKBACKER, Administrator / Administrateur – Democratic Governance Division / Division de la gouvernance démocratique - Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance, Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Ms Judith ORLAND, Democratic Governance Division / Division de la gouvernance démocratique – Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance, Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mme Isabelle ETTER - Assistant / Assistante

Mr Adrian WATERS – Trainee / Stagiaire

*Report of the 13th plenary meeting  
[CDDG(2021)12]*

**Other Secretariat participating in the meeting /Autre Secrétariat participant à la réunion**

Ms Claudia LUCIANI, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directrice de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance / Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Daniel POPESCU, Head of Democracy and Governance Department / Chef du Service de la démocratie et de la gouvernance – Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance - Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Ms Alina TATARENKO – Head of the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance / Cheffe du Centre d'expertise pour la bonne gouvernance - Democratic Governance Division / Division de la gouvernance démocratique - Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance - Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Markus ADELSBACH, Head of the Elections and Civil Society Division / Chef de la Division des élections et de la société civile / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance, Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Ms Mary Ann HENNESSEY, Head of the Democratic Innovation Division / Cheffe de la Division de l'innovation démocratique, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance, Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Niall SHEERIN, Democratic Governance Division / Division de la gouvernance démocratique - Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance, Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

**Interpreters / Interprètes**

Ms Isabelle MARCHINI  
Ms Sylvie BOUX

## APPENDIX II

### AGENDA

1. **Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda** [CDDG(2021)OJ1]
2. **Information on recent activities and developments**
  - Statement by the Chair
  - Report of the Bureau meeting [CDDG-Bu(2021)10]
  - Exchange of views with Ms Claudia Luciani, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance
  - Information by the Secretariat
3. **State of implementation of the CDDG activities according to its terms of reference 2020-2021**
  - Progress of work [CDDG(2021)1]
  - Revision of the work plan [CDDG(2021)2]
- 3.1 **Democracy and technology**
  - Report of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on democracy and technology [GT-DT(2021)3]
  - Report by Mr Peter Andre, CDDG Rapporteur, on developments at the CAHAI [CDDG(2021)3]
- 3.1.1 ***Specific task i: Impact of digital transformation on democracy and good governance***
  - Approval of the study [CDDG(2021)4]
- 3.1.2 ***Specific task ii: Develop standards on new technologies and the different stages of the electoral process (including voter registration, transmission and tabulation of results, etc.) in the form of a Committee of Ministers' recommendation or guidelines***
  - Consideration of the analysis of the replies to the questionnaire [CDDG(2021)5]
  - Consideration of preliminary draft guidelines [CDDG(2021)6]
  - Exchange of views with the participation of
    - Ms Ardita Driza Maurer, University of Zurich, Zentrum für Demokratie Aarau, Gimel, Switzerland
    - Mr Robert Krimmer, ERA-Chair Full Professorship of e-Governance, Skytte Institute, University of Tartu, Estonia
    - Ms Melanie Volkamer, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Germany
  - Exchange of views with the Venice Commission: Presentation of the [Principles for a fundamental rights-compliant use of digital technologies in electoral processes](#), by Mr José Luis Vargas Valdez, Judge at the Federal Electoral Tribunal, Mexico

### **3.2 Specific task iii: Democratic accountability**

- Report of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on accountability [GT-RE(2021)2]
- Consideration of a preliminary draft recommendation for the Committee of Ministers on democratic accountability of elected officials and bodies at local and regional level [CDDG(2021)7 + Addendum]
- Presentation by Mr Jorge Valladares, Research and Policy Expert, Political Integrity, Transparency International (international secretariat)

### **4. Promoting democratic governance through shared experience**

- Exchange of views with Mr Viacheslav Nehoda, Deputy Minister for Communities and Territories Development, Ukraine
- Exchange of views with Mr Frederic Vallier, Secretary General of the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR)
- Presentation of current developments or ongoing reforms by members of the CDDG

### **5. Introduction of a 4-year Strategic Framework**

- Exchange of views on the implications and possible CDDG priorities for 2022-2025 [CDDG(2021)8]  
[SG/Inf(2020)34]

### **6. Activities of the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance**

- Presentation by Ms Alina Tatarenko, Head of the Centre of Expertise for Good Governance
- Update as regards the European Label of Governance Excellence (ELoGE) [DG-SP(2021)3]

### **7. Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers**

- Activities of the Presidency of Germany (November 2020-May 2021) [Events](#)
- Priorities of the Presidency of Hungary (May-November 2021)

### **8. Activities of the Committee of Ministers and other Council of Europe bodies**

- Exchange of views with Ambassador Mårten Ehnberg, Permanent Representative of Sweden, Chair of the Committee of Ministers' Rapporteur Group on Democracy (GR-DEM)
- Parliamentary Assembly: presentation by Ms Sibel Arslan, General Rapporteur on local and regional authorities, member of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development
- Congress of Local and Regional Authorities: presentation by Mr Andreas Kiefer, Secretary General of the Congress
- World Forum for Democracy (WFD) [CDDG(2021)10]
- INGOs Conference: presentation by Mr Gerhard Ermischer, Civilscape
- Activities of the Committee of Ministers and other Council of Europe bodies [CDDG(2021)9]

**9. Gender mainstreaming in the work of the CDDG**

- Presentations by the CDDG gender equality rapporteurs
- Approval of guidelines on gender mainstreaming in the work of the CDDG  
[CDDG(2021)11]

**10. Other business**

- 11. Adoption of the abridged meeting report** [CDDG(2021)12]