



Project on Ethics for the Prevention of Corruption in Turkey (TYEC)

CoE Project No. EC/1062

2nd Quarterly Progress Report

Project title	Ethics for the Prevention of Corruption in Turkey (TYEC)
Project area	Turkey
Project starting date	30 November 2007
Funding	European Commission (90%) & Council of Europe (10%)
Project duration	24 months (1 December 2007- 30 November 2009)
Implementation	(Economic Crime Division/Directorate of Cooperation/DG-HL)- Council of Europe
Project budget	1,500.000 Euro
Reporting period	June-July-August 2008
Date of report	20 September 2008

A project funded by the European Union and implemented by the Council of Europe

www.coe.int/economiccrime

Table of Contents

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION	3
1.1 Beneficiary Country and Institution(s)	3
1.2 Contracting Authority	3
1.3 Implementing Organization	3
1.4 Project Objective	3
2. FIRST QUARTERLY NARRATIVE REPORT	3
2.1 Report on Previous Activities	3
2.2 Planned Activities for Period June- August 2008: Overview	4
3. DELIVERY OF ACTIVITIES: JUNE-AUGUST 2008	5
3.1 Planned Work	5
3.2 Additional Work	14
4. STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING, JUNE 2008	15
5. PLANNED ACTIVITIES FOR PERIOD SEPTEMBER-NOVEMBER 2008	15
5.1 Planned Work	15
5.2 Additional Work	19
6. STRATEGIC OVERVIEW AND CONCLUSION	20

Contact

For further information please contact:

Corruption and Fraud Unit/Economic Crime Division
Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs
Council of Europe
Strasbourg, France

Tel: +33-3-9021-5516
Fax: +33-3-9021-5650
Email: ilknur.yuksekk@coe.int
www.coe.int/economiccrime

This technical report does not necessarily reflect official positions of the Council of Europe or of the donors funding this project.

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

TYEC – “Ethics for the Prevention of Corruption in Turkey” - started on 1 December 2007. This progress report provides an overview over the project activities that took place between 1st June 2008 and 31 August 2008.

1.1 Beneficiary Country and Institution(s)

The beneficiary country is Turkey.

The primary beneficiary institution of the project is the Council of Ethics for Public Service.

1.2 Contracting Authority

The Central Finance and Contracts Unit (CFCU).

1.3 Implementing Organization

The Council of Europe is responsible for the implementation of the project and the use of the project funds from the European Commission. Within the General Secretariat of the Council of Europe in Strasbourg, the Economic Crime Division (Directorate of Human Rights and Legal Affairs) is responsible for the overall administrative project management and supervision.

1.4 Project Objective

The overall objective of TYEC is to contribute to the prevention of corruption in Turkey in accordance with European and other international standards through the implementation and extension of the code of conduct, and the development of anti-corruption measures. The revised Workplan is included in **Annex 1**.

2. FIRST QUARTERLY NARRATIVE REPORT

2.1 Report on Previous Activities

For the purposes of the Steering Group meeting held on 23 June 2008, a summary of the activities discussed in the First Narrative report was presented to the members of the Steering Group, including those areas where new or additional work was being undertaken and where this would mean possible changes to the Workplan.

2.1.1 Previous Activities

Academic Research

The research studies have been advertised and applications started to arrive.

Study Visit

A study visit has been realized to Ireland between 8-13 June 2008, with the participation of 10 people from the Council of Ethics.

Reports & Papers

Inception : The inception report of Council of Europe has been approved.

Interim: The interim report will be finalized according to the comments.
 Technical Paper: Current procedures and possible future work of the Council of Ethics
 Technical Paper: Revising the code and institutional responsibilities
 Technical Paper: Options for the Council of Ethics for public service as the national prevention of corruption council

Conferences

Opening conference took place on 7 February 2008.
 Conference on international ethical standards took place on 27 May 2008.

Change in the Workplan: Trainings

A document consisting of the details of the proposed changes in the workplan has been distributed to the members of the Steering Group.

2.1.2 Decisions made

- Proposed amendments to the training component were accepted in principle and will be confirmed by the Council of Europe.
- New initiatives/projects would be explored with the beneficiary institution and other institutions in the area of anti-corruption.
- The Steering Committee meetings will take place every six months. The next Steering Committee meeting is scheduled for December 2008.

2.2 Planned Activities for Period June- August 2008: Overview

Below were the activities already underway or planned for the next reporting period that were reported to the Steering Group meeting.

