# Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion – CDADI



CDADI (2024)23

# 9th Plenary Meeting, 18-20 June 2024

#### Report

#### **Summary**

The Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI) held its 9th meeting in Strasbourg on 18-20 June 2024 with Erik ADELL HELLSTRÖM (Sweden) as Chair.

- 1. The agenda of the meeting is contained in Appendix I. The list of participants and list of upcoming meetings of CDADI are contained in Appendices II and III.
- 2. At this meeting, CDADI decided to:
  - (a) submit to the Committee of Ministers the thematic report of the ADI-ROM on Early Childhood Education, Athens & Nafplio, Greece, 20-22 September 2023 and invite the Committee of Ministers to take note of it; and
  - (b) submit to the Committee of Ministers the third thematic report of the ADI-SOGIESC on Recommendation <u>CM/Rec(2010)5</u> on the Right to the highest attainable standard of health and access to healthcare for LGBTI people in Europe and invite the Committee of Ministers to take note of it.

# 3. CDADI:

- participated in the opening and several other events of the Council of Europe's No Hate Speech Week;
- took note of the workplan for 2024 and 2025;
- took note of the abridged report of the 9th meeting of the Committee of Experts
  on Roma and Traveller Issues (ADI-ROM); adopted the Roadmap for the
  implementation of capacity building programmes supporting the implementation
  of Recommendation <a href="Mailto:CM/Rec(2020)2">CM/Rec(2020)2</a> on the inclusion of the history of Roma
  and/or Travellers in school curricula and teaching materials at national level and

the six related tools and encouraged its members, participants and observers to transmit the roadmap and the tools to the Ministries of Education and other relevant authorities in their countries and further their implementation and use; encouraged the ADI-ROM to further develop the Roadmap and the tools in the process of their implementation and use; took note of and expressed its support for the dissemination of the results of the Joint Council of Europe and European Union Programme INSCHOOL; took note of and provided guidance for the finalisation of the Feasibility Study on desegregation and inclusion policies and practices in the field of education for Roma and Traveller children, and invited its members, participants and observers to submit written comments by 31 July 2024;

- adopted the compilation of promising practices on combating hate speech at national level and provided guidance for the further work of the CDADI working group on hate speech and hate crime; and exchanged with the participants of No Hate Speech Week on key topics covered by the compilation;
- adopted the document <u>"Summary and Outcomes of the exchange of views of 6</u> <u>December 2023 on Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on Religion";</u>
- took note of the abridged report of the 1st meeting of the Committee of Experts
  on Sexual Orientation Gender Identity and Expression and Sex Characteristics
  (ADI-SOGIESC); provided guidance to the ADI-SOGIESC and its drafting group for
  the further work on the draft of the Committee of Ministers Recommendation on
  the equality of rights of intersex persons and asked its members, participants and
  observers to submit written comments on the existing draft by 22 July 2024;
- took note of the preparatory work for a Study on recurrent problematic areas in the field of regional or minority language protection and identification of good practices in member States;
- took part in the award ceremony of the Journalism Excellence Awards Ethical reporting on Roma and fight against racism and antigypsism through the media, and congratulated the award winners;
- exchanged views on the concept of equality mainstreaming and agreed to inform
  the Committee of Ministers of its intention to follow-up to the Reykjavík
  Declaration by further working out and operationalising the concept of equality
  mainstreaming, meaning the incorporation of equality concerns into all stages of
  the policy process, in view of facilitating its implementation at the level of the
  Council of Europe and the member States, while reinforcing existing
  mainstreaming efforts;
- took note of the report on the evaluation of CDADI initiated by the Council of Europe's Directorate of Internal Oversight, of the management response and action plan, and of the oral contributions of the member States, participants and observers on internal co-ordination regarding the preparation of and follow-up to the work in CDADI to ensure progress in the field of equality, dissemination of CDADI deliverables and implementation of the outcomes of CDADI work, and on

measures at the level of the member States and CDADI to further improve implementation of CDADI outcomes;

- exchanged views with the Chair of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) on its annual report;
- took note of the report of the 5th meeting of the Committee of Experts on Intercultural Inclusion (ADI-INT) and encouraged member States to continue their efforts for the intercultural integration of migrants, including by translating into their languages and disseminating the standards and tools adopted by CDADI and the Committee of Ministers in this field; took note of the state of play of the work for the tool on multi-level governance, which aims to support the capacity-building programme for the integration of migrants and the implementation of CM/Rec(2022)10, and provided guidance for the further work on this deliverable, which could, once finalised, take the form of a self-assessment tool; and took note of the state of play of the preparation of a "Guidance document on strategies for inclusion in the fields under the responsibility of CDADI" and provided guidance to the ADI-INT for the scope and focus of the document as well as the process for its elaboration;
- took note of the progress made and provided guidance to the Committee of Experts on Artificial Intelligence, Equality and Discrimination (GEC/ADI-AI) on the development of the draft Committee of Ministers Recommendation on the impact of artificial intelligence systems, their potential for promoting equality - including gender equality - and the risks that they may cause in relation to nondiscrimination;
- took note of the progress made and provided guidance to its working group on intersectional discrimination on the development of the feasibility study on preventing and combating intersectional discrimination and asked its members, participants and observers to respond to the call for responses of 7 May 2024 on this topic by 2 July 2024;
- admitted the European Network of Equality Bodies (EQUINET) as an observer to the ADI-SOGIESC; and noted for the remaining requests for observer status to the CDADI (the Federal Union of European Nationalities (FUEN) and ADI-ROM (World Roma Federation) that they were neither accepted nor referred to the Committee of Ministers (cf. paragraph 8 of Resolution CM/Res(2011)24); and
- adopted the present abridged meeting report.

