



Strasbourg, 11 February 2021

CAHAI-LFG(2021)PV1

# **AD HOC COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (CAHAI)**

## **Legal Frameworks Group (CAHAI-LFG)**

**1<sup>st</sup> meeting**

**Strasbourg, 10-11 February 2021**

Online meeting – KUDO Platform

---

**List of Decisions and Abridged Report**

---

Prepared by the CAHAI Secretariat

The CAHAI-LFG, meeting under the Co-Chairmanship of Ms Peggy VALCKE (Belgium) and Mr Riccardo VILLA (Italy), on 10 and 11 February 2021 online, decided to:

### **1. Opening of the meeting**

- Take note of the opening remarks by the Chair of the CAHAI, Mr Gregor STROJIN (Slovenia) who reminded the Group that it is tasked with producing possible elements for a future legal framework for the development, design and application of AI, based on the Council of Europe standards on human rights, democracy and the rule of law.
- Take note of the opening remarks by Mr Jan KLEIJSSSEN, Director, Information Society - Action against Crime, who underlined that AI has become a strategic priority for the Council of Europe, as recalled recently by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in her Strategic Framework for the Council of Europe 2022 – 2026, and referred to the high interest surrounding CAHAI activities, as confirmed by the latest exchange of views with the CAHAI Chair on 2 February at the Rapporteur Group on Legal Cooperation (GR-J).
- Take note of the opening remarks by Ms Claudia LUCIANI, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, who stressed the importance of solid internal and external co-operation, including mutual participation in relevant activities of the Council of Europe and other international organisations where there are shared concerns and a real convergence on substance.

### **2. Adoption of the agenda**

- Adopt the agenda.

### **3. Election of the Co-Chairs of the Legal Framework Group**

- Take note of the expressions of interest by Ms Peggy VALCKE (Belgium), Ms Mia SPOLANDER (Finland) and Mr Riccardo VILLA (Italy) in becoming Co-Chairs of the Group.
- Thank all three candidates for having put themselves forward.
- Elect Ms Valcke and Mr Villa as Co-Chairs.

### **4. CAHAI- LFG activities in 2021**

- Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat concerning the tasks and output to be produced by the CAHAI-LFG: in particular, the elaboration of the main elements of a possible future international legally-binding instrument. This was followed by a strategic discussion among delegations on their implementation in the light of the CAHAI Bureau meeting of 15 January 2021, and taking into consideration the work carried out by the CAHAI Policy Development Group (CAHAI-PDG) and the work carried out by the CAHAI Consultation and Outreach Group (CAHAI-COG).

## **5. General presentation of the draft feasibility study**

- Take note of the presentation on the preparation of the study by the Co-Chairs of the CAHAI-PDG (Mr Wolfgang TEVES, Germany and Mr Zoltan TURBEK, Hungary) and the independent scientific expert (Ms Nathalie SMUHA). In the discussions which followed, the importance that all three CAHAI Working Groups work in a flexible and close manner synergy, in cooperation with the CAHAI Bureau and the CAHAI Chair, was underlined.

### **5.1 Chapters 1-3**

- Take note of the presentation of the key findings contained in Chapters 1 – 3 of the Feasibility Study by Ms Smuha and hold an exchange on issues to be addressed by the possible future legally binding instrument. The importance of covering cases where the use of AI has a negative impact on human rights, democracy and the rule of law was emphasised by several members. In the view of these Delegations, a risk-based approach should be adopted, with a focus on high risk applications. The issue of so-called “red lines” was raised by some Delegations considering this to be a key task for the CAHAI. However, some other Delegations considered that the use of “red lines” should depend on the circumstances and any measures taken in this regard should be proportionate and necessary. During the exchange it was underlined that the work of the CAHAI should not lead to a duplication of already existing legal standards or cause legal fragmentation.
- Take note of the conclusion by the Co-Chairs that sub-groups may have to be established on different issues. The idea is not to block technology or innovation, however the application of so-called “red lines” may be necessary concerning certain uses of AI that go against/ do not respect human rights, democracy and the rule of law.

