



INTERCULTURALISM IN THE CULTURAL POLICIES OF EUROPEAN CITIES

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Jordi Pascual from the United Cities and Local Governments Committee on Culture for his wise advice.

Elise Courouble from *La Terre est ronde* consultants for her documentary research.

Jacques Bonniel from the Université Lumière Lyon 2 for rereading the text.

CONTENTS

Introduction	<i>D) The role of interculturalism in cities' strategic planning</i>
1 - Conceptual approaches	<i>E) Cross-subsidisation</i>
2 - Method	<i>F) New types of policy engineering for 'intercultural culture'</i>
3 - Interculturalism in urban dynamics	<i>G) Interculturalism: a challenge for local democracy and sustainable development</i>
<i>A) The arts, culture and social inclusion</i>	<i>H) Defining culture means defining a cultural policy</i>
<i>B) Memory, identity and culture</i>	5 - Recommendations on intercultural urban governance
<i>C) Cultures, public spaces and artists at work</i>	6 - Select bibliography
<i>D) Diversity of cultures, cultural and arts education</i>	
<i>E) Interculturalism and international cooperation</i>	
<i>F) One active ingredient: recognition</i>	
4 - Cultural diversity in city policies	
<i>A) Forms providing a higher profile</i>	
<i>B) Forms encouraging participation</i>	
<i>C) Centrality and marginality</i>	

Introduction

The past decade has been marked by the emergence and promotion of cultural diversity, followed by intercultural dialogue, in the discussion of local, national and international policies and sometimes also in actual decisions. There is now widespread agreement that these values should be claimed as an alternative to the 'clash of civilisations'.¹ Some of the more far-sighted cities have gradually adopted active intercultural policies.

Moreover, local authorities have in the main become key players in cultural and arts policy today; throughout Europe, regionalisation and decentralisation have strengthened their role as funders, coordinators and sometimes organisers of artistic and cultural life.

The purpose of this report for the Intercultural Cities programme is to identify the relationship between the two policy goals of supporting an open and pluralist community on the one hand and promoting the arts, creativity and cultural life on the other.

1 - Conceptual approaches

In order to answer the questions raised by this study, we must consider the meanings of its underlying terms interculturalism and cultural policies.

Intercultural practices and artistic and cultural activities will not converge automatically, since cultural policies in Europe have developed on the basis of a universalism that favours the *common interest over the individual interest*. Born of Enlightenment values, these policies principally endeavour to promote the universal aspect of the arts, heritage and culture for

¹ Samuel Huntington, *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order*, Simon & Schuster, 1996.

the benefit of the human race as a whole. 'In Europe's philosophical and sociological tradition, culture has often been conceived of as a process of self-surpassment and advancement towards knowledge and understanding. Culture supports the civilising process.'²

While it is readily accepted that the arts (jazz, for example), culture (say gastronomy) and heritage (say modern architecture) are the fruit of sundry hybridisations and reciprocal influences, little attention is paid to their actual origins. The list of cultural practices that have borrowed from other traditions is now so long that we may wonder whether any have escaped such mixing. **As a result, interculturalism is not treated as an attribute worth considering in its own right in any approach to the arts.**

National cultural policies in the West have long confined themselves to the ideal of 'making the great works of humanity available to the largest possible number of people'.³ These policies of (top-down) cultural democratisation are gradually being revised through the introduction of (bottom-up) cultural democracy which makes space for popular culture, cultural participation and subcultures.⁴ **They have nevertheless kept a hierarchical approach to artistic production (sometimes invoking the idea of 'excellence', as in France)**, whose value will depend on whether it belongs to the institutions of cultural democratisation or to those of cultural democracy, the latter

² Michel Rautenberg, 'L' « interculturel », une expression de l'imaginaire social de l'altérité', *Hommes et migrations*, special issue, 2008.

³ André Malraux's famous expression, enshrined in the decree founding the French Ministry of Culture in 1959.

⁴ Raymonde Moulin, *L'artiste, l'institution et le marché*, Flammarion, 1992.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

including adult education and cultural or sociocultural activities (depending on the country).

A divide has therefore long existed between democratisation (synonymous with quality) and democracy (synonymous with participation), where culture deriving from intercultural processes is usually 'categorised' (variously according to country) as popular culture. Yet once a branch of popular art or culture attains the rank of recognised art or institutional culture, the question of its ethnic origins gradually fades into the background. **Cultural policies in Europe are now at a stage when it should be possible to stop contrasting quality with participation and democratisation with democracy and to start reconciling participation and amateur practices with high standards.**

Furthermore, in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, **culture** was one of the main instruments for consolidating nation-states in Europe. Until very recently in the history of our continent **it was closely bound up with constructing imagined communities** and used for political purposes to develop collective national identities. It continues to be used in this way in some new democracies whose national territories have been officially recognised more recently. It is therefore only in the past two decades that multiculturalism, cultural diversity and then intercultural dialogue began to be widely recognised in public discourse. 'Our societies display a real paradox here: we sometimes "pretend" that interculturalism is becoming normal, if not routine, and forms the backdrop to our modern way of life, whereas there are contradictions between the way in which our collective cultural identities have been shaped in connection with nation-building policies and the transnational, cross-community and cross-ethnic discourse that we hear elsewhere.'⁵

⁵ Michel Rautenberg, *op. cit.*

This summary analysis shows how assimilation of the new paradigm of **cultural diversity clashes with cultural policies** that are already highly formalised in most European countries at both local and national levels. This clash nevertheless takes on different forms depending on the history of the peoples making up the nation, the degree of regionalisation or political decentralisation within a country, and the extent to which cultural diversity is already established in public authorities and whether or not words are translated into action.

