

FIFTH EVALUATION REPORT ON ARMENIA

Committee of Experts
of the European Charter
for Regional or Minority
Languages



Adopted on 2 July 2020

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a state party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the state and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the state to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the state concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the state in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each state for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the state, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the state in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the state concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective state party for possible comments within a given deadline. A confidential dialogue may, at this stage, be requested by this state party. The final evaluation report is made public, together with the comments, if any, which the authorities of the state party may have made. This document is then transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for the adoption of its recommendations to the state party, on the basis of the proposals for recommendations contained in the evaluation report.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	4
Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Armenia – Recent developments and trends	5
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Armenia	6
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Armenia	15
Chapter 2 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations	17
2.1 Assyrian.....	17
2.1.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Assyrian	17
2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Assyrian in Armenia.....	20
2.2 German	22
2.2.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German	22
2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Armenia	23
2.3 Greek.....	24
2.3.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Greek	24
2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Greek in Armenia.....	27
2.4 Kurdish	28
2.4.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Kurdish	28
2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Kurdish in Armenia	31
2.5 Russian.....	33
2.5.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian	33
2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Armenia	36
2.6 Ukrainian	37
2.6.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian	37
2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Armenia	38
2.7 Yezidi	39
2.7.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yezidi	39
2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yezidi in Armenia.....	42
Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.....	44
Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification	46
Appendix II: Comments from the Armenian authorities.....	47

Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Armenia in 2002 and applies to the following languages: Assyrian (covered by Parts II and III of the Charter), German (Part II), Greek (Parts II and III), Kurdish (Parts II and III), Russian (Parts II and III), Ukrainian (Part II) and Yezidi (Parts II and III).

The situation of Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi has not shown any clear signs of improvement during this monitoring round, especially in the fields of education and the judiciary.

As far as education is concerned, Russian is used at pre-school level, but the need to also provide a substantial part of pre-school education in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi remains. Teaching in or of Russian is available at primary, secondary and technical and vocational levels. Some primary and secondary schools teach Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi to a certain extent, but it is not clear how many pupils are enrolled. Greek is taught in technical and vocational education. Several primary and secondary schools provide intensive teaching of German. Ukrainian is not taught in primary or secondary education.

The lack of teachers of the minority languages is an obstacle in the development of minority language education. Furthermore, modern teaching materials for teaching the minority languages need to be produced.

The Armenian legislation does not guarantee the right to use minority languages before judicial authorities if the minority language speaker has a command of Armenian; this is not in conformity with Article 9 of the Charter as ratified by Armenia.

The state authorities have made available certain administrative texts and forms in Russian, but not in other minority languages. It is also possible to submit oral or written applications in Russian in certain municipalities. Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi are only used in oral communication with local authorities. Greek does not seem to be used in contacts with authorities. Some municipalities have official names in minority languages, but there is no general policy to promote the use or adoption of such names.

The Armenian Public Radio broadcasts programmes in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Yezidi. The Armenian Public Television periodically broadcasts information programmes about national minorities in Armenian or Russian. In addition, Russian is the only minority language in which daily or weekly newspapers are published.

The Armenian authorities have provided some financial support to various publications and cultural activities in all minority languages.

Russian is commonly used in economic life and in cross-border co-operation, which is not the case for the other minority languages.

In general, the lack of a structured approach persists as regards Armenia's obligations under the Charter. In particular, financial support for national minority associations is too low to contribute effectively to the practical implementation of the Charter.

The Ministry of Justice has prepared a draft Law of the Republic of Armenia "On national minorities". Some of its provisions relate to matters covered by undertakings of Armenia under the Charter.

The fifth evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Armenia in February 2020.

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Armenia – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its states parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. Upon accession to the Council of Europe, the Republic of Armenia undertook to sign and ratify the Charter by 25 January 2002. The Charter was signed on 11 May 2001 and entered into force in respect of Armenia on 1 May 2002. It applies to the following languages: Assyrian (covered by Parts II and III), German (Part II), Greek (Parts II and III), Kurdish (Parts II and III), Russian (Parts II and III), Ukrainian (Part II) and Yezidi (Parts II and III).¹

2. Article 15 (1) of the Charter requires states parties to submit three-yearly reports² on the implementation of the Charter. The Armenian authorities submitted their fifth periodical report on 28 June 2019 and made it public. This fifth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (11-14 February 2020) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter.

3. Armenia’s fifth periodical report did not contain sufficiently detailed information to enable the Committee of Experts to conclude on the fulfilment of each Charter undertaking. The Committee of Experts invites the Armenian authorities to include, in their next periodical report, information on the implementation of the undertakings concerning each language specifically, in accordance with the outline adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 2 May 2019.³

4. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in Armenia and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the Armenian authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers in the fourth monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of Armenia in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the Armenian authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Armenia, as provided for in Article 16 (4) of the Charter.

5. As far as the detailed legal examination of each undertaking is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its **fourth evaluation report on the application of the Charter in Armenia** (CM(2017)49⁴).

6. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to Armenia in February 2020. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 2 July 2020. It was made public on 15 September 2020.

¹ ECRML(2014)2, para. 12

² Since 1 July 2019, new rules apply according to the Committee of Ministers decisions adopted on 28 November 2018 on the strengthening of the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, whereby states parties submit their periodical report every five years (instead of every three years) and information about the implementation of the recommendations identified by the Committee of Experts in its evaluation report as being for immediate action every two and a half years.

³ Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties, CM(2019)69 final

⁴ CM(2017)49, https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016807072f2

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Armenia

7. In the last monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that Armenia “**provide adequate funding for cultural activities and to the national minority associations to ensure the promotion of the regional or minority languages.**” In 2019, the Armenian authorities allocated AMD 20 million (€38,400⁵) to national minorities associations. Half of this amount was devoted to the development of national culture, preservation of language and culture, and raising the awareness of representatives of national minorities about the legal framework, with priority for the Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi minorities. As in previous monitoring cycles⁶, the Committee of Experts considers that this financial support is very low and covers the cost of only a few small projects. Since these projects are not all devoted to language promotion, the amounts are clearly insufficient to make a meaningful contribution to the practical implementation of the Charter. Therefore, the Committee of Experts again calls on the Armenian authorities to increase the funding to the national minority associations so as to ensure the effective promotion of the minority languages in different fields of public life.

8. Furthermore, the Committee of Ministers recommended that Armenia “**adopt a proactive attitude regarding the protection and promotion of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi in public life ...**”. As the Committee of Experts observed during the on-the-spot visit, the lack of a structured approach regarding Armenia’s obligations under the Charter persists as no proactive measures are being taken to comprehensively inform the minority language speakers of their rights. The majority of the speakers are aware neither of the Charter, nor of their rights with regard to the use of their language in education, judicial and administrative authorities, public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges and private life. There is also a tendency on the part of the Armenian authorities to assign responsibility for the implementation of the Charter to the local authorities and the national minorities although, during the on-the-spot visit, it was apparent that local authorities are not aware of the rights of the minority language speakers to use their languages in contacts with local administrations. In their statement submitted to the Committee of Experts, representatives of the Yezidi speakers stressed the need to adopt a national strategy and action plan on the preservation and promotion of the minority languages and to implement it in co-operation with the national minority associations.

9. The Ministry of Justice has prepared a draft Law of the Republic of Armenia "On national minorities". Some of its provisions relate to matters covered by undertakings of Armenia under the Charter, for example Articles 7.3, 8.1.a.iv, 8.1.b.iv, 8.1.c.iv, 10.2.b and 10.2.g of the Charter.

10. With regard to education, the draft law provides, in Article 10.1, that the education of children belonging to national minorities can be organised in their mother tongue in preschool and public education institutions (i.e. primary and secondary schools). However, the reference to national minorities and to mother-tongue speakers could, in practice, limit the number of people who could benefit from the possibility of learning a minority language. As far as the reference to the “mother tongue” is concerned, it needs to be borne in mind that many pupils belonging to national minorities in Armenia do not have the minority language as their mother tongue/first language. This concerns, for example, the Greek minority. In general, the concept of “mother tongue” could give rise to different interpretations and should for the sake of legal clarity be replaced with “minority language”. Furthermore, the reference to “national minorities” would create legal uncertainty as to whether pupils belonging to the Armenian majority population may attend minority language classes if they so wish. In this context, the Committee of Experts reiterates that the Charter does not deal with minority languages as the “vehicle of a particular social or ethnic group”⁷, but as part of the cultural heritage of the whole country. Moreover, pursuant to Article 7.1.g, the authorities have the obligation to enable non-speakers of minority languages to learn them if they so desire. Therefore, the Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to clarify, in the draft law, that teaching in or of minority languages is open to pupils or students at all levels of education irrespective of whether they have the minority language as a mother tongue and belong to a national minority.

11. In addition, the draft law provides that a minority language may only be used orally and in writing in communication with authorities of municipalities if those belonging to the national minority concerned make up at least 20% of the local population (Article 9.3). A 20% threshold is also foreseen with regard to the use of place names in minority languages (Article 14). The Committee of Experts observed in previous evaluation reports on several states parties (concerning thresholds of 15% or more)⁸ that a 20% threshold is too high for

⁵ Exchange rate of 27 April 2020

⁶ See e.g. 3rd evaluation report on Armenia, ECRML(2014) 2, para. 26

⁷ Explanatory Report, para. 17

⁸ See e.g. 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on the Slovak Republic, ECRML(2007)1, para. 592-593; 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on Romania, ECRML(2012)3, para. 35, 37; 3rd Report of the Committee of Experts on Montenegro, ECRML(2015)3, para. 21; 2nd

the local use of minority languages in the field of administration. In Armenia, the application of a 20% threshold would, for example, make the use of Greek by local authorities and in communication with them impossible in a number of places where this language has been traditionally used. Based on these considerations, the Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to foresee a lower threshold in the draft law. Moreover, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should determine what absolute number of users of minority languages they consider to be sufficient in order to apply the law to such a language in at least one municipality respectively and take flexible measures according to the situation of each language with a view to ensuring practical implementation of the law.⁹ In particular, the draft law could foresee that the national authorities and the local authorities of Yerevan (where all minorities are present) offer certain basic oral and written services in the minority languages irrespective of any threshold, for example information documents and brochures for national and local elections and written information about social services.

12. Notwithstanding its preceding comments on problematic aspects of the draft law, the Committee of Experts welcomes the intention of Armenia to adopt a Law "On national minorities" and calls on the authorities to finalise the legislative process soon. Considering that a number of aspects relating to language use are not covered by the draft law, the Charter will remain the legal frame of reference for the promotion of minority languages in Armenia. The implementation of the Charter is therefore of utmost importance.

13. According to the state report and information from the local authorities, several places where Kurdish is used have been merged to form the municipality of Alagyaz (Aragatsotn province). During the merger, the local linguistic particularities were taken into account. The Committee of Experts welcomes this and is confident that the Armenian authorities will continue to ensure that the ongoing administrative territorial reform will not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of minority languages, in conformity with Article 7.1.b.

14. In the last evaluation report, the Committee of Experts asked the Armenian authorities to provide additional information about a possible traditional presence of Georgian, Polish and Yiddish in Armenia. While the state report mentions that the Armenian authorities support the periodicals of the Georgian, Polish and Jewish associations, it does not provide the requested information. As it is unclear whether these languages correspond to the definition of regional or minority language within the meaning of the Charter, the Committee of Experts asks the Armenian authorities to provide, in their next periodical report, specific information about a possible traditional presence of Georgian, Polish and Yiddish in Armenia.

Use of the regional or minority languages in education

15. In the last monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that Armenia "**promote the use of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi in pre-school education and extend the offer of teaching of these languages at primary and secondary levels, paying particular attention to teacher training.**"

16. During its on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts visited the kindergarten of the municipality of Verin Dvin (Ararat province), which uses Assyrian to some extent but does not provide a substantial part of pre-school education in this language. The state report further indicates that Kurdish and Yezidi children attend pre-schools, but does not state whether they receive education in Kurdish and Yezidi. Greek is not used in pre-school education.

