



Bradford

Intercultural Profile

September 2019

Introduction

This report is based on the visit to Bradford of the Council of Europe's expert team of Francesca Lionetti (Council of Europe), Niall Crowley, Anne Bathily, and Isobel Platts-Dunn (UK network of intercultural cities) on 12th and 13th September 2019. It should be read in conjunction with the 'Results of the Intercultural Cities Index' for Bradford, prepared in August 2019 by the Council of Europe. This report builds on the index results in prioritising and deepening a number of the initial recommendations made on foot of interaction on site in Bradford.

The Council of Europe has defined the intercultural city as encompassing people with different nationality, origin, language or religion/ belief, where:

- Political leaders and most citizens regard diversity positively, as a resource and accept that all cultures change as they encounter each other in the public arena. Therefore they advocate for a pluralistic city identity.
- The city actively combats discrimination and adapts its governance, institutions and services to the needs of a diverse population.
- The city has a strategy and tools to deal with diversity and cultural conflict and to enhance participation.
- The city encourages greater mixing and interaction between diverse groups in public spaces, as well as in civil society and in the business world¹.

Equality, diversity, and interaction are three inter-linked values that underpin the development and sustenance of an intercultural city²:

¹ The Intercultural City Step by Step: Practical guide for applying the urban model of urban integration, Revised Edition, Council of Europe, 2019.

² Bridging the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Agendas: Background paper, Intercultural Cities, Council of Europe, 2017.

- Equality: involves a commitment by the city to ensure equality and nondiscrimination in all their actions, towards their own workforce, in their relations with partners and suppliers, including civil society organisations and enterprises; and to direct policies and resources to everyone, based on need.
- Diversity: involves a commitment by the city to recognise and preserve diversity as an intrinsic feature of human communities; and to pursue the 'diversity advantage' that accrues from the presence of diversity when coupled with specific policies and strategies that enable diverse contributions to shape the cultural, economic and social fabric of the city, and to manage conflicts which may threaten community cohesion.
- Interaction: involves creating conditions for positive and constructive everyday encounters across cultural as well as gender, sexual identity, age, socio-economic status and other differences, where active engagement across difference, rather than benign indifference, is the necessary building block of a thriving society.

Bradford

Bradford Metropolitan District is the fifth largest local Metropolitan authority in the UK, with a population of 537,200. Bradford is the sixth largest city in the UK, with a multi-ethnic population. Bradford is the UK's youngest city, with 23.8% of the population under 16.

Bradford has a significant and growing economy. However, the latest Gross Value Added per head in Bradford is £18,756 (2017), which was lower than the regional and national averages. Gross value added is the measure of the value of goods and services produced in an area.

Bradford suffers from high levels of deprivation as well as having some of the highest rates of childhood illness in the UK. It is the fifth most income deprived area in the UK with just over a fifth of children and older people living in households experiencing poverty.

National Policy Context

The United Kingdom has a well-developed and long-established equality infrastructure of legislation and institutions. The Equality Act 2010 prohibits discrimination, harassment and sexual harassment in the workplace, education, the buying or renting of property, and the provisions of goods and services. It requires reasonable accommodation for people with disabilities, and allows positive action. It covers the grounds of age, gender reassignment, being married or in a civil partnership, being pregnant or on maternity leave, disability, religion or belief, sex, sexual orientation, and race, including colour, nationality, ethnic or national origin.

Innovatively, the Act imposes a duty on public authorities and bodies exercising public functions to have due regard to the need to: eliminate discrimination, harassment, victimisation, and any other prohibited conduct; advance equality of opportunity; and foster good relations. This requires:

- Ensuring policy and practice comply with the equal treatment legislation;
- Removing or minimising disadvantage experienced by people with protected characteristics; taking steps to meet needs specific to these people; and encouraging

these people to participate in public life or in any other activity where participation by their group is low; and

- Acting to tackle prejudice and promote understanding between people with protected characteristics and others.

Public authorities are required to publish information that demonstrates their compliance with the public sector duty, prepare and publish equality objectives to be achieved through the public sector duty, and conduct an equality impact assessment on draft policy (an implicit requirement in England).

The Integrated Communities Strategy Green Paper, published by government in 2018³, followed by publication of an Integrated Communities Action Plan in 2019 are the most recent policy developments of significance for this field⁴.

The Green Paper set out an understanding of integration as involving “communities where people, whatever their background, live, work, learn and socialise together, based on shared rights, responsibilities and opportunities. Communities where many religions, cultures and opinions are celebrated, underpinned by a shared set of British values that champion tolerance, freedom and equality of opportunity. A society in which everyone is a potential friend”.