#### **Meeting Report**

# ITEM 1 - Opening of the No Hate Speech Week

1. On 18-20 June 2024, CDADI held its 9<sup>th</sup> meeting in Strasbourg, with Erik ADELL HELLSTRÖM (Sweden) as Chair. Members, participants and observers of CDADI attended the opening of the Council of Europe No Hate Speech Week together with ambassadors and other members of Permanent Representations of member States, representatives of the European Union, the Parliamentary Assembly and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities, members of the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) and participants of the No Hate Speech Week. The Chair of CDADI, who moderated the meeting, recalled that based on CDADI's work in cooperation with CDMSI and the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC), the Committee of Ministers had adopted Recommendations <a href="CM/Rec(2022)16">CM/Rec(2022)16</a> on combating hate speech at its Ministerial session in Turin in May 2022 and <a href="CM/Rec(2024)4">CM/Rec(2024)4</a> on combating hate crime on 7 May 2024. The Recommendation on combating hate crime had been prominently mentioned in the Ministerial session on 16 and 17 May 2024 as important element for the implementation of the 2023 Reykjavík Declaration at the outcome of the 4th Summit of Heads of State and Government.

#### ITEM 2 - Adoption of the Agenda

2. CDADI adopted the agenda as it appears at Appendix I. A list of participants and a list of upcoming meetings is available at Appendices II and III.

#### **ITEM 3: New Programme and Budget**

3. The Secretary of CDADI informed members, participants and observers of the workplan for the years 2024-2025 and recalled the detailed presentation of the new programme and budget for 2024-2027 which had been given at the 8th plenary meeting.

# ITEM 4: Roma and Travellers – Part I - Overview of the work and finalisation of the Capacity building programme and tools on history teaching

- 4. The Chair of the ADI-ROM, Manuel DEMOUGEOT, gave an overview of the progress of the ADI-ROM's work and presented the report of the 9th ADI-ROM meeting, which took place on 15 and 16 May in Strasbourg.
- 5. Jean Paul BACHELOT, member of the ADI-ROM working group preparing the Roadmap for the implementation of Capacity building programmes supporting the implementation of Recommendation <a href="CM/Rec(2020)2">CM/Rec(2020)2</a> on the inclusion of the history of Roma and/or Travellers in school curricula and teaching materials at national level and the six related tools, presented together with the Secretariat and the independent expert Oana-Nestian SANDU the Roadmap and the tools for its implementation. Several member States, participants and observers took the floor to welcome this work. It was clarified that the tools should be seen as living instruments which could be updated as new resources become available. It was recalled that the teaching of the history of Roma and Travellers was the topic of the 17th Meeting of the Council of Europe Dialogue with Roma and Traveller Civil Society on 11 and 12 June. CDADI took note of the launch of the new European Union/Council of Europe Joint Programme "Equality and freedom from discrimination for Roma: Roma Holocaust Remembrance and Education (RomaMemory)".

# ITEM 5: Hate speech and hate crime deliverables – Promising practices regarding <a href="Mailto:CM/Rec(2022)16">CM/Rec(2022)16</a> and work programme

- 6. Zoya STEPANYAN (Armenia) reported on the first meeting of the CDADI working group on hate speech and hate crime which took place online on 12 April 2024. The working group, with the approval of the Bureau, proposed to send a short survey to members, participants and observers of the CDADI and CDPC to better understand initiatives taken by member States to prevent and combat hate crime. Member States were encouraged to liaise with CDPC members to avoid duplicating country responses.
- 7. Jennifer JACKSON-PREECE, independent consultant, presented the compilation of promising practices at national level on combating hate speech. The compilation contained a self-assessment tool to allow member States to evaluate the extent to which they had implemented Recommendation <a href="Mailto:CM/Rec(2022)16">CM/Rec(2022)16</a> on combating hate speech. A compilation of written contributions from the tour de table on combating hate speech which took place during the 8<sup>th</sup> CDADI meeting had also been circulated. It was recalled that the compilation of promising practices was the fruit of joint work of CDADI and CDMSI and that CDMSI intended to adopt it shortly after the CDADI meeting. CDADI members, participants and observers thanked the working group for its intensive work on this deliverable.

# ITEM 6: Follow-up on the exchange of views on 'Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion'

8. CDADI members, participants and observers discussed the <u>"Summary and Outcomes of the exchange of views of 6 December 2023 on Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on Religion"</u>, which also appears at Appendix IV of this meeting report. This document was accompanied by a second information note compiling written contributions. The summary and outcomes document describes: current trends of antisemitism, anti-muslim and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion as observed by CDADI members, participants and observers; the existing Council of Europe standards; the measures taken by member States; and suggested follow-up action.

# ITEM 7: LGBTI persons – Thematic and full review of <a href="CM/Rec(2010)5">CM/Rec(2010)5</a> and draft Recommendation on the equality of rights of intersex persons

- 9. The newly elected Chair of the Committee of Experts on Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and Expression and Sex Characteristics (ADI-SOGIESC), Yuri de BOER (the Netherlands) presented the report of the 1st meeting and the Secretariat presented the third thematic report on CM/Rec(2010)5 on the Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health and Access to Healthcare for LGBTI People in Europe. CDADI thanked the ADI-SOGIESC for their intensive work on this report.
- 10. The Chair of the ADI-SOGIESC presented the preliminary draft for a Committee of Ministers Recommendation on the equality of rights of intersex persons and recalled that the ADI-SOGIESC had found compromise proposals for the amendments proposed at its first meeting. An explanatory memorandum would be drafted to accompany the main text. Member States were asked to submit written comments on the existing draft Recommendation by 22 July 2024.

