



Strasbourg, 25 March 2019

CDCPP-Bu(2019)3
Item 4.1 of the agenda

**BUREAU OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE
FOR CULTURE, HERITAGE AND LANDSCAPE
(CDCPP)**

CULTURE

Promoting the CoE's Recommendations on culture and digitisation

**Follow-up to the expert seminar "E-relevance of culture in the age of AI" in the
framework of the high-level conference
"Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on
Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law"
(Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019) and conference conclusions**

Cultural Policy Review of the Republic of Moldova

**Progress report on the Association of the Compendium
of Cultural Policies and Trends**

**Follow-up to the Council of Europe's Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy
(IFCD)**

For information and action

Secretariat Memorandum
prepared by the
Directorate of Democratic Participation
Culture, Nature and Heritage Department

This document is public. It will not be distributed at the meeting. Please bring this copy.

I. Promoting the CoE's Recommendations on culture and digitisation

The Committee of Ministers adopted Recommendation CM/Rec(2018)10 on "Culture's contribution to strengthening the internet as an emancipatory force" at its 1329th meeting on 14 November 2018. A pack has been produced to disseminate this new Recommendation, together with the two previous texts generated by the CDCPP, namely Recommendation CM/Rec (2016)2 on the Internet of Citizens and Recommendation CM/Rec (2017)8 on Big Data for Culture, Literacy and Democracy. The pack can be made available to member States upon request.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- raise awareness on and disseminate the culture and digitisation Recommendations pack to cultural and educational policy makers and other interested stakeholders at national level.

II. Follow-up to the expert seminar "E-relevance of culture in the age of AI" in the framework of the high-level conference "Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law" (Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019) and conference conclusions

As a contribution from the cultural sector, the conclusions and action proposals derived from the Rijeka expert seminar (12-13 October 2018) on culture, creativity and artificial intelligence were presented at a side-event *E-relevance of Education and Culture in the Age of AI*. (see <https://www.coe.int/en/web/culture-and-heritage/-/e-relevance-of-culture-in-the-age-of-ai>) as part of the "AI in Action" sessions of the high-level conference "Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law (Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019). In addition, the exhibition *Anatomy of an AI System* by Vladan Joler and Kate Crawford was offered as a contribution from the culture sector, adding a thought-provoking visual element to the high-level debates. Later this year, the exhibition will be on display at the Council of Europe, possibly related to the CDCPP plenary session and/or a session of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe.

The Helsinki conference "Governing the Game Changer" concluded that more research, understanding, trust and transparency are needed with regard to the complex challenge of AI, as well as multi-stakeholder cooperation. Specific conclusions are available at <https://rm.coe.int/conclusions-from-the-conference/168093368c> and underline (selective list) that timely and thoughtful policy responses should be placed at the top of governments' political agenda and AI should be developed in a human-centric manner and in line with the principles of human rights, democracy and rule of law and respecting existing landmark international instruments to produce benefits for individuals and for societies. There is also a need for effective supervisory mechanisms and democratic oversight structures regarding the design, development and deployment of AI and for effective and legitimate mechanisms to prevent human rights violations and thwart discrimination, inequality and bias. Public awareness of the potential risks and benefits of AI must be enhanced and necessary new competencies and skills developed. The Council of Europe should continue to develop sector-specific recommendations, guidelines and codes of conduct to promote human rights and the viability of democratic institutions and processes, as it should monitor the impact of AI on the collective foundations of democratic societies.

The essential contributions by arts and culture to the deliberations about our common technology-influenced future, both in terms of realistic insight (through critical media art) and sense of direction (reflexive and holistic approach) and the challenges and opportunities related to AI applications in the cultural and heritage sector deserve further investigation. Based on the contributions to the Rijeka expert seminar, a reader is being produced to gather insights and inspire possible further initiatives by the Council of Europe and relevant stakeholders in the cultural/heritage area. The publication should be available at the CDCPP plenary session in June 2019.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- note the results of the High-level conference "Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law" (Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019) and the cultural sector's contribution to it;
- emphasise arts' and culture's important role in the debate about artificial intelligence and as vectors in generating the social intelligence and emancipation to accompany new life practices marked by increasing human-machine interaction and hence the pertinence of the Committee's work on culture, digitisation and AI;
- welcome the production of a reader on the Rijeka expert seminar on culture, creativity and artificial intelligence, for presentation at the CDCPP's plenary session.

III. Cultural policy review of the Republic of Moldova

The Ministry of Education, Culture and Research of the Republic of Moldova has asked for a Cultural Policy Peer Review to be carried out in 2019 on the topic of "culture industries and regional development: maximizing the impact and building a new sustainable model".

The Cultural Policy Peer Review aims at:

1. identifying policy options and measurement indicators to help local and regional governments to increase the development impact of culture and participation, and conceive new ways to measure the impact of culture and migration on local development so as to effectively channel public and private funding;
2. identifying good practices – examples of "what works" and "what doesn't" to maximize the impacts; creating linkages between the cultural institutions and the local economy and social fabric; implications for a wide spectrum of policies ranging from culture and tourism to employment and skills, business development, innovation and spatial planning;
3. proposing recommendations for policies in the area of culture and cultural industries, employment and skills, business development, IT, innovation and spatial planning;
4. proposing new governance arrangements and funding models and looking at how work is organised within cultural institutions, including human resources and funding.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- note the forthcoming targeted cultural policy peer review in the Republic of Moldova in the framework of the Council of Europe programme of policy reviews and legal assistance to member States in the fields of culture and heritage.

IV. Progress report on the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends

After the transition into a multi-Stakeholder Association in October 2017, the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends can now look back on its first full year in this capacity (in 2018).