This Green Paper identifies challenges of a “worrying number” of communities divided along race, faith or socio-economic lines, increased levels of recorded hate crime, and the Race Disparity Audit of public services results which show that “despite improvement in many areas, ethnic minorities have worse outcomes than White British people. But in some measures, it is White British people who are doing worst”.

The Integrated Communities Action Plan follows the seven themes established in the Green Paper of:

- Strengthen leadership: including public authority and business leadership;
- Supporting new migrants and resident communities: including promoting British values, strengthening English language requirements, information provision to migrants, and interventions with refugees;
- Education and young people: including promoting British values, expectations of integration in new free schools, school standards and inspections, school linking, mixing in areas of high segregation, and out-of-school settings.
- Boosting English language: including supports, guidance, provision and coordination.
- Places and communities: including building integrated communities, tracking usage of local assets, sport and physical activity to support integration, use of libraries, and safe, accessible and attractive green spaces.
- Increasing economic opportunity: including employment supports and childcare.
- Rights and freedoms: including a focus on marginalised women, marriage and forced marriage, hate speech and hate crime, and strengthening faith institutions, and the barriers faced by Gypsies, Roma, and Travellers.

³ Integrated Communities Strategy Green Paper: Building stronger, more united communities, HM Government, United Kingdom, 2018.

⁴ Integrated Communities Action Plan, HM Government, United Kingdom, 2019.

The plan emphasises action across these themes through the Integration Area programme. This was launched in March 2018 and involves five Integration Areas, of which Bradford is one, along with Blackburn with Darwen; Peterborough; Walsall; and Waltham Forest. In each area, a Local Integration Partnership, including the business, social, and faith sectors, is established to consult on, identify, and pursue local priorities. The pilot areas are to be funded until 2021. However, a further year's funding is now mooted.

Local diversity and policy context

Bradford has a multi-ethnic and multi-faith population. Data from the 2011 census offers some sense of this diversity. The largest proportion of the district's population (63.9%) identified themselves as White British. The largest minority groups in the city were Asian British Pakistani, representing 20.41%. 45.9% of the population identified as Christians and 24.7% as Muslims. 20.7% stated that they had no religion. In 2017, 3,781 new arrivals to Bradford came from 68 countries, with 57% from the EU and the top three nationalities being Pakistan, Poland and Romania. In March 2018, Bradford District was home to 819 asylum seekers.

The size of the Asian-British Pakistani population is the highest in the UK. This means that Bradford is often characterised as a binary population (White/Pakistani) rather than multidiverse. This characterisation does not capture the reality of Bradford and needs to be challenged where it arises.

Bradford Council is implementing its 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy as a pilot integration area under the Integrated Communities Action Plan. This establishes four pillars, with associated objectives, to be pursued by the Council:

- **Getting On:** Improve opportunities for those furthest away from the labour market enabling them to engage in the economy; Provide opportunities for anyone who wants to learn to speak, read and write so that they can fully participate in education, employment or life in the Bradford District; Improve coordination between partners and services so people have a fair chance.
- **Getting Along:** Influence schools to test new approaches to their School Admissions Policy; Increase social contact between people of different background including school age children providing opportunities for open dialogue and to learn from each other.
- **Getting Involved:** Increase social mixing across the district, widening exposure and opportunities in building friendships and networks; Provide safe spaces where difficult conversations can be held, and conflicts can be resolved.
- **Feeling Safe:** Reduce negative views and stereotypes that some of the District's residents hold about people who are different from themselves; Equip people with the skills to resolve conflict; Facilitate activities through the Safer Communities Partnership.

The implementation of the strategy is supported by a Delivery Plan of actions, which is funded by the Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government.

The strategy identifies strengths of: significant experience in promoting cohesion and opportunity; being the UK's youngest city; a strong and vibrant civil society sector; a culture of enterprise and industry; significant heritage and cultural assets; inclusive public realm; and strong partnerships. The strategy notes a number of challenges evident in Bradford District:

- Schools, noting the profile of local schools reflecting segregated residential patterns, poverty as a key factor impacting on education, and low take up of free early education places in disadvantaged areas.
- Residential, noting Bradford having the third highest level of residential segregation in England with nearly a third of wards having BAME population over 50%.
- Labour market, noting high levels of child poverty in areas with predominantly BAME population, entrenched poverty in predominantly poor white communities, low levels of economic participation, particularly for women, and particular difficulties for asylum seekers.
- Lack of English proficiency, noting some 4.8% of the population who do not speak English.
- Personal, religious and cultural norms, values and attitudes, noting the religious diversity of the area, low democratic participation, and the global composition of the population pointing to the potential for global conflict and national and regional incidents to create unease and tension.
- Lack of meaningful social mixing, noting 1,624 incidents of hate crime reported in the twelve months to December 2017, the city centre being a particular hotspot for such incidents, and strong evidence of Islamophobia and anti-Muslim sentiment.