Output 1	The staff of the Council of Ethics is trained and have the necessary working tools and procedures to better exercise their mandate
Activity 1.2	Train the staff of the secretariat in the management of complaints received (Ankara)
Activity 1.4	Support and organise 2 study visits of staff of the Council of Ethics to study the experience of similar bodies in other European Union countries (i.e., Spain and Ireland/France)

Output 2	A training package/module is available to support the application of the code of ethics for public officials
Activity 2.2	Develop a coherent training package/curriculum for ethics training based on the provisions of the Code of Ethics (Ankara)

Output 3	Train the trainers programme is available- (At least 10 trainers have been trained and are able to deliver ethics training)
Activity 3.1	Select 10 to 15 trainers from training institutions of the public administration (Ankara)
Activity 3.2	Train these trainers in the application of the training package (Ankara)

Output 6	At least 10 research studies are available on the risks of corruption in relation to unethical behaviour and have been discussed in public
Activity 6.2	Organise the publication and dissemination of the results of these studies (Ankara and other regions)
Activity 6.3	Support the Council of Ethics in the organisation of up to 5 public workshops on the results of these studies (Ankara) (to be confirmed after the inception phase)

Output 7	The development of codes of conduct for elected office holders and the judiciary will have been supported
Activity 7.1	Organise workshops on the needs and possibilities for developing codes of conduct for elected office holders and the judiciary: Introduction and brainstorming sessions with recommendations to what extent and scope these codes shall be developed (Ankara)
Activity 7.2	Support the development and drafting sessions of identified Codes of Conduct for elected office holders through workshops and direct technical advice (Ankara)

Output 8	The effectiveness of codes of conduct and other anti-corruption measures in Turkey will have been evaluated and recommendations for future prevention strategies are available
Activity 8.1	Carry out studies evaluating the effectiveness of anti-corruption measures implemented in recent years, including criminal law measures, the public information act, the Code of Ethics
Activity 8.2	Based on these studies, make proposals with regard to future anti-corruption strategies

Output 9	Coordination of measures to promote ethics with other anti-corruption measures in Turkey ensured
Activity 9.1	Support the organisation of regular meetings (once every six months) with the technical commission assisting the Inter-ministerial Anti-corruption Commission
Activity 9.2	Develop proposals for improved management, coordination and monitoring of anti-corruption strategies in Turkey

3. DELIVERY OF ACTIVITIES: JUNE-AUGUST 2008

3.1 Planned Work

Activity 1.2 - Train the staff of the secretariat in the management of complaints received (Ankara)

A report on conducting inquiries was prepared. The purpose of the Guide is to provide all potential complainants, and those against whom complaints are made,

with information about the procedures to be followed by any person wishing to allege a breach of any Article of the Code and the procedures to be followed by the Council of Ethics for Public Service when receiving a complaint. Members of the Secretariat were introduced to the procedures during a training session on 5th June 2008.

Activity 1.4 - Support and organise 2 study visits of staff of the Council of Ethics to study the experience of similar bodies in other European Union countries (i.e., Spain and Ireland/France)

An early activity in the project was a review of the working procedures of the Council of Ethics for the Public Service and its secretariat and make and implement proposals for improvement. Part of the review identified a number of issues relating to the development of the Council of Ethics' capacity, with particular reference to establishing key priorities for the Council of Ethics in support of the fulfilment of its mandate over a phased period and the creation of structure, decision-making and reporting procedures required to provide capacity to meet these priorities. The project included a proposal for a number of study visits to similar institutions. After the review, four EU institutions - the UK Audit Commission, the UK Commission on Standards in Public life, the Standards Board for England and the Irish Government's Standards in Public Office Commission – were identified as offering the Council of Ethics perspectives that will improve its work: The study visit took place between 9th and 13th June 2008. For ease of organization, the visit was located in Dublin and the UK institutions were invited there. To place the visit in context additional speakers were invited to discuss issues of Irish and UK politics and government.

Corruption and Politics: Irish Context: At the start of the study visit Neil Collins, Professor of Government, University College, Cork, described the current structure and issues relating to Irish politics, including the voting system which had led to candidates developing an individualistic approach to their relations with voters and the governance system that had led to decisions between government, the civil service and business that often circumvented the Legislature. Alan Doig, TYEC Resident Advisor, outlined the regional approach to ethics for elected officials and appointed officials at local and national levels. During the week John Devitt, Chief Executive of Transparency Ireland gave an overview of ethical issues from the civil society point of view.

Audit, Inception and Governance, UK Audit Commission: Alison Kelly, UK Audit Commission, described the general work of the Audit Commission which took an approach to promote good practice and help those responsible for public services to achieve better outcomes for citizens, with a focus on those people who need public services most. While the main focus was on audit, the strategic approach included reviews of governance and accountability frameworks within which services were delivered, and for which the Audit Commission made available a range of tools, information and expertise, including self-assessment tools, to help local bodies achieve high standards of governance and proper conduct.

