



Strasbourg, 25 June 2021

CAHAI(2021)08

# **AD HOC COMMITTEE ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE (CAHAI)**

---

**Progress Report**

**by the Co-Chairs of the CAHAI -LFG**

**Ms Peggy VALCKE (Belgium) and Mr Riccardo VILLA (Italy)**

---

[www.coe.int/cahai](http://www.coe.int/cahai)

## **Introduction:**

The CAHAI Legal Frameworks Group (CAHAI-LFG) was established by the CAHAI with a view to preparing for the examination and finalisation by the Committee of a series of elements to be included in a possible future legally binding instrument of the Council of Europe in the area of artificial intelligence (AI) and human rights, democracy, and the rule of law.

For the composition of the CAHAI-LFG, please refer to the Annex of this document.

At its first meeting, the CAHAI-LFG elected Ms Peggy VALCKE (Belgium) and Mr Riccardo VILLA (Italy) as Co-chairs.

## **Meetings:**

A total of five meetings are foreseen for the CAHAI-LFG, three of which have already been held, on 10–11 February, 8–9 April, and 31 May – 1 June 2021, respectively. The 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> meetings are currently scheduled for 20–21 September and 2–3 November 2021.

## **Working methods:**

At its 1<sup>st</sup> meeting, the CAHAI-LFG decided to establish 7 Sub-Working Groups to stimulate discussions and ensure a broad stakeholder approach. These covered the following topics, identified on the basis of the Feasibility Study (*doc. CAHAI(2020)23*):

Sub-Working Group 1: Scope and Basic Principles

Sub-Working Group 2: Human Value, Dignity, Autonomy and Freedoms

Sub-Working Group 3: Non-discrimination, Gender Equality, Fairness, Diversity

Sub-Working Group 4: Impact on Democracy and Rule of Law, Right to a Fair Trial

Sub-Working Group 5: Accountability, Transparency

Sub-Working Group 6: “Red Lines”

Sub-Working Group 7: Cooperation, Compliance, Follow-up

The outcomes of the work of Sub-Working Groups 1 – 5 were examined and discussed by the Group at its 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting. Sub-Working Groups 6 and 7 only started working after the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the CAHAI-LFG and presented their preliminary outcomes at the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting. The revised outcomes produced by these two Sub-Working Groups will be further discussed by the Group during its 4<sup>th</sup> meeting.

At its 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting, the CAHAI-LFG requested the Secretariat, working under the guidance of the Co-Chairs, to elaborate a document containing preliminary draft model provisions concerning the design, development, and application of AI systems. The Secretariat was instructed to base its work on LFG discussions on the Feasibility Study, on the outcomes produced by Sub-Working Groups 1 – 5 and ensuing LFG debates, and as necessary complement those to ensure the legal consistency and coherency of the proposed provisions, including by rationalising possible duplications.

The document on model provisions (*doc. CAHAI-LFG(2021)09Confidential*) produced by the Secretariat under the guidance of the Co-Chairs was examined and discussed at the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the CAHAI-LFG. It should be underlined that the purpose of the document is not to serve as basis for negotiations of a legally binding instrument. It is solely intended as a tool to facilitate the final process of identifying and selecting the elements to be included in a possible future legally binding/non-binding instruments of the Council of Europe in the area of artificial intelligence (AI) and human rights, democracy, and the rule of law. As such, it has proven to be a valuable document which has stimulated

the debate amongst experts and allowed the members of the Group to visualise how the various elements identified by Sub-Working Groups 1 – 5 could form part of a structure similar to that normally adopted by the Council of Europe for treaties (and to some extent recommendations) and be presented when formulated as legal provisions. The document on model provisions, however, is not intended to be the outcome of the work of the CAHAI-LFG to be presented to the CAHAI. To this end, the Group aims at producing another document **describing** the elements selected for inclusion in a possible future legally binding instrument and providing these elements with the necessary legal and policy context, without presenting them in the format of a legal text.