### **5.2 Chapters 4-6**

- Take note of the presentation of the key findings contained in Chapters 4 – 6 of the Feasibility Study by the secretariat and Ms Smuha and hold an exchange on issues to be addressed by the possible future legally binding instrument. One Delegation expressed the view that the elaboration of the elements should rely not only on Council of Europe instruments, but on instruments of a more global nature, for example those produced by the UN.

### **5.3 Chapter 7**

- Take note of the presentation of the key findings contained in Chapter 7 of the Feasibility Study by Ms Smuha and hold an exchange on issues to be addressed by the possible future legally binding instrument.
- With regard to the issue of “new” human rights, agree to keep an open mind for the time being, it being understood that the CAHAI-LFG is merely examining and proposing legal elements to be considered if and when drawing up a binding legal instrument.

- Agree that a roadmap for the upcoming work of the CAHAI-LFG should be prepared by the Co-Chairs and the Secretariat, including goals and the division of tasks. The importance of having clarity on the deliverables of the CAHAI-LFG was underlined.

#### **5.4 Chapter 8**

- Take note of the presentation of the key findings contained in Chapter 8 of the Feasibility Study by Ms Smuha and hold an exchange on issues to be addressed by the possible future legally binding instrument. Some delegations underlined their wish for a traditional Council of Europe convention which could provide a solid legal basis on certain issues. It was argued that there are already many sectorial non-binding instruments in the field of AI but that they are in practice less effective.
- Bearing in mind that the final decision on the type of legal instrument is entirely in the purview of the Committee of Ministers, support that the CAHAI-LFG shall produce provisions that could be used in a legally-binding international instrument, noting that such elements may also be adapted to a soft law instrument, if the Committee of Ministers so prefers.

#### **5.5 Chapter 9**

- Take note of the presentation of the key findings contained in Chapter 9 of the Feasibility Study by Ms Smuha and hold an exchange on issues to be addressed by the possible future legally-binding instrument.
- Take note that with regard to compliance mechanisms, the CAHAI-PDG is already starting work on this topic which will feed into the work of the CAHAI-LFG.
- Agree that compliance mechanisms are important and such norms should be included in a legal instrument. Ongoing monitoring and assessment of AI systems including human intervention should be considered. It was put forward that it would be up to States to establish a system of certification in line with the rules of the future legal instrument, as establishing a supranational body in this respect would be complicated.

#### **6. Information point: Conference on “Protecting Human Rights in the era of AI - Europe as an international standard setter for the regulation of Artificial Intelligence” – Conference organised by the German Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers**

- Take note of the information provided by Mr Wolfgang Teves (Germany), Co-Chair of the CAHAI-PDG, gave information on the conference which was held virtually on 21 January. All relevant information concerning this event including the recording of proceedings can be found on the dedicated website: <https://germanycoe.de/>

#### **7. Planning of work until the next meeting**

- Take note of the outline for the deliverables due by the end of 2021 in the form of ‘Elements for a Legal Framework – Suggestion for a Table of Contents’ prepared by the Co-Chairs and the Secretariat. Included in this table of tasks, which both the CAHAI-LFG and the CAHAI-PDG would share, were both potential elements for a horizontal legal instrument and potential elements for a sectoral approach as well as further policy guidance.

- Take note that the ongoing mapping work on vertical issues within the Council of Europe would continue.
- Divide the CAHAI-LFG into sub-groups in order to facilitate work, as follows:
  - Scope, purpose, definitions, guiding principles – criteria to assess risk;
  - Handling data and AI-systems responsibly: prevention of harm, accountability, responsibility; surveillance;
  - Human freedoms and self-determination; profiling;
  - Non-discrimination, gender equality, fairness, diversity;
  - Democracy and rule of law;
  - Liability; Role of member States and private actors;
  - “Red lines”.

It should be noted that the topics of the sub-groups are not set in stone and may evolve over time, and the above list is not exhaustive.

