

Strasbourg, 5 November 2021

CAHAI-LFG(2021)PV5

# **AD HOC COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (CAHAI)**

## **Legal Frameworks Group (CAHAI-LFG)**

### **5<sup>th</sup> meeting**

**Strasbourg, 2-3 November 2021**

Online meeting – KUDO Platform

---

### **Meeting Report**

---

Prepared by the CAHAI Secretariat

[www.coe.int/cahai](http://www.coe.int/cahai)

## 1. Opening of the meeting

1. The CAHAI-LFG took note of the opening remarks by the Chair of the CAHAI, Mr Gregor STROJIN (Slovenia) who underlined that this is the 5<sup>th</sup> and final meeting of the Working Group. He congratulated all participants for their hard work, especially considering the difficult working conditions due to time constraints and the ongoing Covid19 pandemic, in identifying the elements of a legal framework on AI based on the Council of Europe standards on human rights, democracy, and the rule of law. He further stressed that this document is a key deliverable for the CAHAI and will undoubtedly play an important role in shaping the drafting and negotiation of future instruments, including a potential Council of Europe Convention.
2. Mr Strojcin continued by adding that this document has put the verbal commitments of the CAHAI made over the course of the last two years onto paper. However, he reminded the Group that it is not mandated to draft a legal instrument, but rather to lay out the basic elements of the framework which will be extremely valuable for the next group(s) of experts who will, if the Committee of Ministers decides so, start drafting and negotiating the legal framework in 2022. He notably recalled, in light of the current negotiations of the COP26 meeting in Glasgow, earlier discussions about the need for sustainable AI and urged the Group to consider this aspect when finalising the “elements” document.
3. The CAHAI-LFG also took note of the opening remarks by Ms Claudia LUCIANI, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe who underlined that it is of utmost importance that during these two days, the group focuses on finalising its work in time for the upcoming CAHAI plenary meeting on 30 November to 2 December. She further welcomed the fact that elements on democracy were reinforced in the document under discussion.
4. Ms Luciani wished to emphasise the importance of undertaking this work in a good working atmosphere, giving due respect to everyone’s input and views and thus getting the best out of each and every delegate.
5. The Group finally took note of the opening remarks by Mr Jan KLEIJSSSEN, Director, Information Society - Action against Crime, who also thanked the participants for the enormous amount of work achieved, producing outstanding results under difficult circumstances. He informed the Group that discussions in the Committee of Ministers are ongoing regarding the format of the CAHAI for the coming years.
6. Mr Kleijssen also highlighted the impact of digital transformation on the environment and the need to include an element on sustainability in the current document. Mr Kleijssen brought to the attention of the Group the World Forum on Democracy taking place on 8 – 10 November on the topic of ‘Can democracy save the environment?’.

## 2. Adoption of the agenda

7. The CAHAI-LFG adopted the agenda.

### **3. Introduction by the Co-Chairs and the Secretariat**

8. The Co-Chairs of the CAHAI-LFG, Ms Peggy Valcke (Belgium) and Mr Riccardo Villa (Italy) warmly welcomed all participants to this final meeting and thanked them for all their contributions so far to the “elements” document. They also underlined the importance of finalising this last deliverable during the meeting.

### **4. Information concerning the outcome of the sixth meeting of the CAHAI-PDG (11-12 October 2021)**

9. The Secretariat informed the Group that at its last meeting, the CAHAI-PDG approved two chapters to be included in the “elements” document on namely “Human rights, democracy, and rule of law impact assessment” and “Complementary elements relating to artificial intelligence in the public sector” (Chapters XII and XIII).
10. Following the meeting, the delegation of the Russian Federation informed the Secretariat that it could not support the approval of Chapter XII and the inclusion of Chapter XIII in the document.
11. The Secretariat underlined that during this meeting, discussions would be limited to Chapters I to XI and invited delegations to reserve possible comments on the two chapters prepared by the CAHAI-PDG for the upcoming CAHAI Plenary meeting (30 November – 2 December 2021).

### **5. Second reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law**

#### Chapter II

12. The Group held an exchange on whether or not “dual use” should be included under the scope of a Council of Europe legal instrument on AI, human rights, democracy and the rule of law. Some delegations stated that due to its complexity and the inherent difficulties in drawing a line between military use and civilian use over the lifecycle of an AI system, the question of including “dual use” under the scope of a Council of Europe instrument should be left for the Committee of Ministers to decide on.
13. The Russian Federation reserved its position on paragraph 6 concerning “dual use”.
14. The Group agreed to delete the word ‘significant’ throughout the text when referring to risk in order not to quantify a level of risk, as all risks could, in principle, cause harm.
15. The Russian Federation reserved its position on paragraph 10 mentioning Chapter XIII.