Standards Board for England: Gary Hickey, Research and Monitoring Officer, Standards Board for England, discussed the role of the Board in establishing the ethical framework for local government. He described in detail how the Board handled complaints – and the lessons learnt – before explaining how

responsibility for investigations had been devolved to other agencies and how the Board had taken on a role of strategic regulation. In particular he explained the nature of the statutory Code of Conduct and the role and composition of local government Standards Committees whose main functions are to promote and maintain high standards of conduct for members and to help elected officials to follow the Code of Conduct, as well as giving advice on adopting a local Code of Conduct, monitoring the effectiveness of the Code, and training members on the Code or arrange such training. He outlined the main components of an investigation – Planning, Documentary evidence, Interviews, Reports, Confidentiality, Appeals/complaints procedure – and sanctions procedures. He then discussed the main lessons from the Board's experience, its move toward a strategic role and the responsibility for investigation being given to local councils' standards committees.

With the changes to the investigative approach, he then described in detail the Board's new strategic role, which had the intention of defining the ethical framework for local government; promoting and championing high standards; ensuring effective local arrangements; and monitoring effectiveness of local arrangements. This was intended to ensure system as a whole is fair, to improve performance, to identify problems and to provide support and guidance. The methods to be used included: Quarterly returns (on number and nature of allegations; decisions, outcomes and efficiency; and basic standards committee information) and Annual returns (on activities/plans of standards committees and on wider governance issues) as well as sampling and consultation. The tools to assist this include: DVDs; a support and assessment team; guidance; a helpline; training; annual conference; and research. Overall this was intended to stop ethics slipping off agenda, to encourage ethical audits, to promote learning and understanding about ethics and to provide institutions with support.

Standards in Public Office Commission: The Irish Standards in Public Office Commission provided presentations on a number of issues, including:

Party finance: Aidan Moore of the Commission Secretariat described the main focus of the legislation - to regulate the acceptance and disclosure of political donations; to provide for the limitation, disclosure and reimbursement of election expenses and to provide for the public funding of qualified political parties – and the role of the Commission - to ensure compliance with the Act, to carry out an enquiry as it sees fit and to consider referral of offences to the DPP / Gardaí to prosecute;

Gifts: Paul Murphy of the Ministry of Finance described the law relating to gifts to public officials in terms of what was a gift and who was defined as a public official. He then outlined the reporting procedures and decisions, which included: determining the value of the gift; whether the gift was given by virtue of office; arranging for the custody of the gift and its disposal. He described the new amendments to the law which defines 'Benefit' as a gift of property or of money; a loan (capital value of the loan); the supply of a service or the loan of a property, addresses situations if offered a benefit at an occasion where it would be impractical to refuse it and empowers the Standards Commission to ask the applicant for such information as it considers necessary to consider the application for its opinion.

Roles and Functions of the Commission: The main presentation concerned the establishment, composition and work of the Commission by Brian McKevitt, Assistant Principal of the Commission. He described the legislation and then in detail: Codes of conduct; Guidelines and advice; Making complaints; Investigations; Tax clearance certificates (TDs, Senators, appointees to "Senior Office"). He explained the remit and procedures relating to disclosable interests, the registration and availability of information on interests, and who was covered (both in terms of elected or appointed officials and their relatives and associates)

In terms of guidance he stated that the Standards Commission/Committees on Members' Interests publish statutory guidelines while the Standards Commission has also published guidelines for: Office Holders and Public Servants. At the same time any person may request advice from the Standards Commission (or Committees) about their obligations under the Ethics Acts and the Standards Commission must give advice or decline to give it within 21 days of receipt of request. Any person who has obligations under the Ethics Acts is obliged to act in accordance with guidelines issued or advice given unless doing so would contravene another provision of the Ethics Acts.

In terms of Codes of Conduct, these indicate the standards of conduct and integrity which apply to a person in the performance of their functions, are part of public servant's terms and conditions of employment and are admissible in proceedings before a Court, other tribunal, a Committee on Members' Interests or the Standards Commission.

In terms of investigations, the Commission may undertake them on receipt of a complaint or on their own initiative. The Commission has the powers to access documents and witnesses but reports are issued to relevant Committee/ the public body and sanctions a matter for the Oireachtas / the public body. The Standards Commission may appoint an Inquiry Officer who undertakes the various aspects of an investigation. Finally in terms of training awareness, the Commission provides guidelines and advice, presentations to Public Bodies, runs a website, issues an annual Report, etc.

