AD HOC COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON ROMA AND TRAVELLER\(^1\) ISSUES (CAHROM)

__________

THEMATIC VISIT ON THE TEACHING OF ROMA HISTORY
(INCLUDING ROMA HOLOCAUST/GENOCIDE) IN THE TEXTBOOKS AND SCHOOL CURRICULA

__________

REPORT FOR THE THEMATIC VISIT TO KOŠICE, SLOVAK REPUBLIC
7-9 NOVEMBER 2017

__________

Experts from SLOVAK REPUBLIC, requesting country

Mr Ján HERO
CAHROM member, Adviser to the State Secretary, Ministry of Education, Science, Research and Sport, SLOVAK REPUBLIC

Mr Jozef FACUNA
Deputy Director of the State Pedagogical Institute, SLOVAK REPUBLIC

Experts from CZECH REPUBLIC, HUNGARY, REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA AND ROMANIA, partner countries

Mr Zdeněk DOUBRAVSKÝ
CAHROM substitute member, Secretariat of the Government Council for National Minorities, Government Council for Roma Minority Affairs Unit, CZECH REPUBLIC

Ms Nikolett KONYA
Social inclusion expert, Ministry of Human Capacities, HUNGARY

\(^1\) The term “Roma and Travellers” is used at the Council of Europe to encompass the wide diversity of the groups covered by the work of the Council of Europe in this field: on the one hand a) Roma, Sinti/Manush, Calé, Kaale, Romanichals, Boyash/Rudari; b) Balkan Egyptians (Egyptians and Ashkali); c) Eastern groups (Dom, Lom and Abdal); and, on the other hand, groups such as Travellers, Yenish, and the populations designated under the administrative term “Gens du voyage”, as well as persons who identify themselves as Gypsies. The present is an explanatory footnote, not a definition of Roma and/or Travellers.
Dr Ion DUMINICA  
CAHROM member, Head of the Ethnical Minorities Department, Institute of Cultural Heritage, Academy of Sciences of Moldova, **REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA**

Mr Petre-Georgian MATEI  
Ministry of National Education, **ROMANIA**

Ms Martina MASCHKE  
International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) – Head of the Committee on the Genocide of the Roma

Dr. Gerhard BAUMGARTNER  
Director of the Documentation Centre of the Austrian Resistance, Austria

Mons. Robinson WIJESINGHE  
CAHROM observer, Dicastery for Promoting Integral Human Development, Holy See (excused)

Mr Cristi MIHALACHE  
OSCE/ODIHR Contact Point for Roma and Sinti (CPRSI) – observer (excused)
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## I. INTRODUCTION
- 1.1 Context of the thematic report and visit  
- 1.2 Composition of the thematic group  
- 1.3 Programme of the thematic visit and main issues addressed  
- 1.4 Terminology  
- 1.5 Size, composition, language, lifestyle and situation of Roma.  
  - 1.5.1 Slovak Republic  
  - 1.5.2 Czech Republic  
  - 1.5.3 Hungary  
  - 1.5.4 Republic of Moldova  
  - 1.5.5 Romania

## II. EUROPEAN AND INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND REFERENCE TEXTS
- 2.1 At the level of the Council of Europe  
- 2.2 Other European/international standards and reference texts  

## III. Teaching of Roma history (including Roma Holocaust/genocide) in the textbooks and school curricula
- 3.1 Legislative and policy framework and practise  
  - 3.1.1 Slovak Republic  
  - 3.1.2 Czech Republic  
  - 3.1.3 Hungary  
  - 3.1.4 Republic of Moldova  
  - 3.1.5 Romania

## IV. CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS LEARNED, GOOD PRACTICES IDENTIFIED, AND ENVISAGED FOLLOW-UP
- 4.1 Conclusions of the thematic group of experts  
- 4.2 Lessons learnt by the experts  
- 4.3 Good practices identified  
- 4.4 Envisaged follow-up

## APPENDICES:
- **Appendix 1:** Official invitation letter  
- **Appendix 2:** Programme of the CAHROM thematic visit in Slovak Republic  
- **Appendix 3:** List of experts and participants in the thematic visit  
- **Appendix 4:** Guidelines on the steps towards achieving official recognition of Anti-Gypsyism and on promoting remembrance and the teaching of Roma history in schools.  
- **Appendix 5:** Size, composition, language, lifestyle and situation of Roma in countries participating in the visit.  
- **Appendix 6:** European and international standards and reference texts  
- **Appendix 7:** Table on recognition and commemoration days in CoE member states
I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Context of the thematic report and visit

The issue of teaching Roma history, with special focus on Roma Holocaust during Nazi period in Germany and WWII in Nazi occupied Europe is present in CoE activities for over a decade.

Usually, the discussion on Roma education is connected with the problem of low level of education of Roma communities, low level of school enrolment of Roma children, high school drop-outs rate, segregation in education, overrepresentation of Roma pupils in special schools system, etc., whilst the need for introducing the information concerning Roma history and culture into education system on regular basis, including school curricula and textbooks, is still not properly recognised and valued in European education systems. Meanwhile - the presence of Roma history and Roma culture-related content in school curricula and textbooks can become one of the tools for solving (to some extent) above mentioned problems. It can contribute to awareness raising among the majority population on Roma as the part of European history and European cultural heritage and thus contribute to the change of negative attitude towards Roma among majority. At the same time it can contribute to maintaining Roma self-esteem and to their sense of belonging to European commonwealth that they have already contributed and should still contribute to. Inclusion of Roma history into the education systems within the context of national histories can break the vicious circle of mutual ignorance and mistrustfulness between Roma and non-Roma.

The presenting Roma-related content in education should encompass all elements of the culture, including history, language, literature, music, etc. Special attention should be paid on the dramatic Roma fate during Nazi period. As Roma were recognised as Nazi victims on equal basis with Jews only since the turn of XX and XXI century the cognisance about this are not widely spread neither in school curricula and textbooks nor in European collective memory.

To take stock of the developments, the CoE together with OSCE prepared a database that presents the situation in the member states, mentioned in section 2.1., but in this regard the activities taken on national levels by the authorities responsible for education are indispensable. The CoE is also preparing in cooperation with Georg Eckert Institute and the Roma Education Fund a report analysing the education curricula and the textbooks for primary and secondary education in several member states. The aim is to provide data and clear account of the needs for future actions to be taken by the member states and international organisations. Thus the proposal of Slovak Republic’s authorities on CAHROM thematic visit devoted to this topic was welcomed and met with high interest of CAHROM members. CAHROM interest is reflected also in its proposed Terms of Reference for the period 2018-2019, where - among the specific tasks - it enumerates preparing a draft recommendation on the inclusion of the teaching of Roma history, including Roma Holocaust, in textbooks and school curricula. This specific thematic visit in Slovak Republic is the next step for working out the draft recommendation to the Committee of Ministers of Council of Europe.
The overview of exiting experiences concerning teaching of Roma history was already discussed in 2014, during the CoE and Italian Ministry of Education international seminar, organised under the CoE Dosta! Campaign for combating prejudice and stereotypes towards Roma: “A policy response towards inclusive education: introducing Roma history teaching into national school curricula”. Seminar was focused on providing the available pieces of information on Roma history teaching materials and, on the other hand, to identify the institutional mechanisms to facilitate introducing the Roma history teaching into the national school curricula.

Common efforts of the Council of Europe, European Roma and Travellers Forum, The Partida Romilor “Pro Europa” of Romania, The International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance and the government of Finland on the issue of teaching Roma history resulted in organizing in Bucharest, Romania, on 6-7 April 2016, a conference titled: “Forgotten voices”. Follow up of this conference is “Guidelines on the steps towards achieving official recognition of Anti-Gypsyism and on promoting remembrance and the teaching of Roma history in schools” (see: Appendix 4).

Useful tool offering the teaching materials on Roma, including history, culture, language and literature is the CoE, Graz University and Austrian Ministry of Education project of Roma History fact sheets with aim to support the process of Roma integration via education through mutual knowledge about the common history and culture of Roma and non-Roma in Europe. So far materials are available in Albanian, English, French, German, Italian, Romani, Romanian, Serbian, and Swedish.

One of the issues discussed and findings of the CAHROM thematic visit on Roma mediation (with a focus on school mediators/assistants), held in Lithuania in April 2017, was the role of working Roma school mediators/assistants in the process of promotion of Roma culture and history among school staff, especially teachers, as well as among the pupils originated from the majority population. One of the goals and possible contribution of mediators’ work is the fact that mediators can bring closer Roma culture to Roma and non-Roma pupils as well. Although it must be underlined here that this is (if) temporary solution as the school mediators do not have professional history teaching background and the reality of their daily work doesn’t allow for many interventions in this directions.

