

Strasbourg, 21 September 2021

CAHAI-LFG(2021)PV4

# **AD HOC COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (CAHAI)**

## **Legal Frameworks Group (CAHAI-LFG)**

### **4<sup>th</sup> meeting**

**Strasbourg, 20-21 September 2021**

Online meeting – KUDO Platform

---

### **Meeting Report**

---

Prepared by the CAHAI Secretariat

[www.coe.int/cahai](http://www.coe.int/cahai)

## 1. Opening of the meeting

1. The CAHAI-LFG took note of the opening remarks by the Chair of the CAHAI, Mr Gregor STROJIN (Slovenia) who underlined that with only two CAHAI-LFG meetings left, including this one, it is time to focus on the final deliverable for the CAHAI. The product is a draft paper on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, prepared by the Secretariat and based on the outcomes of the seven sub-working groups and the comments received on the "model provisions", which have in the previous stages of the work been used to illustrate how the elements identified by the CAHAI-LFG could interact in a legal instrument.
2. He recalled that in accordance with the CAHAI's Terms of reference the paper will, when finalised by the CAHAI at its final Plenary meeting on 30 November - 2 December, be submitted to the Committee of Ministers (CM) for consideration. Together with the Feasibility Study submitted last year, this paper is what the CAHAI has been tasked by the Committee of Ministers to deliver.
3. Mr Strojcin reminded the Group that it is not drafting or negotiating any legal instrument. Therefore, the paper simply cannot be more than a "grocery list", presenting which elements to include in a possible legal framework on AI to the Committee of Ministers. He underlined that this checklist will be extremely valuable for the next group(s) of experts who will, if the Committee of Ministers decides so, start drafting and negotiating the legal framework in 2022.
4. The CAHAI-LFG also took note of the opening remarks by Mr Jan KLEIJSSSEN, Director, Information Society - Action against Crime, who invited the Group to remember that the CAHAI is not tasked with drafting the final legal framework, but instead should adopt the document presented, and submit it to the CM by the end of the year. Indeed, the drafting will be the responsibility of a new committee to take over after CAHAI in 2022 - 2023/2024.
5. Mr Kleijssen underlined the importance of the decision of the 131st Session of the Committee of Ministers (Hamburg, 21 May 2021) where it was decided to give priority to the work on an appropriate legal framework for the development, design and application of artificial intelligence based on the Council of Europe's standards on human rights, democracy and the rule of law, and to focus particularly on a possible legal framework, possibly in the form a legally binding instrument of a transversal character.
6. Mr Kleijssen also underlined that it is crucial that the legal framework adds value to the overall global efforts to regulate AI, a result which will primarily be achieved by focusing on the areas of expertise of the CoE, namely human rights, democracy and the rule of law, and recalled the need for the Group not to get bogged down in premature negotiations of details.
7. Furthermore, he highlighted that particular attention should undoubtedly be afforded to AI applications which have a potential for interfering with the (human) rights of individuals or legal persons, with democratic processes, or with the rule of law, while stressing the need not to over-regulate.
8. Finally, he concluded by informing the Group that Ms Clementina BARBARO, Co-Secretary of the CAHAI had been promoted, and has therefore left the CAHAI Secretariat, and thanked

her for her hard work, commitment and contribution to fulfilling the task of the Committee. He introduced and welcomed Ms Louise RIONDEL, who replaced Ms Barbaro in this position.

## **2. Adoption of the agenda**

9. The CAHAI-LFG adopted the agenda.

## **3. Introduction by the Co-Chairs and the Secretariat**

10. The Secretariat informed the Group that the document to be discussed during the meeting was prepared by the Secretariat with input from the Co-Chairs, Ms Peggy VALCKE (Belgium) and Mr Riccardo VILLA (Italy), and the scientific expert. During its 5<sup>th</sup> meeting in July, the CAHAI Plenary was invited to provide feedback on the work of the CAHAI-LFG and the comments by the Committee had been duly taken into account.

11. This version of the document is not yet complete as the part relating to human rights, democracy and rule of law impact assessment (HUDERIA) will be provided by the Secretariat based on the outcomes of the work of the CAHAI-PDG, following its next meeting on 11-12 October.

