

Anti-Discrimination Department
Inclusion and Anti-Discrimination Programmes Division
Intercultural Inclusion Unit

ADI-INT(2024)8

Strasbourg, 11 July 2024

**COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON INTERCULTURAL INCLUSION
(ADI-INT)**

5th meeting, 14-15 May 2024

Lublin, Poland

Report

On 14-15 May 2024, the Committee of Experts on Intercultural Inclusion (ADI-INT) held its 5th meeting in Lublin (Poland) and was welcomed by Mariusz Banach, Deputy Mayor of Lublin.

ITEM 1: Opening of the meeting, adoption of the agenda and information on elections

With the agreement of the Committee, the Secretary to the Committee *ad interim*, Thorsten Afflerbach, Head of the Anti-Discrimination and Inclusion Programmes Division of the Council of Europe, chaired the meeting until the election of the Chair from within its members (agenda item 4).

He opened the meeting and provided information on the election of the ADI-INT Chair and Vice-Chair and the appointment of a Gender Equality Rapporteur under item 4. The ADI-INT adopted the agenda as it appears in Appendix I.

He recalled the conclusions of the 4th ADI-INT meeting held on 17-18 October 2023 in Strasbourg. The Committee took note of the relevant decisions taken by the Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI) at its 8th meeting, held in Strasbourg on 5-7 December 2023, as reported by Wolfram Bechtel, Secretary to the CDADI.

ITEM 2: ADI-INT Terms of reference 2024-2027

The ADI-INT took note of the information provided by the Secretariat on its Terms of reference 2024-2027 and held an exchange of views on the deliverables.

ITEM 3: Implementation of CM/Rec(2022)10 on multilevel policies and governance for intercultural integration in member States

ADI-INT members, participants and observers presented current developments and relevant activities related to the implementation of Recommendation CM/Rec(2022)10 in their countries, regions and cities, and also orally shared information on the progress of intercultural integration. Contributions received in writing prior to the meeting were presented in document ADI-INT(2024)5.

The ADI-INT noted with satisfaction the information shared on the progress in the implementation of CM/Rec(2022)10 on multilevel policies and governance for intercultural integration. In particular, the Committee encouraged governments to translate the Committee of Ministers Recommendation (2022)10 and the Model Framework for an Intercultural Integration Strategy at the national level, as well as the other tools developed by the Committee, noting that this is the first step to ensure the wide dissemination and uptake of Council of Europe standards. The Committee thanked the Government of Spain for their translation of CM/Rec(2022)16 in Spanish. The Committee was also informed that the training Manual on Equality Data Collection to prevent Systemic Discrimination had been published in English and French in March 2024.

The ADI-INT further encouraged all member states to speed up efforts to implement the intercultural integration approach with the view to reinforcing equality for all, meaningful intercultural interaction, and active citizenship and participation, thus also contributing to strengthening democracy and promoting a culture of human rights and asked members to keep the Committee informed of progress in this field. The ADI-INT agreed that further written contributions and/or updates to this agenda item could be submitted to the Secretariat for inclusion in document ADI-INT (2024)5 **by 31 May 2024**.

Finally, the Committee agreed that the above-mentioned document and its updates would constitute a good basis for the next edition of the “Compendium of good practices on intercultural integration and multilevel governance” and decided to prepare the next edition of that compilation at its next meeting in October 2024.

ITEM 4: Election of Chair, Vice Chair and nomination of the Gender Equality Rapporteur

The ADI-INT elected Karoline Fernandez de la Hoz Zeitler (Spain) as Chair and Krzysztof Stanowski (Lublin, Poland) as Vice-Chair; it appointed Grégory Jaquet (Neuchâtel Canton, Switzerland) as its Gender Equality Rapporteur.

ITEM 5: Inspirational initiatives for intercultural inclusion

Anna Dąbrowska, President of the Homo Faber Association, presented the work of the Civic Dialogue Commission (CDC) for the integration of migrants of Lublin. The CDC was created in 2021 to replace the Integration Support Group (2013-2020), an informal, cross-sectoral platform to facilitate the exchange of information on foreigners’ integration and cooperation with national and ethnic minorities, initially set up as a result of a bilateral project with the Swiss canton of Neuchâtel.

The CDC aims at tackling the challenge of treating migrants as fully fledged residents, involving them in the city’s decision-making processes and giving them a voice. On 18 February 2022, only four days after the military aggression by the Russian Federation against Ukraine, the CDC organised a meeting together with several stakeholders, including the Municipality of Lublin, which resulted in a cross-sectoral cooperation to support Ukrainian refugees.