The topic of presence of Roma history and culture was partly mentioned during CAHROM thematic visit on protection, preservation and teaching of languages spoken by Roma, Sinti and Yenish (including ways to handle....
the opposition of traditional communities to have their languages written and taught). The findings of this visit are alarming in regard to the Romani languages situation in all European countries. The situation of those languages vary in different countries from: “unsafe/vulnerable” (the language is used by some children in all domains; by all children in limited domains), through: “definitely endangered” (the language is used mostly by the parental generation and up) to “severely endangered” (language is used mostly by the grand-parental generation and up). This should be perceived as yet another proof for Roma culture to be endangered.

Both of the above mentioned CAHROM thematic visits devoted to situation of languages used by Roma and other related groups and Roma mediators showed that education activities related to any form of Roma history and culture teaching are still rather the postulate than regular practice in Europe and are endangered due to fact of their constant absence of recognition as a part of European heritage.

Above mentioned findings confirm the previously observed urgent need to take steps towards actions leading to the preservation of the Romani culture, including language(s), teaching of Roma history and their contribution into the cultural heritage of Europe and European nations. Otherwise, this part of not only Roma but also part of the European history will be lost. At the same time inclusion of Roma history into the national education systems can change the Roma parents’ and Roma pupils’ attitude in general towards education for better and can improve Roma self-esteem as an equal part of European and national histories teaching.

The symbol of lack of proper recognition of the Roma fate during WWII was case of Czech village of Lety, where the pig farm was placed in the former concentration camp for Roma during WWII, although it must be underlined that next to the place the commemoration site was established in 1995. During 14th CAHROM plenary session, held in Strasbourg in 24-27 October 2017, the Czech member informed that Czech government was able to finalised the purchase of the farm and the place will be turn out into the proper commemoration site.

1.2 Composition of the thematic group of experts

The list of the experts participating in the thematic group with contacts can be found in Appendix 3.

1.3 Programme of the thematic visit and main issues addressed

The agenda (see Appendix 2) included meetings and discussions with crucial stakeholders: representatives of Slovak Ministry of Education, Science, Research and Sport, representatives of private school (Pedagogical and Social Academy in Košice), including teachers instructing Roma history and culture and its students, representative of Documentation Centre of the Austrian Resistance and the representative of an international body, namely Roma Genocide Committee of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA).

During the second day experts had an opportunity to observe two lessons: one devoted to Roma history in general and other one devoted to Roma Holocaust specifically. After lessons the discussion with teachers and students was interesting part of the visit enabling experts the direct feedback from the ground. In the

---

7 Thematic group of experts on protection, preservation and teaching of languages spoken by Roma, Sinti and Yenish (including ways to handle the opposition of traditional communities to have their languages written and taught), Graz, 29-31 March 2017 with representatives of: Austria, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Czech Republic, Finland, Germany, Poland, Slovenia, Slovak Republic and Switzerland.

afternoon there was discussion with other teachers from different schools, teaching Roma history, culture including language, which let the experts to get information on very practical level. Participants had opportunity to visit the only professional Roma theatre “Romathan” that presented the performance on Holocaust and contemporary chauvinistic threats. During the meeting with the head of the theatre participants were informed on the problems of the theatre and Roma culture promotion in general, starting with the bad conditions of the theatre building to the problems with staff that leave to better paid jobs.

A debriefing session between the experts of the thematic group was organised in the morning of the third day.

The agenda followed the guidelines developed by the CAHROM and allowed the possibility for partner countries to introduce their experience and exchange views with local interlocutors.

Some of the main issues addressed during the thematic visit were the following:
- the system of school curricula which leave a lot of space for local initiatives (this solution can be advantage but - in relation to Roma-related topics is disadvantage in practice),
- lack of systematic teaching of basic facts on minorities’ presence in the country during the pedagogical studies,
- history of the XX century is not the priority of history teaching and Holocaust, generally present in school curricula, do not reflects in practice (or to very limited extend) the Roma fate as Holocaust victims,
- teaching materials devoted to Roma are still limited, nonetheless there are several international websites that present materials ready to be use,
- the number of Roma victims testimonies is limited, comparing with others and not properly promoted among teachers, educators, etc.,
- the need for researches on Roma Holocaust.

1.4 Terminology and scope of the visit
Council of Europe prepared in 2012 a Roma-related *Descriptive Glossary* of terms in different areas. According to the *Glossary* following term and their explanations are suggested in relation to history, language and culture:

Samudaripe(n), Mudaripe(n), or Pha(r)raj(i)mos or Por(r)ajmos, or Kalí Traš : the term used in the different Romani language variants to refer to the genocide of the Roma and Sinti during the Second World War.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>French</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Roma genocide</td>
<td>génocide</td>
<td>In Romani, there are several terms to refer to the genocide of the Roma carried out by the Nazis (depending on communities and linguistic variants): “Samudaripe(n)” “Phar(r)aj(i)mos” or “Por(r)ajmos”. “Samudaripe(n)” or “Mudaripe” means “murder of everyone”, and is reminiscent of the Jewish term “Shoah” (“destruction”).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Phar(r)aj(i)mos” and “Por(r)ajmos” means “that which devours”. “Kali Traš” could be translated by “Black tragedy” or Black Horror”.

In the most recent Council of Europe texts, the term “Roma genocide” is used more frequently than “Roma Holocaust”, followed in most cases by the two terms in Romani, “Samudaripen/Pharrajimos”.

In all, it is estimated that some 500,000 Roma and Sinti were exterminated in World War 2, which in percentage terms makes them the ethnic group most affected by the Nazi massacres. Over 90% of the Roma population in certain countries were exterminated by the fascist regimes.

On the night of 2 to 3 August alone, 2,897 Roma and Sinti, primarily old men, women and children, were massacred in the Zigeunerlager (“Gypsy camp”) of the Auschwitz- Birkenau concentration camp (and at least 23,000 Roma and Sinti were gassed in this camp during the Second World War). August 2 was therefore chosen by Roma organisations and a number of member states to commemorate all the Roma and Sinti victims of this period.

For more information, visit the joint Council of Europe/OSCE site: www.romagenocide.org (in particular, the interactive map).

1.5. Size, composition, language, lifestyle and situation of the groups in question
See: Appendix 5.

II. EUROPEAN AND INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND REFERENCE TEXTS
See: Appendix 6.

III. TEACHING OF ROMA HISTORY (INCLUDING ROMA HOLOCAUST/GENOCIDE) IN SCHOOL CURRICULA

3.1 Legislative and policy framework

3.1.1. Slovak Republic

Thirteen national minorities live in the Slovak Republic. Roma national minority is the second largest national minority in Slovakia after Hungarian national minority.

In accordance with the Constitution of the Slovak Republic, international treaties and conventions, Slovak
Republic guarantees dignified conditions for development of every national minority while preserving balanced relations between majority population and national minorities through a tolerant dialogue within Slovak society. National minorities represent an important part of the society with a great cultural richness and important historic heritage. Slovak Republic protects national minorities and creates conditions for their development in terms of maintaining and developing their identity, language, culture and traditions 11. The education in schools with minority language instruction is provided in accordance with European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. Schools with national minority language instruction form an inseparable part of education system in Slovak Republic. Pupils from these schools receive equal education with pupils from schools with language of instruction in Slovak. The main mission of these schools is to provide a quality and equal education, developing and enhancing national identity of pupils, citizenship, developing culture of their mother tongue, knowledge of one’s own history, history of mother nation, popular and cultural national and minority traditions 12.

The education of children of national minority members in their mother tongue is guaranteed by legal and legislative norms of Slovak Republic stipulating rights of persons belonging to national minorities, primarily the Constitution of Slovak Republic from 1st September 1992 and School Act No. 245/2008. As regards education of children and pupils belonging to national minorities, parents have a democratic right to choose language of instruction in the school. The purpose of education of national minorities is to create appropriate conditions for equal education of all Slovak citizens, members of majority nation and all members of national minorities.

On the basis of paragraph C.5. of the Resolution of Slovak government No. 1 from 11th January 2012, the Office of the Plenipotentiary of the Slovak Government for Roma Communities drafted updated Action Plans of National Strategy of Slovak Republic for Integration of Roma until 2020 (hereinafter: the Strategy) for the years 2016–2018 in the field of education, employment, health, housing and a new action plan in the field of financial inclusion. The Strategy represents a commitment of Slovak Republic in terms of public policies in the field of social inclusion. It is focused on a number of target groups, including Roma as a national minority, Roma communities and marginalized Roma communities. The Strategy includes a series of starting points, goals and measures with the aim to stop segregation of Roma communities, to achieve a significant positive change in social inclusion of Roma communities, non-discrimination and change of attitudes and improvement of cohabitation. Updated action plans of the Strategy for 2016 – 2018 take into consideration Recommendations of Council of Europe from 9th December 2013 on effective measures to integrate Roma in member states 13.

