



Strasbourg, 18 December 2018

CDDG(2018)13

EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE (CDDG)

ABRIDGED REPORT OF THE 9th MEETING 28-30 November 2018

1. Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda

The meeting was opened by the Chair, Mr Peter Andre, who welcomed the participants. He extended a particular welcome to:

- Ms Snežana Samardžić-Marković, Director General of Democracy;
- Mr Lovro Kušević, Minister of Public Administration, Croatia;
- Mr Ivan Milivojević, Deputy Secretary General, Standing Conference of Towns and Municipalities (SCTM), Serbia;
- Mr Jean-Pierre Grin, PACE General Rapporteur on local and regional authorities;
- Mr Andreas Kiefer, Secretary General of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities;
- Mr Andrew Dawson, Member Governance Committee, Congress of Local and Regional Authorities;
- Ms Claudia Luciani, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance.

The Chair expressed his appreciation for the fact that speakers from all levels of government were participating. This contributed to the CDDG's mission of facilitating exchanges that would benefit both central as well as local and regional authorities.

The list of participants is set out in Appendix I.

The Committee adopted its agenda as it appears in Appendix II.

Mrs Snežana Samardžić-Marković, Director General of Democracy, expressed her appreciation for the follow-up given by the CDDG to the Secretary General's recommendations in his reports on the State of democracy, human rights and the rule of law.

She invited the members to maximise the CDDG's potential for making a difference through smart governance solutions for challenges to democratic society on the basis of exchanges of experience with reforms, including with ministers, standard-setting and practical cooperation on public administration and governance reforms in cooperation with the Centre of Expertise.

She encouraged committee members to enhance coordination and dialogue among line ministries as well as with Permanent Representations and colleagues from other Departments and Ministries on the CDDG's work and its relevance. She also assured the Committee of her commitment to ensuring that Democratic Governance remains a priority for DG Democracy.

The text of the Director General's speech is available on the CDDG website.

2. Information on recent developments at the Council of Europe

The Committee took note of the information presented by the Director General of Democracy, Mrs Snežana Samardžić-Marković, on the initiatives taken to further strengthen the effectiveness, efficiency and practical relevance of the work of the Council of Europe.

She underlined the importance of the CDDG in contributing to the standard-setting activities in response to challenges facing the Council of Europe and its member States and in sharing their successes, allowing other member states to benefit from their experience and practical solutions.

The Committee would be kept informed on the possible impact of on-going issues in relation to the Organisation's financial situation and structure that might affect its activities.

3. Information by the Chair on recent activities

The Chairman, Mr Peter Andre, gave an overview of his participation in several events as set out in the agenda.

The events had been very well attended, generated great interest on topics important for the Committee such as cross-border cooperation and civil participation, and demonstrated, in particular, the added value for member states at a practical level of the activities of the CDDG and the Centre of Expertise.

With regard to the meeting of the Chairs of Council of Europe Intergovernmental Committees and the Secretary General of the Council of Europe (Strasbourg, 20 September 2018), the Chairman pointed out that the Chairs and Vice-Chairs of the Intergovernmental Committees had underlined the key role the Committees play in providing common responses to challenges as well as their contribution to standard setting work which is an important part of the unique strategic triangle of the Council of Europe.

4. Promoting democratic governance through shared experience

Administrative and local government reform

Mr Lovro Kuščević, Minister of Public Administration of the Republic of Croatia, recalling his country's Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers which ended on 21 November 2018 and the Conference on Cross-Border Co-operation in Dubrovnik, gave a detailed overview of the on-going reforms in terms of public administration in Croatia, a strategically vital area for the functioning of the state.

He underlined the importance of local self-government based on autonomy and subsidiarity. Important elements of the 2018 National Reform Programme therefore envisaged improved responsiveness, efficiency and cost-effectiveness of public administration through:

- functional and fiscal decentralisation ;
- progressive transfer of competencies and responsibilities initially to county level and subsequently to the municipalities;
- depoliticisation of public administration ;
- capacity-building, strengthening the competence framework and know-how for the civil service at local and regional level based on merit;
- digitisation of public administration and delivery of public services;
- rationalisation of the number of state agencies;
- the fight against corruption.

He thanked the Council of Europe and in particular the Centre of Expertise for Local Government Reform and the CDDG for the excellent and fruitful cooperation so far as well as in the future.

The presentation by Minister Kuščević is available on the website of the CDDG.

Issues discussed during the exchange which followed, included decentralisation of competences and resources from the state to the county level, including, equalisation mechanisms and financing of new responsibilities at local and regional level, capacity-building mechanisms, including inter-municipal cooperation and human resource management reforms (merit-based appraisal and remuneration systems), acceptance of reforms by the relevant stakeholders, and accountability.

