



Strasbourg, 6 November 2018

CAHROM (2018)30

**16th MEETING OF THE AD HOC COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS
ON ROMA AND TRAVELLER¹ ISSUES
(CAHROM)**

ABRIDGED MEETING REPORT

adopted by the CAHROM by written procedure

CAHROM website: www.coe.int/cahrom
CAHROM email address: cahrom@coe.int

¹ The term "Roma and Travellers" is used at the Council of Europe to encompass the wide diversity of the groups covered by the work of the Council of Europe in this field: on the one hand a) Roma, Sinti/Manush, Calé, Kaale, Romanichals, Boyash/Rudari; b) Balkan Egyptians (Egyptians and Ashkali); c) Eastern groups (Dom, Lom and Abdal); and, on the other hand, groups such as Travellers, Yenish, and the populations designated under the administrative term "*Gens du voyage*", as well as persons who identify themselves as Gypsies. The present is an explanatory footnote, not a definition of Roma and/or Travellers.

Introduction

The Ad Hoc Committee of Experts on Roma and Traveller Issues (CAHROM) held its 16th plenary meeting in Strasbourg on 16-19 October 2018. The meeting was chaired by Ms Tatjana Anđelić (Montenegro), Chairperson of CAHROM, and by Mr Ján Hero (Slovak Republic), Vice-Chairperson of CAHROM. The 37 member states present were represented by 20 women and 17 men (54 % and 46 % respectively). The agenda appears in the Appendix of this report. The list of participants and the full meeting report is available from the Secretariat.

Items of information for the Committee of Ministers

The Committee,

Civil society's assessment of the implementation of the Council of Europe Thematic Action Plan on the Inclusion of Roma and Travellers (2016-2019)

1) **heard feedback** from the CAHROM Chair and Vice-Chair, as well as CAHROM rapporteurs and members who attended the 6th meeting of the Council of Europe Dialogue with Roma and Traveller Civil Society, held in Strasbourg on 15-16 October 2018; **tasked the Secretariat** to circulate the conclusions and recommendations of the Dialogue, once finalised, to CAHROM members for potential comments and written contributions; **fixed the date of 30 November 2018** as the deadline to provide preliminary written comments; **took note** of the fact that a further assessment of the implementation of the Thematic Action Plan would take place during the 7th International Roma Women's Conference to be held in Helsinki, Finland, on 20-22 March 2019, under the Finnish Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers, and during the 17th CAHROM plenary meeting to be held in Toulouse, France, in June 2019, under the French Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers; **supported** the preparation of a post-2019 strategic policy document on the inclusion of Roma and Travellers and **suggested** that this document takes the shape of an Action Plan;

Exchange with Ms Timea Junghaus, ERIAC Executive Director

2) **held an exchange** with Ms Timea Junghaus, Executive Director of the European Roma Institute for Arts and Culture (ERAC) and Ms Anna Mirga-Kruszelnicka, ERIAC Deputy Director, who presented a promotional video and reported on ERIAC's past and future activities, highlighting the role of arts and culture in fighting anti-Gypsyism; **congratulated** ERIAC for the wide range of activities conducted in a relatively short period of time; **welcomed** the fact that ERIAC had planned a series of events in the Western Balkans; **suggested** the organization of similar events in the Nordic countries in the near future; **took note** of ERIAC Executive Director's appeal to member states to support ERIAC actions and activities;

Recent developments at international level

3) **heard** from the Head of Division of the Roma and Travellers Team about the financial situation of the Council of Europe in relation to the non-payment of its contribution to the Council of Europe ordinary budget by one member state which could have implications on Council of Europe activities and human resources in 2019; **took note** of recent developments concerning the Roma Youth Action Plan by a representative of the Advisory Council on Youth and of recent and forthcoming activities of the European Alliance of Cities and Regions for the Inclusion of Roma and Travellers by a representative of the Secretariat of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe;