The plan identifies its ambition to draw from other key mainstream strategies of the Council, in particular the economic strategy, the anti-poverty strategy, and the hate crime strategy.

The focus for the strategy is defined as integration, an integration that acknowledges that challenges vary from one place to another and is specific to place and community. The focus is broad, on society as a whole, and includes a commitment to ensure White British communities with generations of unemployment along with other poor communities and those most vulnerable to discrimination and marginalisation are included.

Commitment

There is strong, creative, and skilled commitment evident in Bradford Council to the intercultural city. The Council provides the key drive for the intercultural city process. A broader set of partner organisations has usefully been engaged.

The core agenda for Bradford Council as an intercultural city is valuably set by the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy. The approach to its development involved significant levels of participation with wide consultation. This strategy provides a firm foundation for realising the commitment to the intercultural city evident in the Council.

The strategy is described accurately as a development strategy rather than an equality or intercultural strategy. It does not name target groups and poses its commitments in a general manner. However, it is argued that implementation is data driven so the actual initiatives include and benefit all citizens according to their particular situation, and that this focus is sustained in the evaluation framework and indicators. A statement of outcomes sought with a specific naming of the intercultural dimensions to each of these would be a valuable addition.

The strategy emerges from the identification of Bradford as a pilot integration area under the Integrated Communities Action Plan. It is in receipt of vital Government funding up to 2021, with the possibility of a further year funding now emerging. The strategy is largely project-based. It includes an important innovation fund supporting thirteen projects. It involves a range of research initiatives and trialling activities. There is a challenge to address this project basis over time in a way that makes the results sustainable and embed the intercultural city as a long-term systemic focus for Bradford Council and other partner organisations.

Meeting this challenge will be assisted by the roles allocated for project team members in influencing strategy and policy across the various responsibilities of Bradford Council, in particular education, housing, planning and employment. The planned recruitment of a full-time Research Fellow focused on education and housing will further assist a more systemic dimension to emerge.

The 'Innovation Fund' is allocated using a democratic participatory budgeting approach involving the 'People Together' group and the partnership forum. Nine of the thirteen funded projects, under the first round allocation of £50,000, are identified as being from the 'Getting Along' strand of the strategy, with emphasis on social contact. Only one project is identified as being from the 'Getting On' strand of the strategy, with an emphasis on digital skills and resources for asylum seekers and refugees. Two projects each from the 'Feeling Safe' and the 'Getting Involved' strands are identified.

There is a strong institutional infrastructure established by Bradford Council to drive the strategy. This includes the 'Stronger Communities Partnership', 'People Together', the 'Stronger Communities Partner Forum', and a staff team of six.

The 'Stronger Communities Partnership' acts as the Board responsible for the strategy. It has an independent chair and includes members from the business sector, health sector, police, university, faith communities and voluntary and community sector. It has valuable convening

power in being able to draw in different stakeholders into the strategy and the issues it seeks to address.

The 'Stronger Communities Partner Forum' is established to assist organisations and small groups to connect with each other in relation to the fields covered by the strategy. It is open to anyone interested in these issues. It offers a mechanism to bring forward projects. It involves delivery partners, analysts and researchers, and voluntary and faith organisations.

This valuable institutional infra-structure is very much a project of Bradford Council, drawing in partners to the agenda developed in the strategy. This is positive but it will be important to stimulate and support the leadership of specific priority sectors to establish platforms for further action within their areas of responsibility. This would ensure that Bradford as an intercultural city is a form of co-production. For example, business associations could be stimulated to give some priority to this issue and to convene a business platform for peer support on and stimulus for good practice on intercultural workplaces.

The 'People Together' committee is drawn from the neighbourhoods with twenty-seven members, five from each neighbourhood and two representatives of young people. It has five representatives on the 'Stronger Communities Partnership'. It is described as 'a core element of our governance' and a 'shadow Board'. Its roles include support for community cohesion and communities working together and there is an approach to involve it in coproduction of initiatives. The link of members back into their community will be important for this structure to reach its full potential. This link is already well developed for some members, and is reported as being worked on by other members.

Bradford Council have assembled a team of six skilled and committed officers to implement the strategy. This team is a core resource in imagining and realising the intercultural city.

The 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy depends on the implementation and contribution of other Bradford Council strategies, such as the economic strategy and the anti-poverty strategy. Mainstreaming systems are, therefore, particularly important. Such systems will continue to be important with the development of further key strategies, specifically the 2040 Vision for Bradford District and the Bradford City of Culture project. The current approach to mainstreaming should be made more systematic.

The personal relationships, cross membership of committees, staff roles, and project structures, in particular the Stronger Communities Partnership Board all have a contribution to make to this mainstreaming challenge. In some instances, it can call on the equality impact assessment process under the public sector duty of the 2010 Equality Act. However, this process is not and does not have to be applied to all strategy development. A systematic commitment to mainstreaming an intercultural focus in all strategies, built on these foundations will be key to the impact of the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy.

