

1380th meeting, 1 July 2020

10 Legal questions

10.6 European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

b. Fifth report of the Committee of Experts in respect of the United Kingdom

In accordance with Article 16, paragraph 3 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages submits its fifth report on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom to the Committee of Ministers. The report contains proposals for recommendations to be addressed by the Committee of Ministers to the United Kingdom. The United Kingdom Government has been given the opportunity to comment on the content, in accordance with Article 16, paragraph 3 of the Charter.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the State and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the State in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the State in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the State concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective State Party for possible comments within a given deadline. Subsequently, the evaluation report is submitted to the Committee of Ministers, together with suggestions for recommendations that, once adopted by the latter, will be addressed to the State Party. The full report also contains the comments which the authorities of the State Party may have made.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	4
Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man – Recent developments and trends	5
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man	5
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man	6
Chapter 2 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations	10
2.1 Cornish	10
2.1.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Cornish	10
2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Cornish in the United Kingdom.....	11
2.2 Irish	12
2.2.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Irish	12
2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Irish in the United Kingdom	15
2.3 Manx Gaelic	17
2.3.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic.....	17
2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic in the Isle of Man	18
2.4 Scots	19
2.4.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scots.....	19
2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scots in the United Kingdom	20
2.5 Scottish Gaelic	21
2.5.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic.....	21
2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic in the United Kingdom	25

2.6	Ulster Scots	26
2.6.1	Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots	26
2.6.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots in the United Kingdom.....	27
2.7	Welsh	28
2.7.1	Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Welsh.....	28
2.7.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Welsh in the United Kingdom	32
Chapter 3	[Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe	33
Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification		34
Appendix II: Comments from the United Kingdom authorities		37

Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in the United Kingdom in 2001 and applies to the following languages: Cornish, Irish, Manx Gaelic, Scots, Scottish Gaelic, Ulster Scots and Welsh.

The Committee of Experts has observed considerable progress in the implementation of the Charter in the United Kingdom. Institutions and many public services in Wales and Scotland have issued their own language strategies on the use of Welsh and Scottish Gaelic respectively. The governmental structure, based on devolved competences, makes it possible to plan and organise regional or minority language education, funding of cultural activities and encouragement of the use of these languages at the level closest to the citizens. However, responsibility for the Cornish language is not yet devolved, which hampers the ability to act for the promotion of this language.

The Northern Ireland Assembly has so far not reached a consensus on the adoption of an Irish Language Act. However, the Committee of Experts considers the adoption of such legislation as essential to free the promotion of Irish from political tensions.

In practice, the use of minority languages in education largely depends on the local authorities' ability and willingness to finance education in or of the minority language. Language strategies and devolved administrations encourage minority language-medium and minority language education in almost all territories covered by the Charter. Immersion programmes exist for Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Welsh. Cornish, Manx Gaelic, Scots and Ulster Scots are taught most frequently only in 'taster' classes where merely basic phrases or vocabulary are learnt. The Committee of Experts has seen evidence of an impressive and enthusiastic revival of Manx Gaelic in the Isle of Man.

The amendment of the BBC Royal Charter and of the complemented Framework Agreement as well as the co-operation with the devolved administrations have stabilised the financing of broadcasting in Welsh and Scottish Gaelic. These languages are now well served in terms of both radio and television. Broadcasting in Cornish, Manx Gaelic, Scots and Ulster Scots needs to be developed with a view to effectively contributing to the promotion of these languages. Similarly, there is a lack of newspapers in all regional or minority languages.

The use of Welsh and Scottish Gaelic by local authorities has further expanded. The use of Welsh at governmental level is an everyday practice. For Scottish Gaelic, further steps need to be taken in the field of teacher training.

This fifth evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to the United Kingdom in May 2018.

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its States Parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. The United Kingdom signed the Charter on 2 March 2000 and ratified it on 27 March 2001. The Charter entered into force in the United Kingdom on 1 July 2001 and applies to the following languages: Cornish, Irish, Manx Gaelic, Scots, Scottish Gaelic, Ulster Scots and Welsh. The Cornish, Manx Gaelic, Scots and Ulster Scots languages are covered by Part II (Article 7) only, whereas Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Welsh receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).

2. Article 15 (1) of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports about the implementation of the Charter. The United Kingdom authorities submitted their fifth periodical report with a delay, on 23 January 2018, again failing to provide information on Northern Ireland. This fifth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (14-18 May 2018) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the United Kingdom authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the fourth monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of the United Kingdom in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the United Kingdom authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of the United Kingdom, as provided in Article 16 (4) of the Charter.

4. As far as the detailed legal examination of each undertaking is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its **fourth evaluation report on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom (ECRML (2014) 1¹)**.

5. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to the United Kingdom in May 2018. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 20 June 2018.

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man

6. The responsibility for the implementation of the Charter lies mostly within the administrations of Scotland, Wales, Northern Ireland as well as the Isle of Man. In addition to the responsibility for the promotion of Cornish, the UK Government has responsibility for some Charter undertakings (e.g. concerning broadcasting) and has taken steps in implementing them. For example, the central authorities have ensured that the BBC Framework Agreement includes, for the first time, a specific clause which provides a clear commitment for the BBC to continue to deliver output in Irish and Ulster Scots. A framework agreement has been concluded between the BBC and the UK Government on the support of television broadcasts in Scottish Gaelic. Moreover, the new BBC Charter contains a commitment to Welsh language services.

7. The Committee of Experts regrets, however, to note that neither the United Kingdom central authorities nor the devolved administration concerned has included information about the application of the Charter in Northern Ireland in the fifth periodical report. Given that the Northern Ireland Assembly has been suspended since January 2017, it was, as in the fourth monitoring cycle, not possible to agree within the Northern Ireland power-sharing Executive on a contribution to the report. However, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts why the United Kingdom central authorities have not reported on their own competences. The Committee of Experts reminds the UK Government that it has the final responsibility under international law for the implementation of the Charter and that it is its treaty obligation to submit a complete report in full compliance with Article 15 of the Charter.

