



COUNCIL OF EUROPE CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Crime Problems Department
Directorate General I –Legal Affairs
18 October 2004

Programme against Corruption and Organised Crime in South-eastern Europe (PACO)
Implementation of Anti-corruption Plans in South-east Europe (Impact)

Expert Opinion
on the
Improving Success Indicators of the Albanian Anti-corruption Action Plan Matrix
(2004)

By:
Ms. Vera Devine, Belgium

Table of Content

1	INTRODUCTION.....	4
2	MEASURING THE IMPACT AND SUCCESSES OF ANTI-CORRUPTION POLICIES AND STRATEGIES.....	4
2.1	ANALYSIS OF STATISTICS.....	5
2.2	BASELINE PERCEPTION INDICATORS	5
2.3	GENERAL GOVERNANCE INDICATORS	5
2.4	INDICATORS DERIVED FROM AGENCY EVALUATIONS	6
2.5	STATE-OF-AFFAIRS SURVEYS	6
2.6	LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES	7
3	LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE WORK OF ANTI- CORRUPTION COMMISSIONS.....	7
4	IMPLICATIONS FOR THE ALBANIAN ANTI-CORRUPTION REFORM CONTEXT	8
5	THE ANTI-CORRUPTION MATRIX	10
5.1	PRIORITIES AND STRUCTURE.....	11
5.2	CONCEPTS AND ASSUMPTIONS	11
5.3	TERMINOLOGY.....	12
5.4	REMARKS ON SOME OF THE PROPOSED MEASURES	12
5.5	REMARKS ON SOME MEASURES THAT SEEM TO BE MISSING	12
5.6	OTHER.....	13
7	ANNEX.....	15
II.	SPECIFIC ANTI-CORRUPTION MEASURES.....	17
7.2	A. LAW ENFORCEMENT.....	17
A.1.	Reforms in the Public Administration.....	17
A.2.	Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office	18
A.3.	Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity 21	
7.3	B. PREVENTION.....	22
B.1.	Reform in Public Administration	22
B.2.	Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office	24
B.3.	Management and Control of Public Finances and Funds	29
B.4.	Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity 33	
7.4	C. PARTICIPATION AND EDUCATION OF THE PUBLIC	35
C.1.	Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity 35	
C.2.	Civil Society, Media, Transparency, and Public Participation.....	35
III.	GOOD GOVERNANCE.....	41
III.1	Reform in the Public Administration	41
III.2	Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office	41
III.3	Management and Control of Public Finances and Funds	44
III.4	Business Operations and Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integration 46	
III.5	Civil Society, Media, Transparency, and Public Participation.....	46
	ABBREVIATIONS	48

For any additional information please contact:

Council of Europe, Crime Problems Department
Directorate General I – Legal Affairs
67075 Strasbourg CEDEX, France
Tel +33-3-8841-2354
Fax +33-3-8841-3955
e-mail ardita.abdiu@coe.int

The views expressed in this technical paper are solely those of the experts' one and do not necessarily reflect official positions of the Council of Europe

1 INTRODUCTION

In its paper ‘Material on Success Indicators’, the Albanian Anti-Corruption Monitoring Group (ACMG) asked the Council of Europe PACO Impact Project for ‘assistance [...] regarding the methodology in designing and implementing concrete anti-corruption measures and their appropriate, touchable and effective success indicators.’ It also asked for ‘best practices and concrete examples [...] from countries already implementing and/or having implemented successfully such [a] methodology...’

There is no one simple answer to the ACMG’s request. The question of measurement and effective monitoring of the impact of anti-corruption reform is probably one of the most complex and challenging issues in the anti-corruption debate. It is difficult both to identify the baseline level of corruption, and subsequently to measure changes in intensity and occurrence. It is equally difficult to attribute a decrease in either to any single policy measure or reform undertaken.

Some measurement, however, is possible, and after six years of involvement in anti-corruption efforts, it is timely for the Albanian government to ask how the impact and success of its recent reforms could be better assessed. An effective methodology that is best for the Albanian context can only be designed locally, by Albanian experts who, knowing the situation best, can come up with a combination of qualitative and quantitative indicators and a realistic, medium to long-term strategy to monitor data accumulated over several years.

The following technical paper is intended to contribute to this. *Firstly*, as background, it will summarize and source some existing impact and success indicators for anti-corruption programs. *Secondly*, since Anti-corruption Agencies or Commissions are often seen as one of the pillars of such anti-corruption strategies, it will summarize some of the lessons learned and best practices from the work of these agencies. *Thirdly*, it will consider some specific implications this discussion might have for the Albanian context. *Finally*, it will look at the indicators for success as they stand in the current matrix of the ACMG and suggest possible changes, which will be attached in a revised version.

2 MEASURING THE IMPACT AND SUCCESSES OF ANTI-CORRUPTION POLICIES AND STRATEGIES

This section will briefly summarize existing methods to measure impact and success of anti-corruption reform. Generally, there are five categories of indicators:

- a) Indicators derived from *Analysis of Statistics*
- b) *Baseline Perception Indicators*
- c) *General Governance Indicators*

These first three indicators will be mainly quantitative ones.

The final two will be qualitative indicators:

- d) *Agency evaluations (performance reviews and compliance evaluations)*
- e) *State of Affairs surveys*

Additionally, there is a growing body of comparative literature which sets out to assess the impact of donor-funded anti-corruption assistance in

- f) *Lessons Learned and Best Practices Studies*

2.1 ANALYSIS OF STATISTICS

This type of analysis looks at figures such as, for example, aggregate economic data, including estimated economic losses due to corruption; or crime statistics (such as number of criminal offences and number of convictions for corruption etc.). These figures alone will not be explaining the success or failure of anti-corruption policies. They will, however, provide valuable comparative data over time.

2.2 BASELINE PERCEPTION INDICATORS

Probably the two best known perception indices are the Transparency International (TI) Bribe Payers Survey and the TI Corruption Perception Index.

The Bribe Payers Survey is a comprehensive study on bribe-paying in international trade. It looks at key factors influencing corruption, covers unfair business practices, assesses the readiness of the private sector for the new ban on bribing foreign public officials and includes an Industrial Sector Ranking.

The Corruption Perception Index (CPI) ranks countries in terms of the degree to which corruption is perceived by stakeholders to exist among public officials and politicians. CPI's are composite index, drawing on different surveys from a number of independent institutions. The surveys embrace the perceptions of business people, the general public and country analysts.

Although carried out some five years ago (between 1999 and 2000), the Business Environment and Enterprise Performance Survey (BEEPS) conducted by the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) and the World Bank through interviews with representatives from over 4000 companies doing business in 22 transition economies in Central, Eastern and Southeastern Europe, provides an interesting approach in trying to make a correlation between the companies' interactions with the state in relation to areas such as corruption and lobbying, and the companies' overall business performance¹. It thus looks at corruption not from the demand-side, i.e. the public official, but from the supply side.

2.3 GENERAL GOVERNANCE INDICATORS

The World Bank has been at the forefront of work on conceptualizing and establishing indicators of good governance and has over the years refined and tested these indicators in surveys of general levels of governance².

Arguably, there are problems with all of the above indicators. As they are mainly quantitative indicators, they are not easily translated into operational level policy recommendations. The limits of perception indices have also been widely discussed, but even with these caveats, quantitative indicators provide a valuable input into any reform discussion.

The World Bank has started to extend its analytical work from quantitative indicators to include diagnostic toolkits that aim to help practitioners to assess governance performance in a variety of institutional settings. These toolkits provide guidance in

¹ <http://info.worldbank.org/governance/beeps/>

² <http://econ.worldbank.org/docs/918.pdf> - Table 1 in Annex 1 gives an idea of what indicators to use to support an assessment.

assessing central government policy-making institutions in cabinet government, assessing constraints on service delivery, making a civil service institutional assessment, assess commitment to reform, establish diagnostic frameworks for revenue administration, device governance and poverty toolkits, carry out legal and judicial institutional reviews, make public expenditure institutional assessments, and provide models for budgeting³.

2.4 INDICATORS DERIVED FROM AGENCY EVALUATIONS

They can take the form of compliance evaluations or performance evaluations. The former often focus on whether ministries or agencies are complying with legal or structural requirements, for example the compulsory requirement to attend training. So, rather than asking about what effect a certain training had, these evaluations focus on the number of training classes taken, the percentage of employees that underwent training, and which focus the training had. The latter can be carried out in different ways (evaluation interview, self-evaluation, evaluation questionnaire) and provided that they are done on a regular basis, reflect whether and how well basic values (such as ethics values) are embedded among stakeholders, how they perceive misconduct is dealt with within an institution and how values shift over time to reflect changes in policy priorities. Work on measuring the impact and the success of governments' ethics systems has recently started in the OECD's Governance directorate, which builds on the work done by this organization in setting standards in member states' integrity systems, i.e. these countries' preventive aspects of corruption. Work so far has collated examples and case studies from member states and selected non-member states⁴, illustrating different approaches to impact assessments; such report will be published in the forthcoming months.

2.5 STATE-OF-AFFAIRS SURVEYS

The Transparency International Source Book⁵ (a translation of which is available in Albanian⁶) and its guiding questionnaires is a useful tool for describing the function and assessing the performance of a country's 'integrity pillars'.

The relevant chapter of the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime's (UNODC) Anti-Corruption Toolkit⁷ also offers useful ways of looking at monitoring and evaluation of success of anti-corruption reforms. It suggest various methods to measure impact and organize monitoring, such as through Service Delivery Surveys (SDS) or, as they are called elsewhere, social audits. SDS are carried out by involving public sector service users in the communities in areas such as the health sector, the education sector, and the area of licensing and permissions, to get a reliable picture on how services are delivered to end-users. Having collected the findings, users are then involved in discussing remedies and potential solutions for deficient situations, and they are involved in monitoring the implementation of these solutions⁸.

³ <http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/indicators.htm>

⁴ Assessment Strategies and Practices for Integrity and Anti-Corruption Measures in the Public Service. Stuart Gilman, Jeffrey Stout. OECD, GOV/PGC (2004) 24

⁵ <http://www.transparency.org/sourcebook/index.html>

⁶ http://www.transparency.org/sourcebook/other_languages/albanian/sourcebook_alb.html

⁷ http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption_toolkit.html

⁸ For case studies on social audits (for example a regional comparison of the delivery of services in the health and licensing sectors in Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania), see www.ciet.org

In light of Albania's aspirations for European Union membership, the 2002 reports of the Open Society Institute's European Union Accession Monitoring Program (EUMAP) on Corruption and Anti-Corruption Policy and on Judicial Capacity in the then 10 EU candidate countries of Central and Eastern Europe might be a helpful reference document⁹. It provides an overview of the legal and institutional structures and policies through which governments were seeking to combat corruption in light of the requirements for their countries' entry into the EU.

