

Strasbourg, 10 July 2013

ECRML (2013) 4

EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES

APPLICATION OF THE CHARTER IN SWITZERLAND

5th monitoring cycle

- A. Report of the Committee of Experts on the Charter**
- B. Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter by Switzerland**

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its language legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the State and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. The report should be made public by the State. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, so as to attempt to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of an initial periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an "on-the-spot visit" by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the State in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the State concerned.

Having concluded this process of collecting information, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. This report is submitted to the Committee of Ministers, together with suggestions for recommendations that the latter may decide to address to the State Party.

CONTENTS

A. Report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter in Switzerland	4
Chapter 1 Background information	4
1.1. <i>The ratification of the Charter by Switzerland.....</i>	4
1.2. <i>The work of the Committee of Experts</i>	4
1.3. <i>General issues</i>	4
Chapter 2 Conclusions of the Committee of Experts on how the Swiss authorities have reacted to the recommendations of the Committee of Ministers.....	6
Chapter 3 The Committee of Experts' evaluation in respect of Part II and Part III of the Charter	7
3.1. <i>The evaluation in respect of Part II of the Charter.....</i>	7
3.2. <i>The evaluation in respect of Part III of the Charter.....</i>	11
3.2.1. Preliminary remarks on the approach of the Committee of Experts in respect of Part III.	11
3.2.2. Romansh	12
3.2.3. Italian.....	17
Chapter 4 Findings of the Committee of Experts in the fifth monitoring round	19
Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification.....	21
Appendix II: Comments from the Swiss authorities	23
B. Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter by Switzerland	24

A. Report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter in Switzerland

adopted by the Committee of Experts on 28 February 2013
and presented to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe
in accordance with Article 16 of the Charter

Chapter 1 Background information

1.1. The ratification of the Charter by Switzerland

1. Switzerland signed the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) on 8 October 1993. The Federal Council decided to ratify it on 31 October 1997. Through this decision, the Charter became part of Swiss law. The Swiss authorities formally ratified it on 23 December 1997. The Charter entered into force in respect of Switzerland on 1 April 1998.

2. Article 15.1 of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports in a form prescribed by the Committee of Ministers¹. The Swiss authorities presented their fifth periodical report to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe on 18 December 2012.

3. In its previous report on Switzerland, the Committee of Experts of the Charter (hereafter referred to as “the Committee of Experts”) outlined particular areas where policies, legislation and practice could be improved. The Committee of Ministers took note of the report presented by the Committee of Experts and adopted recommendations, which were addressed to the Swiss authorities.

1.2. The work of the Committee of Experts

4. This fifth evaluation report is based on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts from the fifth periodical report of Switzerland as well as through interviews held with representatives of the speakers of the regional or minority languages in Switzerland, and representatives of governmental, cantonal and local authorities during an on-the-spot visit (7-8 February 2013). The present report reflects the policies, legislation and practice prevailing at the time of the on-the-spot visit. Any changes will be taken into account in the next report of the Committee of Experts concerning Switzerland.

5. The present report focuses on the measures taken by the Swiss authorities to respond to the findings of the Committee of Experts in the fourth monitoring cycle and to the recommendations addressed to the Swiss authorities by the Committee of Ministers. It also aims at highlighting new issues detected by the Committee of Experts during the fifth monitoring cycle.

6. The report contains detailed observations which the Swiss authorities are urged to take into account in order to further develop their policy on regional or minority languages. The Committee of Experts has, on the basis of its detailed recommendations, also established a list of general proposals for the preparation of a fifth set of recommendations to be addressed to Switzerland by the Committee of Ministers, as provided in Article 16.4 of the Charter (Chapter 4.2. of this report).

7. The present report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 28 February 2013.

1.3. General issues

Franco-Provençal

8. During the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts met with representatives of Franco-Provençal speakers, who expressed their wish for Franco-Provençal to be covered by the Charter. Franco-Provençal is

¹ MIN-LANG(2009)8 Outline for three-yearly periodical reports as adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

spoken in several cantons in the French-speaking part of Switzerland. The Committee of Experts at this stage lacks a comprehensive overview of the status of Franco-Provençal in these cantons and its situation in policy and practice. Therefore, the Committee of Experts encourages the Swiss authorities to examine, in cooperation with the respective cantonal authorities and representatives of the speakers, whether Franco-Provençal constitutes a regional or minority language in the sense of Article 1.a of the Charter and to report about the outcome in the next periodical report.

Chapter 2 Conclusions of the Committee of Experts on how the Swiss authorities have reacted to the recommendations of the Committee of Ministers

Recommendation no. 1:

“ensure that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools is carried out in a way which is sensitive to the protection and promotion of Romansh as a living language;”

9. There has been a change of perception concerning the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun as a standardised language in schools. The Cantonal Parliament decided in 2011 to allow the use of the five written varieties of Romansh to be taught in schools together with Rumantsch Grischun according to an established scheme. The co-existence model allows for the teaching of the five varieties of Romansh complemented by Rumantsch Grischun as a sixth form of expression.

10. A structured form of dialogue is needed in order to avoid polarisation between the municipalities, schools, parents and speakers with respect to the use of Rumantsch Grischun in education.

Recommendation no. 2:

“organise language training in Romansh for administrative staff”

11. The implementation of this recommendation falls primarily within the scope and the mandate of the Canton of Graubünden. Since 2011 the Canton of Graubünden has increased the offer of language training for administrative staff. These training offers are financially supported by the federal authorities. In the fifth periodical report the Swiss authorities reported that the language courses offered have been well attended by administrative staff within the Canton of Graubünden.