4) **heard feedback** from the Chair of the CAHROM regarding the meeting of chairs of inter-governmental committees and the lunch they had with the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in Strasbourg on 20 September 2018;

- 5) **held an exchange** with representatives from the European Commission, namely from DG JUST on Roma-related developments at EU level and the ongoing progress review of the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies, and from DG NEAR on two IPA projects implemented by UNDP and the World Bank, i.e. the outcomes of a Regional Roma Survey in the Western Balkans and the preliminary findings of a Returnee Study in the Western Balkans (full study due to be released soon);
- 6) **heard** a presentation from a representative of the OHCHR Regional Office for Europe on a joint initiative with MEP Soraya Post and other partners on establishing truth commissions for anti-Gypsyism, as a follow up to the European Parliament resolution of 25 October 2017 on *fundamental rights aspects in Roma integration in the EU: fighting anti-Gypsyism*;

Recent developments at national level

- 7) **heard a presentation from Ms Mila Carovska, Minister of Labour and Social policy of “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”** about their new Law for Social Protection; **welcomed** this positive development and **invited** the CAHROM representative of “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia” to keep the Committee informed about the implementation of this legislation;
- 8) **heard a presentation from Albania** on the new law on Social Housing, which includes provisions related to quotas for Roma and Egyptian families in vulnerable situations to improve access to social housing, as well as the prevention of forced evictions, and **took note** that by-laws are under preparation to complement this new legislation, with temporary shelters to be provided for families until permanent housing can be offered, and free legal assistance made available;
- 9) **heard a presentation from the Russian Federation** on the National Action Plan of Socio-Economic and Ethnocultural Development of Roma in the Russian Federation and **requested the Russian Federation** to provide a list of regions that are planning or have already developed a regional action plan, as well as further information on the registration system for Roma applying for official documents and **fixed the date of 18 November 2018** as the deadline for receiving this information. In addition, the Ukrainian CAHROM member raised the issue of the registration process for Roma who would like to apply for official documents in certain areas of the Ukrainian regions of Donetsk and Luhansk that are not under the administrative control of the Ukrainian authorities;
- 10) **heard a presentation from Croatia** on the main conclusions and recommendations of the International Experts’ Seminar “*Transition from Education to Employment for Roma Youth - A Key step in Roma Inclusion*” held in Brijuni, Croatia, on 25-26 September 2018 under the Croatian Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers;
- 11) **heard from the Deputy to the Permanent Representative of the United Kingdom** on the UK’s work to tackle hate crime and anti-Gypsyism in addition to various other projects promoting better inclusion and tolerance in schools and integration into the healthcare system and education; **requested the United Kingdom** to provide additional information on the True Vision online Police Hate Crime Reporting Portal, on the #OperationReportHate project run by the Traveller Movement and on the cyber hate working group established by the Inter-Parliamentary Coalition for Combating Antisemitism; and **fixed the date of 18 November 2018** as the deadline for receiving this information;
- 12) **heard presentation from Romania** on the Romanian authorities’ initiatives regarding access to employment for Roma;
- 13) **heard a presentation from Bulgaria and the Centre for Educational Integration of Children and Students from Ethnic Minorities (CEICSEM)** on mechanisms introduced in Bulgaria for encouraging the return of *inter alia* Roma children back to school;

Open questions to CAHROM members, participants and observers

14) **heard from Germany** about current reflections of the German authorities on improving data collection on antigypsyist (antiziganist) crimes and **took note** of the fact that seven CAHROM members had responded to Germany's open question; **took note** of the seven replies received to the open question raised by Albania on national/state and external donors' budget allocated to national Roma integration strategies; **took note** of the invitation of the CAHROM Chair addressed to other CAHROM members to provide the Secretariat with written information, including annual average estimates in case of multi-annual funding; and **fixed the date of 30 November 2018** for this request;