- Instruct the sub-groups to deliver their first input by mid-March, to be presented to the CAHAI-LFG at its meeting on 8-9 April 2021.
- Call on members of the CAHAI-LFG to join one or more of the sub-groups.
- Instruct the Secretariat to update the list of sub-groups based on the discussions. A revised document would be sent to the CAHAI-LFG with a request for interest in joining the different sub-groups.

#### **8. Next CAHAI-LFG meeting (8-9 April 2021)**

- Hold its next meeting (virtually) on 8-9 April 2021.

#### **9. Any other business**

- Take note that no issues had been raised under this agenda item.

#### **10. Closing remarks by Mr Patrick PENNINCKX, Head of Information Society Department, Council of Europe**

- Take note of the closing remarks by Mr PENNINCKX, who thanked the members of the CAHAI-LFG for their active participation in the meeting and their commitment to the task ahead. He congratulated the Co-Chairs on their appointment and expressed his thanks to Ms Spolander for her interest.

## APPENDIX I

### Agenda

Wednesday, 10 February 2021		
9.30 am		<p><b>1. Opening of the meeting.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Gregor Strojín, Chair of CAHAI</li> <li>• Ms Claudia Luciani, Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe</li> <li>• Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society- Action against Crime, Council of Europe</li> </ul>
9.50 am		<p><b>2. Adoption of the agenda</b></p>
10.00 am	<a href="#">CAHAI-LFG(2021)01</a>	<p><b>3. Election of the Co-Chairs of the Legal Framework Group.</b></p>
10.30 am	<a href="#">CAHAI(2020)10 ADD REV3</a> <a href="#">CAHAI-BU(2021)REP1</a> <a href="#">CAHAI-PDG(2021)PV1 rev.</a>	<p><b>4. CAHAI- LFG activities in 2021</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Information about the tasks and output to be produced by the CAHAI -LFG provided by the Secretariat</li> <li>• Strategic discussion among Delegations on their implementation in the light of the CAHAI Bureau meeting of 15 January 2021, and taking into consideration the work carried out by the CAHAI Policy Development Group (CAHAI-PDG) and the work carried out by the CAHAI Consultation and Outreach Group (CAHAI-COG)</li> </ul>
11.15 am	<p><u>Document common to all chapters:</u>  <a href="#">Feasibility Study CAHAI(2020)23</a>  <a href="#">CAHAI(2020)27</a></p>	<p><b>5. General presentation of the draft feasibility study</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentation on the preparation of the study by the Co-Chairs of the CAHAI Policy Development Group (PDG) and the scientific expert</li> </ul>
11.30 am		<p><b>5. 1 Chapters 1-3</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentation of key findings of the chapters (scientific expert)</li> <li>• Discussion by CAHAI-LFG on issues to be addressed by the future legal framework</li> </ul>
12.00 am		<i>Lunch break</i>
2.30 pm		<b>[Continued: chapters 1-3]</b>
3.30 pm	<a href="#">CAHAI(2020)08-fin</a>	<p><b>5.2 Chapters 4-6</b> Presentation of key findings of the chapters (scientific expert, secretariat)</p>

