

**Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination,
Diversity and Inclusion - CDADI**



CDADI (2023)11

26.05.2023

BUREAU OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE ON ANTI-DISCRIMINATION, DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION

5th meeting, 3-4 May 2023

Council of Europe office in Paris 55, avenue Kléber, F - 75784 Paris Cedex 16

Report

1. The Bureau of the Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI) held its fifth meeting on 3-4 May 2023 at the Council of Europe office in Paris. The participants in attendance are listed in [Appendix I](#).

ITEM 1: Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda

2. The Bureau adopted the agenda as it appears in [Appendix II](#).

ITEM 2: Developments since the 6th CDADI plenary meeting

3. The Secretary of the CDADI recalled that at its 6th plenary meeting from 29 November – 1 December 2022 the CDADI had transmitted the following to the Committee of Ministers: the Committee of Experts on Roma and Traveller Issues (ADI-ROM)'s Mid-Term Review Report on the Implementation of the Strategic Action Plan for Roma and Traveller Inclusion (2020-2025) and the ADI-ROM's Thematic report on Legislation and policies related to begging, with special focus on children (Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina, 13-15 October 2021).

ITEM 3: Overview about the work to be done during the biennium 2022/2023 and onwards

4. The Head of the Anti-Discrimination Department gave an overview of the next steps in the biennium 2022/2023 and onwards. The 4th Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe would take place in Reykjavík on 16 and 17 May 2023. The Secretary General would take account of the outcomes of the summit and of the online exchange that the CDADI held on 23 March 2023 on its future priorities and prepare a proposal for priorities for the next four years. Discussions on the Programme and Budget were expected to start in September 2023. It was recalled that at the online exchange of views in March 2023, all areas in which the CDADI worked were well supported and covered, that there was wide support for the existing deliverables for 2024 and 2025 and for a balanced set of proposals of new deliverables for 2026 and 2027. The report of that meeting is attached to the present report as Appendix III.
5. The Secretary to the CDADI presented the work plan, highlighting that many deliverables had an end point of December 2023 and that some would already fall due for adoption at the 7th plenary meeting of the CDADI from 27-29 June 2023.

ITEM 4: Preparation of the agenda for the 7th CDADI meeting - Work on main deliverables by expert committees and working groups

6. The Chair of the Committee of Experts on Intercultural Integration of Migrants (ADI-INT), Peter KARIUKI, updated on the progress of the work of the ADI-INT, whose next meeting would take place in Strasbourg on 4-5 May 2023. Two new members would be welcomed: Conny BRÄNNBERG (Västra Götaland, Sweden), designated at the CDADI's 6th plenary meeting, and Zahra NIAZI (Bradford, United Kingdom), appointed by the CDADI by written procedure in March 2023. The ADI-INT planned to discuss the tools developed to support the implementation of CM/Rec (2022)10 on multi-level policies and governance for intercultural integration, notably, a compendium of good practices on intercultural integration and multilevel governance, a training manual on equality data collection and analysis to prevent and address systemic discrimination and a draft background paper and a list of indicators for a future multilevel governance index. It would also aim at adopting a Feasibility study on a new legal and/or benchmarking instrument on comprehensive strategies for inclusion. The compendium of good practices, the training manual, and the feasibility study would be presented for adoption at the 7th CDADI meeting. The Chair of the ADI-INT envisaged a presentation of the background to the multilevel governance index.

