



Strasbourg, 9 April 2020

CDCPP-Bu(2020)2
Item 4.1 of the agenda

**BUREAU OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE FOR
CULTURE, HERITAGE AND LANDSCAPE
(CDCPP)**

CULTURE

**Draft Manifesto on Arts, Culture, Cultural Heritage and Freedom of Expression
in the Digital Era, and Concept for a Council of Europe
Digital #Exhibition featuring works of art from member States to promote the
importance of freedom of artistic expression**

Preview of a publication on E-Relevance of Arts and Culture in the Age of AI

**Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends -
Interim Report 30 March 2020**

Cultural Policy Peer Reviews – North Macedonia

For information and action

Secretariat Memorandum
prepared by the
Directorate of Democratic Participation
Culture, Nature and Heritage Department

I. **Draft Manifesto on Arts, Culture, Cultural Heritage and Freedom of Expression in the Digital Era, and Concept for a Council of Europe Digital #Exhibition featuring works of art from member States to promote the importance of freedom of artistic expression**

Introduction

On the occasion of the 70th anniversary of the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) and given the ongoing need to defend freedom of expression as a fundamental human right to ensure the protection of democratic values in society, the Secretariat, in consultation with the Steering Committee for Culture, Heritage and Landscape (CDCPP), proposes to launch a **Manifesto** on Arts, Culture, Cultural Heritage and Freedom of Expression in the Digital Era and to set up a new Council of Europe **Digital #exhibition** on this issue.

The Manifesto and exhibition concept are results of the work of an *ad-hoc* group of experts, to which the Chair and Vice-Chair of the CDCPP contributed. The Manifesto is a topical résumé of the debate on the role of arts and artistic freedom in current times and a strong appeal to respect this freedom as part of the legal framework of the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR). The digital @exhibition will feature works of art from Council of Europe member States, with a view to promoting the importance of freedom of artistic expression and the role of art, culture and heritage in these times when democracy is under great pressure from the regional and global challenges relating to political, economic, technological and environmental issues¹.

The project is a follow-up to the [30th Council of Europe Art Exhibition](#) “The Desire for Freedom: Art in Europe since 1945” (2012-15), drawing attention to the interrelation of the sector's work with the core values of the Council of Europe and specifically, with the right for freedom of expression as expressed in Article 10 of the ECHR, and thus the sector's contribution to upholding Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law.

¹ Massive disinformation on the internet and the fabrication of myths, the spread of far-right movements, growing inequality, the degradation of the environment and climate change as a result of CO₂ emissions, to name but a few.

FIRST DRAFT BY AN EXPERT GROUP
(JAROSLAV ANDEL, GIULIANA DE-FRANCESCO,
KATA KRASZNAHORKAI, MARY ANN DEVLIEG,
SARA WHYATT, SUPPORTED BY LEVAN KHARATISHVILI)
FOR THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE,
22 MARCH 2020

MANIFESTO
BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE
FOR CULTURE, HERITAGE AND
LANDSCAPE (CDCPP) ON THE
FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION OF
ARTS/CULTURE/HERITAGE IN
THE DIGITAL ERA

This Manifesto was published on 30 June 2020 on the occasion of the 9th Plenary Session of the CDCPP in Strasbourg, France and in the framework of the 70th anniversary of the European Convention on Human Rights.

The Council of Europe is the oldest and only pan-European body ensuring Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law for 830 million citizens in Europe. It does so by means of the 1950 European Convention on Human Rights and the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) that was established in 1959. Over the years, a multitude of legal, monitoring, capacity building and awareness raising instruments have been added to this *acquis* in the policy sectors relevant for ensuring the respect for, and implementation of, human rights in the daily life of Europeans.

With democracy under great pressure from the regional and global challenges relating to political, economic, technological and environmental issues², the 70th anniversary of the ECHR is a good time to highlight the key role of arts, culture and heritage as powerful tools for maintaining constructive dialogue in democratic and open societies.

It is frequently the artists and cultural of workers who hint at problems, spell out uncomfortable truths, speak the unspoken, make the unseen visible – using their artistic and cultural means as formidable communication tools, and creating spaces for societal debate beyond the mainstream bodies of political discourse and the chatrooms social media.