## **4. Information concerning the outcome of the fifth plenary meeting of the CAHAI (5 – 7 July 2021)**

12. See above

## **5. First reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law**

### Chapter I.

13. There was general support for the document as being close to the mandate of the CAHAI and a good starting point for negotiations on a future legal instrument, leaving room for genuine dialogue.

14. The need to further develop the section on democracy, with specific attention to be afforded to safeguards, was underlined.

### Chapter II.

15. The Group was in agreement that there should be a specific reference to the risk-based approach. There should be minimum requirements for all AI applications, and more attention should be given to the prerequisites for splitting them into different categories based on their risk level (low/medium/high).

16. It was deemed important not to lower the level of protection of existing CoE instruments and also take into consideration the case law of the ECHR.

### Chapter III.

17. While discussing this chapter, the Group held an in-depth discussion on impact assessment and methodology. It was recommended that the document should clarify the different uses of the impact assessment, including some general minimum criteria to take into account when assessing risk and differentiating between levels of risk.

18. It was agreed that only AI applications which pose a risk to human rights, democracy and rule of law should be covered by a possible legal framework of the Council of Europe.
19. Regarding definitions, clarifications were developed notably on the difference between harm and unlawful harm. Moreover, it was decided to add a sentence about possible exceptions to the scope.

#### Chapter IV.

20. It was agreed that the Secretariat would reformulate the reference to new rights to emphasise that this applies to the reinforcement of existing rights and when there are gaps in the legal framework.
21. The Group welcomed the inclusion of the concept of human dignity to this chapter.

#### Chapter V.

22. The members agreed that the text should not include concrete examples of AI systems susceptible to ban/moratorium. Instead, the different criteria which would make an AI application liable to such a ban/moratorium should be added. It was decided that further reflexion is necessary on this point.
23. Some members also argued that bans or moratoria should only apply to specific AI applications and not to research and development in the field of AI. It was agreed that alternative wording should be found in order to make a distinction by using stronger wording such as 'recommending' bans/moratoria for AI applications and softer wording such as 'considering' bans/moratoria for research, design and development.

#### Chapter VI.

24. The Group agreed that when referring to gender equality and children, other vulnerable groups should also be added to this list. It was also put forward that there should be more balance when referring to the rights of vulnerable groups and that this aspect could be referred to once in the general remarks at the beginning of the document in order to avoid repetition in every chapter.
25. Several members maintained that there should be a set of minimum standards applying to all AI systems and that the document should not just be limited to safeguards for high-risk applications, on the basis that there are no risk-free AI applications, only low-risk ones.
26. The Group agreed that as a general principle, all AI applications should respect human rights, democracy and the rule of law. It was also highlighted that in some cases AI applications which are not considered high-risk may still have an impact on these rights.
27. Consequently, it was agreed that a future legal instrument should include minimum safeguards concerning human rights, democracy, and the rule of law which apply to all AI applications with specific provisions addressing high-risk applications.

#### Chapter VII.

28. The Group reiterated that public consultation, debate and engagement should be promoted, both to increase awareness and participation.

#### Chapter VIII.

29. The Secretariat underlined that there is not a well-established set of principles regarding democracy, so a general language is being used while trying to be sufficiently clear.
30. The members agreed that together with elections and electoral processes, the wording should be broadened to 'democratic process and participation', to focus more generally on the ways that AI endangers these processes. The impact of AI on the shaping of public opinion was also deemed crucial, and that a point of concern is the growing power in the hands of a few powerful internet companies and that steps should be taken to combat this phenomenon.
31. The Group agreed to introduce a reference to the right to freedom of assembly and association.

#### Chapter IX.

32. Some members questioned if the term 'rights and obligations' is too narrow and suggested that legal rights and comparable/significant interests could be used instead.

#### Chapter X.

33. Certain members urged for a clear legal framework to protect consumers and suggested the introduction of a burden of proof (and the reversal of the burden of proof) regarding civil liability. However, other members disagreed with such an approach.
34. It was decided that it is too premature to decide on this complicated issue and open wording should be maintained, leaving the option for further examination at a later stage if deemed necessary.

#### Chapter XI.

35. The Group decided to remove the reference to 'conformity assessments' as they fall outside the remit of the CoE. However, it was also underlined that member States should nevertheless comply with safety regulations.
36. Regarding national supervisory authorities, it was noted that suitable authorities may already exist and agreed to change the term 'establishment' of national supervisory authorities to 'designation'. Moreover, the Group agreed that the need for independence regarding these authorities should be further elaborated as well as the need for them to be equipped with sufficient resources and competencies.
37. Finally, as regards the Committee of the Parties, it was decided to change the word 'oversee' to 'support', as the type and competence of this committee has not yet been established.