2.6 LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES

There is a growing body of literature dedicated to looking at the effectiveness and lessons learned from the provision of technical assistance in the field of anti-corruption. This development is a result of the fact that such donor-driven assistance has increased substantially over the past 5 years, and that donors increasingly want to understand what effect this assistance had on decreasing corruption in the partner countries.

To this effect, member states commissioned the OECD's Development Assistance Committee (DAC) in 2002 to look at what has been learned about fighting corruption, and what donors have learned from their own experiences.¹⁰ While the report extrapolates some of the emerging lessons learned, it also highlights the difficulties that practitioners face when trying to translate these lessons learned into specific contexts.

Another such effort, which might be more relevant for the Albanian context, is a recently completed study "From the Ground Up - Assessing the Record of Anti-Corruption Assistance in South Eastern Europe" by the Open Society Institute (OSI) in co-operation with the Central European University (CEU), which looked specifically at the effectiveness of anti-corruption assistance in this region¹¹.

3 LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE WORK OF ANTI-CORRUPTION COMMISSIONS

Anti-Corruption Commissions (ACCs) form part of an anti-corruption strategy, and the past five years have seen the formation of many such bodies (which go by different names) in different regions of the world. The discussion on how to measure the impact of anti-corruption reforms has also looked at their role and influence on the overall reform effort.

A consensus has emerged on why Anti-Corruption Commissions (ACC) fail¹², and why anti-corruption reform efforts fail if specifically established bodies fail to deliver. These are conventionally referred to as the 'Seven Deadly Sins'¹³, and they comprise political sins, economic sins, governance sins, legal sins, organizational sins, performance sins and public confidence sins.

⁹ <http://www.eumap.org/reports/2002/corruption/>

¹⁰ <http://www.u4.no/document/showdoc.cfm?id=72>

¹¹ http://www.ceu.hu/cps/res/res_anticorruption.htm

¹² See, for example: 'A good idea gone wrong? Anti-Corruption Commissions in the twenty first century' by Robert Williams and Alan Doig, presented on 1. – 4. September 2004 at the EGPA Annual Conference in Ljubljana, Slovenia http://www.fu.uni-lj.si/egpa2004/html/sg7/Williams_Doig.pdf, see also articles on the same subject under

<http://www.imf.org/External/Pubs/Ft/Fandd/2000/06/Pope.Htm>

<http://www.u4.no/document/aacc/accsuccesses.cfm>

http://www.transparency.org/working_papers/pope/jpope_iaca.html

<http://www.10iacc.org/content.phtml?documents=103&art=178>

¹³ See Williams/Doig and Utstein Group U4 footnote above.

Political sins: a lack of political commitment to the effort is widely held to be a guarantee of failure of any ACC. Lack of commitment can mean a variety of things, such as that an ACC was established in response to outside pressure or to calm public opinion, rather than by genuine political will.

Economic sins: are both at the macro-economic level ('Where economic environments are conducive to endemic corruption, ACCs are likely to be overwhelmed', Williams/Doig 2004) and in a narrower sense concerning the need for adequateness resources for the ACC.

Governance sins: there is a correlation between the non-functioning or deficiencies of the governance institutions generally and the ability of an ACC to perform. i.e., where there are serious deficiencies in the functioning of institutions, an ACC will have difficulties operating.

Legal sins: 'Inadequate, ambiguous, ineffective and unenforceable laws on corruption contribute to ACC failure.' (Williams/Doig 2004)

Organizational sins: include inappropriate structures, but also the requirement for a genuinely local set-up of such agencies. No 'one-model-fits-all' solutions, or 'imported' models of ACCs that are considered to be success stories elsewhere, will succeed.

Performance sins: ACCs fail when they lack realistic action plans, objectives and measurable benchmarks for their own performance and so their work becomes hard to evaluate. Under this category also fall a lack of appropriate staff, and a high turnover of qualified staff.

Public confidence sins: If public trust in ACCs is low, or if ACCs are not well known to the public, the ACC will have difficulties in engaging with the public, and in ensuring the public becomes a source of information. It will thus fail to achieve one of its primary objectives, which is educating the public about corruption and its own efforts to combat it.

4 IMPLICATIONS FOR THE ALBANIAN ANTI-CORRUPTION REFORM CONTEXT

A 2003 EBRD study on 'Anti-Corruption programs in post-communist transition countries and changes in the business environment, 1999 - 2002', notes that: 'There are a number of cases, particularly in south-eastern Europe, where governments have pursued intensive anti-corruption programs in the past several years but administrative corruption and state capture levels as reported [...] in the BEEPS have remained unchanged or even increased. Albania is a strong case in point [...]', since it is 'the only country in which both state capture *and* administrative corruption have increased in the 1999 - 2002 period. Moreover, the frequency of bribes also increased in Albania in this period.'¹⁴

Against this background, and in the light of the lessons in sections 2 and 3 of this paper, the ACMG in Albania might address the following issues:

The Albanian authorities may wish to return to first principles: why has it started anti-corruption reform; what are/were the incentives (donor pressure or wish to adhere to European and international standards?); and is the commitment enduring?

¹⁴ <http://www.ebrd.com/pubs/econ/workingp/85.pdf>

Re-think concepts: There is the impression of a certain level of confusion on some basic concepts. For example, although heaviness of administrative procedures/red tape is providing multiple opportunities for corruption, it is not automatically corruption. And although it is equally true that bad management increases the opportunities for corruption, it must not automatically be corruption; it can be just that: bad management, which is often caused by lack of capacity and skills.

This re-thinking of concepts is important, as going through these issues in the Matrix and re-considering their place in it, the ACMG might find that there are a number of issues that fall under the wider remit of good governance and administrative reform, or social and labor markets reform, not primarily under the fight against corruption. Re-thinking of concepts might also lead to a 'de-cluttering' of what is now a quite heavy Action Plan, and eventually to a prioritizing of activities. The ACMG should, however, continue to play a role in promoting and monitoring the mainstreaming of anti-corruption as a horizontal issue in all of these reforms.

The Albanian authorities may wish to consider the possible consequences of overloading the ACMG. There might be an argument for a 'business plan' of the group, with realistic work schedules, performance indicators and strategic planning where its work should head in the medium to long-term, and how this could be achieved.

Evidence: the need for stronger evidence of the real situation on the ground, particularly in those sectors that have been identified as the most corrupt, has been stressed repeatedly, by the ACMG itself, but also, for example, in the GRECO recommendations to Albania. Serious efforts should be undertaken to get such evidence through public sector service delivery audits. There are a number of arguments for such audits at this point in time: they provide a detailed, realistic and nation-wide picture of the system leakages in key sectors and, in co-operation with both the public and the government, propose remedies for the rectification of problems; the government will undertake – and will be seen to undertake – action to address key problems. Audits also establish clear indicators for success to be measured over time. Local staff will be trained in public sector service audit techniques – skills that can then be used in future efforts. Funding would need to be raised for such audits.

Measuring impact and assessing success requires institutionalized evaluation skills. It should now become one of the priorities for the ACMG to appropriately address this need and to start to develop and sustain these skills in-house. The ACMG could then, over time, consolidate its role as a genuine monitoring body, which has the authority, expertise and capacity to analyze findings, and to issue recommendations. A specific technical assistance proposal should be elaborated to address this need, and donors should be approached for support in this area.

The ACMG has understood the need for clear success indicators and workable methodologies for the monitoring of the success of its anti-corruption reform efforts. There are, however, no ready-made solutions. A combination of internationally developed indicators and methodologies, adapted by local experts to reflect the specific Albanian context on a case-by-case basis, will need to be agreed among stakeholders.

Impact assessment and monitoring of success should be considered up-stream, when designing reforms. As a matter of routine, impact assessment and monitoring should also be realistically priced (through consideration of which institution/agency will be in charge of monitoring, whether it can realistically achieve this with existing resources and capacities, which areas would require specialist surveys and at what cost etc.)

In this context falls the need for training, which the ACMG has already identified in the Matrix, and which is partly being addressed by some donors. Training should address a few issues in addition to the development of evaluation, assessment and monitoring skills. It should, for example, be dealing with issues such as communications strategies and project design. This will help, for example, to clarify the current conceptual conflation of 'measures'/'outputs' and 'success indicators'/objectives in the Matrix. It would also help to successfully design activities that are currently highlighted in the Matrix as not having a broad appeal (f.e. business roundtables), which might be an indicator that it does not really address the needs of the target group.

Measuring impact and success is – much like the entire anti-corruption effort – a medium- to long-term undertaking. Impact in many areas will be visible only when certain data and developments are registered and analyzed over several years. This means that assessments have to be replicated over time and findings need to be compared with each other in order to be meaningful. It might turn out that not all of the collected data was relevant for a given exercise, or that not every methodological approach yielded useful results, and that over time, there will need to be refining or modification. However, measurement has to start at some point in order to allow any comparative basis at all.

Consider the ACMG's value-added and reflect it in the group's activities: while the overall responsibility for many reforms is with the line ministries, there is a unique role to play for the ACMG as the interface between the government and administration on the one hand, and, on the other hand, the public and in particular the business community – the 'supply'-side of bribes. Although business has a permanent seat in the ACMG, there currently seems to be an imbalance as regards to activities specifically targeted at this group.

Gauge opportunities: Albanian authorities are still working on the on-going reform of its legislation related to political party financing, which contains provisions on the financing of electoral campaigns. The up-coming June 2005 elections provide a unique opportunity to identify further the compliance of international standards with this legislation. The ACMG should look to encourage civil society to take a lead in monitoring the application and enforcement of this law in this campaign¹⁵.

5 THE ANTI-CORRUPTION MATRIX

Suggestions for possible success indicators (and a few other suggested changes) have been introduced into the Matrix itself in track change mode.

Often, these suggested 'success indicators' will only be indicators of how the implementation of certain 'measures' could be quantified. This could, however, be a starting point to arrive at a critical mass of data that can be compared, and which, over time, could be modified and refined.

These are suggestions on what such indicators might be – there is no recipe for doing this, and each reform area and reform measure would need to be individually discussed among local stakeholders, and implications such as capacity and resources would need to be factored in before agreeing on a certain set of indicators.

¹⁵ A specific methodology has been developed by the Open Society Institute's Justice Initiative, which has been tested in various eastern European countries as well as in non-European countries.

A few specific remarks on the Matrix:

5.1 PRIORITIES AND STRUCTURE

The Matrix has seen quite a few changes in structure and presentation over the past years. It is an important policy document. As such, it needs to reflect not only the rationale and the scope of reform measures. It should also reflect them in a way that gives a clear indication (to stakeholders and the public) of the priorities. With well over 100 measures in the existing Matrix, it is difficult to sense of where these priorities are, nor on which of these reforms the ACMG as a body with limited funding and limited human resources would focus.