Article 10 of the ECHR protects the right to Freedom of Expression, including freedom of artistic expression. In recent years, with democracy facing increasing challenges, there is evidence of growing interference from state bodies in the freedom of artistic expression³, and also interference from elements of civil society, who take illegal action on the European continent – the continent that strongly identifies with common values and its long-standing democratic traditions. Freedom of expression, including artistic freedom, is globally the most significant and consequential export of the European continent. Therefore, based on the Statutes of the Organisation and mindful of the Council of Europe's role as a platform for constructive dialogue and successful intergovernmental co-operation in the cultural field since 1954 (European Cultural Convention), the Steering Committee for Culture, Heritage and Landscape is keen to emphasise that:

- Human Rights are indivisible. Freedom of expression is a core human right.
- Freedom of expression needs to be protected, be it from abuse of technological developments, attempts to muzzle dissenting voices in a society and misuse of the freedom of expression to foster divisive narratives, intolerance and hate;
- Artistic and creative expression is a part of the freedom of expression and artists must be protected against pressure or threat when opposing anti-democratic narratives and extremist agendas, when being intimidated, silenced or coerced into self-censorship;
- Restrictions on freedom of expression and artistic freedom affect the whole of society, bereaving it of its pluralism and the vitality of the democratic process. The ecosystem of artistic freedom affects education, cultural development and socio-economic standards;
- It is the diversity of cultures, languages, art forms and free artistic expressions that nourishes intercultural dialogue and co-operation and pushes societies to further develop and integrate their diversities. Freedom of expression is reflected in a diverse and stimulating artistic and cultural environment and contributes to mutual understanding;

² Massive disinformation on the internet and the fabrication of myths, the spread of far-right movements, growing inequality, the degradation of the environment and climate change as a result of CO₂ emissions, to name but a few.

³ For details of attacks on artistic freedom, visit the following organisations social media and web sites: Freemuse - www.freemuse.org; PEN International - www.pen-international.org, Index on Censorship - www.indexoncensorship.org; Artists at Risk Connection - www.artistsatriskconnection.org

- Artistic freedom drives curiosity, creativity, innovation, self-realisation, critical thinking and those competences that will be increasingly required for mediating between humans and technologies: arts and culture are central for paving the human-centred way to the future that will be marked by machine-intelligence and man-machine interaction;
- Arts and culture emphasise, express, communicate and anticipate the human reaction to social changes, and provide connections between economic/technological logics and sustainable development. Creativity and diverse cultural expressions, triggered by artistic freedom and freedom of expression, are then catalysts for creating sustainable development planning and policies;
- The power of artistic expression to communicate and transform makes the artist, artistic mobility and artistic freedom strategic resources for society, helping to overcome fragmentation and addressing today's planetary challenges;
- In these difficult times marked by the COVID 19 crisis and where artists' and the cultural sector's revenue generation is severely affected by confinement measures and where at the same time the importance of arts and culture becomes ever more visible as societal resources to keep people included, connected and inspired, it is important to include artists and the cultural sector as beneficiaries of economic support packages made available by states;
- Today's artists and cultural workers are producing the heritage of tomorrow, frequently linking the past, present and future in their acts and products. Their work inspires by anticipating, reflecting on society and memorializing, strengthening individual and collective identities and raising democratic consciousness;
- To pay tribute to the key role of arts, culture and the work of artists in the ongoing endeavour to uphold Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law, and in line with the 30th Council of Europe Art Exhibition "The Desire for Freedom: Art in Europe since 1945" (2012-15), the Organisation is invited to dedicate a digital #exhibition to showcase works of art and culture from its member States⁴ that speak directly of the ongoing quest for freedom of expression and that feature artists as critical agents for the survival of vibrant democracies in the globalised society of today.

⁴ The selection of the national exhibits would be organised in a multi-stakeholder consultation process, involving civil society and art professionals. The exhibition would be digitally reproduced in interested member States and also on show at the Council of Europe premises. Further activities – including networking with other international bodies and organisations on this initiative – could be developed in the future.

**Concept for a digital #exhibition “Free to Create, Create to be Free”
organised by the Council of Europe,
featuring works of art from member States
to promote the importance of freedom of artistic expression**

Introduction

On the occasion of the 70th anniversary of the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), in consultation with the Steering Committee for Culture, Heritage and Landscape (CDCPP), it is proposed to set up a new Council of Europe digital #exhibition “**Free to Create, Create to be Free**”.