The activities of Ministry of Education, Science, Research and Sports of Slovak republic and directly reporting organizations (e.g. National Institute for Education 14):

---

14 National Institute for Education is an organization reporting directly to the Ministry of Education, Science, Research and Sports of the Slovak republic. Its role includes preparation and verification of curricula of general subjects, foreign languages and languages of national minorities. The Institute drafts educational programmes for individual educational phases (pre-primary education, primary education, lower and higher secondary education).
- supporting day-long educational system for pupils from socially disadvantaged environment including pupils from Roma communities;
- supporting teachers’ assistants in primary schools with pupils from socially disadvantaged background and with pupils from Roma communities;
- support and development of linguistic and cultural identity through education in Roma language and in history and culture of Roma;
- material and didactic support concerning subjects Roma language and literature and Roma culture;
- further education of pedagogical staff (teachers) with the aim to increase their intercultural competences in education system of pupils from Roma communities;
- cooperation with Roma and non-government organizations during organization of trainings, workshops, national and international conferences.

In accordance with the current school legislation there are the following educational phases in Slovakia:

1. **Pre-primary education** – kindergartens (they form part of education system, but are not compulsory in the current situation)

2. **Primary education** – compulsory
   a) primary education – 1st stage of primary school
   b) lower secondary education – 2nd stage of primary school

3. **Secondary education**
   a) lower secondary vocational education – two year and maximum three year study in secondary vocational school
   b) secondary vocational education – at minimum three year and maximum four year study program in secondary vocational school with secondary school final exam
   c) complete secondary general education – at minimum four year and maximum eight year study program in secondary grammar school with secondary school final examination
   d) complete secondary vocational education – at minimum four year and maximum five year educational program in secondary vocational school with secondary school final examination

4. **Higher vocational education (post-secondary or tertiary)** – at minimum two year and maximum three year study program in secondary vocational school, with final exam granting the right to use the degree „qualified specialist“ with abbr. „DiS“, or final year of continuous six year study program in conservatory or final year of

---

Institute is responsible for a wide variety of various issues, including for instance issues related to integration and inclusion, education of children and pupils with special education needs (health handicap, social disadvantage), as well as education of children of migrants. Other tasks of National Institute for Education include development and support concerning material and didactic means, pedagogical research, experimental verification of new contents and innovative training models, pedagogical approaches, methods and techniques. National Institute for Education cooperates with international institutions, is beneficiary of various national and international projects funded from EU funds (Erasmus+, ESF), EEA financial mechanism, Norway grants.

The organization of National Institute for Education includes:
- a central committee covering subjects Roma language and literature and Roma culture which has functioned since 2010. The committee is an advisory body of the Director of National Institute for Education. The members of the committee have meetings on a regular basis and collaborate in the process of drafting and innovating content of subjects: a) Roma language and literature, b) Roma culture. The committee reviews and comments documents concerning education of Roma national minority and develops initiatives to improve the position and quality of instruction of Roma language and literature and Roma culture in primary and secondary schools;
- a section responsible for drafting and development of education content concerning national minorities (Hungarian minority, Roma minority, Ruthenian minority, Ukrainian minority, German minority, Russian minority). With regard to Roma minority education, along with pedagogical research focused on inclusion, the Section is responsible for the content of subject Roma language and literature and Roma culture and target requirements for optional subject Roma language and literature. The section is working on two international projects: 1) Together with Roma we will achieve more (financed by EEA financial mechanism and state budget of Slovak republic). The project is completed and a discussion is underway about another predefined project. 2) Through innovation of Roma language didactics towards inclusive education of pupils from disadvantaged background. The project is in the phase of its implementation and is funded by European Union within the program Erasmus+. 
11

Continuous eight year study program in dance conservatory with the right to use the degree “qualified artist” with abbr. “DiS.art”.

5. University education

a) 1\textsuperscript{st} degree – bachelor study program
b) 2\textsuperscript{nd} degree – masters study program (“magister”, “engineer” study program)
c) 3\textsuperscript{rd} degree – post graduate (PhD) study program

Compulsory school attendance is 10 years. Slovak education system is composed of two levels. The first level includes National educational programme which is guaranteed by the state and its content is prepared, innovated and evaluated by National Institute for Education. National educational programme includes: framework study plans and educational standards. The second level includes a School educational programme, which is guaranteed by a specific school in collaboration with school founder, possibly parents and its content is prepared, innovated and evaluated by a specific school.

Slovak education system is composed of two levels. The first level includes National educational programme which is guaranteed by the state and its content is prepared, innovated and evaluated by National Institute for Education. The second level includes a School educational programme which is guaranteed by a specific school in collaboration with school founder, possibly parents and its content is prepared, innovated and evaluated by a specific school.

Schools included into the network of schools and school facilities as:

- School with language of instruction in Slovak. The education is implemented in accordance with Framework study plan with language of instruction in Slovak. The instruction is provided in Slovak language.
- Schools with language of instruction in national minority language. The education is implemented in accordance with Framework study plan with language of instruction in national minority language. The instruction is provided in national minority language.
- Schools with national minority language teaching\textsuperscript{15}. The education is done in accordance with Framework study plan with national minority language teaching. The instruction is provided in Slovak language with a compulsory subject being national minority language.

On this basis there are three possibilities how a school may implement the curriculum of the subject Roma culture within school education system.

\textsuperscript{15} Roma language is taught in: Conservatory, Exnárová street, Košice, Private Pedagogical and Social Academy, Požiarnická No. 1, Košice, Private Music and Drama Conservatory, Požiarnická No. 1, Košice, Private and Music and Drama Conservatory, Rimavská Sobota, Joint School (eight year secondary grammar school and primary school), Kremnica, Constantine the Philosopher University, Department of Romological studies, Nitra. For comparison - an overview of schools in which minority language is taught (numbers for school year 2016/2017): Hungarian language: 340 kindergartens, 255 primary schools, 25 secondary grammar schools (“gymnasiums”), 37 secondary vocational schools, 4 universities: Hans Selye University in Komárno, Constantine the Philosopher University, Faculty of Central European Studies in Nitra, Comenius University in Bratislava, Matej Bel University in Banská Bystrica, University of Prešov in Prešov; Ruthenian language: Primary school with kindergarten, Kalná Roztoka, Michal Sopira Primary school with kindergarten in Radvan nad Laborcom, Primary school with kindergarten Pčolinné, Primary school with kindergarten Klenová, Institute of Ruthenian language and culture of University of Prešov in Prešov; Russian language: Primary school, Komenského 6, Medzilaborce, Primary school Duchnovičova Street, Medzilaborce, Primary school, 8. Mája Street, Svidník, Primary school, Komenského 2, Svidník, Private primary school, Bratislava – Petrážalka; Ukrainian language: Taras Ševčenko Joint school (secondary grammar school and primary school), Prešov. Primary school, Jarabina. Institute of Ukrainian and Central European Studies, University of Prešov in Prešov; German language: Primary school Hlboká, Bratislava, Primary school Hradná nám., Kežmarok, Primary school Chmeľnica 58, Primary school, Štôška 183, Medzov, Primary school, Školská 370/19, Nitranské Pravno
1. Schools with language of instruction in Slovak:
- Roma culture as a cross-curricular theme of Intercultural education. As a cross-curricular topic it can be taught within general educational subject, including, for instance, the following: Ethical education (Models of historic characters), Civic education (family and multi-generational family living), National geography (Holidays in the my region in which I live – Easter, Christmas), Practical classes (Traditions and crafts in regions, such as smith and basket-maker), Romani language and literature (Stories of Roma personalities), Drawing (Depicting Roma history through various drawings), Music (Roma musicians and their life), History (Authentic testimonies of survivors).
- Roma culture as a separate subject within School education programme. Note: Content of the subject Roma culture was experimentally verified at primary and secondary schools in the years 2002-2010. National Institute for Education was a guarantor of this verification process. The experimental verification was followed by preparation of pedagogical documents which provided a basis for drafting content and performance standards for the subject Roma culture for primary schools.

2. Schools with language of instruction in national minority language and/or
3. Schools with national minority language teaching:
- Roma culture as part of curriculum of national minority language and literature (Roma national minority). National minority language and literature is a compulsory subject within education part Language and communication.
- Roma culture as a cross-curricular theme of Intercultural education. As a cross-curricular theme it can be taught within general educational subjects, including, for instance, the following: Ethical education (Models of historic characters), Civic education (family and multi-generational family living), National geography (Holidays in the given region in which I live – Easter, Christmas), Practical classes (Traditions and crafts in regions, such as smith and basket-maker), Romani language and literature (Stories of Roma personalities), Drawing (Depicting Roma history through various drawings), Music (Roma musicians and their life), History (Authentic testimonies of survivors).
- Romani culture as a separate subject within School education programme.

The following materials, which were developed within predefined project “Together with Roma we will achieve more”\textsuperscript{16}, are available for the teaching of Roma language. The beneficiary of this project was National Institute for Education. The project was funded from EEA financial mechanism and state budget of Slovak Republic.
- Fairy tales in Slovak and Romani language,
- Romani – Slovak reading book including and exercise book for pupils in 2\textsuperscript{nd} year of primary school,
- Amari Romañi Čhib/Our Roma including exercise book for beginners,
- History reading book (we search for Roma history) is designed for teachers and pupils from 7\textsuperscript{th} until 9\textsuperscript{th} year of primary school,
- Romani culture designed for teachers and pupils of secondary schools,
- Roma-Slovak and Slovak-Roma dictionary for primary education teachers,
- Journal from international conference “Together with Roma we will achieve more”.