At present, the goal of the CDC is to prepare and implement the city integration policy. Five Polish NGOs are currently part of the CDC, three of which are led by migrants and refugees. The Municipality of Lublin is also participating. Meetings of the CDC are held in English and Polish, and the integration policy will be available in Polish, English and Ukrainian. If necessary, the CDC would also translate parts of the document into additional foreign languages, in order to ensure a wider dissemination.

Vania Freitas, Institutional Relations & Advocacy Coordinator of the Assembly of European Regions (AER) gave an update on the “EU-Belong” project, an intercultural approach to migrant integration in Europe’s regions. EU-Belong is a 3-year project (January 2022 – January 2025) which aims at improving the inclusion of migrants at the regional level through the development and implementation of regional intercultural integration strategies. Over the last 2½ years, 11 regional authorities¹ have participated in capacity building programmes, assessed their integration contexts and co-designed their own 3-year intercultural integration strategies. At present, these strategies would have to be tested through pilot projects. Three examples of such projects were shared:

- “Audiovisuals on Interculturality & Anti-Racism”, implemented in Catalonia (Spain) aims at fostering a discourse on racial justice and non-discrimination among social entities and citizens and providing tools to respond to exclusionary and polarising discourses;

¹ Catalonia, Navarra (Spain), Pomerania, Wielkopolska (Poland), Emilia-Romagna (Italy), Donegal (Ireland), Arad, Timis (Romania), Salzburg (Austria), Leipzig (Germany), Västergötland (Sweden).

- “GranRenoRagazzi”, implemented in Emilia-Romagna (Italy), promotes street education activities for young people with migration background to create a replicable practice able to answer similar challenges at regional and national level; and
- the “Mobile Integration Centre”, implemented in Wielkopolska (Poland), has as objective to increase the availability of consultation, counselling, information and knowledge for both migrants and the host society, reaching smaller localities and remote areas.

The representatives of UNHCR also presented their work in Poland and in Europe and highlighted the toolkit² they had co-authored with the Migration Policy Group and publications they had supported³ on the effective inclusion of refugees as well as the situation of Ukrainian refugees in Poland⁴. UNHCR informed about model initiatives that it supported extensively such as the Baobab Community Centre in Lublin, the Refugee and Migrant Aid centres run by CARITAS in Lublin and Zamość, as well as the Volunteer Center, called “Homes of Hope”. Moreover, UNHCR thanked the Council of Europe for its pledge (made on the occasion of last year’s Global Refugee Forum aimed at implementing the Global Compact on Refugees) to support member states in promoting intercultural inclusion strategies and policies at local, regional and national level⁵ and underlined that UNHCR stands ready to discuss strategies aimed at implementing it.

The ADI-INT took note of the inspiring information shared and exchanged views with the speakers on the initiatives for intercultural inclusion. It thanked the speakers for the interesting information they shared and noted with satisfaction that the initiatives presented could be regarded as examples of good practice for all levels of government.

ITEM 6: Elaboration of deliverables

a) Guidance document on strategies for inclusion in the fields under the responsibility of the CDADI

The Chair recalled that at its 4th meeting, the ADI-INT had instructed the Secretariat with the task of preparing a draft outline document on a Guidance document on strategies for inclusion in the fields under the responsibility of the CDADI – which are: migrants, national minorities, Roma and Travellers, and LGBTI persons. Two experienced consultants have been recruited to help with this work: Christian Ahlund (former Chair of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI)) and Aneta Witwicka (expert on European antidiscrimination policies).

Aneta Witwicka presented the work carried out so far and invited members to comment and share examples coming from their respective inclusion strategies.

² UNHCR & Migration Policy Group, [Effective Inclusion of Refugees: participatory approaches for practitioners at the local level – A toolkit, December 2021, available](#) in 24 languages at: [Effective Inclusion of Refugees: participatory approaches for practitioners at the local level | UNHCR](#)

³ Stowarzyszenie Centrum Wolontariatu w Lublinie Homes of Hope/ Domy Nadziei. A Refugee’s Integration Model, 2022, available at: https://wolontariat.lublin.pl/wp-content/uploads/2023/01/CW2022_Integracja_uchodzcow_pl.pdf

⁴ Deloitte (in cooperation with UNHCR), Analysis of the impact of refugees from Ukraine on the economy of Poland, March 2024, available at: <https://data.unhcr.org/en/documents/details/106993>

⁵ Cf. [Pledges & Contributions | The Global Compact on Refugees | UNHCR \(globalcompactrefugees.org\)](#), pledging entity: Council of Europe

The ADI-INT underlined the importance of including the concept of participatory democracy in the Guidance document since the principle of participation was included in the Reykjavik Declaration, the CDADI terms of reference, and CM Recommendation CM/Rec(2022)10.