However, the reality of conflicts and tensions in cities and at international level has hastened recognition of the concepts of cultural diversity and intercultural dialogue. 'The paradox that we have just mentioned is clearly reflected in public policy: multiculturalism starts to become accepted and play a part when clear and incontrovertible levels of conflict and social breakdown emerge, and a cultural response is then put forward as one possible way of managing social dynamics.'⁶ Basically, if interculturalism is not part of cultural policy "by right", the social situation locally or nationally may oblige stakeholders to think about it. Conversely, recognition of diversity and intercultural dialogue may offer an opportunity to restructure cultural policies that have run out of steam.

Lastly, to round off these introductory remarks on meaning, we should note that **the idea of dialogue between cultures**, used by European foreign policy in the twentieth century, is echoed by dialogue between civilisations as a political alternative to the clash of civilisations, especially in multilateral bodies. The term 'intercultural dialogue', taken up by the Council

⁶ Ilda Curti and Luca dal Pozzolo, 'Multiculturalité et politiques culturelles' in Lluís Bonet and Emmanuel Négrier (eds), *La fin des cultures nationales ?*, La Découverte/PACTE, 2008.

of Europe,⁷ UNESCO and then the European Union, is gradually taking its place among the concerns of European politicians and business people.

2 - Method

This study will endeavour to identify the principles and methods that today's cities are using to forge links and manage the paradoxes between cultural policies and interculturalism. To this end, I have chosen five European cities⁸ of different sizes, with differing degrees of decentralisation, very different relationships with the peoples constituting the nation, and all, at one time or another, having shown the ambition to recognise cultural diversity. Lyon, Berlin and Neuchâtel are part of the Intercultural Cities programme, while Liverpool and Barcelona are not. The smallness of this sample means that the following remarks cannot be exhaustive; other local approaches are probably being developed, and **this report aims simply to provide a few pointers for discussion.**

Taking measures implemented in these five cities, the study attempts to single out and describe the dynamics at work in relation to two specific aspects:

- processes of convergence, mixing and hybridisation between the cultural spheres of different ethnic and social groups, genders, ages, etc: **interculturalism**. *Culture is here understood in the anthropological sense, in terms of norms and values;*

⁷ The term is to be found in Council of Europe documents as early as 1983.

⁸ Barcelona, Berlin, Liverpool, Lyon and Neuchâtel. Many other cities could have been included in this study, but considerations of time and length prevented wider comparison.

- **artistic creation and dissemination of culture:** the arts, culture and heritage. *Culture is here taken to mean the circulation of works and productions that are symbolic, attractive, recreational, etc.*

The study is based on available documents, since there was no time for supplementary interviews with local cultural stakeholders. The author relied on her field experience alone, but the gap between theory and practice will make it necessary to qualify the following remarks.

The investigation of the fields covered by the study draws heavily on work and reference material produced for the Agenda 21 for culture by the United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) Committee on Culture.⁹ The author has been careful to choose examples from a variety of cultural sectors in terms of disciplines as well as economic structure: museums, festivals, public events, visual arts, performing arts, broadcasting, libraries, etc.

Caveat

Performance of a piece composed by a foreign musician, provision of works by authors from all over the world or exhibition of works by a painter with an international reputation will not be considered intercultural activities in this study inasmuch as interculturalism is not invoked as such with regard to residents, audiences and users.

3 - Interculturalism in urban dynamics

⁹ See www.cities-localgovernments.org and www.agenda21culture.net

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

European city projects combining intercultural processes and branches of artistic and cultural expression are driven by a variety of dynamics, and these form the subject of this section. We shall endeavour to describe the **aims, content and forms** of these projects.

It will be seen that some projects are influenced by several dynamics.

A) *The arts, culture and social inclusion*

The artistic and cultural expression of intercultural practices is here considered to be a dynamic process of social inclusion. Cultural identities are promoted by placing the emphasis on their wealth of artistic heritage in order to combat all forms of social, cultural and workplace exclusion. This is done mainly through a process of publicising community-based cultures and emphasising the value of individuals beyond their membership of a particular group.

In *Lyon, the Parade (le Défilé)* created by the Dance Biennale team is one example of this approach. The Biennale's director is familiar with the working-class areas of Rio de Janeiro (the *favelas*) and makes no secret of his admiration for the way in which the Rio Carnival manages to mobilise people socially. The Dance Biennale was devoted to Brazil in 1996, and on that occasion its directors suggested to the cultural bodies of the conurbation's various social groups that they should host the professional dancers, who would then create dance sequences with groups of amateur dancers. In this way the democratisation of culture which the Biennale had been fostering from the outset (introducing the whole of the dance repertoire to as many people as possible) was complemented by cultural participation that drew in people who would not usually have gone to Biennale

performances because alienated from this type of institutional arts provision ('It's not my thing'). The aims are still the same today:

- involving residents of the various working-class neighbourhoods of cities in the Rhone-Alpes region.
- raising the profile of amateur groups in Lyon city centre to change the image of 'violent' suburbs.
- co-producing a highly artistic dance parade bringing together professionals and volunteers.

The Parade takes place every two years and consists of 10 to 12 teams from ten or so cities in the Rhone-Alpes region, mainly from the Greater Lyon area. The groups succeed one another to create a vast parade of dancers, who are usually accompanied by groups of musicians and always have their routines designed and choreographed by professionals. Teams of volunteers also get to work on making the costumes, floats and various props. In all, over 3,000 people are involved. The parade lasts half a day (and has been televised for several years now), and the preparations take up everyone's energies for at least a year beforehand.

Over 300,000 spectators are present at this vast urban ritual¹⁰ staged in the city centre in a public space where the city's main authorities (political, economic, religious, institutional, etc.) are concentrated. *The Parade* showcases one core discipline, dance, together with the complementary disciplines of music and street arts. The cultural project is structured round unity of time, place and subject: the event organisers want to preserve this unifying approach to the arts, which attracts amateurs of both sexes, all ages and very different social origins onto unfamiliar territory.