7. The Chair of the Committee of Experts on Hate Crime (PC/ADI-CH), Stephanie ÖNER, updated the Bureau on the status of the draft comprehensive Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers on combating hate crime following the third meeting of the PC/ADI-CH from 30-31 March 2023 in Strasbourg. The committee examined the text, taking into consideration all comments received between December 2022 and February 2023 from member states, participants and observers. Among other changes, the draft now benefited from a revised and clearer definition of hate crime. The committee also approved the personal characteristics and statuses as proposed by the CDADI at its 6th plenary meeting, including sexual orientation, gender identity and expression, and sex characteristics. The main text and the Explanatory Memorandum would be revised by the Secretariat and the independent experts in the light of the discussions of the PC/ADI-CH before submitting the main text to a public consultation foreseen for mid-May to end of June this year. Additional work would be carried out prior to the fourth meeting of the PC/ADI-CH in October, in particular with regard to the comments received during the public consultation. It was suggested to have a joint meeting between the CDADI and the CDPC in December to ensure that the Recommendation could be smoothly adopted by both committees.
8. The Chair of the Committee of Experts on Roma and Traveller Issues (ADI-ROM), Jan Hero, assisted by the Secretariat of the ADI-ROM, updated the Bureau on the progress of deliverables of the ADI-ROM. First, the Draft Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers on Equality for Roma and Traveller women and girls was advancing well. Following its presentation and discussion at the next meeting of the ADI-ROM, it was foreseen to send a the draft to CDADI members for written comments by 5 June 2023. Second, the Feasibility study on desegregation and inclusion policies and practices in the field of education including Roma and Traveller children was underway and an outline would be presented first to the ADI-ROM and then to the CDADI at their upcoming meetings. For the work on the Capacity-building programme and tools supporting the implementation of CM/Rec(2020)2 on the inclusion of the history of Roma and/or Travellers in school curricula and teaching materials, it had been decided that the experts would focus on three work packages: a mapping study to identify the existing good practices; the elaboration of methodological guidelines for the inclusion of Roma and Traveller history in schooling; and a practical tool for education on Roma Holocaust and other historical persecutions of Roma and Travellers. Fourth, the preparation of the Handbook on democratic governance and representation and participation of Roma and Travellers in public and political life would be discussed at the forthcoming ADI-ROM meeting and some member States had already expressed interest in joining an ad-hoc working group. Finally, from 21-23 February 2023, the ADI-ROM had undertaken a thematic visit on substance use: prevention and treatment in hard to reach communities, hosted by Poland. The draft thematic report would be presented to the ADI-ROM at its upcoming meeting for adoption and then submitted to the CDADI. For the 7th plenary meeting of the CDADI, it was agreed to organise an exchange of views and artistic and cultural event with the European Roma Institute for Arts and Culture (ERIAC).
9. The Co-Secretary to the CDADI presented the progress made on the draft Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers on active political participation of national minority youth. At the fourth meeting of the working group (GT-ADI-MIN) on 27-28 March 2023, the text was finalised, and all comments received from members, participants and observers in January 2023 were considered, as well as comments received from a written public consultation and during online focus group consultations with representatives of national minority youth. The draft recommendation was ready for adoption at the 7th plenary meeting.
10. It was recalled that the CDADI is, according to its Terms of Reference, tasked to assess its working methods regarding the deliverables on national minorities and minority and regional languages in the light of its experience within the framework of the mid-term review of the Programme and

Budget in 2023. An exchange of views on this issue had been taken place at the fourth meeting of the GT-ADI-MIN in order to prepare the discussions on this topic at the 7th plenary meeting.