It was also confirmed that other committees and their deliverables should be consulted in the elaboration of the guidance document when a suitable draft of the document would be available.

The ADI-INT agreed that it would be of great interest to collect and examine existing inclusion strategies or action plans at national, regional and local levels. It was also suggested that ADI-INT members could provide examples of their activities in the field of inclusion to underpin the guidance document with concrete examples. A compendium of such examples could constitute a useful appendix to the guidance document.

The Secretary to the CDADI recalled that the ADI-INT would be able to work on this deliverable until 2025 and has also been tasked with producing another deliverable by the end of 2027, namely a concept and methodology for a new peer learning and benchmarking tool on strategies for inclusion. After the completion of the guidance document on inclusion strategies, the concept and methodology for the peer learning or benchmarking tool could perhaps focus on certain pillars.

Overall, the ADI-INT noted with satisfaction the progress made towards the development of a guidance document on strategies for inclusion in the fields under the responsibility of the CDADI and expressed appreciation for the sound and thorough desk research carried out by the experts.

The ADI-INT provided direction on the next steps for the elaboration of the guidance document. The Committee invited its members to submit to the Secretariat national, regional and local inclusion strategies, if available, by 31 May 2024, and entrusted the Secretariat with the task of producing a first draft of the Guidance document, which will be presented at the next ADI-INT meeting. It also decided to regularly inform the CDADI about the progress of the work on this deliverable.

b) Presentation of the work on Multilevel Governance and of the findings of the pilot, including experience sharing of pilot members

The Chair provided some background information on the development of a Multilevel Governance Index, which originated at the 1st ADI-INT meeting (14-15 June 2022), following the presentation of the ICC Index and of the MIPEX-R, respectively, i.e. the systems of integration policy indicators for the local and regional levels that complement the MIPEX for the state level. The Chair also informed the Committee that the feedback of the ADI-INT and the CDADI have already been taken into account in the revision of the provisional background paper and the list of questions as set out in document ADI-INT(2023)1prov.

The Chair also recalled that at the 4th ADI-INT meeting (17-18 October 2023) the delegations of Belgium, Bilbao, Catalonia, Finland, Spain and the United Kingdom had volunteered to pilot the MLG Index.

The Secretariat then summarised the work of the pilot group set out in document ADI-INT(2024)6.

Subsequently, the members of the pilot group presented their findings. They were generally in agreement about the fact that the questionnaire is a very useful tool, but several elements needed clarification, including its aim/objective and the methodology to be used for the completion of the

questionnaire which seemed to be possible only with the active participation of all levels of governance. It was discussed whether the creation of a multilevel interinstitutional working group would be required, useful and feasible for the completion of the questionnaire, and beyond. The time required to complete the survey was also a source of concern for the pilots.

It was also noted that replies from different countries would be difficult to compare due to the different governance systems, and it was suggested to add a set of criteria to the questionnaire in order to take into account whether the evaluated competence is devolved or not. It was also underlined that, in particular in federal states, the answers and results could vary from one region to another.

The pilot group member from Finland offered to share with the Committee, as a source of inspiration, the assessment report of Finland's multilevel governance system which had been carried out in the framework of an EU-CoE joint project. He proposed to use the index as a part of such a general assessment, rather than as a standalone tool.

In the ensuing debate of the pilot group's findings by the Committee, the ADI-INT enquired about the ultimate purpose and use of the data collected. The Secretariat replied that, as the Multi-Level Governance Index was somewhat modelled on the ICC Index, the latter could be taken as a model for data analysis and production of an Index Report.

Concerning the methodology, the ADI-INT confirmed the concerns of the pilot group that it would not be possible for one level of governance alone to complete the questionnaire but that all levels of governance would need to cooperate on the responses.

One delegation questioned the balance between input and output of this MLG Index (cost-benefit ratio).

The Committee agreed that the tool would need to be cost-effective and have a distinct benefit for the member states. Whereas a tool to review multi-level governance could be useful, the Committee questioned whether it needed to be a multi-level governance index, or whether a multi-level self-assessment and peer-learning tool would be more useful.

