CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF INDIVIDUALS WITH REGARD TO AUTOMATIC PROCESSING OF PERSONAL DATA

34th Plenary meeting

Strasbourg, 19-21 June 2017

ABRIDGED REPORT

Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law
1. The Consultative Committee of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (ETS No. 108, hereafter ‘Convention 108’), established under Article 18 of Convention 108, held its 34th plenary meeting in Strasbourg from 19 to 21 June 2017, with Ms Alessandra Pierucci (Italy) in the chair. The agenda as adopted by the Committee and the list of participants are set out in Appendix 1 and Appendix 2.

The Committee:

2.1. took note of the information provided by Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of the Department of Information Society, regarding in particular other activities of the organisation of relevance to the work of the Committee;

2.2. took note of the state of progress of the modernisation of Convention 108 and called for the urgent finalisation of the work by the Committee of Ministers;

2.3. took note of the state of signatures and ratifications of and accessions to Convention 108 and its Additional Protocol and, in particular, the updates provided by the Tunisian Consul in Strasbourg, Mr Mohamed Trabelsi, concerning ratification of the Convention by Tunisia and legislative developments;

2.4. examined the draft recommendation on the protection of health-related data, held an exchange of views with the expert, Ms Jeanne Bossi Malafosse, and agreed that a revised version of the draft recommendation would be submitted for written comments with a view to finalisation and adoption at the next plenary meeting;

2.5. examined the draft practical guide on the use of personal data by the police, held an exchange of views with the expert, Mr David Allen, and agreed that a revised version would be submitted for written comments prior to the launch of a written procedure for adoption;

2.6. took note of the information provided by the Chair on the automatic exchange of personal data in tax matters and the data protection implications of the applicable standards, instructing its Bureau to continue following up the matter, with due regard for the work carried out by the Article 29 Working Party in this field;

2.7. took note of the information on co-operation with other Council of Europe bodies and, in particular, the work of the Ad-Hoc Committee for the Rights of the Child (CAHENF), the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) and its Committee of Experts on Internet Intermediaries (MSI-NET), the Committee of the Cybercrime Convention (TC-Y), the “Action plan on combating transnational organised crime” adopted by the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC), the Parliamentary Assembly and the Bioethics Committee (DH-BIO);

2.8. took note of the information provided by the Secretariat concerning co-operation programmes in the data protection field;

2.9. examined the draft opinion on the request for accession by Argentina (document T-PD(2017)17) and agreed to submit the draft for adoption by written procedure after the plenary meeting;

2.10. took note of the major developments at national and international level in the data protection field since its last plenary meeting (information compiled in document T-PD 2017(08)Mos), in particular the

---

1 81 participants in all, 39 men, 42 women.
adoption of a resolution on the modernisation of Convention 108 by the Conference of European Data Protection Authorities (Limassol, 27-28 April 2017) and the work done within ICANN;

2.11. adopted its work programme for 2018-2019 (document T-PD(2017)WP2018-2019) and stressed to what extent the actions planned were both necessary and priorities;

2.12. adopted the proposed amendments to the Committee’s Rules of Procedure (document T-PD(2017)Rules);

2.13. took note of the information provided by the Secretariat concerning the celebrations held for Data Protection Day;

2.14. welcomed the admission of the Republic of Korea, Japan and the Republic of the Philippines as observers to the Committee and took note of the information provided by these countries’ representatives, as well as of the information provided by the representative of the ICRC, regarding in particular the launch of the Handbook on data protection in humanitarian action, of the Chair of the AFAPDP regarding the annual conference which will be held in Tunis on 4-5 September 2017 and of the representative of the AEDH concerning the priorities of the Association;

2.15. elected Maria Michaelidou (Cyprus) to the Bureau;

2.16. confirmed that the next meetings of the Bureau would be held in Paris from 11 to 13 September and in Geneva from 18 to 20 December respectively and that the next plenary meeting of the Committee would be held in Strasbourg from 22 to 24 November 2017.
AGENDA

Strasbourg, 27 April 2017

CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION
OF INDIVIDUALS WITH REGARD TO AUTOMATIC PROCESSING
OF PERSONAL DATA [ETS 108]

(T-PD)

34th Plenary meeting

Council of Europe, Strasbourg (Room 2.)

From 19 June 2017 – 2.00 p.m.
to 21 June 2017 – 1.00 pm.