#### ITEM 8: Regional or Minority Languages – Draft study

- 11. Mabera KAMBERI (North Macedonia) informed CDADI of the first meeting of the working group in charge of preparing a Study on recurrent problematic areas in the field of regional or national minority language protection and identification of good practices in member states. The working group, with the approval of the Bureau, proposed sending a short call for responses to member States, participants and observers of CDADI. CDADI members, participants and observers discussed the concept note which had been developed as a starting point for the preparatory work of the working group and gave guidance to the working group. It was recalled that it would be important to ensure that the work of the different bodies of the Council of Europe in the field of regional and minority language protection did not overlap and was in line with the mandates given by the member States.
- 12. The European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI) informed CDADI that it would present the initial results of its research on the opportunities and challenges to ratification of the European Charter of Regional or Minority Languages in seven member States to the Committee of Experts of the Charter (COMEX) on 20 June.

# **ITEM 9: Equality Mainstreaming**

13. The Chair recalled that the Committee of Ministers and its working group on human rights (GR-H) had an intense follow-up process to the Reykjavík Declaration that the Heads of State and Governments had issued at the end of the 4th Summit in May 2023. In the GR-H, the proposal had been made to look into the issue of "Equality mainstreaming", meaning the incorporation of equality concerns into all stages of the policy process. CDADI members of Albania and Finland presented their countries' approach to equality mainstreaming. CDADI members, participants and observers participated in a rich discussion of the approaches taken in different member States which would assist CDADI to further clarify and operationalise the concept of equality mainstreaming while also reinforcing existing mainstreaming efforts. It was agreed to inform the Committee of Ministers of this intention.

#### ITEM 10: Evaluation of CDADI

14. Robert STRYK, Director of Internal Oversight of the Council of Europe presented the main results and recommendations of the evaluation of the work of CDADI. Hallvard GORSETH, Head of the Anti-discrimination Department, presented the management response and action plan to this evaluation. As part of the follow-up to the evaluation, member States, participants and observers discussed how they prepared for CDADI meetings and how they ensure that CDADI deliverables are disseminated and implemented by relevant national authorities. Specifically, responses were given to two questions 1) how do you internally coordinate the preparation and follow-up of CDADI work in your member State to ensure dissemination of CDADI deliverables and implementation of the outcomes of the CDADI work? And 2) what could be done at member State and CDADI level to further improve the implementation of the outcomes of the CDADI work? Member States shared their experience of challenges and good practices, including building networks across different departments, enhancing transparency in communication, and participating in CDADI working groups as much as possible.

#### ITEM 11: Roma and Traveller – Inclusive schooling and desegregation

- 15. Marina VASIC from the Roma and Travellers team presented the Joint Council of Europe and European Union programme INSCHOOL, which had enabled the mapping of trends and pathways towards educational inclusion, in parallel to the feasibility study on desegregation and possible Committee of Ministers Recommendation. The programme had seen success, for example an evolution of inclusive education policy and practice in certain member States.
- 16. Jan HERO, member of the ADI-ROM, presented the draft Feasibility study on desegregation and inclusion policies and practices in the field of education including Roma and Traveller children. member States, participants and observers were invited to send written comments on the draft study by 31 July 2024, after which it was foreseen that the relevant working group and the ADI-ROM would finalise the study, which would be presented to CDADI for adoption at its next meeting in November.

# ITEM 12: Exchange of views on ECRI's annual report

17. The Chair of European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), Bertil COTTIER presented the newly published annual report of ECRI. ECRI had identified several main trends in its work to promote equality and fight racism and intolerance, including addressing the situation of people displaced by war and other emergencies, countering the rise of antisemitism in Europe and taking resolute action against anti-Muslim racism and discrimination across Europe. It was recalled that CDADI very much bases its work on ECRI's monitoring findings, which are the starting point for the work on many, if not all, CDADI deliverables. The need for CDADI and ECRI to work in synergy and provide mutual reinforcement while respecting their distinct roles, was also underlined.

# ITEM 13: Intercultural inclusion – Pilot of the Multilevel Governance Index and Guidance document on strategies for inclusion

- 18. Krysztof STANOWSKI, Vice-Chair of the Committee of Experts on Intercultural Inclusion (ADI-INT) presented the report of the 5th meeting of the ADI-INT held in Lublin (Poland) on 14-15 May 2024 and the progress made with the piloting of a tool on multilevel governance of intercultural inclusion. This tool would constitute one of the outputs under the third deliverable of ADI-INT, as set out in its new Terms of Reference 2024-2027, which reads: "Initiatives for the dissemination and implementation at national level of <a href="CM/Rec(2022)10">CM/Rec(2022)10</a> on multilevel policies and governance for intercultural integration, including tools for the capacity-building programme for migrant integration".
- 19. Christian AHLUND, senior consultant presented the ongoing work of the ADI-INT on a Guidance document on strategies for inclusion in the fields under the responsibility of the CDADI, which constitutes the first deliverable of the ADI-INT under its new Terms of Reference 2024-2027. This deliverable would focus on migrant people, people belonging to national minorities, Roma and Traveller people and LGBTI people. The Chair thanked the ADI-ROM for appointing a rapporteur to the ADI-INT. He suggested that the ADI-SOGIESC do the same and that the representative of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities also contributes to the work on this deliverable.

# ITEM 14: Draft CM Recommendation on the impact of artificial intelligence systems, their potential for promoting equality – including gender equality – and the risks they may cause in relation to non-discrimination

20. Käthlin SANDER (Estonia), Chair of the Committee of Experts on Artificial Intelligence, Equality and Non-discrimination (GEC/ADI-AI) presented the report of the first meeting and of the proposed content and structure of the draft CM/Recommendation on the impact of artificial intelligence systems, their potential for promoting equality – including gender equality – and the risks they may cause in relation to non-discrimination. The next meeting of the GEC/ADI-AI would take place on 25-26 September 2024 where the committee would discuss a first draft of the Recommendation. CDADI members, participants and observers provided guidance to the GEC/ADI-AI.