The project is a follow-up to the [30th Council of Europe Art Exhibition](#) “The Desire for Freedom: Art in Europe since 1945” (2012-15), drawing attention to the significance of arts and culture and their interrelation with the right for freedom of expression, as expressed in Article 10 of the ECHR, in upholding Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law. A digital exhibition is the next step in re-evaluating classic exhibitions for the needs of the 21st century. It provides a fresh view promoting the importance of freedom of artistic expression and the role of art, culture and heritage in these times when democracy is under great pressure from the regional and global challenges relating to political, economic, technological and environmental issues⁵. It also provides a new, innovative means to communicate on and disseminate Council of Europe values.

As the COVID-19-crisis has already shown, freedom of artistic expression is systemically relevant for functioning democracies and arts and culture are essential for well-being, fostering democratic processes and raising awareness for human rights. Accessibility and outreach of arts and culture can be widened exponentially by the Council of Europe's digital #exhibition.

This concept presents the general aims and objectives behind this project, as well as guidelines and proposals for the works of art exhibited.

Aims and objectives

By creating a digital #exhibition with works of art by artists from member States, the Council of Europe offers an opportunity to its member States to:

1. demonstrate the interrelation between art, culture, heritage and freedom of expression as a fundamental human right, and thus highlighting the significance of the role of arts, culture, heritage and creativity in promoting human rights and fostering democratic values in society;
2. facilitate the mutual understanding of different perspectives reflecting various applications of freedom of artistic expression and representing the diversities of cultural expressions by engaging with artistic works from a multitude of member States;
3. raise the level of debate and transnational exchange on the topic of freedom of expression, encouraging member States to formulate creative solutions and supportive reactions in their own countries;
4. constitute a better understanding of the challenges relating to freedom of expression and human rights in today's society, by inspiring critical reflection on artistic freedom related to political, economic, technological and environmental issues;
5. make full use of the great potential and opportunities of digital technologies for wide-spread communication on the exhibition and its featured art works, as well as for innovative creations, creative processes and new productions;
6. offer forward-looking formats on how to present visibility for artists working on major questions of today's societies linking the presentation of artistic practice with a communication- and interactive reflection-space.

⁵ Massive disinformation on the internet and the fabrication of myths, the spread of far-right movements, growing inequality, the degradation of the environment and climate change as a result of CO₂ emissions, to name but a few.

Guidelines

The digital #exhibition would be organised by the Council of Europe, providing complete global digital access. The exhibition would also be displayed at the Palais de l'Europe in Strasbourg.

Participating member States are invited to agree on the following parameters:

- The exhibition will include one to two artistic works per participating member State and specifically feature the works offered by the incoming and outgoing member State holding the Chairmanship of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers;
- The selection of the national exhibit will be organised in a multi-stakeholder consultation process, involving civil society and art professionals. Thus, the process would result in co-operation between government (Ministry of Culture) and independent cultural organisations, curators or other institutions in the field of arts and culture;
- The digital #exhibition will be accessible everywhere and specifically made available in museums and other relevant cultural institutions in interested member States;
- Access to the digital #exhibition will also be offered in different locations at the Council of Europe's headquarters.

Ensuring a long-lasting legacy as an effective outcome of the exhibition, all exhibits will be documented online. A digital sourcebook describing and contextualising the works of art and related material regarding the topic of freedom of artistic expression will be free to download on the digital #exhibition space hosted by the Council of Europe's culture/heritage website, enhancing further international co-operation in this area. Each presentation of the member States is documented in a magazine, that would cumulate in an overall sourcebook on the theme, serving as a basis for further exhibitions and research in this area for policy makers.

Proposals for the works of art

In order to ensure a diverse programme and create an inviting and dynamic centre attracting a wider audience, the framework for the works of art should remain open in terms of content and concept, allowing member States to select freely and reward diversity and creativity, while at the same time keeping in mind the main theme: freedom of artistic expression.⁶

Themes for the national exhibit could be chosen with regards to relevant issues concerning freedom of expression in the country itself, highlighting the subject for the respective country. The themes could also be planned in conjunction with the work of art from the next country to hold the Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers.