The concept of the intercultural city could usefully be a focus for further debate and definition. Current definitions appear to emphasise interaction over the other dimensions to the intercultural city, and to focus on the individual member of the community over the groups that make up Bradford. While this emphasis and focus provides a valuable starting point, it

could be usefully deepened with a stronger emphasis on the dimensions of equality and diversity.

Education

Education is a key theme in the Government's Integrated Communities Action Plan. There is significant segregation in schools in Bradford which needs to be addressed as an intercultural city. Work on this has begun under the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018- 2023' strategy with a research project commissioned by Bradford Council to examine the role of admissions policies in desegregation. Further action will be needed and it will be important to build on this research initiative.

In the current context, school linking is particularly important, though linking cannot substitute for integrated education. Bradford boasts a particularly strong initiative in this regard. The Linking Network is a Bradford based charity that is funded by Bradford Council for work with schools in the area. The approach of the network is rooted in the curriculum, involves teacher training, and involves participation by the children over one year. It involves three exchanges, one in a neutral venue and one in each of two schools, alongside a range of contacts in between. The network has reached a target of 50% primary schools in the area. There is, however, a much lower rate of engagement with secondary schools.

Bradford can point to schools where there is good intercultural practice. The expert team had the opportunity to visit Lapage primary school as one exemplar. Whilst the majority of pupils at this school share a predominant religion, they are also representative of a diverse range of ethnic backgrounds. The school works with the Linking Network and has developed a wide range of activities to respond to its own internal diversity. Key elements in the school's approach include strong leadership, dealing with issues through dialogic talk in a respectful and safe space, and a staff that is reflective of the community. There is a limited systemic focus on capacity building, school policy, or any particular inter-cultural strategy, and it was noted that there were no particular supports for schools to call on for this work.

Inevitably there will be a variety of approaches, capacities, and interest levels within the education sector for this intercultural dimension to their work. It would be important to identify good practice champions and find spaces and platforms for sharing of good practice and for providing peer support around good practice and external support for good practice.

The University of Bradford holds significant potential for the intercultural city. It is one of the first universities to be awarded University of Sanctuary. It provides access to a vital social good in education that needs to be secured by all groups. It is a centre of learning and expertise that could drive innovation in the work of sustaining the intercultural city. It is one of the city's biggest employers.

The university is a member of the 'Stronger Communities Partnership'. Links have been made with the Innovation Hub in the university to inform some of Bradford Council's services with 'Community Readiness'. It will be important to further develop an effective fit for the university with the intercultural city endeavour.

Business and Employment

The themes of strengthening leadership, including by the private sector, and of increasing economic opportunity, including in relation to employment supports, are prioritised in the Government's Integrated Communities Action Plan. Business and employment have usefully been a targeted focus for Bradford City Council as part of the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy. The private sector is also present on the 'Stronger Together Partnership'.

A stand-out project was the initiative being led by Grant Thornton to promote and support potential-based recruitment and to network employers around this. Other stand-out initiatives are the ESIF funded Community-Led Local Development Programmes in Keighley and Manningham, Great Horton and City wards, diverse neighbourhoods recording high levels of deprivation and unemployment. These local programmes have a role in supporting local businesses to grow, and helping unemployed people find jobs and develop new skills.

However, beyond such specific targeted initiatives, the business and employment elements of the strategy rest on the capacity of the economic strategy of Bradford Council to deliver for all (including people with a BAME background). The funding available to the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy has been used to engage the intercultural focus in these strategies, in particular in relation to issues of apprenticeships and graduate employment.

The economic strategy, 'Pioneering, Confident & Connected, An Economic Strategy for Bradford District 2018-2030', commits to an inclusive and sustainable model of growth. Inclusive growth is to be supported by 'improving access to employment, addressing low pay, promoting apprenticeships to under-represented groups and improving in-work progression routes. The strategy identifies Bradford's diverse population as a strategic asset.

The focus on in-work progression routes would appear to be particularly important. The expert team were informed that while workforces tended to be representative of diversity and employment services were open and accessible, diversity was not present at the more senior levels of organisations. Bradford Council's Future Leaders Experience programme could serve as a valuable model to be disseminated and replicated for this purpose.

Community Led Local Delivery (CLLD) area's in Bradford and Keighley, resourced through European Structural and Investment Funds, strive to improve economic development in deprived areas, largely with high level of BAME populations. They support business start-ups, enabling access to employment and self-employment. The economic strategy sets specific targets to raise productivity per head of population, increase the employment rate, and increase skill levels. However, it does not disaggregate these targets by social group.