#### ITEM 15: Intersectional discrimination

21. Aaron GIARDINA, (Malta) presented the outcomes of the 1st meeting of the working group tasked with preparing a feasibility study on preventing and combating intersectional discrimination. CDADI provided guidance to this working group on the development of the feasibility study and asked its members, participants and observers to respond to the call for responses of 7 May on this topic by 2 July 2024. Several members, participants and observers expressed their wish to submit contributions. The next working group meeting would take place in early January 2025 online to allow sufficient time to produce a first draft of the Study incorporating these responses.

#### ITEM 16: Cooperation with civil society and requests for observer status

22. With regard to the request from the European Network of Equality Bodies (EQUINET) for observer status with ADI-SOGIESC, from the World Roma Federation with ADI-ROM, and the Federal Union of the European Nationalities (FUEN) with CDADI, the Chair recalled the guidance in document CDADI(2021)20rev on Cooperation with civil society and granting of observer status. He referred to the arguments put forward by ADI-ROM not to grant observer status for the World Roma Federation. Two delegations expressed that they did not support the request from FUEN, while one delegation supported the request. In accordance with Resolution <a href="McM/Res(2021)3">CM/Res(2021)3</a> on intergovernmental committees and subordinate bodies, their terms of reference and working methods, CDADI admitted EQUINET as observer to the ADI-SOGIESC, while the requests for observer status of the World Roma Federation with ADI-ROM and of FUEN with CDADI were neither accepted nor referred to the Committee of Ministers.

# ITEM 17: Adoption of the Abridged Report and any other business

- 23. A bilingual version of the draft abridged report was displayed and adopted. A list of upcoming meetings of the CDADI and its substructures was displayed, which appears as at Appendix III.
- 24. The CDADI congratulated the award winners of the Journalism Excellence Awards Ethical reporting on Roma and fight against racism and antigypsism through the media. The event aimed to promote a positive image of Roma and marginalised communities in the media, especially women and children and members, participants and observers of CDADI had participated in the award ceremony.

# ITEM 18: Interactive discussion with the participants of the No Hate Speech Week

25. Members, participants and observers of CDADI took part in an interactive discussion with the participants of the No Hate Speech Week, which was moderated by the CDAID Chair and guided by key findings of the newly adopted CDADI/CDMSI Compilation of promising practices at national level on combating hate speech (see item 5 above). Presentations from Viktor KUNDRAK, (Czechia) Christian PÎRVULESCU, Rapporteur of the European Economic and Social Committee and Nelli GISHYAN, from the No Hate Speech Network, were followed by interactive break-out sessions where participants discussed the following topics: Education, training and awareness raising; Online hate speech - Content moderation, take down, and working with trusted flaggers; and Improving support for those targeted by hate speech. These sessions saw rich exchanges on promising practices to prevent and combat hate speech in different member States.

# Appendix I

#### **AGENDA**

- 1. Opening of the No Hate Speech Week
- 2. Adoption of the agenda
- 3. New Programme and Budget
- 4. Roma and Traveller Overview of the work and finalisation of the Capacity building programme and tools on history teaching
- 5. Hate speech and hate crime deliverables promising practices regarding CM/Rec(2022)16 and work programme
- 6. Follow-up on the exchange of views on 'Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion'
- 7. LGBTI persons Thematic and full review of CM/Rec(2010)5 and draft Recommendation on the equality of rights of intersex persons
- 8. Regional or Minority Languages draft study
- 9. Equality mainstreaming
- 10. Evaluation of CDADI and Tour de table on the impact of CDADI
- 11. Roma and Traveller inclusive schooling and desegregation
- 12. Exchange of views on ECRI's annual report
- 13. Intercultural Inclusion Pilot of the Multilevel Governance Index and Guidance document on strategies for inclusion
- 14. Draft CM Recommendation on the impact of artificial intelligence systems, their potential for promoting equality including gender equality and the risks they may cause in relation to non-discrimination
- 15. Intersectional discrimination
- 16. Cooperation with civil society and requests for observer status
- 17. Adoption of the abridged report and any other business
- 18. Interactive discussion with the participants of the No Hate Speech Week

# **Appendix II**

# LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / LISTE DES PARTICIPANT-ES

# **MEMBERS / MEMBRES**

# **ALBANIA/ALBANIE**

### **Robert GAJDA**

Commissioner on Protection against Discrimination, Tirana

# **ANDORRA/ANDORRE**

### Mireia AGULLÓ FARRÉ

Social care desk officer in the Area of Equality Policies, Ministry of Social Affairs and Public Administration of the Government of Andorra

# **ARMENIA/ARMÉNIE**

# Zoya STEPANYAN

Head, International Human Rights Cooperation Division, Department for Human Rights and Humanitarian Issues, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Yerevan

## **AUSTRIA/AUTRICHE**

#### Kerstin SITTE LL.M.

Federal Chancellery, Department II/5 - National Minorities, Vienna

# <u>AZERBAIJAN/AZERBAÏDJA</u>N

#### Sanan ALIYEV

Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Permanent Representation of Azerbaijan to the Council of Europe, Strasbourg

#### **Parviz RUSTAMOV**

Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Permanent Representation of Azerbaijan to the Council of Europe, Strasbourg

# **BELGIUM/BELGIQUE**

#### Isabelle LECLERCQ

Cheffe de service a.i., Service Égalité des Chances, Equal Opportunities Team, SPF Justice, Bruxelles

# **BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA/BOSNIE-HERZÉGOVINE**

#### **Kemo SARAC**

Assistant Minister, Ministry of Human Rights and Refugees of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Sarajevo

# **BULGARIA/BULGARIE**

Excused / excusé

# **CROATIA/CROATIE**

### Alen TAHIRI

Director, Government Office for Human Rights and Rights of National Minorities, Zagreb

# Milena ČALIĆ-JELIĆ

Senior Advisor in the Office for Human Rights and Rights of National Minorities, Zagreb

#### Jelena DOKŠA

Secretary in the Office for Human Rights and Rights of National Minorities

# CZECH REPUBLIC/RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE

# Viktor KUNDRÁK, E.MA.,

Director, Department of Human Rights and Protection of Minorities, Office of the Government of the Czech Republic, Prague