#### Chapter V

16. The element regarding risk classification was further developed to specify that it is based on an initial review to determine if a full impact assessment is required. The examples of categories of risks were also discussed and amended.

17. It was clarified that while the impact assessment should form a constitutive part of the possible legal instrument, the specific model ('HUDERIA') presented in the document would not necessarily be part of a future legally binding instrument.
18. The question of whether or not examples of potential "red lines" should be included was examined. Finally, while recognising the importance of specific issues such as the targeting of children, it was agreed to include more general illustrations in paragraph 21 upon which the Group could agree, namely certain uses of biometrics and social scoring.
19. The Russian Federation reserved its position on paragraph 21 concerning "red lines".
20. The Group agreed that wording should be added to specify that review procedures should be put in place for the reversal of a ban or moratorium should the risks be reduced or mitigation procedures put in place, so that the AI system no longer poses an unacceptable risk.

## Chapter VI

21. The text was amended to refer to "compliance" rather than "conformity" with existing standards. It was further agreed to add a reference to the amending Protocol to Convention 108. Certain delegations underlined the need to keep the text open enough to include states which are not party to a particular convention.
22. Concerning the concept of "unlawful harm", the Group agreed that this concept is difficult to define and the paragraph on this topic was rephrased to recommend that this complex issue be clarified for the purpose of a future legal instrument.
23. One delegation questioned the use of the term "gender equality" and suggested to instead refer to "equality between men and women". The Secretariat and the Chair of the CAHAI, Mr Gregor Stojin, underlined that gender equality is a term used extensively throughout the Council of Europe, including in the Terms of Reference of the CAHAI, and recalled that a gender equality rapporteur is appointed to the CAHAI.
24. The inclusion of a reference to vulnerable groups was widely supported by the Group.
25. The Group agreed to include a reference to sustainability of AI systems throughout their lifecycle as an issue to be borne in mind in future work. There was general agreement that environmental harm is an emerging area and that this is an important issue going forward.
26. The Russian Federation reserved its position on paragraph 30 concerning sustainability and AI.

## Chapter VI

27. Language was added to specify that concerns arise regarding AI and the public sector when AI systems are used to take or inform decisions that impact the rights and obligations of individuals and legal persons.
28. The reference to issues relating to private actors acting on behalf of public authorities was amended to clarify that in such context, Parties should ensure compliance with the standards concerning AI systems as regards human rights, democracy and the rule of law.

## Chapter VIII

29. It was deemed important to mention that the role of private entities which shape the public sphere should be considered in respect to concerns that the growing concentration of economic power and of data could undermine democratic processes. This was done in paragraph 37.

## Chapter XI

30. The Group debated whether to qualify the independence of national supervisory bodies as 'functional'. It was agreed to remove the qualification of independence as 'functional'.

31. The Russian delegation reserved its position on paragraph 43 due to the removal of the word "functional".

### **6. Approval of the draft document and next steps**

32. The CAHAI-LFG approved the text as modified during the meeting. Ms Valcke informed the Group that the document would now be submitted to the CAHAI for finalisation at the upcoming Plenary meeting of 30 November to 2 December.

33. Both Co-Chairs thanked everyone who contributed to the drafting of this document for their hard work.

### **7. Any other business**

34. No issues were raised under this item.

### **8. Closing remarks by Mr Patrick PENNINCKX, Head of Information Society Department, Council of Europe**

35. Mr Penninckx thanked all participants involved for their hard work which has been an enormous collaborative effort, a feat not always easy in an international context and in particular in light of the current public health restrictions. He underlined that the work of the working groups is now over, and that it is henceforth the responsibility of the CAHAI to finalise the document before transmitting it to the Committee of Ministers.