5. Decisions by the Committee of Ministers of relevance to the work of the CDDG

The CDDG took note of the amendment to its terms of reference decided by Ministers Deputies and the recommendations adopted by the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities which it will receive for information and possible comments:

- [Recommendation 419 \(2018\)](#) on Voting rights at local level as an element of successful long-term integration of migrants and IDPs in Europe's municipalities and regions;
- [Recommendation 423 \(2018\)](#) on Conflicts of interest at local and regional level;
- [Recommendation 424 \(2018\)](#) on Transparency and open government;

- [Recommendation 427 \(2018\)](#) on Coping with the debt burden: local authorities in financial difficulty.

The Committee agreed to submit possible comments and observations by written procedure on the basis of draft elements to be prepared by the Secretariat.

6. State of implementation of the CDDG activities according to its terms of reference 2018-2019

An overview of the implementation by the CDDG of the specific tasks assigned by the Committee of Ministers for the biennium 2018-2019 is provided in Appendix III.

6.1 Revision of Committee of Ministers' Recommendation R (98) 12 on the supervision of local authorities activities

The Chair of the CDDG working group on the revision of the Recommendation, Mr Paul Rowsell (UK), briefed the Committee on the results of the group's work.

The CDDG underlined the role of the Recommendation as a high-level document which sets out recommendations to the governments of member States on standards and principles that should be applied in all forms of supervision of local authorities' activities.

In examining the draft revised recommendation, members welcomed the text and underlined that the text would prove helpful in guiding reforms currently underway in their countries.

The CDDG approved the draft Recommendation with a couple of minor drafting changes for transmission to the Committee of Ministers. The Secretariat was asked to prepare a short accompanying text setting out in clear language the aims and objectives of the recommendation.

6.2 Public Ethics

The Committee heard an introduction by the Chair of the CDDG working group on public ethics, Mr Paul-Henri Philips (Belgium, Brussels capital region).

The CDDG discussed draft guide on steps to implementing public ethics in public organisations and several members shared experience with preparing legislation, codes and other instruments for promoting public ethics.

Mr Ivan Milivojević, Deputy Secretary General, Standing Conference of Towns and Municipalities (SCTM), Serbia, presented the "*Good Governance Index at local level*". This tool could serve both as an instrument for self-assessment by municipalities, as well as a tool for external evaluation to identify needs in terms of capacity building or training.

The CDDG agreed that the guide on public ethics (meant for practitioners), along with the guidelines on public ethics (meant as soft-standard setting tool) and the public ethics benchmark toolkit on public ethics (meant for experts) constituted a whole which aimed at providing a complete set of instruments to develop policy, and elaborate and implement measures to assist member states in developing a culture of public ethics that would apply to all levels and all actors involved in public service. The language of the guide and the guidelines should be appropriate for their target groups yet clear and comprehensible.

The CDDG Working Group on Public Ethics and the Secretariat were instructed to ensure that the language of the guide was easily understandable for practitioners at all levels of government. The CDDG welcomed the draft guide, confirmed that it should serve as basis for the preparation of the guidelines and asked CDDG members to provide additional case studies for inclusion in the guide.

The CDDG confirmed that the guidelines on public ethics could begin with the preamble and recommendations to governments on principles and legislation. The Appendix would contain concrete measures in relation to securing high standards of ethical conduct across the public sector, paying specific attention to selected questions such as:

- public ethics measures for different types of public officials, including politicians (elected representatives, members of government), appointed top executives and holders of judicial office, differentiated according to their functions and levels of responsibility and proportional to them;
- public ethics measures for political parties in public life, their internal democratic organisation;
- public ethics measures for the local and regional levels, including the relations between local elected representatives and civil servants and the coordination with the central level.

It instructed the working group on public ethics accordingly and requested that the guide and the guidelines should refer to the European Code of Conduct for all Persons Involved in Local and Regional Governance adopted on 7 November 2018 by the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities and take into account findings of GRECO, documents of other Council of Europe bodies and of other international organisations.

The guidelines and the guide on public ethics should be ready for approval by the CDDG at its plenary meeting late 2019 for subsequent transmission to the Committee of Ministers for adoption.

As regards a feasibility study on the preparation of a Council of Europe indicator framework to identify trends with regard to public ethics and to allow member States to assess their performance, the CDDG, following initial consideration, agreed that further deliberation was needed before confirming its position on the feasibility study. In looking at possibilities to identify trends with regard to public ethics and to allow member States to assess their performance the Committee also asked the working group to look at options such as using existing surveys on governance and integrity by international governmental and non-governmental organisations as well as research institutes and in the countries who so request, working with the revised toolkit on public ethics benchmarking of the Centre of Expertise.

6.3 *E-democracy*

- Information on the first meeting of the working group on e-democracy (27 November 2018, Strasbourg)

Ms Gordana Gapikj-Dimitrovska ("the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia") who chaired the working group on e-democracy gave a short overview of the first meeting the day before (27 November 2018, Strasbourg).

Issues to be addressed in the group's work would include various forms of e-participation, the impact of technology and e-tools on delivering democracy, citizen engagement, governance aspects relating to data protection planning, developing e-democracy strategies and certain aspects of the impact on new information technologies on electoral processes.

The CDDG invited member states to provide input for the working group through examples and experiences in relation to e-democracy initiatives.