12. Furthermore, language training, literature studies and research facilities with respect to Romansh are available in four universities Zurich, Berne, Fribourg and Geneva, which might complement efforts made at cantonal level.

Chapter 3 The Committee of Experts' evaluation in respect of Part II and Part III of the Charter

3.1. The evaluation in respect of Part II of the Charter

13. Apart from the languages additionally covered by Part III of the Charter (Romansh, Italian in the Cantons of Graubünden and Ticino), Part II applies to French (Canton of Bern/Berne), German (cantons of Fribourg/Freiburg; Valais/Wallis; municipalities of Bosco-Gurin [Canton of Ticino] and Ederswiler [Canton of Jura]) as well as to Yenish, which is a non-territorial language.

14. The Committee of Experts will not comment again on Articles 7.1.e, f, g, i, 7.2 and 7.4, as no major issues arose in these areas during the fifth monitoring cycle.

Article 7 - Objectives and principles

Paragraph 1

In respect of regional or minority languages, within the territories in which such languages are used and according to the situation of each language, the Parties shall base their policies, legislation and practice on the following objectives and principles:

- a. *the recognition of the regional or minority languages as an expression of cultural wealth;*

15. The Federal Law on the National Languages and Understanding between the Language Communities (hereafter, Federal Language Law) entered into force on 1 January 2010. The regulation on the application of the law entered into force on 1 July 2010. Specific information on the implementation of the law will be discussed under the paragraphs below.²

- b. *the respect of the geographical area of each regional or minority language in order to ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of the regional or minority language in question;*

Romansh

16. In the fourth evaluation report the Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to ensure that mergers of municipalities do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romansh, and that Romansh-medium education is still available at least to the same extent after any re-organisation".

17. According to the fifth periodical report, the most advanced merger at the language border concerns Glion/Illanz Plus (the German-speaking municipality of Illanz with adjacent smaller Romansh-speaking municipalities). The cantonal and local authorities have discussed measures to ensure the protection of Romansh in administration and education.

18. A referendum on the merger took place on 16 November 2012. Upon approval by the cantonal Parliament, the merger will enter into force on 1 January 2014. The terms of the merger³ provide that Romansh and German are the official languages of the new municipality. The new authorities have the duty to promote Romansh and to ensure that the language does not disappear from the daily administrative use. As far as education is concerned, the schools in the former Romansh municipalities will maintain their status. The pupils in the former Romansh municipalities have to attend these schools. At least one Romansh class at all levels of compulsory education [Klassenzug] will be maintained. The existing schools will be maintained and the closure of an institution is only possible if the number of pupils is below the minimum cantonal level and no exception has been granted by the cantonal authorities.

19. The Committee of Experts welcomes this information. It looks forward to receiving further information on the practical implementation of measures on the promotion of Romansh in the new framework after the merger in the next periodical report.

² For more information on the provisions of the law and the regulation, see 4th Report of the Committee of Experts on Switzerland, ECRML (2010) 8, paragraph 14, and the 5th periodical report of Switzerland, MINLANG (2012) 6, p.12-14

³ Articles 7-8, Merger Agreement of Glion/Illanz Plus, <http://www.glionplus.ch/glionplusch/aktuell/?L=1v>

c. the need for resolute action to promote regional or minority languages in order to safeguard them;

20. The business of the federal institutions is largely conducted in German. The regulation on the application of the Federal Language Law establishes concrete measures for language promotion and the corresponding financial mechanisms, at federal level. For example, it foresees standards for the linguistic competences of staff (productive knowledge of two languages and a receptive knowledge of the third). To further facilitate the use of the lesser used official languages at federal level, the post of a delegate for multilingualism and 16 additional posts of translators into German and Italian have been set up. The regulation also provides for the financial support of the federal authorities in the educational field, in areas such as developing teaching materials, teaching a second or third national language, bilingual education or teacher training. Furthermore, it foresees the support of the federal authorities for organisations which undertake activities in the areas of plurilingualism and understanding between language communities, e.g. events, publications, out-of-school exchanges.

21. In accordance with the new legal framework, the federal authorities (Federal Office for Culture) have concluded four-year agreements (2012-2015) with all bilingual/plurilingual cantons (Bern/Berne, Fribourg/Freiburg, Valais/Wallis and Graubünden/Grigioni/Grischun) with respect to the federal support for activities of these cantons in the language field. Moreover, financial aid is provided to the cantons of Ticino and Graubünden/Grischun/Grigioni for the promotion of Italian and Romansh, e.g. for translations, publications, media, for activities of associations or of the cantonal authorities dealing with the promotion of minority languages. The Committee of Experts welcomes these developments.

Yenish

22. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to consider the provision of stopover facilities also in the light of the protection and promotion of Yenish and to come to flexible solutions”.

23. According to the fifth periodical report, the Swiss authorities are aware of the need to improve the situation of the stopover facilities and are considering solutions to this end. Two new stopover facilities were set up in July 2010 in the canton of Zug, while in the cantons of Fribourg/Freiburg, St. Gallen, Valais/Wallis and Ticino steps are currently being taken to set up new stopover facilities.

24. According to the representatives of the Yenish-speakers further measures are needed to improve the situation concerning the stopover facilities, which play an important role also for the maintenance of the language. The majority of the Yenish population however has settled. The umbrella organisation of the Yenish intends to involve also the settled Yenish in language promotion activities.

25. In the framework of a project on Yenish, which started several years ago⁴, the production of a DVD about the Swiss travellers, accompanied by a booklet, both in German, French, Italian and Yenish will be finalised in April 2013. The project will next develop a Yenish dictionary.