In addition to the document on model provisions, the CAHAI-LFG also heard a first presentation of the outcomes of Sub-Working Groups 6 and 7. After a preliminary examination, the Group decided to allow the Sub-Working Groups to re-consider and, as necessary, revise their respective documents in view of continuing discussion thereof at the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the CAHAI-LFG.

During their work, the Co-Chairs of both the CAHAI-PDG and the CAHAI-LFG have consistently ensured coordination and exchange of information between the two Groups in order for them to have a properly streamlined and consistent outcome for submission to the CAHAI. The Secretariat has also kept the CAHAI-LFG informed of the work brought forward by CAHAI-COG.

### **Preliminary results:**

Due to the very constructive contributions and many efforts of its members, the CAHAI-LFG has made significant progress in identifying the various elements that could be included in a possible future legally binding instrument of the Council of Europe on AI, human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, or alternatively in non-binding instruments. As Co-Chairs we would like to take this opportunity to express our particular gratitude to the Lead Coordinators of Sub-Working Groups 1 – 7, who have all worked very hard and against short deadlines with their respective sub-working groups to produce highly useful results. Though much work has already been done, the CAHAI-LFG will still need to agree on which of these elements to keep in its proposal to be submitted to the CAHAI. It should be underlined here, that this decision is not solely of a technical nature but will necessarily also involve some political choices.

Among the elements which have already been agreed by the Group is the need for a clear and general definition of “AI system”, which could be based on the definition developed by the OECD. In addition, the Group examined several other possible definitions, notably for “provider” and “user”, but also for “lifecycle”. Which definitions should be included among the elements of a possible future legally binding instrument will, of course, depend on the exact scope of that instrument.

Consensus seems to be emerging within CAHAI-LFG that a risk-based approach would be the most appropriate, focusing in particular on the need for independent impact assessments of the risks posed by applications of AI systems in relation to the enjoyment of human rights, respect for democracy, and observance of the rule of law and the subsequent risk mitigation measures that should be taken. As relevant criteria for this assessment, the CAHAI-LFG has considered, besides the likelihood and severity of the negative impact, also contextual factors, such as the sector and area of use; the complexity of the AI-system and the level of automation; the quality, type and nature of data used, or the level of compliance with regulation in other fields. It should be underlined that this risk-based approach is intended to stimulate by providing clear guidance for responsible design, development and use of AI systems – not unduly limiting or stifling such activities.

The CAHAI-LFG considers that a possible legally binding instrument would need to include elements which contain principles, such as (but not limited to) protection of human dignity, prevention of harm, equal treatment and non-discrimination, human oversight, transparency, explainability, and accountability, which should be generally applicable to all forms of AI systems, whether designed, developed and used in a private or public sector context, as well as elements containing principles specifically targeted to the public sector (in particular in relation to law enforcement, the judiciary, public administration and elections), where risk of interferences with human rights, democracy and the rule of law is considered higher than in the private sector. The CAHAI-LFG also paid specific attention to children’s rights and gender equality.

The Group has not yet had the occasion to examine in detail how to mitigate high risks posed by AI systems, as this falls under the outcomes of Sub-Working Group 6, but has had some preliminary exchanges about the possible introduction of a legal obligation for States to provide for a human rights, democracy and rule of law impact assessment. The specificities of such an impact assessment model are the subject of work done by the CAHAI-PDG. Similarly, the CAHAI-LFG has not yet examined in detail the outcomes of the work of Sub-Working Group 7, but intend to hold further discussions on issues like compliance and supervision at its next meeting,

### **Request for guidance:**

During the deliberations of the CAHAI-LFG, several issues of a more political nature have been raised, the discussion of which by the Group would benefit from guidance provided by the CAHAI:

#### *Dual use*

Certain AI systems may be designed and developed with both military and civilian use in mind. It is clear from the Statute of the Council of Europe that the purely military design, development and use of such AI systems would fall outside the scope of a possible legally binding instrument of the Council of Europe. However, the corresponding civilian aspects may fall well within that scope. Should this issue be addressed and clarified as part of the elements or not when determining the scope of a possible future legally binding instrument?