The working group is invited to prepare the draft guidelines on e-democracy in the form of a toolkit. It is envisaged to present the draft guidelines in the form of a toolkit for consideration by the CDDG at its meeting in December 2019.

The CDDG's attention was drawn also to the report on: "*Impact of new information technologies on electoral processes*" presented in conjunction with the Secretary General's 2018 report on the State of democracy, human rights and the rule of law dealing with "[Role of institutions, Threats to institutions](#)" (item 8 of the agenda).

While the primary purpose of the report on the impact of new technologies was to help the Division of electoral assistance in preparing training and capacity building tools in member states, it could also provide input and inspire the CDDG in its work on e-democracy.

6.4 *Strategy for Innovation and Good Governance*

- E-Learning Tool on the 12 Principles of Good Democratic Governance

Following a presentation of the E-Learning Tool on the 12 Principles of Good Democratic Governance by Mr Gennadiy Kosyak, who had been in charge of this project and had now joined the Division of Electoral Assistance, the CDDG expressed its appreciation for the possibilities this offered in supporting training programmes in public administration and the implementation of the 12 Principles.

- Promotion of the 12 Principles of Good Democratic Governance in member States: update

The Head of the Centre of Expertise for Local Government Reform, Ms Alina Tatarenko presented an update on the promotion of the 12 Principles of Good Democratic Governance in member states. The experience in member states illustrated the opportunities offered by the ELoGE programme to improve governance and communication between authorities and citizens at local level.

The CDDG, on the basis of a suggestion by Bulgaria, agreed to serve, in cooperation with the Centre of Expertise, as a platform to share best practice in implementing ELoGE.

6.5 *Cross-Border Cooperation*

The CDDG took note of the active involvement of the Centre of Expertise in cross-border cooperation projects and a number of developments, such as the renewed interest of a number of member States in enhancing such cooperation between local authorities to foster economic development of border regions and the strengthening of inter-territorial cooperation among the Benelux countries. It took note also of the draft regulation on cross-border mechanisms under preparation by the European Commission.

The CDDG was informed on the EDEN database of the Centre of Expertise and the multitude of similar databases which could benefit from the creation of a common platform. The Committee renewed its call on member States to ratify the Madrid Convention and its protocols.

7. Developing tools on good democratic governance and supporting reforms

Centre of Expertise for Local Government Reform

Following the presentation of the Centre's activity report for 2018 by the Head of the Centre, Ms Alina Tatarenko, the CDDG members congratulated the Centre for its successful work and the prospects for 2019. The Committee welcomed the complementarity between the standard setting work of the CDDG and the cooperation activities of the Centre and their cooperation in providing peer to peer advice, thus supporting the democracy pillar of the Council of Europe. It would appear that the significance of the contribution by the Centre to the successful implementation of reforms and initiatives in member states had well exceeded the original expectations at the time of its creation by the 3rd Summit of the Council of Europe.

The Committee took note of the achievements of the EU-Council of Europe project on human resource management in local self-government in Serbia (2016-2017) and the prospects for a second phase (2019-2021). It invited the Centre of Expertise and the partner organisation, the Standing Conference of Towns and Municipalities to report at one of its next meetings on the implementation.

In the light of the increased demand for assistance by the Centre on the part of central authorities, the CDDG considers that changing the name of the Centre to "Centre of Expertise for Good Governance" would be appropriate.

8. 2018 Report by the Secretary General on the State of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law

- Report on: "[Role of institutions, Threats to institutions](#)"

The Chairman presented key elements of the Secretary General's report in relation to the functioning of democratic institutions. The Committee took note of the information provided and agreed to give due consideration to the findings and recommendations in the report in its activities.

- Report on: "*Impact of new information technologies on electoral processes*"

The Head of the Democratic Governance Department, Mr Dan Popescu presented the report on: "*Impact of new information technologies on electoral processes*".

Prepared as a follow-up to the report by the Secretary-General of the Council of Europe on the State of democracy, human rights and the rule of law (2018): "Role of institutions. Threats to institutions", the report examines the impact and risks of digital technology and recommends that the Council of Europe maintains and reinforces its capacity to respond early and effectively to the challenges to safeguard the integrity of the democratic process.

The CDDG welcomed the report which should inspire not only its work on e-democracy but was relevant for democratic institutions and governance in general.

The CDDG welcomed this proposal.

9. Election of the Bureau

Election of the Chair, Vice-Chair and two members of the Bureau

The Committee elected its Bureau as follows: Mr Peter Andre (Austria), Chair, for one year; Mr Francesco Giustino (Italy), Vice-Chair, for one year; Ms Monika Filipová (Slovak Republic) Bureau member elected for two years for the period 2019-2020; and Mr Markku Mölläri (Finland) member for the remainder of the mandate of Mr Damien Feraille, i.e. until 31 December 2019.

10. Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers

The CDDG took note of the activities under the Chairmanship of Croatia (19 May 2018 – 21 November 2018).

Priorities of the Chairmanship of Finland (21 November 2018 – 18 May 2019)

The Finnish delegate presented the [priorities of the Chairmanship of Finland](#) as well as a brief overview of scheduled activities and events.