### **6. Next steps**

38. The Co-Chairs invited members to send written comments on the text to the Secretariat by 8 October, at the latest. The CAHAI-PDG will be meeting on 11 and 12 October and the results

of this meeting will be taken into account in a revised version of the document which will be on the table for discussion at the final meeting of the CAHAI-LFG on 2 and 3 November.

39. Following this last CAHAI-LFG meeting, a new revised version will then be prepared and discussed at the next CAHAI plenary meeting on 30 November – 2 December.

## **7. Any other business**

40. Delegations raised the question of the future of the CAHAI. Mr Kleijssen responded that the Rapporteur Group on Legal Co-operation (GR-J) is to discuss this topic, and that a proposal is on the table regarding the scope of the future Committee taking into account the decision of the 131<sup>st</sup> Session of the Committee of Ministers (Hamburg, 21 May 2021).

## APPENDIX I – AGENDA

Monday, 20 September 2021		
9.30 am		<b>1. Opening of the meeting.</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mr Gregor Strojín, Chair of CAHAI</li> <li>Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society- Action against Crime, Council of Europe</li> </ul>
9.50 am		<b>2. Adoption of the agenda</b>
9.55 am	<a href="#">CAHAI-LFG(2021)PV3</a>	<b>3. Introduction by the Co-chairs and the Secretariat</b>
10.15 am	<a href="#">CAHAI(2021)10</a>	<b>4. Information concerning the outcome of the fifth plenary meeting of the CAHAI (5 – 7 July 2021)</b>
10.35 am	CAHAI-LFG(2021)10 <i>Restricted</i>	<b>5. First reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law</b>
12.00 pm		<i>Lunch break</i>
2.30 pm		[Continued: 5. First reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, followed by a discussion]
5.00 pm		<i>Close of the 1<sup>st</sup> day</i>
Tuesday, 21 September 2021		
9.30 am	CAHAI-LFG(2021)10 <i>Restricted</i>	[Continued: 5. First reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, followed by a discussion]
12.00 pm		<i>Lunch break</i>
2.30 pm		[Continued: 5. First reading of the draft document prepared by the Secretariat on the possible elements of a legally binding instrument on artificial intelligence, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, followed by a discussion]
4.00 pm		<b>6. Next steps</b>
4.15 pm		<b>7. Any other business</b>
4.30 pm		<b>8. Closing remarks by Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department, Council of Europe</b>
5 pm		<i>End of the meeting</i>

## APPENDIX II – LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

### MEMBERS OF THE LEGAL FRAMEWORKS GROUP / MEMBRES DU GROUPE SUR LES CADRES JURIDIQUES

#### BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

---

**Ms Peggy VALCKE** – Co-Chair of the CAHAI-LFG / Co-Présidente du CAHAI-LFG

Researcher and Professor in ICT and Media at the Faculty of Law at the KU Leuven / chercheuse et professeur en ICT et médias à la faculté de droit à la KU Leuven

#### CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

---

**Ms Monika HANYCH** - Senior Ministerial Counsellor, Office of the Government Agent before the European Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice of the Czech Republic / Conseiller ministériel principal, Bureau de l'agent du gouvernement devant la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme, Ministère de la justice de la République tchèque

#### ESTONIA / ESTONIE

---

**Ms Siiri AULIK** - Adviser, Public Law Division, Estonian Ministry of Justice / Conseillère, division du droit public, ministère estonien de la justice

#### FINLAND / FINLANDE

---

**Ms Mia SPOLANDER** - Legal Counsellor, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions (OIK-40), Legal Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Conseiller juridique, Unité des Cours et Conventions des Droits de l'Homme (OIK-40), service juridique, Ministère des affaires étrangères

#### FRANCE

---

**Mme Gaëlane PELEN** - Magistrate - Policy Officer to the Head of the SEM / Magistrate – Chargée de mission auprès de la Cheffe du SEM

#### GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

---

**Ms Lena HOCKE** - Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs (Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz - BMJV)

#### GREECE / GRECE

---

**Ms Stamatina LEKKA** - Executive, Department of Open Governance and Transparency / Exécutive, Département de la gouvernance ouverte et de la transparence



