

Strasbourg, 21 January 2021

CAHAI-PDG(2021)PV1rev.

## AD HOC COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (CAHAI) POLICY DEVELOPMENT GROUP (CAHAI-PDG)

3<sup>rd</sup> online meeting 20-21 January 2021

**Abridged Report** 

Prepared by the Secretariat

www.coe.int/cahai

## 1. Opening of the meeting

- 1. The CAHAI-PDG Co-Chairs welcomed members and participants to the first meeting of the year.
- 2. The Chair of the CAHAI began by highlighting the very positive feedback regarding the work of the CAHAI received during the Conference on Human Rights in the Era of AI Europe as international Standard Setter for Artificial Intelligence organised by the German presidency of the Committee of Ministers on 20 January 2021.
- 3. He also congratulated CAHAI-PDG members for the outstanding work done within very tight deadlines on the feasibility study. As the CAHAI will be preparing elements for both binding and non-binding legal frameworks/instruments, the CAHAI-PDG will examine which aspects could be covered by non-binding sector specific instruments and which elements should be transmitted to the CAHAI-LFG.
- 4. He added that to make the cooperation between the Working Groups more effective, meetings between the Co-Chairs of each Working Group should be organised on a regular basis and Co-Chairs should attend the meetings of the other Working Groups, whenever necessary.
- 5. The Chair of the CAHAI also mentioned the CAHAI plenary taking place on 26 February which will address the multi-stakeholder consultation, and for which input from the CAHAI-PDG is also desirable.

## 2. Adoption of the agenda

6. The agenda was adopted unanimously.

## 3. Information point: Conference on "Protecting Human Rights in the era of AI - Europe as an international standard setter for the regulation of Artificial Intelligence" – Conference organised by the German Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers

- 7. The Co-Chair of CAHAI-PDG, Wolfgang Teves (Germany), presented the Conference on Al organised by the German presidency of the Committee of Ministers on 20 January 2021. He indicated that the conclusions of the conference are available both on the German presidency website and the Council of Europe website. He thanked those CAHAI members who took part for their contributions to the fruitful discussions and the success of the Conference.
- 8. Mr Teves highlighted the main points of the conclusions and the wide support shown to the feasibility study. Moreover, during the Conference much support was voiced for the need for a binding legal framework in the field of AI with sectorial instruments of a binding or non-binding nature.
- 9. Also, the Conference encouraged the CAHAI to continue its work through multi-stakeholder consultations.
- 10. Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director of Information Society and Action against Crime directorate of the Council of Europe thanked the German Presidency of the Committee of Ministers for the organisation of the conference and underlined the varied and important number of participants.

- 11. He indicated that this Conference has contributed broadly to the visibility of the work of CAHAI. As often the focus is on the EU, not everyone is aware that the CoE is playing such a leading role on AI and the Conference was a good opportunity to highlight this. He encouraged the conclusions to be shared with the Committee of Ministers so that it is formally informed.
- 12. Mr Kleijssen also mentioned that issues to be examined would most likely move between the CAHAI-PDG and the CAHAI-LFG, depending on whether consensus is reached in the CAHAI-LFG.

## 4. Exchange of views on CAHAI- PDG activities in 2021, in the light of the CAHAI-PDG 2021 mandate and the CAHAI Bureau meeting of 15 January 2021

- 13. The CAHAI-PDG Co-Chairs presented the working documents including the workplan for 2021.
- 14. There was an exchange of general views among members of the CAHAI-PDG on potentially relevant topics for their work going forward, based on the Feasibility Study adopted at the last plenary in December 2020.
- 15. There were discussions on the issues that the Working Group should focus on and develop. The Co-Chair indicated that the CAHAI-LFG would focus on the concrete elements of Chapter 7 of the Feasibility Study as a starting point, whereas the CAHAI-PDG could develop the issues raised in other chapters, for instance in Chapters 3 and 9.
- 16. The Feasibility Study having been unanimously adopted, it is now for the CAHAI-PDG to determine which issues are to be developed further, as well as to look for gaps in the Feasibility Study where other issues may also need examination.
- 17. The group raised as potential topics, inter alia, compliance mechanisms, human rights impact assessment, aspects of the liability regime, the level of risk of AI applications, education and awareness to AI technologies, policy guidance on positive uses of AI systems, the impact of AI on democracy, the responsible use of AI in the public sector, gender equality and discrimination in the context of the development and use of AI. These items would be more specifically discussed by the Group under agenda item 3.3, with a view to ultimately deciding which ones should become working subjects in 2021.
- 18. The CAHAI-PDG also pointed out the importance of coordinating efficiently the work and tasks with other working groups to avoid overlap and of bringing relevant input to the work of the CAHAI-LFG. The Co-Chairs of the respective working groups would work in close collaboration and take part in the other working group meetings where possible.
- 19. To conclude, it was decided that the Co-Chairs and the Secretariat will prepare a list of potential issues and topics on which the CAHAI-PDG could focus on in 2021, which will be presented during the next day of the meeting for further discussion.