\textsuperscript{16} \url{http://www.statpedu.sk/sk/o-organizacii/projekty/together-roma-we-will-achieve-more/}
3.1.2. Czech Republic

According to qualified estimates, 245,800 Roma live in the Czech Republic, which represents 2.3% of the population. In the school year 2016/2017 primary education was attended by 33,858 Roma pupils according to qualified estimates, which represents 3.7% of all pupils attending primary education. In the Czech Republic, qualified estimates of the number of Roma pupils are carried out only within the framework of primary education. It is currently being discussed to extend the survey to secondary education as well.

Education is normally divided into pre-primary, primary and secondary education. For each type of education, the Framework Educational Programs are developed at national level. They represent the main curriculum documents according to which more specific School Educational Programs are elaborated. For example, in the Framework Educational Programs the topic of Holocaust is, of course, mentioned, but only in general. It does not state that schools have to teach specifically about Roma victims of the Holocaust. The extent to which the history of the Roma will be taught depends on the School Educational Programs or teacher’s own activity and initiative. Schools may use the services of contributory organizations or NGOs. Museum of Roma Culture in Brno is very active in this area – they provide lectures in schools about Roma history, including the Roma Holocaust, and also accept excursions to the permanent exhibition at the museum devoted to the history of Roma and Roma Holocaust.

Tertiary education is autonomous. Universities carry out accredited study programs that are divided into individual fields of study. In the Czech Republic, there is an accredited field of study “Roma Studies” realized by Charles University in Prague, which is unique both in Czech and world context. There is no overview of the extent to which individual schools teach the history of Roma or Romany realities. However, there are data on schools where the Romani language is taught. The Romani language was taught in 2016 at 3 universities, 1 secondary school (Secondary School of Management and Law, s.r.o., in Jihlava, where Romani language and Roma history are taught in the range of 1 hour per week) and 1 elementary school (Florián Bayer Elementary School in Kopřivnice teaches Romani language within the subject of Multicultural Education).

Efforts to teach Romani language are also confronted with declining or no interest on the part of potential pupils and students, and a critical shortage of lecturers who speak Romani language well enough in order to be able to teach it. Teaching of Romani language therefore takes place dominantly in families, even though here it is also in decline. The number of parents who have a good command of Romani language is declining. It is therefore necessary to systematically promote activities supporting the teaching of the Romani language in order to reverse its decline.

3.1.3. Hungary

Law 2011. CXC. on national public education is the most important regulator in public education. The purpose of the Act is to create a system of public education that promotes the harmonious spiritual, physical and intellectual development of children and young people through conscious development of their skills, abilities, knowledge, skills, emotional and volitional qualities, and thus their moral and independent lives. The aim is helping them reach their goals, become people responsible for reconciling private interests with the public interest. Its primary goal is talent management through the means of education and prevention social disruption.
The principles of pedagogy, education goals, development tasks, key competences and educational contents are formulated in the National Core Curriculum are defined in the framework curricula published in the Hungarian Gazette. The framework curricula issued by the Minister are usually divided according to grades (upper and lower secondary schools, four-, six- and eight-grade secondary schools, vocational secondary schools, vocational schools), and specific curricula have been prepared for specific public education tasks.

The National Core Curriculum is one of the basic content-regulatory documents of Hungarian education. The main function of the National Core Curriculum is the principled foundation of the content of public education. It defines the general objectives of public education, the main areas of education to be transmitted, the stages of public education and objectives of development at certain stages. The National Core Curriculum therefore defines key competences, key development tasks and areas of education.

Framework curricula include the objectives of education and training, the subject system, the topic of the subjects, the requirements of the subjects, and the tasks of developing intersubject knowledge and skills areas, and define the recommended time frame of the requirements.

The curricula are structured according to school types and pedagogical sections (upper and lower secondary schools, four-, six- and eight-grade secondary schools, vocational secondary schools, vocational schools), and special curricula have been prepared for some specific public education tasks.

The curriculum for each subject fix annually the compulsory number of lessons per week and the maximum available time frame of 10%. Each subject curriculum covers 90% of the time frame available for the subject (exceptions to the special curriculum framework curriculum).


In some areas, the school can choose from the published framework curricula (variants A and B). The choice should be made based on assess to existing or potential resources and whether the framework curriculum to be chosen matches the profile of the school, its traditions.

In addition to the compulsory subjects and hours, the educational bodies must decide on how to use 10% of the hourly rate of the class (free time frame). One can decide, for example, to increase the duration of a subject with a minimum number of hours or to introduce an optional subject. They can choose an elementary school curriculum in the framework curricula or apply a curriculum that was previously developed and / or used in school practice, and schools can also create their own subjects / subjects.

The aforementioned decisions can jointly define the school's or their individual grades and departments' own faculty of education and, where appropriate, a subject. Versatility is ensured in order to preserve local features and values.

**The appearance of the Roma in the content regulators**

**National Curricula**
History – chronological themes
Grade 5-8. The culture of Hungarian minorities, changes in the situation of the Roma population.
Grade 9-12. Judaism, Holocaust, Roma Genocide.
The history, situation and integration process of Roma culture.

Homeland studies
Grade 5-8. The culture and traditions of minorities living in our country (e.g. elements of Roma People's Knowledge).

Framework curriculum
This curriculum presents this topic not in a chronological order, the topic of minorities appears at different places and time. Roma people can be found in the following places:
Grade 7-8. The concept of Roma Genocide is an obligatory definition apropos of the IIWW. In the topic of Creating and Building Democratic Relationships in Hungary, contain The Situation of Roma topic.
Grade 11-12. The „Porrajmos” is mandatory concept in the theme of the IIWW.

Other topics
Problems of social inequalities and mobility.
(On this topic the teachers and the pupils can initiate a discussion / debate on a social / historical topic. There is a possibility for formulating your own opinion on integration Roma.

Homeland Studies
Grade 5. In the topic of nationalities living in Hungary there is a thematic unit: The designations of nationalities living in Hungary (e.g. German, Slovakian, Serbian, Croatian, Slovenian, Romanian, Roma). In the subject of history in the upper school there are 12 classes available according to the framework curriculum for teaching IIWW, with a significant part of it being the Holocaust. In secondary school there are 15 classes to teach IIWW. In addition, the Holocaust is a topic in other subjects.

Commemorations at school
Since 2001, April 16th is the Memorial Day for Holocaust Victims. On this day schools decide themselves how to commemorate the victims: to do thematic walks, to visit the Holocaust Memorial Centre, to visit memorials, to hold festivals or film screenings (Saul's son, Schindler's list, etc.).
The most important content regulators of education:
• law 2011. CXC. on National Public Education
• Government decree 110/2012. concerning the issue, introduction and Application of the National Core Curriculum
• Decree 20/2012. on the operation of education and training institutions
• Decree 51/2012. (XII.21.) on the order of issuance and approval of framework curricula
• Decree 4/2013. (I 11) on the issue of the teaching of two teaching languages in school education
• Decree 16/2013. (II.28.) on textbook registration, textbook support and the rules of school textbook provision

The list of related websites:
http://www.hdke.hu/
http://ofi.hu/sites/default/files/attachments/forras_biro_aletta.pdf
http://index.hu/belfold/holoka/
http://www.budapest.com/budapest_kalauz/latnivalok/muemlekek/cipok_a_duna_partjan_egy_megrazo_emlekmu.hu.html
http://ofi.hu/holokausztrol-az-iskolaban
3.1.4. Republic of Moldova

The Republic of Moldova is a poly-ethnic state (national minorities account for 35.5% of the population), that is why continuing efforts are made to ensure compliance with the ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and religious identity of each person belonging to a national minority, as well as to create appropriate conditions enabling them to express, preserve and develop this identity.

In order to create the necessary conditions for the socio-cultural development of the Roma, on 09.06.2016 (the GD No.734) the Government of the Republic of Moldova approved the new Action Plan for supporting the Roma Population in the Republic of Moldova for 2016-2020, which represents a continuity of the RM Government’s commitments for Roma people social inclusion. The Action Plan\textsuperscript{17} is a policy document planning the means for solving the problems of Roma communities, as well as ensuring the implementation of a policy at the national level, involving a specific approach for Roma, which confirms the measures undertaken to ensure and implement Roma integration in the active socio-cultural life of the society. Roma Action Plan stipulates the priorities relating to education, health, labor and social protection, housing and community development fields, participation in decision – making and combating discrimination. Key element of new Roma Action Plan is realization of rights of the Roma communities to participate in public life, decision making processes and in solving problems that affect them at different levels. Document includes new measures to ensure Roma social security on labour market\textsuperscript{18}.