It was identified to the expert group that a large percentage of businesses assisted through the City Centre Growth Scheme are minority ethnic owned. However, the economic strategy is silent on such businesses and support to minority ethnic entrepreneurs. This area of endeavour could be expanded to support a capacity within services to entrepreneurs generally, including financial services, to better understand and respond more effectively to the specific needs and approaches of minority ethnic entrepreneurs.

Work with minority ethnic entrepreneurs could include a focus on procurement and enabling their access to procurement systems and channels. Procurement has a wider contribution to make to the intercultural city. Procurement systems in public bodies, like Bradford Council, could include a social clause to favour companies that take a planned and systematic approach to intercultural goals as employers.

The Bradford Economic Partnership drives the strategy and brings together a team of senior leaders from key organisations: local businesses, Bradford Council, the University of Bradford, the City Region Local Enterprise Partnership; and the Chamber of Commerce. There is no community-based representation named.

While there is an interesting initiative being progressed under the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy of unconscious bias training, this does not appear to include the private sector. There is a further challenge, for an intercultural focus to be embedded within organisational structures and systems of individual companies. It would be useful to develop a business platform to support a planned and systematic approach this this in the private and public sector.

Public Services

Public service providers have an important contribution to make to the intercultural city as employers and as service providers. This contribution is underpinned by the equality duty on public bodies under the Equality Act 2010. The distribution of the social goods provided by public and publicly funded services and its capacity to respond to unequal outcomes experienced by minority groups across different fields is a key starting point for this contribution.

Action by the public sector towards the elimination of poverty is important in this regard. The 2019 'Anti-Poverty Strategy, Bradford District Anti-Poverty Co-ordination Group's Approach for Tackling Poverty' aims to 'ensure everyone living or working in the district has the resources, opportunities and choices to live a decent and secure life'. It is linked to Bradford Council's economic strategy. It should hold the potential for delivering new outcomes for all citizens, a potential that requires particular attention if it is to deliver for the full diversity of people experiencing poverty.

The strategy usefully follows the five priority areas contained in the Joseph Rowntree Foundation's 'We Can Solve Poverty in the UK':

1. Boost incomes and reduce costs.
2. Deliver an effective benefits system.
3. Improve education standards and raise skills.
4. Strengthen families and communities.
5. Promote long-term economic growth benefitting everyone.

Key poverty facts are presented that reference refugees and asylum seekers and the Roma and Traveller communities. However, no data is given for other backgrounds. It does, innovatively, reference one data measure by 'location and other equality characteristics', but this is only for the take up of apprenticeships. It provides an interesting table of data sources to be used to consider if anti-poverty actions have been effective. This includes a heading of

'communities of interest/protected characteristics', but this source is not identified as being available for any of the data measures.

The Bradford District Anti-Poverty Co-Ordination Group is responsible for driving the strategy. It includes one representative from faith groups and one 'protected characteristics groups representative'.

The potential contribution of public services to the intercultural city requires the deployment of an intercultural lens in devising employment procedures and in the design and delivery of services. Organisational systems are a key focus in this regard and need to be subject to review for their capacity to deliver the aspirations of the intercultural city in a sustained and systematic manner.

Bradford Council have opened up this focus with an innovative unconscious bias training initiative. This involves five projects covering schools, general practice in health, the community and voluntary sector, the police, and Bradford Council itself. It avoids the danger of emphasising cognitive processes over organisational systems with training that addresses cultural competence alongside unconscious bias and emotional intelligence. It includes important follow-up elements to sustain learning into practice through training of champions and mentoring circles.

Another innovative development in this regard is the involvement of the police in the Faith Trail initiative where participation in this is a required part of police training. The police have deployed Faith Engagement Officers with an impressive track record of work. However, it is clear that there is a need to deepen the focus on institutional systems for an intercultural focus to permeate across the service.

Structures and systems need to be in place and operational across public and publicly funded services to: enable staff capacity; ensure recruitment processes and mainstream service provision are conducted in a manner that is accessible to and meets the specific needs of all citizens; assess the impact of key decisions on all citizens; and track outcomes for and ensure impact on all citizens in employment and from service provision.

Bradford Council is involved in an innovative initiative to identify and define shared values for the district. The values under current consideration have a relevance to the intercultural city. This has the potential to harness the motivational power of these values to shape intercultural neighbourhoods. The initiative could be brought into an institutional setting where the same values could be systematically deployed in public services, alongside other explicitly named values, to specifically sustain an organisational culture that motivates and drives intercultural goals and aspirations in a sustained and systematic manner.

Employment and service provision should be free from discrimination. This is required by legislation, as well as being central to sustaining the intercultural city. Equality legislation can be undermined by under-reporting of discrimination complaints. People at risk of discrimination need to be aware of their rights and people experiencing discrimination need to have access to support to vindicate these rights.