¹ <https://rm.coe.int/16806dcc8d>

8. In spite of persisting shortcomings in the implementation of the Charter (see chapter 1.2 below), the United Kingdom shows examples of good practice and resolute action to promote minority languages in several fields. In education, it is remarkable that minority language medium education (i.e. teaching nearly entirely in the minority language) is not only the preferred educational model of several linguistic groups, but also well-established and, despite the need to develop it further, well-functioning. Given that teaching in minority languages belongs to the most demanding promotional measures under the Charter, the Committee of Experts is pleased to note that demand for it is steadily growing.

9. The Committee of Experts also notes that several authorities engage in language planning and adopt concrete strategies for the development of minority languages. Examples include the 3rd National Gaelic Language Plan, the Cornish Language Strategy, the Cornish Language Plan 2015-2018 and the Manx Language Strategy 2017-2021. Particular mention needs to be made of the “Cymraeg 2050” strategy, which is an overarching plan to promote the use of Welsh in all areas of public life with a view to raising the number of Welsh speakers to one million by 2050. The Committee of Experts considers that these strategies and language plans can serve as models for the promotion of minority languages in other parts of Europe and is looking forward to the outcome.

10. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts wishes to stress the high interest of NGOs in the Charter and their very active role in implementing and monitoring it. Like in the previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts received a considerable number of statements submitted pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter from bodies and associations. This information was very helpful in the course of evaluating the application of the Charter and the Committee of Experts would like to express its appreciation to these organisations for their valuable contribution.

11. There is still a need to raise the awareness of the English-speaking majority population about the United Kingdom’s regional or minority languages as an integral part of the United Kingdom’s cultural heritage, in particular as regards Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Cornish.

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man

12. The **Cornish** language is in an ongoing process of revitalisation. Since 2015, Cornwall Council has been the lead body for the promotion of the language in Cornwall. A new Cornish Language Strategy for the period of 2015-2025 and a Cornish Language Plan for 2015-2018 have been adopted for the promotion of the language. Following an initiative to change Parliamentary Constituency boundaries in the region, Cornwall Council has raised concern over the planned changes. According to information received from NGO representatives, the government department concerned has made no adjustment or accommodation for the Cornish language, in particular regarding names of national institutions in Cornwall. A Standard Written Form for Cornish has been established for the use of Cornish in official documentation, public life and education. The representation of the language in the media is low - BBC Radio Cornwall only broadcasts one 5-minute radio programme in Cornish per week. There are no television programmes in the Cornish language. In Cornwall, the general English curriculum is applied, which does not make provision for the teaching of Cornish. Therefore, Cornish is not currently taught in mainstream education and there are no teachers who would be able to do so soon. There is demand from some primary schools and parents in Cornwall to teach Cornish. The language is currently only taught at adult classes, provided by voluntary community groups and individual teachers. The UK Government has discontinued the specific funding for the promotion of the Cornish language and, at the same time, the Devolution Deal 2014 with Cornwall Council does not include devolved responsibility for the Cornish language. In February 2017, the government announced additional funding to Cornwall Council of £100,000 over two years to support the development of Cornish culture and heritage, including language. It is unclear to the Committee of Experts to what extent the promotion of the Cornish language is financed by this fund. Moreover, Cornwall is only an observer in the British-Irish Council, a fact which hampers the promotion of the Cornish language. A comprehensive research and language planning strategy could raise awareness about the need for the research on Cornish. The co-operation between Akademi Kernewek and Exeter University might facilitate the realisation of this initiative.

13. The public use and promotion of **Irish** in Northern Ireland continues to be highly politicised. Some departments of the Northern Irish authorities as well as some local authorities have adopted “single-language policies” and thereby exclude the use of Irish, which is incompatible with the Charter. Despite recommendations by the Committee of Ministers in previous monitoring cycles, the Northern Ireland Assembly has so far not reached consensus on the adoption of an Irish Language Act. Given the ongoing political resistance, the Committee of Experts considers that such legislation should be passed at central governmental level and comprehensively regulate the use and promotion of Irish. It is seen as essential by both the Committee of Ministers and the Committee of Experts to free the promotion of Irish from political tensions. The Committee of Experts emphasises that it is an obligation of the United Kingdom to implement the undertakings selected for the Irish language. The fact that for many undertakings the power is devolved does not take away the responsibility of the United Kingdom to fulfil its treaty obligations. In education, Irish is a medium of instruction in pre-school, primary and secondary education. As the number of pupils is growing annually, the need to plan more strategically for the projected demand remains. This concerns in particular the training of teachers able to teach subjects in Irish at pre-school and secondary levels, taking into account the particular educational needs in immersion education. The use of Irish in court is still prohibited pursuant to the 1737 Administration of Justice Act, which the Committee of Experts considers discriminatory. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts received unconfirmed information that this restriction will be repealed in the near future. No additional legal texts have been translated into Irish, and those few legal texts that are available in Irish can no longer be found in a central location (e.g. website). The use of place names in Irish by local authorities and public service providers (e.g. Royal Mail) is patchy. Bilingual signage is usually limited to areas where Irish speakers constitute a large majority of the population. This implicit threshold is incompatible with the Charter. In the Northern Ireland Assembly, Irish speakers still have to self-translate their oral contributions. This requirement complicates and discourages the effective use of Irish in debates and is incompatible with the Charter undertaking concerned. In the media, the BBC broadcasts around five hours of radio programmes in Irish per week and occasional television programmes in Irish. There are no private radio programmes in Irish. As part of their licensing conditions, the United Kingdom authorities should require that commercial stations broadcast Irish programmes on a regular basis. The community (“independent”) radio station Raidió Fáilte broadcasts 24 hours per day in Irish, but its broadcast radius of 5km needs to be extended to cover the higher demand. Technical difficulties (geoblocking) complicate the reception of the television channel TG4 from the Republic of Ireland in some areas. Regarding print media, the authorities should take measures facilitating the publication of a newspaper in Irish.