¹⁰ Extract from Philippe Dujardin's contribution to *Banlieues d'Europe* (ed.), *La place et le rôle de la fête dans l'espace public. Nouvelles fêtes urbaines et nouvelles convivialités en Europe*, CERTU, 2006.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

In Neuchâtel, 'a new way of thinking about foreigners - in terms of diversity and as part of a pluralist reality - is essential and must encourage us to change places in our imagination, that is, put ourselves in the position of those who live abroad.'¹¹ This was the humanist spirit that presided over the launch in 2006 of the far-reaching project *Neuchàtoi, hier, aujourd'hui, demain, manifestations interculturelles* ('Neuchàtoi, yesterday, today and tomorrow: intercultural events') - 'Neuchàtoi' being a contraction of 'Neuchâtel à toi' ('your Neuchâtel'), a play on the city's name.

The purpose of this original project was to encourage the population of the canton to engage in 'reflection and debate about its residents' Neuchâtel identity (past, present and future) and the shared values and principles that come of belonging to a local area, region, nation or Europe'. The Working Party on Integration of Foreigners (*Communauté de travail pour l'intégration des étrangers*, CTIE), which organised the project, was trying to promote better mutual knowledge and greater mutual understanding among Swiss citizens and foreigners, since 23% of the population of Neuchâtel was of immigrant origin. It thus had a number of aims:¹²

- initiating a canton-wide debate on various aspects of Neuchâtel identity.
- organising a publicity campaign across the territory.
- encouraging involvement of a large number of public and private partners, including circles not at all accustomed to this type of operation.

In all, 186 events were organised across the six districts of the canton of Neuchâtel and in the Entre-Deux-Lacs region, and

¹¹ Taken from the presentation material for the 'Neuchàtoi' project. Website: www.neuchato.ch

¹² External evaluation report on the Neuchàtoi project by KEK-CDC Consultants, March 2007.

they were attended by 250,000 people. Theatre performances, film screenings, gastronomic events, radio and television broadcasts, publication of a booklet of personal stories, lectures, concerts and sports events took place between March and November 2006. The *Neuchàtoi* closing ceremony at the Théâtre du Passage in Neuchâtel saw the award of the 2006 'Salut l'Etranger!' ('Welcome, Stranger!') prize. The project was deliberately designed to be polymorphous, probably in order to reach as many different communities as possible. The multiplicity of what was on offer here constituted a selling point for communities seen as alienated from institutional arts provision. Unlike *the Parade*, many different dates, places and forms of activity were on offer so as to attract the broadest possible audience.

Like the Lyon Dance Biennale's *Parade*, the *Neuchàtoi* project mobilised a whole area (in this case the canton), albeit with one significant difference: the Swiss declared the purpose straight away in the very title of their project: namely, interculturalism. Switzerland's federal tradition of accommodating three different communities (French-speaking, German-speaking and Italian-speaking) facilitates the recognition of cultural diversity, whereas the French nation retains a very uniform image of itself which obstructs its ability to tackle this problem head on. The universalist idea of cultural diversity championed by the French state within UNESCO remains easier to address at the foreign-policy level than in practical terms at the local level.¹³ In fact, the team organising *the Parade* prefers to talk about exploring the potential of urban cultures rather than about interculturalism - at least to begin with.

¹³ Pascale Bonniel Chalier, 'L'Europe à l'épreuve de ses cultures, les conditions d'une politique culturelle communautaire', unpublished DEA dissertation, University of Paris 8, 2005.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

We may ponder these two different projects' long-term impact on the promotion of diversity: should diversity of cultures be flagged up from the outset or is it better to encourage intercultural processes without really drawing attention to them? An evaluation of the way in which images have changed because of these two projects would indicate whether they help not only to change public discourse, but also, more concretely, to change attitudes.

The Raval district in **Barcelona** is home to a large number of marginalised people and residents of immigrant origin. Since the 1980s, much money has been spent on renovating this neighbourhood, which has now acquired an opera house, a centre of contemporary culture, a design centre, a university and a museum of contemporary art to make it more attractive to the middle classes. Fifty-eight per cent of the population of Raval consists of immigrants of various origins. The *Tot Raval Foundation* - a community platform originally consisting of business people and local restaurant-owners - was set up in 2001 to organise intercultural cooperation both for social and education issues and for culture, the arts, trade and commerce. The Foundation has thus become established as an intermediary between the authorities and the neighbourhood, instigating and promoting a variety of projects and coordinating groups, associations and other bodies. The declared aim of the organisation is to improve the residents' quality of life and relations with each other as well as their relationship with other neighbourhoods and to change Raval's negative image in the public mind.¹⁴

A four-day cultural festival called *Spring in Raval* is held every year and is intended as a genuine 'neighbourhood community project' where all and sundry (residents, associations, businesses) are encouraged to take over their neighbourhood to

¹⁴ Source: www.totraval.org

promote its most valuable, creative and positive aspects. The 'Culture in situ' project fosters the involvement of cultural institutions¹⁵ with guided tours, open days for locals and workshops for children being organised. The opera house, for example, offers a special programme for Raval. Here again, the overall programme covers many different activities and not just cultural and artistic ones in the narrow sense.