3.50 pm		<p><b>5.3 Chapter 7 - Main elements of a legal framework for the design, development and application of AI</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentation of key findings of the chapter on a principle-by-principle basis (scientific expert)</li> <li>• Discussion by CAHAI-LFG on issues pertaining to each principle to be addressed by the future legal framework <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Human Dignity</li> <li>○ Prevention of harm to human rights, democracy and the rule of law</li> <li>○ Human Freedom and Human Autonomy</li> <li>○ Non-Discrimination, Gender Equality, Fairness and Diversity</li> <li>○ Principle of Transparency and Explainability of AI systems</li> <li>○ Data Protection and the right to privacy</li> <li>○ Accountability and Responsibility</li> <li>○ Democracy</li> <li>○ Rule of Law</li> <li>○ Other issues addressed in the chapter</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
5 pm		<i>Close of the 1<sup>st</sup> day</i>
<b>Thursday, 11 February 2021</b>		
9.30 am		<b>[continued: 5.3: Chapter 7]</b>
12.00 am		<i>Lunch break</i>
2.30 pm		<b>[continued: 5.3: Chapter 7]</b>
3.15 pm		<p><b>5.3 Chapter 8</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentation of key findings of the chapters (scientific expert)</li> <li>• Discussion by CAHAI-LFG on issues to be addressed by the future legal framework</li> </ul>
3.30 pm		<p><b>5.4 Chapter 9</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentation of key findings of the chapters (scientific expert)</li> <li>• Discussion by CAHAI-LFG on issues to be addressed by the future legal framework</li> </ul>
4.15 pm		<p><b>6. Information point: Conference on “Protecting Human Rights in the era of AI - Europe as an international standard setter for the regulation of Artificial Intelligence” – Conference organised by the German Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Wolfgang Teves, Co-Chair of the CAHAI-PDG</li> </ul>

4.20 pm		<b>7. Planning of work until the next meeting</b>
4.45 pm	<a href="#">CAHAI(2020)25rev3</a>	<b>8. Next CAHAI-LFG meeting (8-9 April 2021)</b>
4.50 pm		<b>9. Any other business</b>
4.55 pm		<b>10. Closing remarks by Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department, Council of Europe</b>
5 pm		<i>End of the meeting</i>



## APPENDIX II

### List of Participants

#### MEMBERS OF THE LEGAL FRAMEWORKS GROUP / MEMBRES DU GROUPE SUR LES CADRES JURIDIQUES

##### BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

---

**Ms Peggy VALCKE** – Co-Chair of the CAHAI-LFG / Co-Présidente du CAHAI-LFG

Researcher and Professor in ICT and Media at the Faculty of Law at the KU Leuven / chercheuse et professeur en ICT et médias à la faculté de droit à la KU Leuven

##### BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

---

**Mr Dag DZUMRUKCIC** - Minister counsellor, Department for International Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Ministre conseiller, Département des affaires juridiques internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères

##### BULGARIA / BULGARIE

---

**Ms Svetlana LYUBENOVA STILIYANOVA** – Chief expert, Legal Department, Ministry of Transport, Information Technology and Communications / Expert en chef, Service juridique, Ministère des transports, des technologies de l'information et des communications

##### CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

---

**Ms Monika HANYCH** - Senior Ministerial Counsellor, Office of the Government Agent before the European Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice of the Czech Republic / Conseiller ministériel principal, Bureau de l'agent du gouvernement devant la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme, Ministère de la justice de la République tchèque

##### ESTONIA / ESTONIE

---

**Ms Siiri AULIK** - Adviser, Public Law Division, Estonian Ministry of Justice / Conseillère, division du droit public, ministère estonien de la justice

##### FINLAND / FINLANDE

---

**Ms Mia SPOLANDER** - Legal Officer, Legal Service, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Juriste, Service juridique, Unité des tribunaux et conventions des droits de l'homme, Ministère des affaires étrangères

##### FRANCE

---

**Mme Victoria LAFAGE-ROUX** - Office for Expertise and Institutional Issues, Delegation for European and International Affairs, General Secretariat - Ministry of Justice / Bureau de l'expertise et des questions institutionnelles, Délégation aux affaires européennes et internationales, Secrétariat général - Ministère de la Justice

## GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

---

**Ms Lena HOCKE** - Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs (Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz - BMJV)

**Mr Wolfgang TEVES** – Chair of the CAHAI-PDG/ Président du CAHAI PDG

Head of Division for Digital Strategy; Key Policy Issues of the Information Society, Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Chef de la Division de la stratégie numérique, questions politiques clés de la société de l'information, ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs

**Ms Isabella FLORES OVIEDO** - Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs

## GREECE / GRECE

---

**Ms Aggeliki BOLI** - Executive, Department of Digital Strategy, Ministry of Digital Governance / Exécutif, Service de la stratégie numérique, Ministère de la Gouvernance numérique