## 4.1 Elaboration of the questionnaire for the multi-stakeholder consultation

20. Mr Wolfgang Teves presented the questionnaire that had been drafted by the Co-Chairs of the CAHAI-PDG following the CAHAI Bureau meeting on 15 January regarding the multi-stakeholder consultation which will take place this year.

- 21. The Secretariat indicated the expected timeline of the online survey (results by spring), its dissemination and expected result which is to provide a first indication to the CAHAI-LFG on issues where there are broad consensus or differing opinions.
- 22. The CAHAI-PDG members discussed the draft questionnaire and proceeded to make several comments.
- 23. There was general agreement on the inclusion of a preliminary question on the geographical and group affiliation in order to provide a data analysis of the respondents in the final report of the consultation.
- 24. There was also a consensus on the necessity to reduce the length of the questionnaire, to maintain a consistency of language and to clarify the meaning of certain questions in line with the objective of the survey which is to provide relevant input to the CAHAI-LFG work.
- 25. The discussions highlighted the necessity to use a mixed form of possible questions, using both closed questions, open questions, multiple choice questions and a likert-type scale in order to obtain valuable and relevant input for interpretation. A lickert scale would reflect any nuances in the answers and allow for comparison of the different priorities of the respondents. Furthermore, a possibility to say 'no opinion/don't know' should be added to the possible answers to the questions.
- 26. It was decided that questions with a clear yes or no answer that bring no obvious input to the consultation should be avoided. Also, open questions should be well-framed and only asked at the right moment and limiting the length of replies, since the replies could otherwise be difficult to process.
- 27. Finally, the CAHAI-PDG agreed on the need of having a preliminary methodological note at the beginning of the survey to avoid misunderstandings of the questionnaire as well as giving examples in order to clarify questions, where necessary.
- 28. The Secretariat invited delegations to provide their inputs to the questionnaire as soon as possible so that a new draft of the questionnaire could be produced and circulated by the end of the week after this meeting (25 29 January 2021).

## 4.2 Mapping of Council of Europe's ongoing intergovernmental initiatives in the field of AI in 2021 and of those tentatively planned for 2022-23

- 29. The Secretariat informed the Working Group that it would be liaising with other departments within the CoE Secretariat in order to do a mapping of other Al-related initiatives being carried out in the different sectors, as well as to establish in which sectors there is no current activity. This would lead to a better understanding of where the CAHAI could undertake further action and avoid unnecessary duplication of work.
- 30. The importance of the mapping initiative was once again stressed, with the group calling for a rolling list of projects in the field of AI within the CoE that would provide input to the work of the CAHAI: in particular, which issues could be addressed by part of sectorial instruments. The Secretariat confirmed that the mapping should be completed by March.

## 4.3 Exchange of views on working subjects for the CAHAI-PDG in 2021 and division of labour with the CAHAI-LFG.

- 31. The Secretariat, in replying to a previous question, underlined that both Working Groups together should produce one final deliverable: the potential elements of a future legal framework which will be transmitted to the CAHAI plenary.
- 32. The CAHAI-PDG examined the list of possible working subjects prepared by the Secretariat and the Co-Chairs. This list should not be considered as exhaustive or definitive, its role being simply to serve as a basis for discussions.
- 33. Mr Teves reminded the group that the CAHAI-PDG should focus on areas that the Feasibility Study either does not explore in detail or does not cover. The CAHAI-LFG will focus on rights and obligations of Chapter 7, whereas the CAHAI-PDG will focus mostly on Chapters 3 and 9, however other issues could be transmitted from the CAHAI-PDG to the CAHAI-LFG, or vice versa.
- 34. The Working Group agreed that, where avoidable, it is important not to duplicate work undertaken by other relevant international organisations, such as UNESCO and the OECD.
- 35. The importance of having a clear idea of what was to be achieved by the CAHAI-PDG was emphasised by the Working Group. In this regard it was agreed to set up two sub-working groups, one dealing with impact assessments of AI applications, from the perspective of human rights, democracy and the rule of law, and one giving policy guidance on the use of AI in the public sector.
- 36. All agreed that close co-operation between the Working Groups is essential. In order to reach a common understanding between the CAHAI-LFG and the CAHAI-PDG, the group decided it would be useful to invite the Co-Chairs of the CAHAI-PDG to explain the current state of play of the work of the CAHAI-PDG at the next CAHAI-LFG meeting.