The *Neighbourhood International* and *Moved Worlds* festivals in **Berlin Neukölln**, organised by the Neukölln Borough Department of Arts and Culture and a Protestant Church working party, have for many years reflected similar dynamics.¹⁶

Other projects tend much more towards the arts: for example, as part of its programming, *Les Subsistances, Laboratoire de Création artistique* (Arts Laboratory), in **Lyon**, put on a show called *My way (A notre façon)*, an arts project with residents of all nationalities from the Guillotière neighbourhood. 'Everybody has a favourite song that reminds them of their childhood, their native country, their travels or perhaps a wedding or a funeral... songs which everyone knows but which we think belong to us alone and which we jealously keep to ourselves. With the Oh! Oui... company, Lyon residents from a whole range of backgrounds have produced six short musical sequences and acted out stories that were part of their lives.'¹⁷ The history, real-life experience and diversity of a particular neighbourhood have thus provided the raw material for artistic creation.

¹⁵ *Study visit of representatives of pilot intercultural cities in Barcelona, October 2008.*

¹⁶ Neukölln presentation material for the European 'Intercultural Cities' programme.

¹⁷ Presentation brochure for the *Ca tchatche!* languages weekend, Les Subsistances, April 2009.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

In the same vein, as part of the *Neuchâtoï* project the Théâtre du Passage in Neuchâtel decided to work on political and humanist subjects and adapted a play by an Australian author, which was performed by actors of immigrant origin.

We should note that the choice of certain topics by an artist can also raise the status of popular culture and provide common ground between very different practices: in 2008 the photographer Tabitha Jussa exhibited a set of photographs of football supporters under the title *The 12th Man* at the Foundation for Art and Creative Technology (FACT). 'If you love football, you hold a key to the rest of the world.' Some artists thus display a particular interest in subjects that depend on context and relationships and highlight 'everyday' social practices of groups or communities of city-dwellers.

We should also mention, amongst other things, the programmes of film cycles devoted to a particular continent (Asia) or country (Turkey) that are in vogue in intercultural cities. 'Arts cinema' offers a different image of cultural globalisation: one of a varied output as an alternative to the mainstream film industry. The *Asie Expo* association in Lyon and the *Cine Asiatico* association in Barcelona reflect this trend whereby professional programmers and volunteer residents come together to explore a foreign culture that is both remote and near at hand.

B) Memory, identity and culture

'One of the main tasks of urban policy is to (re)define the city's identity, on the basis of its residents' collective memories, its cultural heritage (built and intangible) and a vision of the future that is able to create a consensus among the main political stakeholders as well as opinion-makers (intellectuals, teachers,

the media, etc.).'¹⁸ Cities - melting pots for migration - are not really properly aware of the history and heritage of the various peoples living in them. Some intercultural projects are endeavouring to fill this gap by highlighting the 'hidden' artistic and cultural heritage of communities of immigrant origin. The aim is to encourage processes of recognition of the cultures present in a city and to raise their profile. This approach draws attention to the fact that identity is an affiliation rather than a condition.

In Rhone-Alpes, the regional *Centre de musiques traditionnelles Rhône-Alpes (CMTRA)*, Rhone-Alpes Centre for Traditional Music) has for many years been researching and promoting traditional artistic heritage in the region's multicultural neighbourhoods. By focusing on urban neighbourhoods, the CMTRA is able to reveal the diversity of an area's artistic and cultural wealth and the mixing processes that have been going on for years. Collection of intangible heritage, especially music and dance, highlights a neighbourhood's cultures and restores a positive image of residents from different countries. It also demonstrates that building a collective identity is a complex process which draws on various influences imported from outside the territory.

After covering the Pentes area of the Croix Rouse district in Lyon, collection has been going on in Guillotière, a neighbourhood which has received successive waves of immigration (Asian, Maghrebi, African, Armenian and East European), since 2003. The CMTRA has published DVD sound atlases reflecting the diversity of dance and musical expression and the vitality of the neighbourhood's traditional practices. This research has increased appreciation of amateur practices,

¹⁸ Milena Dragisevic-Sesic, *La culture en tant que ressource du développement urbain*, Fondation Marcel Hicter pour la Démocratie Culturelle, March 2007.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

especially those of older persons, who ensure that they are handed down from generation to generation. The Guillotière choral society, for example, brings together residents from a whole range of backgrounds to perform songs from around the world that have been passed on by their neighbours.

This process of identification has also brought to light trained performers. Performing traditional works allows them to show a commitment to their home countries while seeking to become socialised within French society. For some, the CMTRA initiative has also opened up the possibility of working as professionals.

Through the Aralis hostels in Lyon, which provide accommodation for immigrant workers from sub-Saharan and North Africa, the *Traces* strand of the *Mémoires et Trajectoires* ('Memories and Paths') project has allowed hostel residents to make themselves heard, regain a sense of pride and make their personal journeys known to the residents of Greater Lyon. Photography exhibitions, publications and symposia have revealed the painful and emotional relationship that these workers have with their adoptive country.

The September 2009 *Barcelona Connectada* exhibition at the Barcelona City History Museum showed a work in progress, highlighting the role of immigration in shaping the city. Through a combination of exhibitions, lectures and debates, supported by other media such as the Internet and publications, *Barcelona Connectada* allowed people to see the multiple individual and collective identities of various origins that today make up a common cultural and political project.¹⁹

¹⁹ *Barcelona Connectada* exhibition press kit. Barcelona City History Museum website: www.barcelonaconnectada.cat

The exhibition *Living Together: Views from North Neukölln* put on by Neukölln Museum was intended to reflect the borough's problems and social tensions while showing that the inhabitants wished to live in this neighbourhood. The object was to help change perceptions and make people realise that Germany had become a country of immigration.²⁰

The *NICE08 Nordic Art and Culture Festival* in Liverpool tackled this subject from a different angle.²¹ The festival presented collaborative works between the UK and Nordic countries such as Denmark, Finland, Iceland, Norway, Sweden and the Baltic countries. The aim was to highlight the heritage links between Liverpool and these countries by exploring contemporary art and culture: concerts and dance performances, visiting artists and school workshops were used to investigate these cultures and connections. This approach was complemented by DNA testing in the 'How Nordic you are?' project, where Liverpool's inhabitants were encouraged to find out whether they had any Nordic roots.