11. The Chair of the CDADI working group on sexual orientation and gender identity (GT-ADI-SOGI) Georgia WOLFF, updated the Bureau on the progress of the work of the GT-ADI-SOGI. The 3rd working group meeting would take place on 12 May 2023 in Reykjavík, Iceland. The draft of the 2nd thematic review report of CM/Rec(2010)5 on Hate crimes and other hate-motivated incidents based on sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics (SOGIESC) in Europe would be finalised during that meeting. The 3rd Annual thematic review of CM/Rec (2010)5 on the topic of LGBTI people's access to healthcare was underway. An outline of the European report would be sent to the GT-ADI-SOGI for comments in writing by summer 2023 and a European roundtable would be organised in Strasbourg before 14 November. Second, the SOGI unit was beginning to implement the new methodology for the comprehensive review of CM/Rec(2010)5 as approved by the CDADI at its 6th plenary meeting. It was planned that the questionnaires would be finalised by the first quarter of 2024, which should then be completed by member states by the end of June 2024. Finally, a roadmap of the draft recommendation on equality for intersex persons would be presented to the GT-ADI-SOGI at its upcoming meeting to establish a drafting group and clarify the drafting process. An outline of the Recommendation would be prepared and adopted by the GT-ADI-SOGI at its 4th meeting in November and then presented to the CDADI at its 8th plenary meeting in December 2023 for approval.
12. Menno ETTEMA, of the No Hate Speech and Cooperation Unit, updated the Bureau on the deliverables related to CM/Rec(2022)16 on combating hate speech. Building on the results of the survey on preventing and combating hate speech, that had been carried out in the CDADI and the Steering Committee for Media and Information Society (CDMSI), a report on promising practices in these fields will be prepared, as foreseen in the Terms of Reference of the CDADI. The survey had also helped to prepare, as agreed at the 6th CDADI meeting, a Study on hate speech in times of crisis. It is foreseen to present this study at the 7th plenary meeting of the CDADI with a view to its adoption. Finally, the Bureau discussed the establishment of a small working group composed of 2-3 CDADI members to carry forward, together with the Secretariat, the further deliverables that the CDADI is tasked to prepare relating to the implementation of the CM/Rec(2022)16.
13. The Vice-President of the CDADI provided an update on the progress of the work of the joint task force with the Gender Equality Commission (GEC) on artificial intelligence, equality and discrimination. The comments received in the written consultation with members, participants and observers of the GEC and the CDADI in January 2023 had been considered by the Secretariat and the external consultants and appropriate substantive changes to the study had been made. The task force wished to ensure consistency with the developing Council of Europe and European Union legal framework. The GEC would have their plenary meeting already at the end of May, so the study would be circulated with CDADI members, participants and observers shortly to ensure a smooth process for adoption in both the committees. The Co-Secretary to the CDADI briefly updated the Bureau members as to the developments in the Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI) and the negotiation of the egal instrument on the development, design, and application of artificial intelligence the CAI is in charge of.

ITEM 5 - Draft agenda for the 7th CDADI meeting

14. The Secretariat presented the draft agenda for the 7th CDADI meeting and the Bureau agreed with its contents.

ITEM 6 – Preparation of elections

15. The Bureau discussed the appointment of Rapporteurs and in particular the appointment of a Rapporteur to participate in the work of the new Expert Committee on Violence Prevention (ENF-VAE), which will be established under the Steering Committee for the Rights of the Child (CDENF) and be responsible for preparing a feasibility study on sex and relationship education.

ITEM 7 – Requests for observer status

16. The Bureau considered the lists of observers that have been admitted to the CDADI and its substructures and the balance of those lists.

ITEM 8 – Date of the next plenary and bureau meeting (2024)

17. It was agreed that the 9th plenary meeting would, so far as possible, take place in person in spring 2024. The Bureau meeting should then take place approximately 8 weeks before. The exact place and date needed further consideration.

ITEM 9 – Any other business

18. The agreed pronunciation of the CDADI was to be discussed at the next plenary meeting.

Appendix I

List of Participants / Liste de participant(e)s

BUREAU MEMBERS / MEMBRES DU BUREAU

FRANCE

Sophie ÉLIZÉON, PRÉSIDENTE

Préfète, déléguée interministérielle à la lutte contre le racisme, l'antisémitisme et la haine anti-LGBT (DILCRAH), Paris

SWEDEN/SUÈDE

Erik ADELL HELLSTRÖM, VICE PRESIDENT

EU and International Affairs Coordinator, Division for Discrimination Issues, Human Rights and Child Rights Policy, Ministry of Employment, Stockholm

CROATIA/CROATIE

Alen TAHIRI

Director, Government Office for Human Rights and Rights of National Minorities, Zagreb ***Excused***

PORTUGAL

Cristina MILAGRE

Adjointe du Cabinet de la Secrétaire d'état à l'intégration et aux Migrations

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME UNI

Georgia WOLFF, Senior International LGBT+ Policy Adviser, Government Equalities Office, London,
GT-ADI-SOGI Chair

INVITED SPEAKERS / INTERVENANTS

Jan HERO, ADI-ROM Chair

Peter KARIUKI, ADI-INT Chair

Stephanie ÖNER, PC/ADI-CH Chair

SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT

Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity / Direction générale de la Démocratie et de la dignité humaine

Hallvard GORSETH, Head of the Anti-discrimination Department and of the Roma and Travellers Team a.i. / Chef de Service de l'anti-discrimination et de l'Equipe Roms et Gens du Voyage a.i.

