



Strasbourg, 21 October 2021

CAHAI-PDG(2021)PV4

**AD HOC COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (CAHAI)  
POLICY DEVELOPMENT GROUP  
(CAHAI-PDG)**

**6<sup>th</sup> online meeting  
11-12 October 2021**

---

**Abridged Report**

---

Prepared by the Secretariat

[www.coe.int/cahai](http://www.coe.int/cahai)

## **1. Opening of the meeting**

1. Mr Gregor Stojin, Chair of the CAHAI, opened this 6th and final meeting of the CAHAI-PDG by congratulating the Working Group for its work related to the impact assessment of AI applications on human rights, democracy and the rule of law, as well as on the use of AI in the public sector.
2. He underlined that this being the last meeting of the CAHAI-PDG, it was time to focus on the final product for the CAHAI. In the case of the CAHAI-PDG, this would be the chapter on impact assessment prepared by the Secretariat based on the outcomes of the discussions held within the CAHAI-PDG and its sub-working groups.
3. Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society- Action against Crime, Council of Europe, continued the opening session by highlighting the tremendous work accomplished so far by the CAHAI-PDG on the impact assessment of AI applications on human rights, democracy and the rule of law, in particular bearing in mind that all the meetings have thus far taken place online.
4. He underlined that the chapter on impact assessment would be a crucial part of any future instrument and the utmost importance that, during these two days, the Working Group focuses on finalising its work.
5. Mr Kleijssen also drew the Working Group's attention to the agenda item concerning the examination of the document on human rights, democracy and the rule of law (HUDERIA) prepared by the Alan Turing Institute at the request of the Secretariat. He underlined that although the Group is invited to discuss and take note of the document, it is not intended to be adopted or otherwise approved by the CAHAI-PDG.

## **2. Adoption of the agenda**

6. The Secretariat informed the Group that it had requested the preparation of this document with the aim of advancing the work of the CAHAI-PDG and stimulating debate. It reiterated that the document is simply a reference document and the CAHAI-PDG is not expected to adopt it.
7. The agenda was subsequently adopted.

## **3. Examination of the document on human rights, democracy and the rule of law (HUDERIA) prepared by the Alan Turing Institute, followed by discussions**

8. Mr David Leslie (United Kingdom), member of the CAHAI Bureau, presented the document on Human Rights, Democracy, and the Rule of Law Assurance Framework (HUDERAF) for AI Systems, prepared by the Alan Turing Institute at the request of the CAHAI Secretariat. He explained that the proposals laid out in the document are based on the work of the PDG's Sub-Working Group 1, with the aim to operationalize the outline of a Model for a Human Rights, Democracy, and the Rule of Law Impact Assessment

(HUDERIA). Mr Leslie underlined that as a living document, it is destined to be edited and changed in accordance with future developments.

9. Following a valuable discussion on the various aspects (including methodology, the different specificities of the HUDERIA approach with respect to the impact of human rights, democracy and rule of law, the role and engagement of the stakeholders, coordination on the different phases of the algorithm lifecycle) of the document, it was agreed that many of these insights provided could be taken into the discussions on Chapter XII and impact assessment as an inspiration for debates.
10. The Chair of the CAHAI-PDG, Mr Wolfgang Teves (Germany) thanked the Alan Turing institute for its important work in having prepared such a comprehensive model.
11. The CAHAI-PDG took note of the document and decided to include its Executive Summary in the meeting report as an appendix. Depending on the future terms of reference of the committee replacing the CAHAI, it was agreed that it might be possible to further develop the ideas contained in the document.