UK Committee on Standards in Public Life: The last presentation was from Charles Ramsden, Secretary to the UK Committee on Standards in Public Life. After describing the establishment, composition and work of the Committee, he outlined how the Committee undertook its work and the impact of the Committee's work.

On the final day the participants of the Council of Ethics for Public Service discussed the range of issues that had emerged from the presentations during the week. The members were very interested in the various approaches taken by other organisations, from monitoring to investigations, and how some incorporated an ethical focus with their other work. They recognised the importance of engaging the involvement and commitment of other agencies and of public officials and ministries talking the lead on ethical standards.

Specifically the following issues emerged for further discussion:

- The value of public monitoring of and reporting on ethical frameworks;

- The value of shared resources – the Standards Commission was able to draw on resources shared with the Irish Ombudsman;
- The need to share roles and responsibilities with other agencies;
- The importance of ministries and other public bodies to 'own' responsibility for their ethical frameworks;
- The focus on standards and performance in the public sector and the role of the Council to deal with one aspect – breaches of the Code – and the possibility to extend its work into that of an Ombudsman to address breaches of performance and public service.

The Study Visit Agenda is attached – [Annex 2](#).

Activity 2.2 - Develop a coherent training package/curriculum for ethics training based on the provisions of the Code of Ethics

By end of June 2008 a training package had been drafted. It comprises:

- **A GUIDE FOR FACILITATORS OF ETHICS TRAINING:** a guide for training facilitators to assist them in organising, delivering and following-up the training event, including case study scenarios, PowerPoint slides and the outline of a two-day training event and training materials;
- **AN IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE FOR PUBLIC SERVICES ORGANISATIONS:** a guide for organisations hosting the training event, outlining the preparations required for the event and how ethical principles and practices can be consolidated after the event; and
- **THE POCKET GUIDE FOR ALL PUBLIC OFFICIALS:** an ethics awareness leaflet for public officials.

This material has been translated and is now undergoing a peer-review and translation-check process in order to be distributed to potential trainers at a meeting on 24th September 2008.

Activity 3.1 - Select 10 to 15 trainers from training institutions of the public administration

A circular calling for trainers from ministries was sent out in June 2008. The Council of Ethics for Public Service reviewed the applications and selected 14 candidates. These were called to a meeting on 25th August 2008 where the training programme and timetable were discussed. In a post-meeting circular, trainers will be informed that the training is a major part of the the ethics project with the Council of Europe and is intended to:

- support the Council of Ethics training programme for senior national, regional and local public officials between November 2008 and October 2009;
- use the trainers to work with their ministry ethics commission to set up a training strategy. The Council of Ethics will be writing to discuss this document with the head of the ministry and the ethics commission;;

- assist the Council of Ethics deliver a national training programme;

The dates for the training have been agreed as follows:

24th September – meeting to receive training and ethics material

20th-24th October – training of trainers

27th-28th October – training with ethics material

30th-31st October – test pilot training exercise

29th October/4th-5th November – optional review of materials with trainers

06th November – ethics training conference.

Activity 6.1 - Initiate the identification of subject matter preparation and of the ToRs for at least 10 research studies on ethics issues and corruption in general

A meeting was held at the Ethics Council on 25th July 2008 to consider applications for 6 research studies. The membership included the Chair of the Council of Ethics for Public Service, Omer Atalar (expert), Alan Doig (resident advisor), and representatives from the departments/ministries relating to health, police, land registry and public bidding.

The Chair of the Council of Ethics and Resident Advisor described the project and the role of the Research Studies. The Chair introduced each application for discussion. Those recommended for awards are as follows:

Research Study 1: Conflict of Interest - Omer Faruk Gençkaya

Research Study 3: Planning - Gökçen Kiling

Research Study 4: Law Enforcement - Ibrahim Cerrah

Research Study 6: Land Registry - Hamza Ates

The topics to be addressed through the research are:

Conflict of Interest in Public Administration

The study will assess how the public sector deals with conflict of interest, including:

How is it defined;

What is the legal framework and is it effective;

What are the most common causes of conflict of interest;

What rules and procedures are in place for the registration and disclosure of interests;

What variations exist across the public sector or between national, regional and local governments;

What is the role of the ethics boards and disciplinary boards.

What is or should be the role of the Council of Ethics.

The study may give particular attention to the current roles and responsibilities of the Council of Ethics, how it may liaise with and interact with other agencies, such as Ethics Commissions. It may assess how Turkey approaches conflict of interest in comparison to other EU countries or to wider standards, such as those of the OECD.