14. The successful revival of **Manx Gaelic**, which was extinct in the 1970s, constitutes a rare case in Europe and continues to enjoy strong political and public support in the Isle of Man. In education, two pre-schools (playgroup, nursery) attended by 35-40 children use Manx Gaelic to some extent. One primary school, the Bunscoil Ghaelgagh in St John's/Balley Keeill Eoin, provides education in Manx Gaelic from reception (100% of the curriculum taught in Manx Gaelic) to Year 6 (90% Manx Gaelic, 10% English) to 67 pupils. In the island's primary schools where English is the medium of instruction, Manx Gaelic is an optional subject from the 4th to the 6th years (one hour weekly). At secondary level, one school teaches two subjects (geography and history) in Manx Gaelic in years 7-9. At the remaining four secondary schools, Manx is an optional subject in the 11-18 year old age group. In addition, there is an adult language programme, which is seen as contributing to the social cohesion of the community. Teaching materials are developed or, if imported, translated into Manx Gaelic. Teacher training is organised in England, but representatives of the Manx Gaelic speakers expressed the wish for it to be organised in the Isle of Man. As the Bunscoil Ghaelgagh is no longer able to cater for the growing demand in Manx Gaelic education, one or two additional primary schools teaching in this language should be opened in other parts of the island. There are a few applications available for those who wish to learn Manx Gaelic: a dictionary called Manx Words, Manx Words App and a resource for learners entitled Say Something in Manx). No research is currently being carried out on Manx Gaelic in the Isle of Man. As far as the official use of Manx Gaelic is concerned, the parliament (Tynwald) reads out public summaries of new laws in English and Manx Gaelic at Tynwald Hill once per year. In addition, several municipalities have bilingual place name and street name signs. These topographic names should be recognised as co-official so as to enable their effective use in additional fields (e.g. official documents, postal services, maps). Some signage in Manx Gaelic is also used in public transport. In the media, there are several weekly public radio programmes in Manx Gaelic which last up to one hour. Manx Gaelic is not used on television as the Isle of Man has no channel of its own and the BBC does not provide an allocated timeslot for the island. A newspaper publishes an article in Manx Gaelic once per month. Culture

Vannin, the island's official cultural promotion body, has opened a cultural centre located adjacent to the Bunscoill Ghaelgagh which serves as a forum for numerous activities promoting Manx Gaelic. The Isle of Man also promotes Manx Gaelic in the framework of transfrontier co-operation, *inter alia* through its membership in the British-Irish Council. As part of the official "Manx Language Strategy 2017-2021", the Government of the Isle of Man will explore the possibility of applying Part III of the Charter to Manx Gaelic and has accepted the Council of Europe's offer of assistance regarding this plan. The promotion of Manx Gaelic would also benefit from the adoption of a long-term strategy setting out objectives and milestones for Manx Gaelic pre-school, primary and secondary education (number of pupils and speakers), the use of this language in the media (including television and newspaper) and in the administrative domain (place names, signage, use of the language by and in contact with authorities).

15. Recently acquired statistical data confirms that over 1.5 million people identify themselves as being **Scots** speakers and that a further 400,000 have some knowledge of the Scots language. The public cultural body "Creative Scotland" issued its own Scots Language Policy and established the Scots Scriever's post based at the National Library of Scotland, however, its mandate ended in August 2017. The Scottish Government and its agencies have committed themselves to accept any form of communication in the Scots language. According to the Government's Scots Policy, Scots-related government documents will be produced also in the Scots language. A dictionary in the form of a smartphone app has been developed and a private initiative of the Open University is planning to offer a teacher training resource on the Scots language.

16. According to the last census, more than 57,000 people identify themselves as **Scottish Gaelic** speakers, with a total of about 87,000 claiming some knowledge of the language. The Education (Scotland) Act 2016 which entered into force in 2017 created a duty on local authorities to promote Scottish Gaelic education and a parental right to request Gaelic-medium primary education. Based on the duty prescribed by the Act, Bòrd na Gàidhlig prepared Statutory Guidance on Gaelic-medium and learner education for pre-school, primary and secondary education. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the speakers stated that there is growing demand for Scottish Gaelic-Medium Education. However, it was stated that the teaching of the history and culture reflected by Scottish Gaelic is not ensured. Local authorities and many public bodies have issued language plans for Scottish Gaelic. However, no major achievements were reported on the availability of the language in these fields. The 3rd National Gaelic Language Plan was launched in 2017 with the approval of the Scottish Parliament. Steps have been taken in order to improve teacher training; indeed, its funding has been increased. A framework agreement was concluded between the BBC and the UK Government on the support of television broadcasts in Scottish Gaelic. No practice has been reported on the use of Scottish Gaelic with local authorities. Private radio and television broadcasts in Scottish Gaelic as well as the publication of newspaper articles in Scottish Gaelic should be increased. FilmG, a short film competition run by MG Alba encouraged the production of more than 400 short films in Scottish Gaelic. The National Library of Scotland continues to collect, keep, present and publish works produced in Scottish Gaelic. The standardisation of Scottish Gaelic grammar and vocabulary as well as the determination of Scottish Gaelic place names is ensured by established bodies. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts received positive reports on the increase of Scottish Gaelic signage (e.g. place names, signage on public buildings and police vehicles).

17. **Ulster Scots** continues to have a weak presence in public life. It is not taught in mainstream education and there are no teachers of it. Nevertheless, a number of schools raise awareness of Ulster Scots. During the reporting period, new teaching materials for such awareness-raising activities have been developed and successfully introduced in some primary schools. None of the colleges that provide adult and further education offer Ulster Scots language classes. In administration, three boroughs have adopted policies on the promotion of Ulster Scots and *inter alia* are open to citizens communicating with them in Ulster Scots. According to representatives of the speakers, other areas inhabited in relevant numbers by Ulster Scots speakers are not promoting Ulster Scots or have removed signage in Ulster Scots. In the media, the Ulster Scots Agency has advocated for the development of the use of Ulster Scots by the broadcast media. Considerable progress has been made and a number of radio programmes have been broadcast recently. The Ulster Scots Agency undertook additional measures to broaden the acceptance and the use of Ulster Scots in everyday life. Summer schools and festivals were organised with its help in order to promote Ulster Scots. In 2015, the Northern Irish authorities published a long-term strategy on the promotion of Ulster Scots *inter alia* in education, the media, public services, and culture. However, according to representatives of the Ulster Scots speakers, the implementation of the strategy has still not begun. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the speakers complained that Ulster Scots is often presented in a very negative and stereotyped way in the media, particularly the print media. Moreover, the Ulster Scots representatives feel they are not sufficiently involved by the authorities in developing language policies, especially at local level.