#### **4. Brief summary by the Secretariat of discussions held within the CAHAI-PDG on Artificial intelligence in the Public Sector**

12. The PDG examined a document presenting a Summary of discussions held within the Working Group on Artificial intelligence in the Public Sector, prepared by the Secretariat.
13. Delegations discussed the terminology and whether AI in the public sector should be addressed in a transversal instrument or rather be part of a more sectorial approach. The Secretariat underlined that the discussion on the choice of a transversal or a sectorial approach should be left to the Committee of Ministers who will take the final decision.
14. The topics of human oversight as well as the right to be informed when interacting with an AI system and the right to alternatively interact with a human being where there may be serious consequences for the user were deemed particularly important.
15. The CAHAI-PDG also underlined the fact that any AI system used in the public sector will give rise to certain issues as regards human rights, democracy, and the rule of law and therefore the importance of giving due consideration to the use of AI systems in this field.
16. The Group decided that the reference to gender equality should be extended to other forms of discrimination and that the mention of other vulnerable groups should be extended to anyone adversely affected by the system.
17. Regarding public registers it was mentioned that they should be complemented with, inter alia, information on purpose, the actors involved, the model and the impact assessment.
18. It was decided that this important document on the use of AI in the public sector could be incorporated into the Elements document as Chapter XIII.

19. The CAHAI-PDG unanimously approved the document with the modifications agreed upon during the meeting and instructed the Secretariat to insert it into the Elements document as a new Chapter XIII and to submit it to the CAHAI for finalisation at its next and final plenary meeting (30 November – 2 December 2021). After the meeting, the representative of the Russian Federation has informed the Secretariat that his Delegation could nevertheless not support the inclusion of the document as Chapter XIII.

**5. Examination of elements for Chapter XII, Impact Assessment, of the document on ‘Possible elements of a legal framework on artificial intelligence, based on the Council of Europe’s standards on human rights, democracy and the rule of law’ as prepared by the Secretariat**

20. The CAHAI-PDG examined the elements for Chapter XII on impact assessment of the Elements document. The Co-Chair of the CAHAI-PDG, Mr Zoltan Turbek (Hungary) underlined the importance of ensuring the interlinkage between human rights, democracy and the rule of law. Moreover, he stressed that the document needs to be short and concise.

21. There was discussion on the use of the term “proxies” and it was agreed that clarification is needed. In particular when democracy is concerned, it may be difficult to know which standards are applicable.

22. The Group agreed that the need for transparency is paramount and that transparency requirements can contribute to determine whether an AI system should be subjected to an impact assessment, and in which proportion.

23. There was a discussion on how the risk level will be analysed and which risks are relevant. The need to provide methodology for low, medium and high risk was highlighted.

24. The use of an AI system for new purposes was explored, in particular as concerns which dimension of the reuse would need to be reassessed for risks. The Working Group agreed that this depends on the new purpose of the AI system and that risk assessment is needed when using an AI system for a new or different purpose or in a new or different context.

25. It was agreed that stakeholder engagement is key and that there is a difference between stakeholders and right-holders, which should be reflected in the text, as well as the acknowledgement that in certain contexts, stakeholders are simply members of society.

26. Certain delegations proposed to leave the responsibility for defining the elements for impact assessment to the national level. However, the majority of the Working Group disagreed with this approach.

27. The CAHAI-PDG unanimously approved the draft text for Chapter XII with the modifications agreed upon during the meeting and instructed the Secretariat to submit it to the CAHAI for finalisation at its next and final plenary meeting (30 November – 2 December 2021). After the meeting, the representative of the Russian Federation

informed the Secretariat that his delegation could nevertheless not approve the text of Chapter XII.

## **6. Approval of the HUDERIA elements for Chapter XII**

28. It was agreed that the updated version, including Chapters XII and XIII, of the Elements document (CAHAI-LFG (2021)10) will be presented at the CAHAI Plenary to be finalised and approved before being transmitted to the Committee of Ministers as one of the main deliverables of the CAHAI, along with the feasibility study submitted last year, and therefore fulfilling its mandate.

## **7. Any other business**

29. Mr Turbek informed the PDG members about the high-level multi-stakeholder conference co-organized by the Hungarian Presidency of the Committee of Ministers and the Council of Europe on 26 October 2021, in virtual format, focusing on the theme of “Current and Future Challenges of Coordinated Policies on AI Regulation” (<https://www.coe.int/en/web/artificial-intelligence/ai-conference-current-and-future-challenges>) .