Planning at Local Level

The study will look at the legislative, institutional and procedural arrangements for dealing with planning applications and development at local level. It will consider such issues as the impact of planning on land values, on the policing of illegal building, on the development of area plans, on the relationship between developers, planners and politicians.

The study will consider the expertise of the local public officials involved in planning, the pressures on planning procedures, the potential for corruption, the nature of ethical guidance and procedures for local public officials, and the procedures for the publicity, review and appeal of decisions.

The study may consider the relationships between local, regional and national planning authorities, and the relationship between local public officials and the citizens in the planning process.

The study may consider the wider environmental and conservation issues associated with planning at local levels. It may make recommendations for the improved ethical conduct of local public officials and the improved corporate social responsibility of individuals and companies involved in planning.

Ethical Conduct in Law Enforcement

The study may wish to review the literature on law enforcement misconduct and corruption as a framework to compare and contrast the Turkish context. It may explore the types of misconduct and corruption involving the Turkish law enforcement agencies and review what training and other means are currently used to instil ethical behaviour and deal with breaches.

The study will consider how far the nature of policing and the culture of the agencies provide the opportunities for misconduct and what measures could be taken to address this.

The study will review the role of codes and related procedures and requirements in law enforcement agencies and compare them to the Interpol Code of Conduct and other procedural and institutional measures used to address misconduct and corruption.

Ethical Standards and the Title/Land Registry

The study provides the opportunity to study in detail the legal, institutional and procedural aspects of a single ministry. The study will explore the complexities of service delivery and the risks and vulnerabilities associated with it. It will be able to explore possible reforms that will address the provision of a more efficient public service, particularly using modern

technology, while also seeking to design out the opportunity and incentive for misconduct.

The study may wish to interview public officials about their work and the role of ethics in guiding their decision-making and other processes.

The study should give the Council on Ethics guidance on perceptions of the role and importance of ethics, of an awareness and understanding of the Code, among a range of public officials.

At a meeting on 28th August the research teams and representatives of the relevant ministries met with the Chair of the Council of Ethics for Public Service and the Resident Advisor to discuss methodology and timetables. The key issues stressed were:

- The research is to be undertaken under the name of the Council of Ethics for Public Service in collaboration with ministries. It is important to ensure that good relations are maintained between the Council, the ministries and the research teams.
- The purpose of the research is to help deliver the overall purpose of the project and its support to the work of the Council. Research teams should be familiar with the project and the work of the Council, both in terms of what they intend to do and their findings.
- Corruption includes bribery, gift-giving and other material offers or rewards. Unethical behaviour covers nepotism, favouritism and discrimination. Both are aspects of all public administrations and the research does not need to spend too much time discussing theories of corruption.
- Further, the research studies are not pieces of investigative journalism to prove this, but looking at causes and ways of improving the ethical conduct of public officials. Thus the research should be framed in a way that will provide practitioner solutions for ministries and the Council.
- The research is both empirical and to be undertaken in cooperation with ministries. To ensure this, all researchers should agree rules of engagement with the ministries in advance in terms of the information that is sought, and its use. This may include agreement on the research programmes, issues of anonymity for those interviewed and the use of confidential data. All ministries should have the right to read the final draft reports to correct factual inaccuracies but not to influence the academic rigour of their analysis or the findings.
- The research may include reviews of previously-published material – academic material, media stories and public reports – but should not spend too much time on secondary sources, conceptual discussions or generalisations. A good applied understanding of the laws, procedures and organisational cultures is important, as are the risks and vulnerabilities that give rise to corruption. The focus is on the causes – based on credible evidence – and then the possible realistic solutions.
- As far as possible the final agreed methodology should have the agreement of the Council and the ministry, take account of the timetable and the purpose

of the research. Public opinion surveys, for example, are only valuable if they can be done relatively quickly and are directly relevant to the research (eg, gift-giving in the Land Registry or payments to traffic policy). Much attention should be given to in-depth information from public officials – from the ministries or inspectorates – that provides a true picture of the causes and possible solutions.

- There will be regular meetings to discuss progress because the research needs to fit within other timetables. Members of the project – Omer Atalar, Alan Doig, Serhan Alemdar – are also available at any time for discussions

The research teams then outlined their proposed methodologies and strategies. After discussion these were agreed in general terms. The research teams were invited to re-submit their methodologies and research plan within one month from the date of the meeting. It was agreed that an interim report meeting would be held after approximately 3 months but that the researchers could contact those noted below for informal discussions at any time (the research team for law enforcement had already done so and a date was arranged for the team looking at conflict-of-interest).

On the week commencing 8th September 2008 the remaining 6 studies were advertised in Turkish and English on the Council of Europe and Council of Ethics for Public Service websites.