Wolfram BECHTEL, Secretary of the CDADI, Anti-discrimination Department / Secrétaire du CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Charlotte GILMARTIN, Co-Secretary of the CDADI, Anti-discrimination Department / Co-Secrétaire du CDADI, Service de l'anti-discrimination

Eleni TSETSEKOU, Secretary of the ADI-ROM, Head of Division of the Roma and Travellers Team /
Sécrétaire du ADI-ROM, Chef de division de l'Equipe Roms et des Gens du Voyage

Thorsten AFFLERBACH, Head of the Anti-discrimination and Cooperation Division / *Chef de la division Anti-discrimination et coopération*

Ivana D'ALESSANDRO, Secretary of the ADI-INT, Head of the ICC Unit / *Sécrétaire du ADI-INT, Chef de l'unité ICC*

Stefano VALENTI, Co-Secretary of the PC/ADI-CH, Head of No Hate Speech and Cooperation Unit, Directorate of Anti-discrimination / *Co-sécrétaire du PC/ADI-CH, Chef de l'unité Non au discours de haine et coopération, Direction de l'anti-discrimination*

Menno ETTEMA, No Hate Speech and Cooperation Unit, Directorate of Anti-discrimination / *Unité Non au discours de haine et coopération, Direction de l'anti-discrimination*

Evgenia GIAKOUMOPOULOU, Secretary of the GT-ADI-SOGI, Head of the SOGI Unit, Directorate of Anti-discrimination / *Sécrétaire du GT-ADI-SOGI Chef de l'unité SOGI, Direction de l'anti-discrimination*

Ellsworth CAMILLERI, SOGI Unit, Anti-discrimination and Cooperation Division, Anti-discrimination Department / *l'unité SOGI, division Anti-discrimination et coopération, Service de l'anti-discrimination*

Petra NEUMANN, Seconded official, Co-Secretary of the ADI-ROM, Roma and Travellers Team, Anti-discrimination Department / *Mis à disposition, Co-Secrétaire de l'ADI-ROM, Equipe Roms et Gens du Voyage, Service de l'anti-discrimination*

Ljiljana STOJISAVLJEVIC, Assistant to the Secretary of the CDADI, Anti-discrimination Department / Assistante au secrétaire du CDADI, *Service de l'anti-discrimination*

Appendix II

Agenda

1. Opening of the Bureau meeting and adoption of the agenda
2. Developments since the 6th CDADI plenary meeting
3. Overview about the work to be done during the biennium 2022/2023 and onwards
 - Terms of Reference, Information by Hallvard GORSETH, Head of the Anti-Discrimination Department
 - CDADI Workplan
4. Preparation of the 7th CDADI meeting (27-29 June in Strasbourg) - Work on main deliverables by expert committees and working groups
 - i. Information on progress of the work of the ADI-INT
 - 1. Capacity-building programme and tools supporting implementation of CM/Rec on multi-level policies and governance for intercultural integration
 - 2. Feasibility study on a new legal and/or benchmarking instrument on comprehensive strategies for inclusion
 - ii. Information on progress of the work of the PC/ADI-CH
 - iii. Information on progress of work of the ADI-ROM
 - 1. Draft CM/Rec on equality for Roma and Traveller women and girls
 - 2. Feasibility study on desegregation and inclusion policies and practices in the field of education including Roma and Traveller children
 - 3. Capacity -building programme and tools supporting implementation of CM/Rec(2020)2 on the inclusion of the history of Roma and/or Travellers in school curricula and teaching materials
 - 4. Handbook on democratic governance and representation and participation of Roma and Travellers in public and political life
 - 5. Thematic reports of the ADI-ROM
 - iv. Presentation of the draft CM/Rec on active political participation of national minority youth (GT-ADI-MIN)
 - v. Assessment of the working methods regarding the deliverables on national

