



COUNCIL OF EUROPE CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Economic Crime Division
Directorate of Co-operation
Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs
May 2008

COUNCIL OF EUROPE COOPERATION PROGRAMME

Ethics for the Prevention of Corruption in Turkey (TYEC)
CoE Project No. EC/1062

AMENDMENTS TO PROJECT: TRAINING

Prepared by:

David Watt, United Kingdom
Council of Europe Short-Term Expert

PC-TC(2008)62

The views expressed in this document are author's own and do not necessarily reflect official positions of the Council of Europe

INTRODUCTION

The proposed amendment to the project specification relates to the training component. The original states the following:

Output 2	A training package is available to support the application of the code of ethics for public officials
Activity 2.1	Provision and dissemination of materials on training for ethics and on international standards and tools on enhancement of ethics from other countries
	Review, Translation of models and good practices that exist in other European countries on training for ethics and on international standards and tools on enhancement of ethics
	Dissemination and Introduction of the materials for the Ethics Committees
Activity 2.2	Develop a coherent training package/curriculum for ethics training based on the provisions of the Code of Ethics
	Working and Consulting Sessions between the Ethics Council/ Secretariat and Experts on assessment and drafting of the training package and of the curriculum for ethics training based on the Code of Ethics and for the public officials
Activity 2.3	Finalise the training package and make it available to different institutions for in-service training
	Following a testing of the training package (under outputs 4 and 5), finalise and the training package and make it available to different institutions for in-service training
	Introduce and disseminate the training package to all institutions for internal trainings along with guidelines for trainers.
Activity 2.4	Make available a CD suitable for computer-based training
	Produce and disseminate a training CD suitable for computer-based training by including it in the Final Training Package
Output 3	At least 10 trainers have been trained and are able to deliver ethics training
Activity 3.1	Select 10 to 15 trainers from training institutions of the public administration
	Conduct consulting and information sessions with the relevant public administration training institutions to identify and assess about 10-15 potential Trainers. Initiate a protocol or MOU with respective institutions prior to the selection and training of the trainers.
Activity 3.2	Train the trainers in the application of the training package of the “Code of Ethics”
	Train the Trainers Workshop No.1 on “Application of Code of Ethics”
	Train the Trainers Workshop No.2 on “Application of Code of Ethics”
Activity 3.3	Trainers Initiate the preparation for the delivery of the initial training activities (under outputs 4 and 5)
	Consulting and drafting sessions in support the newly trained trainers in the preparation and design of the initial training, curricula and training methodology and tools prior to actions that are planned to be taken under Output 4 and Output 5.

2. The Training Package

In devising the training package under 2.1 and discussing the implications under 2.3, 3.1-3 the international expert raised a number of issues in an additional document – the Training Strategy [Annex].

2. Delivery of the Original Specification

The international STE developed the training package as follows:

a guide for training facilitators to assist them in organising, delivering and following-up the training event [A GUIDE FOR FACILITATORS OF ETHICS TRAINING], including case study scenarios frameworks, PowerPoint slides and the outline of a two–day training event and training materials;

a guide for organisations hosting the training event, outlining the preparations required for the event and how ethical principles and practices can be consolidated after the event [AN IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE FOR PUBLIC SERVICES ORGANISATIONS]; and

an ethics awareness leaflet for public officials [THE POCKET GUIDE FOR ALL PUBLIC OFFICIALS].

A Turkish STE was recruited to devise and complete 5 case studies under the following requirement:

- each case study needs to be based on real-life examples to ensure.
- each case study should also contain enough information to provide sufficient information that would allow discussion from a number of perspectives – including those of the public official, other persons involved, the official's manager, a member of an Ethics Commission or a member of a ministry inspectorate.
- each case study should contain guidance material so that the facilitator can introduce the case study (such as setting context, purpose of the case study, identifying key parties represented in the case study scenario, the formal procedures being followed and the relevant sections of the code; the ethical dilemmas involved from the various perspectives of the key parties represented, and different interpretations of the causes and consequences of the ethical dilemmas).