Areas which should be reviewed in a prioritizing exercise have been colored orange in the text. There is, for example, the issue of consumer protection. Other examples are the Law on Food or the Law on Guns. Again, it is clear that the Matrix is an attempt to present reform in a comprehensive way. But other considerations must prevail: there are only so much resources available to carry out these reforms, and while the line ministries might prioritize differently, there would seem to be a question as to how many of these reforms the ACMG can effectively and efficiently monitor, advise and report on, without losing focus and being able to make a difference. There might be good reasons why consumer protection, the Law on Food and the Law on Guns are included in this Action Plan (which does not necessarily become clear without the context), but there are sure to be areas that can be de-prioritized. It is not a matter of eliminating these reforms from the Action Plan, but there must be a clear understanding of the ACMG of what has priority in its work, to put to a maximum use its available human and budgetary resources and to fulfill its unique mandate as an interface between the government and the public.

There is also an argument for bundling all sub-measures under a certain measure or reform into one heading/column, and thus to give a concise indication of every step that is necessary to carry out a certain reform. This concerns particularly the last section, which can create the impression of redundancy, as the measures here refer back to ones listed earlier.

5.2 CONCEPTS AND ASSUMPTIONS

The 'Material on Success Indicators' already touched upon the question of Good Governance and the place of these reforms in the overall Anti-corruption agenda (and consequently, in the Matrix), which probably concern primarily areas III/1 (Reforms in the Public Administration) and III/3 (Management and Control of Public Finances and Funds). There is indeed an argument for re-thinking the way in which these areas are dealt with. While it seems appropriate to include any measures that deal with building integrity systems and the strengthening of ethical capacities, it should be clarified when measures address corruption, and when they in fact concern the general improvement of capacities and skills in the civil service. As said above, bad management caused by lack of capacity and skills is not automatically corruption, although bad management does contribute to an enabling environment for corruption.

The same assumptions need to be re-visited for other areas. For example, one of the measures to be undertaken is the "Complete revision of the legal framework for the system of support and social assistance." This is certainly an important issue for Albania in terms of allocation of scarce state budgetary resources and in fighting and preventing abuses of the system. Yet, one could ask whether it is really primarily a measure necessitated by corruption, or whether the system needs to be reformed because it is

obsolete, poorly managed and therefore, *inter alia*, open to abuse? There will be cases of corruption in this area, but at first glance, it does not seem to be the primary problem.

5.3 TERMINOLOGY

There is an argument for reviewing the terminology used. Again, this is not a mere formality. Applying unambiguous language will eventually help to make the Matrix a clearer policy document that stakeholders feel more confident to working with. For example, 'Measures' are used in the same way as 'output'. This is not a problem, as it is quite obvious what is meant. But the 'success indicators' appears to actually include, in many cases, the overall objective of a certain reform package. However, 'objectives' and indicators of success in achieving them are quite different issues.¹⁶

The 'risks' column is fairly straightforward, yet, sometimes, risks seem to have been confused with the reasons or rationale for which reforms are being undertaken.

5.4 REMARKS ON SOME OF THE PROPOSED MEASURES

A note of caution on public awareness campaigns, which feature mainly under 'C' in the Matrix. Experience, in particular in the countries of Central, Eastern and South-eastern Europe (Bulgaria is a prominent example) has shown that when such campaigns are not linked to specific issues, they can fail to achieve their intended goal. They can create confusion in the public as to why a campaign is being undertaken at a certain point in time, and they can create expectations in the public, which, when not met, have the contrary effect (increase in public cynicism) to the one intended. The advice would be not to conduct such campaigns isolated from specific reforms or policy measures undertaken, and to use them in support of achieving these reforms. Campaigns should also always be accompanied by specific guidance to the public on how to act/react in certain situations and clearly indicate channels for complaints. There is a wealth of literature on lessons learned in anti-corruption awareness campaigns, which it would be advisable to look into to get a clearer idea of what to do and what not to do, and how to do it.

There should be some caution in opening new offices for different purposes. There are budgetary considerations. But there should also be awareness of the fact that before resolving any problems, new offices create new ones. There are the facilities to be paid, there are new staff on the payroll, this staff needs to be monitored, trained etc. There should be a realistic assessment of whether this is a good idea in all of the proposed measures. The answer to a non-functioning institution is not to open a new institution in addition to already existing ones.

5.5 REMARKS ON SOME MEASURES THAT SEEM TO BE MISSING

Procurement appears to be a severely underrepresented area of activity. Yet, procurement is an area that lends itself in an ideal way to joint initiatives with civil society (which is one of the core mandates of the ACMG), and in particular with the business sector. In fact, procurement is one of the best entry points to engage with business, as it is in their vital interest that public procurement contracts are awarded in a transparent and fair way. Business is also the best source of inside information into the actual practices in this field. For example, procurement guidelines could be drafted

¹⁶ Although displaying the same problem with regard to the 'success indicators', the 2002 – 2003 matrix was actually more comprehensible in that it indicated the overarching objective (or 'outcome') of a reform, followed by 'measures' (or 'outputs') to be undertaken to achieve these objectives.

involving the business sector, monitoring of compliance with these guidelines could be initiated, a public tender database/website could be installed, etc. (there are examples aplenty - from local government procurement in the Russian regions to the Chilean experience.) For comments on the existing procurement activity see the Matrix.

Internal corruption in the police/customs: Corruption and ethics issues in the police and customs services are touched upon in a few measures. There is, however, no clear indication of a comprehensive measure being undertaken to target this issue explicitly. (Maybe there is too little context in the matrix for an outsider). Indicators would also be needed. The following could be guiding questions: What are the structures in place to investigate internal corruption? What are the resources available to investigate corruption within the police/customs? How visible are the investigators that deal with these matters (higher visibility will result in greater deterrence)? Within a given reporting period, how many hearings have taken place, how many verbal and how many written warnings have been issued? How many final warnings have been issued and how many police/customs officers have been dismissed as a result of their involvement in corruption? Are the names of those found guilty circulated inside the police/customs, and are their names being published (as a deterrent)?

5.6 OTHER

Examples of crime statistics, including bribery, extortion, evasion of tax and customs excise, abuse of power and other, compared over time, can be found at the Transnational Crime and Corruption Center of Georgia under <http://www.traccc.cdn.ge/statistics/>



7.1.1.1.1.1.1
COUNCIL OF MINISTERS
ANTI-CORRUPTION UNIT

“ACTION PLAN ON PREVENTION AND FIGHT AGAINST CORRUPTION 2003-2004”

TABLE OF CONTENT

1	INTRODUCTION.....	4
2	MEASURING THE IMPACT AND SUCCESSES OF ANTI-CORRUPTION POLICIES AND STRATEGIES.....	4
	2.1 ANALYSIS OF STATISTICS.....	5
	2.2 BASELINE PERCEPTION INDICATORS.....	5
	2.3 GENERAL GOVERNANCE INDICATORS.....	5
	2.4 INDICATORS DERIVED FROM AGENCY EVALUATIONS.....	6
	2.5 STATE-OF-AFFAIRS SURVEYS.....	6
	2.6 LESSONS LEARNED AND BEST PRACTICES.....	7
3	LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE WORK OF ANTI-CORRUPTION COMMISSIONS.....	7
4	IMPLICATIONS FOR THE ALBANIAN ANTI-CORRUPTION REFORM CONTEXT.....	8
5	THE ANTI-CORRUPTION MATRIX.....	10
	5.1 PRIORITIES AND STRUCTURE.....	11
	5.2 CONCEPTS AND ASSUMPTIONS.....	11
	5.3 TERMINOLOGY.....	12
	5.4 REMARKS ON SOME OF THE PROPOSED MEASURES.....	12
	5.5 REMARKS ON SOME MEASURES THAT SEEM TO BE MISSING.....	12
	5.6 OTHER.....	13
7	ANNEX.....	15
II.	SPECIFIC ANTI-CORRUPTION MEASURES.....	18
7.2	A. LAW ENFORCEMENT.....	18
	A.1. Reforms in the Public Administration.....	18
	A.2. Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office.....	19
	A.3. Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity.....	22
7.3	B. PREVENTION.....	23
	B.1. Reform in Public Administration.....	23
	B.2. Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office.....	25
	B.3. Management and Control of Public Finances and Funds.....	30
	B.4. Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity.....	34
7.4	C. PARTICIPATION AND EDUCATION OF THE PUBLIC.....	36

C.1.	Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity	36
C.2.	Civil Society, Media, Transparency, and Public Participation	36
III.	GOOD GOVERNANCE	42
III.1	Reform in the Public Administration	42
III.2	Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office	42
III.3	Management and Control of Public Finances and Funds	45
III.4	Business Operations and Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integration	47
III.5	Civil Society, Media, Transparency, and Public Participation	47
	ABBREVIATIONS	49

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
II. SPECIFIC ANTI-CORRUPTION MEASURES					
7.2 A. LAW ENFORCEMENT					
A.1. Reforms in the Public Administration					
A.1.1	Revision of the legislation on Conflict of interests perspective <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Analysing and identifying existing law provisions on conflict of interests ▪ Completion of the legal framework by drafting new provisions on conflict of interests ▪ Design communication strategy, compulsory training module, assessment tool; incorporate relevant topics into overall performance review 	CoM MoJ Civil Society Trade Unions	During 2003-2004	Lack of coordination in time among the institutions	Communication strategy on new provisions will by year x have reached all constituents covered by the new law; the media; business and civil society; By year x, compulsory training on Col Law's provisions will have reached all stakeholders Awareness of provisions in the law will be assessed on an x-annual basis through relevant questions in the baseline performance assessment of civil servants, (Assessment should contain questions regarding familiarity of stakeholders with the provisions as well as questions on reporting of misconduct etc.) Assessment in year x through surveys among civil society, trade unions, business community on perceived changes in behaviour of civil servants in relevant areas (f.e. public procurement).
; A.1.2.	Revision of the law "On Drugs".	MoH	November 2003	Securing the needed assistance	For possible indicators, including statistics describing the gains and losses of corruption for the health system see, for example the methods used by the Counter Fraud Service of the British NHS under http://www.cfsms.nhs.uk/siraccess/cfs/statistics.html
A.1.3	Drafting of a new set of laws for some amendments in the Criminal Code regarding criminal cases in the health sector: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ in the field of medicaments 	MoH	December 2003	None	Number of processed criminal cases ✓ -This could be considered to become part of a wider 'social audit' on the situation in the health service, involving 'clients' in the