### **DENMARK/DANEMARK**

Excused / excusé

# **ESTONIA/ESTONIE**

### Käthlin SANDER

Head of Equal Opportunities Policy, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications, Tallinn

#### FINLAND/FINLANDE

### Corinna TAMMENMAA

Head of Unit, Unit for Autonomy and Equality, Department for Democracy and Public Law, Ministry of Justice, Helsinki

# **FRANCE**

#### Laurence VILLETTE-RICHARD

Conseillère justice et relations internationales, Délégation interministérielle à la lutte contre le racisme, l'antisémitisme et la haine anti-LGBT (DILCRAH), Paris

# **GEORGIA/GĒORGIE**

#### **Anuki BURDULI**

Senior Specialist at the Human Rights Protection Secretariat, Administration of the Government of Georgia, Tbilisi

# **GERMANY/ALLEMAGNE**

#### Mark KAMPERHOFF

Head of EU division, EU coordination, International Affairs, Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth, Berlin

### Lena REINSCHMIDT

EU division, EU coordination, International Affairs, Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth, Berlin

# GREECE/GRÈCE

### **Simon DANIILIDIS**

Department of Human Rights, Ministry of Family and Social Cohesion, Athens

# **HUNGARY/HONGRIE**

#### Bernadett Valéria MARTON-JOHN

Senior Adviser, Unit for Neighbourhood Policy and National Minorities, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Budapest

#### **Bibor HOCHMANN**

Permanent Representation of Hungary, Strasbourg

# **ICELAND/ISLANDE**

### **Gunnhildur GUNNARSDOTTIR**

Ministry of Social affairs and Employment and Ministry of Education and Children representative Iceland's mission to the EU, Brussels

# IRELAND/IRLANDE

# **Aisling O'CALLAGHAN**

Department of Children, Equality, Disability, Integration and Youth, Dublin

#### **ITALY/ITALIE**

#### **Mattia PERADOTTO**

Director, National Office against Racial Discrimination – UNAR, Presidency of the Council of Minister, Rome

# **LATVIA/LETTONIE**

# Sandra KAULINA

Head of Human Rights Division, Department of International Organisations and Human Rights, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Riga

## **LIECHTENSTEIN**

No nomination / Pas de nomination

### LITHUANIA/LITUANE

# Kristina VYŠNIAUSKAITĖ-RADINSKIENĖ

Advisor of Human Rights Division; UN, International Organizations and Human Rights department,

Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Lithuania, Vilnius

# **LUXEMBOURG**

#### **Pierre WEISS**

Sociologist, Integration Department, Ministry of Family Affairs, Integration and the Greater Region, Luxembourg

# **Anne GOSSET**

Adviser, Ministry of Justice, Luxembourg

## Elisabeth KNEIP

Attachée, Ministry of Justice, Luxembourg

# **MALTA/MALTE**

#### **Aaron Lee GIARDINA**

Human Rights and Integration Directorate, Ministry for Home Affairs, Security, Reforms and Equality, Paola

# REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA/RÉPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

# Nicolae RĂDIŢA

Deputy of the Director General of the Agency for Interethnic Relations, Chișinău

#### **MONACO**

No nomination / Pas de nomination

# **MONTÉNÉGRO**

Excused / excusé

### **NETHERLANDS/PAYS-BAS**

#### **Basim al ALOUSI**

Policy Advisor, Ministry of the Interior, The Hague

# NORTH MACEDONIA/ MACÉDOINE DU NORD

#### Mabera KAMBERI

Head of Department for coordination and technical assistant to the minister, Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, Skopje

# NORWAY/NORVÈGE

#### Petter SØRLIEN

Senior Adviser, Department of Equality, Non-discrimination and International Affairs, Ministry of Culture and Equality, Oslo

# **PORTUGAL**

# **Berill BARANYAI**

Senior Officer, Department for Equality and Against Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination The Agency for Integration, Migration and Asylum (AIMA) Lisbon

### ROMANIA/ROUMANIE

# **Maria-Beatrice BERNA**

Third Secretary, Directorate for Human Rights, Protection of Minorities and Council of Europe, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Bucharest

# Ramona Maria CIUCĂ

Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Romania to the Council of Europe, Strasbourg

# **Costin CIOBANU**

Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Romania to the Council of Europe, Strasbourg

# **SAN MARINO/SAINT-MARIN**

#### **Arianna SCARPELLINI**

Assistant of the Minister, Ministry of Health and Social Security, Welfare and Social Affairs, Political Affairs, Equal Opportunities and Technological Innovation, San Marino

#### SERBIA/SERBIE

#### **Boris MILICEVIC**

Assistant Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Social Dialogue, Belgrade

# SLOVAK REPUBLIC/RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

To be nominated / A nominer

# SLOVENIA/SLOVÉNIE

#### Stanko BALUH

Secretary, Government Office for National Minorities, Republic of Slovenia, Ljubljana

### SPAIN/ESPAGNE

#### Nicolás MARUGÁN

Deputy Director General for equal treatment, non-discrimination and against racism, Ministry of Equality, Madrid

# SWEDEN/SUÈDE

# Erik ADELL HELLSTRÖM

Deputy Director for EU- and International Affairs Coordinator, Division for Discrimination Issues, Human Rights and Child Rights Policy, Ministry of Employment, Stockholm

#### **Andres ZANZI**

Senior Adviser, Division for Human Rights and Discrimination Issues, Ministry of Employment, Stockholm

# SWITZERLAND/SUISSE

#### **Muriel TRUMMER**

Juriste, conseillère juridique, Direction du droit international public DDIP, Département fédéral des affaires étrangères, Berne

# **Dominique STEIGER LEUBA**

Avocate, conseillère juridique ; Unité Protection internationale des droits de l'homme, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Département fédéral de justice et police, Berne