Under the theme “*The Essence of Europe – Advancing Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law for All*”, the priorities of the Finnish Presidency were:

1. Strengthening the system of human rights and the rule of law in Europe;
2. Support for equality and women’s rights; and
3. Openness and inclusion—as well as a focus on young people and the prevention of radicalisation.

11. Other business

Information about other Council of Europe bodies

- *Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe*

Mr Jean-Pierre Grin, General Rapporteur on local and regional authorities of the Parliamentary Assembly presented the report on “[The role of national parliaments in successful decentralisation processes](#)”. The report addressed trends in decentralisation as well as tendencies in some member states towards greater centralisation.

The Parliamentary Assembly calls on national parliaments and governments to strengthen local self-government. This should include adequate financing and independence commensurate with the new responsibilities transferred to local government.

In order for decentralisation to be successful, governments should consult all stakeholders, including national parliaments. The latter should also take measures to ensure that transfer of competencies could be reversed only under specific and justifiable circumstances.

The Parliamentary Assembly therefore reaffirms the essential role of decentralisation in making public service more responsive to local needs, promoting an accountable exercise of power and building trust in public authorities - Resolution 2242 (2018).

The presentation by Mr Grin is available on the website of the CDDG.

- Congress of Local and Regional Authorities

The Secretary General of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities, Mr Andreas Kiefer, recalled the principal responsibilities and role of the Congress, including its monitoring activities in member states on the implementation of the Charter and in contributing to compliance with fundamental freedoms and human rights, for example through its publication on the [Promotion of human rights at local and regional level](#).

This year marked the 30th anniversary of the Charter of Local Self-Government and, referring to the report by the Parliamentary Assembly, he underlined the shared responsibility of all stakeholders, the Parliamentary Assembly, the Congress of local and regional authorities and, of course, the member States of the Council of Europe for empowering local government, and strengthening its capacity and accountability to ensure that democracy and democratic institutions at local level can operate and function effectively and efficiently.

He recalled the existing synergies and cooperation with member states at the operational level and also with the Centre of Expertise.

In this context, and in relation to the work of the CDDG, he drew the CDDG's attention to the priorities of newly elected Congress President Anders Knape as well as to the reports and recommendations adopted by the Congress at its 35th Session (November 2018) on "Coping with the debt burden: local authorities in financial difficulty" as well as on "Consultation of local authorities by higher levels of government."

- Conference of INGOs

The CDDG took note that on 19 September 2018, the [Directorate General of Democracy](#) and the Conference of INGOs organised a conference and debate entitled: [Democracy and "The People"](#).

The CDDG Chairman had participated in the session on "Making representative democracy more participatory" where he presented the guidelines on civil participation in political decision making and how the fundamentals and principles that should apply can ensure that civil participation is effective.

Mr Gerhard Ermischer, representative of the Conference of INGOs, expressed the appreciation of the Conference for the excellent cooperation in the different CDDG working groups. He informed the Committee that a number of working groups had been set up at the level of the Conference which should further improve cooperation also with the CDDG.

A project had been launched in relation to the implementation of the guidelines for civil participation in political decision-making in the context of open governance. The Fundamental Rights Agency of the European Union was involved in this, as well as in a joint initiative of the Directorate General of Democracy and the Conference of INGOs on strengthening the freedom of association.

In the framework of this project, the Conference was now analysing data collected in EU member states on freedom of association with a view to drawing possible conclusions. In the view of the Conference, it would be helpful to also collect data in non-EU member states of the Council of Europe.

- World Forum for Democracy (19-21 November 2018)

Mr Michael Remmert, Coordinator of the World Forum for Democracy, presented the results of the [World Forum for Democracy 2018](#) which took place in Strasbourg from 19 to 21 November 2018. The general theme was "[Gender Equality: Whose battle?](#)" The Forum focused, in particular, on women's public, political and economic participation and combating violence against women. Conclusions and proposals for follow-up action were currently under preparation and the CDDG was invited to become involved in follow-up action. The work of the Forum's "Democracy Incubator" which identifies good practice for participation in democratic processes could be of interest also to the e-democracy working group of the CDDG.

- Inclusion and anti-discrimination programmes

Ms Francesca Lionetti from the Intercultural Cities Programme of DG II presented the Inclusive Integration Policy Labs initiative and the Model Strategy for Integration at National Level. These aim at assisting member states in building a sense of identity and belonging among all citizens and commitment to an open society based on shared values.

A number of delegations underlined the importance of the issue and inquired how governments at national and local level could contribute.

The CDDG agreed to contribute to examine the Model Strategy for Integration at National Level and associated questionnaire and member states were invited to submit their responses to the Secretariat by 15 January 2019.

The CDDG thanked the representatives for their presentations. It took note of the activities of other bodies and the information presented. The Committee would take this important information into account in its work and ensure appropriate follow-up and instructed the Secretariat to circulate this information and all relevant reference documents.