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
A.1.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ in the field of health services 				<p>process. The social audit would be designed in such a way as to incorporate newly introduced changes in the legislation, and it would come up with a set of recommendations for improvement, and a timeline for checking the implementation of these improvements. Later, a repeat audit would measure success. [Problem: it requires funding; Advantage: audits normally train a substantial number of local people in auditing and evaluation techniques, so there is a skill-transfer and substantially decreased costs for a repeat audit.]</p>
A.1.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A complete revision of the legal framework for the system of support and social assistance ▪ Revision of law on "Social Insurance" ▪ Design an outreach/communication strategy to explain to clients why this measure is being undertaken (i.e. scarce resources of the state being further depleted by abuse of the system through people/families that are not entitled to benefits; reviewing the way in which social assistance is being awarded will also lead to better quality of service delivery to those who legitimately benefit from the system, as it will diminish the caseload and give more time for social workers to deal with existing cases, payment arrears will be avoided etc., claims processed more quickly etc.) ▪ Design compulsory training module for civil servants in the respective administrations, to ensure that new provisions are being implemented in practice 	MoLSA and involved institutions	January 2004	Lack of coordination of the work among relevant institutions	<p>Improvement of the social assistance and support system approximating with the international standards measured through: 'Before ' and 'after' statistics (i.e., how many people benefited from social assistance before and after the introduction of the package) Statistics on turnover time for claims 'before' and 'after'. Client surveys on perceptions in improvement of quality (timeliness of claims processed, decrease in payment arrears etc.). [This is also a classical 'social audit' topic, see above.]</p>
A.2.	Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office				
A.2.1.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Improvement and completion of the criminal provisions related to corruption, including the criminal responsibility for the foreign officials and the criminal, civil and administrative responsibility of the legal persons 	MoJ	May 2004 December 2003	None	Prevention of the corruptive criminal activities in the economic and financial field and effective measures against the persons responsible, through 'before' and 'after' statistics on cases tried and private sector

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Improvement and completion of the criminal provisions in the economic and financial field 				surveys on awareness of 'supply side' of new legal provisions (potentially carried out through business associations that are part of the ACMG)
A.2.2.	Revision of the criminal legislation related to issues of organized crime	MoJ	December 2003 May 2004	None	Prevention of the criminal activities performed by organized crime groups and effective measures against the responsible persons, assessed through crime statistics 'before' and 'after'.
A.2.3.	Revision and improvement of the provisions of criminal legislation in accordance with the ratified international instruments	MoJ	During 2003 and ongoing	Delays in approval of amendments by the parliament	International monitoring exercises positively evaluate Albania's accordance with international standards in next review exercises..
A.2.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Upgrading the organization process and increase of effectiveness in the functioning of the judicial system ▪ Improvement of the legislation relating to the organization of the judicial system, the professional judicial carrier and the judges' status ▪ Upgrading the judges' profession ethical standards ▪ Improvement on professional functioning of the judicial inspection system ▪ Establishment of a transparent system for the judicial promotion and discipline, including the prosecution of the judges involved in corruption ▪ Training/Communication strategy for judiciary explaining new provisions ▪ - Independent judges and prosecutors and increase of public confidence into the judiciary in relation to the effective penalization of corruption measured through Public Communication strategy to communicate reforms to public. 	HcoJ MoJ MoF	December 2003 June 2004 March 2004	Delays in drafting and the necessary framework Lack of funds Delays for the approval of the legislation by the parliament	Quantitatively: number of judges and prosecutors tried and qualitatively: through stakeholder surveys on perceived improvement of situation. In year X, Survey among legal profession about awareness of legal provisions, follow-up on survey results.
A.2.5.	Completion of the legal framework and the implementation of necessary measures for the effective beginning of the activity of	MoJ MoPO	September 2003 and December 2003 and	Insufficient internal and external technical assistance and	- Effective function of the serious crime courts system, including here the corruption

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	Serious Crimes Court	PG HCoJ	ongoing	financial resources	cases - Specialized and professional investigation and prosecution of cases of the organized and serious crimes.
A.2.6.	Effective functioning of the Serious Crimes Court, institutionalization of the mechanisms in facilitating the working conditions, selection, training, treatment and special protection of the judges, prosecutors and judicial police officers of these structures. If despite objections (as named under 'risks') it is considered a good idea, then creating public support/demand for such an institution should be envisioned through outreach/communication campaign explaining the needs and benefits of such an institution.	MoJ HCoJ PG MoPO	During 2003 and on going	Objection to the idea of creating judicial institutions for serious crimes	Number of cases judged annually compared with the number of cases judged in the previous years.√ Assessment of the effectiveness of the measures listed on the left: Stakeholder review about clarity, transparency and non-arbitrariness of selection criteria, how many people have been trained under this scheme and what is their feedback on the usefulness of the scheme, how do stakeholders view of the protection scheme; follow-up on results of these assessments for further improvement.
A.2.7.	Further improvement of the existing legislation related to specific forms and possibilities of using specific investigative techniques, including the ones that has to do with corruption There should be an objective setting here: how many personnel do you estimate is needed to adequately assess these problems: quantify and explain rationale. Then establishment of success indicators will be easier, too.	MoJ MoPO PG	December 2003 May 2004	None	- Higher number of specialized Prosecutors, Judges, and Judicial Police Officers√ By year x, y number of staff will have been trained for these special functions.
A.2.8.	Establishment of the legal framework and the relevant structures for the protection of witnesses, collaborators of justice and the crime victims - Setting up respective structures to implement the law - Training of relevant police and prosecution staff on new provisions; specific communications training on techniques of how to convince potential witnesses to come forward - Public communications campaign on introduction and	MoJ HCoJ PG MoF MoPO	December 2003 and on going	Delays in drafting and approval of the legal framework Insufficient technical assistance and internal and external financial resources	- Increase of the number of important witnesses and collaborators of justice in the crime proceedings, including cases of corruption√ - In year x, survey of stakeholders on experience with the scheme and avenues for potential improvement.

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
A.2.9.	<p>parameters of the scheme</p> <p>Preparation of the draft-law and the secondary legislation "On guns"</p> <p>Simplification of the procedures in giving the guns' licenses, permissions and police authorizations. Definition of deadlines in guns' examination, granting and keeping</p>	MoPO	April 2004	Delays in the evaluation and approval process by the Albanian parliament.	(Not entirely clear what the AC angle of this reform is)
A.3. Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity					
A.3.1.	<p>Placing foreign financing in a contemporary legal basis through Enactment of the law "On Foreign Financing"</p>	MoE	December 2003	Lack of coordination among the of MoE and MoF in this field	(Too little background information to make the link to AC.)
A.3.2.	<p>Elimination of market deformation through definition of fair privatisation rules and harmonization of the legal framework on privatisation of the strategic sectors with the one that regulates the sector of markets and policies.</p> <p>Set up multi-stakeholder monitoring group (involving civil society groups) to monitor privatisation process operating under new legal framework with clearly defined guidelines, which cover:</p> <p>Examining the efficiency and the quality of the Privatisation, documentation and decision-making process; Compliance of bidding, evaluation and award process with the government policies; legislative mechanisms and legal agreements; conformity of final contract with bidding documents; clarity and transparency of selection criteria; validity of change orders and other contract modifications during execution; verification of privatisation execution and its conformity with contractual requirements assessment of the transaction price</p>	MoE	December 2003 June 2004	None	Bulgaria example of monitoring privatisation could help – (see http://www.10iacc.org/content.phtml?documents=118&art=87).
A.3.3.	<p>- Increase and consolidation of fair competition, which contributes to the business development and effective consumers' protection from abusive provisions through:</p> <p>Implementation of the law "On Protection of Competition"</p> <p>Implementation of the law "On Consumers' Protection"</p> <p>- Effective implementation of the international standards related to</p>	MoE MoE	December 2003 December 2003	None	What is the AC angle?

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	the consumer's guarantee for life, health, wealth and their rights				
7.3 B.	PREVENTION				
B.1.	Reform in Public Administration				
B.1.1.	Extension of the scope of law on "Status of the Civil Servant" to other categories of public administration employees	DPA and institutions involved in the process	June 2004	Delays in adopting the law amendments	Review relevance for this exercise? Number of the institutions included in the scope of the implementation of the law
B.1.2.	Enhancing the capacities of the Anti Corruption Unit and ACMG Monitoring Board Better specify what the needs would be: f.e. training on methods and techniques for evaluation and impact assessment and monitoring; targeted communications training	ACMG TIPA	On going	Lack of training projects	Number of training activities, which have been carried out ✓ according to the identified needs; activities which have been undertaken as a result of these training activities (i.e. surveys designed and implemented by the ACMG, communication campaigns on x subjects, increase of awareness of public about ACMG verified through surveys among the public)
B.1.3.	Enhancing the capacities in the public administration and increasing the professional level of the civil employees through training	DPA and TIPA	During 2003 and on going	Low participation in the training process?	- Number of the trained people - Implementation of the training plans
B.1.4.	Revision of the official immunity system and of rules in granting it and taking it away in relation to the corruptive cases Adoption of the new provisions by the parliament	CoM	May 2004	Lack of coordinating the activities of responsible structures	- Completion of a study or an analytic report on official immunity, results and recommendations will be taken forward and their implementation monitored over time, then reassessed.
B.1.5.	Implementation of the law no. 9049, date 10.04.2003 "On declaration and control of assets, financial obligations of the elected officials and some public employees" Establishment of an effective system on declaration of assets Reports published on the basis of the results from collected declarations	HIDCA All institutions	During 2004 and on going	Delays in establishing relevant structures and bringing them into operation Resistance of the interest groups for the implementation of the law.	Quantitatively: Reduction of the number of violations over x years, number of the fines - Number of the cases reported to the General Prosecution Office and the percentage of cases with court convictions. Qualitatively through assesment of framework (covering f.e. questions such as

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
					how well are regulations enforced, is there counselling on problems, is deterrence for non-compliance efficient enough). Harmonization of the number of the violations with the fines
B.1.6.	Adoption of the Council of Minister Decision "On mode of licensing and functioning of the Private Employment Agencies"". Facilitation of the relevant administrative procedures and taking sanctions for the abusive cases by the licensed entities Communication strategy on new provisions through business sector members of ACMG.	MoLSA	September 2003	Delays in adoption	Assessment of real situation through social audit.
B.1.7.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Identification of the measures for the application of a computerized information system for pensions and for monitoring the contributions. ▪ Improvement of services through extension of the network of local social insurance agencies. ▪ Establishment and operation of the reception facilities. ▪ Cooperation with the local government bodies on collection of information about entities operating under their jurisdiction. ▪ Increased quality of the service in the allocation of benefits from the social insurance system ▪ Updating, two times a year, of the integrated poverty map on the basis of prefecture, in accordance with the social and economic needs. ▪ Full computerization of the social assistance and support system ▪ Training of relevant personnel. ▪ Upgrading the knowledge of citizens on the rights they have in the field of social services. 	MoLSA	<p>On going</p> <p>On going</p> <p>December 2003</p> <p>December 2003</p> <p>On going</p> <p>On going</p> <p>On going</p>	<p>Excessive decentralization and lack of infrastructure for exchange of information</p> <p>Insufficient funds</p>	<p>What is precisely the AC angle here?</p> <p>Improvement in the accuracy and quality of the offered services assessed through stakeholder survey.</p> <p>Reduction of the evasion in the contributions and of the risks for abuses with social insurance funds, removal from the scheme of families, which benefit assistance unjustly.</p> <p>Assessed through 'before' and 'after' statistics of beneficiaries.</p> <p>Lower turnover time of claims of entitled claimants</p>