Liverpool is also behind a noteworthy project in the field of contemporary culture and memory, launched as part of the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue and Liverpool, European Capital of Culture 2008: *Cities on the Edge* invites six cities - Gdansk, Istanbul, Liverpool, Marseille, Naples and Stavanger - to explore their roles as historic ports and cities of migration. 'They share an exceptionally strong sense of their own cultural identity, shaped by influences such as immigration and emigration,

²⁰ *Survey of Berlin-Neukölln for the analytical grid of the Council of Europe* (coordinators: Franziska Süllke and Arnold Mengelkoch), July 2008.

²¹ www.liverpool08.com and <http://forums.liverpool08.com/blogs/intercultural/>

different religions and political traditions.’ The idea is to explore each city’s continuing links with the cultures arising out of various waves of immigration and their links with the diasporas that have emigrated and to show the social and economic urban dynamics that they have created.

C) Cultures, public spaces and artists at work

Management of public space is a key issue for democracy in European cities. Often vandalised and deprecated, public spaces are now being renovated as part of urban redevelopment projects that are increasingly attentive to cultural and intercultural uses. Places with tensions but also places where communities live and are exposed to view, public spaces are just as much meeting places as places of segregation and conflict.

In such a socially and culturally varied neighbourhood as Raval in **Barcelona**, it has been necessary to think of public space as an educational space for exchange between cultures and generations. The **Tot Raval Foundation** has studied the residents’ need for a recreational area where they can socialise, an area for community life built around sport and games, in the square named after Salvador Seguí.

In **Lyon**, a design gallery, **Galerie Roger Tator**, launched an original venture by inviting a landscape designer, Emmanuel Louisgrand, to design an installation on an abandoned site in the multicultural and working-class Guillotière neighbourhood. The artist built a monumental glasshouse in 2003, the year of the heat wave, in the midst of dense housing: ‘I was free to choose between makeshift car parks, patches of waste ground and other abandoned sites in Guillotière.’²² *L’Îlot d’Amaranthes* (‘The

²² *L’Îlot d’Amaranthes*, Emmanuel Louisgrand, multiple authors, Editions Roger Tator, 2008.

Amaranth Block’) has been flourishing vigorously under the noses of the conurbation’s technical experts who had been planning to build a car park on the site. Consensus, and the local population’s readiness to rally round the garden, has been all the easier to achieve because each community has its own imaginary picture of the garden and its own special relationship to nature. After four years of work by the artist, the residents took up the challenge themselves, taking the space over as a collectively cultivated vegetable garden. The artist’s work has radically changed the image of the place as well as its vocation and uses.

This multicultural approach starting from a particular ‘object’ was also the starting point for the *Go Superlambananas* project in **Liverpool**, which encouraged the various communities to put up sculptures in the city in 2008. ‘Creativity, conservation and citizenship are constant themes running through all Wild in Art’s activities.’

Street art festivals also contribute to bringing about changes in image and a symbolic reversal of hierarchies. *Neuchâtoï* in **Neuchâtel**, the *Parade* in **Lyon** and the *Carnival* in **Berlin** are all proof of this. They help residents from outlying districts and the poorer classes to rebuild their dignity by placing them centre-stage in places customarily occupied by the various organs of power - political, religious and economic. For example, the Rue de la République in which *The Parade* takes place begins between the opera house and the city hall and takes in many banks, the Chamber of Commerce and Industry and various big-name shops. The presence of amateurs from the Lyon suburbs and the outlying districts of the region’s mid-sized cities prompts a healthy reversal of social images: diversity then becomes an engine of change.

The fact of having artists in residence in a neighbourhood for several months, or even several years, can sometimes flag up multiculturalism. At the request of the residents of the Duchère

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

neighbourhood, Lyon City Council funded the residence of a firework artist to prepare for a neighbourhood meal for the Festival of Light. This *Festin de Lumières* (Feast of Light) proved a good opportunity to meet for residents who had taken part in visual arts workshops to prepare for the staging of this meal on 8 December 2003. The artist's work made it possible to 'stray from the beaten path' and turn a simple community fair into a real urban installation not just shared by the neighbourhood's inhabitants but also visited by Lyon residents from further afield.

In Lyon, the *Sixth Continent Festival* features a different country or people every year: Algeria, China, Morocco, Réunion, the Roma, etc. have thus had their profiles raised in concert halls, parks and conference rooms.²³ These programmes usually include meetings with geographers, anthropologists and political scientists whose work 're-establishes' if not the truth then at least the historical reality and some cultural facts not known to the city's residents.

In Berlin, an ethnological urban arts project encourages artists to show residents their city, its history and its architecture through exhibitions of photographs, street drawings and cityscapes of the Neukölln neighbourhood. 'In order to understand why, we must face the fact that, given its markedly problematic social structure, Neukölln is Berlin's most challenging borough: it is characterised by a particularly heterogeneous population (including some 60,000 foreign citizens from various ethnic groups), substantial unemployment and poverty, and an enormous development "burden".²⁴ *Intransitos*, an initiative by two artists, has organised an event called *48 hours in Neukölln* which aims to show the links between the various groups of immigrant origin in

the neighbourhood. Artists exhibit their work as a window onto the neighbourhood's life and living conditions.

D) Diversity of cultures, cultural and arts education

Promotion of intercultural dialogue means learning about the cultures present in an area, and this often entails educational activity, both in official educational institutions, namely schools, and in other cultural institutions such as libraries and informal learning centres.

The *Raval library* in *Barcelona* provides information on language courses. Books are available in the languages spoken in the neighbourhood, as well as Bollywood films, CDs of traditional music, etc. This experiment has served as a model for the whole of the Barcelona library network. Library cards are now seen by some communities as a symbol of citizenship, and they say they are proud to hold them.