Bradford Council valuably report that regular campaigns are organised to raise awareness of discrimination. Four anti-rumour and critical thinking themed campaigns are planned during

the next 1-2 years, commencing March 2020. Hate Crime week will continue to be promoted annually, and Hate Crime awareness throughout the year. It will be important to sustain this work and ensure it sets a standard for all public and publicly funded services.

Culture and Civil Life

Bradford Council gives significant focus to the area of culture and civil life. This is an important element of the intercultural city. The cultural strategy, 'Bradford: A Leading Cultural City 2014-2024', sets out its ambitions and its approach in this regard. This is based on five priorities:

1. Investing in our people - A District where people can freely access, enjoy, create, engage in and contribute to Bradford's cultural offer.
2. Building a resilient and sustainable sector – Create an agile, enterprising, and entrepreneurial creative and cultural sector.
3. Responsible and active Leadership – A 'can-do' leadership position at all levels that engenders ownership, responsibility and ambition.
4. A thriving cultural offer – One that inspires our residents and visitors and delivers a magnificent cultural experience for all.
5. A cultural destination – telling and selling our story – Encouraging people to actively take part, watch, engage and experience Bradford as a leading cultural city locally, nationally and internationally.

The strategy includes an important focus on community and on diversity. It notes the role of culture as a platform for communities to share experiences and explore each other's cultures, and its role in contributing to the regeneration of the district whilst supporting and enabling community empowerment.

It notes that the District's 'cultural and faith communities are an important element of its uniqueness and the Cultural Strategy delivery plan will seek to develop new ways in which our diverse communities genuinely connect and develop mutual appreciation and understanding'. It will be important to track endeavour in this regard and to continually deepen its potential, scale, and innovation.

The strategy usefully commits under its priority one, in relation to audiences, that 'engaging specific communities of interest will also be a key area of attention in ensuring that there is appropriate support for our explicit commitment to diversity and equality of access for all'.

It recognises under priority four that 'the 'hidden' or currently under-utilised grassroots and community arts activity is incredibly important to the residents within the district'. It notes that 'building capacity across the spectrum of talent at a grassroots level will enhance the self-determination to create and present work. Connecting and sharing expertise from the professional sector will also be another way to build the skills, knowledge and excellence of the grassroots offer'.

The focus on community arts has significant potential in an intercultural city. Community arts can empower all citizens in giving expression to their dreams and aspirations. They can stimulate interaction between communities in achieving creative spaces and forms for dialogue. They can enable introspection and understanding within all communities about multiple forms of diversity as well as identify and explore shared issues. In this endeavour,

community is producer of, as much as audience for, culture, people's creativity is valued and they are considered as active producers and managers, not just passive receivers. It would be important to take steps to sustain a shared understanding of and commitment to community arts and to ensure its potential for an intercultural city can be realised.

Bradford has just secured a significant grant from the Arts Council to be one of its Creative People and Places locations. The four-year project involves a range of local arts and community organisations with a focus on participation in arts and culture that is community led. It will be delivered by 'a new community-focussed consortium committed to making a step change in arts and cultural opportunity, involvement and participation across the District'.

The ambition to engage members of public in shaping their own arts and cultural provision, and to move from taking art and culture to people to encouraging and enabling people to celebrate the arts and culture in their communities and giving them opportunities to work with professional artists is noted. This has evident potential from the perspective of community arts and the intercultural city. While the project recognises the diversity of Bradford and is focused on disadvantage, it will be important to track and ensure the realisation of the potential of the project for involving people with a diverse background that feel their contributions, voices and aspirations are not normally taken into consideration when discussing cultural and artistic products.

To this end, the expert team had the opportunity to visit Kala Sangam, an Intercultural arts hub which aims at reflecting the diversity of contemporary Britain through the work they present, the artists they support and the communities they engage. The centre, which has been funders-led for the last 20 years, has recently reshaped their offer along three main strands of activities: South Asia Now (prioritising the work which develops the art form or is created by British people of South Asian descent), British Diversity (supporting work that looks at cultural heritage in the context of modern Britain or is actively diversity-focused. This strand also covers work that fuses together different artforms, styles and cultures), This is Bradford (providing support and performance opportunities to local artists and companies). The centre, whose name comes from Sanskrit "Kala" (arts) and "Sangam" (meeting point), evidenced the role of art and culture in bringing people and communities together, increase understanding and awareness of different cultures and to provide talent development pathways to young people and emerging artists, as well enabling 'tricky conversations'.

Bradford can also boast an important and varied track record of festivals and events that contribute to the intercultural city. These are identified as playing significant roles in bringing people from different communities together and in enabling debate on difficult questions.