Roma history teaching and Holocaust remembrance

15) **heard** an introductory presentation from Mr Jean-Philippe Restoueix, DGII Education Directorate, of the draft Committee of Ministers Recommendation "*Passing in remembrance of the Holocaust, of the resistance fighters, against crimes perpetrated by the Nazis, their accomplices and collaborators, and preventing crimes against humanity*" prepared by the Steering Committee for Education Policy and Practice (CDPPE) and submitted to the CAHROM for comments; **took note** of oral comments to the draft text presented by Switzerland; **agreed** to provide the Secretariat with written comments to the draft recommendation **by 18 November 2018**;

16) **heard the** report and the conclusions from the CAHROM Vice-Chair regarding the first meeting of the CAHROM drafting group on a proposed draft Committee of Ministers recommendation on the inclusion of the teaching of Roma history, including Roma Holocaust, in textbooks and school curricula held in Strasbourg on 6 September 2018; **agreed** with the drafting group's proposal to rename the proposed recommendation as follows "*recommendation on the inclusion of the teaching of Roma and/or Travellers' history in school curricula and teaching materials*" and to include specific guidelines regarding *inter alia* the teaching of the Roma Holocaust in the recommendation itself; **took note** of the amendments to the draft text made by Sweden and Switzerland; **agreed to fix the date of 30 November 2018** as the deadline to provide written comments to the draft recommendation as the 2nd meeting of the CAHROM drafting group is due to be held in Strasbourg on 5 December 2018; **agreed** to invite a representation of the European Association of History Educators "EUROCLIO" to the 2nd meeting of the drafting group for an exchange;

17) **thanked the Serbian CAHROM member and the Permanent Representation of Serbia** for the opportunity to visit the exhibition "*Roma during the First World War*";

Situation of Roma in the Americas

18) **took note** of the message from Mr Fernand de Varennnes, UN Special Rapporteur on Minority Issues, to the CAHROM, read by the Chair of CAHROM;

19) **took note** of a briefing document prepared by the Secretariat on Roma living on the American continent; **heard a comprehensive overview from the representative of the Holy See** regarding the situation of Roma in Brazil, Colombia, Mexico and the United States of America and of the actions undertaken by the Catholic church to support Roma and Traveller families; **took note** of the Holy See's suggestion to hold an exchange on the situation of Roma living in Asia at one of its next meetings; **agreed** to reintroduce this item on the agenda of its autumn 2019 plenary meeting and **tasked the secretariat** to extend in due course an invitation to the UN Special Rapporteur on Minority Issues and to Permanent Observers of Canada, the Holy See, Mexico and the United States for an exchange of views;

20) **took note** of the update from the Hungarian Equinet member regarding the pre-boarding screenings of Roma ethnic origin passengers that prevented them from boarding flights to Canada from Budapest, Paris, London, Brussels, Vienna and more recently Lisbon airports; **agreed** to keep this item on the agenda of one of its next meetings and **tasked the Chair** to remind the Permanent Observer of Canada that the Committee is expecting a written answer to additional questions raised by Equinet and ENNHRI members;

Thematic reports

21) **examined and endorsed** the CAHROM thematic report on Roma access to employment, with a focus on Roma women and youth, following a visit held in Enschede and Tilburg, the Netherlands, on 12-14 June 2018 (document CAHROM(2018)13), and the CAHROM thematic report on enhancing Roma children's compulsory school education and access to vocational education for Roma youth, following a visit held in Chişinău and Vulcăneşti, Republic of Moldova, on 24-26 April 2018 (document CAHROM (2018)12);

22) **discussed the follow-up** to thematic reports on Romani language and other languages spoken by Roma, Boyash, Sinti, Kaale, and Yenish following visits to Croatia and Austria in September 2014 and March 2017 respectively, as well as the thematic visit on the schooling of Traveller and allophone (Roma migrants') children held in France in October 2015;

23) **agreed** to include a summary of the discussions held in parallel thematic working groups in an appendix of the full meeting report;

Work programme and working methods

24) **took note** of the amendment introduced in the Terms of Reference of CAHROM regarding the mainstreaming of the rights of persons with disabilities in line with the Council of Europe Disability Strategy 2017-2023; **decided** to take this topic into account for future thematic groups;