18. In 2016, the Welsh Government issued a policy document called Cymraeg 2050 which is an overarching plan to promote the use of Welsh in all areas of public life. The Foundation Phase Action Plan, published in November 2016, aims to set out the need to improve the level of **Welsh** language in all schools and pre-school settings. A new government plan on childcare is currently being developed which aims to increase the provision of Welsh-medium childcare. Welsh-medium education has been considered patchy or absent in some counties of Wales. Local authorities are reluctant to meet demand for teaching in Welsh at primary and secondary level. The offer of vocational training is considered insufficient. Welsh-medium modules are available in Welsh universities and it has been reported that an increasing number of students use Welsh within their studies. The National Centre for Learning Welsh is responsible for the strategic direction of a network of 10 providers who deliver courses in Welsh for participants in adult or continuing education. According to the United Kingdom's fifth periodical report, a well-developed teacher training system ensures the establishment of the education workforce for Welsh. However, during the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts learned about gaps in teaching posts and a lack of a short-term strategy. A large number of students in teacher education participate each year in Welsh-language training courses. The use of Welsh is guaranteed before criminal, civil and administrative courts. The Administrative Court in Wales has heard two judicial review cases where Welsh was used by the parties and judgments were provided in this language. More than 80 public bodies are now subject to Welsh Language Standards, including police forces, Welsh tribunals, health sector bodies and bodies of the education sector. Legislation and administrative texts in Welsh have been grouped on a single page of the United Kingdom legislation website which guarantees easy access to Welsh legislative texts. The Welsh Government provided grant funding to the association of Welsh translators and interpreters (Cymdeithas, Cyfieithwyr Cymru). The new financing system provides a strong financial settlement in relation to the licence fee element of the Welsh television channel S4C's funding. However, the long-term financing of the channel is still uncertain. Radio Cymru continues to broadcast in Welsh, as well as a number of newly established online radio stations. Encouraging Welsh language projects is also a central element of the support of creative industries and digital development sector. There is no daily newspaper printed in Welsh. Authorities are committed to developing the Welsh linguistic and cultural infrastructure, and the Welsh language strategy Cymraeg 2050 covers areas such as economy, education, language standards and culture. Although important steps have been made by the Welsh Government in order to comply with the Committee of Ministers' recommendations regarding the use of Welsh in hospitals, retirement homes and hostels, there is still a lack of capacity. Beyond the action plans, a ward was created in a hospital where medical services are offered in Welsh. The application of the principle of "Active Offer" could lead to the compliance with the recommendation of the Committee of Ministers on the use of Welsh in health and social care.

Chapter 2 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Cornish

2.1.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Cornish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Cornish ²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Cornish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Cornish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Cornish	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Cornish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Cornish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Cornish at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Cornish to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Cornish at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Cornish		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Cornish					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Cornish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Cornish among their objectives 				=	
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Cornish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Cornish 		=			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Cornish in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom³ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

<p>a. Devolve responsibility and provide funding to the County of Cornwall and Cornwall Council for the promotion of Cornish.</p>
--

II. Further recommendations

- b. Ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Cornish.
- c. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Cornish at all appropriate stages.
- d. Take further action in order to facilitate and/or encourage the use of Cornish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life.
- e. Maintain and develop links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Cornish, and establish cultural relations with other linguistic groups.
- f. Promote the study and research on Cornish at universities or equivalent institutions.
- g. Promote transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Cornish, including by giving Cornwall Council full membership in the British-Irish Council.
- h. Raise awareness of Cornish in education and training as well as in the mass media.

³ RecChL(2004)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dd699); CM/RecChL(2007)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d60ba); CM/RecChL(2010)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf339); CM/RecChL(2014)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6ac7).

2.2 Irish

2.2.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Irish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:
 ↑ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Irish ⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Irish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Irish		=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Irish				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Irish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Irish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Irish at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Irish to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Irish at universities or equivalent institutions					=
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Irish	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Irish		=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Irish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Irish among their objectives 					=
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Irish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Irish 					=
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Irish or a substantial part of pre-school education in Irish at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Irish⁵	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Irish, a substantial part of primary education in Irish or teaching of Irish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		↗			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Irish, a substantial part of secondary education in Irish or teaching of Irish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Irish, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Irish or teaching of Irish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient					↙
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Irish or of facilities for the study of Irish as an university or higher education subject		↙			
8.1.fii	offer Irish as a subject of adult and continuing education					↙
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Irish		↙			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Irish		=			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Irish is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Irish at all the appropriate stages of education					↙
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.3	make available in Irish the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Irish				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Irish may submit oral or written applications in Irish to local branches of the national authorities		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Irish		=			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Irish to submit oral or written applications in Irish to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Irish in debates in their assemblies				↙	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Irish in debates in their assemblies				↙	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Irish		=			
10.3.c	allow users of Irish to submit a request in Irish to public service providers		=			
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Irish	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Irish ⁵	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Irish		↙			
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Irish on a regular basis		↙			
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Irish					↙
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Irish					
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Irish					
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Irish					↙
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Irish • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Irish • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Irish 		↙			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Irish		↙			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Irish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing					↙
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Irish					↙
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Irish in providing facilities and planning cultural activities					↙
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Irish					↙
12.2	In territories other than those in which Irish is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Irish					↙
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Irish and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Irish by means other than those specified in the above sub-paragraphs					↙
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Irish is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Irish in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Irish, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Irish is used in identical or similar form	=				

* **The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

19. In light of the information obtained during the on-the-spot visit, primary education in Irish is available in a number of schools. However, there is a lack of teachers and planning for Irish-medium education, which is why Article 8.1.biv is only partly fulfilled. In 2015/2016, the University of Ulster cancelled its full-time BA degree programme in Irish. The current offer of Irish-language teaching in higher education does not satisfy the existing demand. Therefore, Art. 8.1.eiii is only partly fulfilled. The teaching of the history and culture which is reflected by Irish is ensured in Irish-medium schools. However, such teaching is not an integral part of the curriculum in the English-medium schools. Consequently, Article 8.1.g is only partly fulfilled. Irish cannot in practice be used in debates of the Northern Ireland Assembly and in local councils because simultaneous interpretation is not consistently available to all participants and Irish-speaking members are required to self-translate their contributions. Therefore, Art. 10.2.e and f are not fulfilled. In the media, the duration of BBC's radio and television broadcasts in Irish is still restrictive, thereby only partly fulfilling Art. 11.1.a.iii. There are no commercial radio programmes in Irish. The community ("independent") Irish-language radio station Raidió Fáilte has a very limited broadcast radius. Therefore, Art. 11.1.bii is only partly fulfilled. Geoblocking hampers the reception of the television channel TG4 from the Republic of Ireland in some areas. Furthermore, free access to TG4 is not guaranteed in all areas. Consequently, Art. 11.2 is only partly fulfilled. Cultural bodies and facilities using Irish receive less funding than English-language bodies. Their work is also hampered by the lack of a strategy on the promotion of Irish in the field of culture. Therefore, Art. 12.1.a is only partly fulfilled. Since the United Kingdom authorities have not provided the Committee of Experts with information about the application of all their undertakings concerning Irish for a long time, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on several of them.