26. However, the representatives of the Yenish-speakers have informed the Committee of Experts that the financial support for the umbrella NGO has decreased in the past years from 380 000 CHF (approximately 310 000 EUR) to 250 000 CHF (approximately 205 000 EUR) and only a very small amount (5 000 CHF, approximately 4100 EUR) is foreseen for language related activities. The Committee of Experts asks the Swiss authorities to clarify this issue and provide information in this respect in the next periodical report.

German (Municipality of Bosco-Gurin, Ticino)

27. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to further support the local projects of language maintenance in Bosco-Gurin, especially in education.”

28. The Committee of Experts notes that the cantonal authorities did not support any new projects. They continue to limit their support to the *Walserhaus Gurin* association and to rely on project applications. However, the Charter requires that the authorities adopt a structured approach and, on their initiative, take measures to promote minority languages. The cantonal authorities should consider the adoption of a legal text, regulating the use of German in the municipality of Bosco-Gurin in public life, including in the fields of culture, education and administration, in accordance with Article 7.1-4 of the Charter, and provide for adequate financial subsidies.

⁴ See also 4th Report of the Committee of Experts on Switzerland, ECRML (2010) 8, paragraph 19

29. The association *Walserhaus Gurin* informed the Committee of Experts that the municipality of Bosco-Gurin intends to create the conditions facilitating the return of a number of former inhabitants to Bosco-Gurin. This shall create an opportunity to re-establish the local school, namely a bilingual school (Italian-German), which would also offer lessons in the local Walser German variety. The implementation of this plan requires support from the cantonal authorities, especially regarding financial and regulatory aspects.

30. The Committee of Experts encourages the competent authorities to adopt a structured approach for the protection and promotion of German in Bosco-Gurin.

German (Municipality of Ederswiler, Jura)

31. The Swiss authorities have informed the Committee of Experts that the Canton of Jura adopted in November 2010 new legislation in the field of language use. The new Law on the Use of the French Language⁵ provides for measures to promote the use of French in all domains of public life. It also contains provisions referring indirectly to the municipality of Ederswiler, the only German-speaking municipality in the Canton of Jura.

32. The Committee of Experts notes that, apart from this indirect reference, the cantonal authorities still apply only informal measures responding to ad-hoc requests from the municipality of Ederswiler or to difficulties encountered. For example, German translations of administrative documents are provided only if the local authority has problems in dealing with the French version of the document.

33. The Committee of Experts considers that the specific situation of the municipality of Ederswiler requires a structured policy by the Canton of Jura. The adoption of a specific legal text should be considered to confirm the existing practice, in particular the status of German as the official language of the municipality, to regulate the use of German in relations of the inhabitants and the local authorities with the cantonal authorities and service providers, as well to provide for adequate financial support.

Bilingual cantons

34. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit and to a statement submitted in accordance with Article 16.2 of the Charter, there is no structured approach in the canton of Fribourg/Freiburg with respect to the promotion of bilingualism and the official use of French or German in municipalities where a traditional linguistic minority is present. On the basis of this information it appears that a formal recognition of the traditional linguistic minorities at municipal level and special support for the municipalities where these are present is needed. In addition, a cantonal language law on the official use of French or German and amendments adding relevant provisions to the existing laws should be adopted. The cantonal authorities should further establish a transparent procedure ensuring that the local authorities and civil society in the canton of Fribourg/Freiburg can apply for the subsidies for language promotion activities granted by the federal authorities, on the basis of the Federal Language Law. Finally, an administrative responsible body and a contact person for language policy should be designated at cantonal level.

35. The Committee of Experts has already referred to problems linked to the use of the French language in the Canton of Bern/Berne, in the previous evaluation report. It appears that these problems persist.

36. The Committee of Experts has not been made aware of any problems in the canton of Valais/Wallis.

37. The Committee of Experts notes that there is a lack of structured approach with regard to the protection and promotion of German in the cantons of Jura, Ticino and Fribourg/Freiburg, in the municipalities in these three cantons where German is a minority language. The Committee of Experts encourages the federal authorities, in consultation with the cantons concerned, to make use of the federal funds in order to support a structured policy with respect to German in the above-mentioned cantons.

d. the facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of regional or minority languages, in speech and writing, in public and private life;

Italian

38. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts asked for more information about the initiative to create a post of an Italian-speaking media correspondent in Chur with a view to increasing media reporting about cantonal topics in Italian.

⁵ Loi concernant l'usage de la langue française du 17 novembre 2010, http://rsju.jura.ch/extranet/groups/public/documents/rsju_page/loi_170.61_ia4e772044-3.hcsp

39. According to the fifth periodical report, a court complaint has been submitted against the granting of the license to *Südostschweiz Radio/TV AG*, who had agreed to partly finance the post of Italian-speaking media correspondent. The nomination has therefore been blocked until a decision is reached. Meanwhile, the Italian umbrella organisation has requested the canton of Graubünden/Grigioni/Grischun and the federal authorities to create a post of Italian-speaking media correspondent, financed on the basis of the cantonal and federal law on languages. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts has been informed that this request has been rejected at cantonal level, but is still under consideration at federal level.

40. The authorities further inform that since February 2011, *Grigioni sera*, a 10-minutes regional radio programme in Italian containing news from the canton has been broadcast during week days by Rete Uno (the first radio channel of RSI, *Radiotelevisione svizzera di lingua italiana*). Since February 2012 the programme is available throughout Switzerland. The programme is produced by RSI correspondents in the studios of *Radiotelevision Svizra Rumantscha* RTR in Chur and 2,5 posts have been created to this end.

41. The Committee of Experts welcomes this information. However, it asks the Swiss authorities to provide further information about the setting up of a post of an Italian-speaking media correspondent in the next periodical report.