30. No further issues were raised under this item.

**8. Closing remarks by Ms Claudia Luciani, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe**

31. Ms Luciani congratulated the CAHAI-PDG for a very productive meeting. She underlined that the task of the Working Group is to provide the best work possible, with quality documents finalised within the time constraints. She continued that in order to achieve this objective, the Working Groups of the CAHAI should be mindful to maintain a respectful atmosphere at all times and carry out the work in a spirit of mutual respect which is conducive to producing the most qualitative outputs.

32. Mr Teves also thanked all those who contributed to this fruitful meeting.

## APPENDIX I – Agenda

Monday, 11 October 2021		
9:30 am		<b>1. Opening of the meeting</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Gregor Strojín, Chair of CAHAI;</li> <li>• Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society- Action against Crime, Council of Europe;</li> <li>• Ms Claudia Luciani, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe</li> </ul>
9:45 am	<a href="#">CAHAI-PDG(2021)PV1rev.</a> <a href="#">CAHAI-PDG(2021)PV2</a> <a href="#">CAHAI-PDG(2021)PV3</a>	<b>2. Adoption of the agenda</b>
10 am	<a href="#">CAHAI-PDG(2021)09 Human Rights, Democracy, and the Rule of Law Assurance Framework for AI Systems</a>  <i>* Attention: this document is 355 pages long</i>	<b>3. Examination of the document on human rights, democracy and the rule of law (HUDERIA) prepared by the Alan Turing Institute, followed by discussions</b>
12 pm		<b>Lunch</b>
2:30 pm	CAHAI-PDG(2021)07 (restricted)	<b>4. Brief summary by the Secretariat of discussions held within the CAHAI-PDG on Artificial intelligence in the Public Sector</b>
3:30 pm	CAHAI-LFG(2021)10 (restricted) CAHAI-PDG(2021)08 (restricted)	<b>5. Examination of elements for Chapter XII, Impact Assessment, of the document on ‘Possible elements of a legal framework on artificial intelligence, based on the Council of Europe’s standards on human rights, democracy and the rule of law’ as prepared by the Secretariat</b>
5 pm		<b>End of the 1<sup>st</sup> day</b>

**Tuesday, 12 October 2021**

9:30 pm		<b>5. (continued) Examination of elements for Chapter XII, Impact Assessment, of the document on 'Possible elements of a legal framework on artificial intelligence, based on the Council of Europe's standards on human rights, democracy and the rule of law' as prepared by the Secretariat</b>
12 pm		<b>Lunch</b>
2:30 pm		<b>5. (continued) Examination of elements for Chapter XII, Impact Assessment, of the document on 'Possible elements of a legal framework on artificial intelligence, based on the Council of Europe's standards on human rights, democracy and the rule of law' as prepared by the Secretariat</b>
4:30 pm		<b>6. Approval of the HUDERIA elements for Chapter XII</b>
4:45 pm		<b>7. Any other business</b>
4:50 pm		<b>8. Closing remarks by Patrick Penninckx, Head of Department, Information Society Department</b>
5 pm		<b>End of the meeting</b>



## APPENDIX II – List of participants

### MEMBERS OF THE POLICY DEVELOPMENT GROUP / MEMBRES DU GROUPE D'ELABORATION DES POLITIQUES

#### BELGIUM / BELGIQUE HERZEGOVINE

---

**Ms Peggy VALCKE** – Vice-Chair of the CAHAJ / vice-présidente du CAHAJ and/et Co-Chair of the CAHAJ-LFG / Co-Présidente du CAHAJ-LFG  
Professor of Law and Technology, Faculty of Law at the KU Leuven / Professeur de droit et de technologie, Faculté de droit à la KU Leuven

#### BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA/BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

---

**Mr Dag DZUMRUKCIC**, Minister counsellor, Department for International Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Ministre conseiller, Département des affaires juridiques internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères

#### BULGARIA / BULGARIE

---

**Ms Totka CHERNAEVA** - Head of European Programs and Projects Unit Information Technology Directorate / Chef de l'unité "Programmes et projets européens" Direction des technologies de l'information

#### ESTONIA / ESTONIE

---

**Ms Siiri AULIK** - Adviser, Public Law Division, Ministry of Justice / Conseillère, division du droit public, Ministère de la justice

#### GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

---

**Mr Wolfgang TEVES** – Chair / Président

Head of Division for Digital Strategy; Key Policy Issues of the Information Society, Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Chef de la Division de la stratégie numérique, questions politiques clés de la société de l'information, ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs

**Ms Lena Kristina HOCKE**, Senior Lecturer, Unit Digital Strategy, Fundamental Issues of the Information Society / LL.M. maître de conférences, unité stratégie numérique, questions fondamentales de la société de l'information

#### GREECE / GRECE

---

**Mr Konstantinos SFIKAS** - Executive, Department of Open Governance and Transparency / Exécutif, Service de la gouvernance ouverte et de la transparence

## HUNGARY / HONGRIE

---

**Mr Zoltán TURBÉK** – Co-Chair / Co-Président

Director, Department of International Organisations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade / Directeur, Département des organisations internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères et du commerce

## IRELAND / IRLANDE

---

**Mr Fiachra BYRNE** - Justice Attaché, Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Permanent Representation of Ireland to the Council of Europe / Attaché de justice, Adjoint au Représentant permanent, Représentation permanente de l'Irlande auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

## NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

---

**Mr Sander MUL** - Senior Policy Adviser, Ministry of Justice and Security / Conseiller politique principal, Ministère de la justice et de la sécurité

**Mr Michael VOS**, Senior Policy Advisor, AI Policy Team, Ministry of Justice and Security / Conseiller politique principal, équipe chargée de la politique d'AI, Ministère de la justice et de la sécurité

## POLAND / POLOGNE

---

**Mr Robert KROPLEWSKI** - Plenipotentiary of the Minister of Digitization for the Information Society, Ministry of Digitization / Plénipotentiaire du ministre de la numérisation pour la société de l'information, Ministère de la numérisation

## RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE

---

**Mr Andrey KULESHOV** - Advisor on International Cooperation and Coordination at the Centre for AI Science and Technology, Moscow Institute of Physics and Technology / Conseiller en matière de coopération et de coordination internationales au Centre pour la science et la technologie de l'IA, Institut de physique et de technologie de Moscou

**Mr Konstantin KOSORUKOV** - Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Permanent Representation of the Russian Federation to the Council of Europe / Adjoint au Représentant permanent, Représentation permanente de la Fédération de Russie auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

**Ms Maria ALEEVA**, Vice-head of the Division of Institutions of Innovation Infrastructure at the Department for Strategic Development and Innovation at the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation / Vice-head of the Division of Institutions of Innovation Infrastructure at the Department for Strategic Development and Innovation at the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation

**Mr Kirill GEVORGYAN** - Expert, Analytical Center for the Government of the Russian Federation / Expert, Centre d'analyse pour le gouvernement de la Fédération de Russie

## SLOVAKIA / SLOVAQUIE

---

**Ms Barbora ŠIKUTOVA** - Legal expert, International Law Section, Department of European Affairs and Foreign Relations, Ministry of Justice / Juriste expert, Section du droit international, Service des affaires européennes et des relations extérieures, Ministère de la justice

## SLOVENIA / SLOVÉNIE

---

**Mr Gregor STROJIN** – Chair of the CAHAI / Président du CAHAI  
Advisor to the President, Supreme Court of the Republic of Slovenia / Conseiller du Président, Cour suprême de la République de Slovénie