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Irish in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts' recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom⁵ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- | |
|--|
| <p>a. Adopt a comprehensive law and a strategy on the promotion of Irish in Northern Ireland.</p> <p>b. Provide the basic and further training of a sufficient number of teachers teaching in Irish.</p> |
|--|

II. Further recommendations

- c. Extend the provision of pre-school, primary and secondary education in Irish.
- d. Eliminate the unjustified exclusion relating to the use of Irish before courts.

⁵ RecChL(2004)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dd699); CM/RecChL(2007)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d60ba); CM/RecChL(2010)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf339); CM/RecChL(2014)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6ac7).

- e. Extend the offer of Irish as a university subject.
- f. Ensure the teaching of the history and culture reflected by Irish.
- g. Translate into Irish, and make publicly available, the most important national and Northern Irish statutory texts.
- h. Ensure that users of Irish may submit oral or written applications in Irish to local branches of the national authorities, the authorities of Northern Ireland, local authorities and public service providers.
- i. Introduce simultaneous translation facilitating the full use of Irish in the Northern Ireland Assembly and in local councils.
- j. Ensure that local branches of the national authorities draft documents in Irish.
- k. Facilitate the adoption and use, by local and regional authorities as well as public service providers, of place names in Irish.
- l. Take practical measures facilitating the use of family names in Irish in conformity with the Irish spelling.
- m. Extend the offer of public radio and television broadcasts in Irish.
- n. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Irish on a regular basis and extend the broadcast radius of Raidió Fáilte.
- o. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one newspaper in Irish either in printed form or online.
- p. Apply existing measures for financial assistance to include audiovisual productions in Irish.
- q. Take measures to remove technical obstacles to the reception of television broadcasts from the Republic of Ireland.
- r. Adopt and implement a strategy on cultural production and activities in Irish.
- s. Make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Irish and the culture it reflects.
- t. Promote cross-border exchanges, in the fields covered by the Charter, for the benefit of Irish.

2.3 Manx Gaelic

2.3.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:
 ↑ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Manx Gaelic ⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Manx Gaelic as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Manx Gaelic	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Manx Gaelic	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Manx Gaelic, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Manx Gaelic • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Manx Gaelic at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Manx Gaelic to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Manx Gaelic at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Manx Gaelic	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Manx Gaelic	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Manx Gaelic among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Manx Gaelic among their objectives 	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Manx Gaelic • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Manx Gaelic 	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic in the Isle of Man

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom⁷ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Make available primary education in Manx Gaelic in additional municipalities.

II. Further recommendations

- b. Extend the use of Manx Gaelic in pre-school education.
- c. Adopt a long-term strategy setting out objectives and milestones for Manx Gaelic pre-school, primary and secondary education (number of pupils and speakers), the use of this language in the media (including television and newspaper) and in the administrative field (place names, signage, use of the language by and in contact with authorities).
- d. Provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching Manx Gaelic in the Isle of Man.
- e. Promote study and research on Manx Gaelic at universities or equivalent institutions.

⁷ RecChL(2004)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dd699); CM/RecChL(2007)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d60ba); CM/RecChL(2010)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf339); CM/RecChL(2014)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6ac7).

2.4 Scots

2.4.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scots

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scots ⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Scots as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Scots	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Scots	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Scots, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		↘			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Scots • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Scots at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Scots to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Scots at universities or equivalent institutions				↘	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Scots					↘
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Scots					↘
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scots among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scots among their objectives 					↘
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Scots • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Scots 					↘

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

20. Important steps have been taken in the field of developing materials in order to make Scots “more readily available in schools”. Art. 7.1.f is considered partly fulfilled. There are no plans to promote the study and research on Scots at universities or equivalent institutions, therefore Art. 7.1.h is considered not fulfilled. The authorities did not provide information on measures taken in order to comply with Art. 7.1.i; 7.2; 7.3; 7.4; the Committee of Experts cannot therefore conclude on these undertakings.

2.4.2 2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scots in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom⁹ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Scots at all appropriate stages.
--

II. Further recommendations

- b. Take steps to ensure the maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Scots and on the establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups.
- c. Take steps to promote transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Scots.
- d. Promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country, promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scots among the objectives of education and training, encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scots among their objectives, take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by groups using Scots, establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Scots.
- e. Provide facilities enabling non-speakers of Scots to learn the language.

⁹ RecChL(2004)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dd699); CM/RecChL(2007)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d60ba); CM/RecChL(2010)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf339); CM/RecChL(2014)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6ac7).

2.5 Scottish Gaelic

2.5.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scottish Gaelic ¹⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Scottish Gaelic as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Scottish Gaelic, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life	↗				
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Scottish Gaelic • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Scottish Gaelic at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Scottish Gaelic to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Scottish Gaelic at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scottish Gaelic among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scottish Gaelic among their objectives 	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Scottish Gaelic • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Scottish Gaelic 	=				

¹⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scottish Gaelic ¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part III of the Charter						
(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Scottish Gaelic	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Scottish Gaelic	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Scottish Gaelic	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Scottish Gaelic, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Scottish Gaelic or teaching of Scottish Gaelic as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Scottish Gaelic or of facilities for the study of Scottish Gaelic as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Scottish Gaelic as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Scottish Gaelic				↙	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Scottish Gaelic	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Scottish Gaelic and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Scottish Gaelic is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Scottish Gaelic at all the appropriate stages of education		↙			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Scottish Gaelic in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Scottish Gaelic		↗			
10.2.a	use of Scottish Gaelic within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Scottish Gaelic to submit oral or written applications in Scottish Gaelic to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Scottish Gaelic	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Scottish Gaelic in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Scottish Gaelic in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Scottish Gaelic	↗				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Scottish Gaelic	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scottish Gaelic¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.1.b.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Scottish Gaelic on a regular basis				↙	
11.1.c.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Scottish Gaelic on a regular basis				↙	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Scottish Gaelic		↙			
11.1.e.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.1.f.ii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Scottish Gaelic • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Scottish Gaelic • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Scottish Gaelic 					= 11
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Scottish Gaelic language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Scottish Gaelic	↗				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Scottish Gaelic in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Scottish Gaelic is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Scottish Gaelic and the culture it reflects	=				