#### *Classification of risks*

The CAHAI-LFG has identified a need for the elaboration of systems for classification of risks in at least the categories of “low risk” and “high risk”. Should the elements of a possible legally binding instrument contain common requirements for risk assessment of AI systems in relation to their potential impact on human rights, democracy, and the rule of law, or should the elements merely contain an obligation to elaborate such risk assessment systems at domestic level?

#### *Design, development of, and research in, artificial intelligence systems*

The CAHAI-LFG has discussed a proposal by the Secretariat to include a series of research-related provisions among the model provisions. The idea, inspired by the Oviedo Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (ETS No 164), is to generally promote design, development of, and research in, artificial intelligence systems, while ensuring a responsible approach through calling on Parties to establish specialised ethics committees and obliging them to put in place formal ethics review procedures prior to the initiation of research activities. Parties would also be called upon to establish regulatory sandboxes and encourage public debate on fundamental questions raised by developments in artificial intelligence. Should issues relating to research in artificial intelligence, such as those mentioned above, be included in the elements of a possible future legally binding instrument, or should this be left to regulation at domestic level only?

#### *Civil liability*

The CAHAI-LFG has ruled out the introduction of an obligation to introduce criminal responsibility for developers and users of AI systems. However, the issue of civil liability remains open. Should the elements contain a common obligation to establish civil liability for developers and users of AI systems, or should this question be left solely to domestic regulation?

## *Democracy*

One of the added values of the Council of Europe adopting a legally binding instrument on AI is that the issue of the potential negative impact of AI systems on democracy falls clearly within the mandate of the Organisation. However, unlike the situation for human rights, the potential risk to democracy posed by the application of AI systems is in practice proving somewhat more difficult to narrow down. Which aspects of the implications of the use of AI systems for democracy should the CAHAI-LFG concentrate its work on?

### *Specific requirements for the design, development and use of AI in “public administration”*

In so far as high-risk applications of AI systems in the public sector is concerned, the CAHAI-LFG has concentrated its work on the areas of “law enforcement”, the “judicial sector” and “public administration”. Whereas “law enforcement” and “the judiciary sector” are self-explanatory, the Group has discussed if “public administration” is too broad a concept and needs to be broken down in more specific sectors, such as “healthcare”, education”, “social services”, “immigration”, etc. Should a possible legally binding instrument go into that level of detail in regulating the design, development, and use of AI systems in this area or should it be limited to setting out the general principles applicable to “public administration”?

### **Next steps:**

The CAHAI-LFG will at its 4<sup>th</sup> meeting finalise its deliberations on the outcomes of Sub-Working Groups 6 and 7. It will also revisit the document on model provisions to be revised by the Secretariat. The aim is to finalise the selection of elements for a possible legally binding instrument of the Council of Europe and to instruct the Secretariat to produce another document describing the elements selected for inclusion in a possible future legally binding instrument and providing these elements with the necessary legal and policy context, without presenting them in the format of a legal text.

This new document should be examined and agreed at the 5<sup>th</sup> and final meeting of the CAHAI-LFG and submitted to the CAHAI for finalisation.

### **Conclusion:**

We consider that the work of the CAHAI-LFG has progressed as planned and expect to be able to submit the results of the work of the Group to the CAHAI in accordance with the instructions provided by the Committee.