## APPENDIX I – Agenda

Tuesday, 2 November 2021		
9:30 am		<b>1. Opening of the meeting</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Gregor Strojin, Chair of CAHAI</li> <li>• Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society- Action against Crime, Council of Europe</li> <li>• Ms Claudia Luciani, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe</li> </ul>
9:50 am		<b>2. Adoption of the agenda</b>
9:55 am	<a href="#">CAHAI-LFG(2021)PV4</a>	<b>3. Introduction by the Co-Chairs and the Secretariat</b>
10:15 am	<a href="#">CAHAI-PDG(2021)PV4</a>	<b>4. Information concerning the outcome of the sixth meeting of the CAHAI-PDG (11-12 October 2021)</b>
10:30 am	CAHAI-LFG(2021)10rev <u>Restricted</u> CAHAI-LFG(2021)11 <u>Restricted</u>	<b>5. Second reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law</b>
12:00 pm		<i>Lunch break</i>
2:30 pm		<b>[Continued: 5. Second reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, followed by a discussion]</b>
5:00 pm		<i>Close of the 1<sup>st</sup> day</i>

Wednesday, 3 November 2021		
9:30 am	CAHAI-LFG(2021)10rev. <u>Restricted</u> CAHAI-LFG(2021)11 <u>Restricted</u>	<b>[Continued: 5. Second reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, followed by a discussion]</b>
12:00 pm		<i>Lunch break</i>
2:30 pm		<b>[Continued: 5. Second reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, followed by a discussion]</b>

4:00 pm		<b>6. Approval of the draft document and next steps</b>
4:15 pm		<b>7. Any other business</b>
4:30 pm		<b>8. Closing remarks by Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department, Council of Europe</b>
5 pm		<i>End of the meeting</i>

## APPENDIX II – List of participants

### MEMBERS OF THE LEGAL FRAMEWORKS GROUP / MEMBRES DU GROUPE SUR LES CADRES JURIDIQUES

#### BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

---

**Ms Peggy VALCKE** – Co-Chair of the CAHAI-LFG / Co-Présidente du CAHAI-LFG

Researcher and Professor in ICT and Media at the Faculty of Law at the KU Leuven / chercheuse et professeur en ICT et médias à la faculté de droit à la KU Leuven

#### BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

---

**Mr Dag DZUMRUKCIC** - Minister counsellor, Department for International Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Ministre conseiller, Département des affaires juridiques internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères

#### ESTONIA / ESTONIE

---

**Ms Siiri AULIK** - Adviser, Public Law Division, Estonian Ministry of Justice / Conseillère, division du droit public, ministère estonien de la justice

#### FINLAND / FINLANDE

---

**Ms Mia SPOLANDER** - Legal Counsellor, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions (OIK-40), Legal Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Conseiller juridique, Unité des Cours et Conventions des Droits de l'Homme (OIK-40), service juridique, Ministère des affaires étrangères

#### FRANCE

---

**Mme Gaëlane PELEN** - Magistrate - Policy Officer to the Head of the SEM / Magistrate – Chargée de mission auprès de la Cheffe du SEM

#### GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

---

**Ms Lena HOCKE** - Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs (Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz - BMJV)

#### GREECE / GRECE

---

**Ms Stamatina LEKKA** - Executive, Department of Open Governance and Transparency / Executive, Département de la gouvernance ouverte et de la transparence

#### HUNGARY / HONGRIE

---

**Ms Abigel GYORGY** - Department of International Organisations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade / Département des organisations internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères et du commerce



## ITALY / ITALIE

---

**Mr Riccardo VILLA** – Co-Chair of the CAHAI-LFG / Co-Président du CAHAI-LFG

Counsellor, Deputy Head of Cyber Department, Directorate General Political and Security Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Co-operation, Rome / Conseiller, Chef adjoint du département Cyber, Direction générale des affaires politiques et de sécurité, Ministère des affaires étrangères et de la coopération internationale, Rome

## LUXEMBOURG

---

**Ms Michèle FINCK** - Senior Research Fellow, Max Planck Institute for Innovation and Competition / Chercheuse principale, Institut Max Planck pour l'innovation et la concurrence

## REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

---

**Ms Corina CĂLUGĂRU** - Ambassador, Permanent Representative of the Republic of Moldova to the Council of Europe

## NORWAY / NORVEGE

---

**Ms Heather BROOMFIELD** - Senior Advisor, Norwegian Digitalisation Agency / Conseiller principal, Agence norvégienne de numérisation

## POLAND / POLOGNE

---

**Ms Iwona OSTRZYŻEK** - Department for International Cooperation and Human Rights, Ministry of Justice / Département pour la coopération internationale et les droits de l'homme, Ministère de la justice