Main accomplishments include:

- the renewal of 9 national cultural policy profiles on the Compendium's website; Culturalpolicies.net;
- the inclusion of 8 cultural policy profiles from the Arab region;
- the re-design of the Compendium's methodological structure on which the country profiles are based;
- an accuracy check and general update of the platform's online content and statistics;
- implementation of a new and more elaborate communications strategy;
- a very successful first Assembly as an Association in Rijeka, Croatia (9-11 October 2018);
- acquisition of 18 Stakeholder and Standing members.

In addition, many Compendium countries are currently working on updating their cultural policy information along the lines of the newly adopted methodology.

Membership and financial status

The Compendium is proud to have acquired so many members in such a short time, as it considers this as a token of belief in the platform's necessity and ambitions. However, even though the amount of Stakeholder members raised is enough to cover the cost of running the Compendium's daily operation, their number is unfortunately insufficient to help the Compendium realise a much-needed redevelopment, namely the renewal of its website Culturalpolicies.net. Consequently, the Compendium now finds itself in a catch-22 situation: without a new website to showcase the treasure trove of international cultural policy information on offer, it lacks clear 'proof' of the purpose and possibilities of the platform – and therefore diminishes the understanding of what candidate Stakeholder members would be participating in exactly.

In order to maintain the renewal of national cultural policy profiles and commission for the redevelopment of Culturalpolicies.net, the Compendium will have to raise an additional 40,000 to 50,000 euros in 2019. The Compendium Association's board and Service providing team are trying hard to acquire the necessary funds, or the additional four or five Stakeholder members needed to achieve these goals. The Chair of the Compendium Association's board, Marjo Mäenpää and the Compendium's Executive Director Helen Johnson will attend the CDCPP's plenary session on 12-14 June to report on possible developments regarding the Compendium's situation.

Second Assembly of the Association

The Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends will hold its second Assembly as an Association in Paris on 5-6 June 2019. This Assembly will be hosted by the French Ministry of Culture – also a Compendium Stakeholder, in the framework of the French Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe. The topic of interest will be "Imagining the Cultural Policy Future" and was chosen by the Compendium's community of expert authors. During the annual General Assembly meeting, the Compendium's members will be informed on and involved in the Association's developments and the conference will conclude with a Public Forum on 7 June, that will focus on the effects of digitisation on cultural policy.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- welcome the developments regarding the new Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends;
- invite member States and interested cultural policy research institutions to become Stakeholder members of the new Association and encourage interested parties to attend the 2019 Compendium Assembly (inform: office@culturalpolicies.net);
- thank the French government for hosting the second Assembly of the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends on 5-6 June 2019 in the framework of its Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe;
- note the forthcoming reporting on the project by the Chair and Executive Director of the Compendium Association at the CDCPP plenary session.

V. Follow-up to the Council of Europe's Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy (IFCD)

Following suspension of the work on the Council of Europe's IFCD, linked to a decision on budget cuts by the Committee of Ministers in April 2018¹, efforts have aimed at consolidating the existing IFCD project, so as to limit the loss of previous investments and ensure that other interested parties can optimally use the related tools.

In this respect, the following activities were carried out:

- a complete update of the Policy Maker's Guidebook to be launched in spring as the second edition of the online publication (see <https://www.coe.int/en/web/culture-and-heritage/indicators-culture-and-democracy>);
- production of a comprehensive report that traces the methodological development of the IFCD from 2013 to 2017;
- production of a report on the IFCD transfer workshop of November 2018² and
- agreement on the legal aspects related to the transfer of the IFCD project to the University of Administrative Sciences of Speyer, drawn up by the Council of Europe's Legal Advice Department in March 2019.

¹ This preceded the launch of the SG's 2018 Report on the State of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law in May that quotes IFCD findings in Chapter V, Inclusive Societies:

"According to analyses carried out by the Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy (IFCD) in 2017 where people are more involved in cultural life, especially by creating or performing art and participating in cultural activities, confidence in political institutions such as parliaments, government and the judiciary tends to be higher. Trust in the governing system goes along with individuals' feelings of security, which might free people to participate in cultural activities and create. Moreover, participation in cultural life strengthens an individual's feeling of belonging to the system, and thus engenders greater trust in its institutions. Participation in cultural life thrives under conditions of what could be called "good governance". Analysis of the IFCD data in 2017 shows that levels of cultural participation are higher where judicial impartiality and independence, quality of the legal system, transparency, and government checks and balances are stronger."

² The transfer from the Hertie School of Governance to the University of Administrative Science Speyer became necessary due to lack of resources at the Hertie School to carry the project forward.

The opportunity arose for the University of Speyer to apply, in a Consortium with a number of leading European Research Institutions, for a Horizon2020 funded grant (under TRANSFORMATIONS-08: The societal value of culture and the impact of cultural policies in Europe). The suggested research project "DNA Culture" will focus on generating new data and quantitative indicators, thereby building on existing indicator frameworks, i.e. the IFCD, and developing an integrated data platform which will openly share the data and knowledge generated. The Council of Europe supported the application and will follow the project with interest should it be awarded a grant. This would allow the IFCD to be kept alive in a useful context and in line with the ambitions of the Council of Europe Conference of Ministers of Culture of 2013 that initiated the work on an Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy.

The Compendium Association has joined the "DNA Culture" Research Consortium and it is expected that that this step will allow further synergies, eventually benefiting researchers and policy makers alike in their quest to showcase the societal value of culture and the impact of cultural policies in Europe.

Action required

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- take note of the developments regarding the IFCD and underline the importance of the project in demonstrating the societal and political value of culture to governments and other stakeholders.