¹¹ not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scottish Gaelic ¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Scottish Gaelic in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Scottish Gaelic in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Scottish Gaelic is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Scottish Gaelic in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Scottish Gaelic, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Scottish Gaelic is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

21. The adoption and the application of the Education (Scotland) Act and various local and public authority Gaelic plans fulfil the undertaking under Art. 7.1.d. Teaching of the history and culture reflected by Scottish Gaelic is not ensured; Art. 8.1.g is therefore considered not fulfilled. Steps have been taken in order to finance and organise distance-learning courses (e-Sgoil). While the initiative is not considered a long-term solution, the undertaking under Art. 8.2 is partly fulfilled. In specific territorial units, legal provisions allow the production of documents or evidence in Scottish Gaelic in civil proceedings. The Scottish Government has started to adopt documents in Scottish Gaelic; Art. 10.1.c is therefore considered partly fulfilled. Place names in Scottish Gaelic are officially recognised by Royal Mail; Art. 10.2.g is therefore considered fulfilled. There are no private radio or television programmes in Scottish Gaelic; Art. 11.1.bii and Art. 11.1.cii are therefore not fulfilled. The FilmG short film competition encourages the production of audiovisual works in Scottish Gaelic, although their distribution should be increased. Art. 11.1.d is thus only partly fulfilled. Since Creative Scotland was established it is apparent to the Committee of Experts that bodies organising cultural activities do have Gaelic speaking staff at their disposal. Therefore Art. 12.1.e is considered fulfilled.

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom¹² remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Take further measures to make pre-school, primary and secondary education available in Scottish Gaelic.**
- b. **Continue taking measures to strengthen Scottish Gaelic education, especially through the training of teachers and the production of teaching and learning materials.**

II. Further recommendations

- c. Make technical and vocational education in Scottish Gaelic, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Scottish Gaelic or teaching of Scottish Gaelic as an integral part of the curriculum available at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient.
- d. Ensure the teaching of the history and culture which is reflected by Scottish Gaelic.
- e. In territories other than those in which Scottish Gaelic is traditionally used, encourage or provide teaching in or of Scottish Gaelic at all appropriate stages of education.
- f. Continue to encourage the national authorities to draft documents in Scottish Gaelic.
- g. Take further measures for the use of Scottish Gaelic within the framework of the regional or local authorities.
- h. Encourage the publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Scottish Gaelic.
- i. Take further steps to encourage local authorities to use Scottish Gaelic in debates in their assemblies.
- j. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Scottish Gaelic on a regular basis.
- k. Encourage and/or facilitate the distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Scottish Gaelic.

¹² RecChL(2004)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dd699); CM/RecChL(2007)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d60ba); CM/RecChL(2010)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf339); CM/RecChL(2014)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6ac7).

2.6 Ulster Scots

2.6.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:
 ↑ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Ulster Scots ¹³	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Ulster Scots as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ulster Scots					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ulster Scots				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ulster Scots, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Ulster Scots • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ulster Scots at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ulster Scots to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ulster Scots at universities or equivalent institutions					=
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ulster Scots					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ulster Scots					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ulster Scots among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ulster Scots among their objectives 					=
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ulster Scots • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ulster Scots 	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

¹³ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

22. Due to a lack of information in the State periodical report on the situation of Ulster Scots, the Committee of Experts was unfortunately not able to conclude on numerous undertakings.

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom¹⁴ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendation for immediate action

a. Adopt a strategy to promote Ulster Scots in education and other areas of public life.

II. Further recommendation

b. Establish cultural relations with other linguistic groups.

¹⁴ RecChL(2004)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dd699); CM/RecChL(2007)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d60ba); CM/RecChL(2010)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf339); CM/RecChL(2014)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6ac7).

2.7 Welsh

2.7.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Welsh

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Welsh ¹⁵	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Welsh as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Welsh	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Welsh	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Welsh, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life	=				
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Welsh • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Welsh at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Welsh to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Welsh at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Welsh	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Welsh	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Welsh among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Welsh among their objectives 	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Welsh • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Welsh 	=				
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Welsh	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Welsh	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Welsh	=				

¹⁵ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Welsh¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Welsh, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Welsh or teaching of Welsh as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		↔			
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Welsh or of facilities for the study of Welsh as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Welsh as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Welsh	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Welsh	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Welsh and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Welsh in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Welsh, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Welsh in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Welsh in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.c.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Welsh in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Welsh in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Welsh and the related use of documents and evidence in Welsh, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.b	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Welsh, and provide that they can be invoked against third parties who are not users of Welsh	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Welsh ¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities the administrative authorities use Welsh		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Welsh or in bilingual versions	=				
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Welsh	=				
10.2.a	use of Welsh within the framework of the regional or local authority	↗				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Welsh to submit oral or written applications in Welsh to the regional or local authority	↗				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Welsh	↗				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Welsh	↗				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Welsh in debates in their assemblies	↗				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Welsh in debates in their assemblies		=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Welsh	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Welsh is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.4.a	translation or interpretation	=				
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Welsh	↗				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Welsh	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Welsh	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Welsh	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Welsh	=				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Welsh	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Welsh • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Welsh • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Welsh 					= 16
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Welsh are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Welsh	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Welsh by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				

¹⁶ not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Welsh ¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
12.1.c	foster access in Welsh to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Welsh language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Welsh	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Welsh in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Welsh	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Welsh	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Welsh is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Welsh	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Welsh and the culture it reflects	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Welsh in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Welsh in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Welsh in economic and social life	=				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Welsh	↗				
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Welsh	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