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.1.8.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Preparation of the respective study <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ - Preparation of the strategy and action plan 	MoH	May 2004	Assistance required	See above on social audit for health sector
B.1.9.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Implementation of the law "On hospital service" <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Preparation of the secondary legislation package for the implementation of the law (Restructuration of the hospital service) 	MoH	2004 - 2004	Assistance required in the preparation of the secondary legislation	Relation to anti-corruption is not entirely clear.
B.1.10.	Establishment of a control mechanism over the registry offices	MoLGD	January 2004	None	<p><u>(What exactly is the AC relevance here? Is this a priority? If funds for an audit are available, should they then not go to audits in those areas that have been identified as the most corrupt, i.e., health, police, judiciary, customs, tax administration?)</u></p> <p>The audit will review the professionalism of staff level and provide a state of affairs in the sector; finally, it will issue recommendations as to standardization of the operating of the service in registry offices, which will be followed up regularly..</p>
B.2.	Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office				
B.2.1.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The use of the special hotlines to report on corruption by the public <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Introducing a telephone number in the Public Relations Department for all cases when citizens and the drivers identify cases of abuses by the road police inspection agents. 	All institutions MoPO	Ongoing September 2003	None None	<p>The number of cases reported during specific periods, their relation to the number of disciplinary proceedings and criminal accusations coming from the public, time of processing of these</p> <p>Increasing the participation level of the public in reporting the abusive cases of this phenomena committed by police employees.</p> <p>Decrease in number of complaints (as follow-up on many cases will have had a deterrent effect on the police to engage in improper/abusive practices), measured over x period of time.</p>
B.2.2.	Assistance, coordination, and control of the prosecution offices at the district courts and courts of appeal by the Organized Crime	PG	On going	None	- Punishment of the criminal offenders <u>with</u> elements of corruption on the basis of the law

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.2.3.	<p>Department in carrying out full and objective investigations in criminal proceedings related to corruption offences.</p> <p>Organization of continuous training for judges, prosecutors, judicial police officers, and the police in investigating and trying the criminal offences in the field of corruption (particularly, typologies and international dimension)</p>	HCoJ SM PG MoJ MoPO	On going	None	<p>- Reduction of cases with delays or failures in criminal proceedings, including the ones on corruption criminal offences over x amount of time.</p> <p>Quantitative: by x, y number of judges, prosecutors, judicial police officers will have been trained; qualitative assessments of these trainings through exit interviews from trainees. Response to be fed back into the training cycle.</p> <p>The level of comparison with the international dimension</p>
B.2.4.	<p>These are steps to start measuring impact and success and should be under the respective column! Information of ACMG Board about problems emerging from the investigation and trial of criminal offences in the field of corruption, regarding:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Legal violations identified in allowing or favouring corruption. ▪ The need for improvement of the legal and sub-legal acts, which would help to reduce the opportunities stimulating corruption. ▪ Proposals for structural improvements of the public institutions with the aim of increasing the effectiveness of the fight against corruption. ▪ The tendencies of the corruptive criminal acts and the level of their extent. 	PG ACMG	March 2004 and on going	None	<p>Decrease of number of criminal offences in the field of corruption through: <i>Information of ACMG Board about problems emerging from the investigation and trial of criminal offences in the field of corruption, regarding:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ <i>Legal violations identified in allowing or favouring corruption.</i> ▪ <i>The need for improvement of the legal and sub-legal acts, which would help to reduce the opportunities stimulating corruption.</i> ▪ <i>Proposals for structural improvements of the public institutions with the aim of increasing the effectiveness of the fight against corruption.</i> <p><i>The tendencies of the corruptive criminal acts and the level of their extent.</i> <i>Follow-up with these recommendations to improve existing legal framework.</i></p>

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.2.5.	Cooperation with the State Information Service on the collection and processing of information about corruptive affairs with the aim of initiating criminal proceedings	PG SIS	On going	Loopholes and delays in the coordination for programming and realization of the relevant activities among the institutions	Number of reported/proceeded/tried cases with corruptive elements that are result of the coordination✓
B.2.6.	Drafting the legislation on a system for the professional evaluation of the judges - Adjustment of the evaluation system to the best contemporary standards	HCoJ MoJ	May 2004	Delays in the coordination of the activities foreseen by the HCoJ, MoJ and international institutions Funding required	- Objective evaluation of the professional and ethical level of judges, without encroaching upon their independence and impartiality through regular performance reviews.
B.2.7.	<u>Enhance the confidence of public about the services and access into the courts' information through</u> ▪ Establishment of a system for improving the information access of the public to the courts ▪ Making available for the public the judicial unified decisions of the court	MoJ OAJB SC HCoJ	May 2004 September 2003 and on going	Insufficient and/or delayed technical and financial assistance Delays in finishing the donors' projects	- Electronic and other ways of access, beside the one of Official Gazette, about the unified decisions of the Supreme Court. User survey on perceived improvement of the system (need to identify the target group that has currently biggest demand for such information).
B.2.8.	Taking preventing measures against the organized crime and corruption in the regional level	MoPO PG MoJ <i>Intl. Organizations</i>	On going	Technical barriers and lack of collaboration efforts by other countries.	- Increase of the number of offenders that are tried ✓ - Better treatment and in the right time of the cases that affect other countries✓ - Increase of the number of repatriations and deportations✓ - Effective results in the legal proceedings against the persons involved in international crimes✓
B.2.9.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Amendments in the law no. 8749 "On Internal Audit Service" in the Ministry of Public Order. ▪ The adoption of the normative act "On the Secret Fund of the Internal Audit Service". ▪ Improvement of the structure of the Internal Audit Service in accordance with the needs of work. ▪ Increase and strengthening of the internal audit structure 	MoPO MoPO MoPO MoPOP	December 2003 December 2003 November 2003 December 2003	Delay in adoptions of the amendments by the parliament None Delays in the approval of the	- Compliance with work indicators assessed through regular evaluations.

Nr.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Strengthening the activity of IAS to a higher level to fight corruption in the police ranks. - New techniques and financial means for the service - Increase of the discovering power of the service and of the legal documentation - Increase of the work indicators and the criminal proceedings. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Reduction of the audit deadlines and higher audit effectiveness, which will lead to the minimization of the abuses cases and cases on embezzlement of public funds, which will rise in a higher professional level the management and the administration. 			structure by the CM.	
B.2.10	<p>Organization of controls with IAS for the identification of the corruption cases of police employees with the drivers to minimize the passive corruption phenomenon and increase of the police employee's reputation towards the public.</p>	MoPO	On going	None	[Difficult to say whether the involvement of the IAS is the best way to address this issue. What about internal investigators in the police, with high-visibility, able to enforce a system of staged reprimands, non-compliance will result in publicized dismissal?]
B.2.11.	<p>Amendments in law No. 8770 date 19.04.2001 "On service of physical protection and security "</p> <p>Improvement of the criteria and procedures by making them more transparent and simplified in approving and exercising the activity of protection and physical security by unifying them with the commercial company licenses.</p>	MoPO	March 2004	Delays in adoption of the amendments by the Parliament	What is the link to corruption, and is this a priority?
B.2.12.	<p>Adoption of the secondary legislation on procedures and documentation in acquiring, re-acquiring and giving up the Albanian citizenship</p> <p>Adoption of the secondary legislation on procedures and documentation for providing the Albanian citizens with international passport.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilitation of the procedures for the citizens - Reduction of the current documentation required for this purpose 	MoPO Other interested institutions MoPO	November 2003 November 2003	Delays in the approval of the instruction by relevant ministers Delays in the approval of the instruction by relevant ministers	What is the link to corruption, and is this a priority? 'Before' and 'after' statistic (on claims processed so far, and after the introduction of new rules, on processing time for each claim)

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilitation of application procedures - Clear deadlines for every procedure Communication strategy on these new rules to clients/service users.				
B.2.13.	Establishment of a Task Force for the investigation of criminal acts in the field of organized crime. Training of specialists and increase of the level of investigation regarding important cases.	PG MoPO	September 2003	Drafting of the legal framework Funding required	Could this not be merged with a related measure? Is the establishment of another Task Force really the best idea, all the more that additional funding is required that could be put to use elsewhere?
B.2.14.	Drafting and signing of an agreement with the banks on the improvement of the procedures for the collection of fines applied on road traffic offenders - Facilitation of procedures for the payment of fines by the offenders in order to avoid direct payments of fines to the police employees	MoPO	May 2004	Delays in drafting and approval of the agreement	
B.2.15.	Prevention of the forgery of driving licenses and plate numbers through "On line" connection with Tirana Regional Department of Road Transport Service for plated vehicles and driving licenses.	MoPO MoTT	May 2004	None	How exactly is this related to corruption, and is it a priority?
B.2.16.	Organizing the qualification and training courses for State police employees, along their lines of work, on legislation, public communication, and the fight against organized crime and corruption <u>Advantages through their continuous training and the new techniques to fight corruption, the increase of the professional level and respecting the human rights.</u>	MoPO Public Academy Civil Society	2003 – 2004 On going	Technical and financial assistance required	Quantitative: how many policemen trained by when? Qualitative: awareness about these issues should be part of staff's overall regular performance review; feedback from trainees on usefulness of training upon exit, client survey on perceived improvements of the services of the police.
B.2.17.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Establishment of the National Committee of Coordination of the Fight Against Money Laundering ▪ Strengthening and institutionalisation of the cooperation with the structures in and outside the country ▪ Rapid operational action on every suspicion, tip, information, or data about money laundering, financial crime, or 	CoM MoF/DCFML PG MoPO	September 2003 On going On going	Lack of harmonization of the activities and commitments among the institutions set by law	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increase in quantity (number of cases reported, criminally charged and tried on the basis of the typology or fields of illegal acts) and quality of cases (need to define what this would mean).