# <u>TÜRKIYE</u>

### **Mustafa CELAYIR**

Legal Counsellor, Ministry of Justice, Legal Affairs Section of the Permanent Representation of Türkiye to the Council of Europe, Strasbourg

# **UKRAINE**

#### **Ihor LOSSOVSKYI**

Deputy Head, State Service of Ukraine for Ethnic Affairs and Freedom of Conscience, Kyiv

### **UNITED KINGDOM/ROYAUME-UNI**

#### Sean FINCH

Head of LGBT+ International, Workplace, Aslyum and Resettlement, and Hate Crime Policy Government Equalities Office, Manchester

#### **Daniel BUCKETT**

Senior Advisor, LGBT+ International and Safety, Government Equalities Office, London

# INVITEES TO THE 9th CDADI MEETING/ INVITÉ-ES À LA 9E RÉUNION DU CDADI

**Jeroen SCHOKKENBROEK**, Director, Equal Rights and Dignity Directorate / *Directeur, Direction de l'égalité en droits et en dignité* 

Manuel DEMOUGEOT, Chair of the ADI-ROM / Président de l'ADI-ROM

**Jean Paul BACHELOT**, Member of the working group of the ADI-ROM / *Membre du groupe de travail de l'ADI-ROM* 

**Oana NESTIAN-SANDU,** Independent expert, Olga Lengyel Institute for Holocaust Studies / Experte indépendante, Institut Olga Lengyel pour les études sur l'Holocauste

Jenifer JACKSON-PREECE, Independent expert / Experte indépendante

Yuri DE BOER, Chair of the ADI-SOGIESC / Président de l'ADI-SOGIESC

**Robert STRYK,** Director, Directorare of Internal Oversight / Directeur, Direction de l'Audit interne, de l'Évaluation et de l'Investigation

Jan HERO, ADI-ROM member on behalf of Slovakia / Membre au nom de la Slovaquie

**Mihai SURDU**, Independent expert to the ADI-ROM WG on disegregation / Expert indépendant pour le GT sur la déségrégation de l'ADI-ROM

Bertil COTTIER, Chair of ECRI / Président de l'ECRI

Krzysztof STANOWSKI, Vice-Chair of the ADI-INT / Vice-président de l'ADI-INT

**Cristian AHLUND**, External consultant, ex-Chair of ECRI / Consultant externe, ex-président de l'ECRI

# **PARTICIPANT-ES**

# Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) / Assemblée parlementaire du Conseil de l'Europe (APCE)

Giorgio LODDO, Secretary of the PACE Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination / Secrétaire de la commission de l'APCE sur l'égalité et la non-discrimination

# Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe / Congrès des Pouvoirs locaux et régionaux du Conseil de l'Europe

Maren LAMBRECHT-FEIGL, Secretary of Committee on Social Inclusion and Human Dignity / Secrétaire de la commission de l'inclusion sociale et de la dignité humaine

Inge HANNON, Co-Secretary of Committee on Social Inclusion and Human Dignity / Co-Secrétaire de la commission de l'inclusion sociale et de la dignité humaine

# Council of Europe's Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights/ Bureau du Commissaire aux droits de l'homme du Conseil de l'Europe

Patricia ÖTVÖS, Adviser, Division III/ Conseillère, Division no III

Tara BEATTIE, Adviser, Division III/ Conseillère, Division no III

# <u>European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) / Commission européenne contre le racisme et l'intolérance</u>

Johan FRIESTEDT, Executive Secretary of ECRI / Secrétaire exécutif de l'ECRI

# Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (ACFCNM) / Convention-cadre pour la protection des minorités nationales n/a

# **European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages/**

La Charte européenne des langues régionales ou minoritaires (ECRML)

Jörg HORN, ECRML Secretariat/ Secrétariat de l'ECRML

# <u>Steering Committee for Human Rights in the fields of Biomedicine and Health (CDBIO) / Comité directeur pour les droits de l'homme dans les domaines de la biomédecine et de la santé</u>

Laurence LWOFF, Secretary of the Committee / Secrétaire du comité

# Committee of Experts on Roma and Traveller Issues (ADI-ROM) / Comité d'experts sur les questions relatives aux Roms et aux Gens du voyage

Manuel DEMOUGEOT, Chair of the ADI-ROM/ Président de l'ADI-ROM

# <u>Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) / Comité directeur sur les médias et la société de l'information</u>

Giulia LUCCHESE, Media and Internet Governance Division / Division de Médias et gouvernance de l'Internet

# Steering Committee on the rights of the child (CDENF) / Comité directeur pour les droits de l'enfant

Katrin UERPMANN, Secretary of the Committee/ Secrétaire du comité

# Advisory Council on Youth (CCJ) / Conseil consultatif sur la jeunesse

Petr Pavel BANDA, Member of the CCJ/ Membre du CCJ

# Gender Equality Commission (GEC) / Commission pour l'égalité de genre

Cécile GRÉBOVAL, GEC Secretariat, Programme Manager in Gender Mainstreaming, Gender Equality Division / Gestionnaire de programme pour l'intégration de la perspective d'égalité de genre, Division d'égalité de genre

# <u>Directorate of Internal Oversight / La Direction de l'Audit interne, de l'Évaluation et de l'Investigation</u>

Malcolm COX, Senior Evaluator / Évaluateur senior

### **HOLY SEE / SAINT-SIÈGE**

To be nominated / A nominer

# OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS, OBERSERVATRICES

# EUROPEAN NETWORK OF EQUALITY BODIES (EQUINET) / RÉSEAU EUROPÉEN DES ORGANISMES D'ÉGALITE (EQUINET)

Daris José LEWIS RECIO, Legal & Policy Officer, Brussels / Chargée de mission juridique et politique