23. The fifth periodical report contains information on the continuous governmental programmes in the field of the use of Welsh in technical and vocational education. Despite of the request formulated by the Committee of Experts in the fourth evaluation report, the authorities did not comment on the concerns expressed by the speakers' NGOs on the insufficient offer of vocational training. Therefore, Art. 8.1.div is only considered partly fulfilled. During the on-the-spot visit, there were concerns raised about the future of the provision of vocational skills in Welsh. The Committee of Experts was given examples of the practical use of Welsh by the national and local authorities on the fulfilment of Art. 10.2.a, b, c, d, e. Due to the establishment of Welsh Language Standards, progress has been achieved in the field of planning for the recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Welsh and Art. 10.4.b is therefore considered fulfilled. In the last monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the United Kingdom authorities take concrete steps to further increase the use of Welsh in health and social care. A single action plan has been created for both sectors in 2016. An important element of the current plans is the principle of "active offer", which takes the responsibility away from the individual to ask services in Welsh, placing it on the service providers. Beyond the action plans, the creation of a ward delivering Welsh language skills in one hospital is a significant sign of progress in this field. The undertaking defined by Art. 13.2.c is thus considered fulfilled.

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Welsh in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.7.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts' recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom¹⁷ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations

- a. Take further steps to ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Welsh.
- b. Continue to provide technical and vocational education in Welsh, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Welsh or teaching of Welsh as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient.
- c. Ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Welsh.

¹⁷ RecChL(2004)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dd699); CM/RecChL(2007)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d60ba); CM/RecChL(2010)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf339); CM/RecChL(2014)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6ac7).

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the authorities of the United Kingdom have undertaken to protect the regional and minority languages spoken in the country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to the United Kingdom.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Bearing in mind the declarations deposited by the United Kingdom on 27 March 2001, 11 March 2003 and 22 April 2003;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by the United Kingdom;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by the United Kingdom in its fifth periodical report, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in the United Kingdom and the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit,

[Having taken note of the comments made by the authorities of the United Kingdom on the contents of the Committee of Experts' report;]

Recommends that the authorities of the United Kingdom take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. adopt a comprehensive law and strategy on the promotion of Irish in Northern Ireland;
2. continue taking measures to strengthen Scottish Gaelic education, especially through the training of teachers and the production of teaching and learning materials;
3. devolve the necessary responsibilities to Cornwall County Council enabling it to effectively promote Cornish.

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification**United Kingdom**

Declaration contained in a Note Verbale from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office of the United Kingdom, handed at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification on 27 March 2001 - Or. Engl.

The United Kingdom declares that the Charter applies to mainland Britain and Northern Ireland.

Period covered: 01/07/2001 -

Articles concerned : 1

Declaration contained in a Note Verbale from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office of the United Kingdom, handed at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification on 27 March 2001 - Or. Engl.

a) The United Kingdom declares, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2 and Article 3, paragraph 1, of the Charter that it will apply the following provisions for the purposes of Part III of the Charter to Welsh, Scottish-Gaelic and Irish.

Welsh – 52 paragraphs.Article 8: Education

Paragraphs 1a (i) 1b (i) 1c (i) 1d(iv) 1e (iii) 1f (ii) 1g 1h 1i

Total: 9

Article 9: Judicial authorities

Paragraphs 1a (ii) 1a (iii) 1b (ii) 1b (iii) 1c (ii) 1c (iii) 1d 2b

Total: 8

Article 10: Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraphs 1a (i) 1b 1c 2a 2b 2c 2d 2e 2f 2g 3a 4a 4b 5

Total: 14

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1a (i) 1d 1e (i) 1f (ii) 2 3

Total: 6

Article 12: Cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 1a 1b 1c 1d 1e 1f 1g 1h 2 3

Total: 10

Article 13: Economic and social life

Paragraphs 1a 1c 2b 2c 2e

Total: 5

Scottish-Gaelic – 39 paragraphsArticle 8: Education

Paragraphs 1a (i) 1b (i) 1c (i) 1d(iv) 1e (iii) 1f (iii) 1g 1h 1i 2

Total: 10

Article 9: Judicial authorities

Paragraph 1b (iii)

Total: 1

Article 10: Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraphs 1c 2a 2b 2d 2e 2f 2g 5

Total: 8

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1a (ii) 1b (ii) 1c (ii) 1d 1e (ii) 1f (ii) 1g 2

Total: 8

Article 12: Cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 1a 1d 1e 1f 1g 1h 2 3

Total: 8

Article 13: Economic and social life

Paragraphs 1a 1c

Total: 2

Article 14: Transfrontier exchanges

Paragraphs a b

Total: 2

Irish – 30 paragraphs relating to matters which are the responsibility of the devolved administration in Northern IrelandArticle 8: Education

Paragraphs 1a (iii) 1b (iv) 1c (iv) 1d(iv) 1e (iii) 1f (ii) 1g 1h

Total: 8

Article 9: Judicial authorities

Paragraph 3

Total: 1

Article 10: Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraphs 1a (iv) 1c 2b 2e 2f 2g 3c 4a 5

Total: 9

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1d 1e (i) 1f (ii) 1g

Total: 4

Article 12: Cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 1a 1d 1e 1f 1h 2 3

Total: 7

Article 13: Economic and social life

Paragraph 1d

Total: 1

Irish – 6 paragraphs relating to matters which are the responsibility of the UK government in Northern IrelandArticle 8: Education

Paragraph 2

Total: 1

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1a (iii) 1b (ii) 2

Total: 3

Article 14: Transfrontier exchanges

Paragraphs a b

Total: 2

(Total of 36 paragraphs overall)

b) The United Kingdom declares, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 1 of the Charter that it recognises that Scots and Ulster Scots meet the Charter's definition of a regional or minority language for the purposes of Part II of the Charter.

Period covered: 01/07/2001 -

Articles concerned: 2, 3

Declaration contained in a letter from the Permanent Representative of the United Kingdom, dated 11 March 2003, registered at the Secretariat General on 18 March 2003 - Or. Engl.

The United Kingdom declares, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 1, of the Charter that it recognises that Cornish meets the Charter's definition of a regional or minority language for the purposes of Part II of the Charter.

Period covered: 18/03/2003 -

Articles concerned: 2

Declaration contained in a letter from the Permanent Representative of the United Kingdom, dated 22 April 2003 and registered at the Secretariat General on 23 April 2003 - Or. Engl.

