

## *Adult Migrants: Integration and Education*

EXTRACTS FROM CONVENTIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS, RESOLUTIONS  
AND REPORTS

The Committee of Ministers (CM)  
The Parliamentary Assembly (PACE)  
The Congress of Local and Regional Authorities

*Compiled by the Language Policy Programme*

Education Policy Division  
Education Department, DG II  
Council of Europe, Strasbourg

[www.coe.int/lang](http://www.coe.int/lang) / [www.coe.int/lang-migrants](http://www.coe.int/lang-migrants)



## CONTENTS

1.	CONVENTIONS .....	7
1.1.	European Convention on the Legal status of Migrant Workers .....	7
1.2.	European Social Charter (revised).....	7
2.	COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS TO MEMBER STATES .....	8
2.1.	Resolution (68) 18 on the teaching of languages to migrant workers .....	8
2.2.	Recommendation No. R (82) 18 concerning Modern Languages.....	8
2.3.	Recommendation No. R (84) 18 on the training of teachers in education for intercultural understanding, notably in a context of migration .....	9
2.4.	Recommendation No. R (98) 6 concerning Modern Languages.....	10
2.5.	Recommendation CM/Rec(2008) 7 on the use of the Council of Europe's Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) and the promotion of plurilingualism .....	10
2.6.	Recommendation CM/Rec (2008) 10 on improving access of migrants and persons of immigrant background to employment.....	11
2.7.	Recommendation CM/Rec (2011) 2 on validating migrants' skills .....	12
2.8.	Recommendation (2012)13 on ensuring quality education .....	13
3.	PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY.....	15
	A) ADOPTED TEXTS <sup>15</sup>	
3.1.	Recommendation 712 (1973) on the integration of migrant workers with the society of their host countries.....	15
3.2.	Resolution 631 (1976) on the integration of migrants into society as regards education and cultural development.....	15
3.3.	Recommendation 786 (1976) on the education and cultural development of migrants	15
3.4.	Recommendation 915 (1981) on the situation of migrant workers in the host countries	16
3.5.	Recommendation 1206 (1993) on the integration of migrants and community relations	16
3.6.	Recommendation 1383 (1998) on Linguistic Diversification.....	16
3.7.	Recommendation 1500 (2001) on the participation of immigrants and foreign residents in political life in the Council of Europe member states .....	17
3.8.	Recommendation 1539 (2001) on the European Year of Languages .....	17
3.9.	Recommendation 1625 (2003) on Policies for the integration of immigrants in Council of Europe member states.....	17
	3.9.1. <i>Reply adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 14 April 2004 to Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 1625 (2003)</i>	18
	3.9.2. <i>Opinion of the Steering Committee for Education (CD-ED) on Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 1625 (2003)</i>	18
3.10.	Resolution 1437 (2005) on Migration and integration: a challenge and an opportunity for Europe .....	18

3.11. Resolution 1511 (2006) on Migration, refugees and population in the context of the 3rd Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe .....	19
3.12. Resolution 1611(2008) on Immigration from sub-Saharan Africa .....	19
3.13. Resolution 1617 (2008) State of democracy in Europe Specific challenges facing European democracies: the case of diversity and migration .....	19
3.14. Resolution 1618 (2008) State of democracy in Europe Measures to improve the democratic participation of migrants.....	20
3.15. Resolution 1639 (2008) Migration and mobility in the Euro-Asian region – Prospects for the future .....	20
3.16. Resolution 1718 (2010) The impact of the global economic crisis on migration in Europe .....	20
3.17. Recommendation 1917 (2010) – Migrants and refugees: a continuing challenge for the Council of Europe.....	21
3.18. Resolution 1811 (2011) - Protecting migrant women in the labour market.....	21
3.19. Resolution 1973 (2014): Integration tests: helping or hindering integration?.....	22
3.20. Recommendation 2034 (2014): Integration tests: helping or hindering integration?.....	22
<i>Reply of the Committee of Ministers to Recommendation 2034(2014)</i>	22
3.21. Resolution 2006 (2014) Integration of migrants in Europe: the need for a proactive, long-term and global policy .....	23
3.22. Resolution 2088 (2016) The Mediterranean Sea: a front door to irregular migration.....	23
3.23. Resolution 2097 (2016) on access to school and education for all children .....	24
3.24. Resolution 2123 (2016) on Culture and democracy.....	24
3.25. Resolution 2124 (2016) on educational and cultural networks of migrant and diaspora communities .....	24
3.26. Resolution 2137 (2016) on the impact of European population dynamics on migration policies.....	25
3.27. Resolution 2159 (2017) on protecting refugee women and girls from gender-based violence.....	25
3.28. Resolution 2173 (2017) on a comprehensive humanitarian and political response to the migration and refugee crisis and the continuing flows into Europe .....	26
3.29. Resolution 2175 (2017) on migration as an opportunity for European development.....	26
3.30. Resolution 2176 (2017) The integration of refugees in times of critical pressure: learning from recent experience and examples of.....	26
B) ( <i>for information</i> ) MOTION FOR A RECOMMENDATION - NOT EXAMINED BY PACE	27
3.31. Motion for a recommendation on Human rights and democratic concerns for the integration of migrants (Document 11345 - 3 July 2007).....	27
4. THE CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES .....	29
4.1. Resolution 62 (1968) on the settlement of migrant workers in foreign local communities .....	29
4.2. Recommendation 105 (2001) on “Linguistic diversity: a challenge for European cities and regions” Conclusions of the Rovinj Conference, Croatia, 22 and 23 March 2001.....	29
4.3. Recommendation 153 (2004) on “A pact for the integration and participation of people of immigrant origin in Europe’s towns, cities and regions” .....	29

4.4. Resolution 181 (2004) on “A pact for the integration and participation of people of immigrant origin in Europe’s towns, cities and regions” .....	30
4.5. Resolution 218 (2006) on effective access to social rights for immigrants: the role of local and regional authorities .....	30
4.6. Resolution 318 (2010) on cultural integration of Muslim women in European cities	31
4.7. Recommendation 365 (2014) on promoting diversity through intercultural education and communication strategies .....	31
4.8. Resolution 375 (2014) on promoting diversity through intercultural education and communication strategies .....	32
4.9. Recommendation 394 (2017) From reception to integration: the role of local and regional authorities facing migration.....	33
4.10 Resolution 411 (2017) From reception to integration: the role of local and regional authorities facing migration.....	34
4.11 Declaration 4 (2015) on the reception of refugees in Europe .....	34

The project Linguistic Integration of Adult Migrants (LIAM) conducted by the Language Policy Programme of the Council of Europe aims to help member states to develop inclusive language policies based on Council of Europe shared values: respect for human rights and the dignity of the person, democracy and the rule of law. Effective respect for these fundamental principles requires a coordinated and principled approach to language policy which cuts across different domains of integration policy (social, employment, health...), and an awareness of the mutual rights and responsibilities of migrants and societies (see [Guiding Principles](#) – LIAM Project).

The Council of Europe has elaborated standard setting instruments and recommendations which set out the principles governing actions in the migration field. These are complemented by language policy guidelines and reference tools developed to support their effective implementation in an inclusive approach based on shared values and principles developed within the LIAM Project ([www.coe.int/lang-migrants](http://www.coe.int/lang-migrants))

This document contains a compilation of texts from Council of Europe conventions, recommendations and resolutions.

Revised and enriched version – November 2017.

## 1. CONVENTIONS

[\[http://conventions.coe.int\]](http://conventions.coe.int)

### 1.1. European Convention on the Legal status of Migrant Workers

ECT 093 (24.XI.1977)

The member States of the Council of Europe, signatory hereto, [...] have agreed as follows:

#### **Article 14 – Pretraining – Schooling – Linguistic training – Vocational training and retraining**

1. Migrant workers and members of their families officially admitted to the territory of a Contracting Party shall be entitled, on the same basis and under the same conditions as national workers, to general education and vocation training and retraining and shall be granted access to higher education according to the general regulations governing admission to respective institutions in the receiving State.

2. To promote access to general and vocational schools and to vocational training centres, the receiving State shall facilitate the teaching of its language or, if there are several, one of its languages to migrant workers and members of their families.

### 1.2. European Social Charter (revised)

ECT 163 (3.V.1996)

The governments signatory hereto, being members of the Council of Europe, [...] have agreed as follows:

#### **Part II**

The Parties undertake [...] to consider themselves bound by the obligations laid down in the following articles and paragraphs.

#### **Article 19 – The right of migrant workers and their families to protection and assistance**

With a view to ensuring the effective exercise of the right of migrant workers and their families to protection and assistance in the territory of any other Party, the Parties undertake:

11. to promote and facilitate the teaching of the national language of the receiving state or, if there are several, one of these languages, to migrant workers and members of their families;

12. to promote and facilitate, as far as practicable, the teaching of the migrant worker's mother tongue to the children of the migrant worker.