Finally, the ADI-INT thanked the delegations of Belgium, Bilbao, Catalonia, Finland, Spain and the United Kingdom for their considerable work in piloting and commenting on the draft MLG Index, entrusted the Secretariat with the task of proposing a new version of the general background chapter with a streamlined introductory text in time for the next committee meeting. It also asked the pilot group to rework – and possible shorten – the questionnaire and agreed to resume discussions of this item at its next meeting.

ITEMS 7 and 8: Study visit to the Baobab Community Centre for migrants and refugees and the guided multicultural tour of Lublin and debriefing

The Committee carried out a study visit to the Baobab Community Centre for migrants and refugees and the guided multicultural tour of Lublin and exchanged views on the intercultural initiatives they had learnt about, thanked the Lublin authorities for organising it, and congratulated them on their inspiring intercultural policies and activities, which constitute examples of good practice.

The Committee particularly appreciated Lublin's engagement in making the Baobab Community Centre open to all migrants, refugees, asylum seekers, or persons under temporary protection, rather than just for one distinct group.

The Secretariat recalled that the Baobab Community Centre is included in the Compendium of good practices produced by ADI-INT last year and adopted by CDADI at its last meeting. The Secretariat encouraged members to send in similar examples for the next edition of the Compendium, which will be on the agenda of the ADI-INT at its 6th meeting in October this year.

The Ukrainian member of the ADI-INT informed the Committee that one of the current challenges of the Ukrainian authorities was how to encourage persons who have fled Ukraine to return once the situation has stabilised. To this end, it is suggested that welcome centres abroad include among their services ways to put Ukrainians who fled the country in touch with those who stayed. The Committee welcomed the Ukrainian member's offer to share more information at the next ADI-INT meeting.

ITEM 9: Date and venue of the 6th ADI-INT meeting

The ADI-INT agreed to hold its 6th meeting on 10-11 October 2024 in Strasbourg, France.

ITEM 10: Adoption of the abridged report

A bilingual version of the draft abridged report was displayed and adopted on 15 May 2024 at the end of the 5th meeting as contained in document ADI-INT(2024)7bil.

AGENDA

1. Opening of the meeting, adoption of the agenda and information on elections
2. ADI-INT Terms of Reference 2024-2027 and work plan for 2024-2025
3. Implementation of CM/Rec(2022)10 on multilevel policies and governance for intercultural integration in member States
4. Election of Chair and Vice Chair; appointment of the Gender Equality Rapporteur
5. Inspirational initiatives for intercultural inclusion
 - a. The Civic Dialogue Commission for the integration of migrants of Lublin
 - b. The EU-Belong project by the Assembly of European Regions (AER)
6. Elaboration of deliverables
 - a. Guidance document on strategies for inclusion in the fields under the responsibility of the CDADI
 - b. Initiatives for the dissemination and implementation at national level of CM/Rec(2022)10 on multilevel policies and governance for intercultural integration, including tools for the capacity-building programme for migrant integration
 - Multilevel Governance Index (MLG INDEX)
7. Study visit to the Baobab Community Centre for migrants and refugees, Lublin, and guided multicultural tour of Lublin – hosted by the city of Lublin
8. Debriefing of the study visit
9. Date and venue of the next meeting
10. Adoption of the abridged meeting report

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MEMBERS

BELGIUM

Tom De BRUYN

Deputy to the director at the Agency for Home Affairs
Department of Equal Opportunities, Integration and Civic Integration of the Government of Flanders
Brussels, Belgium

Daphné COSTES

Head of team Integration and Civic Integration, Department of Equal Opportunities,
Agency for Home Affairs, Government of Flanders
Brussels, Belgium

BILBAO

Claudia EMMANUEL LAREDO

Public Officer. Immigration and Interculturalism
Bilbao City Council, Spain

Public Officer - Immigration and diversity affairs.
Bilbao City Council Official, Spain.