## HUNGARY / HONGRIE

---

**Ms Kata BENCZE, Dr.** - Legal Officer, State Secretariat for Cooperation in International and European Justice Affairs, Ministry of Justice / Conseiller juridique, Secrétariat d'État à la coopération dans les affaires internationales et européennes de la justice, Ministère de la justice

**Mr Zoltán TURBÉK** – Co-Chair of the CAHAI-PDG/ Co-Président du CAHAI-PDG

Director, Department of International Organisations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade / Directeur, Département des organisations internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères et du commerce

**Ms Abigel GYORGY**, Department of International Organisations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade / Département des organisations internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères et du commerce

## ITALY / ITALIE

---

**Mr Riccardo VILLA** – Co-Chair of the CAHAI-LFG / Co-Président du CAHAI-LFG

Counsellor, Deputy Head of Cyber Department, Directorate General Political and Security Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Co-operation, Rome / Conseiller, Chef adjoint du département Cyber, Direction générale des affaires politiques et de sécurité, Ministère des affaires étrangères et de la coopération internationale, Rome

## REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

---

**Ms Corina CĂLUGĂRU** - Ambassador, Permanent Representative of the Republic of Moldova to the Council of Europe

## NORWAY / NORVEGE

---

**Ms Heather BROOMFIELD** - Senior Advisor, Norwegian Digitalisation Agency / Conseiller principal, Agence norvégienne de numérisation

## POLAND / POLOGNE

---

**Ms Iwona OSTRZYŻEK** - Department for International Cooperation and Human Rights, Ministry of Justice / Département pour la coopération internationale et les droits de l'homme, Ministère de la justice

## PORTUGAL

---

**Mr Pedro Alexandre MONTEIRO ALMEIDA** - Legal Adviser, European Affairs Coordination Unit, Ministry of Justice / Conseiller juridique, Unité de coordination des affaires européennes, Ministère de la justice

## RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE

---

**Mr Konstantin KOSORUKOV** - Head of the Division of General Legal Issues, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Chef de la Division des questions juridiques générales, Département juridique, Ministère des affaires étrangères

## SLOVAKIA / SLOVAQUIE

---

**Ms Barbora ŠIKUTOVA** - Legal expert, International Law Section, Department of European Affairs and Foreign Relations, Ministry of Justice / Juriste expert, Section du droit international, Service des affaires européennes et des relations extérieures, Ministère de la justice

## SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

---

**Mr Gregor STROJIN** – Chair of the CAHAI / Président du CAHAI

Advisor to the President, Supreme Court of the Republic of Slovenia / Conseiller du Président, Cour suprême de la République de Slovénie

## SPAIN / ESPAGNE

---

**Mr Mario HERNNÁNDEZ RAMOS** - Associate Professor of Constitutional Law, University of Salamanca; Senior Legal Advisor Ministry of Justice, Government of Spain / Professeur agrégé de droit constitutionnel, Université de Salamanque; Conseiller juridique principal Ministère de la Justice, Gouvernement espagnol

## SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

---

**Mr Roger DUBACH** - Ambassador, Deputy Director, Directorate of International Law, Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs (FDFA) / Ambassadeur, Directeur adjoint, Direction du droit international, Département fédéral suisse des affaires étrangères (DFAE)

**Ms Dominique KELLER** - Directorate of International Law, Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs (FDFA) / Direction du droit international, Département fédéral suisse des affaires étrangères (DFAE)

**Mr Jürg LINDENMANN** - Advisor, Federal Department of Foreign Affairs, Directorate of International Law / Conseiller, Département fédéral des affaires étrangères, Direction du droit international public

**Mr Thomas SCHNEIDER** - Ambassador, Federal Department of the Environment, Transport, Energy and Communications, Deputy Director, Federal Office of Communications, Director of International Relations / Ambassadeur, Département fédéral de l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication, Vice-Directeur, Office fédéral de la communication, Directeur Relations internationales