This material was not completed in time for the international STE to integrate into the training package. Consequently parts of the presentation material, including the CD-Rom, are currently provisional. The material was also not sufficiently drafted to take account of the public sector context. A new Turkish STE has agreed to under this work within a wider role discussed under 3.3 below. The Turkish STE should have experience in public ethics training, in adult learning, and the use of case study material.

- **RECOMMENDATION: that the international STE is allocated a further 3 FTE (full-time equivalent) days to integrate the re-drafted case studies into the training package.**

3. The Missing Components

The Training Strategy document notes that the specification lacks 3 additional components:

3.1 Number of Trainers

The specification requires 10 to 15 trainers to be trained. Some of those who are trained may not be suitable for leading training. With the expectation that the trainers should be in post long enough to (i) provide training and (ii) train others – at least 18 months – some may be promoted, fall ill, etc. There needs to be enough trained to allow for wastage:

- **RECOMMENDATION: up to 25 trainers are trained and assessed prior to delivery of Outputs 4 and 5.**

3.2 Training of Trainers [ToT]

The trainers will be trained in three areas:

- ✓ How to train in ethics
- ✓ How to train
- ✓ How to train others.

The second and third of these are specialist skills which will involve a specialist organisation experienced in:

- ✓ training trainers
- ✓ training trainers in training adults
- ✓ training trainers in training public officials
- ✓ training trainers in organising training events
- ✓ training trainers in training others.

The international STE proposes 5 to 6 days as the minimum for this; such training will involve at least two specialist trainers and an appropriate learning environment.

- **RECOMMENDATION: a professional ToT organisation – university, research institute, NGO, private sector company - be recruited for the ToT under 3.2. This should be costed at 12 person days plus accommodation, etc.**

In order to integrate the ethics package with the ToT and to ensure that the work of the international STE is fully explained to the ToT provider, the international STE be allocated sufficient days to discuss the training package with the ToT provider. In addition the Turkish STE should take on the role of expert assessor to oversee the effective translation into Turkish of the training package, to oversee the work of the ToT provider and to participate in the initial evaluation of the trainers and the training material – see 3.3.

3.3 Evaluation

Activities 2.2, 2.3 and 3.3 may be contradictory. Given the status of those being trained under Output 4. and 5., and the importance of their commitment to cascade training within their ministries or departments, the training and training package must be 'fit for purpose' prior to these outputs. Accordingly, once the training of trainers - How to train in ethics, How to train; How to train others – has taken place their suitability, and the suitability of the material, must be piloted before Outputs 4 and 5 take place. This will require a ministry to be tested for (i) a training event and (ii) a training of trainers event. Both will be debriefed and evaluated in terms of trainers' perceptions, participants' perceptions, the usability of the material and any technical issues. Only then can Activity 3.3 be completed.

At the same time, and before Outputs 4 and 5 can take place, communication with all Ethics Commissions to report on the plans for the training, for the implementation of cascade training and on the development of a wider ethics programme to extend and sustain the value of the training should take place. Thus the organisation of an Ethical Leadership Conference for Ethics Commissions' members to consult on current ethical issues, the training programme and the future roles and responsibilities of the ministries and Ethics Commission should be held.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **the Turkish STE be allocated sufficient days to (i) complete the case studies, (ii) confirm the suitability of the Turkish translation of the training package, (iii) oversee the work of the ToT provider, (iv) evaluate the pilot training, and (v) work with the international STE to complete the final amendments of the training package: 15 days.**
- **The international STE be allocated 10 days to work with the ToT providers and to finalise the training package.**
- **Funds be made available to have 2 pilot events – a training session and a training of trainers session to evaluate training and training material from the perspectives of the deliverers and the recipients.**
- **Funds be made available – possibly from the funds allocated for the second conference under Activity 1.2 – for a training awareness conference.**

3.3 Training Strategy 5.- 8.

The training package is a product and the training an activity. Developing both into a coherent and sustainable strategy that enhances the ethical dimension of public office will require an additional activity that seeks to agree a planned implementation of:

- A continuing resource of competent trainers with a working knowledge of ethical principles and the legal and regulatory framework for the public service.
- A positive working relationship between the Council of Ethics and the Ministry and Governorate Ethics Commissions, to gain their endorsement and support for the training programme in order to promote attendance and to generate follow-up activities.
- A schedule for the delivery of efficient and effective training cascades to senior managers in ministries and governorates.
- A plan to ensure that the ethical principles promoted in the training are sustained and consolidated.
- A plan to reinforce the effectiveness of training via a functioning ethics system.
- A plan to complete the training cascade throughout all areas and tiers of the public service.