## 5. Planning of work and distribution of tasks until the next meeting

37. The Secretariat informed the Working Group that a description of the tasks of the two above-mentioned sub-working groups will be circulated to CAHAI-PDG members, asking for those who are interested to sign up to one or both groups.

## 6. Next CAHAI-PDG meetings

38. The Group was informed that the 4th CAHAI-PDG meeting would take place on 18-19 March 2021, in an online format.

## 7. Any other business

39. No other issues were raised.

# 8. Closing remarks by Ms Claudia Luciani, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe

40. Ms Luciani did not deliver closing remarks but intervened in the framework of the discussions under point 4.3. She indicated that the German conference had been a very interesting forum of discussion on issues related to the challenges brought by AI in the field of human rights, democracy and the rule of law. She stressed that the CAHAI-PDG has the privileged opportunity to be able to explore different issues related to the application of

Al in the framework of democratic processes, and encouraged the Group to go further in the analysis of the challenges and possible policy answers.

## APPENDIX I - AGENDA

Thursday, 21 January 2021			
9.30 am		<ol> <li>Opening of the meeting.</li> <li>Mr Gregor Strojin, Chair of CAHAI</li> </ol>	
9.45 am		2. Adoption of the agenda	
9.50 am	<u>CAHAI(2020)10</u> <u>ADD REV3</u> <u>Feasibility Study</u> <u>CAHAI(2020)23</u>	3. Exchange of views on CAHAI- PDG activities in 2021, in the light of the CAHAI-PDG 2021 mandate and the CAHAI Bureau meeting of 15 January 2021	
10.10 am	<u>CAHAI-</u> PDG(2021)01	3.1. Elaboration of the questionnaire for the multi- stakeholder consultation	
		<ul> <li>Presentation by the CAHAI-PDG co-chairs</li> <li>Comments by CAHAI-PDG members, observers and participants</li> </ul>	
11.20 am		3.2 Mapping of Council of Europe's ongoing intergovernmental initiatives in the field of AI in 2021 and of those tentatively planned for 2022-23	
12.00 pm		Closing of the first day	
Friday, 22 January 2021			
11 am		3.3 Exchange of views on working subjects for the CAHAI- PDG in 2021 and division of labour with the CAHAI-LFG	
12.30 pm		Lunch break	

2 pm		4. Planning of work and distribution of tasks until the next meeting
2.30 pm		5. Information point: Conference on "Protecting Human Rights in the era of Al - Europe as an international standard setter for the regulation of Artificial Intelligence" – Conference organised by the German Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers
		Mr Wolfgang Teves, co-chair of the CAHAI-PDG.
		<ul> <li>Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society- Action against Crime, Council of Europe</li> </ul>
2.40 pm	CAHAI(2020)25rev1	<b>6. Next CAHAI-PDG meetings (</b> 18-19 March 2021, online meeting)
2.45 pm		7. Any other business
2.50 pm		8. Closing remarks by Ms Claudia Luciani, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe
		End of the meeting

## **APPENDIX II – LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

## MEMBERS OF THE POLICY DEVELOPMENT GROUP / MEMBRES DU GROUPE D'ELABORATION DES POLITIQUES

#### BELGIUM/BELGIQUE

**Ms Peggy VALCKE** – <u>Vice-Chair of the CAHAI / Vice-présidente du CAHAI</u> Researcher and Professor in ICT and Media at the Faculty of Law at the KU Leuven / chercheuse et professeur en ICT et médias à la faculté de droit à la KU Leuven

#### BELGIUM/BELGIQUE

**Mr Dag DZUMRUKCIC** - Minister counsellor, Department for International Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Ministre conseiller, Département des affaires juridiques internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères

## BULGARIA / BULGARIE

**Ms Totka CHERNAEVA** - Head of European Programs and Projects Unit Information Technology Directorate / Chef de l'unité "Programmes et projets européens" Direction des technologies de l'information