## 2. COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS TO MEMBER STATES

[<http://www.coe.int/t/cm>]

### **2.1. Resolution (68) 18 on the teaching of languages to migrant workers**

The Committee of Ministers,

[...]

Considering that some knowledge of the language of the reception country is indispensable both for the migrant worker's adaptation to and success in his new milieu and for his occupational training or further training;

Aware of the need to extend language teaching to the wife and children of migrant workers, bearing in mind, notably, that for children knowledge of the language is a pre-requisite for schooling in the new country;

Considering that the primary aim of migrant workers in learning the language of the reception country is to be able to express themselves in it and that they therefore seek study methods leading to rapid results rather than methods entailing the lengthy exercises which characterise language teaching in schools;

Considering that the home countries, immigration countries and public authorities and private bodies employing migrant workers should do their utmost to assist migrants wishing to learn the language of the reception country, and to facilitate the provision of the most effective types of language course;

Noting that for migrants language study is mainly a means to an end;

[...]

Invites member governments to:

(i) make greater efforts to enable all migrant workers who so desire to learn the language of the reception country;

(ii) provide wives and children of migrant workers also with special facilities for learning the language of the reception country, notably by the provision of courses corresponding to their special needs;

(iv) if possible, to combine language teaching in the reception country with vocational training destined to enable migrant workers to acquire skills or enhance their qualifications.

### **2.2. Recommendation No. R (82) 18 concerning Modern Languages**

The Committee of Ministers, [...]

Considering that the aim of the Council of Europe is to achieve greater unity between its members and that this aim can be pursued in particular by the adoption of common action in the cultural field;

Considering that the rich heritage of diverse languages and cultures in Europe is a valuable common resource to be protected and developed, and that a major educational effort is needed to convert that diversity from a barrier to communication into a source of mutual enrichment and understanding;

[...]

Recommends the governments of member states, in the framework of their national policies and systems, and national cultural development policies, to implement by all available means and within the limits of available resources, the measures set out in the appendix to the present recommendation;

#### Appendix to Recommendation No. R (82) 18

D. Language learning by migrants and their families

10. To promote the provision of adequate facilities for migrant workers and the members of their families:

10.1. to acquire sufficient knowledge of the language of the host community for them to play an active part in the working, political and social life of that community, and in particular to enable the children of



migrants to acquire a proper education and to prepare them for the transition from full-time education to work;

10.2. to develop their mother tongues both as educational and cultural instruments and in order to maintain and improve their links with their culture of origin.

11. To promote the introduction and development of appropriate initial and further training programmes for teachers of languages to migrants, leading to recognised qualifications;

12. To participate in the development of language programmes involving co-operation between authorities or other bodies representing the host community, the migrant community and the country of origin, especially with regard to the production of teaching materials, teacher training and mother tongue development.

### **2.3. Recommendation No. R (84) 18 on the training of teachers in education for intercultural understanding, notably in a context of migration**

The Committee of Ministers,

[...]

5. Considering that the societies with multicultural features created in Europe by the population movements of recent decades are an irreversible and generally positive development, in that they may help to further closer links between the peoples of Europe as well as between Europe and other parts of the world;

6. Considering that flourishing relations in all fields require a fuller understanding of the cultures and ways of life of other peoples as well as, in the event of their common cultural heritage;

7. Considering that the presence in schools in Europe of millions of children from foreign cultural communities constitutes a source of enrichment and a major medium- and long-term asset, provided that education policies are geared to fostering open-mindedness and an understanding of cultural differences;

8. Considering the essential role of teachers in helping such pupils to integrate into school and society, as well as in developing mutual understanding;

10. Considering that, in order to fulfil this task, the training given to teachers should equip them to adopt an intercultural approach and be based on an awareness of the enrichment constituted by intercultural understanding and of the value and originality of each culture;

12. Considering, too, that teachers issuing from migrant populations are particularly suited to creating with their pupils an educational process which takes account of the interaction of the features of their cultures of origin and of their host milieu;

I. Recommends:

A. *that the governments of member states...*

1. make the intercultural dimension and the understanding between different communities a feature of initial and in-service teacher training, and in particular:

1.1. train teachers in such a way that they:

- become aware of the various forms of cultural expression present in their own national cultures, and in migrant communities;

- recognise that ethnocentric attitudes and stereotyping can damage individuals, and therefore, make an attempt to counteract their influence

- realise that they too should become agents of a process of cultural exchange and develop and use strategies for approaching, understanding and giving due consideration to other cultures as well as educating their pupils to give due consideration to them;

- become aware of social exchanges existing between the country of origin and the host country not only in the cultural field but also in their historical dimension;

- become conscious of the economic, social, political and historical causes and effects of migration;

2. encourage the development and use of appropriate materials to support the intercultural approach in the training of teachers and in school in order to give a “truer” image of the different cultures of their pupils;

4. where appropriate, encourage the holding of national and international seminars and courses on the intercultural approach to education for teachers, teacher trainers, administrators and other persons involved in teacher-training, including welfare and labour officers who have close professional relations with migrant families;

7. promote the circulation of the material on intercultural education and training developed under the auspices of the Council of Europe;

#### **2.4. Recommendation No. R (98) 6 concerning Modern Languages**

The Committee of Ministers,

[...]

Recognising the progress which member states have made since its Recommendation No. R (82) 18 concerning modern languages, whose principles are today more important and more relevant than ever;

Aware of the dangers that might result from marginalisation of those who lack the skills necessary to communicate in an interactive Europe;

Recommends that governments of member states:

- [...] in accordance with their constitutional set-up, national or local circumstances and their education system, use every available means to implement the measures set out in the appendix hereto in their education policies and systems and their cultural development policies;

*Appendix to Recommendation No. R (98) 6*

*A. General measures and principles*

1. Pursue education policies which:

1.2. develop learners' respect for other ways of life and equip them for an intercultural world, in particular through

*F. Bilingual education in bilingual or multilingual areas*

22. Take the necessary steps, particularly - although not only - in bilingual or multilingual areas to ensure that:

22.2. there is parity of esteem between all the languages and cultures involved so that children in each community may have the opportunity to develop oracy and literacy in the language of their own community as well as to learn to understand and appreciate the language and culture of the other;

23. Continue to promote bilingualism in immigrant areas or neighbourhoods and support immigrants in learning the language of the area in which they reside.

*G. Specification of objectives and assessment*

29. Promote the development of varied forms of assessment and recognition of plurilingual competences which take into account the considerable diversity of needs, paying particular attention to the definition of objectives for partial competences and the assessment of their attainment.

#### **2.5. Recommendation CM/Rec(2008) 7 on the use of the Council of Europe's Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) and the promotion of plurilingualism**

*(Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 2 July 2008 at the 1031st meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)*

The Committee of Ministers, under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe,

Considering that the aim of the Council of Europe is to achieve greater unity among its members and that this aim is to be pursued in particular by the adoption of common action in educational and cultural matters;

[...]

Emphasising the present and future political importance of developing specific actions and strategies to promote plurilingualism and to diversify and intensify language learning in a pan-European context;

Bearing in mind the benefits to member states of the Council of Europe's achievements in the field of language education;

[...]

Taking into account:

– the added value of the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) and of other related instruments elaborated by the Council of Europe for the development and implementation of language education policies in member states;

[...]

– the conclusions of the 2007 Intergovernmental Policy Forum entitled “The Common European Framework of Reference for Languages and the development of language policies: challenges and responsibilities”, which was organised by the Language Policy Division of the Council of Europe in Strasbourg from 6 to 8 February 2007,

Recommends that governments of member states:

– use every available means in accordance with their constitution, their national, regional or local circumstances and their education system to implement the measures set out in Appendix 1 to this recommendation with respect to the development of their language education policies;

A. General principles and measures to be implemented by authorities responsible for language education at national, regional and local level

National, regional and local education authorities are invited to:

1. create and/or maintain conditions favourable to the use of the CEFR as a tool for coherent, transparent and effective plurilingual education in such a way as to promote democratic citizenship, social cohesion and intercultural dialogue, in keeping with Council of Europe policy as reaffirmed by the Third Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe (Warsaw, 2005);

[...]

2.3. provide guidance for the diversification of language learning within educational systems in order to maintain and develop plurilingualism among citizens of Europe as a means of knowledge building and skills development, with a view to enhancing social cohesion and intercultural understanding;

2.4. encourage learners, teachers, teacher trainers, course designers, textbook authors, curriculum developers, examining bodies and education administrators to:

2.4.1. adopt a learner-focused, action-oriented, competence-based approach;

2.4.2. take into consideration the social and cultural dimensions of language learning;

## **2.6. Recommendation CM/Rec (2008) 10 on improving access of migrants and persons of immigrant background to employment**

The Committee of Ministers, under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe, [...]