Activity 7.1 Organise workshops on the needs and possibilities for developing codes of conduct for elected office holders and the judiciary: Introduction and brainstorming sessions with recommendations to what extend and scope these codes shall be developed

It was noted in the 1st Quarterly narrative Report that 2 studies had been completed on codes for the judiciary and the legislature. Work was begun in August to plan a ToR for the workshops, and names of international and Turkish speakers. It is intended to combine this with an Activity under 8.3 - Organise up to 2 national conferences on the prevention of corruption in Turkey – proposed in the Workplan for November 2008.

Activity 8.1 Carry out studies evaluating the effectiveness of anti-corruption measures implemented in recent years, including criminal law measures, the public information act, the Code of Ethics

A Turkish academic was appointed in August to work with the Resident Adviser on the Activity. Material is being collected and collated, and contact has been made with the Prime Ministry Inspectorate which is keen to be involved in the work.

Activity 9.1 Support the organisation of regular meetings (once every six months) with the technical commission assisting the Inter-ministerial Anti-corruption Commission

Initial work under 8.1 quickly established that neither the Technical Commission nor the Inter-ministerial Commission exist (nor have they been in existence since 2004). The work relating to the Output – Activity 9.2: Develop proposals for

improved management, coordination and monitoring of anti-corruption strategies in Turkey - will be undertaken during the work for Output 8. It is understood that informal discussions have taken place about reviving the Technical Commission.

3.2 Additional Work

As noted at the Steering Committee meeting, additional work relating to some of the Outputs has also been undertaken as follows:

Activity 1.1 - Review of the working procedures of the Council of Ethics for Public Service and its secretariat: Submission of proposals and recommendations for the improvement.

A new working paper is being prepared which discusses the legal and institutional context of the work of the Council of Ethics for the Public Service before focussing on the Council's procedures and working practices and the implications for future directions. It builds on a previous review of the structure, work and capacity of the Council within the context of a possible new agency that combines the functions of the Council of Ethics for Public Service and an Ombudsman into an Office for Public Standards.

Another new working paper is being prepared which discusses the issue of sanctions within the legal and institutional context of the work of the Council of Ethics for the Public Service. It builds on a previous review of the structure, work and capacity of the Council and proposes a good practice range of sanctions, including comments on the enforcing institution and aggravating/mitigating factors in determining the level of sanction.

Activity 2.2 - Develop a coherent training package/curriculum for ethics training based on the provisions of the Code of Ethics

As discussed at the Steering Group meeting, the process of developing training materials identified a number of key issues relating to the planned delivery of the programme and related logistics, which need to be addressed by means of a coordinated and coherent training strategy. This was developed into a document - **THE TRAINING STRATEGY** - which is intended to encourage ministries, through their ethics commissions, to cascade the ethics training and to develop other procedures and activities that sustain the purpose of the training. The document has been translated into Turkish and will be circulated to the proposed trainers and ethics commissions in September 2008. It describes the purpose of the training aspect of the project, the role of those trained and the training strategy. It states that the international expert will visit a number of ministries to meet with their ethics commissions and personnel departments to discuss the implementation of the strategy in October 2008. It is also proposed to invite an official from each personnel department to participate in a pilot training exercise so that they can see the training material, meet the trainers and experience the training themselves. Finally there will be an ethics training conference in early November 2008 to launch the training; ethics commissions and personnel staff will be invited.

4. STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING, JUNE 2008

A meeting of the Steering Committee was held on 23 June 2008 – the Minutes are attached in **Annex 3**.

5. PLANNED ACTIVITIES FOR PERIOD SEPTEMBER-NOVEMBER 2008

5.1 *Planned Work*

Below are the activities already underway or planned for the next reporting period.

Output 2	A training package/module is available to support the application of the code of ethics for public officials
Activity 2.2	Complete the development of a coherent training package/curriculum for ethics training based on the provisions of the Code of Ethics
Activity 2.3	Following a testing of the training package (under outputs 4 and 5), finalise the training package and make it available to different institutions for in-service training
Activity 2.4	Produce and disseminate a training CD suitable for computer-based training

This Activity involves the completion and publication of the training package, the training of the selected trainers including the use of the training package – the timetable is stated above an agreement is being made with TUSSE, the Turkish public sector training company. The training programme will be supervised by a Turkish and international Short Term expert (STE) and will involve a pilot exercise and 2 reviews of the material.

Output 3	Train the trainers programme is available - (At least 10 trainers have been trained and are able to deliver ethics training)
Activity 3.2	Train these trainers in the application of the training package (Ankara)
Activity 3.3	Support these trainers in the delivery of initial training activities (under outputs 4 and 5)

This Activity follows the outline for Output 2 above.