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	corruption <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increase the efficiency of the Committee and its cooperation with other structures. 				
B.2.18.	Improvement of work quality through the training of the personnel through: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training the staff of the Department of Coordination of the Fight against Money Laundering. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training the personnel of the legal entities engaged in prevention of money laundering. 	MoF DCFML	On going	Lack of coordination and commitments for drafting and finalizing the respective programs and funds	In year x, y number of staff will have been exposed to training See above on training.
B.2.19.	This might be best done in conjunction with other reform efforts in the health system? Consolidation of the Doctors' Order <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Organization of round tables ▪ Promotion of awareness campaigns 	MoH <i>Doctor's Order Civil Society</i>	2004	Funding required	Link to corruption? Comparison of the number of complaints with the measures taken\
B.2.20.	Adoption of the draft-law "On the Pharmacist's Order" <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Organization of round tables ▪ Conduction of awareness campaigns ▪ - Organization of the Pharmacist's Order 	MoH <i>Civil Society</i>	2004	Reaching the consensus in adopting the draft-law Funding required	Link to corruption? - Comparison of the number of complaints with the measures taken\
B.3.	Management and Control of Public Finances and Funds				
B.3.1.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Enhanced training capacity and the improvement of the professional and ethical abilities of the auditors, who are employed in the SSA or other bodies. ▪ Exchange of experiences and providing training to the auditors in and outside the country - Passing from controls on legitimacy to assessing controls and certifying the government accounts. - Securing continued internal training for the SSA staff ▪ Establishment of the group of "Trainers' Training". 	SSA	On going On going	Insufficiency of the budgetary funds	- Increase of the number of the trained personnel\.
B.3.2.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Evaluation of the internal audit in all the institutions and 	SSA	On going	Lack of coordination among the	

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.3.3.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ entities, which manage public funds. ▪ Concentration and supervision of processes and fields with greater risk identified by INTOSAI's analysis ▪ Enhancement of the audit capacities and greater management effectiveness in the state internal audit bodies. <p>Greater cooperation between SSA and executive structures.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Improved communication and more contacts between the SSA and other institutions on the implementation of the measures recommended by the SSA. ▪ Higher transparency and effectiveness for audit detections ▪ 	MoF	On going	activity of SSA, MoF and the other interested institutions	Control and re-control of implementation of audit recommendations. On x-annual basis.
B.3.4.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Implementation of the law "On Internal Audit" and approval of three draft decisions for the implementation of the law <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Completing the audit staff, increasing the level of qualification, higher work quality. - Implementation of the procedures, improvement of the public funds usage - Establishment of the Internal Audit Committee - Establishment of the State Commission for the auditing qualification - Drafting and approval of the auditing procedures - Intensive training programs of the auditing structures - Higher work quality. - Establishment of the framework of the Internal Audit and elimination of the gaps. - Definition of the terms of reference for the recruiting of the auditors. 	MoF Audit Department	September 2003 September 2003 December 2003 On going	Delays in approval of CW's Decision	Look up TI Source Book
B.3.5.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Preparation of the inventories of the legislation on the internal audit ▪ Making recommendations for the improvement of the 	MoF Audit Department	September 2003 September 2003	Delays in preparing the inventories	

Nr.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.3.6.	<p>system.</p> <p>Implementation of the standard public procurement modules, through accurate application of the public procurement regulations thereby increasing the credibility of the public procurement process to the business community and the public</p> <p>Improvement of the information related to technical specifications</p>	PPA CoM PPA GDS S/	July 2003 December 2003	None Abuses by procurement entities and suppliers – this is what you are trying to eliminate through the measures described.	Reduction of cases of abuse with public funds in procurement procedures through statistical evidence. Supply of the procurement entities with goods or services of international standards? Unclear what this means and whether it fits into this category.
B.3.7.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increase the professional level through courses of "Trainers' Training " within PPA -Institutionalisation and concentration of the training on the anti corruption measures - Accurate application of public procurement regulations by all civil employees. 	PPA T/PA	On going December 2003	Lack of resources for training	- Number of training activities Client survey (mainly those benefiting from public procurement, i.e. the business community) on perceived improvement of situation.
B.3.8.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Updating the information data system through the application of ASYCUDA project (Tirane, Durres) ▪ Improvement of the data management and the identification of a new management information system through ASYCUDA project ▪ Computerization of the customs accounting plan through ASYCUDA project ▪ Expansion of the project in other cities' customs - Protection and good maintenance of the customs data - Implementation of ASYCUDA project - Increase of transparency in the customs offices 	GDC	End of 2003 On going End of 2003 On going	Inaccurate information in customs data	
B.3.9.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Identification of tougher disciplinary measures against the staff, increased abilities and the improvement of methods for the identification of violations of the staff in due time and through the right process (in accordance with the legal, 	GDC	On going	Lower quality of work by untrained staff Technical and financial	See other points for potential indicators for training.

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	<p>organizational, and structural framework)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Improvement of the auditing in the customs' warehouses ▪ Application of the Customs Code of Ethics ▪ Continuous education and training of the staff, including the audit staff ▪ Improved professional abilities of the staff for auditing the customs' service and the business in general ▪ Circulation of the personnel every 2-3 years and individual evaluation ▪ Simplification or elimination of tariffs through the elimination of various taxes for items that can be classified in more than one way - Greater professionalism and higher quality of measures taken against customs violations - Quarterly publications of the auditing report, publication of the number of sanctions toward the custom's personnel, establishment of a quarterly or annual evaluation - Increased awareness of the personnel and enhance the ethical level in delivering the customs services - Improved specialization of the staff - Prevention of the conflict of interests in the customs 	GDC CAM-Albania		assistance for training required	
B.3.10.	<p>Preparation of the draft procedural manuals for the evaluation-collection, investigation, internal audit, excise control, and finances. Their application in practice. Operation of the structures in the central and local GDT offices on basis of the relevant work manuals</p>	GDT	During 2003 and first half of 2004	Failure to finalize the procedural manuals in due time	
B.3.11.	Implementation of common procedures and criteria of civil servant status for recruiting staff members	GDT	December 2003	Deviation from applying defined procedures	Improvement of the administrative composition of the staff in tax offices and increased number of employees graduated in the legal and economical field

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.3.12.	Preparation of the appendices of the tax audit manual: "Notes for Industries" - Strengthening the detection capacities in the control of various activities - Higher quality in the audit of specific important activities, which make a significant contribution to the state fiscal revenues.	GDT	December 2003	Failure to complete it within the set deadline	- Enhanced detection power and the improvement of this indicator compared to the previous periods
B.3.13.	Implementation of an integrated tax computer system for the administration of the primary national taxes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Development and application of an income tax module. ▪ Development and application of the module on social insurance contribution. ▪ Parallel training of the staff on the basis of the operational modules Progressive integration of all national taxes Operation of an integrated tax computer system by the end of the program. Level of the professionalism and independence of the staff in the use of the applied system	GDT	2003-2004	Failure to complete the projects in accordance with the time frame Failure to fund the project in the framework of CARD program Delays in the project funding	What is the direct link to corruption? (Tax inspectors have been identified as amongst the most corrupt officials... yet the measures that are proposed do not appear to address this issue).
B.3.14.	Improvement of the work of tax police bodies and registration sectors for the identification of the taxes payers, through the market control, exploitation of the information by the third parties (licensing bodies) and the collaboration with other institutions	GDT Tax Police	December 2003 and by the end of every year	Lack of cooperation and lack of coordination of work with the local government units.	Direct link to corruption? - Increase of the number of the taxpayers from year to year on the basis of specific objectives laid down in the work programs ✓ - Increase of the tax revenues on the basis of the objectives laid down in the annual budget plans ✓
B.4. Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity					

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.4.1.	<p>Adoption and the implementation of the Order of the Prime Minister "On the Simplification of the Procedures and Criteria for the Public Services Offered by Central Administration Institutions"</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reduction of the chances for corruption through enhanced accountability and simplification and unification of the procedures - Communication strategy on changes to public - Training of staff, i.e. particularly those at the interface with the public 	<p>CoM Minister of State All institutions</p>	<p>December 2003</p>	<p>Delays in drafting specific legislation by the relevant institutions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - More qualitative delivery of the public services through client surveys - Shorter turnover times for claims etc. (measured through 'before'/after' statistics) - social audit
B.4.2.	<p>Drafting a law on public investments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Drafting the law is with the participation of the line ministries, stakeholder groups, the organizations representing the local government authorities, and the civil society - Adoption of law in due time - Drafting and adoption of secondary legislations in implementing this law - Making controls on the construction activities with an specialised institution in this field ((MoTT) - Drafting and improving of rules that operate in construction activities - Setting up the relevant structures for their functioning - Strengthening the set up structures for the control of the public work and investments in construction activities 	<p>MoTT MoF MoE Civil Society</p>	<p>During 2003</p>	<p>Delays in setting up the relevant structures for their functioning</p>	<p>What is the link to corruption?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Higher, measured percentage of the effectiveness of public investments, detailed with measurable indicators√ - Percentage of the number of cases presented as corruption cases before the enactment of this law, compared with the number of cases after this law is adopted and being enforced√
B.4.3.	<p>Application of FIA recommendations study "On the removal of the administrative barriers to investments..." through the implementation of measures and coordination of the work of the Central Group and technical groups"</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Removal of the administrative barriers for the problems of the land use, construction permissions, construction standards and the appeal system. 	<p>MoE Business Community MoTAT</p>	<p>On going</p>	<p>Lack of work coordination</p>	<p>Not clear what the AC angle is here?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -The number of implemented recommendations and the reduction of the administrative barriers - Reduce the number of illegal constructions - Reduce the deadlines of the application and approval of the construction permissions. - Increase of the effectiveness of the

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
B.4.4.	<p>- Identification of the public and private territories</p> <p>Preparation of the legal package in the privatisation field</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Successful privatisation - Improvement of the elements of the real evaluation of public property in the privatisation of small and medium-sized enterprises - Simplification of the evaluation procedures (the number of procedures) - Greater transparency in publication and privatisation 	MoLGD Local government units	April 2004	Failure for its approval in due time causes incongruity between the mode of evaluation of the property, which is privatised, and the current condition of the property	<p>complaint system through quicker processing of complaints.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Control on materials and conditions of construction?
7.4 C. PARTICIPATION AND EDUCATION OF THE PUBLIC					
C.1. Business Operations and the Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integrity					
C.1.1.	<p>Organization of roundtable meetings with the business community on job promotion programs.</p>	MoLSA Chamber of Commerce and Industry Business Association Trade Unions	On going	Lack of participation – then you have to rethink the content and format of your activities. If they are not attracting enough people, they might not be appropriately designed.	<p>Not clear what the relation to corruption is here.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of joint meetings√ - Number of participants√ - Number of issues solved in the meetings√ - Implementation of program in small businesses measured through feedback from stakeholders
C.2. Civil Society, Media, Transparency, and Public Participation					
C.2.1.	<p>Establishment of a Gov-Service Portal – central government portal, which will provide information about all public services</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Centralized information offered to the public related to the public services and better coordination of the information among central institutions 	Minister of State Office ACMG Line ministries	May 2004	Financial support	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of users (while this can be a useful indicator, other factors need to be considered here, i.e., the level of computerization and the level of computer-literacy, in order to make these measures valuable investments). - Public awareness about the services and information presented measured through