## ESTONIA/ESTONIE

**Ms Siiri AULIK** - Adviser, Public Law Division, Ministry of Justice / Conseillère, division du droit public, Ministère de la justice

## GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

## Mr Wolfgang TEVES - Chair / Président

Head of Division for Digital Strategy; Key Policy Issues of the Information Society, Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Chef de la Division de la stratégie numérique, questions politiques clés de la société de l'information, ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs

**Ms Lena Kristina HOCKE** - LL.M. Senior Lecturer, Unit Digital Strategy, Fundamental Issues of the Information Society / LL.M. maître de conférences, unité stratégie numérique, questions fondamentales de la société de l'information

**Ms Isabella FLORES OVIEDO** - Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / *Ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs* 

## **GREECE / GRECE**

**Mr Konstantinos SFIKAS** - Executive, Department of Open Governance and Transparency / Exécutif, Service de la gouvernance ouverte et de la transparence

## HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Mr Zoltán TURBÉK – Co-Chair / Co-Président

Director, Department of International Organisations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade / Directeur, Département des organisations internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères et du commerce

#### IRELAND / IRLANDE

**Mr Fiachra BYRNE**, Justice Attaché, Permanent Representation of Ireland to the Council of Europe / Attaché de justice, Représentation permanente de l'Irlande auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

#### ITALY / ITALIE

**Ms Alessandra PIERUCCI** - Service for EU and International Matters, Garante per la protezione dei dati personali / Service pour les affaires européennes et internationales, Contrôleur de la protection des données

## NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

**Mr Floris KREIKEN**, Policy Advisor, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations / Conseiller politique principal, Ministère de l'intérieur et des relations au sein du Royaume

**Ms Monika MILANOVIC**, Legal Advisor, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations / Conseillère juridique, Ministère de l'intérieur et des relations au sein du Royaume

**Mr Sander MUL**, Senior Policy Adviser, Ministry of Justice and Security / Conseiller politique principal, Ministère de la justice et de la sécurité

**Mr Michael VOS** - Senior Policy Advisor, Al Policy Team, Ministry of Justice and Security / Conseiller politique principal, équipe chargée de la politique d'Al, Ministère de la justice et de la sécurité

#### **POLAND / POLOGNE**

**Mr Robert KROPLEWSKI** - Plenipotentiary of the Minister of Digitization for the Information Society, Ministry of Digitization / Plénipotentiaire du ministre de la numérisation pour la société de l'information, Ministère de la numérisation

## **RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE**

**Mr Andrey KULESHOV** - Advisor on International Cooperation and Coordination at the Centre for AI Science and Technology, Moscow Institute of Physics and Technology / Conseiller en matière de coopération et de coordination internationales au Centre pour la science et la technologie de l'IA, Institut de physique et de technologie de Moscou

## SLOVAKIA / SLOVAQUIE

**Ms Barbora ŠIKUTOVA** - Legal expert, International Law Section, Department of European Affairs and Foreign Relations, Ministry of Justice / Juriste expert, Section du droit international, Service des affaires européennes et des relations extérieures, Ministère de la justice

## SPAIN / ESPAGNE

**Mr Ricardo SANZ** - Professor of Systems and Autonomous Engineering in the Technical University of Madrid, Researcher of the joint centre CSIC-UPM on Autonomous Systems and Robotics / Professeur d'ingénierie des systèmes et d'ingénierie autonome à l'Université technique de Madrid, chercheur du centre commun CSIC-UPM sur les systèmes autonomes et la robotique

## SWEDEN / SUEDE

**Mr Magnus NORDSTRÖM** - Deputy director, Europe Division, Department for European Security Policy, Ministry for Foreign Affairs / Directeur adjoint, Division Europe, Service de la politique européenne de sécurité, Ministère des affaires étrangères

## SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

**Mr Thomas SCHNEIDER** - Ambassador, Federal Department of the Environment, Transport, Energy and Communications, Deputy Director, Federal Office of Communications, Head of International Relations / Ambassadeur, Département fédéral de l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication, Vice-Directeur, Office fédéral de la communication, Chef Relations internationales

## **TURKEY / TURQUIE**

**Ms G. Benan AKBAS** - EU Expert, Directorate General for EU and Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Science and Technology / Expert de l'UE, Direction générale des affaires européennes et étrangères, Ministère de la science et de la technologie