Recalling the 1950 Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ETS No. 5) and its protocols;

Recalling the 1996 revised European Social Charter (ETS No. 163); [...]

Recommends that, with a view to ensuring the fullest possible integration of migrants and persons of immigrant background in the labour market, the governments of the member states:

i. review the effectiveness of all relevant policy and practice in their country and, for this purpose, establish an effective system of evaluation and efficiency control;

ii. implement, where necessary and in relation to the areas specified below, measures based on the general principles and guidelines set out in the appendix:

general measures;

- entry and re-entry into the labour market;
- recruitment;
- career development.

[...]

Guidelines on Integration and readmission to the labour market [...]

16. Newly arrived migrants should benefit from short introduction sessions in order to facilitate their integration into the labour market. These sessions should be designed to provide migrants with the minimum linguistic skills, practical information and knowledge of the receiving society and its labour market.

- Persons intending to emigrate as part of a work permit or family reunion scheme might also benefit from such sessions before leaving their country of origin.
- In order to ensure their effectiveness, introduction sessions should be delivered, so far as possible, in the mother tongue of the migrant or in a language that he or she understands.
- In principle, participation in the sessions should be voluntary

## II. Language training

19. Adequate knowledge of the language of the country in which they live is the most important means by which migrants can successfully enter into the labour market. Migrants should be actively encouraged to participate in language training programmes. Participation in language courses that lead to acquiring formal language proficiency certificates might, if national legislation requires, be made compulsory.

20. Languages courses for migrants should be adapted to their different needs and include workplace-related language skills. For this purpose, the following factors should be taken into account:

- length of residence in the country;
- educational level and field;
- professional experience;
- mother tongue.

21. Language courses should be provided by the relevant national or local authorities in co-operation with employers, trade unions, professional organisations, NGOs and migrants' associations.

22. A system of quality control should be established in order to guarantee the content of the language courses and the qualifications of the trainers.

[...]

## II. Training

37. Incentives for continual participation in language training (particularly training aimed at improving work-related skills) should be offered by employers to migrants.

38. Employers should ensure that migrants and persons of immigrant background in their employment have equal access to opportunities for promotion through the provision of training and re-training programmes.

### **2.7. Recommendation CM/Rec (2011) 2 on validating migrants' skills**

*(Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 19 January 2011 at the 1103rd meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)*

The Committee of Ministers, under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe,

[...]

Guidelines

*A. Information, guidance and assistance for migrants*

15. Information on how to validate their skills should be made freely available to migrants and be provided to all newly-arrived migrants by the appropriate government service, notably by the employment and/or migration service. Where introductory programmes for migrants exist, information on validating skills and competences should be an integral part of these programmes.

16. Identification of a migrant's skills and qualifications should be undertaken as early as possible upon his or her arrival; thereafter each migrant should receive:

- detailed guidance on validation and/or retraining and assistance in completing necessary administrative procedures; and
- a personal portfolio or competence passport designed to show his or her relevant learning experience and professional competence.

17. Specific and additional assistance to migrants should include:

- individual counselling and guidance with a view to supporting them in passing through a formative assessment process and identifying their training or retraining needs;
- advice on presenting their skills to employers and preparing job applications (including assistance in presenting their portfolios or competence passports);
- the possibility to take part in language and occupation-specific communication courses.

18. The bodies responsible for validating skills and competences should inform migrants in advance and in detail about the content of the validation process, relevant requirements and expectations, as well as about the professional standards they are expected to meet.

19. Migrant associations should be informed about the processes and procedures for validating or recognising skills and competences and encouraged to disseminate this information among migrants.

#### *B. Validating migrants' skills and competences*

20. The bodies responsible for validating skills and competences should be recognised, competent and independent, and work in close partnership with relevant governmental services and employers.

21. Assessment of a migrant's skills and competences should be undertaken against the relevant professional standards and requirements prevailing in the member state.

22. Assessment of a migrant's skills and competences may be carried out through practical tests, examinations, simulation exercises, interviews and other appropriate means.

[...]

### **2.8. Recommendation (2012)13 on ensuring quality education**

The Committee of Ministers, under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe,

Considering that the aim of the Council of Europe is to achieve greater unity among its members and that this aim can be pursued notably by common action in educational and cultural matters;

Having regard to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ETS No. 5, 1950), in particular its Protocol No. 1 (ETS No. 9, 1952) and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948);

Having regard in particular to their provisions establishing the right to education;

[...]

Having regard to the European Convention on the Legal Status of Migrant Workers (ETS No. 93, 1977);

[...]

Considering that ensuring that everyone can benefit from a quality education is a matter of individual justice as well as the best possible use of the resources of our societies;

Considering that ensuring quality education is a public responsibility;

[...]

Considering that while access to education is in itself an important right, the true value of this right can only be realised if education is of adequate quality and if learning opportunities and arrangements enable pupils and students to complete their education in reasonable time and under conditions conducive to quality education;

[...]

Considering that in democratic societies, everybody should enjoy equal opportunities so that they can exercise their right to education and benefit from a quality education, commensurate with their aspirations and abilities;

[...]

Scope and definitions

[...]

4. While general in scope, the recommendation recognises that in the case of some individuals and groups, including those whose [...] conditions put them at particular disadvantage, special measures may be required to ensure quality education.

[...]

6. For the purposes of this recommendation, “quality education” is understood as education which:

a. gives access to learning to all pupils and students, particularly those in vulnerable [...] groups, adapted to their needs as appropriate;

[...]

9. The terms “pupils” and “students” designate persons enrolled in an education programme.

[...]

Lifelong learning

23. Individuals should also have access to quality education in lifelong learning which develops and updates their competences and ensures that their full potential as citizens is developed.

24. Therefore, public authorities should provide a framework within their education systems which encourages lifelong learning through alternative learning paths, recognition of prior learning qualifications and other measures. Special efforts should be directed at those who have been unable [...] to make adequate use of other opportunities for education, including those who have left the education system with inadequate qualifications or none at all.

### 3. PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

[\[http://assembly.coe.int\]](http://assembly.coe.int)

#### A) ADOPTED TEXTS

#### **3.1. Recommendation 712 (1973) on the integration of migrant workers with the society of their host countries**

The Assembly,

[...]

9. Recommends that the Committee of Ministers invite the governments of immigration countries among Council of Europe member States:

(i) to adopt a policy for improving the situation of migrant workers and for integrating them more easily and quickly with the society of their host countries ;

#### **3.2. Resolution 631 (1976) on the integration of migrants into society as regards education and cultural development**

The Assembly,

[...]

2. Noting that migrants can be a source of cultural enrichment for society;

3. Considering that every possible step to facilitate the integration of migrants into society should be taken as a matter of urgency;

4. Recognising that governments, and also the societies, of host countries and emigration countries have a common responsibility towards migrants;

6. Calls upon all its members:

- to give their support to co-operation between the countries concerned, at the level both of governments and of communities, in the education and cultural development of migrants ;

[...]

- to invite governments to carry out an effective programme of action to assist migrants and foster their integration into society.

#### **3.3. Recommendation 786 (1976) on the education and cultural development of migrants**

The Assembly:

[...]

2. Convinced that a variety of cultures can be a source of mutual enrichment for the societies concerned, but fearing that the educational and cultural difficulties encountered by migrants may aggravate the social problems;

3. Believing that migrants contribute to the unification of Europe, but that improved information is needed in order to dissipate misunderstanding and prejudice, both in the host countries and in the emigration countries;

12. Recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

a. invite member governments to implement with greater vigour the texts adopted in the Council of Europe concerning migrants, especially Resolution (70) 35, on school education for the children of migrant workers

c. invite member governments to provide greater resources and step up the training of personnel to be responsible for the education and cultural development of migrants;

### **3.4. Recommendation 915 (1981) on the situation of migrant workers in the host countries**

The Assembly:

[...]

9. Convinced that paramount importance should be given to the conditions of migrants in programmes and in national policies, and emphasising the debt owed by societies in the host countries to migrants for the cultural enrichment they bring;

Recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

i. invite the governments of member states:

*f.* to promote intercultural activities, in particular in the field of information for the public, in order to give it a better understanding of the position of migrants, and to increase their efforts in the field of education and vocational training of migrants, taking account of the specific aspects of these points (such as the specific problems of migrant women's education and the vocational training of adult migrants and their children, including the need to provide migrants' children with education from the pre-school stage right up to the higher level);

### **3.5. Recommendation 1206 (1993) on the integration of migrants and community relations**

9. Positive action should be taken in the context of education policies to eliminate the causes of underachievement. This might include extending pre-school provision, strengthening guidance and counselling and school-parent links, and organising acculturation classes for parents. Members of immigrant communities should be encouraged to become teachers. Adult education should be strengthened as a means to compensate for lack of qualifications. Teacher training and curricula should emphasise the need for all young people to take a positive, tolerant view of cultural diversity, and to reject racist or xenophobic attitudes and prejudices.