## PORTUGAL

---

**Mr Pedro ALMEIDA** - Legal Adviser, European Affairs Coordination Unit, Directorate-General for Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice / *Conseiller juridique, Unité de coordination des affaires européennes, Direction générale de la politique de la justice, Ministère de la justice portugais*

## RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE

---

**Mr Konstantin KOSORUKOV** - Head of the Division of General Legal Issues, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Chef de la Division des questions juridiques générales, Département juridique, Ministère des affaires étrangères

**Mr Alan KHUBAEV** - Executive Officer, Department for Information Security, Ministry of Digital Development, Communication and Mass Media / *Directeur exécutif, Département de la sécurité de l'information, Ministère du développement numérique, de la communication et des médias*

**Mr Kirill GEVORGYAN** - Expert, Analytical Center for the Government of the Russian Federation / Expert, Centre d'analyse pour le gouvernement de la Fédération de Russie

## SLOVAKIA / SLOVAQUIE

---

**Ms Barbora ŠIKUTOVA** - Legal expert, International Law Section, Department of European Affairs and Foreign Relations, Ministry of Justice / Juriste expert, Section du droit international, Service des affaires européennes et des relations extérieures, Ministère de la justice

## SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

---

**Mr Gregor STROJIN** – Chair of the CAHAI / Président du CAHAI

Advisor to the President, Supreme Court of the Republic of Slovenia / Conseiller du Président, Cour suprême de la République de Slovénie

## SPAIN / ESPAGNE

---

**Mr Mario HERNÁNDEZ RAMOS** - Associate Professor of Constitutional Law, University of Salamanca; Senior Legal Advisor Ministry of Justice, Government of Spain / Professeur agrégé de droit constitutionnel, Université de Salamanque; Conseiller juridique principal Ministère de la Justice, Gouvernement espagnol

## SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

---

**Mr Jürg LINDENMANN** - Advisor, Federal Department of Foreign Affairs, Directorate of International Law / Conseiller, Département fédéral des affaires étrangères, Direction du droit international public

**Mr Thomas SCHNEIDER** - Ambassador, Federal Department of the Environment, Transport, Energy and Communications, Deputy Director, Federal Office of Communications, Director of International Relations / Ambassadeur, Département fédéral de l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication, Vice-Directeur, Office fédéral de la communication, Directeur Relations internationales

## TURKEY / TURQUIE

---

**Ms Leyla KESER BERBER, Prof. Dr.** - Associate Professor & Dr., Information Technology Law Institute, Istanbul Bilgi University Law Faculty / Professeur associé et Dr., Institut de droit des technologies de l'information, Faculté de droit de l'Université Bilgi d'Istanbul

**Ms Selen Av. Işıl Selen DENEMEÇ** - Digital Transformation Office of the Presidency of the Republic of Turkey / Bureau de la transformation numérique de la présidence de la République de Turquie

**Mr Eren SÖZÜER** - Research Associate, Istanbul University Faculty of Law / *Associé de recherche, Faculté de droit de l'Université d'Istanbul*

**Mr İsmet GÜVENÇ KAYAŞ** - Rapporteur Judge, DG for Foreign Relations and EU Affairs, Ministry of Justice / *Rapporteur Juge, DG des relations extérieures et des affaires européennes, Ministère de la justice*

**Mr Nevzat OZMEN**, Rapporteur Judge, Ministry of Justice / Rapporteur juge, Ministère de la justice

## **UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI**

---

**Ms Rose WOOLHOUSE** - Head of Europe Desk at the UK Government Office for Artificial Intelligence / Chef du bureau Europe de l'Office du gouvernement britannique pour l'intelligence artificielle

**Ms Melissa COUTINHO** – Senior Lawyer, Products, Business & Better Regulation, Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy (BEIS) Legal Advisers, Government Legal Department / Juriste principal, Produits, entreprises et meilleure réglementation, Ministère des affaires, de l'énergie et de la stratégie industrielle (BEIS) Conseillers juridiques, Département juridique du gouvernement

**Ms Louiza ANTONIADES** - Lawyer, Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy / *Juriste, ministère des affaires, de l'énergie et de la stratégie industrielle*

## **Other Member States of the Council of Europe / Autres Etats membres du Conseil de l'Europe**

### **LATVIA / LETTONIE**

---

**Mr Jānis KĀRKLIŅŠ** - Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary, Permanent Representative of Latvia to the Council of Europe / Ambassadeur extraordinaire et plénipotentiaire, Représentant permanent de la Lettonie auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