## ITALY / ITALIE

---

**Mr Riccardo VILLA** – Co-Chair of the CAHAI-LFG / Co-Président du CAHAI-LFG

Counsellor, Deputy Head of Cyber Department, Directorate General Political and Security Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Co-operation, Rome / Conseiller, Chef adjoint du département Cyber, Direction générale des affaires politiques et de sécurité, Ministère des affaires étrangères et de la coopération internationale, Rome

## LUXEMBOURG

---

**Ms Michèle FINCK** - Senior Research Fellow, Max Planck Institute for Innovation and Competition / Chercheuse principale, Institut Max Planck pour l'innovation et la concurrence

## NORWAY / NORVEGE

---

**Ms Heather BROOMFIELD** - Senior Advisor, Norwegian Digitalisation Agency / Conseiller principal, Agence norvégienne de numérisation

## PORTUGAL

---

**Mr Pedro ALMEIDA** - Legal Adviser, European Affairs Coordination Unit, Directorate-General for Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice / Conseiller juridique, Unité de coordination des affaires européennes, Direction générale de la politique de la justice, Ministère de la justice portugais

## RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE

---

**Mr Konstantin KOSORUKOV** - Head of the Division of General Legal Issues, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Chef de la Division des questions juridiques générales, Département juridique, Ministère des affaires étrangères

## SLOVAKIA / SLOVAQUIE

---

**Ms Barbora ŠIKUTOVA** - Legal expert, International Law Section, Department of European Affairs and Foreign Relations, Ministry of Justice / Juriste expert, Section du droit international, Service des affaires européennes et des relations extérieures, Ministère de la justice

## SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

---

**Mr Gregor STROJIN** – Chair of the CAHAI / Président du CAHAI

Advisor to the President, Supreme Court of the Republic of Slovenia / Conseiller du Président, Cour suprême de la République de Slovénie

## SPAIN / ESPAGNE

---

**Mr Mario HERNÁNDEZ RAMOS** - Associate Professor of Constitutional Law, University of Salamanca; Senior Legal Advisor Ministry of Justice, Government of Spain / Professeur agrégé de droit constitutionnel, Université de Salamanque; Conseiller juridique principal Ministère de la Justice, Gouvernement espagnol

## SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

---

**Mr Jürg LINDENMANN** - Advisor, Federal Department of Foreign Affairs, Directorate of International Law / Conseiller, Département fédéral des affaires étrangères, Direction du droit international public

**Mr Thomas SCHNEIDER** - Ambassador, Federal Department of the Environment, Transport, Energy and Communications, Deputy Director, Federal Office of Communications, Director of International Relations / Ambassadeur, Département fédéral de l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication, Vice-Directeur, Office fédéral de la communication, Directeur Relations internationales

## TURKEY / TURQUIE

---

**Ms Leyla KESER BERBER, Prof. Dr.** - Associate Professor & Dr., Information Technology Law Institute, Istanbul Bilgi University Law Faculty / Professeur associé et Dr., Institut de droit des technologies de l'information, Faculté de droit de l'Université Bilgi d'Istanbul

**Ms Selen Av. Işıl Selen DENEMEÇ** - Digital Transformation Office of the Presidency of the Republic of Turkey / Bureau de la transformation numérique de la présidence de la République de Turquie

**Mr Eren SÖZÜER** - Research Associate, Istanbul University Faculty of Law / Associé de recherche, Faculté de droit de l'Université d'Istanbul

**Mr İsmet GÜVENÇ KAYAŞ** - Rapporteur Judge, DG for Foreign Relations and EU Affairs, Ministry of Justice / Rapporteur Juge, DG des relations extérieures et des affaires européennes, Ministère de la justice

## UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

---

**Ms Rose WOOLHOUSE** - Head of Europe Desk at the UK Government Office for Artificial Intelligence / Chef du bureau Europe de l'Office du gouvernement britannique pour l'intelligence artificielle

**Ms Melissa COUTINHO** – Senior Lawyer, Products, Business & Better Regulation, Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy (BEIS) Legal Advisers, Government Legal Department / Juriste principal, Produits, entreprises et meilleure réglementation, Ministère des affaires, de l'énergie et de la stratégie industrielle (BEIS) Conseillers juridiques, Département juridique du gouvernement

