



Strasbourg, 5 November 2018

CDCPP-Bu(2018)8 rev2  
Item 4.1 of the agenda

**BUREAU OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE  
FOR CULTURE, HERITAGE AND LANDSCAPE  
(CDCPP)**

**CULTURE**

**Recommendation on culture's contribution to strengthening the  
internet as an emancipatory force**

**Expert seminar on Culture, Creativity and Artificial Intelligence  
(E-relevance of culture in the age of AI)**

**First Assembly of the Association of the  
Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends**

**Cultural Policy Reviews of Georgia  
and the Republic of Moldova**

For information and action

Secretariat Memorandum  
prepared by the  
Directorate of Democratic Participation  
Culture, Nature and Heritage Department

## **I. COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS' RECOMMENDATION ON CULTURE'S CONTRIBUTION TO STRENGTHENING THE INTERNET AS AN EMANCIPATORY FORCE**

The Committee of Ministers' draft Recommendation on "Culture's contribution to strengthening the internet as an emancipatory force" is the result of follow-up work by experts and CDCPP members on the 4<sup>th</sup> Council of Europe Platform Exchange on Culture and Digitisation in October 2017 at the Center for Art and Media (ZKM) in Karlsruhe, Germany. The event examined how digital cultural tools can be used to empower culturally competent citizens and fight populism, fake news, xenophobia and hence foster democracy.

The text was examined at the meeting of the Committee of Ministers' Rapporteur Group Education, Culture, Sport, Youth and Environment (GR-C) on 23 October 2018 as appendix III to the Abridged Report of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the CDCPP (6-8 June 2018). Following adoption by silent procedure by 26 October, the GR-C will transmit the Recommendation for adoption by the Ministers' Deputies at their 1329<sup>th</sup> meeting on 14 November 2018.

### **Action required**

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- welcome the forthcoming adoption of the Committee of Ministers' Recommendation on culture's contribution to strengthening the internet as an emancipatory force;
- disseminate it widely at national level with policy makers and other interested stakeholders, including as a package with the previous texts overseen by the CDCPP (Recommendation CM/Rec (2016)2 on the Internet of Citizens and Recommendation CM/Rec (2017)8 on Big Data for Culture, Literacy and Democracy).

## **II. EXPERT SEMINAR ON CULTURE, CREATIVITY AND ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE ("E-RELEVANCE OF CULTURE IN THE AGE OF AI"), RIJEKA, CROATIA, 12-13 OCTOBER 2018**

### Initial conclusions

1. Arts & Culture need to be part of the dialogue about information society (be it about digital transformation at large, or AI in particular).
2. Arts & Culture are providing essential contributions to the deliberations about our common technology-influenced future, both in terms of realistic insight (through critical media art) and sense of direction (reflexive and holistic approach).
3. Arts & Culture stimulate active engagement and creativity in citizens and hence diversity in production, against the odds of global cultural standardisation and homogenisation.

4. Arts & Culture are an irreplaceable means of expression of the human genius, its infinite innate inventiveness and creativity, its power of self-determination and its manifest human rights.
5. Arts & Culture are key vectors in generating the necessary social intelligence and emancipation to accompany new life practices marked by increasing human-machine interaction.

#### *Summary of the debates held*

The seminar explored the role and relevance of arts, culture and communication/public dialogue about technologies in the age of AI. Actually, it searched the "cultural-ethical DNA of AI" and naturally revolved much around the digital challenges of society - beyond its main focus on AI issues.

Debates among leading researchers, artists, policy makers and practitioners highlighted that artists and cultural workers make an important contribution, by providing critical analyses and a sceptical approach as a basis for a broader awareness of the challenges and opportunities implied in AI. An exhibition on the life and death of an AI system (Vladan Joler) illustrated the quality of the artistic approach: seeing the whole picture, using presentation and communication forms which are less available for scientists, making complex things visible and providing language for the unbelievable, unspeakable. The exhibition also showcased the immense human labour and exploitation of resources - mostly in other parts of the world - that is behind, and within AI applications.

Artists and cultural workers can elaborate alternative models of development, with a cultural agenda - beyond economic/commercial logics. They are able to reveal a multiplicity of readings, narratives and views and they attract media attention. As the seminar agreed, they will not easily be replaced by machines "although some AI generated art work looks more convincing than work shown at the Art Basel", as one expert underlined. Yet, people seem to appreciate the physical presence of a human, the imperfection of human creation and the concepts, narration, intention, effort and biographical context coming from humans.