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
C.2.2.	Creation of the information offices in all Public Institutions for public interests	Public institutions Information department in the CoM	December 2003	Delays in the opening of the information offices	surveys More accurate information to the public about their rights and about the obligations of the Public Administration measured through <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The number of the institutions, which have opened information offices ▪ The number of people, who have received information from these offices√ ▪ Percentage of those, who think that these offices are useful√ ▪ Reduced percentage of the complaints about lack of information and transparency√
C.2.3.	Implementation of Law No. 8503, date 30.06.1999 "On the right of information about official documents" <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Drafting regulations for every institution regarding the publication of the official documents, which are accessible for the public 	Ombudsman Office All institutions	May 2004	None-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of cases submitted for solution - Number of cases, which have been resolved and in what timeframe. - Number of the complaints. - Collecting and analysis of type of information requested (to avoid oversupply of information or collection of irrelevant information that overloads the system)
C.2.4.	The operation of the Triangle Commission in implementing the Memorandum of Understanding and the information of the public through joint press statements	PG Minister of State Civil Society	October 2003 Quarterly	None-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of meetings? - Number and type of declarations for the press - Number of cases discussed in the meetings - Increased public awareness of existence and work of Triangle Commission through representative surveys in the public.
C.2.5.	Preparation of a coherent program for the information of the public through the media about the anti corruption measures	ACMG Civil Society Trade Unions Media	May 2004	Delays in preparing the program Financial and technical problems	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The program is published and is measurable in time and quality - Number of publications Public is aware of this work, measured

Nr.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
C.2.6.	Publication of the ACMG reports	ACMG	On going		through representative surveys.
C.2.7.	Organization of roundtable meetings and regional activities	ACMG Civil Society OCP Trade Unions	On going	Lack of financial resources	The number of the published reports - The number of roundtable meetings - The number of regional activities - Number of participants - The themes discussed
C.2.8.	Preparation and accomplishment of various surveys on public perception about corruption	ACMG Civil Society Trade Unions <i>Donors</i>	2003-2004	Inaccurate information and little credible conclusions Lack of funds	- Analysis and targeted follow-up on survey findings - The publication of the results - Measurement of performance of the work accomplished in implementing anti corruption measures
C.2.9.	Hearing sessions with the business community, the civil society, and the trade unions at the Anti Corruption Board meetings	ACMG Civil Society Business Community Trade Unions	December 2003 May 2004	None	- The number of the hearing sessions - The number of participants - Media reports on these activities and the extent of media coverage
C.2.10.	Inclusion and organization of some informative and educational activities about Fight Against Corruption in the schools and also in the activities of the civil society	MoES FAEDU NPO	May 2004	The ministry does not approve the program Lack of funds	- Type of modules and preparation time - Measurement of the perception of the pupils about the inclusion of these modules in the textbook\vs
C.2.11.	Transparency about the results in the SSA's communication with other institutions and the continuous information of the Assembly and public to exert influence on the process of cooperation Publication of the auditing plan on the activities of the following year Quarterly publication of the results, reports and auditing conclusions in a informative bulletin and internet webpage	SSA SSA	On going February-March 2004	Lack of providing information on sensitive issues within the set deadline and in due time	- Existing means, which are used, how many they are ? - To what extent will they increase in order to enhance transparency? - To what extent are the Assembly and citizens informed (results of the surveys)\ - Increase of transparency in the auditing process\y - Better information of the public and its

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	Drafting and publication of the auditing plan	SSA	Quarterly	Lack of evidence and not a good knowledge of the recommendations; there is no result from the auditing if measures are not taken in implementing the recommendations	awareness, measured through surveys - Number of the reports published
C.2.12.	Publication of 6-month reports on the activity of the audit bodies	MoF	Quarterly	Failure to inform the stakeholders in due time	The number and quality of the reports prepared
C.2.13.	Greater transparency in the relations with the taxpayers and the public Clarification and explanation of the legislation in the written and electronic media, publication of the guides, leaflets, etc., usage of the 24-hours lines to denounce the corruptive acts of the employees	GDT	On going	Misinformation of the public? Lack of knowledge about the information?	- Improvement of the voluntary indicator of the obligations by the taxpayers (voluntary payment of the taxes) - Reduction of the applications of restricting measures for collection of taxes by force, evidenced through statistics
C.2.14.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Implementation of the Information and Education Program for the business community and the promotion of the involvement of this community in all regulatory and legal changes of their interest. ▪ Strengthening the cooperation between the business sector and the government institutions to identify problems and priorities, draft policies, and undertake joint initiatives ▪ This is very vague – what does it mean exactly? 	MoE	On going	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The public does not have sufficient information about the work done - Inaccurate applications - Separation of the business from government policies - It causes disorders in operations with the businesses <p>The above are all reasons why the measures are being undertaken, not risks.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of the joint meetings - Number of the specific recommendations, which have been implemented
C.2.15.	Establishment of public dialogue <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Institutionalisation of the permanent forum/forums of the business community and the government ▪ Organization of educational programs, through the network of the chambers of commerce, for local business communities about procurement procedures related to the 	MoE <i>Chamber of Commerce and Industry</i>	On going	Separation of the business from the government policies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The established forum - The number of educational programs, which have been carried out - The number of seminars, joint roundtable meetings, and the number of the participants in these activities

Nr.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> business community Organization of the seminars, roundtable meetings, etc. on issues related to problems tackled in the action plan 				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number and quality of the changes due to the organization of the educational programs – need to agree how to measure them.
C.2.16.	Enhance transparency through: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Opening the page of HCoJ on the Internet A presenting publication for the High Council of Justice, so the public can know about it 	HCoJ	December 2003 October 2003		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of visitors - Number of copies sold/distributed
C.2.17.	Enhance transparency about social services <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public awareness campaign to inform the public about the legislation, benefits, and services offered by the social insurance services through - Distribution of information about social services through leaflets, brochures, posters. - Establishment of the information offices in the public institutions. Transparency about the NPO projects offering social services in the World Bank projects in order to achieve a more effective delivery and the geographical extension of these services. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public awareness campaign about the need for the judicial and physical entities to be registered with the social insurance system. Publication and distribution of the annual social insurance report and other informative materials. Application of the procedures for the inclusion of the Albanian emigrants in the voluntary insurance schemes in the framework of the inter-ministerial working group. 	MoLSA	On going On going On going December 2003	Lack of institutional capacities to respond to the interests of the public at large, who is interested in these areas. Depends on the approval of the CARDS project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increase of the number of participants in the social insurance scheme
C.2.18.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Enhanced transparency about the services offered by the health and hospital services through the system of publications, announcement of tariffs etc. Information of the public about services available Improvement of the public knowledge about the health 	MoH	Quarterly		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comparison of the quarterly reports, which have been received - Coverage with the structures, which are they, how effective they are

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	<p>insurance programme financed by the Institute of Health Care</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Development of a strategy to ensure the distribution of the updated list of prices of the most important medicines which are covered by the Health Care Institution ▪ Development of effective information campaigns on the rights and benefits covered by the health insurance (HCI) leaflets, better usage of the mass media means) ▪ Revision and improvement of the Patient Rights' Card and the consultation with the right partners from the government and the civil society on its update and a wider distribution 	<p>MoH MoH MoH</p>	<p>On going On going 2003-2004</p>	<p>Funding required Cooperation with the civil society</p> <p>Funding required Cooperation with the civil society</p>	<p>The results of the surveys</p> <p>Results of the surveys</p> <p>Results of the surveys</p>
C.2.19.	<p>Organising public awareness campaigns about anti corruption problems in the health sector in order to increased responsibility of the population about the services offered by the health system.</p>	<p>MoH NPO</p>	<p>March 2004</p>	<p>Organization of roundtable meetings for broader consultations</p> <p>- Low participation - Formal awareness campaigns</p>	<p>- Number of activities - Participation of the public in these campaigns</p>
C.2.20.	<p>Opening of the complaints offices in the hospitals or other health structures, by making available telephone lines and post boxes, as well as personnel giving guidance for various complaints.</p>	<p>MoH</p>	<p>On going 2003-2004</p>	<p>Funding required Reliability of these offices</p>	<p>- The number of complaints, which have been received; progressive decrease in the number of complaints (statistics) - The ratio of the complaints received to the punitive sanctions - Progressive increase of the offices number</p>
C.2.21.	<p>Collaboration in reinforcing the capacity of NGO/civil society groups in monitoring the delivery of the social services: Nurses, Doctor's Order, Albanian Patients' Association and other health personnel and patients' groups</p>	<p>MoH Civil Society</p>	<p>On going</p>	<p>Coordination of work with the civil society</p>	<p>- Number of the roundtables organized - Number of the new proposals in changing the situation</p>

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
C.2.22.	Introducing and extending the existing initiatives for the promotion of transparency: opening of information positions related to the payments and reimbursement of the services and medicines	MoH /HCI	On going	None	- Number of the new proposals reflected in the decision making of the MoH Distribution of information by all means and by means of communication
III.	GOOD GOVERNANCE				
III.1	Reform in the Public Administration				
III.1.1.	Clarification of the duties and functions as well as consolidation of coordinating capacities in the CM	CoM Coordination Dept.	During 2004	None	Successful monitoring
III.1.2.	Monitoring the implementation of law on "The Status of Civil Servant"	DPA	On going	None	The number of the recruitments; the number of people dismissed from the civil service; the number of the people employed with contract
III.1.3.	Approval of the internal regulations for every ministry/central institution	All Ministries and central Institutions	December 2003	None	Effective functioning and the application of authority of the Ministries and central institutions
III.1.4.	Implementation of law " On prescription of the interest's areas of the social insurances contributions" ▪ Sanctioning with legal and sub legal acts of the cooperation procedures with tax office and SIL ▪ Passing the responsibility from SIL to GDT regarding the collection the contributions	GDT HII MoLSA SIL	December 2003	Delays in the approval of the subsidiary legislation framework in passing on the contributions' collection operations from HII to the GDT	Completion of steps based on the scheme that will be approved by a Council of Ministers Decision on operation for the collection of contributions
III.2	Rule of Law, Judiciary, Prosecution Office				
III.2.1.	Cooperation among the internal audit institutions, the High State Control, and the prosecution office on the criminal charges filed with the prosecution office - Enhance the quality and submission of complete documents in a lawsuit. - Enhance the level of cooperation and assistance by the financial audit institutions during the investigation and trial of the criminal charges, which they have filed	SSA MoF/General Directorate of Audit PG	On going	Lack of work programs coordination in the realization of respective activities	- The increase of the number of criminal charges, which they have filed with the prosecution office regarding corruption?.