Consulting a curator or a curatorial collective is strongly recommended, considering the effective planning of an artistic concept and the selection of appropriate exhibits. Curators may be specialised individuals, curatorial collectives or artists.

Establishing a Board overseeing, channelling and coordinating the digital #exhibition for the whole duration of the project would be helpful.

⁶ Further specifications defining concrete regulations for the exhibition, technical and spatial features, as well as financial considerations, will be determined by the Council of Europe and made available to member States on the culture/heritage website.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- welcome the opportunity to contribute to the 70th anniversary of the European Convention on Human Rights by means of a Manifesto on Arts, Culture, Cultural Heritage and Freedom of Expression in the Digital Era and a concept of a digital #exhibition by the Council of Europe, featuring works of art from member States, with a view to promoting the importance of freedom of artistic expression;
- exchange on the Manifesto and the suggested aims, objectives and guidelines regarding the concept for the digital exhibition with a view to submitting the texts for launch at the CDCPP plenary session;
- mobilise member States and other stakeholders to support the Manifesto and contribute actively to the implementation of the digital #exhibition by providing, in digital format, national works of art that promote the freedom of expression and by providing voluntary contributions for the realisation of the project.

II. Preview of a publication on E-Relevance of Arts and Culture in the Age of Artificial Intelligence

Following the thought-provoking Rijeka expert seminar (12-13 October 2018) on "Culture, creativity and artificial intelligence" and the Helsinki conference "Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of Artificial Intelligence development on Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law", work is ongoing on a Council of Europe publication on culture, arts and AI.

Internet specialist Vuk Ćosić is acting as editor, and artist Vladan Joler⁷ designing the book. The Council of Europe's publishing house is advising on the project and will issue the publication in summer 2020, on the occasion of the CDCPP plenary.

The publication brings together the insights from the above-mentioned Council of Europe events and combines them with academic and theoretical-speculative essays and literature, an art catalogue, illustrations of best practices of AI applications in the areas of culture, arts and heritage and examples of critical art.

Contributors and their texts include Vuk Ćosić (introduction), Matteo Pasquinelli (Grammar of Error for AI), Regine Debatty (5 blog post on art & AI), Felix Stalder (Algorhythmicity), Gerfried Stocker (Rethinking the Techno-logos), Kate Crawford & Vladan Joler (Anatomy of an AI System), James Bridle (Cloud), Lev Manovich (Defining AI arts), Joana Moll (Deep Carbon), Bruce Sterling (The Beachcomber of Novi Kotor), Andreas Broeckmann (Names and Myths of Technologies), Anne Faucheret & Vanessa Joan Müller (Quotes), Hito Steyerl & Kate Crawford (Data Streams).

The publication will echo the Council of Europe's messages that AI must be developed in a human-centric manner and in line with the principles of human rights, democracy and rule of law, respecting existing landmark international instruments to produce benefits for individuals and for societies.

Effective supervisory mechanisms and democratic oversight structures may be needed vis-à-vis the design, development and deployment of AI and for the effective and legitimate prevention of human rights violations and to thwart discrimination, inequality and bias. Public awareness of the potential risks and benefits of AI must be enhanced, and necessary new competencies and skills developed.

⁷ Author, together with Kate Crawford, of the exhibition "Anatomy of an AI System" that was shown at the Victoria and Albert Museum in London and at Council of Europe events in Rijeka, Helsinki and a 2019 PACE session.

In this endeavour, sector-specific recommendations and guidelines are important. Culture and the arts are particularly well placed to communicate complex subject matters, inform, alert, educate, reflect, contextualise, raise interest and offer playful ways of acquainting oneself with innovation. The book is meant to be widely distributed, including through dedicated institutions such as Ars Electronica with their international networks and outreach.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- welcome the forthcoming launch of the publication “E-Relevance – the Role of Arts and Culture in the Age of AI” at the plenary session of the CDCPP and ensure its dissemination with interested stakeholders at national level;
- emphasise the sector's role in the debate about artificial intelligence and as vectors in generating the social intelligence and emancipation to accompany new life practices marked by increasing human-machine interaction and hence the pertinence of the Committee's work on culture, digitisation and AI as a contribution to the Council of Europe's work on AI.

III. Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends - Interim Report 30 March 2020 (in the form of a newsletter)

COVID-19

The COVID-19 pandemic forced cultural institutions and venues around the world to close their doors, leaving hundreds and thousands of cultural events cancelled and even more people without work and income. Although the total effect on the cultural sector remains unclear, the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends monitors current developments regarding COVID-19 and the cultural field.

The Compendium mobilised its expert authors to gather country specific information on the implications for the sector and the current measures being taken. The responses received are presented on [Culturalpolicies.net](https://culturalpolicies.net) and updated frequently. Currently, there is information on the impact and measures of COVID-19 on the cultural sector for 13 countries: Croatia, North Macedonia, UK, Malta, Czech Republic, France, Estonia, The Netherlands, Spain, Finland, Ireland, Norway and Portugal. The Compendium is also collecting and curating online cultural initiatives related to the current COVID-19 crisis. This separate and sector specific list can be found [here](#) and will be expanded on a regular basis too.

Country profiles

In 2019, the new grid structure for the country profiles was completed. Since the beginning of the year the Compendium has published the long country profiles of Lithuania, Germany, Bulgaria and the UK. Following in the next few months will be Poland, Romania, Scotland, Belgium (Flanders), Italy, Estonia, Croatia and Ireland.

The Compendium has determined a new and more concise structure to the short profiles and in April and May will also be focusing on updating and expanding these for the following countries: the Netherlands, Lithuania, Romania, Bulgaria, Germany, UK, Poland, Estonia, Spain, Latvia and Austria.

Environmental sustainability and culture

At the beginning of the year, the Compendium made inquiries into the policy measures and practices within arts and culture regarding environmental sustainability. The publication of these outcomes has been postponed due to the urgency to focus on the COVID-19 crisis. However, it is planned to publish this information in due course.

Communication and impact

The website of the Compendium remains the central point around which all communication regarding the associations revolves. In 2020, it made it a point to update news on a weekly basis and the monthly newsletter is now much more informed by current news from within the Compendium community. Especially the Compendium's efforts and quick response in curating information in times of COVID-19 have led to a growth in the system's social media and website interaction.

In the first three months of this year, the Compendium had over 40 000 page views and 7 000 users. The monthly newsletter reaches over 4 000 readers, and its reach continues to grow with several new subscriptions each week.

Members and partners

It goes without saying that the above-mentioned points each play a part in solidifying memberships and attracting new ones. The Compendium is pleased to announce that The Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports of Georgia has become a new member of the Association.

Annual Compendium Assembly

The Annual Assembly in 2020 is (so far) still planned to be held in Bucharest, Romania from 23-25 September. The theme, content and speakers were being finalised when the COVID-19 pandemic took over. The Association will update its stakeholders on the annual assembly as soon as possible.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- welcome the developments regarding the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends;
- invite member States and interested cultural policy research institutions to become Stakeholder members of the new Association;
- encourage interested parties to attend the 2020 Compendium Assembly on 23-25 September in Bucharest, Romania (please inform: office@culturalpolicies.net).

IV. Cultural Policy Peer Review of North Macedonia

In 2019, the Government of North Macedonia asked the Secretariat to carry out a Cultural Policy Peer Review on the topic of developing cultural and creative industries and enhancing regional co-operation, with a view also to accessing European funding in this area.

The review was planned to take place in Skopje from 17 to 20 March 2020 in collaboration with the Ministry of Culture of North Macedonia, but given the circumstances, had to be postponed (new dates still to be confirmed). The review team comprises three independent experts including a lead expert, as well as five regional neighbouring contributors (from Albania, Bulgaria, Greece, Kosovo⁸, Romania) and a member of the Council of Europe Secretariat.

⁸ "All reference to Kosovo, whether to the territory, institutions or population, in this text shall be understood in full compliance with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and without prejudice to the status of Kosovo."

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- note the forthcoming cultural policy peer review of North Macedonia, in the framework of the Council of Europe's programme of policy reviews and legal assistance to member States in the fields of culture and heritage;
- notify the Committee and Secretariat of any interest in undertaking similar reviews in individual countries, as provisions are made in the 2020/21 Council of Europe Programme and Budget to accommodate such policy peer reviews.