# ENAR - European Network against Racism / Réseau européen contre le racisme

Kim L. SMOUTER UMANS, ENAR Executive Director / Directeur exécutif

Julie PASCOËT, Policy and advocacy coordinator, Brussels / Coordinatrice de la politique et de la défense des intérêts

# <u>EUROPEAN CENTRE FOR MINORITY ISSUES (ECMI) / CENTRE EUROPÉEN POUR LES QUESTIONS RELATIVES AUX MINORITÉS</u>

Ljubica ĐORĐEVIĆ-VIDOJKOVIĆ, Senior Researcher, Head of the Justice and Governance

Meyeti PAYET, Project Consultant / Consultante du projet

# The International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association (ILGA-EUROPE) / L'Association internationale des lesbiennes, gays, bisexuels, trans et intersexes (ILGA)

Cianán B. RUSSELL, Ph.D., Senior Policy Officer, ILGA-Europe / Chargé de mission principal, ILGA-Europe, Brussels

Jana HUGO, Policy Officer / Chargée de mission

# Assembly of European Regions / Assemblée des Régions d'Europe (AER) n/a

### Ligue internationale contre le racisme et l'Antisémitisme (LICRA)

Gilbert FLAM, Président de la commission des affaires européennes et internationales de la LICRA

# <u>European Roma Institute for Arts and Culture (ERIAC) / Institut européen des Roms pour les arts et la culture</u>

Timea JUNGHAUS, Executive Director / Directrice exécutive

# SECRETARIAT / SECRÉTARIAT

# <u>Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity / Direction générale de la Démocratie et de la dignité humaine</u>

Hallvard GORSETH, Head of the Anti-discrimination Department / Chef de Service de l'antidiscrimination

Wolfram BECHTEL, <u>Secretary of the CDADI</u>, Head of CDADI Division, Anti-discrimination Department / <u>Secrétaire du CDADI</u>, Chef de la division CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Charlotte GILMARTIN, Co-Secretary of the CDADI, CDADI Division, Anti-discrimination Department / Co-Secrétaire du CDADI, Division CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Cristina MILAGRE, Seconded official, CDADI Division, Anti-discrimination Department / Fonctionnaire mis-a-disposition, Division CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Eleni TSETSEKOU, Secretary of the ADI-ROM, Head of Division of the Roma and Travellers Team, Anti-discrimination Department / Secrétaire de l'ADI-ROM, Cheffe de la division pour l'Equipe Roms et Gens du Voyage, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Oana TABA, Co-Secretary of the ADI-ROM, Roma and Travellers Team, Anti-discrimination Department /Co-Secrétaire de l'ADI-ROM, Equipe Roms et Gens du Voyage, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Marina VASIĆ, Administrator - Programme manager, Roma and Travellers Team, Antidiscrimination Department / Administratrice – Manager de programme, Equipe Roms et Gens du Voyage, Service de l'anti-discrimination Thorsten AFFLERBACH, Head of the Inclusion and Anti-discrimination Programmes Division, Anti-discrimination Department / Chef de la division de Programmes sur l'inclusion et l'anti-discrimination, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Menno ETTEMA, former Co-Secretary of ADI/MSI-DIS, Head of Hate Speech, Hate Crime and Artificial Intelligence Unit, Inclusion and Anti-discrimination Programmes Division, Anti-discrimination Department / ancien Co-Secrétaire de l'ADI/MSI-DIS, Chef de l'Unité-Discours de haine, crimes de haine et intelligence artificielle, division Programmes sur l'inclusion et l'anti-discrimination, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Nidaa BOTMI, Project officer Hate Speech, Hate Crime and Artificial Intelligence Unit, Antidiscrimination Department / Cheffe de projet, Unité Discours de haine, crimes de haine et intelligence artificielle, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Evgenia GIAKOUMOPOULOU, Secretary of the ADI-SOGIESC, Head of the SOGIESC Unit, Inclusion and Anti-discrimination Programmes Division, Anti-discrimination Department / Secrétaire de l'ADI-SOGIESC / Cheffe de l'unité SOGIESC, division Programmes sur l'inclusion et l'anti-discrimination, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Ellsworth CAMILLERI, Co-Secretary of the ADI-SOGIESC, SOGIESC Unit, Inclusion and Anti-discrimination Programmes Division, Anti-discrimination Department / Co-Secrétaire de l'ADI-SOGIESC, Unité SOGIESC, division Programmes sur l'inclusion et l'anti-discrimination, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Ljiljana STOJISAVLJEVIC, <u>Assistant to the Secretary of the CDADI</u>, Senior Assistant of the CDADI Division, Anti-discrimination Department. / Assistante au Secrétaire du CDADI, Assistante principale de la division CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Sandrine JOUSSE, Administrative Assistant, CDADI Division, Anti-discrimination Department / Assistante administrative, division CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Eda UNER, Trainee, CDADI Division, Anti-discrimination Department / Stagiaire, division CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