Yenish

42. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the Swiss authorities to clarify with the representatives of the Yenish-speakers the issue of a possible presence of Yenish on radio.”

43. According to the fifth periodical report, there has been no demand from the Yenish-speakers for radio programmes in Yenish. The authorities explain that there still exists a controversy within the Yenish community regarding the extent to which the language should be accessible to those outside this community.

44. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed by the representatives of the Yenish-speakers that, although they are aware of the need to promote the language, the main obstacle for the presence of Yenish on radio is the lack of specialised staff. The Committee of Experts was also informed that, unlike in the previous years, there is an increased interest in using the Internet in the Yenish community and the authorities are considering using it in the provision of education for Yenish children. Moreover, a DVD about the Yenish, in four languages including Yenish, will be finalised in April 2013 (see also under 7.1.c) The Committee of Experts has also been informed that there exists a quarterly about the Yenish, *Scharotf*, but which is only published in German and French.

45. The Committee of Experts notes that the Internet could be an important tool in the promotion of the language and encourages the authorities to explore this possibility. It further encourages the authorities to examine, in co-operation with the speakers, how Yenish could be promoted in the media.

Bilingual cantons

46. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts was informed of occasional difficulties in communicating in French with the institutions of the canton of Bern/Berne. It was further informed that the canton of Fribourg/Freiburg had not implemented Article 6.3 of the new Constitution of the canton, providing for the official use of French or German in the municipalities with a “significant traditional linguistic minority”. The use of German remained inconsistent.

47. According to the fifth periodical report, the share of French and German civil servants in the institutions of the canton of Bern/Berne depends on the department and level. The French-speakers are well-represented, but at managers’ level, the majority is German-speaking and German remains the dominant working language of canton administration. Therefore, occasional difficulties might exist.

48. As far as the canton of Fribourg/Freiburg is concerned, the authorities report that the new government programme will give particular consideration to the language issues. In addition, in 2011 and 2012 the federal authorities have granted financial support to the canton for French and German language courses for the staff of the canton hospital. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts has been informed that a systematic policy promoting bilingualism in public life is lacking. For example, in administration, bilingual forms are available only at cantonal level, but not in the municipalities. Bilingual French-German signs have been displayed at the railway station in Fribourg/Freiburg and Murten/Morat.

h. the promotion of study and research on regional or minority languages at universities or equivalent institutions;

49. In accordance with the new legal framework (see under 7.1.a), the National Competence Centre of Multilingualism has as objectives to conduct research in the field of language, to create a network of scientific institutions active in the field of multilingualism and to set up a documentation centre on multilingualism. An agreement for research covering the years 2011-2014 has been concluded by the federal authorities with the University of Fribourg and the University of Teacher Education in Fribourg/Freiburg. A three-year research programme is currently running.

50. The federal authorities and the Canton of Ticino are also supporting the activity of the *Osservatorio linguistico della Svizzera italiana*, which is conducting research on the Italian language in Switzerland.

Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to promote, by appropriate measures, mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country and in particular the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages among the objectives of education and training provided within their countries and encouragement of the mass media to pursue the same objective.

51. In accordance with the new legal framework (see under 7.1.a), the federal authorities (Federal Office for Culture) have concluded four years agreements (2012-2015) with Agence Télégraphique Suisse (ATS) and Schweizer Feuilleton Dienst (SFD), supporting them in their activities regarding the language policy, culture and linguistic understanding.

52. In addition, the federal authorities support *fondation.ch*, with the view to promote school exchanges and double the number of those taking part in these activities by 2016. An agreement for 2011-2014 has been concluded with the foundation, which develops exchange programmes and offers services in the field of communication and promotion.

53. The Swiss Parliament adopted in autumn 2011 the Message on Culture 2012-2015, which sets as objectives, *inter alia*, the promotion of cultural diversity and exchanges.

54. The association "The Future of Swiss Travellers", founded and supported by the federal authorities, launched in September 2012 its new website, in German, French and Italian, which provides information on the history and current activities of the Swiss travellers, through articles, photos and audio-visual products. A DVD about the Yenish will be finalised in April 2013 (see under 7.1.c).

55. Since February 2012, *Grigioni sera*, a 10-minutes regional radio programme in Italian containing news from the canton of Graubünden/Grigioni/Grischun has been broadcast throughout Switzerland (see also under 7.1.d).

Paragraph 5

The Parties undertake to apply, mutatis mutandis, the principles listed in paragraphs 1 to 4 above to non-territorial languages. However, as far as these languages are concerned, the nature and scope of the measures to be taken to give effect to this Charter shall be determined in a flexible manner, bearing in mind the needs and wishes, and respecting the traditions and characteristics, of the groups which use the languages concerned.

56. In its evaluation of the situation of Yenish vis-à-vis Article 7 paragraphs 1-4 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts has kept in mind that those principles should be applied *mutatis mutandis*.

3.2. The evaluation in respect of Part III of the Charter

3.2.1. Preliminary remarks on the approach of the Committee of Experts in respect of Part III

57. The languages covered by Part III of the Charter are Romansh, and Italian in the Cantons of Graubünden and Ticino.

58. The Committee of Experts will not comment on provisions in relation to which no major issues were raised in its previous reports and for which it did not receive any new elements requiring a revised assessment. It reserves, however, the right to evaluate the situation again at a later stage.