17. Primary and secondary education is available in Russian, which is also widely taught as a foreign language as part of the curriculum in all provinces of Armenia. Certain primary and secondary schools teach Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi, but it is not clear to what extent. With regard to Yezidi, the state report indicates that no curriculum for teaching it exists at secondary level. In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers mentioned that pupils do not receive grades because Yezidi is taught outside the curriculum. Some primary and secondary schools offer intensive teaching of German. According to representatives of the speakers, Greek and Ukrainian are not taught in primary or secondary education. Regarding Greek, the Armenian authorities have informed the Committee of Experts that "access to teaching minority languages in secondary education is provided in [...] Greek", but it is unclear whether Greek is actually taught in secondary education. The Committee of Experts has no information about the number of pupils learning each minority language in primary and secondary education and the number of weekly hours of teaching of each language. In general, the information provided by the Armenian authorities concerning teaching in/of minority languages

Report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML(2015)7, para. 91; 3rd Report of the Committee of Experts on Serbia, ECRML(2016)1, para. 15-17; 2nd Report of the Committee of Experts on Bosnia and Herzegovina, ECRML(2016)3, para. 24-31; 6th Report of the Committee of Experts on Hungary, ECRML(2016)6, para. 21; 4th Report of the Committee of Experts on Armenia, CM(2017)49, para. 14-15; 3rd Report of the Committee of Experts on Ukraine, CM(2017)97, para. 25

⁹ See 5th Report of the Committee of Experts on the Slovak Republic, CM(2019)126, para. 18

at these levels is not sufficiently clear and language-specific to allow the Committee of Experts to draw a conclusion in all cases.

18. Representatives of the Russian speakers confirmed during the on-the-spot visit that Russian is taught in technical and vocational education (Article 8.1.div). Furthermore, Greek is taught at the “Yerevan Armenian-Greek State College of Tourism, Service and Food”. Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi are not taught at that level of education.

19. At university, German, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Ukrainian can be studied as subjects. This is not the case for Assyrian and Yezidi. According to the state report, the teachers of Yezidi have no higher professional education since there are no relevant faculties in higher educational establishments of Armenia.

20. According to representatives of most national minorities, the lack of teachers of the minority languages is one of the main bottlenecks in the development of minority language education. There are two main structural problems: the low (especially financial) attractiveness of a job in teaching and deficits in the training of teachers. In light of the information obtained during the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to take comprehensive steps to improve the training of teachers of the minority languages. These steps should include an increase in the salaries of teachers, the use of long-term contracts for teachers, improved learning of languages and didactics at university, and the proactive recruitment of graduates of relevant studies as language teachers.

21. As far as language courses for adults/adult education is concerned (Articles 7.1.g, 8.1.fiii), associations of national minorities continue to organise “Sunday schools” whereby the respective minority languages are taught. For example, with certain support from the Armenian authorities, Greek courses are held in the cities of Yerevan, Alaverdi, Gyumri, Vanadzor, Stepanavan, Noyemberyan and in Koghes. The Ukrainian minority teaches Ukrainian at Sunday schools in Yerevan and Vanadzor to children and adults. However, there is a shortage of teaching materials in Ukrainian. In addition, the German minority association organises German courses at its Sunday school in Yerevan. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the German speakers stated that they are in need of increased state funding to cater for the growing demand for these courses and to purchase modern teaching materials in German. Furthermore, representatives of the Yezidi speakers expressed a strong wish for the organisation of language courses for adults. Considering the advanced linguistic assimilation of many people belonging to national minorities in Armenia, the Committee of Experts underlines the importance of providing facilities teaching minority languages to adults.

22. Russian is the only minority language which is taught in continuing education (Article 8.1.fiii).

23. According to representatives of the speakers of all minority languages except Russian, there is a need to improve the quality and methodology of teaching materials for the teaching of minority languages and to produce teaching materials for all grades of education and for all minority languages. In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers expressed the wish to set up an expert group which will work on new teaching materials. The Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to produce modern teaching materials and teacher manuals in Assyrian, German, Greek, Kurdish, Ukrainian and Yezidi, improving the linguistic quality and increasing the learner orientation (methods, adapted topics and texts, needs of the pupils/students), as well as teaching materials and teacher manuals for these languages in Armenia. In the framework of co-operation on minority languages with Georgia, the Council of Europe and the EU have published free teaching materials for kindergarten (for age three to six) in Assyrian, German, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Ukrainian, which may be used by authorities, teachers and parents in Armenia as well.

Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities

24. Regarding the use of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Russian or Yezidi in *criminal proceedings*, the Committee of Experts underlines that the Charter guarantees the accused the right to use these languages (Article 9.1.ii) and that the judicial authorities are under the obligation to provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in these languages (Article 9.1.iii) as well as to produce, on request, documents connected to the proceedings in them (Article 9.1.iv).

25. In accordance with the Committee of Experts’ standard interpretation, these guarantees apply irrespective of whether the person concerned speaks the official language. Furthermore, the translation and interpretation should not involve extra expense for those concerned. Both aspects apply also to Armenia’s undertakings with regard to *civil proceedings* (Article 9.1.bii, d) and *proceedings concerning administrative matters* (Article 9.1.cii, ciii, d). However, as the Committee of Experts already indicated to the national

authorities in its questionnaire and in the meeting with them during the on-the-spot visit, the relevant Armenian legislation examined below does not ensure these aspects.

26. According to Armenia's state report, the Judicial Code Constitutional Law of Armenia provides that "[e]veryone shall have the right to act in the procedure in the language they prefer if they provide proper interpretation into Armenian" (Art. 12.3). Furthermore, "[a] court shall provide services of an interpreter, at the expense of the state funds, to an accused in a criminal case who has no command of Armenian, unless the accused wishes to provide the interpretation at his or her own expense" (Art. 12.5). In addition, "[a] court shall provide services of an interpreter, at the expense of state funds, to participants of administrative procedure, to persons participating in the case in civil cases and to victims in criminal cases where he or she is unable to communicate in Armenian and proves that he or she does not have sufficient means for providing paid interpretation services" (Art. 12.6).

27. Article 15 of the Criminal Procedure Code of Armenia contains similar provisions. Article 3.1 provides that criminal proceedings shall be conducted in accordance with the provisions of the code, unless otherwise provided for by international treaties ratified by the Republic of Armenia. On this basis, the state report specifies that "the certified copies of documents to be delivered to the person belonging to a national minority and lacking command of the language of proceedings (Armenian language) may, upon the desire of the person, be provided in the respective language as in that case it will be necessary to be guided by the requirements of the Charter. Based on this principle, persons belonging to national minorities and lacking command of the language of proceedings may also demand that the documents to be delivered be provided to them with certified copies in the respective language." The Committee of Experts notes, however, that a command of Armenian is not relevant for the application of the Charter undertakings in question.

28. As far as *civil proceedings* are concerned, Armenia has undertaken to allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Russian or Yezidi without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary, brought about by the use of interpretation and translation (Article 9.1.bii).

29. Pursuant to Article 16.3 of the Civil Procedure Code of the Republic of Armenia, those participating in the case shall have the right to act in court in the language they prefer as long as they ensure provision of interpretation into Armenian. Article 16.4 of the code provides that the court shall provide interpretation services, at the expense of the state funds, to anyone participating in a case, experts appointed upon its initiative, specialists or witnesses invited upon its motion, if the respective person has no command of Armenian and the person participating in the case proves that he or she does not have sufficient means for providing paid interpretation services. Pursuant to Article 16.2, persons participating in a case shall submit all the procedural documents in Armenian or in another language with proper Armenian translation. Should they fail to comply with this requirement, the court shall not consider or allow the procedural documents, and in cases provided for by this code, shall return to the person who submitted them.

30. With regard to *proceedings concerning administrative matters*, Armenia has undertaken to allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Russian or Yezidi without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary, brought about by the use of interpretation and translation (Article 9.1.cii), and to allow documents and evidence to be produced in these languages in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary, brought about by the use of interpretation and translation (Article 9.1.ciii).

31. The relevant provisions of the Administrative Procedure Code of the Republic of Armenia (Article 9, paragraphs 1-3) correspond *mutatis mutandis* to the provisions of the Civil Procedure Code described above.

32. In light of the above information, the Committee of Experts concludes that the Armenian legislation pertaining to the use of minority languages before judicial authorities is not in conformity with Armenia's undertakings under Article 9.1 of the Charter. Therefore, the Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to amend the relevant laws so as to make it unambiguously clear that minority language speakers living in the relevant judicial districts may use their language in criminal, civil and procedures concerning administrative matters even if they have a command of Armenian, and that they do not incur additional expense if interpretation or translation is provided. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should actively inform the speakers of the minority languages of the possibilities to use their language before judicial authorities and encourage them to make use of these possibilities.

33. As far as the use of the respective languages before judicial authorities in practice is concerned, the Armenian authorities have provided data for the years 2017-2019. In the said period, translations from/into Russian have been made in 801 criminal proceedings, in 438 civil proceedings, in 23 administrative cases and

for 294 court orders in criminal and civil cases. Translations from/into Greek were made in seven criminal proceedings and ten civil proceedings in 2018 and 2019, and four translations for court orders in criminal and civil cases in 2017. Furthermore, there was only one translation from or into Yezidi in a criminal proceeding in 2017, while six translations from/into Kurdish in criminal proceedings were made in 2019. Assyrian has not been used before judicial authorities in the period 2017-2019.

34. As far as Article 9.3 is concerned, the Armenian authorities have made the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of minority languages in Russian available, but not in other minority languages. The Committee of Experts observes again that the implementation of this provision can make a valuable contribution to developing legal terminology in the minority languages, especially those that are less-widely used (Assyrian, Kurdish, Yezidi). Furthermore, it raises the public prestige of a minority language and facilitates its use in several fields of public life covered by Armenia's ratification of the Charter. Therefore, the Armenian authorities should translate into Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi at least those statutory texts which are relevant to the application of the Charter in the different fields covered by it, including education, judiciary and administration.

Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities

35. In the last monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that Armenia **"take determined action for the use of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi before the administrative and judicial authorities and introduce place names in the minority languages in the municipalities concerned."**

36. In general, the Committee of Experts noted, during the on-the-spot visit, a low level of awareness of the Charter obligations concerning administrative authorities both among local authorities and minority language speakers. Representatives of authorities pointed out on several occasions that most persons belonging to national minorities have a command of Armenian and "no problem" communicating with authorities in Armenian. In the view of the Committee of Experts, such statements reveal a misunderstanding of the objectives of the Charter which aims to promote the use of minority languages in all domains of public life with a view to maintaining these languages as living and fully functional languages. The use of a minority language in contacts with authorities should not be interpreted as a lack of command of Armenian, but as a natural choice in areas where minority languages have been traditionally used.

37. According to Armenia's state report, speakers of minority languages may submit applications in their languages to provincial authorities (i.e. local branches of the state authorities). In such cases, the replies would be given in Armenian, except for in cases when the applicant indicates that he or she expects to receive the reply in the minority language. In light of the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit, Russian speakers have experienced difficulties using their language with local branches of the state authorities. Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi do not seem to be used in contacts with such authorities as foreseen by Article 10.1.a.iv.

38. The state authorities have made available certain administrative texts and forms (Article 10.1.b) in Russian, but not in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi. In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers requested that documents relating to referenda and elections be translated into the minority languages to enable speakers to make an informed choice and to give the language a meaningful function. The Committee of Experts notes that the translation of administrative texts and forms is a relatively simple measure with benefits for the promotion of a minority language (see the Committee of Experts' comments on Article 9.3 above). Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should identify the texts and forms which are relevant for Article 10.1.b and translate them into Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Yezidi and, where still needed, Russian.

39. As far as local authorities are concerned, it is possible to submit oral or written applications in Russian to *inter alia* the municipalities of Fioletovo and Lermontovo (Lori province), in accordance with Article 10.2.b. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi are used in oral communication with local authorities, but not in written form. Greek does not seem to be used in contacts with local authorities. Against this background, the Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to develop a structured policy promoting the oral and written use of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Yezidi in contacts with, and by, local authorities. To this effect, the authorities should inform local authorities of their obligations under Article 10.2, increase the number of officials who master the minority languages orally and in writing (through staff mobility in accordance with Article 10.4.c, linguistic training and recruitment), make more official documents automatically available in minority languages (including on websites) and use these languages in administrative signage. Furthermore, the authorities should inform the speakers of the minority languages of the possibility to use the languages in dealings with those authorities

and encourage the speakers to make use of these possibilities. These observations apply similarly to Article 10.1.a.iv (local branches of state authorities, see above).

40. As the state report does not contain specific information on the actual use of minority languages by local authorities in debates of their assemblies (Article 10.2.f), the Committee of Experts relies on information obtained during the on-the-spot visit from representatives of local authorities. In light of this information, Assyrian is used for example in the local assembly of Verin Dvin and Russian *inter alia* in Fioletovo. However, despite the high proportion of Kurdish speakers in the municipality of Alagyaz, Kurdish is not used in the local assembly as not all the officials in charge of the meetings speak this language. Yezidi is in a similar situation. There is no information about whether Greek is used in local assembly debates. The Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should inform relevant municipalities of the obligation arising under Article 10.2.f and encourage them to take practical steps which make the oral and/or written use of the respective minority languages in debates of local assemblies possible.