The *public library* in *Neukölln* provides similar activities and runs a 'News from Babylon' introducing foreign cultures. This library has greatly influenced practices in all Berlin libraries (and even beyond), which have introduced intercultural training programmes for their staff. Furthermore, the local library, together with the *Neukölln* cultural association, offers an 'international factory of story-telling' which encourages parents to read stories both in German and in other languages spoken in the neighbourhood.

Like museums, libraries, where education and culture cross paths, have built up considerable legitimacy and remain a symbol of access to knowledge. The cultural diversity policies that they introduce reach a wider audience than centres for the performing arts, as shown by studies of cultural practices across Europe. Their

²³ www.sixiemecontinent.net

²⁴ www.intransitos.de

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

popularity makes them vital spaces of social and cultural mediation in a city.

The *NICE08 Nordic Art and Culture Festival* also took place in Liverpool's schools. The link between culture and education seems to be a priority for the city of Liverpool. In Kensington, an area marked for regeneration, the *Music for Life* and *Yellow House* projects have helped to make the neighbourhood more attractive and to give fresh confidence to families and children from the different communities.²⁵

E) Interculturalism and international cooperation

City councils have gradually become very active in the field of international cultural cooperation, joining central government and regional councils. Their calendars of events are filled with twinnings, arts exchanges and co-productions between cultural institutions. Yet there is often very little room for the promotion of intercultural projects.

The hosting of foreign seasons that we sometimes come across in France and other European countries has, however, altered the highly ambassadorial and prestigious aura that used to surround these exchanges. We are seeing changes in scale; less official cultural stakeholders are now taking initiatives in the field of international cultural cooperation.

The *Théâtre des Asphodèles* in Lyon has for several years been running a project based on sharing the French language. Initially built up by a wide variety of the region's social, educational and cultural stakeholders, the international *Caravane des dix mots* (Ten-Word Caravan) has taken a simple concept based on artistic creativity and cultural outreach and adapted it

²⁵ *Deliverington: Kensington Regeneration Annual Report 2007-2008.*

for over ten European countries. Workshops, performances and readings allow amateurs of all ages and origins to voice their diversity through ten words of French, producing remarkable forms of expression and acts of imagination. The overall project has led to the production and distribution of a number of DVDs recounting the collective adventure.

Furthermore, diasporas in cities constitute fertile ground for cultural and arts projects that make connections between countries united by a common history.

The *Compagnie Gertrude II* has for several years been running *Noir sur Blanc* ('In Black and White'), a cultural cooperation project between Sétif, Algiers and Lyon. 'We shall share France forever with millions of men and women from Algeria. Their bones lie beneath our soil; their blood runs in our veins. Them-us, us-them - impossible to tell, so soaked are we in another history that is knocking at our door.'²⁶ A contemporary approach to exchanges between artists/performers and cultural stakeholders in the two countries was offered in the form of writers, artists and theatre groups in residence, training courses in project engineering in Algeria, hosting of co-productions in Lyon, and a Franco-Algerian week in the amphitheatre of the Lyon opera house. *Noir sur blanc* is part of a process of international cooperation and solidarity that aims to restore a contemporary view of their country to Lyon residents of Algerian origin while providing assistance for Algerian artists and performers who are experiencing an unfavourable climate for their arts.

The *Cities on the Edge* project coordinated by Liverpool is also part of a new process of international exchange. Having publicly apologised for its slave-trade past, Liverpool City Council has embarked on research and exchange with other port cities to

²⁶ Excerpt from the play *Ce ciel si ciel*, first performed in 2008.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

explore its past and present cultural identity and restore it to the area's residents and communities. It is thus turning round the situation by moving beyond its dramatic past in order to turn it into a resource and discover 'how mixing can be turned to economic, social and cultural advantage'.

This 'coming out' reflects a maturity and sense of political responsibility that are all too rare in Western cities.

Some cities see their intercultural activities as an asset to be promoted beyond their boundaries. Barcelona is very much in the forefront here. With the **Barcelona Intercultural Dialogue** programme launched in 2008, the Catalan city is trying to encourage fuller integration of immigrants by publicising its cultural policy throughout Spain and abroad.²⁷ It has taken over the chair of the United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) Committee on Culture, is making the most of exchange of experience with cities abroad to draw inspiration for its own approach and is exhibiting cultural leadership that is acknowledged across the continent.

F) One active ingredient: recognition

By way of summing up this section, we shall here turn to the work of the German philosopher Axel Honneth,²⁸ who identifies three types of recognition: emotional, legal and social. These three forms of recognition occur through easily identifiable individual and group processes that bring self-confidence, self-esteem and self-respect. Regarding the last of these, 'if an

²⁷ Barcelona City Council Culture Institute website:
<http://www.bcn.cat/cultura/dialeg/eng/>

²⁸ *The Struggle for Recognition: Moral Grammar of Social Conflicts*, Axel Honneth, Polity Press, Cambridge, 1996.

individual's values and lifestyle do not match those culturally recognised by society, the individual will be impeded in his or her capacity for self-realisation'.²⁹ The cultural projects described in this study have the cardinal virtue of exposing to view the cultures of others and giving them legitimacy. They contribute to processes of recognition that create the conditions for a better shared existence in cities.

Recognition is all the greater when intercultural projects are hosted or taken up by major institutions in a city. In Lyon, since 2002 the **National Opera** has been pursuing an active policy of building links with multicultural and working-class neighbourhoods. The hip hop company **Pockemon Crew** was thus able to use a rehearsal room in the opera house to prepare for the 'battle of the year', the international hip hop championship that takes place every year and which the company won in 2004. A presentation of sound atlases of the Croix-Rousse neighbourhood published by the **CMTRA** attracted residents of this neighbourhood, which is close to the opera house, who had never crossed the threshold of that venerable institution. The **Danse Ville Danse** meetings at the **Maison de la Danse** have helped to legitimise urban dance and introduce dancers who generally come from the suburbs. In **Liverpool**, theatre involvement in the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue was reflected by a highly varied performing arts programme throughout the season.