25) following the request by the Rapporteur Group of the Committee of Ministers on Social and Health Questions (GR-SOC) of 11 September 2018, **examined the request from the Sovereign Order of Malta to be granted “participant” status in the CAHROM** and, with a large majority, **considered** that the longstanding social and humanitarian actions of the Sovereign Order of Malta benefitting the Roma population are relevant for the work of the Committee, and could be an added value for the fulfilment of its main tasks as described in the Terms of Reference of the Committee, in particular the identification of good practices and the exchange of information, views and experience on measures for Roma and Travellers at national, regional and local level; **considered** that the actions of the Sovereign Order of Malta related to Roma as presented by its Ambassador at large for the Roma people at two CAHROM meetings (in 2014 and 2018) pursue the same objective as the Council of Europe, i.e. fostering the integration of the Roma population, in particular through health and education actions for Roma women and children; and **took note of the fact that several delegations expressed support for the request of the Sovereign Order of Malta; and that, of the three delegations who initially expressed reservations, one maintained its reservation, one abstained and one did not come back to the Secretariat within the *ad referendum* deadline;**

26) **examined the request received from the European Roma Institute for Arts and Culture (ERIAC) to be granted “observer” status in the CAHROM;** due to the lack of consensus, and in compliance with paragraph III.C.8.a. of Resolution CM/Res(2011)24, **decided that this matter be referred to the Committee of Ministers;**

27) **re-elected** Ms Tatjana Anđelić (Montenegro) as chair and Mr Ján Hero (Slovak Republic) as vice-chair, and **elected** Ms Merita Xhafaj (Albania) as third Bureau member for the 2019 Bureau;

28) **adopted** the Updated Guidelines for CAHROM Rapporteurs (document CAHROM (2018)3);

29) **appointed its rapporteurs as follows:** Ms Mabera Kamberi (“the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”) as Gender Equality Rapporteur and Ms Berill Baranyai (Portugal) as her substitute; Ms Henna Huttu (Finland) as Roma Children Rapporteur and Ms Sophie Heegaard-Schroeter (Switzerland) as her substitute; Mr Nicolae Radiţa (Republic of Moldova) as Roma Youth Rapporteur and Mr Stanko Baluh (Slovenia) as his substitute; Mr Martijn Kraaij (the Netherlands) as Rapporteur on the Role of Local and Regional Authorities for the Inclusion of Roma and Travellers and Ms Linda Niki Volosinsky

(Hungary) as his substitute; Mr Andr s Zanzi (Sweden) as Rapporteur on Anti-Gypsyism and Hate Crime and the CAHROM member from the United Kingdom as his substitute (member yet to be appointed);

30) **heard feedback** from the thematic visit on Roma integration, policy development and coordination practices in countries with a small Roma population held in R ga, Jelgava and J rmala, Latvia, on 3-5 October 2018, in which representatives from Estonia, Finland, Georgia, Lithuania, Norway and Slovenia, as well as from the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI) participated;

31) **took note** that a thematic visit on solving the lack of identity documents and statelessness would be held in Tirana, Albania, on 14-16 November 2018, and that Bosnia and Herzegovina, Italy, Montenegro, Serbia, "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" and Ukraine, as well as representatives of the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI), the European Network on Statelessness (ENS) and the UNHCR would participate;

32) **endorsed** the updated list of proposed CAHROM thematic groups/visits for 2018-2020 (document CAHROM (2018)2rev3);

Exchange on practices concerning the geographical and/or social mapping of Roma and Traveller communities and their impact on data collection and policies

33) **took note** of the presentation by "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" on its social mapping of Roma in fourteen local self-governing municipalities under an IPA project; **took note** of the fact that an extension of this mapping to ten additional municipalities with the financial support of the Regional Cooperation Council (RCC) is under consideration;