11. [...] Training and recruitment of public service personnel should take account of cultural and ethnic diversity.

15. The Assembly therefore recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

iii. instruct the European Committee on Migration (CDMG), where appropriate in consultation with other Steering Committees, to include in its future work:

b. detailed examinations on a country-by-country basis of national situations and policies with regard to community relations ;

c. the study of ways to maintain the relationship between migrants and their countries of origin, for example through appropriate policies on dual nationality or citizenship;

d. the examination of the cultural and social integration problems specific to migrant workers with temporary residence, engaged on long- or short-term contracts;

### **3.6. Recommendation 1383 (1998) on Linguistic Diversification**

8. The Assembly also recommends that the Committee of Ministers invite member states:

i. to promote the creation of regional language plans, drawn up in collaboration with elected regional representatives and local authorities, with a view to identifying existing linguistic potential and developing the teaching of the languages concerned, while taking account of the presence of non-native population groups, twinning arrangements, exchanges and the proximity of foreign countries;



### **3.7. Recommendation 1500 (2001) on the participation of immigrants and foreign residents in political life in the Council of Europe member states**

3. The Assembly is of the opinion that the presence of immigrants and foreign residents is an enriching and positive factor in our societies and everyday life.

7. [...] The lack of integration can be a source of social tension and conflict.

11. The Assembly recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

iv. urge the governments of member states:

b. to review their national legislation with a view to making it more flexible and adequate to the needs of immigrants and foreign residents [...]

### **3.8. Recommendation 1539 (2001) on the European Year of Languages**

7. Linguistic diversity has many facets, from the protection of minority languages, many of which are dying out, to the advantage of learning the languages of neighbours and neighbouring cultures and the protection of culture and cultural works in all European languages in the context of globalisation. The Assembly hopes that the Year will act as a stimulus for the development of language policies encouraging, above all, cultural and linguistic diversity and promoting the integration of minorities and immigrants, social cohesion in general and human rights.

### **3.9. Recommendation 1625 (2003) on Policies for the integration of immigrants in Council of Europe member states**

1. Since its very creation, the Parliamentary Assembly has devoted considerable attention to the issue of the integration of immigrants. [...]

2. The Assembly also recalls the importance given to the integration of immigrants in the overall activities of the Council of Europe, [...].

3. The Assembly regrets that since 11 September 2001 the immigration debate has been dominated by questions of security and border controls, to the detriment of integration policies, and that a certain rhetoric has developed in the media and public opinion often stigmatising immigrants.

4. [...] governments and public opinion, however, should also be aware that the failure to devise and implement effective integration policies for immigrants will pose an equal threat to the values which are at the heart of European society, namely equality, democratic representation and social cohesion.

5. The Assembly therefore reaffirms its vision of Europe as a multinational and multicultural society, where immigrants take part as equal members, on the basis of equality of rights and opportunities in return for equality of obligations, whilst respecting the rules of democracy, cultural diversity and the rule of law.

7. Integration policies should have the dual aim of providing immigrants with the means to function in the society where they live and develop their potential while preserving their cultural and ethnic identity, and familiarising the non-immigrant population with the rights of immigrants, their culture, traditions and needs.[...]

8. The Assembly therefore recommends that the Committee of Ministers:

iv. call on member states to:

b. establish integration programmes for those immigrants who have recently arrived. Such programmes should:

- be accessible on a voluntary basis;

[...]

- be tailor-made to the individual needs of each beneficiary;

- include language tuition, information on the way of life and customs of the host society, including access to basic services such as health, housing and legal advice;

[...]

- provide for financial inducements to encourage participation;

f. encourage the active involvement of immigrant women in all aspects of the host society, including political life, as well as their access to education, vocational training and the labour market;

### **3.9.1. Reply adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 14 April 2004 to Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 1625 (2003)**

CM/AS (2004) Rec1625 final

2. The Committee of Ministers shares the Parliamentary Assembly's concern that immigration questions should not be dictated merely by concern over security and border controls, and agrees that effective integration policies are needed to allow immigrants to participate fully in the life of the host community and raise awareness of diverse cultures and traditions among non-immigrant populations. [...] The Committee agrees that strategies for integration must necessarily cover all areas of society, and include social, political and cultural aspects.

3. [...] and through the extensive work of the European Committee on Migration (CDMG), the Council of Europe will continue its efforts to elaborate and promote integration policies to meet the challenges of modern society.

[...]

6. Language policies should also foster integration. The Committee of Ministers supports the opinion of the CD-ED that it is necessary to address the policy implications of introducing objective standards of competence not only in foreign but in other languages. This requires exploring the increasingly complex overlaps and divergences between mother tongue, languages of instruction and languages traditionally defined as "foreign", as they are experienced by learners.

### **3.9.2. Opinion of the Steering Committee for Education (CD-ED) on Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 1625 (2003)**

#### **Appendix 2 to the draft reply**

[...]

The CD-ED believes that education is a key to the acquisition of values and attitudes such as tolerance, solidarity and respect for the other and to uprooting ignorance and prejudice. It is largely through transmission of knowledge about the "other" and through dialogue that immigrants can be successfully integrated.

[...]

The Committee welcomes the reference to the necessity for language tuition for recently arrived immigrants (paragraph 8.iv b.). It recalls that it has constantly promoted diversified language learning, and draws attention to its recent initiatives in this regard, notably the *Guide for Language Education Policies in Europe* and the Language Education Policy Profile activity which aims to provide member states with expert assistance in reviewing and planning policies for diversification. In this context, it suggests that it is necessary to address the policy implications of introducing objective standards of competence not only in foreign but in other languages. This requires exploring the increasingly complex overlaps and divergences between mother tongue, languages of instruction and languages traditionally defined as "foreign", as they are experienced by learners.

### **3.10. Resolution 1437 (2005) on Migration and integration: a challenge and an opportunity for Europe**

4. The concept of integration aims at ensuring social cohesion through accommodation of diversity understood as a two-way process. Immigrants have to accept the laws and basic values of European societies and, on the other hand, host societies have to respect immigrants' dignity and distinct identity and to take them into account when elaborating domestic policies.

7. Council of Europe member states must, for their part, ensure that, within their jurisdiction, immigrants are not discriminated against in terms of access to and protection of their rights, with particular attention to certain sectors, such as education and employment.

9. In this connection, the Assembly calls on Council of Europe member states to:

iv. make a subsequent effort to foster knowledge of the fundamental values of the Council of Europe at all levels of society, in particular among immigrants, by:

a. holding courses on basic rights and responsibilities for newly arrived immigrants, free of charge;

### **3.11. Resolution 1511 (2006) on Migration, refugees and population in the context of the 3rd Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe**

[...]

4. With regard to the priorities laid down in the Warsaw Declaration and Action Plan, the Assembly intends to focus its activities in the field of migration, refugees and population around the following priority actions:

[...]

4.2. promoting intercultural dialogue, fostering tolerance and ensuring the integration of immigrant communities in their host societies;

[...]

### **3.12. Resolution 1611(2008) on Immigration from sub-Saharan Africa**

5. The Parliamentary Assembly believes that Europe is therefore facing several challenges in terms of controlling irregular migration and managing informal economic activity, which existed before the mass arrival of sub-Saharan immigrants but has been boosted by their presence and which, paradoxically, helps them to integrate into their host countries. At the same time, Europe may benefit from the arrival of a younger population likely to reduce the impact of the unfavourable demographic trends currently affecting it.

6. However, in spite of legislation against racism and discrimination, European States are not all able to guarantee that all migrants settling in their countries will be fairly treated in terms of access to healthcare, education, decent housing and properly declared paid employment.

8. Therefore, the Assembly calls on member states to:

8.3. In terms of the harmonisation of European legislation:

8.3.3. co-operate in harmonising legislation on learning the language of the host country;

8.3.4. co-operate in harmonising legislation on admitting the children of irregular migrants to schools.

[...]

### **3.13. Resolution 1617 (2008) State of democracy in Europe Specific challenges facing European democracies: the case of diversity and migration**

[...]

12. Striking the right balance between respect for diversity and the need for integration is essential for the proper functioning of democracy. Integration, which is basically aimed at eliminating exclusion and segregation of society, has to go hand in hand with respect for diversity, different cultures, languages and religions, in full respect for human rights. Integration is not to be confused with assimilation and would be undermined by it.

13. At the same time, however, integration does imply a degree of involvement in the society as a whole, including knowledge of the language(s) of the country of residence and respect for the constitutional values in that country, in particular respect for the principles of human rights, democracy and the rule of

law. Easy access and motivation for language learning should be provided to migrant women. Cultural and educational policies should be developed to raise migrant women's awareness of constitutional values and the principles of human rights.