\*\*\*\*

**ANNEX  
COMPOSITION OF THE CAHA-LFG**

**Member States of the Council of Europe / Etats membres du Conseil de l'Europe**

Belgium	Ms Peggy VALCKE - Researcher and Professor in ICT and Media at the Faculty of Law at the KU Leuven / chercheuse et professeur en ICT et médias à la faculté de droit à la KU Leuven	Belgique
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Mr Dag DZUMRUKCIC - Minister counsellor, Department for International Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Ministre conseiller, Département des affaires juridiques internationales, Ministère des affaires étrangères	Bosnie-Herzégovine
Bulgaria	Ms Svetlana LYUBENOVA STILYANOVA – Chief expert, Legal Department, Ministry of Transport, Information Technology and Communications / Expert en chef, Service juridique, Ministère des transports, des technologies de l'information et des communications	Bulgarie
Czech Republic	Ms Monika HANYCH - Senior Ministerial Counsellor, Office of the Government Agent before the European Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice of the Czech Republic / Conseiller ministériel principal, Bureau de l'agent du gouvernement devant la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme, Ministère de la justice de la République tchèque	République tchèque
Estonia	Ms Siiri AULIK - Adviser, Public Law Division, Estonian Ministry of Justice / Conseillère, division du droit public, ministère estonien de la justice	Estonie
Finland	Ms Mia SPOLANDER - Legal Officer, Legal Service, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Juriste, Service juridique, Unité des tribunaux et conventions des droits de l'homme, Ministère des affaires étrangères	Finlande
France	Mme Gaëlane PELEN - Magistrate - Policy Officer to the Head of the SEM General Secretariat / Magistrate – Chargée de mission auprès de la Cheffe du SEM, Secrétariat général	France
Germany	Ms Lena HOCKE - Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection / Ministère fédéral de la justice et de la protection des consommateurs (Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz - BMJV)	Allemagne
Greece	Ms Stamatina LEKKA - Executive, Department of Open Governance and Transparency / Executive, Département de la gouvernance ouverte et de la transparence	Grèce
Hungary	Ms Kata BENCZE, Dr. - Legal Officer, State Secretariat for Cooperation in International and European Justice Affairs, Ministry of Justice / Conseiller juridique, Secrétariat d'État à la coopération dans les affaires internationales et européennes de la justice, Ministère de la justice	Hongrie
Italy	Mr Riccardo VILLA - Counsellor, Deputy Head of Cyber Department, Directorate General Political and Security Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Co-operation / Conseiller, Chef adjoint du département Cyber, Direction générale des affaires politiques et de sécurité, Ministère des affaires étrangères et de la coopération internationale	Italie
Luxembourg	Ms Michèle FINCK - Senior Research Fellow, Max Planck Institute for Innovation and Competition / Chercheuse principale, Institut Max Planck pour l'innovation et la concurrence	Luxembourg

Republic of Moldova	Ms Corina CĂLUGĂRU - Ambassador, Permanent Representative of the Republic of Moldova to the Council of Europe	République de Moldova
Norway	Ms Heather BROOMFIELD - Senior Advisor, Norwegian Digitalisation Agency / Conseiller principal, Agence norvégienne de numérisation	Norvège
Poland	Ms Iwona OSTRZYŻEK - Department for International Cooperation and Human Rights, Ministry of Justice / Département pour la coopération internationale et les droits de l'homme, Ministère de la justice	Pologne
Portugal	Mr Pedro Alexandre MONTEIRO ALMEIDA - Legal Adviser, European Affairs Coordination Unit, Ministry of Justice / Conseiller juridique, Unité de coordination des affaires européennes, Ministère de la justice	Portugal
Russian Federation	Mr Konstantin KOSORUKOV, Head of the Division of General Legal Issues, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Chef de la Division des questions juridiques générales, Département juridique, Ministère des affaires étrangères	Fédération de Russie
Slovakia	Ms Barbora ŠIKUTOVA - Legal expert, International Law Section, Department of European Affairs and Foreign Relations, Ministry of Justice / Juriste expert, Section du droit international, Service des affaires européennes et des relations extérieures, Ministère de la justice	Slovaquie
Spain	Mr Mario HERNNÁNDEZ RAMOS - Associate Professor of Constitutional Law, University of Salamanca; Senior Legal Advisor Ministry of Justice, Government of Spain / Professeur agrégé de droit constitutionnel, Université de Salamanque; Conseiller juridique principal Ministère de la Justice, Gouvernement espagnol	Espagne
Switzerland	Mr Roger DUBACH, Ambassador, Deputy Director, Directorate of International Law, Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs (FDFA) / Ambassadeur, Directeur adjoint, Direction du droit international, Département fédéral suisse des affaires étrangères (DFAE)	Suisse
Turkey	Ms Leyla KESER BERBER, Prof. Dr. - Associate Professor & Dr., Information Technology Law Institute, Istanbul Bilgi University Law Faculty / Professeur associé et Dr., Institut de droit des technologies de l'information, Faculté de droit de l'Université Bilgi d'Istanbul	Turquie
United Kingdom	Ms Rose WOOLHOUSE -Head of Europe Desk at the UK Government Office for Artificial Intelligence / Chef du Desk Europe à l'Office du gouvernement britannique pour l'intelligence artificielle  alternating with / en alternance avec  Ms Melissa COUTINHO - Senior Lawyer in the Products, Business & Better Regulation unit of the Department of Energy and Industrial Strategy / Juriste principal au sein de l'unité "Produits, entreprises et meilleure réglementation" du ministère de l'énergie et de la stratégie industrielle	Royaume-Uni