41. In Armenia, there is no practice of using place names in two languages with respect to a settlement. Either a place name in a minority language is the sole official name or it is not officially used. Place names in *Russian* are the official names of *inter alia* the municipalities of Fioletovo, Lermontovo and Privolnoye (Lori province). The Committee of Experts visited Fioletovo during the on-the-spot visit and noted that some signs, though not the official place-name signs, mention “Fioletovo” in Cyrillic script. The street names in this place are signposted in Russian and the Cyrillic script. The Committee of Experts also noted that the official names of some places are *Kurdish* (e.g. Rya Taza, Aragatsotn province), but that these names are written only in the Armenian script and a transliteration in Latin script reflecting the English pronunciation (in particular on the official place-name signs). Armenia’s state report indicates that, in Kotayk province, signage in minority languages has been introduced in Arzni (*Assyrian*) as well as in Zovuni, Nor Geghi and Kanakeravan (all in *Yezidi*). However, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts what kind of signage has been introduced there and concerning which place names. In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers complained that even in places where Yezidis make up a large part of the population the names of villages and streets are signposted in Armenian only. The state report also refers to a discussion about introducing signage in Greek in Koghes and Yaghdan (Lori province). However, the local authorities have not implemented this measure, arguing that the local Greek-speaking population also speaks Armenian. Finally, the Committee of Experts has been informed by representatives of local authorities and minority language speakers that official place names in minority languages have been renamed and received names in Armenian. The process of changing names started at the time of Armenia’s independence and has affected names in different minority languages.

42. As the Committee of Experts has pointed out regarding many states parties, the adoption and use of traditional topographic names in minority languages is a relatively simple promotional measure increasing the visibility and prestige of a minority language, raising awareness among the majority population and maintaining the linguistic heritage. Therefore, the fact that speakers of a minority language also speak the majority language (such as the Greeks in Koghes and Yaghdan, see above) is not a reason for not adopting or using place names in minority languages. Given that the use of place names falls within the competence of each municipality, the Committee of Experts invites the Armenian national authorities to approach relevant municipalities, encourage them to adopt place names in local minority languages or to readopt place names that were abolished in the recent past, and to support the implementation of these measures with a specific funding scheme. As a first step, the Armenian authorities could, in co-operation with the representatives of the minority language speakers and experts, prepare an inventory of the traditional place names existing in the minority languages in Armenia.

43. It is not clear to the Committee of Experts whether users of minority languages are allowed to submit a request in such a language to public service providers. In practice, minority languages are not used in contacts with public service providers. The Committee of Experts notes that Armenia has ratified Article 10.3.c and Article 13.2.b. While Article 10.3.c requires that public service providers accept requests submitted to them in relevant minority languages, Article 13.2.b creates an obligation for the authorities to actively promote the use of minority languages in economic and social life in the public sector. The Committee of Experts notes that both undertakings complement each other and considers that the Armenian authorities should prepare, in co-operation with the representatives of the national minorities and the public service providers concerned, a strategy and an action plan concerning the promotion of the use of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi in contacts with, and by, public service providers or in other economic and social fields of the public sector, for example transport companies, postal services and energy suppliers.

44. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that the authorities take the language skills of public service employees into account. However, they do not seem to have a systematic approach to the handling of requests by officials who would like to use a minority language at work. Therefore, the Committee of Experts invites the Armenian authorities to establish a specific procedure on how to comply

with requests from public service employees who have knowledge of a minority language to be appointed in the territory where that language is used (Article 10.4.c).

45. Representatives of the speakers of most minority languages confirmed, during the on-the-spot visit, that it is possible to adopt family names in these languages (Article 10.5). However, official documents (e.g. identity documents) use these names in the Armenian script, supplemented by a transliteration in Latin script based on the English pronunciation. In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers pointed out that Yezidis encounter difficulties in adopting their historical surnames because of a lack of documents proving their accuracy and requested the authorities to simplify the related administrative procedure.

Use of the regional or minority languages in the media

46. In the last monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that Armenia “**create the appropriate conditions for the presence of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi on television and radio**”. Furthermore, the Committee of Ministers recommended that Armenia “**adopt a proactive attitude regarding the protection and promotion of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi in ... the media**”.

47. Armenia has ratified Article 11.1.a.iii which requires the authorities to make adequate provision so that public broadcasters offer television and radio programmes in the minority languages. Pursuant to the Law of the Republic of Armenia "On television and radio"¹⁰, there is an obligation for the Public Television and Radio Company to provide airtime for the broadcasting of programmes about the lives, cultures and languages of the national minorities of Armenia. The defined minimum airtime is 30 minutes per week on public television and 30 minutes per day on public radio.

48. Every day, the Armenian Public Radio broadcasts in Assyrian (15 minutes), Greek (15 minutes), Kurdish (30 minutes) and Yezidi (30 minutes). On working days, a news programme is broadcast in Russian (15 minutes). In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers expressed the wish to extend the presence of the minority languages on Public Radio so that the broadcasts make an effective contribution to the preservation and promotion of these languages.

49. According to the state report, the Public Television periodically broadcasts information programmes about national minorities in Armenian or Russian. In these programmes, representatives of national minorities speak in their languages while commenting on events or festivals of national minorities. The Committee of Experts has not received precise information about the extent to which Russian is used. As far as the other minority languages are concerned, the Committee of Experts notes that their use in the form of interviews results in a short broadcasting duration which fails to meet the requirements of Article 11.1.a.iii. Furthermore, there seems to be no predictability as to when a certain language will be used on television. In their current format, these broadcasts are unlikely to make an impact on the situation of the minority languages and should be seen as simply a measure to raise awareness of the existence of minority languages. Such awareness raising is relevant under Article 7.3. In order to fulfil Article 11.1.a.iii, it is important to broadcast individual programmes in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi and to ensure adequate broadcasting duration and regularity. In addition, the Committee of Experts underlines the importance of television programmes for children in minority languages in order to support language transmission.

50. Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi are not used in private radio and television programmes (Article 11.1.b.ii, cii). The Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to encourage and facilitate the use of these languages by private (commercial) broadcasters, for example through financial incentives or license requirements. As far as Russian is concerned, the Committee of Experts is aware that most private radio and television broadcasters in Armenia broadcast films and some programmes in Russian, which are watched and/or listened to by the entire population regardless of ethnic or linguistic affiliation.

51. In accordance with the Committee of Experts' standard interpretation, a “newspaper” in the sense of Article 11.1.e has to be published at least weekly.¹¹ In Armenia, a daily (“Golos Armenii”) and a weekly newspaper (“Novoe Vremya”) are published in Russian. There are no daily or weekly newspapers in the other minority languages. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should, in co-operation with representatives of the speakers, encourage the creation of newspapers in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi to be published at least weekly, including online when appropriate.

52. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed by representatives of the minority language speakers that there are no obstacles to the reception of radio and television broadcasts in the

¹⁰ Article 26, Part 2, point 3, sub-point d

¹¹ See, for example, the Committee of Experts' first report on Romania, ECRML(2012)3, paragraph 174.

minority languages from abroad (Article 11.2). The same applies to the circulation of information in the written press.

53. No member of the Commission on Television and Radio of the Republic of Armenia specifically represents speakers of minority languages. In addition, there is no mechanism ensuring that the interests of the minority language speakers are taken into account within the commission, as required by Article 11.3.

Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

54. The Armenian authorities have provided financial support to the publication of books and periodicals in minority languages, for example "Assyriskie Novosti" (quarterly in Russian and Assyrian), "Ilios" (monthly in Armenian, Russian and Greek), "Rya Taza" and "Zagros" (monthlies in Armenian and Kurdish), "Dnipro-Slavutich" (monthly in Ukrainian), "Ezdikhana" (monthly in Armenian and Yezidi), a family calendar in Yezidi and Armenian, and a poetry collection in different minority languages.

55. Furthermore, state support has been granted to cultural activities and events of national minorities. Examples include an exhibition on Assyrians in Armenia, an event presenting Greek culture and language and a concert by the German minority's folklore group at the Yerevan Day celebration. Cultural events of national minorities have also been organised in territories where the minority languages have not been traditionally used (Article 12.2).

56. The support to cultural activities in minority languages depends to a considerable extent on ad hoc initiatives by associations of national minorities. In order to ensure more sustainable and diversified support, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should actively approach the associations of the national minorities and jointly develop strategies on the mid-term and long-term production, dissemination and funding of cultural works in the respective minority language in several cultural domains.

57. In their report, the Armenian authorities state that they are willing to also present the culture of national minorities in other countries, but that the scarcity of financial means would make it difficult to fulfil their obligation under Article 12.3. In this context, the Committee of Experts notes that the implementation of this undertaking does not necessarily need to involve major expense or the organisation of events abroad. For example, the Armenian authorities could provide information about the existence of the minority languages and the cultural heritage related to them on the websites of Armenia's embassies and in promotional (including touristic) information produced and disseminated for an audience abroad.

Use of the regional or minority languages in economic and social life

58. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was not made aware of practices actively discouraging the use of minority languages in connection with economic or social activities (Article 13.1.c). However, the authorities have not reported on any activities organised by them with a view to facilitating and/or encouraging the use of minority languages in these domains, including in the public sector (Article 13.1.d, 13.2.b). While Russian is commonly used orally and in writing in economic life, Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi are, at most, used orally in places where a high proportion of the population speaks these languages. Greek is not used in economic life. No written use of Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi in economic life seems to exist (e.g. signage and publications of companies) and there is, more generally, a lack of awareness that the use of these languages by the private sector could make an important contribution to maintaining them as languages with functions in all fields of daily life. The Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should prepare, in co-operation with the representatives of the national minorities, a strategy and an action plan concerning the promotion of the use of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi in economic life. These measures should extend to both the private sector and to the public sector and complement the measures taken with respect to Article 10.3.c (see above).

59. As far as the use of minority languages by social care facilities is concerned, Armenia's state report refers to a number of relevant institutions¹² and indicates that speakers of all languages covered by the Charter are receiving care in such institutions. However, the report also states that such persons speak Armenian and that there is no information about difficulties faced by them in communicating with the staff. Furthermore, speakers of minority languages are among the staff of social care institutions. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the speakers confirmed that apart from Russian, no minority language is used in practice in social care facilities. The presence of staff who also speak languages such as Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and

¹² Children's Home, Children's Care and Protection Boarding Institution, Child and Family Support Centre, Children's Social Care Centre, Boarding House, Care Centre for People with Mental Disorders, Centre of Home Social Service Provision for Single Elderly and Disabled People

Yezidi is a result of coincidence and not of a specific recruitment policy. Considering that Article 13.2c contains the obligation to “ensure” that social care facilities offer the use of the aforementioned languages, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should adopt an active approach concerning the implementation of this undertaking. In particular, they should identify the social care facilities located in the areas where the minority languages are used, foresee the recruitment and/or linguistic training of a sufficient number of staff (e.g. doctors, nurses), actively inform speakers of these languages of the possibilities to use them and encourage the speakers to avail themselves of these possibilities.

Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges

60. In previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts was informed that Armenia had concluded bilateral agreements with, for example, Greece, the Russian Federation, Germany and Ukraine in whose framework activities to promote Greek, Russian, German and Ukrainian were organised (e.g. school exchanges, university co-operation). However, Armenia’s fifth state report does not contain specific information about the implementation of Articles 7.1.i and 14, in particular examples of relevant activities carried out in the framework of these bilateral agreements during the period under review. Representatives of the speakers of Russian and Ukrainian nonetheless confirmed during the on-the-spot visit that these languages are promoted in official co-operation with the Russian Federation and Ukraine. Moreover, according to their representatives, the Greek and German minorities co-operate with related minorities in Georgia (e.g. participation in Greek cultural activities and in Georgia’s celebration of the 200th anniversary of the settlement of Germans in the Caucasus). As far as Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi are concerned, the Committee of Experts has no information as to whether bilateral agreements exist with states in which these languages are used and, if so, whether these agreements have been applied to foster contacts between the users of these languages in the fields of culture, education and media (Article 14a).

61. Moreover, the state report does not contain specific examples of steps taken by authorities to facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders between regional or local authorities in whose territory Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Yezidi are used (Article 14.b). Several municipalities where Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi are used do not have twin municipalities abroad where the same language is used. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that associations of the Greek minority themselves maintain regular contacts with authorities in Greece which finance activities of the minority in Armenia. However, there is no information as to whether local or regional authorities in Armenia are actively involved in these contacts. The situation of Russian is different since, according to representatives of the speakers, this language benefits from several twinnings between Armenian cities (especially Yerevan) and cities in the Russian Federation.