[...]

### **3.14. Resolution 1618 (2008) State of democracy in Europe Measures to improve the democratic participation of migrants**

[...]

9. The Assembly recognises that much good practice has been developed concerning the democratic participation of migrants. Drawing on this and with the intention of improving the integration and democratic participation of migrants across Europe, the Assembly calls on member states of the Council of Europe to:

[...]

9.1.1. promoting integration as a non-discriminatory two-way process, with measures to combat racism and discrimination and encourage inclusiveness (such as diversity training for those working with migrants and benchmarking to ensure inclusiveness), steps to make members of the majority population aware of the different cultures of migrants and the need to avoid stigmatisation of migrants in the integration debate;

9.1.2. education and learning the language of the host society. This is particularly important for women and new arrivals, who should be provided with literacy courses, language training, civic awareness programmes and labour market training. Requirements relating to language skills should not constitute an obstacle for the exercise of the right to family life;

[...]

9.2.1.2. ensuring that other requirements such as naturalisation tests, language tests, income and housing requirements, fees and oaths do not become unduly onerous in terms of their number and requirements;

[...]

### **3.15. Resolution 1639 (2008) Migration and mobility in the Euro-Asian region – Prospects for the future**

[...]

9. Given that the regulation of migration flows is a relatively recent political priority in the Euro-Asian region, it is crucial to assist the countries to establish standards with regard to the rights of migrant workers and their families and to raise awareness of human rights of all migrants, including migrants in an irregular situation.

[...]

15. The Assembly encourages the countries of origin in the Euro-Asian region to:

[...]

15.4. provide language courses to labour migrants prior to their departure, in co-operation with cultural centres of the countries of destination;

[...]

### **3.16. Resolution 1718 (2010) The impact of the global economic crisis on migration in Europe**

[...]

11. In the light of the above, the Assembly calls upon its member states, the European Union and the world community at large to analyse the multi-dimensional and interconnected elements of the crisis and to take greater consideration of the impact of the crisis on migration and development in Europe and abroad. In particular, they are called upon to: [...]

11.2. enable migrant workers who have lost their jobs to retain their immigration status and residence permit for at least a certain period of time after their employment contract ends in order to be able to seek new employment. They should receive the same help in finding a new job as the local population; [...]

11.4. provide guarantees that the rights of migrants are adequately and effectively protected in terms of their human rights, working and living conditions and in the event of loss of employment;

### **3.17. Recommendation 1917 (2010) – Migrants and refugees: a continuing challenge for the Council of Europe**

NB. The Recommendation doesn't explicitly refer to education

**Extracts of the [Report](#)** presented by Ms Doris Fialla, Rapporteur, Committee on Migration, Refugees and Population (Doc. 12201 – 12 April 2010).

66. Integration is not a precise science, and the many different efforts being taken across Europe need to be shared in order to build up as much good practice as possible. Language learning, citizenship awareness, democratic participation, access to work, education and housing, protection of rights and community bridges are all essential for integration and need to be examined in any integration strategy.

68. Promoting integration and intercultural dialogue contributes to the core objective of the Council of Europe. The 3rd Summit made integration one of the priorities for the Organisation in migration matters. It also put great emphasis on intercultural dialogue as a means of promoting awareness, understanding, reconciliation and tolerance, as well as preventing conflicts and ensuring integration and the cohesion of society. It is therefore of no surprise that many sectors of the Organisation have dedicated time and resources to projects that relate to these issues.

### **3.18. Resolution 1811 (2011) - Protecting migrant women in the labour market**

[...]

7. In view of the above considerations, the Assembly recognises the need for host countries to develop and implement measures to specifically address the protection of migrant women in the labour market, irrespective of their occupation or immigration status. In this regard, it calls upon member states of the Council of Europe to: [...]

7.1.5. encourage countries of origin to create a single and effective system of information on jobs abroad, presenting an equal number of jobs for migrant women, and strengthen the monitoring of employment agencies and other agencies providing information abroad; [...]

7.2.3. authorising women who have joined their spouses to seek employment immediately upon arrival and to take affordable training and language courses; [...]

7.3.1. ensuring that all migrant women, independent of their legal status, are granted the same rights as national workers; in particular by guaranteeing their access to decent working conditions, protection under labour legislation and access to social security;

7.3.2. introducing procedures for the recognition of degrees, diplomas and professional qualifications obtained in the country of origin and providing opportunities for upgrading qualifications through vocational and lifelong training as well as local language skills; [...]

**Note:** the following Resolution is particularly important and entirely linked to language tests and migrants. Significant extracts are copied but the integral text is relevant for this compilation.

### 3.19. Resolution 1973 (2014): Integration tests: helping or hindering integration?

See also [Recommendation 2034 \(2014\)](#) below

3. There are two primary concerns over the use of these tests. The first is whether they promote integration or have the opposite effect. The second is whether they are being used not so much as an integration measure, but rather as a migration management mechanism to limit the number of migrants
4. Encouraging integration through language and other testing is not in itself problematic, and it is a measure that many member States are likely to continue with in one form or another. It is, however, important to be aware of the limitations of such tests and ensure that they contribute to integration and do not become a barrier to it
5. The Parliamentary Assembly is concerned that current integration tests in Europe are not as effective as they should be. In the first place, the level of knowledge required sometimes exceeds what is reasonably attainable by many immigrants or candidates for immigration, leading to the exclusion of many people who would otherwise have no problems integrating.
6. Member States of the Council of Europe are therefore invited to reappraise their approach to integration tests by evaluating their long-term effectiveness as a tool for efficient, sustainable and user-friendly integration.

### 3.20. Recommendation 2034 (2014): Integration tests: helping or hindering integration?

See also [Resolution 1973 \(2014\)](#) above

2. The Assembly notes that knowledge of a receiving society's language(s) facilitates the successful integration of migrants.
3. Statistics and evaluation studies show that language and integration tests have led to a decrease in the number of applicants for family reunification, permanent residence permits 4. Not only has the use of tests increased significantly, but the standards required have reached higher levels, often using the Council of Europe's Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, Assessment (CEFR) as a benchmark.
5. The Assembly notes that the CEFR offers reference levels which are widely used for evaluating language competences and represents one of the many successes of the Council of Europe. It recognises, however, that this instrument was never developed as a mechanism for establishing whether or not a certain language level was indicative of a degree of integration. It is only a measure of linguistic ability.
6. **The Assembly also notes the important activities carried out by the Language Policy Unit of the Council of Europe** (Education Department, DG II), and in particular its work on the linguistic integration of adult migrants (LIAM).

In this context, the Assembly invites the Committee of Ministers to:

- 7.1. undertake, **through its Language Policy Unit**, further work in respect of the CEFR, in order to identify appropriate ways of drawing on its content in the integration process. In this respect, the committee may consider it appropriate to produce guidelines on how the CEFR can be used and the limitations to its use for purposes of integration evaluation, or examine an alternative tool, based on the CEFR, which might be more appropriate for these purposes than language proficiency levels;
- 7.2. put forward alternatives to integration/language tests as a means of promoting and measuring integration and improving the prospects for integration of migrants and would-be migrants;
- 7.3. promote further the work of the Council of Europe on the linguistic integration of adult migrants.

#### [Reply of the Committee of Ministers to Recommendation 2034\(2014\)](#)

2. The Committee of Ministers notes that it is important that integration policies be based on the Council of Europe's fundamental values and, in particular, allow migrants to develop their potential and participate actively in the life of the host country. The provision of language courses for migrants together with appropriate evaluation processes forms part of this because, as the Assembly stresses, knowledge of a receiving society's language(s) facilitates successful integration. However, it is important that the

language courses on offer should take account of each migrant's specific resources and needs and enable him or her to acquire, in particular, language skills relevant to his or her work.

3. As regards the Council of Europe's "[Common European Framework of Reference for Languages \(CEFR\)](#)" and its use in the context of language tests and integration, the Committee of Ministers refers to its Recommendation CM/Rec(2008)7 on the use of the CEFR and the promotion of plurilingualism.

4. Furthermore, it emphasises that a set of tools has been drawn up and is available on line on the Council of Europe's [website](#) devoted to the linguistic integration of adult migrants, answering the Assembly's concerns. It also points out that, through its Language Policy Unit, the Council of Europe can provide assistance to member States wishing to adapt their policies, existing instruments and resources in order to meet their specific needs related to the linguistic integration of adult migrants.

5. Regarding further work on the CEFR, the Committee of Ministers informs the Assembly that a "[Guide to Policy Development and Implementation](#)" arising from the intergovernmental project on "Linguistic Integration of Adult Migrants (LIAM)" was recently published, as was a collection of documents entitled "The linguistic integration of adult migrants: from one country to another, from one language to another", whose aim is to help authorities and practitioners to identify appropriate ways of using the CEFR in language education, in curriculum design and development and for the evaluation of adult migrants' language skills.