Of course, to optimise the resources allocated by the authorities, the large cultural institutions that usually receive the lion's share of the cultural budget must be fully involved in the intercultural process. Shrinking budgets during difficult economic

²⁹ Elsa Costanzo, 'Quelles possibilités pour les projets interculturels de répondre aux enjeux du désir contemporain de reconnaissance ? Étude de trois cas', unpublished master's dissertation, Université Lumière Lyon 2, 2008.

times, together with the emergence of new forms of governance, suggests that the best that can be hoped for is that public funding will remain the same.

However, processes of recognition take many different forms and cannot be confined to major arts institutions that will not necessarily bring out the multicultural element of their programmes and are little frequented by most social groups in the city and particularly people who feel indifferent to them. **Thus local social, educational and cultural facilities and shared public spaces play a permanent and wide-ranging role in development of cultural dialogue. Libraries, social centres, schools, youth clubs, small arts venues, brownfield cultural sites and community centres are often the first places where cultural diversity is expressed.** In the various cities studied, neighbourhood amenities thus provide an essential and welcoming presence. The example of **NTH8** (Nouveau Théâtre du 8e) shows that a cultural presence in the heart of a neighbourhood can be used to 'knit' together a work that constitutes a recognition of the history and cultures of an urban area that has been taking in people from various waves of immigration for decades.³⁰

At bottom, the major policy challenge is to understand citizens as persons rather than individuals.³¹

³⁰ www.NTH8.com '*Je me souviens de Rita Renoir, histoire rêve du quartier des Etats-Unis*' was a text written and performed by the actor Vincent Bady based on different people's recollections of the Etats-Unis neighbourhood in Lyon and reconstructed in various forms for the neighbourhood's residents.

³¹ A distinction made clearly by the Canadian philosopher Charles Taylor in his book *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition*, Princeton University Press, 1994.

4 - Cultural diversity in city policies

Caveat

To determine the actual importance of intercultural projects in public policy (especially cultural public policy) would require more time, proof and investigation than has been possible for this report.

Thus, rather than findings, the following section presents hypotheses which would gain from being discussed by the participants in the Intercultural Cities programme.

It should first be said that a measure of caution is appropriate with respect to the following analysis, which may be imbued with some of the author's own enthusiasm and political commitment. In Mónica Lacarrieu's words: 'It is to be hoped that culture will become central to town planning. And, we might add, to better management of social conflict, to dealing with urban pathologies of insecurity, and even ... to the human condition! But is it possible to tackle all these issues with culture? Is this not just another myth where these particular conflicts are concerned? In any case, people working in the social field are cautiously observant of the influence that culture is now acquiring as a *solution*.'³²

We shall therefore content ourselves with a modest and practical approach without risking any decisive and all-encompassing conclusions.

³² Mónica Lacarrieu, 'La construction des imaginaires locaux et des identités culturelles dans le cadre de la mondialisation', in Lluís Bonet Agusti and Emmanuel Négrier, *op. cit.*

At this point, let us return to the aims of the Intercultural Cities programme:

*'The intercultural city does not simply "cope" with diversity but uses it as a source of dynamism, innovation, creativity and growth. It accepts diversity as a norm and helps people from all groups - minorities as well as the majority - benefit from it. The intercultural city shapes its educational, social, housing, employment, cultural and related policies, and its public spaces, in ways which enable people from different cultural backgrounds to mix, exchange and interact for mutual benefit. Structures and mechanisms for public consultation, debate and decision-making represent the community's cultural mix and are able to deal with issues of cultural difference. The intercultural city does not avoid cultural conflict but accepts it and develops ways of dealing with it. Political leaders and media promote an understanding of diversity as an asset and encourage citizens to perceive it in the same way. Because of close interaction and trust between cultural groups and strong participation in civic life, the intercultural city is able to respond positively to the global social and economic challenges.'*³³

In the following paragraphs an attempt will be made to single out activities that provide a durable, rather than a limited, basis for dealing with the problems of interculturalism, making a lasting contribution to the meeting of cultures, including standing up to them if necessary, and the strengthening of social ties in cities.

A) Forms providing a higher profile

³³ Text drafted by Irena Guidikova for the Council of Europe Intercultural Cities programme.

Street events, neighbourhood meals, open-air installations and celebrations are often used to promote cultural diversity. 'Is it this potential for multiplicity, paradox and rapprochement that makes the celebration an omnipresent and virtually inescapable form for many so-called intercultural actions, activities and projects? We might surmise a sort of isomorphism between interculturalism and celebrations as a congenial way to meet people and socialise. A sort of genealogy might then be traced between the banquets upon which the communities of classical antiquity were founded and what interculturalism is trying to create through shared celebrations: an open community rather than a closed one excluding other communities and a rootstock rather than a fixed body.'³⁴

Thus cities make considerable use of entertainment policies and various forms of celebration to espouse cultural diversity. These methods have appreciable advantages:

- they carry a powerful PR message that is extensively taken up by local media;
- they encourage flexibility and direct contact without the trouble of formal introductions;
- they raise the profile of cultures banished from cities, which they display in public and media space;
- they demonstrate political determination at the local level that needs to be seen and heard.