59. For Romansh, these provisions are the following:
- Articles 8.1.a.iv; c.iii; d.iii; e.ii; f.iii; g; i
 - Articles 9.1.a.iii; b.iii; 9.2.a
 - Articles 10.1.a.i, c; 2.a;b, c, d, ; g; 3.b; 4.c; 5
 - Article 11.1.e.i; f.i; 3
 - Articles 12.1.a; b; c; e; f; g; h; 2; 3
 - Articles 13.1.d; 2.b
 - Article 14.a; b
60. For Italian in the Canton of Graubünden, these provisions are the following:
- Articles 8.1.a.i; b.i; c.i; d.i; e.ii; f.i; g; h; i
 - Articles 9.1.a.i, a.ii, a.iii; b.i, b.ii, b.iii; c.i; c.ii; d; 2.a; 3
 - Articles 10.1.a, b; c; 2.a;b,c, d; g; 3.a; 4.a; b; c; 5
 - Articles 11.1.a.i; e.i; g; 2; 3
 - Articles 12.1.a; b; c; d; e; f; g; h; 2; 3;
 - Article 13.1.d;
 - Articles 14.a; b
61. For Italian in the Canton of Ticino, these provisions are the following:
- Articles 8.1.a.i; b.i; c.i; d.i; e.ii; f.i; g; h; i
 - Articles 9.1.a.i; a.ii; a.iii; b.i; b.ii; b.iii; c.i; c.ii; d; 2.a; 3
 - Articles 10.1.a.i; b; c; 2.a; b; c; d; e; f; g; 3.a; 4.a; b; c; 5
 - Articles 11.1.a.i; e.i; g; 2; 3
 - Articles 12.1.a; b; c; d; e; f; g; h; 2; 3
 - Articles 13.1.d; 2.b
 - Articles 14.a; b

3.2.2. Romansh

Article 8 - Education

Preliminary remarks on the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools

62. In the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Swiss authorities “ensure that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools is done in a way which has a positive impact on the protection and promotion of Romansh as a living language”. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to continue their dialogue with the Romansh-speakers with a view to achieving the greatest possible support for the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun as the standard written form to be taught in schools as well as building confidence in the continued protection and promotion of the regional varieties of Romansh.

63. According to the fifth periodical report 3 different levels (“Pionier”, “Standard” and “Konsolidierung” of pilot classes have been introduced in order to facilitate the promotion of Rumantsch Grischun as a language of teaching literacy and providing for common ground for a standardised approach of Romansh. These measures have not been unanimously well received by all municipalities and parents concerned, some of them expressed (by referendums) a preference for the local written variety.

64. During the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts was informed about the difference of views expressed by the representatives of “Pro idioms” and “Pro Rumantsch”. “Pro idioms” favours the promotion of the five written varieties of Romansh while “Pro Rumantsch” favours the promotion of Rumantsch Grischun as a common written standard in education.

65. In 2011 the so-called coexistence model was adopted, revising the initial decision of the cantonal Parliament of Graubünden from 2003. The co-existence model allows for the teaching of the five varieties of Romansh complemented by Rumantsch Grischun as a sixth form of expression.

66. The Committee of Experts looks forward to receive information on how matters develop. The Committee underlines that a structured form of dialogue would be most welcomed in order to make the *co-existence model* work in practice.

Paragraph 1

With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:

b. i. to make available primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages;

67. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts requested the competent Swiss authorities to submit further information about the introduction of *Frühenglisch* [early teaching of English in primary school] and its implications on the teaching of Romansh as a second language.

68. According to the fifth periodical report it is still too early to make an evaluation about possible repercussions of the introduction of *Frühenglisch* on the teaching of Romansh, as the changes foreseen will only be implemented as from 2012/13 onwards.

69. During the on-the-spot visit the authorities confirmed that the introduction of *Frühenglisch* would only start in 2012/13 at the level of the 5th class, but this would not interfere with the teaching of Romansh.

70. The Committee considers this undertaking fulfilled and asks the competent Swiss authorities to provide, in the next periodical report, further information concerning the impact of *Frühenglisch* on the teaching of Romansh.

h to provide the basic and further training of the teachers required to implement those of paragraphs a to g accepted by the Party;

71. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking still fulfilled, but, in view of the reorganisation of teacher training, “encourage [d] the cantonal authorities to look into the issue as a matter of priority and to explore possible solutions for the future”.

72. According to the fifth periodical report all Romansh schools are having at their disposal a sufficient number of teachers at primary level to ensure adequate teaching in Romansh in all municipalities concerned. At secondary level the discussions are still under way between different partners concerned: the cantons, the federal authorities and the universities.

73. During the on-the-spot visit the representative of the *Pädagogische Hochschule Graubünden*, informed the Committee of Experts that the capacities and level of teachers to be provided at primary level is still considered to be sufficient, but additional training capacities will be needed in order to ensure adequate teacher training at secondary level. There are facilities for the training of secondary teachers in Romansh at the universities of Zurich and Fribourg, there seems to be a risk for the sustainability of these facilities, as the discontinuation of the chair of Romansh in Fribourg has demonstrated. The number of secondary teachers trained to provide education in Romansh seems to be too low to serve the future needs of the Romansh educational system.

74. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled regarding primary education. The Committee of Experts is not in the position to conclude with respect to teacher training on secondary level. It encourages the competent Swiss authorities to take positive measures to ensure secondary teacher training in Romansh.

Article 9 - Judicial authorities

Paragraph 1

The Parties undertake, in respect of those judicial districts in which the number of residents using the regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below, according to the situation of each of these languages and on condition that the use of the facilities afforded by the present paragraph is not considered by the judge to hamper the proper administration of justice:

In criminal proceedings:

a. ...

ii. to guarantee the accused the right to use his/her regional or minority language;

In civil proceedings:

b. ...