## PARTICIPANTS

### Council of Europe bodies and institutions / Organes et institutions du Conseil de l'Europe

Conference of INGOs	<p>Ms Francesca FANUCCI - Senior legal advisor at European Center for Not-for-Profit Law / Conseiller juridique principal au Centre européen pour le droit des associations à but non lucrative</p> <p>alternating with / en alternance avec</p> <p>Mr Didier SCHRETTTER, Representative of the Conference of INGOS, Chair of the European Association for Audiovisual Media Education (EAAME) / Représentant de la Conférence des OING, Président de l'Association Européenne pour l'Éducation aux Médias Audiovisuels (AEEMA)</p>	Conférence des OING
Data Protection Unit	<p>Mr Alessandro MANTELERO - Associate Professor of Private Law and Law &amp; Technology at the Polytechnic University of Turin / Professeur associé de droit privé et de droit et technologie à l'Université polytechnique de Turin Postal address: Politecnico di Torino, Corso Duca degli Abruzzi 24, I - 10129 Torino</p>	Unité de protection des données
European Committee on Democracy and Governance (CDDG)	<p>Mr Peter ANDRE - Senior Expert for legal affairs, Federal Ministry of Interior, Austria, CDDG Rapporteur on Democracy and Technology / Expert principal pour les affaires juridiques, Ministère fédéral de l'intérieur d'Autriche, Rapporteur du CDDG sur la démocratie et la technologie</p> <p>as observers / en role d'observateurs</p> <p>Ms Judith ORLAND, Program Manager Democracy and AI, Democratic Governance Division, CDDG Secretariat</p> <p>and / et</p> <p>Ms Sonia SIRTORI, Head of the Democratic Governance Division, CDDG Secretariat</p>	Comité européen sur la démocratie et la gouvernance (CDDG)
Gender Equality Commission	<p>Ms Käthlin SANDER - Head of Gender Equality Policy, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Social Affairs, Estonia / Responsable de la politique d'égalité entre les sexes, département des politiques d'égalité, ministère des affaires sociales, Estonie</p> <p>and / et</p> <p>Ms Cécile GRÉBOVAL - Programme Manager Gender Mainstreaming / Gender Equality Advisor, Gender Equality Division - Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance, Council of Europe / Responsable de programme, Gender Mainstreaming / Conseillère en matière d'égalité entre les femmes et les hommes, Division de l'égalité entre les femmes et les hommes - Direction générale de la dignité humaine, de l'égalité et de la gouvernance, Conseil de l'Europe</p>	Commission pour l'égalité de genre
CEPEJ	<p>Mr Adis HODZIC - Senior Advisor for Statistics, Secretariat of the High Judicial and Prosecutorial Council of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Sarajevo, Member of the CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST Group / Conseiller principal pour les statistiques, Secrétariat du Haut Conseil des juges et des procureurs de Bosnie-Herzégovine, Sarajevo, membre du groupe CEPEJ-GT-CYBERJUST</p>	CEPEJ