However, AI might have a substantial impact on cultural and creative industries (music, film, journalism, design,...), challenging prevailing business models. Also, power inequalities in terms of representation may grow, due to uneven archival traditions in different world regions: cultures with strong archival traditions will be able to better feed the data needs of AI systems and hence be more "present" in global perception and markets.

A current initiative in Rijeka to teach AI about a threatened local language may serve as good practice and inspire similar initiatives at protecting and promoting European cultural diversity. Such initiatives would deserve European funding and support. Hence, combining high-quality business and technology assets with ethics and values would provide the competitive edge for a (also commercially successful) European model that should be self-confident since built on long-standing values rather than mere commercial rules.

In all this, communication was key. Mostly, people still seemed to be either fearing loss of control through AI, or simply ignoring the challenges involved. There was also a mythological dimension to AI and at the same time, a rational one: people voted for being operated on by robots rather than doctors, given the higher success rates of AI-based surgery. But when it comes to the nursery, people clearly preferred the human touch.

### **Action required**

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- take note of the results of the Rijeka expert seminar on Culture, Creativity and Artificial Intelligence to be conveyed to the Council of Europe's forthcoming conference "Governing the Game Changer – Implications of AI development on human rights, democracy and the rule of law" (Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019);
- thank the Government of Croatia for having hosted the Rijeka expert seminar in the framework of its Presidency of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe;
- underline the pertinence of the Committee's work on culture and digitisation issues, and its interest in continuing with this work strand in the future (2020/2021).

### **III. FIRST ASSEMBLY OF THE ASSOCIATION OF THE COMPENDIUM OF CULTURAL POLICIES AND TRENDS (CCPT), RIJEKA, CROATIA, 9-11 OCTOBER 2018**

Subsequent to the creation of the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends (on 21 October 2017 in the Netherlands) to manage the Compendium project following a 1½ year negotiation process between the Compendium stakeholders (member States, the Council of Europe, ERICarts, Compendium authors, academics and cultural institutions), the new body has successfully started its work.

The Association is a self-sustaining structure<sup>1</sup>, comprising a Board, a General Assembly, an Assembly of Compendium Experts and a Service Provider. It enables its members<sup>2</sup> full involvement in the running of this unique and ambitious online information system.

#### *The Compendium Association's first General Assembly*

The first General Assembly of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends' Association in Rijeka, Croatia (9-11 October) was successful. Dr Ernst Wagner, Chairman of the European Network of Observatories in the Field of Arts and Cultural Education (ENO) held an opening keynote speech in which he stressed the importance of cultural education in turbulent times: 'Cultural education contributes to the appreciation of cultural diversity, but that isn't recognised by all. We need clear definitions and discourses and the Compendium can contribute to that.'

---

<sup>1</sup> Members, comprising member States and cultural research institutions, as well as potentially universities, pay an annual membership fee (stakeholder members €10 000 and standing members €2 000) which puts an end to the previous need for ad hoc project fundraising.

<sup>2</sup> The Association's members to date comprise Austria, Asia-Europe Foundation, Belgium/Kunstenpunt, Council of Europe, Croatia, Cyprus, ERICarts, European Cultural Foundation, ECURES, Finland/Cupore, France, Germany/KuPoGe, Latvia, the Netherlands, Romania/Culturadata, Sweden/Kulturanalys Norden and Switzerland/BAK. Since then, requests regarding future membership have been made by Albania, The Observatory of the Economy of Culture (Bulgaria) and Lithuania. In addition, the CCPT is sponsored by the Dutch Ministry of Culture, who donated a contribution of €50 000 in 2018.

At the end of the first day, the Board of the ACE (the Assembly of Compendium Experts) was set up. Veronika Ratzenböck (Austria) was appointed Chair, Dorota Ilczuk (Poland) appointed Vice-Chair and Andrej Srakar (Slovenia) will be Secretary. Ms Ratzenböck will also act as the Compendium Association's 7th Board member and will in this capacity represent the Compendium's expert community.