RECOMMENDATION:

- **the Turkish STE and the international STE be allocated 20 days in total to work with the Council of Ethics, ministries and ethics commissions to develop an agreed training strategy addressing the requirements above.**

4. Timelines

	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov
that the international STE is allocated a further 3 FTE (full-time equivalent) days to integrate the re-drafted case studies into the training package.						
up to 25 trainers are trained and assessed prior to delivery of Outputs 4 and 5.						
a professional ToT organisation – university, research institute, NGO, private sector company be recruited for the ToT under 3.2. This should be costed at 12 person days plus accommodation, etc.						
the Turkish STE be allocated sufficient days to (i) complete the case studies, (ii) confirm the suitability of the Turkish translation of the training package, (iii) oversee the work of the ToT provider, (iv) evaluate the pilot training, and (v) work with the international STE to complete the final amendments of the training package: 15 days.						
The international STE be allocated 10 days to work with the ToT providers and to finalise the training package						
Funds be made available to have 2 pilot events – a training session and a training of trainers session to evaluate training and training material from the perspectives of the deliverers and the recipients.						
Funds be made available – possibly from the funds allocated for the second conference under Activity 1.2 – for a training awareness conference.						

the Turkish STE and the international STE be allocated 20 days in total to work with the Council of Ethics, ministries and ethics commissions to develop an agreed training strategy addressing the requirements above.

--	--	--	--	--	--

ANNEX: THE TRAINING STRATEGY

1. Introduction

The process of developing training materials has identified a number of key issues relating to the planned delivery of the programme and related logistics, which need to be addressed by means of a coordinated and coherent training strategy.

2. Issues to be Addressed

The efficient and effective delivery of the Ethical Leadership Programme will need to address the following issues:

- How to create and maintain a pool of competent trainers with a working knowledge of ethical principles and the legal and regulatory framework for the public service.
- How to build a positive working relationship between the CoE and the Ministry and Governorate Ethics Commissions, to gain their endorsement and support for the training programme in order to promote attendance and to generate follow-up activities.
- How to schedule and deliver efficient and effective training cascades to senior managers in ministries and governorates.
- How to ensure that the ethical principles promoted in the training are sustained and consolidated.
- How to reinforce the effectiveness of training via a functioning ethics system.
- How to complete the training cascade throughout all areas and tiers of the public service.

A training strategy, based upon the following coordinated programme of action to address the above issues will need to be agreed, timetabled, incorporated in the project's work schedule and then implemented, encompassing:

3. Trainer-Training

The delivery of the Ethical Leadership Programme to the senior managers of the Turkish public services is a major undertaking that will be heavily dependent upon the creation of a team of competent trainers, proficient in training facilitation and knowledgeable about ethics and public service governance. The activities required to create this trainer team will require:

- The selection and initial screening of a minimum of 25 persons, including CoE personnel, based upon review of CVs for evidence of training experience, knowledge/experience of governance, ethics and public administration.
- The provision of a trainer-training course by a Turkish training organisation. The terms and reference and specification should incorporate, within an integrated programme, 3-4 days of training in ethics, governance and public administration and 5-6 days in training methodologies and practices. The programme should be based upon the 'Facilitation Guide' and incorporate within an "action learning" framework the final content and structure of the 'Ethical Leadership Programme' to be designed and developed by the trainees, facilitators and international consultant.
- The final selection of trainers and briefing on the delivery of the Ethical Leadership Programme.
- The pilot testing of the Ethical Leadership Programme and the selected trainers under the supervision of the trainer-training providers and the international consultant.