The education in the Republic of Moldova is based on the principle of recognition and guarantee of the rights of persons belonging to national minorities, including the right to preserving, developing, and expressing their ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and religious identity. The national legislation ensures the right to choose the language of education and training at all levels of education. The right of citizens to education in their native language is ensured through the establishment of the necessary number of educational institutions, classes, groups, and their operating conditions. The assurance of equal access to education for all citizens, regardless of their material status, domicile, sex, ethnicity, etc. is provided in the new Code of Education approved in 2014\textsuperscript{19}. Hence, it sets forth the “principle of fairness”, based on which, access to education is ensured without any discrimination.

In line with the Code of Education of the Republic of Moldova, the education system is organized by levels and cycles in compliance with the Standard International Classification of Education (ISCED-2011):

- (a) Level 0 – early education: ante-preschool education; preschool education;
- (b) Level 1 – primary education;
- (c) Level 2 – secondary education, cycle I: gymnasium education;
- (d) Level 3 – secondary education, cycle II: lyceum education; secondary technical vocational education;
- (e) Level 4 – post-secondary technical vocational education;
- (f) Level 5 – non-tertiary post-secondary technical vocational education;
- (g) Level 6 – higher education, cycle I: Bachelor degree higher education;
- (h) Level 7 – higher education, cycle II: Master degree higher education;
- (i) Level 8 – higher education, cycle III: PhD degree higher education.

The pre-university educational institutions network of Moldova includes 1,489 institutions (schools, secondary

\textsuperscript{17} The new Action Plan was developed in the EU framework on Roma, OSCE/ODIHR Strategy and Report on implementation of the strategy in states that are party of OSCE (2008), CoE and United Nations recommendations.

\textsuperscript{18} \url{http://lex.justice.md/index.php?action=view&view=doc&lang=1&id=365368}

\textsuperscript{19} \url{http://lex.justice.md/md/355156/}
and high schools) of which 280 institutions are teaching in Russian, and 82 are mixed. In Moldova 3 models of language study of the national minorities in the pre-university education system was formed:

(a) Schools and high schools teaching in Russian;
(b) Schools teaching in Russian, with Ukrainian, Gagauz, Bulgarian, Polish, Hebrew, or German as a course in the curriculum;
(c) Experimental educational institutions, where languages of the national minorities are used as the teaching language: Ukrainian – in two schools, Bulgarian – one school.

Social education function is formation of national consciousness, identity and culture and promotion of intercultural dialogue. Ministry of Education promotes intercultural dialogue in relation to problems faced by Roma, Roma children, youth, and educational system. A large network of pre-university education institutions is developed, providing access to free gymnasium for all children, including Roma children. In November 2012, with the financial support of OSCE/ODIHR, there was developed the “Guideline for Roma Families” edited in 3 languages (Romanian, Russian, Romani), which represents an assistance framework to facilitate the access to social assistance services, private medical services, education, conclusion of civil status documents, etc. The guidelines were distributed to the leaders of Roma Associations, as well as to the population in communities compactly populated by Roma. Following the recommendations mentioned in “Guideline for Roma Families” – Roma communities involve in activities related to including children in educational process, identifying mechanisms for Roma children/pupils absent from classes, cooperate with level 1 and 2 local public authorities and non-governmental organizations promoting Roma inclusion. Providing compulsory schooling for children and prevention of child abandonment – is the focus of central and local public authorities, discussed in meetings of district councils, town halls, and administrative councils of General Directorates of Education, Youth and Sport and of teaching councils of educational institutions.

According to data presented by Education, Youth and Sports Directorates, 1739 Roma students are registered in the country. As result of measures taken, on October 15, 2016 outside official school were 79 Roma children aged 7-16, on 29.12.2016 – number of non-schooled pupils decreased to 17. Among non-schooling causes are: precarious material condition, vagabondage, exchange of living place, parents' refusal, etc. Relative dropout situation has improved. On 25.01.17, 28 Roma students dropped out of school compared to 98 students in study year 2015-2016. Feeding of the students in educational institutions is organized free of charge (Level 1), as stipulated by Government Decision no.234/ 25.02.2005 and Government Decision no.198 of 16.04.1993. Manual provision of students in pre-university education is entirely accomplished (100%) through Manual Rental Scheme managed by Special Book Fund. Under Government Decision no.1040/05.10.2005, students of grades I to IV are provided with manuals free of charge. During last year's, all children in Ist class, on 1st September, receive first handbook – The Abbey. Roma students from vulnerable families receive material assistance from local municipalities for purchase of school supplies and, where appropriate, clothing and footwear.

Activities of the Ministry of Education on providing – Roma education in the Republic of Moldova:

• Ensure free transportation of children from Roma – intensive located communities, more than 3 km distance from nearest educational institution;
• Ensure introduction of prolonged study program for Roma children for homework preparation and organization of meditation classes;
• Encompass teaching and management staff in educational institutions in in-service training process on intercultural education;
• Collaborate with non-governmental and public organizations of Roma, to involve them, solving problems related to including children in educational process;
• Organize and conduct trainings on cultural difference in pre-school and school education, in partnership with Roma organizations;
• Develop Guides for Community Mediators (eg. Chapter „Education”) 20.

According measure No.1.2.2., which are included in Action Plan for supporting the Roma Population in the Republic of Moldova for 2016-2020: „Elaboration of a module in the National school curriculum on the subject – History, culture and traditions of the Ukrainian, Russian, Gagauzian, Bulgarian, Roma and other ethnic groups in the Republic of Moldova”, during the 2016-2017 study year – this subject was introduced in the National School Curriculum / Framework Plan for Education (Level 1,2,3) 21. Implementation of the module „The history, culture and traditions of the Ukrainian, Russian, Gagauzian, Bulgarian people” in the pre-university education institutions of the Republic of Moldova was facilitated thanks to the published teaching materials (textbooks in native language) 22 and teachers which are trained in pedagogical institutions during last 25 years. Contrariwise, implementation of the module „The history, culture and traditions of the Roma people” at present is provided by teaching materials published in Romani language by the Council of Europe 23 and academic publications edited by the researchers from „Roma ethnology” Group from the Institute of Cultural Heritage of the Academy of Sciences of Moldova 24. But for now, unfortunately, in the Republic of Moldova there are no trained teachers which are available to implement this topic in pre-university education institutions.

Concerning inclusion of the topic concerning „Roma Holocaust” in the Moldavian school textbooks, it is worth mentioning following:

In Romanian and Worldwide History Textbook (Chisinau: Cartididact, 2013) for Level 2: secondary education, first cycle (Gymnasium) – form IX, it was included Chapter nr. I/16: Romania, Bessarabia and Transnistria (1940-1944) / Case study “Policy toward Hebrew and Roma” (p. 67).

In Romanian and Worldwide History Textbook (Chisinau: Cartier educational, 2013) for Level 3: secondary education, second cycle (high school/Lyceum) – form XII, it was included Chapter nr.1/5: Bessarabia and Romania during the Second World War (1939-1945) / Paragraph nr.05 “Holocaust” (pp. 29-31) 25.

### 3.1.5. Romania

Both slavery and the Holocaust were part of the Roma historical experience on the Romanian territories. Nevertheless, these topics continue not to be (satisfactorily) covered by the national history curriculum.

The Romanian pre-university education system after 1990 has a tripartite structure of four years each: primary school (1-4), lower secondary school (5-8) and upper secondary education (9-12).

---


25 http://www.cartier.md/carti/istoria-rom%C3%A2nilor-%C8%99i-universal%C4%83/1086.html
1) **Mandatory (although rather superficial and biased ) covering of the Holocaust with optional textbooks**

After 1999, pedagogical pluralism was introduced. For every class, there are variable numbers of textbooks approved by a committee within the Ministry of Education, out of which every teacher can choose. The textbooks can vary with regard to their pedagogical approach, content, layout etc. As a consequence of the Decision no. 3001/1999 of the Ministry of Education, the Holocaust was introduced as a mandatory subject within the larger theme of WWII and issued related to it were included in the curricula for the 7th, 8th and 10-12th grades. However, until 2003, the Holocaust was presented in a rather chaotic and biased manner (some textbooks didn’t mention the Holocaust or offered false information, put emphasis on the German responsibility exclusively, while neglecting the Romanian involvement, etc.).

Things started to slightly improve after 2004 (The Final Report of the International Commission for the Study of the Holocaust in Romania “Elie Wiesel”). The Ministry of Education decided that both the school curricula and textbooks were to be realised according to the conclusions of the Final Report. However, there is not yet a specific chapter on the Holocaust. Instead, information on it is to be found in different chapters: Ethnic and confessional diversity; Romania and religious tolerance in the 20th century, etc. On the whole, there are significant differences. Some textbooks cover it superficially (no reference to anti-Semitic legislation, pogroms and deportations of Jews and Roma, overgeneralizations and minimization), while others treat the Holocaust relatively satisfactorily. However, on the whole, as the Holocaust was treated only as part of the larger WWII theme within the mandatory curricula, there are few references to the Roma (very brief information on slavery and the Holocaust, without enough attention to the context, features, comparison, etc.).

