



Strasbourg, 20 November 2019

CAHAI/Bu(2019)REP1

English

AD HOC COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (CAHAI)

Bureau – First Meeting

Strasbourg, 19 November 2019

Palais de l'Europe, Room 17

Abridged report

www.coe.int/cahai

1. The Bureau of the Ad hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence held its first meeting in Strasbourg on 19 November 2019, chaired by Gregor Stojin (Slovenia), President of the CAHAI. The following bureau members were also present: Ms Peggy Valcke, Vice-President (Belgium), Ms Siiri Aulik (Estonia), Ms Marine Kettani (France), Mr Thomas Schneider (Switzerland) and Mr Wolfgang Teves (Germany). Mr Marco Bellezza (Italy) was apologised.

1. Information from Bureau members and Secretariat

2. Following brief introductions by the Chair, the members of the Bureau and the secretariat members on their background and professional experiences, the Bureau took note of the elements set out in Resolution CM/Res(2011)24 regarding the role of the Bureau.

2. Stock taking of the first two days of the plenary

3. The Bureau took stock of the discussions held during the two days of the meeting, of member States' statements and their understanding of the expectations of the Committee of Ministers with respect to CAHAI's tasks and deliverables.

4. The Bureau exchanged views on the different elements of CAHAI's expected outputs, in particular the future feasibility study, as well as the possible content of the progress report which should be communicated by the CAHAI by May 2020 to the Committee of Ministers. It considered that, based on the orientations provided by CAHAI members in its Second Plenary in March 2020, the Committee should be able to include in its progress report an overview of the substantive issues and a clear roadmap for the fulfilment of its mandate, including with respect to the process of multi-stakeholder consultations, and specific proposals for decision by the Committee of Ministers (including as appropriate any proposals with respect to its working methods, its workplan and any relevant related staff and budgetary implications). Bureau members underlined the importance of ensuring that the roadmap takes into account any relevant initiatives and legal developments at international or European level during CAHAI's mandate.

5. The Bureau discussed also what could constitute the possible elements of the future feasibility study's outline, including the mapping of legal instruments and of the effects and impact of AI on human rights, rule of law and democracy, the range of policy, legislation and regulatory acts, mechanisms and measures that could be included for consideration in this context. They decided to resume this discussion at the next Bureau meeting, on the basis of a draft outline prepared on the basis of the exchange of views during this plenary meeting.

3. Workplan and working methods 2020 of the CAHAI

6. The Bureau examined briefly the working document CAHAI(2019)04 in the light of the budgetary appropriations decided upon by the Committee of Ministers, including with respect to the total number of bureau and plenary meetings and the possibility of establishing working groups.

7. Bureau members considered that a decision on the number of working groups and their specific tasks should be taken once a clear roadmap would be approved by the CAHAI at its second plenary meeting, in order to ensure that the working groups would adequately respond to the identified needs and actions to be undertaken by the Committee. With respect to the format of multi-stakeholder consultations, Bureau members indicated the need to clarify the scope and content of such consultations.

8. The Bureau members expressed their readiness to contribute to the elaboration of the relevant working documents for the next plenary meeting, with the support of the Secretariat

and where necessary, with the involvement of additional member states' experts and consultants.

9. The Bureau was informed by the Secretariat of possible requests for contributions and representation of the CAHAI to other committees and bodies. The Bureau agreed that such requests should be considered on a case by case basis, taking into account the added value of the CAHAI's representation to such events.

4. Admission of observers to the CAHAI

10. The Secretariat presented briefly the rules to be applied for the admission of observers other than those already explicitly mentioned in CAHAI's terms of reference and informed the Bureau that since the elaboration of the relevant working documents, an additional request from a civil society organisation had reached the secretariat. The Secretariat presented briefly the organisations which had formulated requests for admission.

11. The Bureau discussed the need for the CAHAI to agree on clear criteria for the admission of observers in order to enable the Committee to take an informed decision on this matter. Such criteria could include: the degree of representativeness of the requesting organisation, the potential contribution it could make to the fulfilment of CAHAI's main task in the light of its background work and experience, as well as, where relevant, any previous experience of co-operation with the Council of Europe (or other international organisations) in this field. It also discussed the possibility to consider inviting the requesting organisations to attend the next plenary as guests, so as to give them an opportunity to introduce themselves to the Committee before a formal decision is taken in this respect.

5. Preparation of the point 8.2 of the agenda of the CAHAI meeting: Appointment of the Gender Equality Rapporteur

12. The Bureau welcomed the expression of interest received from Ms Jana NOVOHRADSKA (Slovak Republic) for the position of Gender Equality Rapporteur.

6. Information by the Secretariat of the provisional meeting dates (Plenaries and Bureau)

13. The Bureau examined the dates proposed by the Secretariat for holding the next Bureau meeting. With respect to plenary meetings, the Bureau discussed a proposal not to hold the meetings on Monday, due to travel implications for many delegations and requested the secretariat to check the availability of meeting rooms for alternative dates.

14. The Bureau agreed to hold its second Bureau meeting from 23-24 January 2020 and to consider at a later stage the dates and location of the next Bureau meeting.

7. Communication plans for the CAHAI

15. The Bureau took note of the Secretariat's communication plans and agreed to resume the discussion on this issue at its next meeting.

8. Any other business

16. The President informed the Bureau of the letter received on 19 November from the delegation of the Russian Federation seeking a "special status" to take part in Bureau meetings without defrayal of expenses and expressing the desire to head a working group for mapping current national and international initiatives in the area of AI in CAHAI and the

readiness of involving Mr Andrey Neznamov in the functioning of the working group . The letter is included in Appendix I.

17. The Bureau requested the Secretariat to seek a legal opinion from the Legal Service of the Organisation on the Russian Federation's request for a special status, taking into account any precedents and existing practice in the Organisation regarding the working methods of the Bureau and the involvement of other member states. The Bureau agreed to discuss this request in advance of the next Bureau meeting, taking into account the opinion of the Legal Service. As regards the second proposal, the Bureau took note of the Russian Federation's readiness to head a working group and contribute with additional experts, and considered that this proposal should be examined by the CAHAI when deciding upon which working groups should be established and their working methods.

Appendix I.

To the Chairman
of the Ad hoc Committee
on Artificial Intelligence

Mr Gregor Strojín

November 19, 2019, Strasbourg

Seeing the considerable support to the Russian Federation's participation in the work of the bureau we submit following proposals on its participation in the CAHAI.

Egor Shipitsyn
Member of the CAHAI from the Russian Federation
Acting Director
Ministry of Economic Development
of the Russian Federation



Annex 1

The Russian Federation applies for a special status in the bureau for Mr Egor Shipitsyn, member of the CAHAI from the Russian Federation which would allow to participate in bureau meetings and to contribute to its work without defrayal of expenses.

Annex 2

In addition the Russian Federation expresses its desire that Mr Egor Shipitsyn, member of the CAHAI from the Russian Federation would head *the working group for mapping current national and international initiatives in the area of artificial intelligence* in CAHAI and Mr Andrey Neznamov would participate in the functioning of if such group is suggested.