Arts and culture engage values in the various creative productions involved. The values engaged can motivate an audience concern, and that of its wider community, for interaction, equality and diversity. This potential could be further developed and enhanced through linking the Bradford Council's Values for the District project with the arts and culture sector to explore how these values might be engaged by this field.

Bradford is currently involved in bidding to become UK City of Culture 2025. The development of the bid offers important opportunities to stimulate community arts, advance thinking on

the values engaged by arts and culture initiatives, and enable all citizens as producers and consumers of arts and culture.

Media

Public discourse is an important focus for the intercultural city. Public discourse can reflect the issues and tensions arise and, equally, be a causal factor in the issues and tensions that arise in intercultural settings. Challenges of stereotyping and hatred in relation to public discourse in Bradford were identified. This is an important space for engagement so that the values that underpin the intercultural city can be widely engaged and leave no space for toxic public discourse.

The 'Stronger Communities Communication Strategy' is being prepared with the aim of promoting positive narratives of all communities living in the district. The communication department of Bradford Council is committed to highlighting diversity as an advantage. There is a good relationship reported with local media. National media however is a source of disruption.

Bradford Council's Values for the District project has a key contribution to make to public discourse and needs to be central to the communication strategy being developed. It will be important to develop and proactively promote narratives that are creative in engaging these values, the values of the intercultural city and the value that resonate with the community. A sustained communication strategy, based on these values, could be developed and implemented across all the intercultural city stakeholders to gain critical mass in shaping public discourse.

Governance and democratic participation

Access to and influence on decision-making processes for all citizens and organisations is important for the intercultural city. The 'Stronger Communities' team evidence an important commitment to and effective implementation of participative approaches and meaningful co-design. This includes an engagement with civil society platforms. It appears to reflect core values in Bradford Council as many initiatives report taking such an approach.

It would be important to build on this with actions to: stimulate similar approaches by other key stakeholders of the intercultural city as needed; ensure organisations of and led by diverse communities have adequate resources; and devise strategies for representation of citizens with a minority background on Boards of the key services to these communities.

Intelligence

There is a focus on data gathering and analysis with new data links and sharing opportunities being explored across institutions and the district, such as 'Connected Bradford'. Bradford Council is now utilising 'Local Insight' to map and overlay data from various sources with a wide range of provision to enable better planning.

Born in Bradford is an initiative of significant value for the intercultural city. This is a longitudinal study tracking the health and wellbeing of over 13,500 children and their parents

born at Bradford Royal Infirmary between March 2007 and December 2010. It enables understanding of the influences that shape people's lives and affect their health and wellbeing. A follow-up of all the Born in Bradford families to see how their lives have changed since pregnancy is now beginning. This does not appear to plan to address school interventions, which would ignore a key influence on the cognitive development and wellbeing of children and families.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Bradford Council has given important leadership for the intercultural city. It has developed an impressive agenda and institutional infra-structure for this goal to be pursued. There are a number of steps it could consider and take to deepen and systematise this work, under the following intercultural city indicators:

Commitment:

1. The potential and ambition of the 'Strong Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy should be underpinned by a statement of outcomes sought with a specific naming of the intercultural dimension to each outcome.
2. The strategy is largely project-based, with some elements striving for a longer-term systemic impact, and this should be strengthened over the life of the programme to ensure an embedding of the intercultural city as a long-term systemic focus for Bradford Council and other partner organisations.
3. Consideration should be given to the balance of projects across each of the strands of the strategy that are supported under the innovation fund, with particular attention to increasing the number of projects under the 'Getting On' strand, due to its key economic equality potential.
4. Leadership from and platforms within key sectors should be stimulated and supported to ensure that Bradford as an intercultural city is a form of co-production, alongside the current infrastructure in place.
5. The links operationalised by the members of the 'People Together' committee back into their communities should be supported and, where necessary, strengthened.
6. A commitment to mainstreaming an intercultural focus across all Bradford Council strategies should be explicitly established, building on current foundations, with the necessary systems put in place to ensure mainstreaming is fully and effectively implemented and tracked over time.
7. The concept of the intercultural city should be a focus for further debate and definition, deepening the emphasis on interaction with a stronger emphasis on the allied dimensions of equality and diversity and enabling a named focus on groups and individuals.

Education:

1. The research project on admissions policies should provide the foundation and stimulus for further work to reduce segregation in schools.
2. The work with the Linking Network will continue to be important and its further growth within the primary sector and, in particular, the secondary sector should be supported.
3. Good practice champions in the field of education should be identified and spaces and platforms created for sharing of good practice and intercultural systems and for providing peer support around and external support for this.
4. An effective fit for the university within the intercultural city should be explored and pursued.