minorities and minority and regional languages

- vi. Information on progress of the work of the GT-ADI-SOGI
 - 1. Second thematic implementation review report on CM/Rec(2010)5
 - 2. Preparations for third thematic implementation review report on CM/Rec(2010)5
 - 3. Methodology for comprehensive implementation review of CM/Rec(2010)5
- vii. Work related to CM/Rec(2022)16 on combating hate speech
 - 1. Draft study on preventing and combating hate speech in times of crisis
 - 2. Terms of Reference for a working group responsible for preparing deliverables regarding the implementation of CM/Rec(2022)16
- viii. Information on progress of work of the joint task-force with GEC on AI, equality and discrimination by the Secretariat
- 4. Draft agenda for the 7th CDADI meeting
- 5. Preparation of elections
- 6. Requests for observer status
- 7. Date of the next Plenary and Bureau meeting (2024)
- 8. Any other business

Appendix III

Exchange of views on CDADI future priorities and Terms of Reference

23 March 2023

I. Opening of the meeting and introduction

1. The Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI) held an exchange of views on its priorities and terms of reference for the years 2024-2027 via videoconference hosted from Strasbourg on 23 March 2023.
2. The Vice-Chair of the CDADI, Erik ADELL HELLSTRÖM, chaired the meeting and recalled that it had been organised to exchange suggestions for the work programme of the CDADI and its substructures for the years 2024-2027.
3. Hallvard GORSETH, Head of Anti-Discrimination Department, provided further information on the process of developing the mandate for the years 2024-2027. It was recalled that the 4th Summit of the heads of states and governments of the 46 member states of the Council of Europe would take place in May 2023 in Reykjavik, Iceland. The Committee of Ministers had asked the Secretary General to prepare a new Programme and Budget for the organisation, including new terms of reference for the intergovernmental committees from 2024 – 2027.

II. Discussion of suggestions of minor changes for the period 2024-2025

4. The Vice-Chair invited CDADI members, participants and observers to express in the first part of the exchange their views on the existing mandate for the period 2024-2025. During the subsequent discussion, CDADI members, participants and observers made the following contributions:
 - (i) Overall, delegations expressed their continued support for the existing terms of reference for 2024 and 2025 and suggested that only minor changes would be needed.
 - (ii) It was suggested that the new mandate of the CDADI should contain a link to democracy, for example in the introduction, to explicitly communicate the important contribution of the CDADI's work to the functioning of democracy and to ensuring that minority groups can participate in public life.
 - (iii) Delegations stressed the need to continue the work on hate speech. Following the adoption of Recommendation CM/Rec(2022)16 of the Committee of Ministers to the member States on combating hate speech, the CDADI should continue to support member states with its implementation, including developing tools and reviewing good practices. The links between hate speech and hate crime were acknowledged and suggestions were made to work on the implementation of the recommendation on combating hate crime as soon as it was expected to be adopted, namely, from 2024 onwards.
 - (iv) Delegations emphasised the importance of the CDADI's work in the field of artificial

intelligence systems, their potential for promoting equality – including gender equality – and the risks they may cause in relation to non-discrimination (jointly with the GEC) and in particular the foreseen drafting of a Committee of Ministers recommendation on this topic by an expert committee. It was suggested that one of the topics to explore could be equal access to technology.