Ms Leyla KESER BERBER, Prof., Dr., University of Bilgi / Université de Bilgi

## UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

\_\_\_\_\_

**Dr Andrew HARDING** - Senior Policy and Technology Advisor, Centre for Data Ethics and Innovation / Conseiller principal en politique et technologie, Centre pour l'éthique des données et l'innovation

**Ms Cailean OSBORNE** - International Policy Lead, Centre for Data Ethics and Innovation / Responsable de la politique internationale, Centre pour l'éthique des données et l'innovation

## Other Member States of the Council of Europe / Autres Etats membres du Conseil de l'Europe

**SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE** 

-----

**Mr Gregor STROJIN** – <u>Chair of the CAHAI / Président du CAHAI</u> Advisor to the President, Supreme Court of the Republic of Slovenia / Conseiller du Président, Cour suprême de la République de Slovénie

## PARTICIPANTS

# Council of Europe bodies and institutions / Organes et institutions du Conseil de l'Europe

## **CONFERENCE OF INGOS / CONFÉRENCE DES OING**

**Ms Francesca FANUCCI** - Senior legal advisor at European Center for Not-for-Profit Law, Netherlands / Conseiller juridique principal au Centre européen pour le droit des associations à but non lucrative, Pays-Bas

**Mr Didier SCHRETTER,** Representative of the Conference of INGOS, Chair of the European Association for Audiovisual Media Education (EAAME) / Représentant de la Conférence des OING, Président de l'Association Européenne pour l'Éducation aux Médias Audiovisuels (AEEMA)

# ADVISORY COUNCIL ON YOUTH (CCJ) / CONSEIL CONSULTATIF SUR LA JEUNESSE (CCJ)

Ms Emilija GAGRCIN - Advisory Council on Youth / Conseil consultatif sur la jeunesse

## CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE – DATA PROTECTION / COMITE CONSULTATIF-PROTECTION DES DONNEES (T-PD)

**Mr Alessandro MANTELERO**, Associate Professor at Politecnico di Torino - Tongji University / *Professeur associé au Politecnico di Torino – Université Tongji* 

## EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE (CDDG) / COMITE EUROPEEN SUR LA DEMOCRATIE ET LA GOUVERNANCE (CDDG)

**Mr Peter ANDRE** - Senior Expert for legal affairs, Federal Ministry of Interior, Austria, CDDG Rapporteur on Democracy and Technology / Expert principal pour les affaires juridiques, Ministère fédéral de l'intérieur d'Autriche, Rapporteur du CDDG sur la démocratie et la technologie

## GENDER EQUALITY COMMISSION / COMMISSION POUR L'EGALITE DE GENRE

**Ms Käthlin SANDER** - Head of Gender Equality Policy, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Social Affairs, Estonia / Responsable de la politique d'égalité entre les sexes, département des politiques d'égalité, ministère des affaires sociales, Estonie

#### European Union and Observers from International Organisations / Union européenne et Observateurs des Organisations Internationales

## EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPEENNE

**Mr Eike GRAEF** - Policy officer, Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers, Directorate C : Fundamental Rights and Rule of Law, Unit C.2: Fundamental rights policy, European Commission / Responsable des politiques, Direction générale de la justice et des consommateurs, Direction C : Droits fondamentaux et de l'état de droit, Unité C.2: Politique des droits fondamentaux, Commission européenne

## EUROPEAN DATA PROTECTION SUPERVISOR (EDPS) / CONTROLEUR EUROPEEN DE LA PROTECTION DES DONNEES (CEPD)

**Mr Simeon de BROUWER**, Trainee at Policy & Consultation Unit / Stagiaire à l'Unité politique et consultation

**Ms Anna Zsofia HORVATH**, Trainee at Technology & Privacy Unit / Stagiaire à l'Unité Technologie et vie privée

## EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (FRA) / AGENCE DE L'UNION EUROPEENNE POUR LES DROITS FONDAMENTAUX (FRA)

Ms Jana GAJDOSOVA - Programme Manager - Just, Digital and Secure Societies, Research & Data Unit, / Gestionnaire de programme - Sociétés justes et sécurisées, Unité de recherche et de données

Mr David REICHEL, Project manager / Chef de projet

## Observer States to the CAHAI / Etats observateurs au CAHAI

ISRAEL / ISRAEL

**Mr Cedric Yehuda SABBAH** - Director, International Cybersecurity & IT Law, Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law), Ministry of Justice, Israel / Directeur, Cybersécurité internationale et droit des technologies de l'information, Bureau du procureur général adjoint (droit international), Ministère de la Justice, Israël