Reports of the meetings of the Bureau

The CDDG took note of the information presented on the meetings of the Bureau on 17 April and 19 October 2018 in Paris as set out in documents CDDG-Bu(2018)9 and 16.

Recent developments in member States

The delegation from the Slovak Republic presented the efforts underway in relation to the supervision of local authorities as well as in relation to public ethics and the importance in this context of the work underway in the CDDG working groups. She thanked the members for their contributions to the rapid response questionnaire and peer reviews.

The delegation from Cyprus provided an overview of the assistance by the Centre of Expertise for their support in terms of training needs analysis and technical support in developing a national training strategy for local government.

The Ukrainian delegation outlined the results of the support by the Council of Europe and the Centre of Expertise in particular in relation to the new draft law on supervision of local authorities and expressed her authorities' appreciation for the excellent cooperation so far as well as in the future.

The Greek representative informed the Committee that the new law for local government provided for an expansion of the European Charter of Local Self-Government to second tier authorities.

Any other item

Having heard Mr Edwin Lefebvre, CDDG Gender Equality Rapporteur, the Committee decided to appoint Ms Siobhan Smyth (UK) co-rapporteur on gender equality.

12. Date of the next meeting

The next plenary meeting of the CDDG would be held from 9-11 December 2019.

A provisional calendar of meeting dates for the CDDG and the working groups is presented in Appendix IV.

APPENDIX I
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MEMBERS / MEMBRES

CHAIRMAN / PRESIDENT

Mr Peter ANDRE, Ministry of Interior, Expert for Legal Affairs

ALBANIA / ALBANIE

Apologised for absence / Excusé

ANDORRA / ANDORRE

Mme Florència ALEIX, Desk Officer, Département des affaires multilatérales, Ministère des Affaires Etrangères

ARMENIA/ARMENIE

Apologised for absence/excusé

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Mag. Stefan GÖLLER, BA, Amt der Wiener Landesregierung

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Mr Seymur NAGHIYEV, Legal Advisor, Ministry of Justice

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

M. Paul-Henri PHILIPS, Coordinateur pour les Organisations Internationales, Relations multilatérales et Organisations Internationales, Région Bruxelles-Capitale

Mme Françoise LANNOY, Directrice générale, Service public de Wallonie, Intérieur et action sociale, Région Wallone

Mr Edwin LEFEBRE, Ministry of the Flemish Community, Agency for Home Affairs, Flemish Region

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

Ambassador Almir ŠAHOVIĆ, Assistant Minister for Multilateral Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Bosnia and Herzegovina

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Mr Mihail VASILEV, State Expert, Department "Administrative-territorial Structure", Directorate "Spatial Development and Administrative-territorial Structure", Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works

CROATIA / CROATIE

Mr Lovro KUŠČEVIĆ, Minister of Public Administration

Ms Terezija MARIĆ

Ms Blaženka BABIĆ, Deputy Permanent Representative

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Mr Antonis ECONOMIDES, Chief Administrative Officer, Ministry of the Interior

Ms Kakia DEMETRIOU, Administrative Officer A, Ministry of the Interior

CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Mr Petr FEJTEK, Department for Strategic Development and Coordination of Public Administration, Ministry of Interior of the Czech Republic

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Mr Henrik Villum JENSEN, Ministry of Economic Affairs and the Interior

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Mr Kersten KATTAI, Regional Administration Policy Department, Ministry of Finance

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Mr Markku MÖLLÄRI, Ministerial adviser, Department for Local Affairs and Regional Administration, Ministry of Finance

FRANCE

Mme Mathilde CISOWSKI, Bureau des structures territoriales, Sous-direction des compétences et des institutions locales, Direction générale des collectivités locales, Ministère de l'Intérieur

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Apologised for absence / Excusé

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Mrs Kristina SCHADE, Division O2, Better regulation, bureaucracy reduction; Act on E-Government; local matters, Federal Ministry of the Interior

Mrs Gabriele STELLMACHER, Representative of the „Laender“ (States), Ministry of Interior and Sports of Lower Saxony, Department for Local Government Affairs

GREECE / GRECE

Mr Georgios CHRYSAFIS, Directorate of Organisation and Functioning of Local Government, Ministry of the Interior

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Mr David KOJSZA, Desk Officer for Development, Prime Minister's Office,
Department of Territorial Strategy

ICELAND / ISLANDE

Mrs Stefanía TRAUSTADÓTTIR, Senior Advisor, Local Government, Department of Local
Government and Regional Policy, Ministry of Transport and Local Government

IRELAND / IRLANDE

Mr Diarmuid O'LEARY, Principal Officer, Department of Housing, Planning, and Local
Government

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Francesco GIUSTINO, Presidenza del Consiglio dei Ministri, Ufficio Attività Internazionali

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Ms Agnese PABERZA DRAUDINA, senior expert, Local Governments Department, Local
Governments Supervision Division, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional
Development

Mrs Fatma FRIDENBERGA, Riga City Council Legal Office

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Mr Paulius SKARDŽIUS, Senior Adviser, Ministry of the Interior