The Compendium's executive director Helen Johnson gave a presentation on the Association's first year and future plans. Since the founding of the Association, 17 Ministries of Culture and institutions have become members. In 2018, ten country profiles have been, or will be, updated and a grid renewal process was initiated. Ms Johnson also provided a glimpse of the designs for a new Compendium website that will be developed in 2019. During the General Assembly meeting, the Association's work plan and budget for 2019 were approved. The proposed finalisation of the Grid development process and the appointment procedure for new experts were also discussed and approved. New Expert Authors for Albania, Denmark, Ireland, Portugal and Sweden were presented.

Lastly, the Board announced future collaboration with parties such as the European Cultural Foundation (ECF), the Asia-Europe Foundation (ASEF), the European Network of Observatories in the Field of Arts and Cultural Education, ENO and presented the changes within its own constituent body: Kathrin Merkle will henceforth replace Siobhan Montgomery (both CoE), who was thanked for all her efforts as the Board's first Vice-Chair. Jean-Cédric Delvainquière (France) will become Vice-Chair and Carmen Croitoru (Romania) will be Secretary of the Board. The Board will continue to meet as often as is necessary to ensure the smooth functioning of the Association and the Compendium database.

### **Action required**

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- take note of the positive developments regarding the new Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends;
- invite member States and interested cultural policy research institutions to become stakeholder- or standing members of the new Association;
- thank the Dutch government for the substantial financial support given to the Compendium and the Boekman Foundation in Amsterdam for acting as Service Provider;
- thank the government of Croatia for having hosted the 1<sup>st</sup> Assembly of the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends in the framework of its Presidency of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe;
- thank the French government for inviting the second General Assembly of the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends to Paris in June 2019, in the framework of the French Presidency of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.

## **IV. CULTURAL POLICY REVIEWS OF GEORGIA AND THE REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA**

### *Work achieved*

The Georgian Ministry of Culture asked for a Cultural Policy Peer Review to be carried out in 2018, with a view to reforming the highly complex Georgian Arts Education System, consisting of formal and non-formal education institutions and out-of-school elements.

The Peer Review visit was carried out in July 2018 involving governmental experts (Finland, Poland, Spain) and independent ones. The expert group interviewed some 100 Georgian stakeholders from the field of arts education, music, fine arts, film, science, policy making and creative industries. It compiled the review report including recommendations, and sent it to the Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport in September 2018.

Georgia has recently undergone a re-organisation involving the merger of the Ministry of Education and Science with the Ministry of Culture and Sport. This new setting offers opportunities for enhanced synergies between culture and education that can indeed be beneficial for coping with the needs of increasing globalisation, while fostering inclusive societies, culture-based creativity and a creative economy as a main driver of economic development in the 21st century.

The Georgian case might inspire other countries seeking to enhance the interaction between cultural and educational policy and strategy for capacity building in modern societies. A one-day conference or expert seminar is envisaged on this topic in spring 2020, to be held in the framework of the Georgian Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.

### *Forthcoming work*

The Ministry of Education, Culture and Research of the Republic of Moldova has asked for a Cultural Policy Peer Review to be carried out in 2019 on the topic of "culture industries and regional development: maximizing the impact and building a new sustainable model".

The Cultural Policy Peer Review aims at:

1. Identifying policy options and measurement indicators to help local and regional governments to increase the development impact of culture and participation, and conceive new ways to measure the impact of culture and migration on local development so as to effectively channel public and private funding;
2. Identifying good practices - examples of "what works" and "what doesn't" to maximize the impacts, and creating linkages between the cultural institutions and the local economy and social fabric and the implications for a wide spectrum of policies ranging from culture and tourism to employment and skills, business development, innovation and spatial planning;
3. Proposing recommendations for policies in the area of culture and cultural industries, employment and skills, business development, IT, innovation and spatial planning;
4. Proposing new governance arrangements and funding models, and looking at how work is organised within cultural institutions, including human resources and funding.

**Action required**

The Bureau of the CDCPP is invited to:

- take note of the conclusions of the cultural policy peer review of Georgia;
- note the request by the Republic of Moldova for a targeted cultural policy review to be carried out in 2019;
- underline the pertinence of the Council of Europe's policy peer reviews and legal assistance to member States in the cultural and heritage sector and the need to adequately fund these activities through the Ordinary budget of the Organisation.