## TURKEY / TURQUIE

---

**Ms Leyla KESER BERBER, Prof. Dr.** - Associate Professor & Dr., Information Technology Law Institute, Istanbul Bilgi University Law Faculty / Professeur associé et Dr., Institut de droit des technologies de l'information, Faculté de droit de l'Université Bilgi d'Istanbul

**Ms Güldane Benan AKBAŞ** - EU Expert, Ministry of Science and Technology – DG for EU and Foreign Affairs / Expert de l'UE, Ministère des sciences et de la technologie – DG pour l'UE et les Affaires étrangères

## UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

---

**Ms Rose WOOLHOUSE** - Head of Europe Desk at the UK Government Office for Artificial Intelligence / Chef du bureau Europe de l'Office du gouvernement britannique pour l'intelligence artificielle

**Ms Melissa COUTINHO** – Senior Lawyer, Products, Business & Better Regulation Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy (BEIS) Legal Advisers, Government Legal Department

## PARTICIPANTS

### Council of Europe bodies and institutions / Organes et institutions du Conseil de l'Europe

#### CONFERENCE OF INGOS / CONFÉRENCE DES OING

---

**Ms Francesca FANUCCI** - Senior legal advisor at European Center for Not-for-Profit Law, Netherlands / Conseiller juridique principal au Centre européen pour le droit des associations à but non lucrative, Pays-Bas

**Mr Didier SCHRETTER** - Representative of the Conference of INGOS, Chair of the European Association for Audiovisual Media Education (EAAME) / Représentant de la Conférence des OING, Président de l'Association Européenne pour l'Éducation aux Médias Audiovisuels (AEEMA)

#### CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE – DATA PROTECTION / COMITE CONSULTATIF- PROTECTION DES DONNEES (T-PD)

---

**Mme Sophie KWASNY** - Head of the Data Protection Unit / *Chef de l'Unité Protection des données*

**Mr Alessandro MANTELERO**, Associate Professor at Politecnico di Torino - Tongji University / *Professeur associé au Politecnico di Torino – Université Tongji*

#### EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE / COMITE EUROPEEN SUR LA DEMOCRATIE ET LA GOUVERNANCE (CDDG)

---

**Mr Peter ANDRE** - Senior Expert for legal affairs, Federal Ministry of Interior, Austria, CDDG Rapporteur on Democracy and Technology / Expert principal pour les affaires juridiques, Ministère fédéral de l'intérieur d'Autriche, Rapporteur du CDDG sur la démocratie et la technologie

**Ms Judith ORLAND** - Program Manager Democracy and AI, Democratic Governance Division, CDDG Secretariat

## **GENDER EQUALITY COMMISSION / COMMISSION POUR L'EGALITE DE GENRE**

---

**Ms Käthlin SANDER** - Head of Gender Equality Policy, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Social Affairs, Estonia / Responsable de la politique d'égalité entre les sexes, département des politiques d'égalité, ministère des affaires sociales, Estonie

**Mme Cécile GREBOVAL** - Programme Manager Gender Mainstreaming / Gender Equality Advisor / Responsable de programme, Gender Mainstreaming / Conseillère en matière d'égalité entre les femmes et les hommes

## **EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR THE EFFICIENCY OF JUSTICE / COMMISSION EUROPEENNE POUR L'EFFICACITE DE LA JUSTICE (CEPEJ)**

---

## **VENICE COMMISSION / COMMISSION DE VENISE)**

---

**Mr Michael JANSSEN** - Elections and Political Parties, Secretariat of the Venice Commission / Elections et partis politiques, Secrétariat de la Commission de Venise

**European Union and Observers from International Organisations / Union européenne et Observateurs des Organisations Internationales**

## **EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPEENNE**

---

## **EUROPEAN DATA PROTECTION SUPERVISOR (EDPS) / CONTROLEUR EUROPEEN DE LA PROTECTION DES DONNEES (CEPD)**

---

**Mr Plamen ANGELOV** - Legal Officer, Policy & Consultation Unit / Juriste, unité politique et consultation

**Mr Xabier LAREO** - Technology and security officer, Technology and Privacy unit / Agent de la technologie et de la sécurité, unité Technologie et vie privée