2) **Elective courses and textbooks**

After international pressure on Romania to deal with its past and acknowledge its own participation in the Holocaust, a solution for a better covering of the Holocaust (not necessarily of the Roma history in general) was the decision of MEN to introduce an elective course on “The History of Romanian Jewry and the Holocaust” where also the fate of the Romanian Roma during WWII was treated on several pages.

Afterwards, a few other elective textbooks were introduced (The History of Communism; History of the national minorities in Romania, 2008; History of the Romanians from the South of the Danube, 2009; History of the European Union; History of the Monarchy in Romania, 2012; The recent History of Romania; Contemporary Migration movements in the XXth and XXlst century, 2016). More information on the Roma history was offered by the textbook “History of the national minorities in Romania” where a group of Roma intellectuals were invited to write on the history of the Roma.

3. **Recent Roma involvement and inclusion of topics regarding the Roma history in the mandatory curriculum.**

According to the Order of the Ministry of Education 3593 / 18.06.2014, the Ministry launched a process to change the gymnasium curriculum. Consequently, the Roma Agency “Impreuna” advocated for introducing elements of Roma history in the compulsory History curriculum. In October 2016, a partnership agreement was signed by: 1) the Roma Agency “Impreuna”, 2) The Ministry of Education, 3) The “Elie Wiesel” National Institute for Studying the Holocaust in Romania, 4) The National Centre for Roma Culture – Romano Kher to develop educational materials for teachers’ training with focus both on the Roma slavery and on the Holocaust. Different pressures from above (IHRA) and from grass root level (Roma organizations) ensured the success of this initiative. According to the Order No. 3393/28.2.2017 of the Romanian MEN, starting with the school year 2020/2021, there will be lessons both on the Roma slavery (“Roma – from slavery to
emancipation”) and the Holocaust of Roma and Jews, in the frame of the History curriculum for the 8th grade, as part of the compulsory study of history.

4. Trainings with history teachers
There were already such trainings with focus on the Holocaust. So far such trainings were organised by several Universities and by INSHR-EW (the National Institute for the Study of the Holocaust “Elie Wiesel”). These are accredited by MEN. Furthermore, there are trainings with the history teachers organized by Yad Vashem (generally - on Holocaust) or, recently, by Yahad In Unum (Holocaust by bullets and Roma in Eastern Europe). In 2016, within the project “My tolerant school”, thanks to the partnership agreement signed between the Roma Agency “Impreuna”, MEN and INSHR-EW, a training was organized with focus on the Roma history (special interest in slavery and Roma Holocaust). 104 teachers from different regions in Romania attended these training sessions. In the meantime, IMPREUNA managed to have its teaching training on Roma history and Holocaust accredited by the MEN.

IV. CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS LEARNED, GOOD PRACTICES IDENTIFIED AND ENVISAGED FOLLOW-UP
4.1. Conclusions of the thematic group of experts

General findings

Holocaust - after 7 decades - still is not only the “historical” phenomenon but becomes continually an object of “politisation” (or political and historical manipulations), often used in current policy and “Roma Holocaust” is / can be a part of those processes, as Holocaust Roma victims’ commemoration is still not properly address in public debate and in educational systems (curricula, textbooks and teaching materials). Although the visit’s title focused on Roma history and culture, the main subject discussed was the teaching on Holocaust, which shows that this topic demands a wider discussion.

Roma culture (including language) teaching versus teaching Roma history (including Holocaust)

Whenever the teaching of the Roma history and culture is discussed the issue of languages spoken by Roma and related groups occurs. In opinion of experts, the language(s) teaching - even being a part of “Roma culture” file - should be discussed separately, as the challenges and methods require different approach than in case of Roma history and culture.

“Roma studies” (including language teaching) are present in several countries at the academic level, available for students of different faculties, interested in Roma history. The examples of Charles University, Prague, Czech Republic, Constantine the Philosopher University in Nitra, Slovak Republic, Helsinki University, Helsinki, Finland or Pedagogical University, Cracow, Poland (post-graduate) should be mentioned here as good examples of Roma culture and history teaching on the tertiary level addressed to wider public.

\[26\] The issue of languages spoken by Roma and related groups was discussed during the CAHROM thematic visits on: 1. The protection and promotion of the languages spoken by Roma, Zagreb - Medimurje County, Croatia, 24 - 26 September 2014, and 2. The Protection, preservation and teaching of languages spoken by Roma, Sinti and Yenish (including ways to handle the opposition of traditional communities to have their languages written and taught), 29-31 March 2017 Graz, Austria, and their findings can be found in relevant reports, available on CAHROM website https://www.coe.int/en/web/portal/cahrom.
During the visit experts had opportunity to meet with schools’ teachers from few Slovak municipalities where the subject devoted to Roma culture is instructed, in line with curricula prepared by Slovak National Institute for Education. The content of these lessons consists of: Roma customs and traditions, music, literature, Roma role models and “successful stories” of well-known people of Roma origin, etc.

Nonetheless it must be said that in opinion of teachers the Roma culture subject in practise relays on “good will” of school and/or teachers. Moreover, nowadays the list of additional subjects that can be chosen by the schools/teachers is very wide and Roma history/Roma Holocaust/Roma culture might not be “attractive” enough for both: teachers and pupils to be chosen.

**National curricula framework**

The main reason of this situation, identified during the visit, is relative autonomy of the schools and/or teachers in constructing the final shape of lessons’ content.

The scheme of approach to school curricula, present nowadays in many countries, is twofold:

1. the general, national framework curriculum of specific subject, which is/can be supplemented with specific content by
2. local authorities/school council/school funder/teachers according to the local needs, interests, conditions, etc.

This solution, in line with modern tendency to leave a space for local initiatives, can be advantage and disadvantage at the same time. Advantage – as it creates the space for Roma-related content in the regions where Roma are numerous and present since ages; and disadvantage in case of discriminatory approach, which often is a case in regions where Roma in fact are numerous! - if there is not obligation and/or no pressure from central level to include Roma related issues.

**Are Roma history and Roma culture subjects important and attractive enough for school teaching?**

Experts discussed the question to what extent the Roma history and Roma culture are interesting to be involved into the school curricula, facing – above mentioned - growing competition of additional subjects proposed to pupils.

Taking into account that Roma are part of European countries since ages and that they are the most numerous European minority – there is a need to implement the knowledge about their history, culture and contribution into national cultural heritage into the school curricula and textbooks – in the framework of subjects on national/ethnic minorities at least.

It is especially important in mixed regions, borderlands or traditional places of residence of national minorities’ representatives. Whenever it is possible – it should be at least mainstreamed into the literature, history, geography, music, civic education, etc. lessons.

This type of education has twofold influence:

- in relation to majority pupils – it raise awareness about country history, minorities contribution into the cultural heritage and can offer them the multicultural perspective,
- in relation to minority pupils – it creates the sense of belonging to wider, national and civic community, it improves the sense of citizenship and offers awareness that Roma are not the only group in “minority” situation.
How to motivate the teachers to include Roma-related content into the curricula and lessons

In that context the question on how to motivate teachers to include Roma-related subjects into the local school curricula, especially in regions with national minorities’ presence, was raised many times. One of the possible responses to that problem is newly established Slovak education regulation that comprised the financial incentives for schools for organising the visits in commemoration sites (in relation to teaching about the Holocaust).

Another discussed solution is combining the Roma-related files, as well as the general knowledge on national minorities’, into the process of the teachers’ professional development assessments.

It was mentioned also a “soft”, pragmatic way of introducing/promotion of Roma-related issues into the process of education through questions regarding Roma history during pupils’ exams.

Teachers and educators trainings

As to the need of trainings – special attention should be paid on tertiary education level and – pedagogical (not exclusively) faculties – in order to deliver to future teachers the basic knowledge on national/ethnic minorities, on intercultural education, on different historical and cultural background of groups present in the country that might require any special attitude, etc. - as an indispensable part of teachers’ professional preparation.

To facilitate the inclusion of Roma history and Roma culture teaching into education system - the list of available materials devoted to Roma history (including part devoted to Roma genocide during WWII) and culture, like: books, testimonies, artefacts, movies and documentaries27, lessons’ scenarios, list of people trained, etc. - should be prepared, regularly updated and exchanged on the national levels among entities responsible for education, national minorities’ policies, teachers’ training centres, schools, teachers, educators, etc.

Teaching materials

Another issue discussed during the visit was the problem of teaching materials. There are already existing teaching materials, prepared by international stakeholders, like: Council of Europe and Graz University, Austria, Fact sheets on Roma28, Council of Europe and OSCE website on Roma Holocaust29, US Holocaust Memorial Museum30, Memorial and Museum Auschwitz-Birkenau Former German Nazi Concentration and Extermination Camp31, Yad Vashem - The World Holocaust Remembrance Centre32 and, presented during the visit by dr.

28 http://romafacts.uni-graz.at/
29 http://roma-genocide.org/
30 https://www.ushmm.org/collections/bibliography/sinti-and-roma-gypsies/
Gerhard Baumgartner, *Fate of European Roma and Sinti during the Holocaust* – teaching material website, prepared by Austrian Ministry of Education and cofinanced by IHRA, available in 6 languages (and planned in 2018 in few more). Another interesting example is the project “NA BISTER” of Regional Museum in Tarnow, Poland that listed Roma commemorative sites all around Europe[^33]. Unfortunately, the knowledge of those existing quality teaching materials is not widely spread and not systematically exchanged among national stakeholders.