Venice Commission	Mr Michael JANSSEN, Elections and Political Parties Division, Secretariat of the Venice Commission / Elections et partis politiques, Secrétariat de la Commission de Venise	Commission de Venise
-------------------	---	----------------------

**European Union and Observers from International Organisations / Union européenne et Observateurs des Organisations Internationales**

European Union	Mr Eike GRAEF - Policy officer, Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers, Directorate C : Fundamental Rights and Rule of Law, Unit C.2: Fundamental rights policy, European Commission / Responsable des politiques, Direction générale de la justice et des consommateurs, Direction C : Droits fondamentaux et de l'état de droit, Unité C.2: Politique des droits fondamentaux, Commission européenne	Union européenne
EDPS (European Data Protection Supervisor)	Mr Plamen ANGELOV - Legal Officer, Policy & Consultation Unit / Juriste, unité politique et consultation  in case of unavailability to be deputised by / en cas d'indisponibilité pour être suppléé par  Mr Xabier LAREO LÓPEZ DE VERGARA - Technology and security officer, European Data Protection Supervisor / Responsable de la technologie et de la sécurité, Contrôleur européen de la protection des données	CEPD (Contrôleur Européen de la Protection des Données)
OECD	Ms Karine PERSET - Administrator – Artificial Intelligence Policy Observatory, Digital Economy Policy Division; Science, Technology and Innovation Directorate / Administrateur - Observatoire des politiques d'intelligence artificielle, Division de la politique de l'économie numérique, Direction de la science, de la technologie et de l'innovation  in case of unavailability to be deputised by / en cas d'indisponibilité pour être suppléé par  Ms Laura GALINDO - Consultant, Artificial Intelligence Policy Observatory, Digital Economy Policy Division; Science, Technology and Innovation Directorate / Consultante, Observatoire des politiques d'intelligence artificielle, Division de la politique de l'économie numérique, Direction de la science, de la technologie et de l'innovation	OCDE
OSCE (Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe)	Ms Julia HAAS - Assistant Project Officer, Office of the Representative on Freedom of the Media	OSCE

**Observer States to the CAHAI / Etats observateurs au CAHAI**

Canada	Ms Lesia STANGRET - Legal Specialist, Criminal, Security and Diplomatic Law Division, Global Affairs Canada, Government of Canada / Spécialiste juridique, Direction du droit criminel, du droit de la sécurité et du droit diplomatique, Affaires mondiales Canada, Gouvernement du Canada	Canada
Israel	Mr Cedric (Yehuda) SABBAH - Director, International Cybersecurity & IT Law, Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law), Ministry of Justice, Israel / Directeur, Cybersécurité internationale et droit des technologies de l'information, Bureau du procureur général adjoint (droit international), Ministère de la Justice, Israël	Israël
Mexico	Mr Joel GOMEZ TREVIÑO - Dr. - Founding Chairman of the Mexican Academy of Digital Law (AMDI), Chairman of the Digital Law and Privacy Committee of the National Association of Corporate Lawyers (ANADE). / Président fondateur de l'Académie mexicaine de droit informatique (AMDI), Président du Comité sur le droit informatique et la protection de la vie privée de l'Association nationale des avocats d'entreprise (ANADE)	Mexique
United States	Mr Yann AGERT - Consular and Political Assistant / Adjoint aux affaires consulaires et politiques	Etats Unis