## **ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT (OECD) / ORGANISATION DE COOPÉRATION ET DE DÉVELOPPEMENT ÉCONOMIQUES (OCDE)**

---

**Ms Laura GALINDO** - Consultant, Artificial Intelligence Policy Observatory, Digital Economy Policy Division; Science, Technology and Innovation Directorate / Consultante, Observatoire des politiques d'intelligence artificielle, Division de la politique de l'économie numérique, Direction de la science, de la technologie et de l'innovation

## **ORGANIZATION FOR SECURITY AND CO-OPERATION IN EUROPE (OSCE) / ORGANISATION POUR LA SECURITE ET LA COOPERATION EN EUROPE (OSCE)**

---

**Ms Julia HAAS** - Assistant Project Officer, Office of the Representative on Freedom of the Media / Chargé de projet adjoint, Bureau du Représentant pour la liberté des médias

## Observer States to the CAHAI / Etats observateurs au CAHAI

### CANADA

---

**Ms Gabrielle SIGNORINI** - Senior Counsel, Treasury Board Secretariat Legal Services Unit, Department of Justice / Conseiller principal, Unité des services juridiques du Secrétariat du Conseil du Trésor, Ministère de la justice

**Ms Lesia STANGRET** - Legal Specialist, Criminal, Security and Diplomatic Law Division, Global Affairs Canada, Government of Canada / Spécialiste juridique, Direction du droit criminel, du droit de la sécurité et du droit diplomatique, Affaires mondiales Canada, Gouvernement du Canada

### ISRAEL / ISRAËL

---

**Mr Cedric (Yehuda) SABBAAH** - Director, International Cybersecurity & IT Law, Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law), Ministry of Justice, Israel / Directeur, Cybersécurité internationale et droit des technologies de l'information, Bureau du procureur général adjoint (droit international), Ministère de la Justice, Israël

### MEXICO / MEXIQUE

---

**Mr Joel GOMEZ TREVIÑO, Dr.** - Founding Chairman of the Mexican Academy of Digital Law (AMDI), Chairman of the Digital Law and Privacy Committee of the National Association of Corporate Lawyers (ANADE) / Président fondateur de l'Académie mexicaine de droit informatique (AMDI), Président du Comité sur le droit informatique et la protection de la vie privée de l'Association nationale des avocats d'entreprise (ANADE)

### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA / ETATS-UNIS D'AMERIQUE

---

**Mr Aamod OMPRAKASH** - Foreign Affairs Officer, Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor, Office of Multilateral and Global Affairs / Responsable des affaires étrangères, Bureau de la démocratie, des droits de l'homme et du travail, Bureau des affaires multilatérales et mondiales

**Ms Darragh PARADISO** - Deputy Permanent Observer, Consul General, Office of the Permanent Observer of the United States of America to the Council of Europe / Observateur permanent adjoint, Consul général, Bureau de l'Observateur permanent des États-Unis d'Amérique auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

**Mr Yann AGERT** - Consular and Political Assistant / Adjoint aux affaires consulaires et politiques

### OBSERVERS ADMITTED TO THE CAHAI / OBSERVATEURS ADMIS AU CAHAI

### EUROPEAN NETWORK OF NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS / RÉSEAU EUROPÉEN DES INSTITUTIONS NATIONALES DES DROITS DE L'HOMME (ENNHRI)

---

**Ms Marya AKHTAR** - Chief Legal Advisor, LL.M., The Danish Institute for Human Rights / Conseiller juridique en chef, LL.M., L'Institut danois des droits de l'homme