Awareness raising about regional or minority languages

62. As mentioned with regard to Article 11.1.a.iii above, the Public Television periodically broadcasts information programmes about national minorities in Armenian or Russian which provide information on, for example, events organised by them. The Committee of Experts considers these programmes a measure to raise awareness in the general Armenian population of the existence of the minority languages in accordance with Article 7.3.

63. However, the Committee of Experts has not received specific information about measures taken in mainstream education (curricula, teaching materials, teacher training etc.) to inform pupils/students who do not belong to national minorities about the existence of the national minorities/minority languages in Armenia, in particular by indicating the names of these minorities and outlining the basics of the related history and culture. The Council of Europe and the EU have published such teaching materials about the history and cultural contributions made by the Assyrian, German, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Ukrainian minorities in Georgia. Considering that the history of these minorities is closely related to the history of the eponymous minorities in Armenia, the Armenian authorities could consider adapting these materials, in co-operation with the speakers and the Council of Europe.

64. In general, the Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to adopt a structured approach to promote awareness of the Armenian public of the minority languages and the cultures they represent as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Armenia, both in the general curriculum at all stages of mainstream education and in the mass media (Article 7.3).

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Armenia

65. **Assyrian** (covered by Parts II and III) is taught to a certain extent in primary education in Verin Dvin (the place with the highest number of Assyrians in Armenia, located in Ararat province) and Arzni (Kotayk province) as well as in Dimitrov (Ararat province) and Nor Artagers (Armavir province). It is also offered in No. 8 Alexander Pushkin Basic School and No. 29 Andranik Margaryan High School in Yerevan. According to the representatives of the Assyrian speakers, Armenia is the only country that has defined learning outcomes (expectations for reading, writing, speaking and listening at a certain grade) for Assyrian. There is some use of Assyrian in the new kindergarten of Verin Dvin. Teachers of Assyrian lack a specific professional education as there is no relevant specialisation offered by higher education institutions in Armenia. With funding from the Armenian authorities, the Assyrian minority issues a quarterly publication. Cultural activities in Assyrian are organised mainly in the municipalities where Assyrians make up a large proportion of the population.

66. **German** (covered by Part II) is used by four pre-schools and taught intensively (up to six hours weekly) by several primary and secondary schools mostly in Yerevan, some of which are also attended by children/students belonging to the German minority. Furthermore, the teaching of German as a foreign language is offered in primary and secondary education in different parts of Armenia. The association of the German minority organises language courses at its Sunday school in Yerevan. German is taught at a number of university or higher education institutions, which carry out research on this language. With funding from the Armenian authorities, the German minority association has published various books about the history of the Germans in Armenia and the Caucasus since the 19th century. It also has a folklore group which performs songs in German. In Yerevan, two libraries specialise in books and newspapers in German.

67. The speakers of **Greek** (covered by Parts II and III) reside mainly in Lori province and Yerevan, and, to a lesser extent, in the town of Gyumri (Shirak province). During the on-the spot-visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that the teaching of Greek is organised at Sunday schools operated by the Greek minority and funded by the Greek Embassy in Armenia. In Shirak province, a Sunday school teaches Greek three times a week (on Saturday, Sunday and Wednesday). A Sunday school is also operating in Yerevan. The Sunday school in Lori province which taught Greek one hour per week stopped operating in 2018 because the teacher migrated to Greece. A Centre of the Greek language and Greek culture exists in Yerevan. The teaching materials used for teaching Greek come from Greece as no teaching materials in Greek are produced in Armenia. During the on-the spot-visit, representatives of the Greek speakers informed the Committee of Experts that they wish to reintroduce teaching of Greek at School 12 or School 74 in Yerevan which had taught Greek in the past. Greek can be studied at the Yerevan State University and the Yerevan Brusov State University of Languages and Social Sciences. With regard to cultural activities, the Armenian authorities provide financial support for the monthly publication "Ilios" appearing in Russian, Armenian and Greek.¹³ An extensive collection of books in Greek is kept at the national library.

68. **Kurdish** (covered by Parts II and III) is *inter alia* taught at the secondary school in Alagyaz (Aragatsotn province), the largest Kurdish-populated municipality in Armenia. However, higher education institutions in Armenia do not offer a specialisation for the training of teachers of Kurdish. The teaching materials for Kurdish are outdated regarding topics and methodology. Kurdish does not seem to be used in pre-schools and is not taught in technical and vocational education. The Committee of Experts has not been informed whether adult education courses of Kurdish are offered. Kurdish can be studied at the Faculty of Oriental Studies at Yerevan State University where research on this language is also carried out. As for cultural activities, books containing poetry have been published in Kurdish with financial support from the Armenian authorities. Every year on 21 March, in different concert halls of Yerevan, the Kurdish National Committee of Armenia and the Kurdistan Committee of NGOs celebrate the Kurdish national holiday "Navroz" at which Kurds from all parts of Armenia come to participate.

69. **Russian** (covered by Parts II and III) has a very strong position in Armenia. Teaching in and of Russian is provided at all levels of education in Armenia, from pre-school to university. Pre-school, primary and secondary education in Russian is offered in the municipality of Fioletovo (Lori province), a traditional Russian settlement, as well as in other schools in the country. Russian is also widely taught as a second foreign language in all parts of Armenia, taught in technical and vocational education, and offered as an adult education course. Teaching materials used in schools providing education in Russian continue to be printed in Armenia. In addition, complementary teaching materials are imported from the Russian Federation. Russian

¹³ Moreover, in 2015, the association "Ilios Greek Community of Yerevan" received financial support for the translation of the documentary film about the Greek Genocide "Following the Traces of the Argonauts". In 2016, the "Khariton" ensemble of the Greek minority received financial support for its participation in the "Grape festival "The harvest by the centuries, Stimaga", an international folk-dance festival in Greece. In addition, the book "Sakkilari" by Greek author N. Nikolaidi and co-author A. Khurshudyan was published in 2016.

can be studied as a university subject in several higher education institutions in Armenia, and teachers of Russian receive appropriate university level education. Study and research on Russian are carried out in several educational and research institutions. Russian history, culture and literature are also to a certain extent integrated into the school curriculum. Russian is widely present in the public space and used in economic and social life. Literature in Russian is commonly available in libraries and bookshops, and many cultural events are organised regularly in Russian.

70. **Ukrainian** (covered by Part II) is not taught in regular pre-school, primary or secondary education in Armenia. However, the Ukrainian minority teaches the Ukrainian language and the history, literature and traditions of the minority at two Sunday schools in Yerevan and Vanadzor to children and adults. Nevertheless, there is a shortage of teaching materials in this language. Ukrainian is taught at the Yerevan Education and Research Institute, a branch of the Ternopil National Economic University (Ukraine). The Armenian authorities support cultural activities of the Ukrainian minority. There are two Ukrainian vocal groups ("Dnipro" and "Verbychen'ka") and a national dance group ("Sevan"). Furthermore, associations of the minority organise concerts and events (e.g. the Day of the Ukrainian Language in 2019). A monthly magazine ("Dnipro-Slavutich") is published in Ukrainian. In addition, a museum in the Taras Shevchenko State School (No. 42) in Yerevan is devoted to the Ukrainian poet Taras Shevchenko.

71. **Yezidi** (covered by Parts II and III) is not used in pre-school education. In secondary schools of municipalities where Yezidis make up a larger share of the population, Yezidi is taught, to some extent, outside the curriculum. Teaching materials for Yezidi are outdated regarding topics and methodology. Teachers of Yezidi do not have an appropriate professional education as there is no relevant specialisation offered in higher education in Armenia. Yezidi is not taught in technical and vocational education. The Committee of Experts has not been informed whether adult education courses of Yezidi are offered. Yezidis organise their cultural activities (e.g. national holidays) mainly in the rural municipalities with Yezidi population. Various cultural events such as exhibitions, film presentations, workshops and seminars are also organised by the Yezidi National Committee in Yerevan. Yezidi is mutually intelligible with Kurdish, but unlike Kurdish written in Cyrillic script.

Chapter 2 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Assyrian

2.1.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Assyrian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Assyrian ¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Assyrian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Assyrian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Assyrian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Assyrian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Assyrian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Assyrian at all appropriate stages					=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Assyrian to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Assyrian at universities or equivalent institutions				✓	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Assyrian					✓
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Assyrian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Assyrian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Assyrian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Assyrian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Assyrian	=				
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiv	favour and/or encourage the provision of pre-school education in Assyrian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Assyrian				✓	
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Assyrian, a substantial part of primary education in Assyrian or teaching of Assyrian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient					✓
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Assyrian, a substantial part of secondary education in Assyrian or teaching of Assyrian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient					✓
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Assyrian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Assyrian or teaching of Assyrian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient			=		

¹⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Assyrian¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Assyrian or of facilities for the study of Assyrian as an university or higher education subject				✓	
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Assyrian as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Assyrian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Assyrian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Assyrian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Assyrian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Assyrian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Assyrian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Assyrian and the related use of documents and evidence in Assyrian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.3	make available in Assyrian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Assyrian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Assyrian may submit oral or written applications in Assyrian to local branches of the national authorities			=		
10.1.av	ensure that users of Assyrian may validly submit a document in Assyrian to local branches of the national authorities ¹⁵					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Assyrian or in bilingual versions				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Assyrian to submit oral or written applications in Assyrian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Assyrian in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Assyrian		=			
10.3.c	allow users of Assyrian to submit a request in Assyrian to public service providers					✓
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Assyrian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Assyrian		✓			
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Assyrian		= ¹⁶		= ¹⁷	
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Assyrian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Assyrian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Assyrian				=	
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Assyrian ¹⁸					

¹⁵ Armenia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiv and 10.1.av which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.av.

¹⁶ public radio

¹⁷ public television

¹⁸ Armenia has ratified Article 11.1.e which covers two alternative options (ei and eii). Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.eii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Assyrian¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Assyrian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Assyrian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Assyrian 	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Assyrian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Assyrian		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Assyrian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Assyrian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Assyrian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Assyrian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Assyrian and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Assyrian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Assyrian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Assyrian in economic and social life				=	
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Assyrian in economic and social life				✓	
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Assyrian				✓	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Assyrian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Assyrian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education					✓
14.b	for the benefit of Assyrian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Assyrian is used in identical or similar form					✓

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

72. In light of the information provided in Armenia's state report, pre-school education, either in its entirety or for a substantial part, is not currently available in Assyrian. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers Article 8.1.a.iv not fulfilled. As far as primary and secondary education is concerned, the Committee of Experts has not received sufficient information to conclude on the fulfilment of Articles 8.1.b.iv and 8.1.c.iv. According to the replies by the Armenian authorities to the Committee of Experts' questionnaire, there is neither university or other higher education in Assyrian, nor are there facilities for the study of Assyrian as a university or higher education subject. Therefore, Articles 7.1.h and 8.1.e.iii are not fulfilled. The Armenian legislation regulating language use in judicial proceedings does not permit a speaker of Assyrian to use this language if he/she

speaks Armenian, nor does it guarantee that the use of Assyrian would not involve extra expense. Furthermore, Assyrian has not been used in practice before judicial authorities during the reporting period. Consequently, the Committee of Experts considers the undertakings concerned (Articles 9.1.a.ii, 9.1.a.iii, 9.1.a.iv, 9.1.b.ii, 9.1.c.ii, 9.1.c.iii, 9.1.d) not fulfilled. It is unclear to the Committee of Experts if users of Assyrian are allowed to submit a request in Assyrian to public service providers. According to information provided by representatives of the speakers, Assyrian is not used in practice in contacts with public service providers. Therefore, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of Article 10.3.c. While it is possible to adopt family names in Assyrian, official documents (e.g. identity documents) use these names in the Armenian script, in some case supplemented by a transliteration in Latin script based on the English pronunciation. Since there is no possibility to have the family name also written in the Assyrian script, the Committee of Experts considers Article 10.5 partly fulfilled. The Armenian authorities have not reported any activities organised by them to facilitate and/or encourage the use of Assyrian in economic and social life, including in the public sector (Article 13.2.b). Furthermore, the Armenian authorities are not actively ensuring that social care facilities, such as hospitals, offer the use of Assyrian (Article 13.2c). Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers both undertakings not fulfilled. The Committee of Experts has no information as to whether bilateral agreements exist with states in which Assyrian is used and, if so, whether these agreements have been applied to foster contacts between the users of this language in the fields of culture, education and media (Article 14a). Moreover, the state report does not contain specific examples of steps taken by authorities to facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders between regional or local authorities in whose territory Assyrian is used (Article 14.b). Consequently, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on Articles 7.1.i and 14.

