



**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS
COMITE EUROPEEN DES DROITS SOCIAUX**

20 December 2019

Case Document No. 1

Sindacato Autonomo Europeo Scuola ed Ecologia (SAESE) v. Italy
Complaint No. 186/2019

COMPLAINT

Registered at the Secretariat on 25 November 2019

For the European Committee of Social Rights
Strasbourg – France

Object: Supplement to the Collective Complaint filed on 24 November 2019 – Pensions in Italy

*By way of supplement to our legal opinion filed on 24 November 2019, we hereby submit a practical example in order to provide a better idea of the way in which Article 30 of the European Social Charter has been violated. With this in mind, we submit for your attention the circumstances of **Very Important People** in Italy.*

Many former television and film stars are in fact forced to get by on very low pensions, which are in some cases significantly below €1 000 per month. Consequently, after very long careers, many of the famous people whom we all know are left with a pittance, as is apparent for example from the case of former dancer **Enzo Paolo Turchi**, who has admitted receiving only €740 each month. Also **Simona Izzo** is not getting on particularly well: *“My pension is €1 000 a month, if I didn’t work I wouldn’t even get €1 200 and I wouldn’t be able to do anything”*. But this is not all, as she goes on to add specifically in response to the debate that has arisen since her announcement that: *“If I said that I was working to pay my grandchildren through school they should say I’m doing something good”*.

Giucas Casella is not faring much better, receiving a pension of around €800 per month. Also the singer **Wilma De Angelis** has to make do with the same amount, despite having started to perform at the age of 16.

Not even former model **Alvaro Vitali** seems to be doing that well, following a stellar television and cinema career in the 1990s, who is now also in financial difficulty.

VIPs living with a very low pension also include **Barbara Bouchet**. Whilst her son Alessandro Borghese is enjoying great success on television with successful cooking programmes, it seems that the actress by contrast has to get by on just €511 each month. The most recent person to announce her current financial difficulties has been **Maria Teresa Ruta**. Although she has not yet retired, according to the most recent calculations the presenter would actually end up receiving just €275 each month.

Finally, other VIPs with a very low pension include Margherita Fumero, Edoardo Vianello and Dalila Di Lazzaro.

Date: 8 December 2019

Yours faithfully,

Signed: Prof. Francesco Orbitello
President and Treasurer of the SAESE

**For the European Committee of Social Rights
Strasbourg – France**

Object: Collective complaint against the “Fornero Law” (Pensions for all schools staff) – Italy

After teaching for 40 years, a lower secondary school teacher (former middle school) will now retire with €1 550 per month; according to projections by the INPS [National Institute for Social Security] (which take account of salary inflation over the years), if he or she had the good fortune to secure a permanent employment contract at age 27, he or she will retire with €1 200.

*According to the figure reported in the INPS budget for 2018, it is receiving contributions of 227 billion (of which 56 are from public sector employees and 146 from private sector employees), whilst paying out 265 in benefits. The difference is made up by the state, i.e. taxpayers. Essentially, the contributions paid by employees are not covering the pensions paid out. Today, three and a half million workers in insecure employment in schools (**teachers and ATA staff**) aged below 35 have contracts. They will have to pay into a supplementary pension if they wish to avoid the risk of living in poverty. According to the 2011 Report on the Welfare State, a public sector employee with 40 years of contributions (including 18 before 1996) aged 60 could expect to receive a pension equal to around 100% of his or her final salary; a private sector employee would receive 77%. In 2036, a person in the same circumstances will receive a pension equal to 58% of the final salary. The “Dignity Decree” of the First Conte Government does not help: it reduced the maximum limit for fixed-term employment to 2 years, but if the company does not make the worker permanent the labour market does not offer many opportunities. If we consider the rest of Europe, it will be noted that only Sweden has enacted such a strict reform; however, in that country there is more flexibility and average salaries are higher. In France, pensions are calculated based on the 25 best years of contributions, for example between the ages of 37 and 62, which means that it is possible to retire under quite favourable conditions; in this way the system guarantees dignity. Not even strict Germany has enacted a reform like ours. Naturally, the public accounts and demographics in France and Germany are not under the same pressure as they are for us; however, it takes particular ill will to insist on this reform without offering the prospect of any realistic initiatives to create new jobs.*

This is not to speak of “Quota 96” workers in the schools branch who, as a result of a mere error, which was subsequently admitted (two years later) by Fornero, were refused permission to retire when they were only a few steps short of that cherished goal.

Needless to say, whilst Fornero is to be regarded as the main individual responsible, the Italian Government also contributed to this situation by rejecting the corrective amendments unanimously approved by the Italian Parliament in August 2014.

The trade union is also submitting a complaint against Italy on the grounds that “the minimum level for pensions based on contribution history and old age, whether defined-contribution or not, is manifestly inadequate”. The complaint is being submitted by SAESE against Italy concerning Article 30 of the European Social Charter, which enshrines the “right to protection against poverty and social exclusion”, because “it has failed to adopt a global and co-ordinated approach to combat poverty and social exclusion”.

Date: 24 November 2019

Yours faithfully,

**Signed: Prof. Francesco Orbitello
President and Treasurer of the SAESE**