6. With regard to options other than language tests for evaluating the language skills of migrants and candidates for immigration, mention should be made of the tools developed by the Language Policy Unit such as the "[European Language Portfolio for Adult Migrants](#)" and the related documents, which aim to put the emphasis on skills profiles rather than on levels.

### **3.21. Resolution (2006) 2014 Integration of migrants in Europe: the need for a proactive, long-term and global policy**

[Report](#) (doc 13530 – 2014)

3. The Assembly considers the integration of legal immigrants as a two-way process of inclusion in the institutions and relationships of the host society, involving rights and responsibilities on both sides. The main areas of integration include the labour market and social services, education and political participation.

12. The Assembly therefore recommends that member States:

12.1. review their current integration policies with a view to exploring solutions for better integration of migrants;

12.5. concerning education:

12.5.1. foster proficiency in the language of the host country;

12.5.2. promote educational practices placing an emphasis on social mix;

12.5.3. train teachers and school staff in intercultural practices;

12.5.4. avoid the practice of grouping and classifying pupils according to their origin;

### **3.22. Resolution 2088 (2016) The Mediterranean Sea: a front door to irregular migration**

12. The Assembly calls on member States:

12.3. with regard to legal channels of entry, to:

12.3.5. support grass-roots initiatives in the field of [...] education;

### **3.23. Resolution 2097 (2016) on access to school and education for all children**

1. Europe has seen significant progress in the last two decades as regards access to school and education. Such progress, however, is of varying degrees according to the different European regions and groups of population concerned. Barriers to access to school still exist in the Council of Europe member States [...].

2. The Parliamentary Assembly calls for these barriers to be lifted. [...]

[...]

4. The Assembly therefore calls on member States to enhance their education systems in order to ensure access to quality education for all and regular class attendance until the end of the study programme. Member States should, in particular:

4.8. encourage parental involvement in school activities, particularly in schools with a higher proportion of students whose parents have low levels of education or a low level of proficiency in the language of their children's schooling (for example migrant families);

4.16. foster access to pedagogical professions for students from minority and migrant families;

4.17. ensure gender equality at all levels of the education system, with a special focus on women and girls from disadvantaged groups, such as Roma, migrants and refugees, and women and girls with disabilities;

5. The Assembly insists that sustained investment in education [...] must be given equal priority with investment in the economy, infrastructure, security and all other areas seen as crucial to Europe's global economic competitiveness and stability.

6. The Assembly therefore recommends that the parliaments and governments of the member States of the Council of Europe:

6.1. uphold the right of everyone to participate in cultural life as a core human right, seeking to offset barriers which hamper the access to culture for [...] migrants, refugees, asylum seekers [...];

### **3.24. Resolution 2123 (2016) on Culture and democracy**

5. The Assembly insists that sustained investment in education and cultural activities must be given equal priority with investment in the economy, infrastructure, security and all other areas seen as crucial to Europe's global economic competitiveness and stability.

6. The Assembly therefore recommends that the parliaments and governments of the member States of the Council of Europe:

6.1. uphold the right of everyone to participate in cultural life as a core human right, seeking to offset barriers which hamper the access to culture for women, young people, minorities, migrants, refugees, asylum seekers and other vulnerable groups; [...];

### **3.25 Resolution 2124 (2016) on educational and cultural networks of migrant and diaspora communities**

1. The Parliamentary Assembly considers that communities living abroad ought to be seen as vital bridges between Europe's cultures and as an asset for the countries of residence and of origin. However, the integration of diaspora communities and migrants represents a major challenge for European societies today.

2. Problems of marginalisation and exclusion are increasing across Europe. Weak identification both with the country of residence and of origin can create a sense of alienation, particularly among second and third generations of young people searching for identity and belonging. Many feel they are not perceived as equal citizens and can fall prey to fundamentalism, extremism and racism. Such anxieties can further deepen the divide between communities along linguistic, cultural or religious lines.

3. The Assembly believes that the role of educational [...] networks of communities living abroad is crucial to building cohesive societies by strengthening pluralism and democracy in European societies. These



networks play a key role in providing support, solidarity and mutual assistance; they provide a link to the culture of origin and an openness to multiple cultural affiliations; they nurture multilingualism; [...].

4. The Assembly nevertheless considers that their role is not sufficiently understood and recognised, and that associations and networks are not sufficiently mobilised, particularly in the context of developing national and local strategies that aim to improve social cohesion and the spirit of “living together”. [...]

5. The Assembly therefore recommends that the governments and parliaments of the member and observer States of the Council of Europe, as well as the States whose parliaments enjoy observer or partner for democracy status with the Assembly:

5.1. when they are the countries of residence of diaspora communities:

5.1.1. involve diaspora associations in the framing and implementation of policies concerning different aspects of the integration process, including educational [...] integration;

### **3.26. Resolution 2137 (2016) on the impact of European population dynamics on migration policies**

1. The significant changes in the dynamics of the European population in the 21st century call for an assessment of their impact on future migration policies in Europe.

[...]

7. The Assembly is convinced that in order to respond to the present population challenges in Europe, a cross-sectoral approach to social, labour market and immigration policies should be applied, and that the human rights and dignity of all people should be put at the forefront of all related policies.

8. The Assembly therefore invites the Council of Europe member States concerned to:

8.3. devise, as required, forward-looking migration policies, [...], to attract qualified migrants, in particular by:

8.3.6. facilitating the recognition of the educational diplomas and vocational skills of migrants;

8.3.7. further developing vocational training and language courses for migrants, especially for migrant women;

### **3.27. Resolution 2159 (2017) on protecting refugee women and girls from gender-based violence**

1. In the past two years, more than 1 million asylum seekers have come to Council of Europe member States looking for protection and opportunities for their children to grow up in peace. [...]

2. In their countries of origin, during the journey, in transit and in destination countries, many refugee and asylum-seeking women and girls have been exposed to gender-based violence in the form of coercion, forced prostitution, harassment, survival sex, sexual slavery or various types of extortion. However, their protection from violence has not been considered a priority in the management of the refugee crisis. While the Parliamentary Assembly praises the countries which have so far taken in large numbers of refugees and asylum seekers, it regrets that the gender dimension of the refugee crisis has been largely overlooked and has left gaps in protection, thereby increasing risks for many women.

[...]

4. (...) In addition to ensuring protection from violence and assistance to victims, States should invest in integration programmes to provide women refugees with prospects for the coming years and help them to find their place in our societies.

5. In the light of these considerations, the Assembly calls on Council of Europe member and observer States to take the following concrete measures to address gaps in protection and mitigate risks:

5.5. invest in social and economic integration programmes specifically targeting women refugees, in particular by providing language courses and facilitating the recognition of diplomas [...];

### **3.28. Resolution 2173 (2017) on a comprehensive humanitarian and political response to the migration and refugee crisis and the continuing flows into Europe**

1. The Parliamentary Assembly regrets that, despite much debate and some positive action, no comprehensive humanitarian and political response has yet been found for the challenges presented by the large-scale migratory and refugee flows into Europe. It considers that this state of affairs, although mainly the consequence of armed conflicts in Syria and in other countries, demonstrates the failure of European States to co-operate effectively in addressing its root causes, providing humanitarian assistance, protecting human rights and managing efficiently the reception, asylum processing and integration of refugees and asylum seekers.

2. The Assembly recalls its numerous adopted texts calling for greater co-operation and increased solidarity and sharing of responsibilities between refugees' countries of origin, transit and destination [...].

10. With respect to national practices and regulations, the Assembly further calls on member States to:

10.4. share and implement best practices in areas such as [...] education [...];

### **3.29. Resolution 2175 (2017) on migration as an opportunity for European development**

9. The Assembly is convinced that to facilitate mutually beneficial migration to Europe, member States should take concrete measures in areas which have a positive impact on migration. Therefore, it recommends that member States:

9.3. promote inclusive societies by enabling the full and active participation of migrants in all aspects of life by:

9.3.4. providing opportunities for language learning for migrants;

9.3.5. ensuring that language and citizenship classes are made available to asylum seekers and refugees;

9.3.6. developing educational programmes in schools to promote knowledge of different cultures, languages and religions;

### **3.30. Resolution 2176 (2017) The integration of refugees in times of critical pressure: learning from recent experience and examples of best practice**

6. Recalling its [Resolution 2137 \(2016\)](#) on the impact of European population dynamics on migration policies, and referring to [Resolution 2175 \(2017\)](#) on migration as an opportunity for European development, especially with respect to the employment of migrants, the Assembly encourages the Council of Europe member and observer States and States whose parliaments enjoy observer or partner for democracy status with the Parliamentary Assembly to ensure the successful integration of refugees by:

6.8. with respect to the settlement of migrants in the host country:

6.8.1. ensuring that relocation of migrants is carried out taking into account the capacities of and opportunities available in the places of settlement, including educational [...] opportunities [...];

6.8.2. providing adult migrants with the necessary language and vocational training courses and a level of civic instruction which provides guidelines for everyday life in the country;

6.8.3. creating conditions and measures for the recognition and validation of academic [...] experience and qualifications for those refugees without proof of their diplomas;

[...]