LUXEMBOURG

Apologised for absence / excusé

MALTA / MALTE

Mr Robert TABONE, Local Government Division, Ministry for Justice, Culture and Local
Government

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Mr Adrian ERMURACHI, Deputy Secretary General of the Government

MONTENEGRO

Ms Zorana POPOVIC, Senior Adviser, Directorate for Local Self-Government, Ministry of Public
Administration

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Mr Jan Willem KOOISTRA, Deputy Head Section Democracy, Democracy and Citizenship
Department, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

NORWAY / NORVEGE

Mrs Nina Britt BERGE, Senior Adviser, Department for Local Government, Ministry of Local Government and Modernisation

POLAND / POLOGNE

Mr Robert GAWŁOWSKI, National Institute of Local Government

PORTUGAL

Mr Andra NIKOLIC, Head of the Department for Cooperation and Financial Affairs, Head of the Financial Recovery Department, General Directorate for Local Authorities

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Mr Mihai Adrian GROSAN, Chief of service, Ministry of Regional Development, Public Administration and European Funds, Directorate General of Public Administration, Romanian Government

RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE

Mr Vladimir LEBEDENKO, Vice-Director of the Department for Liaisons with the Constituent Entities of the Federation, the Parliament, and Public Associations of the MAE

SAN MARINO / SAINT-MARIN

Mr Paolo RONDELLI, Ambassador, Permanent Delegate of San Marino to UNESCO, Dipartimento Affari Esteri

SERBIA / SERBIE

Mrs Milica MARKOVIĆ, Senior Advisor, Head of Section for the development of Local Self-government system, Ministry of Public Administration and Local Self-government

Mr Ivan MILIVOJEVIĆ, Deputy Secretary General, Standing Conference of Towns and Municipalities

SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Mrs Monika FILIPOVÁ, Director a.i., Local State Administration, Self-Government and Foreign Affairs Department, Public Administration Section, Ministry of Interior of the Slovak Republic

SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

Mr Andrej ČOKERT, Office for Local Self-Government, Ministry of Public Administration

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Apologised for absence / Excusé

SWEDEN / SUEDE

Ms Maria ANTONSSON, Desk Officer, Ministry of Finance, Department of Public Administration, Local Government Division

Mr Torkel WINBLADH, Desk Officer, Ministry of Finance, Department of Public Administration, Local Government Division

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

M. Bertrand BISE, Juriste & Economiste, Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Domaine de direction Droit public, Unité Projets et méthode législatifs

"THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA" / "L'EX-REPUBLIQUE YUGOSLAVE DE MACEDOINE"

Ms Gordana GAPIKJ-DIMITROVSKA, State Advisor, the Ministry of Information Society and Administration

TURKEY / TURQUIE

Mr Sertac SEZGIN, Controller of Municipalities, Ministry of Interior

UKRAINE

Mrs Elena KOTLYAROVA, Head of Expert Group on Cooperation, with EU institutions and international, technical assistance, Department of Local Self-Government and Territorial Organisation of Power, Ministry of Regional Development, Building and Housing of Ukraine

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Mr Paul ROWSELL, Head of Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

Ms Siobhan SMYTH, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

PARTICIPANTS**PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE**

Mr Jean-Pierre GRIN, General Rapporteur on local and regional authorities

Ms Yulia PERERVA, Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

**CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE /
CONGRES DES POUVOIRS LOCAUX ET REGIONAUX DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Andrew DAWSON, Member of the Governance Committee, Congress of Local and Regional Authorities

Mr Andreas KIEFER, Secretary General / Secrétaire Général

Mr Tim LISNEY, Deputy Secretary of the Chamber of Local Authorities / Secrétaire adjoint de la Chambre des pouvoirs locaux – Secretary of the Governance Committee / Secrétaire de la Commission de la gouvernance

**CONFERENCE OF INGOS OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONFERENCE DES OING DU
CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Gerhard ERMISCHER, CIVILSCAPE, Representative of the INGOs Conference to the CDDG

**COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS / COMMISSAIRE AUX DROITS DE
L'HOMME**

Apologised for absence / Excusé

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS

HOLY-SEE / SAINT-SIEGE

M. Thierry RAMBAUD, Professeur des Universités

BENELUX UNION/UNION BENELUX

Apologised for absence / excusé

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

**ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT (OECD) /
ORGANISATION DE COOPERATION ET DE DEVELOPPEMENT ECONOMIQUES (OCDE)**

Apologised for absence / excusé

**COUNCIL OF EUROPEAN MUNICIPALITIES AND REGIONS (CEMR) / CONSEIL DES
COMMUNES ET REGIONS D'EUROPE (CCRE)**

M. Carlos MASCARELL VILAR, chargé de mission – gouvernance et citoyenneté

SECRETARIAT

Mrs Snežana SAMARDŽIĆ-MARKOVIĆ, Director General of Democracy (DG II) / Directrice Générale de la Démocratie (DG II)