**Ms Louiza ANTONIADES** - Lawyer, Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy / Juriste, ministère des affaires, de l'énergie et de la stratégie industrielle

## PARTICIPANTS

**Council of Europe bodies and institutions / Organes et institutions du Conseil de l'Europe**

## CONFERENCE OF INGOS / CONFÉRENCE DES OING

---

**Ms Francesca FANUCCI** - Senior legal advisor at European Center for Not-for-Profit Law, Netherlands / Conseiller juridique principal au Centre européen pour le droit des associations à but non lucrative, Pays-Bas

**CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE – DATA PROTECTION / COMITE CONSULTATIF- PROTECTION DES DONNEES (T-PD)**

---

**Mr Alessandro MANTELERO** - Associate Professor of Private Law and Law & Technology at the Polytechnic University of Turin / Professeur associé de droit privé et de droit et technologie à l'Université polytechnique de Turin

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE / COMITE EUROPEEN SUR LA DEMOCRATIE ET LA GOUVERNANCE (CDDG)**

---

**Mr Peter ANDRE** - Senior Expert for legal affairs, Federal Ministry of Interior, Austria, CDDG Rapporteur on Democracy and Technology / Expert principal pour les affaires juridiques, Ministère fédéral de l'intérieur d'Autriche, Rapporteur du CDDG sur la démocratie et la technologie

**Ms Judith ORLAND** - Programme Manager Democracy and AI, Democratic Governance Division, CDDG Secretariat / Chef de programme Démocratie et IA, Division de la gouvernance démocratique, Secrétariat du CDDG

**GENDER EQUALITY COMMISSION / COMMISSION POUR L'EGALITE DE GENRE**

---

**Ms Käthlin SANDER** - Head of Gender Equality Policy, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Social Affairs, Estonia / Responsable de la politique d'égalité entre les sexes, département des politiques d'égalité, ministère des affaires sociales, Estonie

**Mme Cécile GREBOVAL** - Programme Manager Gender Mainstreaming / Gender Equality Advisor / Responsable de programme, Gender Mainstreaming / Conseillère en matière d'égalité entre les femmes et les hommes

**STEERING COMMITTEE FOR EDUCATION POLICY AND PRACTICE / COMITE DIRECTEUR POUR LES POLITIQUES ET PRATIQUES EDUCATIVES (CDPPE)**

---

**Mr Michael REMMERT** – Head of Education Policy Division / Chef de la Division Politiques éducatives

**Mr Ahmet Murat KILIC** - Education Policy Division / Division Politiques éducatives

**European Union and Observers from International Organisations / Union européenne et Observateurs des Organisations Internationales**

**DELEGATION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION TO THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / DÉLÉGATION DE L'UNION EUROPÉENNE AUPRES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

---

**Ms Maria Cristina DI MAURO** - Legal Affairs Trainee / Stagiaire en affaires juridiques

**Observer States to the CAHAI / Etats observateurs au CAHAI**

**CANADA**

---

**Mr Michael ZANETTE** - Senior Analyst, Global Affairs Canada, Government of Canada / Analyste principal, Affaires Mondiales Canada, Gouvernement du Canada

**Ms Tebello MOROJELE** - Legal Officer, Global Affairs Canada, Government of Canada / Juriste, Affaires Mondiales Canada, Gouvernement du Canada

## ISRAEL / ISRAËL

---

**Mr Cedric (Yehuda) SABBAH** - Director, International Cybersecurity & IT Law, Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law), Ministry of Justice / Directeur, Cybersécurité internationale et droit des technologies de l'information, Bureau du procureur général adjoint (droit international), Ministère de la Justice

### **Council of Europe partner Internet companies / Entreprises internet partenaires du Conseil de l'Europe**

## TELEFÓNICA

---

**Ms Paloma VILLA MATEOS** - Manager, Public Policy and Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Mr Gonzalo LOPEZ BARAJAS** - Manager, Public Policy & Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Mr Pablo BARRIONUEVO** - Manager, Public Policy & Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Civil Society Organisations, other private sector and academic actors relevant to the work of the CAHAI / Organisations de la Société civile, autres acteurs du secteur privé et académique, concernés par les travaux du CAHAI**

## AI TRANSPARENCY INSTITUTE

---

**Mrs Olivia ERDELYI**, Lecturer in AI Law, University of Canterbury (New Zealand) / Chargé de cours en droit de l'IA, Université de Canterbury (Nouvelle-Zélande)