- ii. *to allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use his or her regional or minority language without thereby incurring additional expense; - if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations;*

In proceedings before courts concerning administrative matters:

c. ...

- ii. *to allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use his or her regional or minority language without thereby incurring additional expense;*

75. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered these undertakings only formally fulfilled. It “encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to clarify, in co-operation with the speakers of Romansh, how the formal possibility of using Romansh in proceedings before judicial authorities can be efficiently implemented in practice.”

76. The fifth periodical report does not contain any specific information concerning the implementation in practice of the possibility to use Romansh before judicial authorities, nor of any consultation with Romansh speakers in that regard. The only information provided in this respect was that lawyers operating on the Romansh language territory are explicitly informing the litigants, the parties to the case that they are allowed to make use of Romansh in proceedings before judicial authorities.

77. During the on-the-spot visit two examples have been referred to, where Romansh has been used during the legal proceedings. The most recent case referred to by the federal authorities (Federal court in Lausanne) is dating back to 10 December 2012.

78. Since the Committee of Experts has not received any information regarding the use of Romansh in practice before local courts, it is not in a position to conclude and asks the Swiss authorities to provide for concrete examples in the next periodical report.

Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to make available in the regional or minority languages the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of these languages, unless they are otherwise provided.

79. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled at cantonal level and partly fulfilled at federal level.

80. The fifth periodical report does not contain any concrete information on specific measures taken by the Swiss authorities to provide for translation of the most important national statutory texts in Romansh at federal level.

81. During the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts has been informed that the federal authorities are entrusting the cantonal authorities to provide for translations of important legislative texts stemming from the federal level. At federal level only the three official languages, (German, French and Italian) are part of the constitutional obligations to be covered. An additional linguistic effort has been conceded by Federal authorities in view to promote Romansh.

82. The cantonal authorities of Graubünden declared that they are providing for translation into Romansh of all relevant legislative texts. These translations are produced within a short timeline, following closely the adoption of the original texts. The timeframe indicated by the authorities was of approximately one month. However, the Committee of Experts has not been informed by the Swiss authorities which important national statutory texts have been translated into Romansh. It therefore asks the Swiss authorities to provide detailed information in this regard in the next periodical report.

83. The Committee of Experts nevertheless considers this undertaking fulfilled.

Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services

State Administration

Paragraph 1

Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:

- b. to make available widely used administrative texts and forms for the population in the regional or minority languages or in bilingual versions;*

84. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled regarding the cantonal authorities and not fulfilled concerning the federal authorities.

85. The Committee of Experts has not been informed by the Swiss authorities which administrative texts and forms for the population at federal level are available in Romansh. It therefore asks the Swiss authorities to provide detailed information in this regard in the next periodical report.

86. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking still fulfilled at cantonal level and is not in a position to conclude at federal level.

Local and regional authorities

87. In the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended Switzerland to “organise language training in Romansh for administrative staff”.

88. According to the fifth periodical report financial support has been provided in order to foster multilingualism in the canton of Graubünden. The aim is to develop multilingualism within local authorities and administrations, notably in the field of translations and terminology, as well as offering language training for administrative staff.

89. During the on-the-spot visit the cantonal authorities of Graubünden reaffirmed their commitment to train administrative staff in order to increase their respective languages capacities. According to cantonal authorities, some progress has been made with respect to Romansh. Due to limited resources available for translations the cantonal authorities have to prioritise translation requests and will decide on a case by case basis in the light of needs expressed.

Paragraph 2

In respect of the local and regional authorities on whose territory the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages is such as to justify the measures specified below, the Parties undertake to allow and/or encourage:

- e. the use by regional authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;*

90. In the fourth evaluation report the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking formally fulfilled.

91. The fifth periodical report provided no practical or additional information concerning the use of Romansh in debates in regional assemblies.

92. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts received feedback by the cantonal authorities, that the regional authorities are making use of the regional or minority languages in debates within their respective assemblies.

93. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled.

- f. the use by local authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;*

94. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking formally fulfilled.

95. The fifth periodical report provided no practical information or concrete examples concerning the use of Romansh in local assembly debates.

96. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts has been informed by the cantonal authorities, that the local authorities are making use of the regional or minority languages in their debates.

97. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled.

Paragraph 4

With a view to putting into effect those provisions of paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 accepted by them, the Parties undertake to take one or more of the following measures:

- a. translation or interpretation as may be required;*

98. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking partly fulfilled.

99. During the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts was informed that the translation capacities at cantonal level are still too limited with respect to the needs expressed by the language communities concerned. It considers the undertaking still partly fulfilled and urges the Swiss authorities to strengthen the cantonal translation service.

Article 11 - Media

Paragraph 1

The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:

- a to the extent that radio and television carry out a public service mission:*

- iii to make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer programmes in the regional or minority languages;*

- b. i. to encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one radio station in the regional or minority languages;*

100. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts noted that there is a substantial offer of public radio broadcasting in Romansh.

101. During the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts has been informed that the private radio station "Radio Grischa" is broadcasting one hour per week in Romansh, in conformity with its license conditions.

102. The Committee of Experts observes that there is no private radio station broadcasting exclusively in Romansh. However, in view of the total offer of radio programmes in Romansh, the Committee of Experts considers both undertakings fulfilled.

- c. ...*

- ii. to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of television programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;*

103. In previous evaluation reports, the Committee of Experts considered the amount of television programmes in the public broadcasting system as being highly satisfactory, but considered this undertaking not fulfilled with regard to private broadcasting.

104. According to the fifth periodical report, the regional broadcaster "TeleSüdostschweiz (TSO) is a private service provider with a public mandate and an obligation to produce and broadcast programmes in Romansh. The TeleSüdostschweiz is broadcasting a monthly programme in Romansh, called "Baterlada".