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Assyrian in Armenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Armenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Armenia¹⁹ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Favour the provision of at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Assyrian and provide information about the teaching in/of Assyrian in primary and secondary education.**
- b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a public television programme in Assyrian on a regular basis and of a sufficiently long duration.**
- c. **Promote the use or adoption of place names in Assyrian in accordance with the script and spelling of this language.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the Assyrian speakers, a strategy on the promotion of the use of Assyrian in different fields of public life.
- e. Increase the funding to the national minority associations so as to ensure the promotion of Assyrian in different fields of public life.
- f. Teach Assyrian as an integral part of the curriculum in technical and vocational education.
- g. Encourage the provision of facilities for the study of Assyrian as a university or higher education subject, including teacher training.
- h. Favour the offer of Assyrian as a subject in adult and continuing education.
- i. Amend the relevant legislation pertaining to the use of minority languages before judicial authorities with a view to allowing Assyrian speakers to use this language in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters even if he/she speaks Armenian and without incurring additional expense.
- j. Ensure that users of Assyrian may submit oral or written applications in Assyrian to local branches of the national authorities and to local authorities.
- k. Make widely used national administrative texts and forms available in Assyrian or bilingually.
- l. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Assyrian on a regular basis.

¹⁹ RecChL(2006)2; CM/RecChL(2009)4; CM/RecChL(2014)2; CM/RecChL(2017)2

- m. Facilitate the creation of a newspaper in Assyrian published at least weekly, including online where appropriate.
- n. Organise activities to promote the use of Assyrian in economic and social life, including public services provided by administrative authorities.
- o. Ensure that social care facilities, such as hospitals, offer the use of Assyrian.
- p. Promote awareness of the Assyrian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Armenia in mainstream education and in the media.

2.2 German

2.2.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning German ²⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of German as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of German	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote German		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of German, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using German • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of German at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of German to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on German at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of German	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of German	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses German • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to German	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

²⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ \(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Armenia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Armenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Armenia²¹ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- | |
|---|
| a. Increase support to the Sunday school of the German minority, including by providing modern teaching materials in German. |
|---|

II. Further recommendations

- b. Promote awareness of the German language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Armenia in mainstream education and in the media.

²¹ RecChL(2006)2; CM/RecChL(2009)4; CM/RecChL(2014)2; CM/RecChL(2017)2

2.3 Greek

2.3.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Greek

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Greek ²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter (Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Greek as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Greek	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Greek		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Greek, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Greek • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Greek at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Greek to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Greek at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Greek					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Greek	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Greek among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Greek among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Greek • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Greek	=				
Part III of the Charter (Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiv	favour and/or encourage the provision of pre-school education in Greek or a substantial part of pre-school education in Greek				↘	
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Greek, a substantial part of primary education in Greek or teaching of Greek as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				↘	
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Greek, a substantial part of secondary education in Greek or teaching of Greek as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				↘	
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Greek, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Greek or teaching of Greek as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	↗				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Greek or of facilities for the study of Greek as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Greek as a subject of adult and continuing education		↘			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.a ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Greek in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			

²² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Greek²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Greek, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Greek, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Greek in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↗			
9.1.c.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Greek in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↗			
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Greek in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↗			
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Greek and the related use of documents and evidence in Greek, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.3	make available in Greek the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Greek				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.a.v	ensure that users of Greek may submit oral or written applications in Greek to local branches of the national authorities			=		
10.1.av	ensure that users of Greek may validly submit a document in Greek to local branches of the national authorities ²³					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Greek or in bilingual versions				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Greek to submit oral or written applications in Greek to the regional or local authority			=		
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Greek in debates in their assemblies			=		
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Greek		=			
10.3.c	allow users of Greek to submit a request in Greek to public service providers					✓
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Greek to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Greek		✓			
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Greek		= ²⁴		= ²⁵	
11.1.b.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Greek on a regular basis				=	
11.1.c.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Greek on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Greek				=	
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Greek ²⁶					
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Greek • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Greek • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Greek 	=				

²³ Armenia has ratified Articles 10.1.a.iv and 10.1.av which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.a.v.

²⁴ public radio

²⁵ public television

²⁶ Armenia has ratified Article 11.1.e which covers two alternative options (ei and eii). Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.eii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Greek ²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Greek		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Greek language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Greek in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Greek is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Greek	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Greek and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Greek	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Greek in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Greek in economic and social life				=	
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Greek in economic and social life				=	
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Greek				=	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Greek is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Greek in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education			✓		
14.b	for the benefit of Greek, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Greek is used in identical or similar form					✓

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

73. Greek is not taught in pre-school, primary or secondary education. Consequently, Articles 8.1.a.iv, 8.1.b.iv and 8.1.c.iv are not fulfilled. Nevertheless, according to the state report, Greek is taught at the “Yerevan Armenian-Greek State College of Tourism, Service and Food”, which fulfils Article 8.1.d.iv. The Greek minority runs Sunday schools, which *inter alia* offer Greek as a subject in adult education. However, Greek is not taught in continuing education. Therefore, Article 8.1.f.iii is partly fulfilled. The Armenian legislation regulating language use in judicial proceedings does not permit a speaker of Greek to use this language if he/she speaks Armenian, nor does it guarantee that the use of Greek would not involve extra expense. However, there were cases of translations from/into Greek made in criminal and civil proceedings during the reporting period. Considering, on the one hand, the deficient legal framework, but on the other hand a certain (albeit limited) practice, the Committee of Experts considers the undertakings concerned (Articles 9.1.a.ii, 9.1.a.iii, 9.1.a.iv, 9.1.b.ii, 9.1.c.ii, 9.1.c.iii, 9.1.d) partly fulfilled. It is unclear to the Committee of Experts if users of Greek are allowed to submit a request in Greek to public service providers. According to information provided by representatives of the speakers, Greek is not used in practice in contacts with public service providers. Therefore, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of Article 10.3.c. While it is possible to adopt family names in Greek, official documents (e.g. identity documents) use these names in the Armenian script, in some

case supplemented by a transliteration in Latin script based on the English pronunciation. The Committee of Experts therefore considers Article 10.5 partly fulfilled. Armenia has concluded bilateral agreements with Greece, but the Committee of Experts has not received examples of activities carried out in their framework which foster contacts between the users of Greek in the fields of culture, education and media. Therefore, Article 14a is considered only formally fulfilled. Moreover, the state report does not contain specific examples of steps taken by authorities to facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders between regional or local authorities in whose territory Greek is used (Article 14.b). Consequently, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on Article 14.b.

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Greek in Armenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Armenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Armenia²⁷ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Favour the provision of at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Greek and teach Greek as an integral part of the curriculum in primary and secondary education.**
- b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a public television programme in Greek on a regular basis and of a sufficiently long duration.**
- c. **Promote the use or adoption of place names in Greek in accordance with the script and spelling of this language.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the Greek speakers, a strategy on the promotion of the use of Greek in different fields of public life.
- e. Increase the funding to the national minority associations so as to ensure the promotion of Greek in different fields of public life.
- f. Favour the offer of Greek as a subject in continuing education.
- g. Amend the relevant legislation pertaining to the use of minority languages before judicial authorities with a view to allowing Greek speakers to use this language in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters even if he/she speaks Armenian and without incurring additional expense.
- h. Ensure that users of Greek may submit oral or written applications in Greek to local branches of the national authorities and to local authorities.
- i. Make widely used national administrative texts and forms available in Greek or bilingually.
- j. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Greek on a regular basis.
- k. Facilitate the creation of a newspaper in Greek published at least weekly, including online where appropriate.
- l. Organise activities to promote the use of Greek in economic and social life, including public services provided by administrative authorities.
- m. Ensure that social care facilities, such as hospitals, offer the use of Greek.
- n. Promote awareness of the Greek language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Armenia in mainstream education and in the media.

²⁷ RecChL(2006)2; CM/RecChL(2009)4; CM/RecChL(2014)2; CM/RecChL(2017)2

2.4 Kurdish

2.4.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Kurdish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Kurdish ²⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Kurdish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Kurdish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Kurdish		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Kurdish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Kurdish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Kurdish at all appropriate stages					↘
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Kurdish to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Kurdish at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Kurdish					↘
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Kurdish	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Kurdish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Kurdish among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Kurdish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Kurdish 	=				
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiv	favour and/or encourage the provision of pre-school education in Kurdish or a substantial part of pre-school education in Kurdish				↘	
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Kurdish, a substantial part of primary education in Kurdish or teaching of Kurdish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient					↘
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Kurdish, a substantial part of secondary education in Kurdish or teaching of Kurdish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient					↘
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Kurdish, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Kurdish or teaching of Kurdish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient			=		
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Kurdish or of facilities for the study of Kurdish as an university or higher education subject	↗				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Kurdish as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Kurdish in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				↘	

²⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Kurdish²⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Kurdish, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Kurdish, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Kurdish in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.c.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Kurdish in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Kurdish in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Kurdish and the related use of documents and evidence in Kurdish, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.3	make available in Kurdish the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Kurdish				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.a.v	ensure that users of Kurdish may submit oral or written applications in Kurdish to local branches of the national authorities			=		
10.1.av	ensure that users of Kurdish may validly submit a document in Kurdish to local branches of the national authorities ²⁹					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Kurdish or in bilingual versions				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Kurdish to submit oral or written applications in Kurdish to the regional or local authority		✓			
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Kurdish in debates in their assemblies			✓		
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Kurdish		↗			
10.3.c	allow users of Kurdish to submit a request in Kurdish to public service providers					✓
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Kurdish to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Kurdish		✓			
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Kurdish		=		=	
11.1.b.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Kurdish on a regular basis				=	
11.1.c.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Kurdish on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Kurdish				=	
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Kurdish ³²					
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Kurdish • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Kurdish • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Kurdish 	=				

²⁹ Armenia has ratified Articles 10.1.a.iv and 10.1.av which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.av.

³⁰ public radio

³¹ public television

³² Armenia has ratified Article 11.1.e which covers two alternative options (ei and eii). Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.eii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Kurdish ²⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Kurdish are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Kurdish		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Kurdish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Kurdish in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Kurdish is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Kurdish	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Kurdish and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Kurdish	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Kurdish in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Kurdish in economic and social life				=	
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Kurdish in economic and social life				=	
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Kurdish				=	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Kurdish is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Kurdish in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education					✓
14.b	for the benefit of Kurdish, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Kurdish is used in identical or similar form					✓

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

74. In light of the information provided in Armenia's state report, pre-school education entirely in Kurdish or a substantial part of pre-school education in this language is not currently available. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers Article 8.1.a.iv not fulfilled. As far as primary and secondary education is concerned, the Committee of Experts has not received sufficient information to conclude on the fulfilment of Articles 7.1.f, 8.1.b.iv and 8.1.c.iv. According to the replies by the Armenian authorities to the Committee of Experts' questionnaire, Kurdish can be studied at Yerevan State University as a subject, which fulfils Articles 7.1.h and 8.1.e.iii. The Armenian legislation regulating language use in judicial proceedings does not permit a speaker of Kurdish to use this language if he/she speaks Armenian, nor does it guarantee that the use of Kurdish would not involve extra expense. In addition, there were very few cases of translations from/into Kurdish made in criminal proceedings during the reporting period. Considering the deficient legal framework and the very limited practice, the Committee of Experts considers the undertakings concerned (Articles 9.1.a.ii, 9.1.a.iii, 9.1.a.iv, 9.1.b.ii, 9.1.c.ii, 9.1.c.iii, 9.1.d) not fulfilled. While Kurdish can be used orally in contacts with local authorities, the Committee of Experts has not received any information as to whether Kurdish is also used in its written form in such cases. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers Article 10.2.b partly fulfilled.

Furthermore, there is no information as to whether Kurdish has been used in debates of local assemblies during the reporting period; Article 10.2.f is therefore only formally fulfilled. The Committee of Experts is aware that the official names of some settlements in Armenia are Kurdish (e.g. Rya Taza), but notes that these names are written only in the Armenian script and a transliteration in Latin script reflecting the English pronunciation (in particular on the official place-name signs). Article 10.2.g is therefore only partly fulfilled. It is unclear to the Committee of Experts if users of Kurdish are allowed to submit a request in Kurdish to public service providers. According to information provided by representatives of the speakers, Kurdish is not used in practice in contacts with public service providers. Therefore, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of Article 10.3.c. While it is possible to adopt family names in Kurdish, official documents (e.g. identity documents) use these names in the Armenian script, in some case supplemented by a transliteration in Latin script based on the English pronunciation. The Committee of Experts therefore considers Article 10.5 partly fulfilled. The Committee of Experts has no information as to whether bilateral agreements exist with states in which Kurdish is used and, if so, whether these agreements have been applied to foster contacts between the users of this language in the fields of culture, education and media (Article 14a). Moreover, the state report does not contain specific examples of steps taken by authorities to facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders between regional or local authorities in whose territory Kurdish is used (Article 14.b). Consequently, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on Articles 7.1.i and 14.