AGENDA

1. Opening of the meeting

- T-PD(2016)RAP33Abr: Abridged report of the 33rd Plenary meeting (Strasbourg, 29 June - 1 July 2016)
- T-PD-BUR(2016)40RAP: Abridged report of the 40th Bureau meeting (Strasbourg, 30 November-2 December 2016)

2. Adoption of the agenda

3. Statement by the secretariat

Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department

4. Modernisation of Convention 108

a. Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat.
5. State of Play – Accession

Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat.

6. Protection of Health Related Data


Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the expert and will examine the revised version of the draft Recommendation, together with written comments received with a view to finalising the draft Recommendation (the draft explanatory memorandum will be prepared for the 35th Plenary meeting and both texts will be submitted to the Committee for approval at that meeting).

7. Data protection and police

Expert: Mr. David Allen, United Kingdom (to be confirmed).

Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the expert and will examine the revised version of the draft practical guide together with written comments received with a view to finalising the guide for subsequent adoption.
8. Automatic exchange of Personal Data

*Required action*: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the Chair and the secretariat.

- **Letter**
  
  - Letter of the Chair of the Article 29 Working Party to the OECD

- **Article 29 WP Guidelines**
  
  - Guidelines on the criteria to ensure compliance with data protection requirements in the context of the automatic exchange of personal data for tax purposes (adopted on 16 December 2015)
  
  - Opinion on the implications for data protection of mechanisms for automatic inter-state exchanges of data for administrative and tax purposes

- **T-PD(2014)05**
  
  - Report on the implications for data protection of the growing use of mechanisms for automatic inter-state exchanges of data for administrative and tax purposes, as well as in connection with money laundering, financing of terrorism and corruption

9. Cooperation with other Council of Europe Bodies and Entities

*Required action*: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat.

- **Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI)**
  
  - MSI-NET

- **CAHENF**

- **Cybercrime Committee (T-CY)**

- **CODEXTER**

- **Bioethics Committee (DH-BIO)**

- **European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC)**
  
  - Council of Europe action plan on combating transnational organised crime (2016-2020)

- **Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe**
  
  - Recommendation 2102 (2017) – “Technological convergence, artificial intelligence and human rights”

10. Cooperation Projects

*Required action*: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat.
HELP in the 28 Data Protection and privacy rights

Information Document CoE cooperation projects in the data protection field

11. Opinions

Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat.

- T-PD(2017)07 Compilation of opinions

12. Work programme 2018-2019

Required action: The Committee will examine the proposed work programme as prepared by the Bureau and approve it.


13. Rules of Procedure

Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat and will exchange views on means to enhance the efficiency and working methods of the Committee, examining proposed amendments to the Rules of procedure.


14. Overview of activities and major developments in the field of data protection

Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat.

- European Conference of Data Protection Authorities, Limassol, 27-28 April 2017

- T-PD(2017)08Mos Information on the recent developments at national level in the data protection field

- T-PD(2017)09 Compilation of website news

15. Data Protection Day

Required action: The Committee will take note of the information provided by the secretariat.
16. Data Protection Commissioner

**Required action:** The Committee will take note of the information provided by the Council of Europe Data Protection Commissioner.

- Activity report
- Secretary General’s Regulation of 18 April 1989

17. Observers

**Required action:** The Committee will take note of the information provided by the observers and by the secretariat.

- T-PD(2017)10Observers - State of play and admission criteria

18. Elections

**Required action:** The Committee will proceed to the elections.

- T-PD(2017)11Memorandum concerning elections

19. Next meetings

**Required action:** The Committee will take note of the proposed dates for the next meetings.

20. Any Other Business

* * *
APPENDIX II

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS


CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF INDIVIDUALS WITH REGARD TO AUTOMATIC PROCESSING OF PERSONAL DATA [ETS 108]

COMITE CONSULTATIF DE LA CONVENTION POUR LA PROTECTION DES PERSONNES A L’EGARD DU TRAITEMENT AUTOMATISE DES DONNEES A CARACTERE PERSONNEL [STE 108]

34th meeting / 34ème réunion

Strasbourg, 19-21 June / juin 2017
Palais de l’Europe, Room / salle 2.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS

MEMBERS / MEMBRES

ALBANIA / ALBANIE
Besnik Dervishi, Commissioner

Ardita Shehaj, Director of the Department of the Right to Information

ANDORRA / ANDORRE
Anna Cadena, Inspectora de l’Agència Andorrana de Protecció de Dades, Carrer Dr. Vilanova, 15-17, 5, edifici Consell General, AD 500-Andorra la Vella

Joan Crespo, Inspectora de l’Agència Andorrana de Protecció de Dades, Carrer Dr. Vilanova, 15-17, 5, edifici Consell General, AD 500-Andorra la Vella