Output 4	The governors, deputy governors and members of ethics commissions of the 81 provinces have been trained in the application of the code of ethics for public officials
Activity 4.1	Plan the organisation of up to 10 training events for governors, deputy governors and district governors

Activity 4.2	Plan the organisation of up to 15 training events for members of ethics commissions in provinces and municipalities
--------------	---

The locations for the training to take place in November are noted below in the Workplan. Initial planning is taking place about delivery. After the training programme in October trainers will be selected for participation in the training. The initial training will be monitored and evaluated.

Output 5	Officials of central institutions and organisations responsible for ethics (members of the ethics commissions and senior managers) have been trained in the application of the code of ethics for public officials
Activity 5.1	Plan the organisation of up to 6 training events for members of ethics commissions and officials responsible for in-service training in different institutions of the public administration
Activity 5.2	Plan the organisation of up to 4 training events for senior officials of central level institutions of the public administration (under secretary, general director, president, general secretary and deputy general secretary levels)

The Activity will follow that of Output 4.

Output 6	At least 10 research studies are available on the risks of corruption in relation to unethical behaviour and have been discussed in public
Activity 6.1	Commission 6 research studies

For the six studies, the approach taken for the first four studies will be followed. The studies have been advertised. Closing date will be mid-October, with an intended decision by end of October, a start-date of 1st November and a completion within 5 months. Representatives of the relevant ministries will participate in the award process. The topics of the research studies are:

1. Public Bidding and Ethics (re-advertisement)

The study will review national, regional and local legislation, institutional arrangements, and procedures for capital, recurrent and maintenance (or works) public sector contracts.

The study may want to consider preventative measures throughout the lifecycle of a contract, procurement planning and the decision to procure, including the preparation of operational-technical requirements; organisation and allocation of public procurement through open procedures (unless there are exceptional circumstances justifying alternative procedures) and the completion of contract; and closure of the contracts through post-award performance and payment.

It will identify risks, weaknesses and vulnerabilities in each area and in each type of contract. It will make proposals for the improvement of procedures, to minimise the possibility of corruption, including the use of e-government and

other means of transparency, ethical conduct of those involved in procurement, the responsibilities of the private sector, and possible sanctions (including voiding of contracts, debarment, integrity pacts and so on). It may wish to compare and contrast Turkish procedures against international standards, such as the UNCITRAL Model Law, matters regarding personnel responsible for procurement, such as risk management, audit trails and record-keeping, specific appointments processes, specific codes of conduct and training requirements, and the role of inspectorates and audit.

The study will identify those areas and procedures where the Council of Ethics may have a particular impact in terms of guidance, training and review.

2. Ethical Conduct in the Health Services (re-advertisement)

The study will provide the opportunity to assess the ethical conduct of those within the health services and the relation between the health services and its suppliers, particularly the pharmaceutical industry.

The study may wish to review how the separation of responsibilities and interests between the Ministry of Health, its subordinate units, state and private supplies of healthcare products, healthcare professionals and the public and any conflict of interest is managed.

The study will explore the role and responsibilities of health professionals, their professional standards, and the potential for misconduct and corruption. It will consider the ethical framework surrounding the system of delivery of, use of, and payment for, pharmaceutical products.

The study may review how national and international private sector companies approach their roles and responsibilities in terms of ethical contracting and relations with public officials and health professionals.

3. The Shadow Economy

The shadow economy (or the informal or cash economy) is often used as an indicator of corruption, or at least as evidence of a lesser developing economy or society in which exchange or cash is the basis of economic activity. Not only does this work outside the formal tax and customs framework, denying the state revenue, but it allows illicit accumulation of wealth and assets often used in influence trading and corruption. It instils an anti-state attitude and encourages covert relations between public officials and the private sector.

The study will explore how far the informal economy has decreased or increased in recent years and in which sectors it is more prevalent, and why. It may review the work of the tax and other revenue agencies and consider what threats its existence poses to an ethical environment in the public sector.

4. Professional Associations and Ethics

The study would survey all those professional bodies in Turkey for their developments of Codes of Conduct, how they were constructed, implemented and enforced. Distinctions may be made between professional and generic ethical contents, which in turn may be compared and contrasted with the Council of Ethics's Code.

Questionnaires and interviews may be undertaken as to the perceptions of professional associations in complementing the work of the Council of Ethics and working toward generic themes across codes, in the provision of training and in the raising of awareness of ethical standards. Particular attention may be given to those professional associations whose members are also public officials and governed by more than one code (such as health professionals).