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Kurdish in Armenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Armenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Armenia³³ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Favour the provision of at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Kurdish and provide information about the teaching in/of Kurdish in primary and secondary education.**
- b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a public television programme in Kurdish on a regular basis and of a sufficiently long duration.**
- c. **Promote the use or adoption of place names in Kurdish in accordance with the script and spelling of this language.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the Kurdish speakers, a strategy on the promotion of the use of Kurdish in different fields of public life.
- e. Increase the funding to the national minority associations so as to ensure the promotion of Kurdish in different fields of public life.
- f. Teach Kurdish as an integral part of the curriculum in technical and vocational education.
- g. Favour the offer of Kurdish as a subject in adult and continuing education.
- h. Amend the relevant legislation pertaining to the use of minority languages before judicial authorities with a view to allowing Kurdish speakers to use this language in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters even if he/she speaks Armenian and without incurring additional expense.
- i. Ensure that users of Kurdish may submit written applications in Kurdish to local branches of the national authorities and to local authorities.
- j. Make widely used national administrative texts and forms available in Kurdish or bilingually.
- k. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Kurdish on a regular basis.
- l. Facilitate the creation of a newspaper in Kurdish published at least weekly, including online where appropriate.
- m. Organise activities to promote the use of Kurdish in economic and social life, including public services provided by administrative authorities.
- n. Ensure that social care facilities, such as hospitals, offer the use of Kurdish.

³³ RecChL(2006)2; CM/RecChL(2009)4; CM/RecChL(2014)2; CM/RecChL(2017)2

- o. Promote awareness of the Kurdish language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Armenia in mainstream education and in the media.

2.5 Russian

2.5.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Russian ³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter (Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Russian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Russian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Russian	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Russian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Russian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Russian at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Russian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Russian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Russian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Russian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among their objectives	=				
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Russian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Russian	=				
Part III of the Charter (Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiv	favour and/or encourage the provision of pre-school education in Russian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Russian	=				
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Russian, a substantial part of primary education in Russian or teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Russian, a substantial part of secondary education in Russian or teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Russian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Russian or teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Russian or of facilities for the study of Russian as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Russian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.a ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Russian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			

³⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Russian³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Russian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Russian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Russian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↙			
9.1.c.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Russian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↗			
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Russian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↗			
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Russian and the related use of documents and evidence in Russian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.3	make available in Russian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Russian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.a.v	ensure that users of Russian may submit oral or written applications in Russian to local branches of the national authorities		↙			
10.1.av	ensure that users of Russian may validly submit a document in Russian to local branches of the national authorities ³⁵					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Russian or in bilingual versions		=			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Russian to submit oral or written applications in Russian to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Russian in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Russian		=			
10.3.c	allow users of Russian to submit a request in Russian to public service providers					↙
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Russian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Russian		↗			
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Russian		=	³⁶		↙ ³⁷
11.1.b.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Russian on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.c.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Russian on a regular basis	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Russian	=				
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Russian ³⁸					
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Russian 	=				

³⁵ Armenia has ratified Articles 10.1.a.iv and 10.1.av which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.av.

³⁶ public radio

³⁷ public television

³⁸ Armenia has ratified Article 11.1.e which covers two alternative options (ei and eii). Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.eii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Russian ³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Russian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=			=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Russian	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Russian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Russian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Russian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Russian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Russian and the culture it reflects	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Russian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Russian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Russian in economic and social life	=				
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Russian in economic and social life	=				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Russian	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Russian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Russian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Russian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Russian is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

75. The Armenian legislation regulating language use in judicial proceedings does not permit a speaker of Russian to use this language if he/she speaks Armenian, nor does it guarantee that the use of Russian would not involve extra expense. Nevertheless, the Armenian authorities have provided data indicating that translations from/into Russian have been made in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters. Considering, on the one hand, the deficient legal framework, but, on the other hand, a certain (though limited) practice, the Committee of Experts considers the undertakings concerned (Articles 9.1.a.ii, 9.1.a.iii, 9.1.a.iv, 9.1.b.ii, 9.1.c.ii, 9.1.c.iii, 9.1.d) partly fulfilled. According to Armenia's state report, minority language speakers may submit applications in their languages to provincial authorities (i.e. local branches of the state authorities). However, in light of the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit, Russian speakers have experienced difficulties in submitting written applications in Russian to local branches of the state authorities. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers Article 10.1.a.iv partly fulfilled. It is unclear to the Committee of Experts if users of Russian are allowed to submit a request in Russian to public service providers. According to information provided by representatives of the speakers, Russian is in practice not used in contacts with public service providers. Therefore, the Committee

of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of Article 10.3.c. While it is possible to adopt family names in Russian, official documents (e.g. identity documents) use these names in the Armenian script, in some case supplemented by a transliteration in Latin script based on the English pronunciation. The Committee of Experts therefore considers Article 10.5 partly fulfilled. According to the state report, the Public Television periodically broadcasts information programmes about national minorities in Armenian or Russian. The Committee of Experts has not received precise information about the extent to which Russian is used and is therefore not in a position to conclude on Article 11.1.a.iii regarding television. With regard to Article 11.1.b.ii, the Committee of Experts is aware that private radio stations also broadcast in Russian and considers this undertaking fulfilled.

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Armenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Armenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Armenia³⁹ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Ensure that users of Russian may submit written applications in Russian to local branches of the national authorities.
--

II. Further recommendations

- b. Amend the relevant legislation pertaining to the use of minority languages before judicial authorities with a view to allowing Russian speakers to use this language in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters even if he/she speaks Armenian and without incurring additional expense.
- c. Make widely used national administrative texts and forms available in Russian or bilingually.

³⁹ RecChL(2006)2; CM/RecChL(2009)4; CM/RecChL(2014)2; CM/RecChL(2017)2

2.6 Ukrainian

2.6.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Ukrainian ⁴⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Ukrainian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ukrainian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ukrainian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ukrainian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Ukrainian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ukrainian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ukrainian to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ukrainian at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ukrainian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ukrainian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ukrainian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ukrainian	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

⁴⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ \(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Armenia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Armenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Armenia⁴¹ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- | |
|--|
| a. Increase support to the Sunday schools of the Ukrainian minority, including by providing modern teaching materials in Ukrainian. |
|--|

II. Further recommendations

- b. Provide for the teaching of Ukrainian at primary and secondary school levels.
- c. Increase the funding to the national minority associations so as to ensure the promotion of Ukrainian in different fields of public life.
- d. Promote awareness of the Ukrainian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Armenia in mainstream education and in the media.

⁴¹ RecChL(2006)2; CM/RecChL(2009)4; CM/RecChL(2014)2; CM/RecChL(2017)2

2.7 Yezidi

2.7.1 Compliance of Armenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yezidi

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Yezidi ⁴²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Yezidi as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Yezidi	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Yezidi		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Yezidi, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Yezidi • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Yezidi at all appropriate stages					↘
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Yezidi to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Yezidi at universities or equivalent institutions				↘	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Yezidi					↘
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Yezidi	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yezidi among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yezidi among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Yezidi • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Yezidi 	=				
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiv	favour and/or encourage the provision of pre-school education in Yezidi or a substantial part of pre-school education in Yezidi				↘	
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Yezidi, a substantial part of primary education in Yezidi or teaching of Yezidi as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient					↘
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Yezidi, a substantial part of secondary education in Yezidi or teaching of Yezidi as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				↘	
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Yezidi, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Yezidi or teaching of Yezidi as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Yezidi or of facilities for the study of Yezidi as an university or higher education subject				↘	
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Yezidi as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Yezidi in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				↘	

⁴² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Yezidi⁴²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Yezidi, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Yezidi, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Yezidi in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.c.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Yezidi in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Yezidi in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				✓	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Yezidi and the related use of documents and evidence in Yezidi, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				✓	
9.3	make available in Yezidi the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Yezidi				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.a.v	ensure that users of Yezidi may submit oral or written applications in Yezidi to local branches of the national authorities			✓		
10.1.av	ensure that users of Yezidi may validly submit a document in Yezidi to local branches of the national authorities ⁴³					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Yezidi or in bilingual versions				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Yezidi to submit oral or written applications in Yezidi to the regional or local authority		✓			
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Yezidi in debates in their assemblies			✓		
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Yezidi		=			
10.3.c	allow users of Yezidi to submit a request in Yezidi to public service providers					✓
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Yezidi to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Yezidi		↗			
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Yezidi		=44		=45	
11.1.b.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Yezidi on a regular basis				=	
11.1.c.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Yezidi on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Yezidi				=	
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Yezidi ⁴⁶					
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Yezidi • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Yezidi • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Yezidi 	=				

⁴³ Armenia has ratified Articles 10.1.a.iv and 10.1.av which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.av.

⁴⁴ public radio

⁴⁵ public television

⁴⁶ Armenia has ratified Article 11.1.e which covers two alternative options (ei and eii). Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.eii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Armenia concerning Yezidi ⁴²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Yezidi are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Yezidi		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Yezidi language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Yezidi in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Yezidi is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Yezidi	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Yezidi and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Yezidi	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Yezidi in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Yezidi in economic and social life				=	
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Yezidi in economic and social life				=	
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Yezidi				✓	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Yezidi is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Yezidi in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education					✓
14.b	for the benefit of Yezidi, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Yezidi is used in identical or similar form					✓

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

76. In light of the information provided in Armenia's state report, pre-school education, either in its entirety or for a substantial part, is not currently available in Yezidi. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers Article 8.1.a.iv not fulfilled. As far as primary education is concerned, the Committee of Experts has not received sufficient information to conclude on the fulfilment of Articles 7.1.f and 8.1.b.iv. Armenia's state report indicates that no curriculum exists for teaching Yezidi in secondary education. In their statement submitted to the Committee of Experts, representatives of the Yezidi speakers stated that Yezidi is taught outside the curriculum. In light of this information, the Committee of Experts considers Article 8.1.c.iv not fulfilled. According to the replies by the Armenian authorities to the Committee of Experts' questionnaire, there is neither university or other higher education in Yezidi, nor are there facilities for the study of Yezidi as a university or higher education subject. Therefore, Articles 7.1.h and 8.1.e.iii are not fulfilled. The Armenian legislation regulating language use in judicial proceedings does not permit a speaker of Yezidi to use this language if he/she speaks Armenian, nor does it guarantee that the use of Yezidi would not involve extra expense. In addition, there were very few cases of translations from/into Yezidi made in criminal proceedings during the reporting period. Considering the deficient legal framework and the very limited practice, the Committee of Experts considers the undertakings concerned (Articles 9.1.a.ii, 9.1.a.iii, 9.1.a.iv, 9.1.b.ii, 9.1.c.ii, 9.1.c.iii, 9.1.d) not fulfilled. In practice, no oral or written applications in Yezidi are transmitted to local branches of the national authorities;

therefore, Article 10.1.aiv is only formally fulfilled. While Yezidi can be used orally in contacts with local authorities, the Committee of Experts has not received any information as to whether Yezidi is also used in its written form in such cases. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers Article 10.2.b partly fulfilled. Furthermore, there is no information as to whether Yezidi has been used in debates of local assemblies during the reporting period; Article 10.2.f is only formally fulfilled. It is unclear to the Committee of Experts if users of Yezidi are allowed to submit a request in Yezidi to public service providers. According to information provided by representatives of the speakers, Yezidi is in practice not used in contacts with public service providers. Therefore, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of Article 10.3.c. While it is possible to adopt family names in Yezidi, official documents (e.g. identity documents) use these names in the Armenian script, in some case supplemented by a transliteration in Latin script based on the English pronunciation. The Committee of Experts therefore considers Article 10.5 partly fulfilled. Furthermore, the Armenian authorities are not actively ensuring that social care facilities, such as hospitals, offer the use of Yezidi (Article 13.2c). Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers this undertaking not fulfilled. The Committee of Experts has no information as to whether bilateral agreements exist with states in which Yezidi is used and, if so, whether these agreements have been applied to foster contacts between the users of this language in the fields of culture, education and media (Article 14a). Moreover, the state report does not contain specific examples of steps taken by authorities to facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders between regional or local authorities in whose territory Yezidi is used (Article 14.b). Consequently, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on Articles 7.1.i and 14.