ARMENIA / ARMENIE
Shushan Doydoyan, Head of the Personal Data Protection Agency, RA Ministry of Justice, 3/8 V. Sargsyan street, 0010, Yerevan

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE
Matthias Schmidl, Deputy Head of the Austrian Data Protection Authority, Hohenstaufengasse 3 1010 Wien

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAİDJAN
Farid Gurbanli, Head Legal advisor of the Legal Provision Office of The State Security Service, Parliament avenue 14, Baku
BELGIUM / BELGIQUE
Ketsia Malengreau, Attachée, SPF Justice, Direction générale de la Législation et des Libertés et Droits fondamentaux, Service des droits de l'Homme – Protection de la vie privée, 5-8 Avenue de la Porte de Hal, 1060 Bruxelles

Valérie Verbruggen, Conseiller Juridique, Commission de la protection de la vie privée, 35 Rue de la presse, 1000 Bruxelles

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE HERZEGOVINE
Nedžmija Kukričar, Expert Advisor for inspection supervision at Personal Data Protection Agency in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Vilisonovo šetalište street, No.10.

BULGARIA / BULGARIE (apologised / excusé)

CROATIA / CROATIE
Maja Peran, Personal Data Protection Agency, Martićeva 14, 10000 Zagreb, Croatia

CYPRUS / CHYPRE
Maria Michaelidou, Office for the Commissioner for Personal Data Protection, P.O. Box 23378, 1682 Nicosia

CZECH REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE
Jiří Maštálka, Office for Personal Data Protection Pplk. Sochora 27, 170 00 Prague 7

DENMARK / DANEMARK
Nanna Østerrøgild Bødker, Head of Section, Danish Ministry of Justice, Data Protection Division, Slotsholmsgade 10, DK-1216 Copenhagen K

ESTONIA / ESTONIE
Kaja Puusepp, Development Director, Data Protection Inspectorate for Data Privacy and Freedom of Information, Väike-Ameerika 19, 10129 Tallinn

FINLAND / FINLANDE
Leena Vettenranta, Senior Specialist (Data Protection), Ministry of Justice, PO Box 25, FI-00023

FRANCE
Agnès Maîtrepière, Chargée de mission auprès du Directeur des affaires juridiques du Ministère des affaires étrangères et du développement international, 57 Boulevard des Invalides, 75700 Paris

GEORGIE / GEORGIA
Tamar Kaldani, Personal Data Protection Inspector of Georgia, 7, N. Vachnadze Str., Tbilisi, 0105

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE
Uwe Wusterhausen, Data Protection Unit (V II 4), Federal Ministry of the Interior, Alt-Moabit 140, D-10557 Berlin

Paul Gaitzsch, Federal Ministry of the Interior
Heiko Haupt, Federal Data Protection Agency

GREECE / GRECE
Evagelos Papakonstantinou, Lawyer, Hellenic Ministry of Justice, Leoforos Mesogeion 96, Athens,

HUNGARY / HONGRIE
Attila Péterfalvi, President, National Authority for Data Protection and Freedom of Information H-1125 Budapest, Szilágyi Erzsébet fasor 22/C
ICELAND / ISLANDE
Helga Sigridur Thorhallsdottir, Legal expert, Data Protection Authority, Raudararstigur Nr 10, 105 Reykjavik

IRELAND / IRLANDE
Noreen Walsh, Civil Law Reform Division, Department of Justice and Equality, Bishop’s Square Redmond’s Hill, Dublin 2

ITALY / ITALIE
Alessandra Pierucci, (Chair/Présidente), Piazza di Monte Citorio 121, 00186 Rome

LATVIA / LETTONIE (apologised / excusé)

LIECHTENSTEIN (apologised / excusé)

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE
Aušra Špakauskienė, Chief Specialist of Law Division, State Data Protection Inspectorate of the Republic of Lithuania

LUXEMBOURG
Gérard Lommel, (Second vice-chair / deuxième Vice-président), Commissaire du gouvernement à la protection des données, Ministère d’Etat, Bâtiment Zurich, 3 boulevard Roosevelt, L-2450 Luxembourg

MALTA / MALTE
Ingrid Camilleri, B.A., LL.D., Head – Legal, Office of the Information and Data Protection Commissioner, Airways House, Second Floor, High Street, Sliema SLM 1549

MAURITIUS / MAURICE (apologised / excusé)

MONACO
Corinne Laforest de Minotty, Inspection générale de l'administration, Chef de l'Inspection Générale de l'Administration, Ministère d'Etat - Place de la Visitation, 98000 Monaco

MONTENEGRO (apologised / excusé)