## SPAIN / ESPAGNE

---

**Mr Ricardo SANZ** - Professor of Systems and Autonomous Engineering in the Technical University of Madrid, Researcher of the joint centre CSIC-UPM on Autonomous Systems and Robotics / Professeur d'ingénierie des systèmes et d'ingénierie autonome à l'Université technique de Madrid, chercheur du centre commun CSIC-UPM sur les systèmes autonomes et la robotique

## SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

---

**Mr Thomas SCHNEIDER** Apologised / Excusé  
Ambassador, Federal Department of the Environment, Transport, Energy and Communications, Deputy Director, Federal Office of Communications, Head of International Relations / Ambassadeur, Département fédéral de l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication, Vice-Directeur, Office fédéral de la communication, Chef Relations internationales

**Ms Livia WALPEN** - Senior Policy Advisor International Relations, Swiss Federal Office of Communication (OFCOM), Swiss Federal Department of the Environment, Transport, Energy and Communications (DETEC) / Conseiller politique principal en relations internationales, Office fédéral de la communication (OFCOM), Département fédéral de l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication (DETEC)

## TURKEY / TURQUIE

---

**Ms G. Benan AKBAS** - EU Expert, Directorate General for EU and Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Science and Technology / Expert de l'UE, Direction générale des affaires européennes et étrangères, Ministère de la science et de la technologie

**Ms Zümrüt MÜFTÜOĞLU** - Expert, Presidency of the Republic of Turkey – Digital Transformation Office / Expert, Présidence de la République de Turquie – Bureau de la transformation numérique

## UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

---

**Ms Damini SATIJA** - Senior Policy Advisor at the Centre for Data Ethics and Innovation / Conseiller politique principal au Centre pour l'éthique des données et l'innovation

**Mr Christopher THOMAS** - Policy Advisor in the AI Assurance team / Conseiller politique dans l'équipe AI Assurance

**Mr David LESLIE** - Research Team Leader in Data Ethics, Governance and Regulation of Digital Technologies, Applied Ethics of Artificial Intelligence, and AI and Society, The Alan Turing Institute / Chef d'équipe de recherche en éthique des données, gouvernance et réglementation du numérique Technologies, éthique appliquée de l'intelligence artificielle, IA et société, l'institut Alan Turing

## **PARTICIPANTS**

### **Council of Europe bodies and institutions / Organes et institutions du Conseil de l'Europe**

#### **CONFERENCE OF INGOS / CONFÉRENCE DES OING**

---

**Ms Francesca FANUCCI** - Senior legal advisor at European Center for Not-for-Profit Law, Netherlands / Conseiller juridique principal au Centre européen pour le droit des associations à but non lucrative, Pays-Bas

**Mr Didier SCHRETTER** - Representative of the Conference of INGOS, Chair of the European Association for Audiovisual Media Education (EAAME) / Représentant de la Conférence des OING, Président de l'Association Européenne pour l'Éducation aux Médias Audiovisuels (AEEMA)

#### **CULTURAL SUPPORT FUND (EURIMAGES) / FONDS CULTUREL (EURIMAGES)**

---

**Mr Thierry HUGOT**, Financial Analyst, Eurimages Secretariat, / Analyste financier, Secrétariat d'Eurimages

#### **CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE – DATA PROTECTION / COMITE CONSULTATIF- PROTECTION DES DONNEES (T-PD)**

---

**Mr Alessandro MANTELERO** - Associate Professor at Politecnico di Torino - Tongji University / Professeur associé au Politecnico di Torino – Université Tongji

#### **EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE (CDDG) / COMITE EUROPEEN SUR LA DEMOCRATIE ET LA GOUVERNANCE (CDDG)**

---

**Mr Peter ANDRE** - Senior Expert for legal affairs, Federal Ministry of Interior, Austria, CDDG Rapporteur on Democracy and Technology / Expert principal pour les affaires juridiques, Ministère fédéral de l'intérieur d'Autriche, Rapporteur du CDDG sur la démocratie et la technologie