- (v) The importance of the continuation of the work in the field of intercultural integration and inclusion was stressed. In particular, the Committee of Experts on Intercultural Integration of Migrants (ADI-INT) should continue its work on the Capacity building programme and tools for migrant integration supporting the implementation of CM Recommendation (2022)10 on Multilevel policies and governance for intercultural integration at national level and take initiatives and awareness-raising activities for their dissemination and implementation. Its broader work on strategies for inclusion would also be very useful and important for member states.
- (vi) Support was expressed for the continuation of GT-ADI-SOGI's deliverables as planned. The ongoing work on the comprehensive review of the implementation of Recommendation/CM Rec (2010)5 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and thematic reviews, and the draft recommendation on the equality of rights of intersex persons, were important. Several delegations emphasised their wish to see the working group transformed into an expert committee.
- (vii) Delegations underlined the need to continue the work related to Roma and Travellers, including by contributing to the implementation of the Council of Europe's Strategic Action Plan for Roma and Traveller Inclusion (2020-2025), the preparation of a new Council of Europe strategic action plan for Roma and Traveller inclusion (2026-2030), the ongoing work on promoting equality for Roma and Traveller women and girls and through thematic visits and reports.
- (viii) Delegations and participants also stressed the importance of the CDADI's work in the field of national minority and minority language protection. It would be important to carry on the work currently undertaken as part of the drafting of a Committee of Ministers Recommendation on the active political participation of national minority youth. Several delegations and the representative of the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages underlined the importance of intergovernmental work on national minority language protection and the identification of good practices in member States, as foreseen in the current terms of reference. Referring to the recent changes in the Council of Europe membership, several members suggested deleting the foreseen study on the risk of discrimination and impediments to full access to rights resulting from statelessness.

III. Discussion of suggestions for the mandate for the period 2026 – 2027

5. The Vice-Chair subsequently invited CDADI members, participants and observers to express their views on the future priorities and mandate for the period 2026-2027. During the subsequent discussion, CDADI members, participants and observers made the following contributions:
 - (i) Delegations expressed support for a study into intersectional discrimination to pave

the way for a potential Committee of Ministers Recommendation in this field. This was an important issue which played a role in many areas under the CDADI's mandate. It was suggested that intersectional discrimination should also be an aspect in the work on other deliverables.

- (ii) Delegations stressed the need to continue the work on hate speech, in particular in continuing to support member states by developing tools and reviewing good practices. Once the draft Committee of Ministers recommendation on combating hate crime was adopted, it was suggested that deliverables should focus on promising practices and tools for implementation at national level by member States.
- (iii) It was felt that further work in the field of artificial intelligence systems, equality and non-discrimination was important and that subject to a recommendation being adopted in this field, tools to assist member states in implementation would be beneficial.
- (iv) Delegations supported the continuation of the ADI-INT's broader work on inclusion, including through developing a guidance document for strategies for inclusion and working on the concept and methodology for a peer learning and benchmarking tool on strategies for inclusion. It was proposed that desegregation, including spatial and other forms of segregation in the framework of intercultural integration policies should be studied.
- (v) It was proposed that the GT-ADI-SOGI should develop a new strategy on equality of the rights of LGTBIQ+ persons and explore discrimination and violence on grounds of gender expression. It was also suggested to explore how to strengthen social participation by LGTBI persons in various fields including sports, education and democracy.
- (vi) Delegations expressed support for the continuation of the ADI-ROM's work, and notably to its preparing of a new Council of Europe strategic action plan for Roma and Traveller inclusion (2026-2030) and preparing a mid-term review report of that strategy.
- (vii) Several delegations supported a study on data collection and good practices in this area in relation to the rights of persons belonging to national minorities and the use of regional or minority languages.
- (viii) An observers also proposed to explore institutional or structural discrimination, which could be relevant for more than one of the deliverables, and to explore equality impact assessments, plans and duties, the environmental crisis and its impact on minority/disadvantaged groups, and sanctions in discrimination cases.

IV. Any other business and closing remarks

6. The Vice-President informed the committee that a new ADI-INT member should be appointed before the next ADI-INT meeting on 4 and 5 May 2023 and suggested to submit the Secretariat's proposal for tacit approval in writing. No interventions were made.
7. The Vice-Chair thanked members, participants and observers for a rich exchange to develop the new mandate of the CDADI and its substructures.