## ALGORITHMWATCH

---

**Ms Angela MÜLLER**, Senior Policy & Advocacy Manager / Responsable principal de la politique et du soutien aux intérêts

## ALLAI

---

**Mr Christofer TALVITIE** -

## GLOBAL PARTNERS DIGITAL

---

**Mr Ian BARBER** - Senior Legal Officer / Conseiller juridique principal

## HOMO DIGITALIS

---

**Mr Eleftherios CHELIOUDAKIS** - Co-founder and Secretary of the Board of Directors / Co-fondateur et secrétaire du conseil d'administration

## ISTANBUL BAR ASSOCIATION

---

**Ms Selin ÇETIN** - Coordinator of the AI Working Group, IT Law Commission / Coordinateur du groupe de travail sur l'IA, Commission du droit des technologies de l'information

**Mr Barış ERMAN, Dr.** – Academic at Yeditepe University Law Faculty / Universitaire à la faculté de droit de l'université Yeditepe

**Ms Dila AY** – Trainee at AI Working Group / Stagiaire au groupe de travail sur l'IA

**Ms Betül ÇOLAK** - Lawyer, Istanbul Bar Association AI Working Group / Avocat, Groupe de travail IA du Barreau d'Istanbul

## LAW SOCIETY OF IRELAND

---

**Ms Labhaoise NI FHAOLAIN** - Researcher in AI Regulation and Governance and member of the Law Society's Technology Committee / Chercheur en réglementation et gouvernance de l'IA et membre du comité technologique de la Law Society

## MEDIALAWS

---

**Ms Flavia BAVETTA** – Teaching Fellow / Chargé d'enseignement, Università Commerciale Luigi Bocconi

## INDEPENDENT EXPERTS / EXPERTS INDEPENDANTS

**Ms Nathalie SMUHA** - Researcher - Department of International & European Law, KU Leuven, Member of the OECD Network of Experts on AI (ONE AI), Former Coordinator of the EC High-Level Expert Group on AI, Belgium / Chercheur - Département de droit international et européen, KU Leuven, membre du réseau d'experts de l'OCDE sur l'IA (ONE AI), ancien coordinateur du groupe d'experts de haut niveau de la CE sur l'IA, Belgique

**Lord Tim CLEMENT-JONES CBE** - House of Lords Liberal Democrat Spokesperson (Digital), United Kingdom / Porte-parole libéral-démocrate de la Chambre des Lords (Digital), Royaume-Uni

**Mr Peter PARYCEK, Prof, Mag.** - Head - Department for E-Governance and Administration, Donau-Universität Krems / Chef du département de la gouvernance électronique et de l'administration, Donau-Universität Krems

## SECRETARIAT GENERAL OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE

### DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME ET DE L'ÉTAT DE DROIT (DG I)

**Mr Jan KLEIJSEN** - Director, Information Society – Action against Crime, Council of Europe / Directeur, Société de l'Information – Lutte contre la Criminalité, Conseil de l'Europe

**Mr Patrick PENNINGKX** - Head of Department, Information Society Department / Chef du Service, Service de la société de l'information Apologised / Excusé

**DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF DEMOCRACY / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DE LA DÉMOCRATIE (DG II)**

**Ms Claudia LUCIANI** – Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directrice, Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance

**SECRETARIAT OF THE CAHAI / SecrÉTARIAT DU CAHAI**

**Mr Kristian BARTHOLIN**  
Secretary of CAHAI / Secrétaire du CAHAI

**Ms Louise RIONDEL**  
Co-Secretary of CAHAI / Co-Secrétaire du CAHAI

**Mr Aleksandr TIULKANOV** – Special advisor on digital developments / Conseiller spécial sur les développements numériques

**Mr Rafael ISMAYILOV** – Administrative assistant / Assistant administratif

**Ms Lucy ANCELIN** - Assistant to the CAHAI / Assistante du CAHAI

**Ms Claire ROBINS** - Secretariat, Counter-terrorism division / SecrÉTariat, Division Anti-terrorisme

**Ms Geisa-Conceicao CIPRIANI** – Trainee / Stagiaire

\*\*\*

**INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES**

**Ms Christine TRAPP**

**Ms Katia DI STEFANO**