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yezidi in Armenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Armenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Armenia⁴⁷ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Favour the provision of at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Yezidi and provide information about the teaching in/of Yezidi in primary education.**
- b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a public television programme in Yezidi on a regular basis and of a sufficiently long duration.**
- c. **Promote the use or adoption of place names in Yezidi in accordance with the script and spelling of this language.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the Yezidi speakers, a strategy on the promotion of the use of Yezidi in different fields of public life.
- e. Increase the funding to the national minority associations so as to ensure the promotion of Yezidi in different fields of public life.
- f. Teach Yezidi as an integral part of the curriculum in secondary as well as technical and vocational education.
- g. Encourage the provision of facilities for the study of Yezidi as a university or higher education subject, including teacher training.
- h. Favour the offer of Yezidi as a subject in adult and continuing education.
- i. Amend the relevant legislation pertaining to the use of minority languages before judicial authorities with a view to allowing Yezidi speakers to use this language in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters even if he/she speaks Armenian and without incurring additional expense.
- j. Ensure that users of Yezidi may submit oral or written applications in Yezidi to local branches of the national authorities and to local authorities.
- k. Make widely used national administrative texts and forms available in Yezidi or bilingually.
- l. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Yezidi on a regular basis.

⁴⁷ RecChL(2006)2; CM/RecChL(2009)4; CM/RecChL(2014)2; CM/RecChL(2017)2

- m. Facilitate the creation of a newspaper in Yezidi published at least weekly, including online where appropriate.
- n. Organise activities to promote the use of Yezidi in economic and social life, including public services provided by administrative authorities.
- o. Ensure that social care facilities, such as hospitals, offer the use of Yezidi.
- p. Promote awareness of the Yezidi language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Armenia in mainstream education and in the media.

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Armenian authorities have undertaken to protect the regional and minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Armenia.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Bearing in mind the instrument of ratification deposited by Armenia on 25 January 2002;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Armenia;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Armenia in its fifth periodical report, supplementary information given by the Armenian authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Armenia and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

[Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Armenian authorities on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;]

Recommends that Armenia take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. favour the provision of at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi;
2. improve minority language teaching in primary and secondary education by extending the number of weekly lessons, promoting teacher training and producing modern teaching materials;
3. introduce the broadcasting of a public television programme in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi on a regular basis and of a sufficiently long duration;
4. take steps to ensure that speakers of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Yezidi can use their language in contacts with administrative and judicial authorities;
5. promote the use or adoption of place names in the minority languages in the municipalities concerned;
6. provide adequate funding for cultural activities and to the national minority associations in order to ensure the promotion of the minority languages, including extracurricular education.

The Committee of Ministers invites the Armenian authorities to submit the information on the recommendations for immediate action contained in the fifth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts by 1 May 2021.⁴⁸

⁴⁸ See Committee of Ministers Decisions [CM/Del/Dec\(2018\)1330/10.4e - CM-Public](#), and Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the states parties, [CM\(2019\)69 final](#).

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification

Armenia

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 25 January 2002 - Or. Engl.

In accordance with Article 3, paragraph 1, of the Charter, the Republic of Armenia declares that within the meaning of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, minority languages in the Republic of Armenia are Assyrian, Yezidi, Greek, Russian and Kurdish languages.

Period covered: 01/05/2002 -

Articles concerned: 3

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 25 January 2002 - Or. Engl.

According to Article 2, paragraph 2, of the Charter, the Republic of Armenia declares that it shall apply the following provisions of the Charter to the Assyrian, Yezidi, Greek, Russian and Kurdish languages:

Article 8 - Education

Sub-paragraphs 1.a.iv; 1.b.iv; 1.c.iv; 1.d.iv; 1.e.iii; 1.f.iii.

Article 9 - Judicial authorities

Sub-paragraphs 1.a.ii, iii, iv; 1.b.ii; 1.c.ii and iii; 1.d.

Paragraph 3.

Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services

Sub-paragraphs 1.a.iv and v; 1.b; 2.b; 2.f; 2.g; 3.c; 4.c.

Paragraph 5.

Article 11 - Media

Sub-paragraphs 1.a.iii; 1.b.ii; 1.c.ii; 1.e.

Paragraphs 2 and 3.

Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities

Sub-paragraphs 1.a.d.f. (*)

Paragraphs 2 and 3.

Article 13 - Economic and social life

Sub-paragraphs 1.b; 1.c; 1.d; 2.b; 2.c.

Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges

Paragraphs a and b.

[(*) Declaration contained in a Note verbale from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Armenia, dated 23 March 2004, transmitted by a Note verbale from the Permanent Representation of Armenia, dated 31 March 2004, registered at the Secretariat General on 1 April 2004 - Or. Engl.

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Armenia draws the attention of the Secretariat General to a technical error contained in Armenia's instrument of ratification of the Charter.

When depositing the instrument of ratification, an error of translation occurred, namely Armenia made undertakings concerning Article 12 of the Charter, where the subparagraph c) was included. Indeed, by decision N-247-2 of 28 December 2001 of the National Assembly, Armenia is bound by subparagraph d) of Article 12.]

Period covered: 01/05/2002 -

Articles concerned: 2

Appendix II: Comments from the Armenian authorities

Use of the regional or minority languages in education

- 15. In the last monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that Armenia “promote the use of Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi in pre-school education and extend the offer of teaching of these languages at primary and secondary levels, paying particular attention to teacher training.”**

According to the *Law on Pre-School Education* adopted on May 6, 2020, pre-school education of national minorities in the Republic of Armenia can be organized in their mother tongue or national language alongside with compulsory education in Armenian.

Armenia provides ongoing support to the organization of pre-school education in the relevant languages for the communities of national minorities. Pre-school education centres have been set up in school buildings in a number of rural communities of Armenia, where classes for 4-5-year-old children of national minorities operate in the first half of the day. At the same time, the implementation of the state policy in the field of pre-school education is carried out by the local self-government bodies, therefore, the organization of classes depends on the financial capacity of the local self-government bodies. The issue of pre-school education for Yezidi and Kurdish children living in Armenia is regularly discussed with the local authorities of the respective settlements, but in some communities the number of pre-school children is so few that it is difficult for the local authorities to carry out the classes.

Armenia provides ethnic minorities’ language teaching at elementary grades as an integral part of the curriculum, and this education is organized even if there is an insufficient number of students. In rural schools of Yezidi-Kurdish settlements Yezidi and Kurdish languages are taught in elementary grades, provided that there is a specialist, regardless of the number of children, even for 2-3 children.

Minority languages are taught in the framework of basic education as an integral part of the curriculum for pupils who have applied and where the number of applicants are sufficient.

In higher grades Russian, Assyrian and Greek languages are taught, and so is the case with Yezidi and Kurdish languages though with some reservations, as schools in some rural areas of the Kurds and Yezidis are basic, based on the insufficient number of children for the higher grades.

Since 2017 the curriculum of the *Secondary School for National Minorities*, developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of Armenia (*currently Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport*) included the subject “*National Language and Literature*” of the national minorities in each primary grades with 4 hours per week. For each of the middle and higher grades the subject on “*Native Language and Literature of National Minorities*” is taught 3-4 hours per week.

- 18. Representatives of the Russian speakers confirmed during the on-the-spot visit that Russian is taught in technical and vocational education (Article 8.1.div). Furthermore, Greek is taught at the “Yerevan Armenian-Greek State College of Tourism, Service and Food”. Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi are not taught at that level of education.**

German and French are also taught in a number of VET institutions. Teaching of Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi as an integral part of the curriculum was not provided due to lack of applicants. The teaching of 2 foreign languages is envisaged by VET state educational standards. Only in case of existence of at least 10 applicants the educational institution can consider the possibility of its implementation.

- 19. At university, German, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Ukrainian can be studied as subjects. This is not the case for Assyrian and Yezidi. According to the state report, the teachers of Yezidi have no higher professional education since there are no relevant faculties in higher educational establishments of Armenia.**

German, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Ukrainian, as well as Assyrian can be studied as a subject at the university. Assyrian language is taught at Yerevan State University.

The Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport of the Republic of Armenia is ready to assist the communities of national minorities in resolving the human resource problem if the community representatives wish to obtain a relevant profession. In order to fully organize the education of the children of the Yezidi and Kurdish communities, there is a constant need of replenishing the staff of Yezidi and Kurdish professionals. However, the state's efforts in this regard will only be effective if representatives of the Yezidi and Kurdish communities apply to higher education institutions of Armenia for using study spots provided for them for free.

20. According to representatives of most national minorities, the lack of teachers of the minority languages is one of the main bottlenecks in the development of minority language education. There are two main structural problems: the low (especially financial) attractiveness of a job in teaching and deficits in the training of teachers. In light of the information obtained during the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to take comprehensive steps to improve the training of teachers of the minority languages. These steps should include an increase in the salaries of teachers, the use of long-term contracts for teachers, improved learning of languages and didactics at university, and the proactive recruitment of graduates of relevant studies as language teachers.

Until 2019, one fifth of the pedagogical staff of Armenia, in accordance with the law, has passed the mandatory training and certification, which was carried out by the National Institute of Education of Armenia. Since 2019, no teacher training or certification has been conducted in Armenia, pending the modernization and reform of this process. A new order for training and certification of teaching staff is being developed. At the same time, reforms in the field of education, including the increase of salaries, are carried out exclusively in the manner prescribed by law, and apply to all beneficiaries without any discrimination.

23. According to representatives of the speakers of all minority languages except Russian, there is a need to improve the quality and methodology of teaching materials for the teaching of minority languages and to produce teaching materials for all grades of education and for all minority languages. In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers expressed the wish to set up an expert group which will work on new teaching materials. The Committee of Experts calls on the Armenian authorities to produce modern teaching materials and teacher manuals in Assyrian, German, Greek, Kurdish, Ukrainian and Yezidi, improving the linguistic quality and increasing the learner orientation (methods, adapted topics and texts, needs of the pupils/students), as well as teaching materials and teacher manuals for these languages in Armenia. In the framework of co-operation on minority languages with Georgia, the Council of Europe and the EU have published free teaching materials for kindergarten (for age three to six) in Assyrian, German, Greek, Kurdish, Russian and Ukrainian, which may be used by authorities, teachers and parents in Armenia as well.

During the 2018-2020 years, 16810 Yezidi and 1500 Kurdish textbooks have been published with the means of the state budget. 1500 Assyrian textbooks were published in 2019. Curricula are developed by relevant specialists (representatives of national minorities) and educational resources in the languages of national minorities are published on the basis of the programs and proposals created by them. At the same time, any literature or teaching material can be submitted for review, in order to make them applicable in public schools.

Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial and administrative authorities

Paragraphs 24-34

Articles 9 and 10 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages set out the obligations of States Parties to ensure the use of national minority languages in judicial and administrative bodies, as well as the use of national minority languages in public service activities. Article 9 of the Charter stipulates, in particular, that States Parties undertake both in criminal, civil and administrative cases in the courts

1. to ensure that, by the request of one of the persons participating in the proceedings, the courts conduct the case in the regional or minority language and/or,
2. to guarantee the use of regional or minority language of the accused in criminal cases and in civil and administrative cases of any person participating in the court session.

In criminal cases, the Parties undertake to:

1. Ensure that inquiries and evidences (written or oral) should not be considered inadmissible simply because it was written in a regional or minority language, and/or,
2. Upon request, provide documents related to legal cases in the regional or minority languages, if necessary, through translators and translations without excluding additional costs for stakeholders.

In addition, in civil and administrative cases, the Parties undertake to allow documents and evidences to be provided in the regional or minority languages and where appropriate, where appropriate, by translators and translations.

According to Article 12 of the Judicial Code of the Republic of Armenia:

1. The language of the proceedings in the Republic of Armenia is Armenian.
2. All documents are submitted to the court in Armenian or properly translated into Armenian, except in cases provided by law.
3. Everyone has the right to take part in the trial in the language of his choice, if he provides a proper Armenian translation.
4. State and local self-government bodies and officials are obliged to participate in the trial in Armenian.

5. The court is obliged to provide the services of an interpreter at the expense of state funds to the accused who does not speak Armenian in the criminal case, except when the accused wants to provide the translation at his own expense.

6. The court shall provide the services of an interpreter at the expense of state funds to the participant in the administrative case, to the person participating in the civil case and to the victim in the criminal case, if he/she does not have the opportunity to communicate in Armenian and proves that does not have sufficient funds to provide paid translation.