**OBSERVERS ADMITTED TO THE CAHAI / OBSERVATEURS ADMIS AU CAHAI**

European Network of National Human Rights Institutions (ENNHRI)	Ms Marya AKHTAR - Chief Legal Advisor, LL.M., The Danish Institute for Human Rights / Conseiller juridique en chef, LL.M., L'Institut danois des droits de l'homme	Réseau européen des institutions nationales des droits de l'homme (ENNHRI)
---	--	--

**Council of Europe partner Internet companies / Entreprises internet partenaires du Conseil de l'Europe**

ICCO (International Communications Consultancy Organisation)	Ms Christina FORSGÅRD - Senior Partner, Founder of Netprofile in Finland / Associé principal, fondateur de Netprofile en Finlande  in case of unavailability to be deputised by / en cas d'indisponibilité pour être suppléé par  Mr Juergen H. GANGOLY - Managing Partner, The Skills Group GmbH, Austria	ICCO
---	--	------

IEEE (Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers)	Mr Nicolas ECONOMOU - Chair, Law Committee, IEEE Global Initiative on Ethics of Autonomous and Intelligent Systems  in case of unavailability to be deputised by / en cas d'indisponibilité pour être suppléé par  Ms Clara NEPPEL - Dr, Senior Director, European Business Operations / Directeur principal, Opérations commerciales européennes	IEEE
RIPE NCC	Ms Athina FRAGKOULI - Chief Legal Officer, RIPE Network Coordination Centre (NCC)	RIPE NCC
Telefónica	Ms Paloma VILLA MATEOS - Manager, Public Policy and Internet / Gestionnaire, Politique publique et Internet	Telefónica

**Civil Society Organisations, other private sector and academic actors relevant to the work of the CAHAI / Organisations de la Société civile, autres acteurs du secteur privé et académique, concernés par les travaux du CAHAI**

Access Now	Mr Daniel LEUFER - Europe Policy Analyst / Analyste des politiques européennes	Access Now
AI Transparency Institute	Ms Eva THELISSON – CEO / PDG	AI Transparency Institute
AlgorithmWatch	Mr Matthias SPIELKAMP - Co-founder of the AlgorithmWatch platform / Co-fondateur de la plateforme AlgorithmWatch  in case of unavailability to be deputised by / en cas d'indisponibilité pour être suppléé par  Ms Angela MÜLLER, Senior Policy & Advocacy Manager / Responsable principal de la politique et du soutien aux intérêts	AlgorithmWatch
ALLAI	Ms Catelijne MULLER – President ALLAI	ALLAI
EEEI	Mr Robert RANQUET - Vice President Public Affairs – AI / Vice-président des affaires publiques – IA	EEEI
Homo Digitalis	Mr Eleftherios CHELIOUDAKIS - Co-founder and Secretary of the Board of Directors / Co-fondateur et secrétaire du conseil d'administration	Homo Digitalis
MediaLaws	Mr Marco BASSINI – Postdoctoral Researcher and Professor of IT Law, Bocconi University - Vice Editor-in-Chief, MediaLaws / Chercheur postdoctoral et professeur de droit des technologies de l'information, Université Bocconi - Vice-rédacteur en chef, MediaLaws  in case of unavailability to be deputised by / en cas d'indisponibilité pour être suppléé par  Mr Oreste POLLICINO - Full Professor of Constitutional Law and Media Law, Bocconi University / Member of the Management Board of the EU Fundamental Rights Agency  or / ou  Mr Giovanni DE GREGORIO - PhD Candidate, Milan State University - Bicocca and Research Fellow in Media Law, Bocconi University	MediaLaws

### Independent Experts / Experts indépendants

Belgium	Ms Nathalie SMUHA, Researcher - Department of International & European Law, KU Leuven, Member of the OECD Network of Experts on AI (ONE AI), Former Coordinator of the EC High-Level Expert Group on AI / Chercheur - Département de droit international et européen, KU Leuven, membre du réseau d'experts de l'OCDE sur l'IA (ONE AI), ancien coordinateur du groupe d'experts de haut niveau de la CE sur l'IA	Belgique
---------	---	----------