## **PARTICIPANTS**

### **Council of Europe bodies and institutions / Organes et institutions du Conseil de l'Europe**

#### **CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES / CONGRES DES POUVOIRS LOCAUX ET REGIONAUX**

**Mr Roman CHLAPAK**, Secretary, Governance Committee / Secrétaire, Comité de gouvernance

#### **CONFERENCE OF INGOS / CONFÉRENCE DES OING**

---

**Ms Francesca FANUCCI** - Senior legal advisor at European Center for Not-for-Profit Law, Netherlands / Conseiller juridique principal au Centre européen pour le droit des associations à but non lucrative, Pays-Bas

**Mr Didier SCHRETTER** - Representative of the Conference of INGOS, Chair of the European Association for Audiovisual Media Education (EAAME) / Représentant de la Conférence des OING, Président de l'Association Européenne pour l'Éducation aux Médias Audiovisuels (AEEMA)

#### **CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE – DATA PROTECTION / COMITE CONSULTATIF- PROTECTION DES DONNEES (T-PD)**

---

**Mr Alessandro MANTELERO** - Associate Professor of Private Law and Law & Technology at the Polytechnic University of Turin / Professeur associé de droit privé et de droit et technologie à l'Université polytechnique de Turin

## **EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE / COMITE EUROPEEN SUR LA DEMOCRATIE ET LA GOUVERNANCE (CDDG)**

---

**Mr Peter ANDRE** - Senior Expert for legal affairs, Federal Ministry of Interior, Austria, CDDG Rapporteur on Democracy and Technology / Expert principal pour les affaires juridiques, Ministère fédéral de l'intérieur d'Autriche, Rapporteur du CDDG sur la démocratie et la technologie

**Ms Judith ORLAND** - Program Manager Democracy and AI, Democratic Governance Division, CDDG Secretariat / Chef de programme Démocratie et IA, Division de la gouvernance démocratique, Secrétariat du CDDG

## **GENDER EQUALITY COMMISSION / COMMISSION POUR L'EGALITE DE GENRE**

---

**Ms Käthlin SANDER** - Head of Gender Equality Policy, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Social Affairs, Estonia / Responsable de la politique d'égalité entre les sexes, département des politiques d'égalité, ministère des affaires sociales, Estonie

**Mme Cécile GREBOVAL** - Programme Manager Gender Mainstreaming / Gender Equality Advisor / Responsable de programme, Gender Mainstreaming / Conseillère en matière d'égalité entre les femmes et les hommes

## **European Union and Observers from International Organisations / Union européenne et Observateurs des Organisations Internationales**

### **EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPEENNE**

---

**Ms Yordanka IVANOVA**, - Legal and Policy Officer, Directorate-General for Communications Networks, Content and Technology (DG CNECT), European Commission / Conseiller juridique et politique, Direction générale des réseaux de communication, du contenu et des technologies (DG CNECT)

### **EUROPEAN DATA PROTECTION SUPERVISOR (EDPS) / CONTROLEUR EUROPEEN DE LA PROTECTION DES DONNEES (CEPD)**

---

**Mr Plamen ANGELOV** - Legal Officer, Policy & Consultation Unit / Juriste, unité politique et consultation

### **Observer States to the CAHAI / Etats observateurs au CAHAI**

### **CANADA**

---

**Mr Michael ZANETTE** - Senior Analyst, Global Affairs Canada, Government of Canada / Analyste principal, Affaires Mondiales Canada, Gouvernement du Canada

**Ms Tebello MOROJELE** - Legal Officer, Global Affairs Canada, Government of Canada / Juriste, Affaires Mondiales Canada, Gouvernement du Canada

**Ms Lesia STANGRET** - Legal Counsel, Department of Justice / Conseiller juridique, Service de la justice

## **ISRAEL / ISRAËL**

---

**Mr Cedric (Yehuda) SABBAH** - Director, International Cybersecurity & IT Law, Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law), Ministry of Justice / Directeur, Cybersécurité internationale et droit des technologies de l'information, Bureau du procureur général adjoint (droit international), Ministère de la Justice