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS (apologised / excusé)

NORWAY / NORVEGE
Jon Lunde, Higher Executive Officer, Norwegian Ministry of Justice and Public Security

POLAND / POLOGNE
Urszula Góral, Director of the Social Education and International Cooperation Department, Bureau of the Inspector General for Personal Data Protection, ul. Stawki 2, 00-193 Warszawa

PORTUGAL
João Pedro Cabral, Legal Adviser, Directorate General of Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice, Avenida D. João II, n.º1.08.01 E, Torre H, Pisos 2/3, 1990-097 Lisboa

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA
Eduard Raducan, Director, National Center for Personal Data Protection of the Republic of Moldova, 48 Serghei Lazo street, MD-2004 Chisinau

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE (apologised / excusé)

RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FÉDÉRATION DE RUSSIE
Konstantin Kosorukov, Head of Division, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation
Anton Koldin – Head of Division of Co-operation with Foreign States, Department of International Co-operation, Ministry of Communications of the Russian Federation

Elena Donchenko – Deputy Head of Division of Registry of Operators of Personal Data, Federal Service for Supervision in the Sphere of Telecom, Information Technologies and Mass Communications

Maria Yukhno, Third Secretary, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation

Anton Markovskiy, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of the Russian Federation to the Council of Europe

**SAN MARINO / SAINT MARIN (apologised / excusé)**

**SEN EGAL**
Mamoudou Niane, Directeur des Affaires Juridiques et de la Coopération de la CDP
34, Mermos VDN, Dakar

**SERBIA/ SERBIE (apologised / excusé)**

**SLOVAK REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE**
Miroslava Benedíková, Director of the Department of International Affairs, Office for Personal Data Protection of the Slovak Republic, Hraničná 12, 820 07 Bratislava 27

**SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE (apologised / excusé)**

**SPAIN / ESPAGNE**
Ramón Novo Cabrera, State Attorney, Agency for Data Protection of Spain, C/ Jorge Juan, 6, 28001 Madrid, C/Jorge Juan, 6, 28001-Madrid

**SWEDEN / SUEDE**
Manne Heimer, Legal Adviser, Division for Constitutional Law Ministry of Justice, Regeringskansliet SE-103 33 Stockholm

**SWITZERLAND / SUISSE**
Jean-Philippe Walter, (first Vice-Chair / premier Vice-président), Préposé fédéral suppléant, Préposé fédéral à la protection des données et à la transparence (PFPDT), Feldeggweg 1, 3003 Berne

**“THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA” / « L’EX-RÉPUBLIQUE YOUGOSLAVE DE MACÉDOINE »**
Igor Kuzevski, Secretary General, Directorate for Personal Data Protection, Goce Delcev 18, 1000 Skopje

**TURKEY / TURQUIE**
Abdullah Ömeroğlu, Rapporteur Judge, Mustafa Kemal Mah. 2151. Cad., No: 34/A 06520, Söğütözü-Ankara

**UKRAINE**
Ólena Smirnova, Deputy Head of the Secretariat of the Ukrainian Parliament Commissioner for Human Rights, Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights, 21/8, Instytutska str., 01008 Kiev

Iryna Bisyk, acting Head of the Department for personal data protection

**UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI**
Olufemi Animashaun, Senior Policy Advisor, EU and International Data Protection Policy, 100 Parliament Street, London SW1A 2BQ
URUGUAY
Laura Nahabettián Brunet, Data Protection Unit, Citizens Rights Manager at E-government Agency
Andes N° 1365 7th floor

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

FRENCH-SPEAKING ASSOCIATION OF PERSONAL DATA PROTECTION AUTHORITIES / ASSOCIATION FRANCOPHONE DES AUTORITÉS DE PROTECTION DES DONNÉES PERSONNELLES (AFAPDP)
Jean-Philippe Walter, Chair / Président, Association francophone des autorités de protection des données personnelles, 8 rue Vivienne CS 30223, 75083 Paris Cedex 2

ASSOCIATION EUROPEENNE POUR LA DEFENSE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME / EUROPEAN ASSOCIATION FOR THE DEFENSE OF HUMAN RIGHTS (AEDH)
Maryse Artiguelong, Déléguée, AEDH, Rue de la Caserne 33 – 1000 Brussels, Belgium

EUROPEAN COMMISSION / COMMISSION EUROPEENNE
Lukasz Rozanski, DG Justice Unit C4, Rue de la Loi 200, 1049 Brussels

EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON LEGAL CO-OPERATION / COMITÉ EUROPÉEN DE COOPÉRATION JURIDIQUE (CDCJ) (apologised / excuse)