All mentioned materials relate to the Holocaust, except the CoE factsheets on Roma that present many aspects and facts on Roma origin and their history and presence in Europe. It seems that teaching materials concerning Roma culture, especially of high quality and methodologically prepared are not many and hard to work out. Nonetheless, the existing examples of Slovakian, Moldovan and Romanian materials and textbooks were mentioned.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Roma culture museums</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In this regard the important role can be played by professional Roma culture museum. As there is not many such an entities in Europe the list of existing ones would enable better cooperation between schools, educators and those entities on both national and international level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem related to the quality materials on Roma history and Roma Holocaust is connected also with modest (relatively, comparing with others victims) number of survivals’ testimonies and their public availability. This is one of the reasons for urgent need to make a list of such a testimonies/sources on national levels, and make them available for teachers, teachers’ training centres, etc., possibly with engagement of ministries of education. It should be accompanied also by encouraging researchers to explore this field.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching of Roma history and Holocaust</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promotion of knowledge and teaching on Roma Holocaust should be perceived trifold:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- as the matter of commemoration,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- of teaching and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- of research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nowadays, those three dimensions differ from country to country.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Is history teaching still important and attractive enough?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In relation to that it must be noticed here that in general - history teaching seems to play less and less important role in modern education systems that are presenting rather competencies approach than knowledge improvement approach. It is reflected, among others, in reducing the number of history lessons. Thus, the history of XX century often is not instructed properly due to lack of time and there is not enough space during lessons to go deeply into details of one of the European totalitarian regimes - Nazi (and the second one is even less recognised).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[^32]: [http://www.yadvashem.org/education](http://www.yadvashem.org/education)
Apart from lack of quality materials relating to Roma history and Roma Holocaust the issue of methodology was discussed – how to make the materials of high quality and attractive to pupils. During the visit pupils that took part in school excursion to the Memorial and Museum Auschwitz-Birkenau Former German Nazi Concentration and Extermination Camp shared with CAHROM visit experts their experiences from this particular visit. Direct experience of pupils seeing the exhibitions devoted to Roma Holocaust, the ruins of crematoria, barracks, victims’ hair, shoes, eyeglasses … cannot be overestimated. This kind of victims’ remains play crucial role in building the awareness of totalitarian crimes and threats. It also allows to personalise victims, as the numbers, especially when high – are anonymous. High quality teaching materials, based on individual stories, can contribute to the personalisation of victims. Experts were of opinion that wherever it is possible – pupils should be able to visit this kind of places, accompanied by well-prepared teachers which can deal afterwards with possible pupils’ emotions. Apart from history knowledge - these kinds of lessons are also contributing to the civic education and this multi-approach should be present at all school levels.

It should be pointed out that on case of Romania there is no particular places of direct persecution of Roma – although the Roma were deported from hundreds of cities and villages in 1942 to today’s Transnistria – and there is only one Holocaust Memorial in Romania, in Bucharest.

The states of origin of Holocaust victims – with no or few commemoration sites and no Holocaust/totalitarianisms education centres should reflect on the possible forms of commemoration and education on Holocaust/totalitarianisms, including Roma victims - as it was a part of history of their own citizens’ and European history of XX century.

**The need for research on Roma Holocaust**

Roma Holocaust is relatively less recognised and described, comparing with other victims. That is the reason why states should encourage research centres to include this topic into research programmes. Research is need also for recognising the sites where Roma were murdered during WWII, as the Auschwitz – being a symbol of mass murder of Jews and Roma – is not the only place of Roma persecutions. Many Central-Eastern European Roma Holocaust victims were killed in still unknown places in forests, with no burial, no graves, no names. The good example on local scale of this kind of research is Regional Museum in Tarnow, Poland, project of “Malopolska Roma Trail of Martyrdom”34 – the regional research of sites of Roma genocide during WWII and the their commemoration (website, publication, monuments and organised every year from mid-90’ties of XX cent. - *The International Roma Caravan of Memory*).

**Education and awareness raising among Roma**

Usually, while speaking about any kind of promotion of knowledge on Roma, the main addressee remains the majority society. Nonetheless, especially in that particular issue, it should not be forget that one of the important factors concerning the Roma Holocaust recognition is lack of compulsory education among Roma after-war generations. Basic education, that is the case of many Roma, often not completed – deprives them from the awareness of their own history at all, including the period of WWII, thus - from the identity.

---

Nowadays, the Roma Holocaust theme within the Roma communities is dominated by the compensation processes, especially within the elder generation. It must be taken into account here that Roma became a part of this process (of compensation) only at the turn of XX/XXI century, which is another evidence of Roma marginalisation and exclusion. Nonetheless, among the young and better educated generation, the Roma Holocaust slowly becoming a part of their identity. One of the symptoms of this attitude are meetings of Roma youth from all over the Europe in Auschwitz-Birkenau commemoration ceremonies in 2nd August, organised by ternYpe, International Roma Youth Network, with support of international organisations and Polish authorities.

**Cooperation with Jewish education centres, museums, research centres or organisations**

The problem of quality training materials and highly qualified teachers occurs in that context as well. The need for teachers’ training on Holocaust, including Roma as the victims is needed, as it is still not properly recognized. Interesting solution, already existing in many countries, is cooperation with Yad Vashem - The World Holocaust Remembrance Centre. Excellent teaching materials are available on its websites and stable seminars for educators from all over the world are organised regularly, both in situ and in countries. The possibilities of including Roma victims into the education activities should be explored in countries cooperating with Yad Vashem.

Another possibility for commemoration of Roma Holocaust and for developing of any kind of teaching - also in informal education - is to improve the cooperation with Jewish minorities’ institutions, like museums or research centres. The example can be the cooperation in this regard in Slovakia - with Jewish Museum in Bratislava, or planned in Romania in forthcoming years - the exhibition on Roma Holocaust to be open in the Jewish Museum, Bucharest.

Inclusion of Roma Holocaust victims into the history teaching beyond the formal education, into the wider public discourse and collective memory should be realised also with cooperation with museums of former Nazi death and concentration camps – the examples of such an inclusion of Roma victims are exhibitions in Memorial and Museum Auschwitz-Birkenau Former German Nazi Concentration and Extermination Camp (block 13) and in Museum of the Former German Kulmhof Death Camp.

**Road map for Roma history and culture teaching to be prepared on national levels.**

Experts recommend to Members States to organise the seminar(s) concerning the issue on teaching materials on Roma Holocaust, Roma history and Roma culture to overview the situation in the country and to identify good practices and on that basis - to prepare a “road map” concerning the development of that topics in future. It should be accompanied by (or to be a part of) similar process concerning all national/ethnic minorities presence in school curricula and textbooks.

**“Roma Holocaust” or mainstreaming Roma victims into the Holocaust teaching?**

The term “Roma Holocaust” was discussed as in practice it happened to be a kind of trap: even though the “Holocaust” is part of the school curricula, the term “Roma Holocaust”, that become a part of “Roma related dictionary” relatively lately, seems to be still beyond this general subject of Holocaust. Thus, in opinion of the experts the effort is needed in order to mainstream the Roma victims into the Holocaust teaching, to sensitise educators that Holocaust consisted of different types of victims and to provide to teachers a quality materials
relating to Roma fate during WWII, instead of creating alternative term, reducing the phenomenon to the ethnic basis exclusively.

4.2 Lessons learned by the experts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What are the challenges in the context of implementation of Roma culture curriculum in school education system in Slovakia?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**University type education:**
The fundamental question is “what to teach” and “how to teach” for better preparation of future teachers, mainly teachers of history, civic education, ethical education in order to ensure that Roma culture issues become either a part of cross-curricular theme of Intercultural education, or as a separate school subject. It should be done through several activities: 1) Composition of expert team, 2) Preparation of multiplicators (mainly university teachers), 3) Further education of future teachers teaching Roma culture as cross-curricular theme, 4) Qualification training of teachers teaching subject Roma culture, 5) Drafting of training programs, study materials, textbooks, etc.

**Education to increase professional competences of teachers, pedagogical and expert staff:**
- Innovative education of teachers teaching in primary and secondary schools.
- Innovative education of teachers’ assistants, educators, special pedagogues, school psychologists working in primary and secondary schools.

**Innovation of Roma culture curriculum, preparation of textbooks and methodological materials:**
- Regular monitoring of quality concerning subject Roma culture in primary and secondary schools.
- Preparation of textbooks for subject Roma culture for teachers and pupils and students (kindergartens, primary and secondary schools, primary and secondary schools, universities).

**Awareness in regions:**
- to motivate school founders and schools in relation to the needs to implement curricula of subject Roma culture in education,
- to organize seminars and workshops with school founders, school principals and teachers,
- to organize seminars and workshops for local communities (parents, social workers, etc.).