BURSA-OSMANGAZI (TÜRKİYE)

Şenol DÜLGER

Head of Osmangazi Municipality's International Office, and in charge of external relation
Bursa-Osmangazi, Türkiye

CATALONIA (SPAIN)

Eunice ROMERO RIVERA

Director general of Migrations, Refugee and Antiracism
Generalitat de Catalunya
Barcelona, Spain

CROATIA

Mirela ŠAVRLJUGA

Advisor in government and Government Office
Office for Human Rights and Rights of National Minorities,
Government of the Republic of Croatia
Zagreb, Croatia

FUENLABRADA (SPAIN)

Francisco Javier AYALA ORTEGA

Mayor of Fuenlabrada
Fuenlabrada, Spain

Alvaro REVILLA

General Director for social politics
Fuenlabrada city council, Spain

Raquel VALADES

Institutional Relations Director
Fuenlabrada, Spain

FINLAND

Peter KARIUKI

Senior specialist/ Secretary General, Advisory Board for Ethnic Relations (ETNO)
Ministry of justice
Department of democracy and public law
Helsinki, Finland

ITALY

Nadan PETROVIC

Professor
Coordinator of the Centre for migration and refugee studies
Expert of UNAR
Rome, Italy

LUBLIN (POLAND)

Krzysztof STANOWSKI

Director of the International Cooperation Centre of the Municipality of Lublin
Lublin, Poland

LUXEMBOURG

David MARQUES

Social Assistant
Department of Integration, Integration Project Officer, Research and Development Unit Delegate for Equal Opportunities between Women and Men, Ministry for Family, Integration and the Greater Region Luxembourg

CANTON OF NEUCHÂTEL (SWITZERLAND)

Grégory JAQUET

Head of Office - Delegate for Foreigners, République et Canton de Neuchâtel,
Department of Employment and Social Cohesion, Multicultural Cohesion Office
Neuchâtel (République et Canton), Switzerland

NORTH MACEDONIA

Robert ALAGJOZOVSKI

National coordinator for interculturalism
One society, development of culture and inter-ministerial cooperation
Government of North Macedonia
Skopje, North Macedonia

PORTUGAL

Cecília MENDES

Services Director
High commission for migration
Lisbon, Portugal

REGGIO EMILIA (ITALY)

Luca COLOMBO

Municipal officer, focusing on welfare, social cohesion and intercultural policies, and projects/services against educational poverty for minors and young adults,
Reggio Emilia, Italy

REYKJAVÍK (ICELAND)

Joanna MARCINKOWSKA

Project Manager, Expert in interculturalism and inclusion
Reykjavík City Human Rights and Democracy Office
City of Reykjavik, Iceland

RIGA (LATVIA)

Irina VASILJEVA

Project Manager, Society Integration and Participation Division,
Neighbourhood Development and Society Integration Department
Riga Neighbourhood Residents Centre
Riga, Latvia

SPAIN

Karoline FERNANDEZ DE LA HOZ ZEITLER

Director
OBERAXE (Spanish Observatory on Racism and Xenophobia)
Directorate on Humanitarian Attention and Social Integration of Migrants.
Secretariat of State of Migrations.
Ministry of Inclusion, Social Security and Migrations
Madrid, Spain

UNITED KINGDOM

Ben GREENER

Deputy director for faith, integration and communities
Ministry of housing, communities and local government
Local Government & Communities
United Kingdom Government
London, United Kingdom

UKRAINE

Olena SOTNYK

Advisor to the Deputy Prime Minister of Ukraine
Kyiv, Ukraine

PARTICIPANTS

UNHCR

Jutta SEIDEL

Senior Legal Associate
UNHCR Representation to the European Institutions in Strasbourg

Dominik WACH

Assistant Durable Solutions Officer
UNHCR Representation in Poland, Warsaw

OBSERVER STATES

CANADA

Valérie DUQUETTE

First Secretary, Mission of Canada to the European Union

OBSERVERS

AER (Assembly of European Region)

Vania FREITAS

Institutional Relations and Advocacy Officer
Brussels, Belgium

EXPERTS/SPEAKERS

Mariusz Banach

Deputy Mayor of Lublin

Anna DĄBROWSKA

President of the Homer Faber Association, will present the work of the Civic Dialogue Commission for the integration of migrants of Lublin.

Aneta WITWICKA

Intercultural Cities Programme Expert

COUNCIL OF EUROPE

DG II - Directorate General of Democracy and Human Dignity **Directorate of Equal Rights and Dignity**

Thorsten AFFLERBACH

Head of Inclusion and Anti-discrimination programmes

Wolfram BECHTEL

Secretary of the Steering Committee on Anti-discrimination Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI)

Giulia BIANCHINI

Senior Project Officer
Intercultural Inclusion Unit

Sandrine JOUSSE

Assistant of the Committee of Experts on Intercultural Inclusion (ADI-INT)
Intercultural Inclusion Unit

INTERPRETERS

English / French:

Sabine EL SAYEGH
Eva WOLF-CALMET