6.8.7. fully recognising the key role of women for the successful integration of migrant families and ensuring that the specific needs of migrant women are duly taken into account in terms of access to [...] vocational and linguistic training, and independent access to education, while providing the necessary resources and training staff;

B) (for information) MOTION FOR A RECOMMENDATION - NOT EXAMINED BY PACE

### **3.31. Motion for a recommendation on Human rights and democratic concerns for the integration of migrants (Document 11345 - 3 July 2007)**

[...]

2. Integration through communication in the language of the host society, is a major factor in integration. Is this however a right to learn the language of the host society or is it a responsibility? It is certainly both.

3. Integration has become a condition precedent for admission into a number of member states, and priority is being given to starting the process of integration as early as possible, including before entry into the country.

4. Once in the country specific integration programmes are often available and may also be compulsory with incentives offered or sanctions applied. These courses however vary considerably from one country to another in terms of their scope, duration and form.

5. It is now not unusual for countries to introduce history and citizenship tests, loyalty oaths and language proficiency tests all as part of the process of integration, reflecting a rights based and responsibility based approach.

8. There are currently no clear guidelines to help member states in tackling integration through language and citizenship learning and no guidelines to ensure that the best balance can be maintained between a rights based and responsibility based approach. State practices differ widely and there is no current system of analysing the policies adopted by member states. While some good practices are developing, not all may be worth replicating or entrenching. An analysis of the different policies adopted to-date in Europe is required and some essential questions need to be examined, including:

- Should integration courses (covering history, citizenship and languages) be voluntary or compulsory?
- Should they be before or after entry into the host country?
- Should they be free of charge, subsidised or paid for, or should there be financial incentives?
- How should the courses and any tests (especially the language courses and tests) be validated
- What incentives and sanctions can be reasonably applied?

9. In view of the above and given the importance of human rights and democratic responsibilities in the process of integration of migrants, through for example citizenship and language learning, the Parliamentary Assembly recommends that the Committee of Ministers invites member states to:

- facilitate informed and participative public discussion on the policy issues related to citizenship and language learning;
- share their survey data and experience of policies and practices concerning citizenship and language learning as a means of integrating migrants in Europe;
- proceed with the compilation of best practices with a view to drawing up guidelines for policies in this area;
- involve all concerned parties in discussions on the issue, including migrants and their representatives, central and local governmental representatives, teachers, language testers, etc.;
- take measures to ensure quality in language education and in assessment procedures where these exist, including training courses for all those responsible for providing language learning and for those responsible for assessment;
- carry out surveys on language needs and citizenship needs and guide policy making on these issues.

[...]



## 4. THE CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES

[\[www.coe.int/congress\]](http://www.coe.int/congress)

### **4.1. Resolution 62 (1968) on the settlement of migrant workers in foreign local communities**

The Conference,

[...]

7. Having ascertained that action on the part of such bodies would be such as to fill the numerous gaps still to be found not only in reception arrangements but also in the field of assistance to the migrant worker in respect of the following points:

- language teaching to workers and members of their families;

[...]

- vocational training and further education for migrant workers through the medium of evening classes;

8. Requests the Committee of Ministers to consider the possibility of setting up in local communities in immigration countries "Europa" centres according to the pattern outlined in the document drawn up by the Standing Committee of the Conference with the assistance of the Working Party on the settlement of foreign workers in local communities;

[...]

### **4.2. Recommendation 105 (2001) on "Linguistic diversity: a challenge for European cities and regions" Conclusions of the Rovinj Conference, Croatia, 22 and 23 March 2001**

The Congress,

[...]

7. Recommends that the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe:

a. invite the Council for Cultural Co-operation (CDCC) to co-operate with the other steering committees concerned (the Steering Committee on Local and Regional Authorities (CDLR) and the European Committee for Social Cohesion (CDCS)) in preparing and implementing programmes of activity to enable immigrants or foreign residents to learn the language of their host country and also to improve the host populations' knowledge of the migrants' and foreign residents' languages;

[...]

### **4.3. Recommendation 153 (2004) on "A pact for the integration and participation of people of immigrant origin in Europe's towns, cities and regions"**

The Congress, bearing in mind the proposal of the Chamber of Local Authorities,

[...]

18. Calls on the governments of member states:

[...]

b. to provide greater financial and human support for programmes in local and regional authorities such (as those proposed in the Stuttgart Final Declaration), focusing, in particular, on language learning for children and adults, education, training and vocational integration, as well as urban planning and housing measures that enable migrants and their families to be offered appropriate integration conditions in the towns and regions where they live;

[...]

#### **4.4. Resolution 181 (2004) on “A pact for the integration and participation of people of immigrant origin in Europe’s towns, cities and regions”**

The Congress, bearing in mind the proposal of the Chamber of Local Authorities,

[...]

15. Calls on all local and regional authorities in Europe to draw upon the Stuttgart Final Declaration with a view to fostering the integration and participation of people of immigrant origin, in particular by:

[...]

b. taking account of these issues in all policy sectors so as to meet the specific needs of residents of immigrant origin, in particular in terms of education, training, language skills, housing and social and cultural programmes;

[...]

Appendix

Final Declaration of the Conference “Foreigners’ integration and participation in European cities” 15-16 September 2003

[...]

3. It will be possible to achieve these [...] objectives only through co-operation between the different political tiers.

At national level

[...]

Measures with a view to school and vocational training and labour market integration in cities must be supported. State assistance is required to promote languages among children and adults.

[...]

At local/regional authority level

[...]

This implies that migrants living in a country must be able to understand, speak and read that country's language.

Language learning at nursery school is the easiest way. But there is also a need to encourage language learning and education at primary and secondary schools.

[...]

#### **4.5. Resolution 218 (2006) on effective access to social rights for immigrants: the role of local and regional authorities**

[...]

3. The Congress is nevertheless aware that, despite the efforts made by certain European towns, cities and regions to foster the integration of immigrants and access by them to key social rights, they do not always enjoy equal access to the latter and sometimes even suffer various forms of discrimination in the areas of employment, housing, education and healthcare because of institutional, social, cultural or personal factors.

[...]

6. Likewise, in view of the responsibilities they often exercise in the field of education, local and regional authorities can not only promote intercultural dialogue in schools but also develop educational tools vital to the more effective integration of immigrants, such as literacy.

[...]

#### **4.6. Resolution 318 (2010) on cultural integration of Muslim women in European cities**

1. In Europe today, particularly in those countries where Muslims are in a minority, immigrant Muslim women can face multiple challenges. Many of these are to do with culture, the dominant culture of the country of origin and the dominant culture of the host country, as well as with differences of cultural sensitivities among different groups in each society. Muslim women often suffer from double cultural disaffiliation, disconnected from their culture of origin and unable to identify with the dominant culture of the host country. Their lack of integration is an area where local authorities can play an important role.

[...]

4. Language and education are key elements in the integration process. [...] Women are often isolated by their poor command of the language of the host country.

[...]

13. The Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe therefore invites local and regional authorities to encourage, stimulate and promote specific measures to facilitate the integration of immigrant Muslim women into their communities, notably by:

[...]

b. offering suitable language courses for the language of the host country, preferably in the host country;

#### **4.7. Recommendation 365 (2014) on promoting diversity through intercultural education and communication strategies**

1. The population of Europe is rapidly diversifying, and it is now the case that not just major cities, but also small municipalities and authorities more and more frequently have local populations of a very wide range of ethnic, cultural and religious origins. Ethnic minorities, foreign residents, migrants, asylum-seekers, refugees and residents of migrant origin form a European population which is not only growing more strongly than in the previous decades, but has also become an integral part of the fabric of our societies. They are now a major force, thanks to their economic, social and cultural contribution.

2. Their diversity represents a wide-ranging resource for innovation, growth and local economic, social and cultural development, making possible an opening up to other cultures and an inflow of new knowledge, methodologies, skills and ideas which increase a society's creativity and make it better able to face up to new situations, crises and challenges. In the cultural sphere, diversity is a source of enrichment which is perceptible in literature, cinema, the arts, sport, cookery, fashion, and in many forms of expression and types of activity. That creativity is also a source of job creation, attracting industries and firms in search of innovative ideas.