5. Ethics and the Customs Services

The study may wish to review the literature on misconduct and corruption in the customs service, particularly the work of the World Customs Organisation (WCO), as a framework to compare and contrast the Turkish context. It may explore the types of misconduct and corruption involving the Turkish customs service. The study will be used to compare and contrast issues identified in similar institutions.

The study will explore the nature of recruitment, promotion, management arrangements, the management of risk, review of training and other means currently used to instil ethical behaviour and deal with breaches.

6. Ethics, Culture, and Society

The study is envisaged as possibly taking two approaches in seeking to establish the social and cultural context – ranging from where do public officials develop their ethical standards to the public's perceptions of the conduct of public officials.

The study may make a broad review of the development of ethical standards in the Turkish context, how it may be developed through faith, family, education and other influences. Drawing on the extensive literature, it may wish to consider how the approach to, and view of the role of ethics, has developed in different sectors in the public and private sectors in order to where social and cultural attitudes may complement or contradict the development of an ethical environment in the public sector.

In particular the study should look at the current and future roles of education, media, and NGOs in promoting ethics and how they may work with the Council.

The study should provide the Council of Ethics with guidance on those areas where training should reinforce ethical standards and where it may need to address areas of potential conflict (for example, in relation to family or regional ties and nepotism).

The study would also consider in details trends and attitudes expressed in public opinion polls and other quantitative surveys to assess how public perceptions of misconduct and corruption involving public officials has changed. Of particular interest are any assessments of which ministries or activities may be seen as more susceptible to abuse than others and what the public expect from public officials. Comparisons with the various articles in the Code may give the Council on Ethics guidance on perceptions of the relative importance of each.

Output 7	The development of codes of conduct for elected office holders and the judiciary will have been supported
Activity 7.1	Organise workshops on the needs and possibilities for

	developing codes of conduct for elected office holders and the judiciary: Introduction and brainstorming sessions with recommendations to what extent and scope these codes shall be developed
Activity 7.2	Support the development and drafting sessions of identified Codes of Conduct for elected office holders through workshops and direct technical advice

Background working papers have been completed. Terms of Reference for workshops for the Legislature and the Judiciary are being prepared. It is intended that the workshops will be held in late November or early December and consideration is being given to holding a related conference on corruption proposed under Output 8.

Output 8	The effectiveness of codes of conduct and other anti-corruption measures in Turkey will have been evaluated and recommendations for future prevention strategies are available
Activity 8.1	Carry out studies evaluating the effectiveness of anti-corruption measures implemented in recent years, including criminal law measures, the public information act, the Code of Ethics
Activity 8.3	Organise up to 1 national conference on the prevention of corruption in Turkey

Background research is underway. The Turkish STE is completing a gap-analysis paper on the laws and procedures relating to corruption and ethics in preparation of a focus on the 4 areas noted under 8.1. The Resident Advisor will complete a background paper on corruption in Turkey.

Output 9	Coordination of measures to promote ethics with other anti-corruption measures in Turkey ensured
Activity 9.2	Develop proposals for improved management, coordination and monitoring of anti-corruption strategies in Turkey

Work under this Activity will be subsumed under Output 8.

5.2 Additional Work

Additional work will also be undertaken as follows:

Activity 1.1 - Review of the working procedures of the Council of Ethics for Public Service and its secretariat: Submission of proposals and recommendations for the improvement.

Completion of new working paper on combining the functions of the Council of Ethics for Public Service and an Ombudsman into an Office for Public Standards (September 2008).

Completion of new working paper on sanctions (September 2008).

Activity 2.2 - Develop a coherent training package/curriculum for ethics training based on the provisions of the Code of Ethics

Completion of a further working paper on a sustainable training strategy, following the work of international STE in October 2008.

6. STRATEGIC OVERVIEW AND CONCLUSION

The project is progressing according to the workplan and its timetable. It has the support of the Council of Ethics for Public Service. It has attracted the interest and commitment from a range of stakeholders in the public sector, such as, universities, research institutes and NGOs, and the private sector.

In terms of the future work, the main topic to be addressed is the development of a strategic approach to training. The training package is essentially a tool. Confirmation is needed of the realism and relevance of the case studies in order to ensure that the trainers receive adequate training, and that they know how to train others. It is also important that they fully understand the ethics material they are using.

Other challenges include the commitment of the ministries to the training, their sustainable support and the involvement of the ethics commissions in ensuring the cascade of the training within their respective ministries.

More generally attention will now be turned to the wider ethical environment in the Turkish public sector, including reviews of the environment's legal, institutional and procedural components, the effect of previous reform initiatives and proposals for future reform, and institutional relationships.