**What are the needs?**
- Building personal capacities with regard to education, drafting of study materials, textbooks, methodological materials and research,
- Providing support to schools – material and technical support, consultation support, support in the field of further education, financial support to implement curriculum of subject Roma culture in school education,
- Networking of schools which teach Roma culture in school environment and outside of school,
- Sharing of good examples from practice, supporting teaching materials, exchange of experience between teachers,
- To find funding or grant scheme for financing specified needs from EU funds.

**Moldova:**
After exchange and discussion with the teachers of Roma history from schools instructing this subject in the Slovak Republic, the importance of teaching the subject „Roma history, culture and traditions” in – *Romani*
language was highlighted. The process of forming civic identity of Slovak Republic’s citizens should be preceded by the awareness of specific ethnic identity, and the native language teaching is the main instrument that forms the ethnic identity for any pupils representing any national minority. This statement is valid for any country where there are representatives of ethnic minorities, including the Roma. This subject concerning the improving of teaching of the Roma history (including Roma Holocaust/genocide) in the textbooks and school curricula must to be accomplished also through thematic debate at CoE Dialogue Meeting with Roma and Traveller Civil Society.

4.3 Good practices identified

Slovak Republic
- in 2017 a Ministry of Education regulation adopted that is incentive for school to organise visits for pupils in commemoration sites; it is not obligation for school but Ministry will provide the financial resources for schools willing to organise such a visit; thus – the financial barrier for additional activities relating to Holocaust teaching were abolished,
- the teaching materials for the subject „Roma history, culture and traditions“35,
- the project: Together with Roma, we will achieve more, funded by EEA grants and the state budget. Within this project, teachers, teachers’ assistants, primary school educators from 20 elementary schools were trained. Education was focused not only on Romani language but also on Roma history. The aim of this training was to strengthen intercultural education in schools by increasing their professional competencies. In addition to the education, two learning materials have been developed: history textbook (searching for the past of Roma), and on Roma culture. Education is still ongoing and is working on the implementation of the Roma history material on school curricula issued by the CoE. The National Institute for Education also informed about the innovation of educational standards for the subject Roma culture (realia) for primary and secondary schools. These materials serve teachers teaching Roma culture (realia) subject matter as a tool for the preparation of time plans and lessons. The subject of Roma culture (realia) consists of the culture and history of the Roma as well as their social situation in Slovakia and Europe. This subject is taught at schools: in Private Pedagogical and Social Academy and Private Music and Drama Conservatory, Košice, Private and Music and Drama Conservatory, Rimavská Sobota, Joint School (eight year secondary grammar school and primary school), Kremnica.

Czech Republic
On the one hand, it is good that in Slovakia there exist private schools that focus on education of Romany realities, Roma culture and Romani language. It encourages self-esteem and pride in pupils about their origins. At the same time it contributes to the preservation or even the development of Roma culture and language. On the other hand, it is important to say that these are segregated schools, where mainly Romani pupils are educated. The long-term goal should be the education of Roma pupils in mainstream schools, where they will have the opportunity to study Roma realities, Roma culture and language.

Republic of Moldova:
For Romania: Regarding the concept of elaboration of the additional school textbook in Romania for the subject „The Holocaust: A warning of History“ – the chapter concerning the teaching of Roma Holocaust must

35 http://www.statpedu.sk/sk/o-organizacii/projekty/spolu-romami-dosiahneme-viac/publikacie/
to be included as an integral part of this tragic phenomenon as such and not to be approached in a separate way\textsuperscript{36}.

**Norway toolkit on national minorities for kindergartens:** Moldovan expert informed about good example of improving the knowledge on minorities - it is Norwegian example of toolkit on national minorities living in Norway, prepared for kindergarten level. Starting the intercultural and civic education on the earliest possible education level contributes to better understanding of human right perspective and the cultural heritage of all ethnicities in the respective country.

**Romania**
– as it was mentioned during the visit – Roma Holocaust is partly dominated by the issues of compensations, and the case of “irregularities” are known and not only in Romania. To assure the victims the proper payment, Romanian NGO Centrul de Resurse pentru Comunitate (Community Resource Center) prepared a website with all needed information that can be used by Roma survivors to be compensate as entitled Holocaust victims (www.roma-survivors.ro ),
- especially in the Central European states (Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary, Poland, etc.) there is a good practice to organize educational activities with the pupils visiting different commemoration sites, memorials, former German Nazi concentration camps that are relevant also for the Roma history (Auschwitz, Lety, Komarom, etc.); pupils during the history lessons (field visit) could identify the names of six camps in Slovakia, where the Roma were detained;
- In other countries like Romania there are not similar commemoration sites and the existing ones, like mentioned above, are far away (outside the Romanian borders, thus impossible to visit, in practice). There is only one Holocaust Memorial in Bucharest (where there is also a so called “Roma wheel” referring to the Roma victims) so need to consider how to fill this gap in case of countries with no commemoration sites;
- Romania created the possibility to learn more about Roma minority during education process – there are additional, optional course for those pupils who are interested in to deepen their knowledge. This solutions should be copied by other countries, especially those, where Roma consist a significant number of country citizens. It must be underlined that the activity of minorities, including Roma, to support the national and local education authorities is important factor in providing the sources, expertise and consultations.

**4.4 Envisaged follow-up**

**Slovakia**
- *To know each other* project – under preparation

**Czech Republic**
- The National Roma Contact Point considers the possibility to map schools where teaching of Romani language and/or Roma history or Roma realities. The NRCP would like to mediate contacts between these schools and similar schools in Slovakia.

- A variant is also organizing Czech-Slovak Conference of Directors and Teachers with the aim of exchanging experience.

Hungary

- Based on the results of textbook review - suggestions were made to modify textbook content in relation to Roma presence.

Republic of Moldova

- Experience gained during this thematic visit on the teaching of Roma history (including Roma Holocaust/genocide) in the textbooks and school curricula, was already shared with the conference participants for young scholars „Valorisation of the ethno-cultural heritage of the Republic of Moldova in research and education” (II edition), organized by Institute of Cultural Heritage of the Academy of Sciences of Moldova, held in Chisinau, November 16, 2017 ³⁷.

Romania

There are promises on behalf of MEN that more attention will be paid to the Roma history. According to information from the general inspector for History within Ministry of Education:
- trainings with history teachers will continue and be expanded,
- Roma history will be taught at more educational levels (other than the 8th grade) by introducing into the curriculum for all branches, profiles and specialties, some content on the history of the Roma and the Holocaust;
- an optional course on Roma History and the Holocaust and a textbook will be introduced,
- the exhibition on Roma Holocaust is under preparation in Jewish Museum in Bucharest.

Recommendations:

To CoE

- proposal to organise one of the next CoE Dialog Meetings with Roma NGO on the Roma history & culture (without language item) teaching, including the Holocaust period, in school system.

To CAHROM

- To invite IHRA representative for next CAHROM plenary to present the IHRA, Committee on Roma Genocide and its achievement and deepen the cooperation between IHA and CAHROM,
- To improve cooperation with national delegation to IHRA on Roma Holocaust commemorations,
- Regularly update the information on recent developments on the CoE/OSCE webside Genocide of the Roma ³⁸
- to prepare “road map” on national levels relating to Roma history and culture teaching prospects,
- to prepare the list of existing teaching material of all kind on national level and disseminate it among the national stakeholders.

³⁷ http://www.asm.md/?go=noutati_detalii&n=8225&new_language=0
³⁸ http://roma-genocide.org/
Cooperation among: Council of Europe (CAHROM), EU National Roma Contact Points (NRCP) and International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA)

Unanimously, after IHRA presentation, participants of the thematic visit agreed that there is an urgent need for closer cooperation between IHRA (and national delegations to IHRA), CoE Member States and National Roma Contact Points (NRCP) of EU on several issues related to Roma Holocaust: to exchange the information on recent developments in the field of commemorations and researches on Roma Holocaust, updating existing IHRA information and exchange and discussions on national levels on the list of IHRA’s “problematic” commemorations sites.
APPENDICES:

Appendix 1: Official invitation received from Slovak Republic authorities
(letter is pending)

Appendix 2: Agenda of the CAHROM thematic visit to Košice, Slovak Republic, on 7-9 November 2017

[FINAL AGENDA 2
NOVEMBER VERSION.]

Appendix 3: List of experts participating in the CAHROM thematic group

[list of experts.doc]

Appendix 4: ERTF Guidelines on the steps towards achieving official recognition of Anti-Gypsyism and on promoting remembrance and the teaching of Roma history in schools.

[ERTF_Guidelines_on_the_stepst_toward_]

Appendix 5: Size, composition, language, lifestyle and situation of Roma in countries participating in the visit (Slovak republic, Czech Republic, Hungary, Republic of Moldova and Romania).

[APPENDIX 5.docx]

Appendix 6: European and international standards and reference texts.

[APPENDIX 6.docx]

Appendix 7: Table on recognition and commemoration days in CoE member states

[Item 05 - Summary_EXCEL_tab]