**Council of Europe partner Internet companies / Entreprises internet partenaires du Conseil de l'Europe**

**INTERNATIONAL COMMUNICATIONS CONSULTANCY ORGANISATION (ICCO)**

---

**INSTITUTE OF ELECTRICAL AND ELECTRONICS ENGINEERS (IEEE)**

---

**Mr Nicolas ECONOMOU** - Chair, Law Committee, IEEE Global Initiative on Ethics of Autonomous and Intelligent Systems

**Ms Clara NEPPEL, Dr.** - Senior Director, European Business Operations / Directeur principal, Opérations commerciales européennes

**RIPE NCC**

---

**TELEFÓNICA**

---

**Mr Gonzalo LOPEZ BARAJAS** - Manager, Public Policy & Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Ms Paloma VILLA MATEOS** - Manager, Public Policy and Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet

**Civil Society Organisations, other private sector and academic actors relevant to the work of the CAHAI / Organisations de la Société civile, autres acteurs du secteur privé et académique, concernés par les travaux du CAHAI**

**ACCESS NOW**

---

**Mr Daniel LEUFER** - Europe Policy Analyst / Analyste des politiques européennes

**AI TRANSPARENCY INSTITUTE**

---

**Ms Eva THELISSON** – CEO / PDG

**ALLAI**

---

**Ms Catelijne MULLER** – President ALLAI

**EUROPEAN EXPERTISE & EXPERT INSTITUTE (EEEI)**

---

## HOMO DIGITALIS

---

**Mr Eleftherios CHELIOUDAKIS** - Co-founder and Secretary of the Board of Directors / Co-fondateur et secrétaire du conseil d'administration

## MEDIA LAWS

---

**Mr Marco BASSINI** – Postdoctoral Researcher and Professor of IT Law, Bocconi University - Vice Editor-in-Chief, MediaLaws / Chercheur postdoctoral et professeur de droit des technologies de l'information, Université Bocconi - Vice-rédacteur en chef, MediaLaws

## INDEPENDENT EXPERTS / EXPERTS INDEPENDANTS

**Ms Nathalie SMUHA** - Researcher - Department of International & European Law, KU Leuven, Member of the OECD Network of Experts on AI (ONE AI), Former Coordinator of the EC High-Level Expert Group on AI, Belgium / Chercheur - Département de droit international et européen, KU Leuven, membre du réseau d'experts de l'OCDE sur l'IA (ONE AI), ancien coordinateur du groupe d'experts de haut niveau de la CE sur l'IA, Belgique

**Lord Tim CLEMENT-JONES CBE** - House of Lords Liberal Democrat Spokesperson (Digital), United Kingdom / Porte-parole libéral-démocrate de la Chambre des Lords (Digital), Royaume-Uni

## SECRETARIAT GENERAL OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE

### DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME ET DE L'ÉTAT DE DROIT (DG I)

**Mr Jan KLEIJSSSEN** - Director, Information Society – Action against Crime, Council of Europe / Directeur, Société de l'Information – Lutte contre la Criminalité, Conseil de l'Europe

**Mr Patrick PENNINGCKX** - Head of Department, Information Society Department / Chef du Service, Service de la société de l'information

### DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF DEMOCRACY / DIRECTION GÉNÉRALE DE LA DÉMOCRATIE (DG II)

**Ms Claudia LUCIANI** – Director, Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directrice, Direction de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance

## SECRETARIAT OF THE CAHAI / SECRÉTARIAT DU CAHAI

**Ms Clementina BARBARO**  
Co-Secretary of CAHAI / *Co-secrétaire du CAHAI*

[Ms Laetitia DIMANCHE, CAHAI Project Assistant / Assistante du Projet CAHAI](#)

**Mr Kristian BARTHOLIN**  
Co-Secretary of CAHAI / *Co-secrétaire du CAHAI*

**Ms Lucy ANCELIN** - Assistant to the CAHAI / *Assistante du CAHAI*

**Mr Yannick MENECEUR** - Policy Adviser / *Conseiller en politiques*

**Ms Claire ROBINS** - Secretariat, Counter-terrorism division / *Secrétariat, Division Anti-terrorisme*

\*\*\*



**INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES**

**Ms Julia TANNER**

**M. Didier JUNGLING**