**Ms Judith ORLAND** - Programme Manager Democracy and AI, Democratic Governance Division, CDDG Secretariat / Responsable du programme Démocratie et AI, Division de la gouvernance démocratique, Secrétariat du CDDG

## **GENDER EQUALITY COMMISSION / COMMISSION POUR L'EGALITE DE GENRE**

---

**Ms Käthlin SANDER** - Head of Gender Equality Policy, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Social Affairs, Estonia / Responsable de la politique d'égalité entre les sexes, département des politiques d'égalité, ministère des affaires sociales, Estonie

**Mme Cécile GREBOVAL** - Programme Manager Gender Mainstreaming et Gender Equality Advisor, / Responsable de programme, Gender Mainstreaming, Conseillère en matière d'égalité entre les femmes et les hommes

## **European Union and Observers from International Organisations / Union européenne et Observateurs des Organisations Internationales**

### **EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPEENNE**

---

**Mr Eike GRAEF** - Policy officer, Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers, Directorate C : Fundamental Rights and Rule of Law, Unit C.2: Fundamental rights policy, European Commission / Responsable des politiques, Direction générale de la justice et des consommateurs, Direction C : Droits fondamentaux et de l'état de droit, Unité C.2: Politique des droits fondamentaux, Commission européenne

**Ms Yordanka IVANOVA** - Legal and Policy Officer, Directorate-General for Communications Networks, Content and Technology (DG CNECT), European Commission / Conseiller juridique et politique, Direction générale des réseaux de communication, du contenu et des technologies (DG CNECT)

### **EUROPEAN DATA PROTECTION SUPERVISOR (EDPS) / CONTROLEUR EUROPEEN DE LA PROTECTION DES DONNEES (CEPD)**

---

**Mr Stefano LEUCCI** - Technology and legal officer, Technology and Privacy Unit / Agent de la technologie et du droit, Unité Technologie et Vie privée

**Mr Xabier LAREO** - Technology and security officer, Technology and Privacy unit / Agent de la technologie et de la sécurité, unité Technologie et vie privée

## **OBSERVERS/ OBSERVATEURS**

### **Observer States to the CAHAI / Etats observateurs au CAHAI**

#### **ISRAEL / ISRAEL**

---

**Mr Cedric Yehuda SABBAH** - Director, International Cybersecurity & IT Law, Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law), Ministry of Justice, Israel / Directeur, Cybersécurité internationale et droit des technologies de l'information, Bureau du procureur général adjoint (droit international), Ministère de la Justice, Israël

## **MEXICO**

---

**Dr. Jorge Arturo CERDIO HERRAN** – Professor, Autonomous Technological Institute of Mexico (ITAM) /  
Professeur, Institut Technologique Autonome de Mexique (ITAM)

### **OBSERVERS ADMITTED TO THE CAHAI / OBSERVATEURS ADMIS AU CAHAI**

**Council of Europe partner Internet companies / Entreprises internet partenaires du Conseil de  
l'Europe**

## **TELEFONICA**

---

**Mr Pablo BARRIONUEVO** - Manager, Public Policy & Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et  
Internet

**Ms Isabel Maria ALVARO ALONSO** – Trainee / Stagiaire

**Civil Society Organisations, other private sector and academic actors relevant to the  
work of the CAHAI / Organisations de la Societe civile, autres acteurs du secteur prive et  
academique, concernes par les travaux du CAHAI**

## **ALGORITHMWATCH PLATFORM**

---

**Ms Angela MÜLLER** - Senior Policy & Advocacy Manager / Responsable principal de la politique et du  
soutien aux intérêts

**Ms Nikolett ASZODI** - Junior Policy & Advocacy Manager at AlgorithmWatch / Responsable junior de la  
politique et du plaidoyer chez AlgorithmWatch

## **EUROPEAN ASSOCIATION OF DATA PROTECTION PROFESSIONALS (EADPP)**

---

**Mr Constantinos TSIOURTOS** - Advisor to the Chair / Conseiller de la présidence

## **EEEI**

---

**Mr Robert RANQUET** - Vice President Public Affairs – AI / Vice-président des affaires publiques - IA  
EEEI Global Partners