INTERNATIONAL CHAMBER OF COMMERCE (ICC) / CHAMBRE INTERNATIONALE DU COMMERCE (CIC)
Jacques Beglinger, Attorney-at-law, D.E.S.S., Member of the Executive Committee, Swiss Holdings, Federation of Industrial and Service Groups in Switzerland – Bern

INTERNATIONAL COMMITTEE OF THE RED CROSS / COMITÉ INTERNATIONAL DE LA CROIX-ROUGE (ICRC / CICR)
Julie Tenenbaum, Regional Legal Adviser for Europe, 10bis, Passage d'Enfer, 75014 Paris, France

INTERPOL
Karkala Smaragda, Associate Legal Officer, Data Protection Office, Interpol General Secretariat, 200 Quai Charles de Gaulle, 69006 Lyon, France

JAPAN
Naoko ITO-NAKAIMA, Deputy Director for International Affairs, Secretariat Personal Information Protection Commission, Kasumigaseki Common Gate, West Tower 32F, 3-2-1 Kasumigaseki, Chiyoda-ku Tokyo 1000013

Shun Kitagawa, Consul, Consulate-General of Japan in Strasbourg, “Bureaux Europe” 20 Place des Halles 67000 Strasbourg

MEXICO / MEXIQUE
Santiago Oñate Laborde, Observateur Permanent du Mexique auprès du Conseil de l'Europe.

María Noemí Hernández Téllez, Observateur Permanent Adjoint du Mexique auprès du Conseil de l’Europe

Lorena Alvarado Quezada, Adjointe à l'Observateur Permanent du Mexique auprès du Conseil de l’Europe

PHILIPPINES
Raymund E. Liboro, Privacy Commissioner, National Privacy Commission, Republic of the Philippines
Damian Domingo O. Mapa, Deputy Commissioner, National Privacy Commission, Republic of the Philippines

**REPUBLIC OF KOREA / REPUBLIQUE DE COREE**
Kiseok Kim, Director, Privacy Protection Cooperation Team, Consumer Policy Bureau  
Korea Communications Commission (KCC), Building #2, 47 Gwanmun-ro, Gwacheon-si, Gyeonggi-do, 13809

Jeongsoo Lee, Deputy Director, Privacy Protection Cooperation Team, Consumer Policy Bureau  
Korea Communications Commission, Building #2, 47 Gwanmun-ro, Gwacheon-si, Gyeonggi-do, 13809

Jaesuk Yun, Manager, Personal Information Cooperation Team, Personal Information Protection Division  
Korea Internet & Security Agency, IT Venture Tower, 135, Jundae-ro, Sonpa-gu, Seoul, 05717

Hyekyung Kang, Manager of Data Breach Investigation Team

**OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS**

**MOROCCO / MAROC**
Lahoussine Aniss, Secrétaire Général de la Commission Nationale de contrôle de la protection des données à Caractère Personnel (CNDP), Imm. Les patios, bd Annakhil, 3e étage, Hay Riad Rabat

**TUNISIA / TUNISIE**
Chawki Gaddes, Président de l'Instance Nationale de Protection des Données Personnelles, 1, rue Mohamed Moalla, 1002, Tunis

Mohamed Trabelsi, Consul, Consulat de Tunisie, 6 Rue Schiller, 67000 Strasbourg, France

Hamida Zabidi, Consulat de Tunisie, 6 Rue Schiller, 67000 Strasbourg, France

**EXPERTS SCIENTIFIQUES / SCIENTIFIC EXPERTS**

David Allen, Consultant

Jeanne Bossi-Malafosse, Consultant / Consultante

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE BODIES / ORGANES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights /  
Bureau du Commissaire aux droits de l'homme

Kurnik-Maricle Aleksandra, Advisor / Conseillère, Division I.

Mignot Leila, trainee / stagiaire, Division I.
Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit

Bioethics / Bioéthique
Laurence Lwoff, Secretary of DH-BIO / Secrétaire du DH-BIO

SECRETARIAT

Information Society Department / Service de la société de l'information
Penninckx Patrick, Head of Department / Chef de Service

Anne Boyer-Donnard, Principal Administrative Assistant, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law

Data Protection Unit / Unité de la protection des données
Sophie Kwasny, Secretary of Committee of Convention 108 / Secrétaire du Comité de la Convention 108

Péter Kimpiàn, Programme Advisor / Conseiller de programme

Anne-Sophie Gantchoula, trainee, stagiaire

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRETES

Gillian Wakenhut
Katia di Stefano
Didier Jungling