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
III.2.2.	Preparation and compilation of the regulations, structures, and methods for the evaluation of the effectiveness of the legislation	MoJ	During 2003 and continuing	Delays and lack of coordination with the international institutions Funding required	Higher quality of the new legislation and its practical implementation
III.2.3.	Expansion and improvement of the judicial cooperation with other countries through bilateral and multilateral agreements	MoJ	During 2003 and continuing	None-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of ratified international instruments. - Regular Peer review of level of implementation through experts from other countries that have ratified these instruments; follow up on recommendations.
III.2.4.	Adherence, signing, and ratification of other necessary international instruments in the field of the criminal law	MoJ	During 2003 and continuing	None-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Regular Peer review of level of implementation through experts from other countries that have ratified these instruments; follow up on recommendations.
III.2.5.	Improvement of the working conditions and the training of the judicial administration staff	MoJ OAJB SM	Ongoing	Delays in the implementation of the local and foreign projects	<p>This could be assessed through stakeholder surveys. If the objective is to increase working conditions of staff, then staff have to be asked whether they feel that these conditions have indeed improved.</p> <p>See previous comments on training and how success could be measured.</p> <p>Other indicators could be statistics on annual increases of salary levels, decrease in turnover of qualified staff etc.</p>
III.2.6.	Improvement of the system of the administration and exchange of information in the judicial system	OAJB MoJ	On going	Delays in the implementation of the local and foreign projects	
III.2.7.	Establishment and improvement of the structures for public relations in the judicial system	HCoJ MoJ	On going	Delays in the implementation of the local and foreign projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of the opened offices - The number of the complaints; decrease of complaints over time, evidenced through statistics.

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
III.2.8.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Improvement and completion of the legal framework for the organization and operation of the free legal professions ▪ Approval, improvement, and effective implementation of the ethical regulations 	<p>MoJ</p> <p><i>Chamber of Lawyers</i></p> <p><i>Chamber of Notaries</i></p>	December 2003	The relations between the associations of the free legal professions and the MoJ	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The improvement of the quality of the services of the free legal professions - The number of the cases, which are reported or identified as violations of the ethical regulations and relevant legislation - Enhanced public trust and greater credibility of the Notaries and Lawyers
III.2.9.	<p>Prevention and low-cost and quicker settlement of the disputes out of court, mainly through the adoption and implementation of the law "On mediation for the settlement of disputes" and the law "On Arbitration"</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adoption of new legal provisions by the parliament - Easing the burden of work for courts and the institutions dealing with conflicts - Establishment and operation of the professional systems providing alternative solutions for the settlement of the legal disputes 	MoJ	<p>July 2003</p> <p>December 2003</p>	Delays in adopting the legislation	Decrease in court costs (statistical evidence), decrease in case load, quicker turnover of caseload that is being dealt with in court, as overload decreases (statistics).
III.2.10.	<p>Improvement of the regulations for the organization and operation of the bailiff service, the working conditions, and the treatment of the bailiff officials thereby:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Greater credibility of the bailiff services to the institutions, business community, and the public 	MoJ	December 2003	<p>Lack of personnel</p> <p>Lack of financial means</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The time period and the number of the cases in which the executive titles have been fully implemented on the basis of the court orders/decisions - The increase of the number and fields of inspection and monitoring in the activity of the bailiff bodies
III.2.11.	Establishment of an integrated computer system (database) in the Inspection Unit for the administration of the documentation	MoPO	On going	Lack of logistic support Funding required	Drawing conclusions, identification of tendency of corruptive and abusive activity in the police ranks at a national level and follow-up on these conclusions, regular review of implementation of the conclusions.

Nr.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
III.2.12.	Amendment to the Council of Minister Decision No. 280; date 02.06.2000 "Regulations of the State Police Personnel", thereby achieving enhanced responsibility in human resource management. (including ethics values?)	MoPO	April 2004	None	
III.2.13.	Drafting and adoption of the agreement on police cooperation with Montenegro and Macedonia thereby strengthening the fight against cross border crime and the prevention of trafficking, smuggling, and illegal crossings..	MoPO	December 2003	None-	
III.2.14.	Preparation of the draft law "On health service in the Republic of Albania", thereby improvement of the basic provisions that will have an immediate effect on the improvement of the services in the whole health system	MoH	December 2003	Foreign assistance required	
III.2.15.	Revision of the law "On health insurances" <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Step 1: Extending the scheme, supplementary insurances ▪ Step 2: Total revision of the legal framework of the health insurance" <p>- Improvement and completion of the provisions that have to do with the extension of the scheme of health insurance in the hospitals, in very expensive check-ups, and supplementary health insurances</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 	MoH, I, HCI Trade Unions	October 2003 2004	Foreign assistance required Reaching a consensus on discussion and approval of the draft-law Foreign assistance required in reaching consensus	- Study conducted, analysis of findings of the study, preparation of the package with the respective dispositions
III.2.16.	Improvement of the law "On food"	MoH	October 2003	None	Study conducted, analysis of finding of the study, preparation of the package with the respective dispositions
III.3 Management and Control of Public Finances and Funds					
III.3.1.	Enhanced responsibility of the auditors and the structural links in the SSA for the application of an effective and credible audit, thereby achieving greater effectiveness of the audit through higher responsibility and awareness of the personnel about prospective tasks..	SSA	On going	None	

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
III.3.2.	Beginning of the computerization of the Treasury system to ensure detailed and rapid supply of information <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ First stage ▪ Second stage ▪ Completion of the pilot project for Tirana Treasury Branch. 	MoF	Until the end of 2003 2005	Financial and technical assistance required Delays in providing accurate information	
III.3.3.	Revision of the obligations about transit goods and the comparison with the previous periods in order to make improvements in the existing system – this is part of a success indicator.	GDC	On going	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The information used for reporting is not accurate. - Lack of trained staff - Lack of technical assistance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Reduction of the number of declarations. -The number of monthly reports by office branches about incomplete transits, which have been later subjected to inspections. -Effective implementation of the instruction “On legal procedures for forceful collection of the customs debt” measured through regular reports and evaluation of findings and trends in these reports.
III.3.4.	These are actually partly success indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Quarterly revision, of the level of previously applied fines and confiscations in order to identify the improvements, which should be made in the system ▪ Introduction and application of new techniques for post-customs inspection ▪ Revision and improvement of the information system about the obligations related to customs declarations, and the strengthening of the measures for their collection. 	GDC	On going	Reduction of revenue collection rate and increase of evasion	Higher collection rate of the customs revenues and prevention of evasion\ Higher collection rate of the customs debt\
III.3.5.	Improvement of the work and quality at the customs border points and specification of standard deadlines for customs clearances	GDC	On going	Lower work quality	Improvement of the quality of the inspections and the reduction of the time needed for processing
III.3.6.	Improvement of the internal audit structures, their inspection procedures, the approval of an annual inspection plan	GDC	On going	Abuses with funds – that is the reason for the measure.	Reduction of procedures for inspections evidenced through, for example, more efficient (quicker) inspections
III.3.7	Increase of incomes especially from the VAT: Processing and exchange of information collected from the office branches, buyers and taxpayers suppliers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increase of abilities on the auditing and verification of the 	GDT	On going	Not applying the scheme on processing and usage of the gathered information	Statistical prove on increase of incomes from VAT

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	taxpayers' transactions				
III.3.8.	Cooperation with the local authorities on increasing the level of auditing the use of economic assistance funds thereby prevention of abusive effects on the use of the public funds. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increased level of auditing in using the economic assistance funds 	MoLSA MoLGD	On going	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Abuses with funds – is the reason why this measure is being undertaken. - Lack of commitment by the institutions to the practical implementation of the specific tasks agreed in the framework of the institutional cooperation 	Number of the identified cases.
III.3.9.	Increase of the level of cooperation and coordination of institutional activity to control labour market and reduce black labour to a minimum, resulting in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Higher level of the inter-institutional cooperation sanctioned by legal provisions and subsidiary legislation 	MoLSA SIL NLS SII GDT	On going	Lack of will by all sides to cooperate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Reduction of the number of beneficiaries and increase of the level of benefit per family. - The increase of the number of the contributors and the increase of revenues from social insurance contributions.
III.3.10.	This should fall under the procurement section. The institutions should make concentrated procurement of the constructions and goods or services with high level of consumption	All institutions	On going	Lack of the transmission of the information	The most possible effective use of the public funds – there is very different ways of looking at this issue. Bigger value contracts also make them more susceptible to corruption. Another argument is that spreading of procurement to as many local suppliers as reasonable is to spread the benefit for the local economy evenly. Also, some procurement, if done centrally, has hidden costs, such as having to distribute the goods to the local level, so the cost argument would need to be reviewed.
III.4 Business Operations and Privatisation Process – Their Transparency and Integration					
III.4.1.	Establishment of coordinating programs among institutions and with civil society, which take part in the privatisation process.	MoE	January 2004	Failure in the privatisation	see above recommendation to look at monitoring of privatization in Bulgaria.
III.5 Civil Society, Media, Transparency, and Public Participation					
III.5.1.	Distribution of information (through brochures, leaflets, posters etc.) on the delivery of public services, brochures explaining the	All Public Institutions	On going	Low level of the commitment of the ministries	- The number of people receiving these information√

NR.	7.1.1.1.2 MEASURES	RESPONSIBLE/ COOPERATING INSTITUTIONS	DEADLINE	RISKS	SUCCESS INDICATORS
	services, which the ministries offer to the public				- Percentage of those, who are satisfied with the information received\

ABBREVIATIONS

ACMG	Anti-Corruption Monitoring Group
CEC	Central Election Commission
CIC	Chamber of Industry and Commerce
CIS	Commission of Insurance Supervision
CoM	Council of Ministers
DCFML	Directorate of the Coordination of the Fight against Money Laundering (MF)
DPA	Department of Public Administration
DPH	Directorate of Public Health (MH)
FAEDU	Federation of Albanian Education Trade Unions
GASS	General Administration of Social Aid and Service
GDC	General Directorate of Customs (MF)
GDS	General Directorate of Standardisation
GDT	General Directorate of Taxation (MF)
HCoJ	High Council of Justice
HIDCA	High Inspectorate of Declaration and Control of Assets
HII	Health Insurance Institute
ICS	Internal Control Service
IHCI	Institute of Health Care Insurance
MoAF	Ministry of Agriculture and Food
MoCYS	Ministry of Culture Youth and Sports
MoD	Ministry of Defence
MoE	Ministry of Economy
MoEN	Ministry of Environment
MoES	Ministry of Education and Science
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoIE	Ministry of Industry and Energy
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MoLGD	Ministry of Local Government and Decentralization
MoPO	Ministry of Public Order
MoTAT	Ministry of Territory Adjustment and Tourism
MoTT	Ministry of Transport and Telecommunications
MoLSA	Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs
NPO	Non Profit Organizations
NSL	National Service of Labour
OAJB	Office of Administration of Judiciary Budget
OCP	Office for Citizens' Protection
OMO	Ombudsman Office
PG	Prosecutor's General Office
PPA	Public Procurement Agency
SC	Supreme Court
SI	Statistics Institute
SII	Social Insurance Institute
SIL	State Inspectorate of Labour (MoLSA)
SIS	State Intelligence Service
SM	School of Magistrate
SSA	State Supreme Audit
TIPA	Training Institute of Public Administration