Business and Employment:

1. The targets for the economic strategy should be disaggregated by equality characteristics, including BAME communities.
2. The focus on in-work progression routes under the economic strategy should have a particular focus on employees from a BAME background, given reported under-representation at senior level in the public and private sector organisations.
3. The economic strategy should include initiatives for capacity building in services to entrepreneurs, including financial services, to better respond to the specific needs of minority ethnic entrepreneurs and for enabling access by these entrepreneurs to procurement systems and channels.
4. The 'Bradford Economic Partnership' should replicate an appropriate form of the 'People Together' committee used in the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy.
5. Procurement systems in public bodies should be supported to include some a social clause to favour companies that take a planned and systematic approach to intercultural goals in their employment and operations.
6. A business platform should be developed to support planned and systematic approaches to intercultural issues in employment within private and public sector organisations.

Public services:

1. Disaggregated data on poverty should be monitored under the anti-poverty strategy and data measures should be developed for key actions, or using the broader formula of 'by location and equality characteristics'.
2. The 'Bradford District Anti-Poverty Co-Ordination Group' should replicate an appropriate form of the 'People Together' committee used in the 'Stronger Communities Together 2018-2023' strategy.
3. The Values for the District project should extend its ambitions to encompass institutional settings with action to enable these values, alongside other values already explicitly named, to systematically motivate and drive workplace and service provision priorities and procedures in public and publicly funded services to be intercultural.
4. Public services should be enabled and encouraged to review their employment procedures, and the design and delivery of their services through an intercultural lens and to put in place the structures and systems needed to sustain this focus, based on the Values for the District project.
5. Public services should be encouraged to promote the standard of non-discrimination to their employees and service users and provide an accessible means of making and informally resolving a complaint.

Culture and Civil Life:

1. The implementation of the 'Bradford: A Leading Cultural City 2014-2024' strategy should be monitored, and evolve as necessary, for the manner and level at which it

realises its potential for: contributing to mutual appreciation and understanding between different people; equality of access for all communities; and advancing empowering forms of community arts within BAME communities.

2. The implementation of Bradford's 'Creative People and Places' initiative should be monitored for the manner and level at which it realises its potential for all citizens, especially those with a minority or diverse background.
3. The development of Bradford's bid for UK City of Culture 2025 should include all citizens and should advance approaches to community arts, the engagement of values by arts and culture initiatives, and the role of all citizens as producers of arts and culture.
4. Bradford Council's Values for the District project should establish links with the arts and culture sector to explore how these values might be engaged by this field.

Media:

1. The 'Stronger Communities Communication Strategy' being developed should take a values-led approach, drawing from the Values for the District project.
2. A wider communication platform should be developed, involving all stakeholders for the intercultural city, to build a critical mass of communication that engages these values creatively and systematically.

Governance and democratic participation:

1. Actions should be taken to: stimulate participative approaches by all key stakeholders within the intercultural city; ensure organisations of and led by BAME communities have adequate resources; and implement strategies for BAME representation on Boards of key services to these communities.

Intelligence:

The current phase of the Born in Bradford study should be extended to encompass school interventions and the impact of diverse classrooms on the development and wellbeing of children and families.

Appendix: ICC Expert Visit Agenda

Day 1 (Thursday 12th September)

9.30 – 13.00	Intercultural Cities Conference
09.30 - 09.50	Registration & Networking
09.50 – 10.00	Stronger Communities Together – Zahra Niazi, Programme Lead
10.00 - 10.10	Cllr Abdul Jabar, Portfolio Holder of Neighbourhoods and Community Safety, Bradford Council
10.15 - 10.25	Kersten England, Chief Executive of Bradford Council
10.30 - 11.30	Presentation on ICC and Index Results - Council of Europe
11.30 - 12.00	Q & A – Chaired by Kersten England
12.00 – 12.15	Refreshment Break
12.15 - 13.00	Roundtable Discussions – Introduced by Nigel Smith, Principle Executive Officer, Bradford Council
13.00 - 13.15	Summary & Close - Bishop Toby Howarth (Chair – Stronger Communities Partnership Board)
14.30 – 15.00	Kala Sangam tour – South Asian Arts
15.00 – 15.45	Bradford Cathedral) (Meet the organisers of the regular ‘Faith Tours’ and West Yorkshire Police)
16.00 – 17.00	Lapage Primary School & The Linking Network

Day 2 (Friday 13th September)

09.30 – 10.00	UNESCO World Heritage Site - Guided Tour (Saltaire) (Accompanied by People Together members and Stronger Communities colleagues)
10.00 - 11.00	Refreshment Break and discussion (Salts Mill, Saltaire)
11.30 – 12.30	The Good Shepherd Centre, Keighley (Representatives will be present from Bradford Council’s Keighley Area Team, People Together, Equality & Community Relations Strategic Group (ECRSG), Keighley Film Festival, Keighley Asian Women & Children’s Centre, Reassurance & Engagement (RE) and Bradford Youth Service.)