# INTERPRETERS /INTERPRÈTES

Lucie DEBURLET-SUTER Morgane LAMOTHE Gillian WAKENHUT

Appendix III

List of upcoming meetings of the CDADI and its substructures

Date	Name
18-19/04/2024	CDADI Bureau meeting
Paris	· ·
29 April 2024	ADI-ROM Working Group on a Feasibility study and possible draft Recommendation on desegregation and inclusion policies and practices in the field of education of Roma and Traveller children
22/05/2024 online	GT-ADI-MIN on regional and national minority language protection
14-15/05/2024 The Hague	Committee of experts on Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and Expression and Sex Characteristics (ADI-SOGIESC) followed by IDAHOT+ Forum
14-15/05/2024 Lublin	Committee of Experts on Intercultural Inclusion (ADI-INT)
15-16/05/2024 Strasbourg	Committee of Experts on Roma and Traveller Issues (ADI-ROM)
18-20/06/2024	9 <sup>th</sup> CDADI meeting
Strasbourg 3-4/09/2024	ADI-SOGIESC Working group on draft CM/Rec on the equality of rights of
Strasbourg	intersex persons
25-26/09/2024	Committee of Experts on Artificial Intelligence, Equality and Discrimination
Strasbourg	(GEC/ADI-AI)
Sep/Oct 2024	ADI-ROM Working Group on a Feasibility study and possible draft Recommendation on desegregation and inclusion policies and practices in the field of education of Roma and Traveller children
3-4/10/2024 Paris	CDADI Bureau meeting
10-11/10/2024 Strasbourg	Committee of Experts on Intercultural Inclusion (ADI-INT)
29-30/10/2024 Strasbourg	Committee of Experts on Roma and Traveller Issues (ADI-ROM)
29-30/10/2024 Strasbourg	Committee of experts on Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and Expression and Sex Characteristics (ADI-SOGIESC)
Oct/Nov 2024 Online	WG on deliverables regarding hate speech and hate crime (GT-AD-DCH)
Nov 2024 online	GT-ADI-MIN on regional and national minority language protection
26-28/11/2024 Paris	10 <sup>th</sup> CDADI meeting
Jan 2025 online	Working group on intersectional discrimination (GT-ADI-DI)
6-7/05/2025 (tbc) 15-16/04/2025 (tbc)	CDADI Bureau meeting
19-20/05/2025	Committee of experts on Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and
Malta (tbc)	Expression and Sex Characteristics (ADI-SOGIESC)
1-3/07/2025	11 <sup>th</sup> CDADI meeting

# **Appendix IV**

# Report and follow-up on the CDADI Exchange of views on Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion

1. This summary report is based on submissions from Council of Europe member States and other organisations both during the exchange of views during the CDADI meeting on 6 December 2023 and in written contributions following the exchange of views.

### Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion

- 2. Quite a number of CoE member States, but not all, noted an increase in antisemitic acts after the terrorist attack of Hamas against Israel on 7 October 2023. In some cases, data was still being collected and analysed. Such acts ranged from hate speech to threats against Jewish institutions such as schools and synagogues, to physical attacks against Jewish students at universities, and violent clashes at demonstrations. Several member States had enhanced security and protection of Jewish institutions. The majority of incidents which had been flagged concerned online hate speech in social media, where perpetrators could post anonymously, spreading fake news and disinformation aimed at creating hostility and provoking further violence against Jewish populations. The increase in attacks against the Jewish population in several CoE member States had created great uncertainty among Jewish communities. In such circumstances, Jewish people often refrained from wearing religious symbols in public, which could identify them as being Jewish. It was also noted that online hate speech against ethnic and religious minorities was widely underreported and that there was a lack of data.
- 3. Several CoE member States also noted an increase in anti-Muslim racism, mainly from right wing extremist groups. In some member States, data related to hate speech and hate crime was not disaggregated in relation to ethnic or religious minorities, which made it difficult to distinguish between different ethnic or religious minorities. Some anti-Muslim insults and threats took place as a reaction to demonstrations but also online via social networks. Anti-Muslim incidents in the workplace had also been reported. A resurgence in anti-Muslim stereotypes and a lowered threshold for expressing anti-Muslim opinions had also been noted, especially online.

# Council of Europe standards in this area

4. The recent standards prepared by the CDADI on combating hate speech (CM/Rec(2022)16), combating hate crime (CM/Rec(2024)4) and on intercultural integration (CM/Rec(2022)10) provide comprehensive guidance for preventing and combating racism and intolerance, including on the ground of religion. The recent General Policy Recommendations No. 5 and No. 9 of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance on combating anti-Muslim racism and discrimination and on combating Antisemitism provide more detailed guidance for preventing and combating those specific forms of racism.

### Measures taken by member States

- 5. During the exchange of views and through written contributions, member States reported on a wide variety of measures that they have taken to prevent and combat Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion. A large number of these are documented in the separate compilation of written contributions.
- 6. The measures include the enactment of legislation against hate crime, hate speech and religious extremism, the adoption of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) working definition of Antisemitism as well as of national strategies and action plans dealing with Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion. Member States have also established structures for the implementation of such action plans, reporting platforms for hate speech and hate crime and advice networks for victims. In several member States, solidarity manifestations took place. The level of funding for security measures for synagogues, Jewish organisations and also mosques and Muslim faith schools has been increased, and the police have taken measures to prevent religiously motivated hate speech at public gatherings. Several member States have set up fora for inter-religious dialogue, and in one member State, the relevant forum held an extraordinary session immediately after the terrorist attack of Hamas. Also, awareness raising campaigns promoting cohesion instead of hatred among the general population, support for civil society projects and training activities on the Holocaust and human rights for all members of the police of one member State were being organised.

# Follow-up

- 7. The CDADI encourages its members, participants and observers to continue to be inspired by the practices shared during and after the exchange of views on 6 December 2023 and to make use of the relevant standards, reports and tools developed by the CDADI. In addition to the standards cited in § 4 above, specific mention is made of the recent CDADI Study on preventing and combating hate speech in times of crisis. In its ongoing work, the CDADI will pay specific attention to Antisemitism and other forms of intolerance and hatred based on religion, for example in its work on artificial intelligence, equality and discrimination, and on intersectional discrimination.
- 8. The CDADI encourages other Council of Europe bodies, including ECRI and the Special Representative of the Secretary General on antisemitic, anti-Muslim and other forms of religious intolerance and hate crimes, to continue their important action in this field. Based on § 28 of CM/Rec(2022)16, the CDADI calls on public officials in leadership positions to publicly promote a culture of human rights and highlight the unifying elements among religions. The further development of such discourse bears a great potential to prevent Antisemitism, Anti-Muslim racism and other forms of religious intolerance and hatred. The CDADI finally encourages political parties and their leaders to sign the Charter of European political parties for a non-racist and inclusive society, to refrain from disseminating hate speech and to condemn hate speech firmly and promptly, while respecting freedom of expression.