The Government of the United Kingdom declares that the Charter should extend to the Isle of Man, being a territory for whose international relations the Government of the United Kingdom is responsible.

Period covered: 23/04/2003 -

Articles concerned: 1

Declaration contained in a letter from the Permanent Representative of the United Kingdom, dated 22 April 2003 and registered at the Secretariat General on 23 April 2003 - Or. Engl.

As a consequence of the extension of the Charter to the Isle of Man, the Manx Gaelic language will be a "regional or minority language" for the purposes of the Charter and accordingly Part II of the Charter will henceforth apply to the Manx Gaelic language.

Period covered: 23/04/2003 -

Articles concerned: 2

Appendix II: Comments from the United Kingdom authorities

The United Kingdom welcomes its ongoing engagement with the Committee of Experts (“the Committee”) of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (“the Charter”), and has taken note of the Committee’s fifth report in respect of the United Kingdom. The Committee’s report pertains to the situation described by the United Kingdom Government in its report in January 2018, and the visit made by representatives of the Committee to the United Kingdom in May 2018.

The United Kingdom will make its official response to the Committee’s recommendations in its next periodical report under Article 15 of the Charter, at which point it will provide also updated information on its national situation since 2018. In addition, it wishes at this stage to offer the following comments on the Committee’s fifth report in respect of some of the languages concerned. All paragraph references are to the Committee’s fifth report.

Cornish (paragraph 12 and section 2.1)

Regarding Parliamentary Constituency boundaries in the region, Cornwall Council wishes to clarify that a review of boundaries proposed a new constituency only partially in Cornwall, and that its concern is that this new administrative unit, which is not coterminous with the territory of the language, could constitute a new obstacle to the promotion of Cornish.

With respect to the names of national institutions in Cornwall, Cornwall Council wishes to note that, in its view, there are multiple Government departments that could accommodate Cornish, not just one as implied by the phrase “the government department concerned” in paragraph 12. In light of this, Cornwall Council expresses the view that undertaking 7.1.b – “ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Cornish” – should be marked in section 2.1.1 as “partially fulfilled”.

Although it is correct that Cornish is not taught widely in mainstream education, around 15 schools provide introductory lessons in Cornish.

The Government continues to work with Cornwall Council to develop sustainable funding for culture, heritage and language. In 2019, the Government provided £200,000 (around €225,000) of dedicated funding to Cornwall to support projects furthering the protection of Cornish language and culture. £150,000 has been provided to tackle barriers to systematic education provision around Cornish language and culture, and £50,000 has been allocated to build cultural distinctiveness into planning and development decisions.

The Committee notes that “Cornwall is only an observer in the British-Irish Council, a fact which hampers the promotion of the Cornish language.” As explained to the Committee’s representatives during the on-the-spot visit, the British-Irish Council is derived from the Belfast Agreement and includes only devolved nations and authorities as full members. Although Cornwall Council hold a Devolution Deal with Government – dating from 2015, not 2014 as indicated in paragraph 12 – it does not have the legal status of a devolved nation or authority, and hence is not eligible for full membership; but it does benefit from observer status.

Scots (paragraph 15 and section 2.4)

In section 2.4.1, undertaking 7.1.f – “provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Scots at all appropriate stages” – is marked as “not fulfilled” in the table; but in paragraph 20, immediately following the table, the Committee contradictorily says that “Art. 7.1.f is considered partially fulfilled”. The Scottish Qualifications Authority (SQA) has, since 2013, made available Scots language qualifications, and materials are available to support this. Education Scotland has also encouraged the teaching of Scots in primary schools and provided resources to support this. These resources are now located on the website of the Scots Language Centre. Scottish Language Dictionaries, the Association for Scottish Literary Studies and Scots Hoose have also made materials available for this.

With regard to undertaking 7.1.h – “promotion of study and research on Scots at universities or equivalent institutions” – which the Committee considers “not fulfilled”, the study of Scots at universities is possible. In addition, the Open University is in the process of producing a resource aimed at the continuing professional learning of teachers and other tutors: in particular, to complement the past and continuing activity of Education Scotland in this field. The course focuses on Scots as a living language as well as the history and linguistic development of Scots. This short course is being produced in collaboration with Education Scotland and expert authors in the field.

Scottish Gaelic (paragraph 16 and section 2.5)

Undertaking 7.1.f – “provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Gaelic at all appropriate stages” – is marked as “partly fulfilled”. There are now Gaelic qualifications available at all levels, and resources to support the teaching of Gaelic. It is therefore not clear from the report why the Committee has marked this undertaking as “partly fulfilled”.

Welsh (paragraph 18 and section 2.7)

The Welsh Government wishes to note that, since its evidence was submitted in September 2017, it has been implementing its new Welsh Languages Strategy: Cymraeg 2050. This strategy aims to meet the challenge of reaching a million Welsh speakers by 2050. The Committee’s report was not able to assess progress since the launch of Cymraeg 2050 in July 2017, but the Welsh Government would therefore expect to see improvement recognised against more undertakings in the next periodic report. The Welsh Government notes in particular that its Welsh Language Strategy is a long-term strategy, reflecting that activity aimed at increasing the number of speakers does not happen overnight, and notes that the initial years of the strategy will focus on laying the foundations to facilitate and increase in the number of Welsh speakers in the longer term.

The National Centre for Learning Welsh is responsible for the strategic direction of a network of eleven providers who delivers courses in Welsh for participants in adult or continuing education – not ten, as stated in paragraph 18.

Regarding post-16 education, and specifically vocational training, there has been a gradual increase in recent years in the number of learners who use Welsh as part of learning activities that contribute to a vocational qualification. However, activity is underway to provide further support for the sector to develop the provision further. In July 2018, the Cabinet Secretary for Education and the Minister for Welsh Language and Lifelong Learning received a report by the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol’s Post-16 Advisory Group, representing further education and work-based learning sectors, presenting a renewed vision for improving Welsh-medium vocational training. As a result, the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol published their Further Education and Apprenticeship Welsh-medium Action Plan in December 2018, which was launched by the Welsh Government Minister for Education in January 2019.

Although the Committee correctly notes that there is no daily newspaper printed in Welsh, the Welsh Government, through the Welsh Books Council, continues to fund the Welsh language daily online news service Golwg 360.