Ms Claudia LUCIANI, Director of Human Rights, Equality and Governance / Directrice de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance / Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Daniel POPESCU, Head of Democratic Governance Department / Chef du Service de la gouvernance démocratique – Directorate of Human Rights, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance - Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mrs Jutta GÜTZKOW, Head of Good Governance Division / Chef de la Division de la bonne gouvernance – Secretary of the CDDG / Secrétaire du CDDG - Directorate of Human Rights, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance - Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Theo WELS, Administrator / Administrateur – Good Governance Division / Division de la bonne gouvernance - Directorate of Human Rights, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance - Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Ms Alina TATARENKO – Head of the Centre of Expertise for Local Government Reform / Chef du Centre d'expertise sur la réforme de l'administration locale - Good Governance Division / Division de la bonne gouvernance - Directorate of Human Rights, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance - Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Gennadiy KOSYAK – Electoral Assistance Division / Division de l'assistance électorale - Directorate of Human Rights, Equality and Governance / Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance - Directorate General of Democracy / Direction générale de la démocratie

Mr Aleksandar JOVANOVIĆ – Project Manager, Council of Europe Office in Belgrade

Mme Isabelle ETTER - Assistant / Assistante

Mr Lasse LOHMANN – Trainee / Stagiaire

Ms Francesca LIONETTI, Intercultural Cities - Directorate General of Democracy

Dr. Michael REMMERT, Co-ordinator World Forum for Democracy and Schools of Political Studies - Directorate General of Democracy

Interpreters / Interprètes

Cynera JAFFREY
Luke TILDEN
Didier JUNGLING

APPENDIX II

AGENDA

- | | | | |
|-----------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1. | Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda | [CDDG(2018)OJ1] | For adoption |
| 2. | Information on recent developments at the Council of Europe | | For information |
| 3. | Information by the Chair on recent activities | | For information |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Participation in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conference on Cross-Border Cooperation (Dubrovnik, 25 May 2018) • Conference on Civil Participation in local decision-making processes (Yerevan, 4 September 2018) • International Day of Democracy (Strasbourg, 19 September 2018) • Meeting of the Chairs of Council of Europe Intergovernmental Committees and the Secretary General of the Council of Europe (Strasbourg, 20 September 2018) | | |
| 4. | Promoting democratic governance through shared experience | | |
| | <p><i>Administrative and local government reform</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr Lovro Kušćević, Minister of Public Administration, Croatia | | For discussion |
| 5. | Decisions by the Committee of Ministers of relevance to the work of the CDDG | [CDDG(2018)2] | For information and action |
| 6. | State of implementation of the CDDG activities according to its terms of reference 2018-2019 | | |
| 6.1 | <p><i>Revision of Committee of Ministers' Recommendation R (98) 12 on the supervision of local authorities action</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reports on the meetings of the working group on the revision of Recommendation No. R (98) 12 of the Committee of Ministers on supervision of local authorities' action | [GT-CACL(2018)3]
[GT-CACL(2018)6] | For information |
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Draft revised Recommendation | [CDDG(2018)3] | For discussion and adoption |

6.2	<i>Public Ethics</i>	[CDDG(2018)4]	For discussion and action
	- Reports on the meetings of the working group on public ethics	[GT-EP(2018)3] [GT-EP(2018)7]	For information
	- Revision of the 2004 Handbook of good practice on public ethics at local level: revised draft guide on public ethics	[CDDG(2018)4 Addendum]	For discussion and action
	- Guidelines on public ethics		
	- Preparation of a feasibility study on a Council of Europe indicator framework on public ethics		
6.3	<i>E-democracy</i>		
	- Information on the first meeting of the working group on e-democracy (27 November 2018, Strasbourg)	[GT-ED(2018)1] [GT-ED(2018)2]	For information
6.4	<i>Strategy for Innovation and Good Governance:</i>		
	- E-Learning Tool on the 12 Principles of Good Democratic Governance		For information
	- Promotion of the 12 Principles of Good Democratic Governance in member States: update	[CDDG(2018)5]	For discussion and action
6.5	<i>Cross-Border Cooperation</i>		
	- EDEN Database		For information and discussion
	- Update on recent developments in the EU		
7	Developing tools on good democratic governance and supporting reforms		
	<i>Centre of Expertise for Local Government Reform</i>	[CDDG(2018)9]	For discussion
	- Activities in 2018 including	[CELGR(2018)2]	For discussion
	- Peer Reviews		
	- New, revised and updated tools		
	- Activities in 2018 and perspectives for 2019		
8.	2018 Report by the Secretary General on the State of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law		
	- Report on: " <i>Role of institutions, Threats to institutions</i> "	[CDDG(2018)10]	For discussion
	- Report on: " <i>Impact of new information technologies on electoral processes</i> "	[CDDG(2018)11]	For information and discussion
	- Exchange of views		For discussion
9.	Election of the Bureau		
	<i>Election of the Chair, Vice-Chair and two members of the Bureau</i>	[CDDG(2018)6]	For election

10. Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers

Activities under the Chairmanship of Croatia (19 May 2018 – 21 November 2018) and Priorities of the Chairmanship of Finland (21 November 2018 – 18 May 2019)