105. In view of the total offer of television programmes in Romansh both undertakings seem to be fulfilled.

3.2.3. Italian

A. Canton of Graubünden

Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraph 2

In respect of the local and regional authorities on whose territory the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages is such as to justify the measures specified below, the Parties undertake to allow and/or encourage:

...

- e. *the use by regional authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;*

106. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking formally fulfilled.

107. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of experts has been informed by the cantonal authorities of Graubünden, that the regional authorities are making use of the regional or minority languages in debates in their respective assemblies.

108. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled

Article 13 – Economic and social life

Paragraph 2

With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake, in so far as the public authorities are competent, within the territory in which the regional or minority languages are used, and as far as this is reasonably possible:

...

- b *in the economic and social sectors directly under their control (public sector), to organise activities to promote the use of regional or minority languages;*

109. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled, but encourages the cantonal authorities to look into these matters. The Committee of Experts was informed that the website of the cantonal hospital in Chur (www.ksgr.ch) is still not available in Italian.

110. During the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts has been informed by the cantonal authorities of Graubünden that the authorities are highly sensitive to this problem and a formal reply has been transmitted to the Italian-speaking community representatives, who have raised this issue again.

111. The cantonal authorities informed the Committee of Experts that additional efforts will be made, with the aim to provide at least for a multilingual entrance to the website, but that the translation capacities of the canton are limited and that this might still take time before becoming fully operational.

112. This kind of difficulty has also been brought to the attention of Committee of Experts with respect to other institutions with a cantonal mandate, such as the Graubünden Cantonal Bank, not providing for information in Italian on their respective website. The authorities are aware of the problem and promised to provide for a multilingual entrance to the website in due course.

113. Based on the information referred to above, the Committee of Experts must revise its former conclusion and considers this undertaking partly fulfilled. It urges the cantonal authorities in Graubünden to take the necessary measures to promote the use of Italian in institutions with cantonal mandates.

B. Canton of Ticino

114. In the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts considered that the Canton of Ticino fulfilled all undertakings regarding the Italian language.

115. According to the information received within the framework of the fifth evaluation cycle the situation with respect to the Canton of Ticino has not changed since the last evaluation report.

Chapter 4 Findings of the Committee of Experts in the fifth monitoring round

A. The Committee of Experts expresses its gratitude to the Swiss authorities for their exemplary and smooth co-operation in the fifth monitoring cycle, in particular with respect to the organisation of the on-the-spot visit. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts wishes to thank the Swiss authorities for having responded in the periodical report to the requests for information by the Committee of Experts. Switzerland has taken significant steps to improve the situation of the regional or minority languages spoken on its territory. The adoption of the federal language law and of the entry into force of Graubünden's cantonal language law in 2010 significantly improves the legislative protection of Romansh and Italian in Graubünden, but Italian and Romansh would still need additional support by the cantonal authorities.

B. The Swiss federal authorities and the associations representing the speakers of Yenish remain committed to protecting and promoting it. The Swiss authorities have carried out regular consultations with the Yenish-speakers which led to a project on Yenish that was proposed by the Yenish umbrella association. This project aims at registering the vocabulary of Yenish and promoting its dissemination and use within the Yenish community. Currently the elaboration of a dictionary is under preparation, with the support of the federal authorities, helping to establish a common reference framework for Yenish speakers, who still need to re-learn and re-establish their culture and language, also within their own language community.

C. The overall provision of education in Romansh remains good. Rumantsch Grischun was gradually introduced in schools including the necessity to elaborate new teaching materials. The canton's strategy, which is supported by the Lia Rumantscha, has so far been endorsed at regional and local level by a number of municipalities. However, a considerable number of Romansh municipalities still have strong reservations towards the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun due to fears that this might be to the detriment of the varieties of Romansh ("idioms"). Some municipalities decided to go back to the idioms after having previously introduced Rumantsch Grischun in schools. The cantonal authorities are in favour of a so-called *co-existence model*, where the five written varieties should co-exist together with the Rumantsch Grischun. In order to try to best accommodate the five varieties of Romansh together with the standardised form of Rumantsch Grischun at school level, a structured dialogue between all parties concerned should be put in place.

D. Concerning teacher training in Romansh projections show that there will be a shortage of Romansh teachers at secondary level. This shortage may increase even more if the relevant university chairs are discontinued.

E. Romansh is rarely used in practice before courts. Efforts are needed to increase the use of the language in court proceedings.

F. According to the cantonal language law, the cantonal authorities are obliged to use Romansh in communications with Romansh-speaking citizens and municipalities with Romansh as an official language. The situation is fairly good at local level, where Romansh is regularly used in dealings of citizens with the administration and is also used as an internal working language of some local authorities. However, additional language training is needed for the administrative staff of municipalities with Romansh as an official language. The merger of municipalities presents particular challenges in maintaining the use of Romansh in local administrations. The forthcoming merger of Glion/Ilanz Plus might constitute an interesting test case.

G. The amount of Romansh language radio broadcasting is exemplary mainly due to the offers of the public broadcasters. There is also a satisfactory offer of television programmes.

H. The situation of the Italian language in Graubünden is overall satisfactory. Problems remain regarding the use of Italian in connection with the delivery of public services by cantonal entities.

I. In respect of the Italian language in the Canton of Ticino all undertakings chosen from the Charter are fulfilled.

J. Finally, there is a wish expressed by the Franco-Provençal speakers for their language to be covered by the Charter. Franco-Provençal is spoken in several cantons in the French-speaking part of Switzerland, but the Committee of Experts lacks a comprehensive overview of its status and situation in policy and practice.