3. [...] The Report of the Group of Eminent Persons of the Council of Europe entitled "Living together. Combining diversity and freedom in 21st-century Europe" identified European diversity as the main challenge facing modern democracy. That same report highlighted the crucial role played by local and regional authorities in responding effectively, as well as their role in building harmonious intercultural relations between the different population groups.

4. When it comes to accepting cultural diversity as an enriching factor, there is still a degree of resistance and reluctance among the local population, fuelled by prejudice and misconceptions based on rumours, stereotyping and misinformation. That prejudice, often stemming from ignorance of other cultures, continues to affect the way in which people regard others. That resistance also comes from a more subjective and unconscious perception that the concept of cultural diversity is linked to the idea of the "foreign", "immigrant" or "minority" culture constituting a threat to the majority culture. Ignorance of the benefits of diversity is thus a major obstacle to intercultural action.

5. The Congress is certain that the diversity and cultural heritage of populations represent two of the main assets of European societies, and that a precondition for a change in attitudes to diversity is a better knowledge of its advantages in both populations and authorities, necessitating the development of policies encompassing all social, ethnic and cultural groups and an educational effort based on intercultural [...] teaching.

6. In this respect, the Congress reaffirms the relevance of its [...] Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)7 on the Council of Europe Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education [...].

[...]

10. In the light of the foregoing, the Congress asks the Committee of Ministers to adopt as soon as possible the recommendation to member States on intercultural integration, and to invite the member States of the Council of Europe to:

[...]

*b.* formulate intercultural [...] education strategies of a general nature, with a view to promoting a consistent approach to diversity amongst the different government structures and the different levels of governance, and to raise society's awareness of the advantages of diversity in order to derive maximum benefit from it;

*c.* to develop the curriculum, textbooks and teacher-training courses for schools, higher education establishments and schools of journalism, so as to improve intercultural skills and the vision of diversity;

[...]

#### **4.8. Resolution 375 (2014) on promoting diversity through intercultural education and communication strategies**

1. The population of Europe is rapidly diversifying, and it is now the case that not only in major cities, but also in small municipalities and authorities, the local population is more and more comprised of a very wide range of ethnic, cultural and religious origins. Ethnic minorities, foreign residents, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees and residents of migrant origin form a European population which is not only growing more rapidly than in previous decades, but which has also become an integral part of the fabric of our societies. They are now a major force, thanks to their economic, social and cultural contribution.

2. Their diversity represents a wide-ranging resource for innovation, growth and local economic, social and cultural development, enabling an opening up to other cultures and an inflow of new knowledge, methodologies, skills and ideas which increase a community's creativity and make it better able to face up to new situations, crises and challenges. In the cultural sphere, diversity is a source of enrichment which is perceptible in literature, films, the arts, sport, cookery and fashion, and in many other forms of expression and activity. This creativity is also a source of job creation, attracting industries and firms in search of innovative ideas.

3. [...] The Report of the Group of Eminent Persons of the Council of Europe entitled "Living together. Combining diversity and freedom in 21st-century Europe", identifies European diversity as the main challenge facing modern democracy. The same report highlights the crucial role played by local and regional authorities in responding effectively, as well as their role in building harmonious intercultural relations between the different segments of the population.

4. However, when it comes to accepting cultural diversity as an enriching factor, there is still a degree of resistance and reluctance among local populations, fuelled by prejudice and misconceptions based on rumours, stereotyping and misinformation. This prejudice, often stemming from ignorance of other cultures, continues to affect the way in which people regard others. This resistance also derives from a more subjective and unconscious perception that the concept of cultural diversity is linked to that of the "foreign", "immigrant" or "minority" culture constituting a threat to the majority culture. Ignorance of the benefits of diversity is thus a major obstacle to intercultural action.

5. The Congress is certain that the diversity and cultural heritage of Europe's populations represent two of the main assets at the disposal of local and regional authorities, and that these authorities can, in turn, contribute to changing people's perceptions, bringing about a better understanding of other cultures, raising awareness of the advantages of diversity and approaching diversity in a context of interaction between different local groups. This work must include the implementation of strategies on intercultural education for the population and the training of public officials in intercultural skills, as well as effective strategies for making local residents aware of the assets of diversity. [...]

6. The Congress is also sure that it is necessary, in order to promote the benefits of diversity, to develop policies encompassing all social, ethnic and cultural groups. In this context, the Congress reaffirms the relevance of its Resolutions [...] 332 (2011) on education for democratic citizenship – tools for cities, as well as of Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)7 of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the Council of Europe Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education.



12. The Congress emphasises the role played in this process by civil society (especially by associations of migrants and minorities, including Roma), youth organisations, the media, educational institutions, trade unions and the private sector (including migrants' businesses), as well as the growing role of the new media and social networks.

13. In the light of the above, the Congress invites the local and regional authorities of Council of Europe member States to set up "local partnerships for diversity" – platforms for co-operation and co-ordination with the aforementioned stakeholders, in order to promote the advantages of diversity. The objectives of these platforms should be to:

[...]

b. formulate intercultural [...] education strategies of a general nature, with a view to promoting a consistent approach to diversity amongst the different local and regional authorities, raising public awareness of the advantages of diversity and deriving maximum benefit from it;

[...]

14. The Congress, *in particular*, invites local and regional authorities to make use of the *Practical guide for applying the urban model of intercultural integration*, produced by the Intercultural cities programme on the basis of the participating cities' experience, with a view to re-examining administrative functions through an "intercultural prism", particularly in respect of education, [...].

15. In particular, where [...] education [is] concerned, the Congress invites local and regional authorities to:

[...]

c. co-operate with educational institutions, including schools, higher education establishments and schools of journalism, to develop their curricula and textbooks, as well as teacher-training courses intended to improve local minority groups' intercultural skills, vision of diversity and knowledge of cultures;

d. ensure that minority groups and migrants learn the local languages, and that new arrivals, in particular with the help of their associations, are taught about the host country's culture as well as its local laws and traditions;

[...]

f. engage in structured co-operation with civil society, and particularly with youth organisations, with a view to promoting the teaching of diversity and of diversity advantages;

#### **4.9. Recommendation 394 (2017) From reception to integration: the role of local and regional authorities facing migration**

1. The increasing number of migrants coming to Europe constitutes a critical challenge for all levels of government, calling for adapted and effective measures in Council of Europe member States.

2. Local and regional authorities who, as public authorities closest to the population, are the first port of call in any emergency situation, have the responsibility to provide newly arrived migrants with access to key public services [(...) education] without any discrimination.

[...]

8. Migration management goes hand in hand with integration policies put in place as early as possible.  
[...]

9. To tackle these issues, the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe has adopted various resolutions to improve the validation of migrants' skills, [...]. The Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights has regularly published opinions advising member States to improve the protection of human rights of migrants and to ensure that undocumented migrants and their children have access to basic rights, in particular the right to [...] education. [...].

#### **4.10 Resolution 411 (2017) From reception to integration: the role of local and regional authorities facing migration**

1. The increasing number of migrants coming to Europe constitutes a critical challenge for all levels of government, calling for adapted and effective measures in Council of Europe member States. Local and regional authorities who, as the public authority closest to the population, are the first port of call in any emergency situation, have the responsibility to provide newly arrived migrants with access to key public services [(...) education] without any discrimination.

[...]

7. Reception and integration of refugees necessitates well-defined integration policies to be put in place as early as possible. [...].

8. To tackle these issues, the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe has adopted various recommendations to improve the interaction of refugees and migrants with the receiving societies as well as validation of migrants' skills [...]. The Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights has regularly published opinions advising member States to improve the protection of human rights of migrants and to ensure that undocumented migrants and their children have access to basic rights, in particular the right to [...] education.[...].

[...]

10. In light of the above and convinced that local and regional authorities are the cornerstone of efforts to effectively tackle the current challenges linked to migration, the Congress, while recognising that each State has a sovereign right to determine whom to admit its territory, subject to that State's international obligations, calls on the local and regional authorities of the member States,

[...]

*b.* concerning more specifically the reception of refugees, to:

[...]

*iv.* develop assistance programmes for refugees, taking into account their personal identities, individual skills and abilities and providing counselling and support for the development of their individual life projects, including language and vocational training, with particular attention to women, young people and groups with special needs such as elderly people and persons with disabilities;

[...]

*vi.* remove practical barriers encountered by refugees when trying to access the labour market, by providing them with integration programmes facilitating access to the local employment market, education, vocational training, [...];

#### **4.11 Declaration 4 (2015) on the reception of refugees in Europe**

The Congress:

[...]

2. resolutely observes:

*a.* that the States of Europe must assume shared responsibility for accommodating the refugees on their territory in total respect for the right to asylum in force and to human dignity;

[...]

*d.* that this role is reflected in practical terms on the ground by the provision of [...] facilities to help ensure access to [...] education, etc.