Article 15 of the Criminal Procedure Code stipulates:

- "1. The language of criminal proceedings in the Republic of Armenia is Armenian.
2. (...) The accused participating in the criminal proceedings, if he does not speak Armenian, the court is obliged to provide the services of an interpreter at the expense of state funds, except when the accused wants to provide the translation at his own expense.
3. The participant of the criminal proceedings (except for the body conducting the criminal proceedings), the expert appointed on his/her initiative, a specialist or witness invited through his/her mediation shall be provided with the services of an interpreter if the relevant person does not speak Armenian and the person proves that he/she does not have sufficient means to provide paid translation."

Article 16 of the Civil Procedure Code stipulates:

- "1. The language of civil proceedings in the Republic of Armenia is Armenian.
3. Persons participating in the case have the right to appear in court in the language of their choice if they provide an Armenian translation.
4. The court shall provide the services of an interpreter the person participating in the case, the expert appointed on his initiative, the specialist or witness invited on his/her initiative at the expense of state funds, if the relevant person does not speak Armenian and the person participating in the case proves that does not have sufficient resources to provide paid translation."

According to Article 9 of the Administrative Procedure Code.

1. The administrative trial is conducted in Armenian.

2. A party, his representative, an expert appointed on the initiative of a party or a witness summoned by a party shall have the right to appear in court in the language of their choice if the party provides the Armenian translation. (...)

3. The natural person who is a party, the expert appointed on his/her initiative or a witness invited through his/her mediation shall be provided with the services of an interpreter if the relevant person does not speak Armenian and the party proves that he/she does not have sufficient means to provide paid translation.”

4. The expert appointed by the court and the witness summoned on the initiative of the court shall be provided with the services of interpreter at the expense of the state budget of the Republic of Armenia if the relevant person does not speak Armenian.

As seen above, the Charter set out the obligations of States Parties concerning the judicial proceedings of each other, separated by the phrase "and/or", from which it follows that the States Parties, as appropriate, and taking into account their capabilities, may in any case ensure the fulfilment of one or more of the above obligations and are not constrained by the obligation to ensure the fulfilment of all obligations.

The Criminal Procedure Code, the Civil Procedure Code and the Administrative Procedure Code of Armenia, defining Armenian as the language of the trial, enshrine norms that ensure the implementation of the right to judicial protection of persons who do not speak the language of the trial, including persons representing national minorities. In particular, it is the duty of the judicial body to provide interpreter services at the expense of the state budget if the relevant person proves that he/she does not have sufficient means to provide paid translation, and the Criminal Procedure Code also stipulates the duty of the body conducting the proceedings to provide the accused with the services of an interpreter if necessary.

Thus, it is our belief that the Republic of Armenia, by the provision of the above-mentioned acts, ensures the fulfilment of the obligations undertaken under Article 9 of the Charter.

Article 10 of the Charter stipulates: "In administrative districts of a State where the number of people speaking a regional or minority language justifies the following measures, in accordance with the condition of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as possible:

- a) 1. to ensure that administrative bodies use regional or minority languages or
 2. to ensure that public relations officials use regional or minority languages with those who speak to them in those languages or
 3. to ensure that persons speaking regional or minority languages have the right to submit oral and written applications, receive a response in that language or
 4. to ensure that persons speaking regional or minority languages have the right to submit oral and written applications in that language or
 5. to ensure that persons speaking regional or minority languages have the right to submit documents in that language.
- b) make widely available administrative texts and forms available in regional or minority languages or in bilingual versions;
 - c) allow administrative bodies to draw up documents in the regional or minority languages.”

Article 27 of the Law on "Fundamentals of Administrative Action and Administrative Proceedings" stipulates that persons fluent in the languages of national minorities in the Republic of Armenia may submit an application for administrative proceedings and the attached documents in the language of the respective minorities. The fourth part of the same article defines that in the course of administrative proceedings, participants may use foreign languages. However, these persons shall ensure Armenian translation through their own translator if the administrative body is unable to provide such translation. Fourth part of Article 59 of the law envisaged that the administrative body having adopted the act may, upon the request of the addressee of the written

administrative act, provide him/her the copy of the administrative act translated into a foreign language, which should be endorsed with the official seal of the relevant administrative body.

The provisions of the Law "*Fundamentals of Administrative Action and Administrative Proceedings*" stipulate the fulfilment of the obligations provided in Article 10, Part 1, clause a, sub-clauses 3 and 4 of the Charter. That is, the right of persons speaking regional or minority languages to submit written and oral applications, as well as to submit documents in the regional or minority language is enshrined. The law also allows administrative bodies to draw up documents in foreign languages, including regional or minority languages, in case of relevant application of the person. With regard to clause b of the Article, that is, the obligation of the State to make widely available administrative texts and forms available in regional or minority languages or in bilingual versions, it should be stressed that Armenian and Russian and in some cases English versions of a number of laws are available, and the Division of National Minorities and Religious Affairs of the Government of the Republic of Armenia provides availability of the bilingual documents (Armenian and Russian) on the rights and freedoms of national minorities and defining the mechanisms for their implementation on the official website of the Government.

Thus, it is our belief that the legislation of the Republic of Armenia complies with the requirements of Article 10 of the Charter.

The Armenian authorities regret that the information provided by within the framework of the 5th Periodic Report was not duly considered during the elaboration of Chapter 2 of the Report.

The authorities do not agree also with the distinction made between the Greek and Russian on one hand and Assyrian, Kurdish and Yezidi on the other, in terms of compliance with Article 9.1.a.ii of the Charter.

Use of the regional or minority languages in the media

The Law on Audiovisual Media adopted on July 16, 2020 and entered into force on August 7, defines the following new legal regulations;

1. Audio-visual broadcasts that seek to preach discrimination on the grounds of nationality, race, sex or religion or contain information that pursues such a purpose are prohibited (Part 7 of Article 9);
2. Public broadcasters are obliged to develop and implement program policies, providing customers with programs that represent the interests of different provinces, national minorities, different sections and social groups of society, aimed at overcoming stereotypes of national, racial, religious and gender discrimination, as well as to providing broadcasting of programs on the life and culture of the national minorities of Armenia, at least 30 minutes per week by public audio-visual broadcasters and 2 hours by public audio broadcasters (Article 22, Part 6, Clause 3).

48. Every day, the Armenian Public Radio broadcasts in Assyrian (15 minutes), Greek (15 minutes), Kurdish (30 minutes) and Yezidi (30 minutes). On working days, a news programme is broadcast in Russian (15 minutes). In their statement, representatives of the Yezidi speakers expressed the wish to extend the presence of the minority languages on Public Radio so that the broadcasts make an effective contribution to the preservation and promotion of these languages.

The broadcast time of radio programs in Yezidi language has become 60 minutes. We would like to inform you that the Public Radio broadcasts programs in 13 languages every day: 15 minutes in Russian, Greek, English, French, German, Spanish, Turkish, Georgian, Assyrian, 30 minutes in Arabic, Azerbaijani, Persian, Kurdish and 60 minutes in Yezidi. These broadcasts are also available on the website of the Public Radio Company (www.armradio.am). From September 3, 2018, the program "Side by Side" about the cultural life of national minorities is broadcast for 35-40 minutes on Public Television. The news service regularly presents materials, reports on events related to national minorities and their problems.

49. In accordance with the Committee of Experts' standard interpretation, a "newspaper" in the sense of Article 11.1.e has to be published at least weekly. In Armenia, a daily ("Golos Armenii") and a weekly newspaper ("Novoe Vremya") are published in Russian. There are no daily or weekly newspapers in the other minority languages. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should, in co-operation with representatives of the

speakers, encourage the creation of newspapers in Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi to be published at least weekly, including online when appropriate.

Since 2015 press for national minorities received financial support and allocations from the Armenian state bodies according to separate publications: newspapers "Yezdikhana", "Lalish", "Rya-Taza", "Golos Armenii", "Dnipro-Slavutich", "Zagros", "Daviti Vahan", "Iveria", "Novoye Vremya", "Belarus" (in Russian, Belarusian), "Assyrian Novosti" (in Russian, Assyrian), "Ilios" (in Russian, Armenian, Greek), "Argumenti Nedeli v Armenii".

Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 54-57

Every year the Armenian state budget allocates 20 million drams to national minority non-governmental organizations, half of which is distributed equally among the organizations representing the communities of 11 national minorities included in the Council of National Minorities, and the other half is allocated to the community organizations (also non-members of the Council) for the implementation of the programs approved by the Council. The amount allocated from the state budget for this purpose until 2012 was 10 million drams, and has doubled since then..

Use of the regional or minority languages in economic and social life

59. As far as the use of minority languages by social care facilities is concerned, Armenia's state report refers to a number of relevant institutions and indicates that speakers of all languages covered by the Charter are receiving care in such institutions. However, the report also states that such persons speak Armenian and that there is no information about difficulties faced by them in communicating with the staff. Furthermore, speakers of minority languages are among the staff of social care institutions. During the on- the-spot visit, representatives of the speakers confirmed that apart from Russian, no minority language is used in practice in social care facilities. The presence of staff who also speak languages such as Assyrian, Greek, Kurdish and Yezidi are a result of coincidence and not of a specific recruitment policy. Considering that Article 13.2c contains the obligation to "ensure" that social care facilities offer the use of the aforementioned languages, the Committee of Experts considers that the Armenian authorities should adopt an active approach concerning the implementation of this undertaking. In particular, they should identify the social care facilities located in the areas where the minority languages are used, foresee the recruitment and/or linguistic training of a sufficient number of staff (e.g. doctors, nurses), actively inform speakers of these languages of the possibilities to use them and encourage the speakers to avail themselves of these possibilities.

Representatives of all nationalities are employed in the Armenian healthcare institutions without any national discrimination, as in such a circumstance the professional knowledge and abilities of the people are considered. In the case of equal professional knowledge, of course, additional knowledge of languages is a priority. Naturally, representatives of national minorities working in hospitals support the hospital's administrative and medical staff in communicating with patients and persons speaking the relevant minority languages. To date, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Armenia has not received any application, complaint or proposal from the national minority community regarding the existence of obstacles in this respect. However, taking into account the recommendations contained in the report, the Ministry of Health will continue to pursue the issue, especially in the major state hospitals of the country.

Awareness raising about regional or minority languages

The Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport of the Republic of Armenia has developed a new draft of the state standard of general education, according to which in the 5th-6th grades of basic school pupils will get acquainted with the traditions, culture, national holidays and beliefs of the national minorities of Armenia within the framework of the educational subject "*Me and my homeland*".

Chapter 2

2.1 Assyrian

7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Assyrian at universities or equivalent institutions		↗			
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Assyrian or of facilities for the study of Assyrian as a university or higher education subject	↗				

8.1 div - Teaching of Assyrian as an integral part of the curriculum was not provided due to lack of applicants. It should be noted that the teaching of 2 foreign languages is envisaged by VET state educational standards. Only in case of existence of at least 10 applicants the educational institution can consider the possibility of its implementation.

2.4 Kurdish

8.1 div - Teaching of Kurdish as an integral part of the curriculum was not provided due to lack of applicants. It should be noted that the teaching of 2 foreign languages is envisaged by VET state educational standards. Only in case of existence of at least 10 applicants the educational institution can consider the possibility of its implementation.

1.7 Yezidi

8.1 div- Teaching of Kurdish as an integral part of the curriculum was not provided due to lack of applicants. It should be noted that the teaching of 2 foreign languages is envisaged by VET state educational standards. Only in case of existence of at least 10 applicants the educational institution can consider the possibility of its implementation.

72. According to the replies by the Armenian authorities to the Committee of Experts' questionnaire, Assyrian can be studied at Yerevan State University as a subject, which fulfils Articles 7.1.h and 8.1.eiii.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages is an independent body that evaluates the compliance of the States Parties with their undertakings and, where appropriate, encourages them to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on 25 June 1992 and entered into force on 1 March 1998, is the European convention for the protection and promotion of regional and minority languages. It is designed to enable speakers to use them both in private and public life and obliges the States Parties to actively promote the use of these languages in education, courts, administration, media, culture, economic and social life, and cross-border co-operation.

Regional or minority languages are part of Europe's cultural heritage and their protection and promotion contribute to the building of a Europe based on democracy and cultural diversity.

The text of the Charter is available in over 50 languages.

www.coe.int/minlang

www.coe.int

The Council of Europe is the continent's leading human rights organisation. It comprises 47 member states, including all members of the European Union. All Council of Europe member states have signed up to the European Convention on Human Rights, a treaty designed to protect human rights, democracy and the rule of law. The European Court of Human Rights oversees the implementation of the Convention in the member states.