The Swiss government was invited to comment on the content of this report in accordance with Article 16.3 of the Charter. The comments received are attached in Appendix II.

On the basis of this report and its findings the Committee of Experts submitted its proposals to the Committee of Ministers for recommendations to be addressed to Switzerland. At the same time it emphasised the need for the Swiss authorities to take in to account, in addition to these general recommendations, the more detailed observations contained in the body of the report.

At its 1176th meeting on 10 July 2013, the Committee of Ministers adopted its Recommendations addressed to Switzerland, which is set out in Part B of this document.

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification

SWITZERLAND

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 23 December 1997 - Or. Fr.

The Swiss Federal Council declares, in accordance with Article 3, paragraph 1, of the Charter, that in Switzerland Romansh and Italian are the less widely used official languages to which the following paragraphs chosen in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, of the Charter, shall apply:

a. Romansh

Article 8 (education)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iv), b (i), c (iii), d (iii), e (ii), f (iii), g, h, i

Article 9 (judicial authorities)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (ii), a (iii), b (ii), b (iii), c (ii)

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a

Paragraph 3

Article 10 (administrative authorities and public services)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b, c

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g

Paragraph 3, sub-paragraph b

Paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs a, c

Paragraph 5

Article 11 (media)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), b (i), c (ii), e (i), f (i)

Paragraph 3

Article 12 (cultural activities and facilities)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, e, f, g, h

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3

Article 13 (economic and social life)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraph d

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph b

Article 14 (transfrontier exchanges)

Sub-paragraph a

Sub-paragraph b

b. Italian

Article 8 (education)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), a (iv), b (i), c (i), c (ii), d (i), d (iii), e (ii), f (i), f (iii), g, h, i

Article 9 (judicial authorities)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), a (ii), a (iii), b (i), b (ii), b (iii), c (i), c (ii), d

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a

Paragraph 3

Article 10 (administrative authorities and public services)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b, c

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g

Paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b

Paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs a, b, c

Paragraph 5

Article 11 (media)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), e (i), g

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3

Article 12 (cultural activities and facilities)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g, h

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3

Article 13 (economic and social life)

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraph d

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph b

Article 14 (transfrontier exchanges)

Sub-paragraph a

Sub-paragraph b.

Period covered: 01/04/98 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s): 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 2, 3, 8, 9

Appendix II: Comments from the Swiss authorities

The Swiss authorities have studied the comments made by the Charter Committee of Experts. The points raised will be taken into consideration for the current three-year period. Targeted efforts will be made to take account of the Committee of Experts' recommendations and details will be set out in the next periodical report by Switzerland.

The Swiss authorities would like to clarify some points mentioned in the report.

- § 20-21 Within the federal institutions, each individual staff member is entitled to work and communicate in the official language he or she chooses. It is true that German is used more widely than French or Italian, given the higher number of German-speaking staff members. A distinction should be made between the measures to promote plurilingualism within the federal institutions and the measures to promote and encourage plurilingualism and cultural diversity in society. The measures in the former case do concern the areas of the representation of minority linguistic communities within federal institutions, improvements in linguistic competences, access to language teaching for federal government staff, the post of a delegate for plurilingualism and the creation of additional translators' posts. The other points in the order on languages (education, bilingual education, support for organisations and also support for the plurilingual cantons, as well as Graubünden/Grischun/Grigioni and Ticino) concern the promotion of languages in society.
- § 26 Since 2006, federal support for the Travellers' umbrella organisation (Radgenossenschaft der Landstrasse) has been approximately CHF 250 000. The ordinary support was only higher for a few years (2003-2005) (maximum of CHF 300 000 rather than CHF 380 000). Following parliamentary decisions on rationalising public finances, however, the support had to be reduced to its usual level of approximately CHF 250 000. The additional annual sum of CHF 5 000 is used for daily allowances of CHF 350 for Travellers at international organisations, in particular the Council of Europe. Travellers also receive occasional support for projects to promote and protect the Yeshiva language. This financial support is additional funding which is not included in the total of CHF 250 000.
- § 34 Support for plurilingual cantons is arranged through agreements between the federal government and the individual cantons. It is used to promote bi/plurilingualism within the *cantonal* authorities and for education purposes. Municipalities are not entitled to funding of this kind, which is designed to promote bi/plurilingualism at cantonal level; the aim here is to foster linguistic and cultural exchanges between the language communities in the cantons with a view to creating an environment and a society in which cantonal bilingualism flourishes.
- § 44 *Scharotl* is only published in German.
- § 45 The Internet is clearly a useful tool for promoting languages. The Yeshiva have not, however, indicated any desire for their language to be promoted more widely in the media. Nevertheless, the Federal Office for Culture has stated its willingness to consider possible support for a school project involving the use of Skype to foster remote learning for Yeshiva children when they are travelling.

B. Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter by Switzerland

Recommendation CM/RecChL(2013)4 of the Committee of Ministers on the application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages by Switzerland

*(Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 10 July 2013
at the 1176th meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)*

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Having regard to the instrument of ratification submitted by Switzerland on 23 December 1997;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts on the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Switzerland;

Having taken note of the comments made by the Swiss authorities on the contents of the Committee of Experts' report;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Switzerland in its fifth periodical report, supplementary information provided by the Swiss authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Switzerland and the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit,

Recommends that the authorities of Switzerland take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. ensure that the introduction and establishment of Rumantsch Grischun in schools takes into account the traditionally used idioms in order to protect and promote Romansh as a living language;
2. promote the use of Italian in the economic and social public sector under the control of the canton of Graubünden.