## **GLOBAL PARTNERS DIGITAL**

---

**Mr Richard WINGFIELD**, Head of Legal / Chef des affaires juridiques

## HOMODIGITALIS

---

**Mr Eleftherios CHELIOUDAKIS** - Co-founder and Secretary of the Board of Directors / Co-fondateur et secrétaire du conseil d'administration

## ISTANBUL BAR ASSOCIATION

---

**Mr Kemal KUMKUMOGLU**, Lawyer, Member of AI Working Group of IT Law Commission of the Istanbul Bar Association / Avocat, Membre du groupe de travail sur l'IA de la commission du droit des TI du barreau d'Istanbul

**Ms Selin ÇETIN**, Coordinator of the AI Working Group, IT Law Commission / Coordinateur du groupe de travail sur l'IA, Commission du droit des technologies de l'information

**Dr Barış ERMAN**, Academician from Yeditepe University / Académicien de l'université de Yeditepe

**Atty. Tuğçe Duygu KÖKSAL**, Head of Istanbul Bar Association- Centre of Human Rights / Chef de l'Association du Barreau d'Istanbul - Centre des Droits de l'Homme

**Atty. Cenk KONUKBAY**, Vice-Chairman of Istanbul Bar Association- Centre of Human Rights / Vice-président de l'Association du Barreau d'Istanbul - Centre des Droits de l'Homme

**Ms Dila AY**, trainee of AI Working Group of Istanbul Bar Association / stagiaire du groupe de travail AI de l'Association du Barreau d'Istanbul

## INDEPENDENT EXPERTS / EXPERTS INDEPENDANTS

**Ms Nathalie SMUHA** - Researcher - Department of International & European Law, KU Leuven, Member of the OECD Network of Experts on AI (ONE AI), Former Coordinator of the EC High-Level Expert Group on AI, Belgium / Chercheur - Département de droit international et européen, KU Leuven, membre du réseau d'experts de l'OCDE sur l'IA (ONE AI), ancien coordinateur du groupe d'experts de haut niveau de la CE sur l'IA, Belgique

**Lord Tim CLEMENT-JONES**, Co-Chair All-Party Parliamentary Group on AI & Former Chair, House of Lords Select Committee on AI / Co-président du groupe parlementaire multipartite sur l'IA et ancien président de la commission spéciale de la Chambre des Lords sur l'IA

## SECRETARIAT GENERAL OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE

### DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME ET DE L'ÉTAT DE DROIT (DG I)

**Mr Jan KLEIJSEN** - Director, Information Society – Action against Crime, Council of Europe / Directeur, Société de l'Information – Lutte contre la Criminalité, Conseil de l'Europe

**Mr Patrick PENNINGKX** - Head of Department, Information Society Department / Chef du Service, Service de la société de l'information

### DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF DEMOCRACY / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DE LA DÉMOCRATIE (DG II)

**Ms Claudia LUCIANI** – Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directrice, Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance

### SECRETARIAT OF THE CAHAI / SECRÉTARIAT DU CAHAI

**Mr Kristian BARTHOLIN**  
Secretary to the CAHAI / Secrétaire du CAHAI

**Ms Lucy ANCELIN** - Assistant to the CAHAI / Assistante du CAHAI

**Ms Louise RIONDEL**  
Co-Secretary to the CAHAI / Co-Secrétaire du CAHAI

**Ms Claire ROBINS** - Secretariat, Counter-terrorism division / Secrétariat, Division Anti-terrorisme

**Mr Alexandr TIULKANOV** – Special advisor on digital developments / Conseiller spécial sur les développements numériques

**Ms Geisa CONCEICAO CIPRIANI** - Digital Development Unit Trainee / Stagiaire de l'unité de développement numérique

\*\*\*

### INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES

**Ms Julia TANNER**

**M. Didier JUNGLING**