#### MEXICO

\_\_\_\_\_

**Dr. Jorge Arturo CERDIO HERRAN** – Professor, Autonomous Technological Institute of Mexico (ITAM) / Professeur, Institut Technologique Autonome de Mexique (ITAM)

#### OBSERVERS ADMITTED TO THE CAHAI / OBSERVATEURS ADMIS AU CAHAI

Council of Europe partner Internet companies / Entreprises internet partenaires du Conseil de l'Europe

TELEFONICA

**Ms Paloma VILLA MATEOS**, Manager, Public Policy & Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

Civil Society Organisations, other private sector and academic actors relevant to the work of the CAHAI / Organisations de la Societe civile, autres acteurs du secteur prive et academique, concernes par les travaux du CAHAI

## ACCESS NOW

Mr Daniel LEUFER - Europe Policy Analyst / Analyste des politiques européennes

AI TRANSPARENCY INSTITUTE

Ms Eva THELISSON – CEO / PDG

## HOMODIGITALIS

**Mr Eleftherios CHELIOUDAKIS** - Co-founder and Secretary of the Board of Directors / Co-fondateur et secrétaire du conseil d'administration

#### MEDIALAWS

**Mr Marco BASSINI** – Postdoctoral Researcher and Professor of IT Law, Bocconi University - Vice Editor-in-Chief, MediaLaws / Chercheur postdoctoral et professeur de droit des technologies de l'information, Université Bocconi - Vice-rédacteur en chef, MediaLaws

## INDEPENDENT EXPERTS / EXPERTS INDEPENDANTS

**Ms Nathalie SMUHA**- Researcher - Department of International & European Law, KU Leuven, Member of the OECD Network of Experts on AI (ONE AI), Former Coordinator of the EC High-Level Expert Group on AI, Belgium / Chercheur - Département de droit international et européen, KU Leuven, membre du réseau d'experts de l'OCDE sur l'IA (ONE AI), ancien coordinateur du groupe d'experts de haut niveau de la CE sur l'IA, Belgique

Lord Tim CLEMENT-JONES CBE - House of Lords Liberal Democrat Spokesperson (Digital), United Kingdom / Porte-parole libéral-démocrate de la Chambre des Lords (Digital), Royaume-Uni

## SECRETARIAT GENERAL OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE

## DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME ET DE L'ÉTAT DE DROIT (DG I)

**Mr Jan KLEIJSSEN -** Director, Information Society – Action against Crime, Council of Europe / Directeur, Société de l'Information – Lutte contre la Criminalité, Conseil de l'Europe

**Mr Patrick PENNINCKX** - Head of Department, Information Society Department / Chef du Service, Service de la société de l'information

**Mme Sophie KWASNY** - Head of Unit - Data protection, Information Society Department / Chef d'Unité - Protection des données, Service de la société de l'information

**Mr Michael JANSSEN** - Elections and Political Parties Division, Secretariat of the Venice Commission / Elections et partis politiques, Secrétariat de la Commission de Venise

**Mr Thierry HUGOT** - Financial analyst, Cultural Support Fund, Eurimages Secretariat, / Analyste financier, Secrétariat d'Eurimages

## DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF DEMOCRACY / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DE LA DÉMOCRATIE (DG II)

**Ms Claudia LUCIANI** – Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directrice, Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance

**Ms Judith ORLAND** - Programme Manager Democracy and Al, Democratic Governance Division, CDDG Secretariat / Responsable du programme Démocratie et Al, Division de la gouvernance démocratique, Secrétariat du CDDG

## SECRETARIAT OF THE CAHAI / SECRÉTARIAT DU CAHAI

#### Ms Clementina BARBARO Co-Secretary of CAHAI / Co-Secrétaire du

Co-Secretary of CAHAI / Co-Secretaire du CAHAI

#### Ms Ursula STICKER Co-Secretary of CAHAI / Co-Secrétaire du CAHAI

Mr Yannick MENECEUR - Policy Adviser / Conseiller en politiques Ms Lucy ANCELIN - Assistant to the CAHAI / Assistante du CAHAI

**Ms Claire ROBINS -** Secretariat, Counterterrorism division / Secrétariat, Division Anti-terrorisme

**Ms Laetitia DIMANCHE**, Project Assistant, Information Society Department / *Assistante de projet, Service de la société de l'information* 

\*\*\*

## **INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES**

Ms Corinne McGEORGE

Mr Didier JUNGLING