34) **heard** a preliminary comparative analysis of geographical and/or social mapping of Roma and Traveller communities in vulnerable situations in various member states from Ms Zora Popova, representative of the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI); **welcomed** this analysis and **invited** Ms Zora Popova to pursue this comparative analysis by introducing new elements of comparison (census results, halting sites of Travellers, indicators, methodology, etc.) and enlarging the research to other member states with a view to present a more consolidated analysis at its next meeting;

Screening of the movie "unerh rt j nisch" ("yeniche sounds")

35) **thanked** Switzerland and its Permanent Representation for the opportunity to watch a documentary movie on the Yenish population living in Switzerland; **decided** to postpone the feedback discussion to its next meeting due to early departure of several participants;

Arrangements for the next plenary meetings

36) **thanked the French authorities** for their invitation to host the 17th plenary meeting in Toulouse on 11-14 June 2019 under the French Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers; **agreed** on agenda items for its next meeting (see full meeting report);

37) **took note** of preliminary discussions between the Secretariat and the CAHROM members concerned regarding the possible hosting of a future CAHROM meeting by Georgia and Germany under their respective Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers, and of the proposal from Croatia to host a future CAHROM plenary meeting;

Adoption of the list of decisions

38) **took note** of the list of decisions presented by the Secretariat and, in the absence of a quorum, **adopted** the present abridged meeting report by written procedure.

Appendix: Agenda of the 16th CAHROM meeting, Strasbourg, 16-19 October 2018

Tuesday, 16 October 2018

- I. OPENING OF THE 16th CAHROM MEETING AND ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA
- II. CIVIL SOCIETY'S ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE THEMATIC ACTION PLAN ON THE INCLUSION OF ROMA AND TRAVELLERS 2016-2019
- III. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS AT INTERNATIONAL LEVEL AND EXCHANGE WITH ERIAC
 - 3.1 Exchange with ERIAC Executive Director
 - 3.2 Exchange with the European Commission and the OHCHR

Wednesday, 17 October 2018

- IV. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS AT NATIONAL LEVEL AND OPEN QUESTIONS
 - 4.1 Recent developments at national level
 - 4.2 Open questions to CAHROM members, participants and observers
- V. ROMA HISTORY TEACHING AND HOLOCAUST REMEMBRANCE
 - 5.1 CAHROM comments to the draft Committee of Ministers Recommendation "Passing in remembrance of the Holocaust, of the resistance fighters, against crimes perpetrated by the Nazis, their accomplices and collaborators, and preventing crimes against humanity"
 - 5.2 CAHROM comments to the draft Committee of Ministers recommendation on the inclusion of the teaching of Roma and Travellers' history in school curricula and teaching materials
- VI. SITUATION OF ROMA IN THE AMERICAS

Thursday, 18 October 2018

- VII. EXAMINATION OF CAHROM THEMATIC REPORTS (PARALLEL WORKING SESSIONS)
 - 7.1 Parallel thematic working sessions
 - 7.2 Rapporteurs' feedback on parallel thematic working groups
- VIII. CAHROM WORKING METHODS AND PROGRAMME OF ACTIVITIES
 - 8.1 CAHROM Terms of Reference 2018-2019, including the examination of the request from the Order of Malta to be granted "participant" status and from the ERIAC to be granted "observer" status
 - 8.2 Revised Guidelines for CAHROM Rapporteurs and (re)appointment of CAHROM rapporteurs
 - 8.3 CAHROM thematic groups and visits for 2018-2020

Friday, 19 October 2018

- IX. Elections of the 2019 CAHROM Bureau
- X. EXCHANGE ON THE GEOGRAPHICAL AND/OR SOCIAL MAPPING OF ROMA AND TRAVELLER COMMUNITIES AND ITS IMPACT ON DATA COLLECTION AND POLICIES
- XI. ARRANGEMENTS/PROPOSALS FOR THE AGENDA OF THE NEXT PLENARY MEETING
- XII. ADOPTION OF THE LIST OF DECISIONS