**Mr Tamir GUR**, Ministry of Justice / Ministère de la justice

### **OBSERVERS ADMITTED TO THE CAHAI / OBSERVATEURS ADMIS AU CAHAI**

**Council of Europe partner Internet companies / Entreprises internet partenaires du Conseil de l'Europe**

## **TELEFÓNICA**

---

**Ms Paloma VILLA MATEOS** - Manager, Public Policy and Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Mr Gonzalo LOPEZ BARAJAS** - Manager, Public Policy & Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Mr Pablo BARRIONUEVO** - Manager, Public Policy & Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Ms Isabel Maria ALVARO ALONSO** – Trainee / Stagiaire

**Civil Society Organisations, other private sector and academic actors relevant to the work of the CAHAI / Organisations de la Société civile, autres acteurs du secteur privé et académique, concernés par les travaux du CAHAI**

## **ALGORITHMWATCH**

---

**Ms Nikolett ASZODI** - Junior Policy & Advocacy Manager / Responsable junior de la politique et du plaidoyer

## **ALLAI**

---

**Mr Christofer TALVITIE** -

## **GLOBAL PARTNERS DIGITAL**

**Mr Ian BARBER** - Senior Legal Officer / Conseiller juridique principal

## **ISTANBUL BAR ASSOCIATION**

**Ms Selin ÇETIN** - Coordinator of the AI Working Group, IT Law Commission / Coordinateur du groupe de travail sur l'IA, Commission du droit des technologies de l'information

**Ms Betül ÇOLAK** - Lawyer, Istanbul Bar Association AI Working Group / Avocat, Groupe de travail IA du Barreau d'Istanbul

**Mr Baran KIZILIRMAK** -

**Ms Zeynep CEMRE DEMIRTAS** - Attorney at Law, Istanbul Bar Association / Avocat au barreau d'Istanbul

## INDEPENDENT EXPERTS / EXPERTS INDEPENDANTS

**Ms Nathalie SMUHA** - Researcher - Department of International & European Law, KU Leuven, Member of the OECD Network of Experts on AI (ONE AI), Former Coordinator of the EC High-Level Expert Group on AI, Belgium / Chercheur - Département de droit international et européen, KU Leuven, membre du réseau d'experts de l'OCDE sur l'IA (ONE AI), ancien coordinateur du groupe d'experts de haut niveau de la CE sur l'IA, Belgique

**Lord Tim CLEMENT-JONES CBE** - House of Lords Liberal Democrat Spokesperson (Digital), United Kingdom / Porte-parole libéral-démocrate de la Chambre des Lords (Digital), Royaume-Uni

**Mr Peter PARYCEK, Prof, Mag.** - Head - Department for E-Governance and Administration, Donau-Universität Krems / Chef du département de la gouvernance électronique et de l'administration, Donau-Universität Krems

## SECRETARIAT GENERAL OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE

### DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME ET DE L'ÉTAT DE DROIT (DG I)

**Mr Jan KLEIJSEN** - Director, Information Society – Action against Crime, Council of Europe / Directeur, Société de l'Information – Lutte contre la Criminalité, Conseil de l'Europe

**Mr Patrick PENNINGKX** - Head of Department, Information Society Department / Chef du Service, Service de la société de l'information

### DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF DEMOCRACY / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DE LA DÉMOCRATIE (DG II)

**Ms Claudia LUCIANI** – Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directrice, Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance

## SECRETARIAT OF THE CAHA / Secrétariat du CAHA

**Mr Kristian BARTHOLIN**  
Secretary of CAHA / Secrétaire du CAHA

**Ms Louise RIONDEL**  
Co-Secretary of CAHA / Co-Secrétaire du CAHA

**Mr Aleksandr TIULKANOV** – Special advisor on digital developments / Conseiller spécial sur les développements numériques

**Ms Laetitia DIMANCHE** - Project Assistant, Information Society Department / Assistante de projet, Service de la société de l'information

**Mr Rafael ISMAYILOV** – Administrative assistant / Assistant administratif

**Ms Lucy ANCELIN** - Assistant to the CAHA / Assistante du CAHA

**Ms Claire ROBINS** - Secretariat, Counter-terrorism division / Secrétariat, Division Anti-terrorisme

**Ms Laura VUILLEQUEZ** – Study visitor / Visiteur d'étude

**Ms Geisa-Conceicao CIPRIANI** – Trainee / Stagiaire

\*\*\*

## **INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES**

**Mme Isabelle MARCHINI**

**Ms Sara WEBSTER**