4. Relations with Ministry and Governorate Ethics Commissions

The CoE will require the active support from the Ministry and Governorate Ethics Commissions, who will constitute the corporate "Ethics Champions" for the provision of and follow-up to the Ethical Leadership Programme. At present the relationship between the CoE and the Ethics Commissions is unclear and under-developed and the following series of activities are recommended:

- Written communication with all Ethics Commissions to report on the activities of the CoE, plans for the Ethical Leadership Programme, the planned Ethical Leadership Conference (see below) and to confirm of names and office titles of the members of all Ethics Commissions.
- The organisation of an Ethical Leadership Conference for Ethics Commissions' members to consult on current ethical issues, the training programme and to identify additional 'Ethics Champions.'
- Follow-up communication to the Ethics Commissions, at regular intervals, to report on training programme pilots, training programme schedules, emergent issues etc.

5. Training Cascades

The planning and implementation of "cascaded" ethics training, first for public service senior managers and then throughout the all areas and all tier of the Turkish public services will require the following activities.

- The confirmation of a training cascade model for ministries and governorates.
- The collation of information on the organisational structures and staffing numbers to be covered by the Ethical Leadership Programme and the initial scheduling of pilot activities, training events, delivery and logistics management.
- The joint planning with Ministry and Governorate Ethics Commissions to discuss the numbers and locations of senior managers required to participate in the Ethical Leadership Programme, the identification of representatives to undertake liaison activities and the scheduling of pilot training activities and the scheduling of the training cascade.
- The review of pilot training activities, final revision of the Ethical Leadership Programme, preparation of materials and briefing of trainers.
- The implementation of the planned training cascades for ministries and governorates.

6. Sustaining Ethical Principles and Conduct

At this stage of the development of the Ethical Leadership Programme it may seem somewhat premature to be considering how to consolidate the ethical principles and standards of conduct to be promoted by the training event, however it is essential that activities to consolidate the initial ethics are included in the overall programme planning from the inception phase onwards. These activities explicitly designed to sustain the ethics "message" and maintain improvement in ethical standards should include:

- The incorporation in the trainer-training programme of information on informal training techniques and possible methods for following up the Ethical Leadership training event to enable facilitators to provide advice to ministries and governorates on how to consolidate ethical principles and conduct.
- The incorporation in the design of the post training event evaluation of questions, prompts and advice on planned follow-up activities.
- The design, scheduling and implementation of further evaluation methodology = within the project's work schedule to investigate appropriate indicators of ethics awareness and ethical conduct.
- The development of proposals for improvements required to governance mechanisms that will constitute a functioning ethics system. (see below)
- The completion of the training cascade by means of public relations campaigns, electronic media and printed materials. (see below)

7. Building a Functioning Ethics System

The promotion of an “ethical culture”, which represents the overall purpose of the CoE and the aim of the Ethical Leadership Programme will only be fulfilled if there is a parallel development of the “ethics system” i.e. the policies, procedures and practices required to strengthen the control systems that will serve to prevent corruption. The development of an ethics system will require:

- The implementation of a series of “ethics audits” of key mechanisms for regulating ethical standards and conduct within the public administration system to include:
 - Codes of conduct.
 - Staff recruitment and selection.
 - Procurement and contracting.
 - Performance management.
 - Discipline and grievance
 - Staff promotion.
 - Interests and assets declaration.
 - Internal and external audit and inspection.
- The review of ethics audit findings and the formulation of proposals for systemic improvements.

8. Completing the Training Cascade throughout All Areas and Tiers of the Public Service

The “cascading” of the principles and practices of the Ethical Leadership Programme will only be possible with the use of web-based and print-based materials promoted and reinforced by cascade team briefings throughout all areas and at all levels of the public service. The completion of the ethics and training cascade will require:

- The survey and assessment of level of web access and usage in ministries and governorates
- The costing and scheduling of the dissemination of ethics training materials throughout the Turkish public service, web and print—based.
- The review of the Ethical Leadership Programme training materials based upon the evaluation data following the completion of piloting activities and initial training cascades.
- The design and drafting of “stand-alone” web and print-based training materials adapted from the Programme’s training materials.
- The piloting, evaluation and revision of the training materials.
- The completion of electronic and print-based training materials.
- The implementation of a communications and public relations campaign to promote awareness and usage of ethics training materials.
- The provision of team-briefing guidelines for all management tiers.