[CDDG(2018)7] For information

11. Other business

Information about other Council of Europe bodies

[CDDG(2018)8] For information and action

- Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe
- Congress of Local and Regional Authorities
- Conference of INGOs
- World Forum for Democracy (19-21 November 2018)
- Inclusion and anti-discrimination programmes

[CDDG(2018)12] For information and action

Reports of meetings of the Bureau

[CDDG-Bu(2018)9] For information and discussion
[CDDG-Bu(2018)16]

*Recent developments in member States
Any other item*

Adoption of the abridged meeting report

[CDDG(2018)13] For adoption

12. Date of the next meeting

For decision

APPENDIX III

IMPLEMENTATION BY THE CDDG OF THE SPECIFIC TASKS ASSIGNED BY THE COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS FOR THE BIENNIUM 2018-2019, AS OF NOVEMBER 2018

- (i) Revise Committee of Ministers' Recommendation [Rec\(98\)12](#) on the supervision of local authorities' action.
- *The Committee approved the draft Recommendation which will be submitted in early 2019 to the Committee of Ministers for adoption.*
- (ii) Focus on promoting the implementation of the Council of Europe instruments on participation (Guidelines for civil participation in political decision-making, revised Recommendation on the participation of citizens in local public life once adopted by the Committee of Ministers, Additional Protocol to the European Charter on Local Self-government on the right to participation in the affairs of a local authority).
- *The Committee referred to these documents in the preparation of the revised Recommendation on the supervision of local authorities' activities and of the Guide on steps for implementing public ethics in public organisations.*
 - *The Committee supported the application of the toolkit on civil participation in decision-making, prepared by the Centre of Expertise on the basis of the above documents.*
 - *The Chair of the CDDG participated in several events on civil participation, notably the Conference on civil participation in local decision-making processes (Yerevan, 4 September 2018) and the International Day of Democracy (Strasbourg, 19 September 2018).*
- (iii) As a follow-up to the findings of the good governance section of the Secretary General's Reports on the State of Democracy, Human Rights and Rule of Law with regard to public ethics:
- develop guidelines on public ethics at all levels of government, taking into account the findings of GRECO and Committee of Ministers' Recommendation [Rec\(2000\)10](#) on Codes of Conduct for Public Officials;
 - *A CDDG working group will prepare the guidelines in 2019 for approval by the Committee in December 2019 and subsequent transmission to the Committee of Ministers for adoption.*
 - update the 2004 Handbook of good practice on public ethics at local level, taking into account experience with the implementation of the revised Public Ethics Benchmark Toolkit of the Centre of expertise on local government reform, and extend it to cover all levels of government – local, regional and national;
 - *In 2018, the CDDG updated the handbook as a Guide on steps to implementing public ethics in public organisations. It will be submitted to the Committee of Ministers in early 2020 together with the Guidelines on public ethics.*
 - carry out a feasibility study on the preparation of a Council of Europe indicator framework to identify trends with regard to public ethics and to allow member States to assess their performance.
 - *This task will be addressed in 2019.*

(iv) In the field of e-democracy,

- in accordance with Recommendation [CM/Rec\(2017\)5](#) on standards for e-voting, hold a review meeting on its implementation in 2019;
- *This task will be addressed in 2019.*
- develop guidelines on e-democracy as a toolkit;
- *The CDDG, in November 2018, gave detailed instructions to its working group on e-democracy for preparing the document. Approval by the Committee for subsequent submission to the Committee of Ministers is envisaged in December 2019.*
- oversee the implementation of the priority “building democracy online” of the Internet Governance – Council of Europe Strategy 2016-2019.
- *As one of its tasks, the working group on e-democracy will formulate possible proposals for consideration by the Committee.*

(v) Contribute to the updating of toolkits of the Centre of expertise for local government reform reflecting the latest governance practices, for example in the field of e-governance.

- *This task will be tackled in 2019, once the CDDG working group on e-democracy is more advanced in the development of the guidelines on e-democracy.*

(vi) Report to the Committee of Ministers on a regular basis on the work and achievements of the European Stakeholders Platform which delivers the accreditation to the national platforms or bodies authorised to grant the European Label of Governance Excellence (ELoGE).

- *The European Stakeholders Platform did not meet in 2018 because no applications for accreditation were received. The CDDG further agreed to serve, in cooperation with the Centre of Expertise, as platform to share best practice in implementing ELoGE.*

ANNEXE IV**CDDG AND WORKING GROUPS****Provisional Calendar of meetings in 2019**

Dates and places of meetings are subject to availability of resources

COMMITTEE	DATE	ROOM*
Working Group on E-democracy (GT-ED)	14-15 March	G05
Working Group on Public Ethics (GT-EP)	18-19 March or 21-22 March	G02
CDDG Bureau	24 May	G04
Working group on Public Ethics (GT-EP)	17-18 June	G05
Working Group on E-democracy (GT-ED)	12-13 September	G04
CDDG Bureau	24-25 October	2 (Paris)
10 th Plenary meeting of the CDDG	9-11 December	G03

(* Unless indicated otherwise, meetings are scheduled to take place in Strasbourg)