The French and Slovakian candidates for *European Capital of Culture* have clearly signified their desire for interculturalism, being encouraged in this by the European Commission during the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue in 2008. Lyon devoted a large section to interculturalism in its application. According to experts, Marseille's social and geographical situation and its

³⁴ Abdellatif Chaouite, *L'interculturel comme art de vivre*, L'Harmattan, Paris 2007.

determination to celebrate its intercultural dimension, particularly through the programming of public events, weighed in favour of its being nominated.³⁵

B) Forms encouraging participation

There are basically two forms of participation: participation through pursuit of an artistic or cultural activity and civic participation which demands to be involved in the management of cultural policies.

Promotion of diversity and intercultural dialogue seems to go hand in hand with citizen participation. In most of the projects described in the previous section, people affected by certain forms of discrimination had to be mobilised if the projects were to be relevant and legitimate. This enabled events to be claimed by the groups mobilised and ensured that they were rooted in the local area. This mobilisation was based on the assumption that the residents' participation would give them greater awareness of themselves and others, together with a certain dignity.

Another advantage of resident participation is that it requires time; with artists in residence or collection of personal memories the long period involved allows processes of recognition gradually to become established between individuals and groups at local level.

Nowadays there is a strong tendency for cities to use arts teams and cultural facilities relying on resident participation rather than 'mere' suggestions for cultural consumption. This nevertheless requires a sound underlying concept and frequent liaison to foster such participation, although working-class

³⁵ Interview with Bertrand Collette, Assistant Director, *Marseille Provence European Capital of Culture*, March 2009.

residents should not be enjoined too often to participate, as they have everyday social and economic problems which relegate cultural and intellectual matters to the background. In Lyon a number of projects have sometimes been on offer at the same time in the same place with the risk of social and educational organisations being unable to cope effectively in terms of liaison.

Less common are examples of civic participation in the management of cultural policies and projects. It is a question of 'breaking the alliance between a city's cultural officials and its policy-makers to give its residents a voice again.'³⁶ The type of consultation customary in town planning and transport, for example, is much more sensitive in the field of culture, where there are still hierarchies between experts and neophytes.

The main asset of the borough of Neukölln in the heart of Berlin is its residents' exceptional involvement in effective 'neighbourhood management' organisations aimed at improving local life and fostering and supporting grass-roots initiatives. Since 2002 this citizen involvement in the borough's public-policy decisions has been carried even further. Residents' representation in advisory bodies has taken a step forward with the establishment of a Migration Advisory Committee and the position of Representative for Migration and Integration.³⁷

In Barcelona, the setting-up of an advisory Council for Culture has made it possible to invite representatives from different communities to take part in formulating cultural

³⁶ Christelle Blouët, 'L'Agenda 21 de la culture en France : état des lieux et perspectives', unpublished master's dissertation, University of Angers, 2008.

³⁷ Neukölln presentation material for the Intercultural Cities programme.

strategy. One its three cross-disciplinary committees is devoted to intercultural dialogue.

C) *Centrality and marginality*

However, intercultural activities still occupy an awkward, marginal position in cultural policy. 'Culture and the arts are here being asked to function as a means of easing social communication and a way of breaking down conventional, stereotyped codes of behaviour. In this situation, social issues require culture to occupy the ground, devise languages and establish relationships. At best, attention is focused on the social dynamics behind an event, a piece of work or a performance without necessarily paying heed to the quality of the cultural or artistic product. The term 'local activities', which is admittedly legitimate enough in urban regeneration policy, thus becomes synonymous with multiculturalism and acquires a weak and marginal meaning in more institutionalised cultural policies.'³⁸

We cannot but share this unease in relation to many projects being implemented in intercultural cities. Despite the presence of intercultural dialogue on cities' policy agendas, we cannot avoid the conclusion that intercultural activities are still very often peripheral to official cultural policy, both in their share of the municipal budget and in the authorities' hierarchy of actual priorities.

Fifty years of spatial segregation in European cities has resulted in veritable ghettos. Modern urban regeneration policies usually seek to restore fit housing and rebuild the quality of life in disadvantaged neighbourhoods. But this is not always enough to create centrality. For this to happen, something symbolic has to be injected: putting major arts institutions - traditionally sited

³⁸ Ilda Curti and Luca dal Pozzolo, *op. cit.*

near the city's centres of power (city halls, police headquarters, religious institutions, chambers of commerce, etc.) - in multicultural neighbourhoods helps to bring about changes in image.

Similarly, organisation of major events supported by the public authorities help to change residents' attitudes, especially when they occupy central areas. Both *Neuchàtoi* and the Dance Biennale's *Parade* are proof of this.

The *Neuchàtoi* project has thus been instrumental in changing the ways in which the multicultural nature of the canton of Neuchâtel is perceived. It seems that the project's success might have something to do with the 'Yes' vote in the referendum on securing the right of foreigners to vote, which was rejected in an earlier referendum.

A creature of urban rituals and new or recycled myths, the intercultural city has to be rebuilt on new symbols that can unite its residents. 'Today's urban marketing (urban staging) creates new myths and revitalises old ones. Old myths also need support. Creating new urban myths and a 'positive' image of the city is even more important when the aim is to promote a new cultural and economic policy for the city that will lead to prosperity.'³⁹

D) The role of interculturalism in cities' strategic planning

The inclusion of intercultural dialogue as a priority during municipal terms of office and its translation into urban planning documents is essential if all local stakeholders are to be mobilised.

³⁹ Milena Dragisevic-Sesic, *op. cit.*

In **Barcelona**, the importance of interculturalism is clearly apparent in the city council's policy agenda. The mayor chairs an Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue Committee. The first plan was adopted in 2002 and a political consensus was sought in order to win over the local community as a whole. This cultural policy tendency is made plain in the 2006 Strategic Plan for Culture.⁴⁰ The city's strategy is to address this issue in all aspects of municipal activity - culture, equality, economics, security, the media, etc. - and raise the profile of interculturalism in public discourse. Barcelona would seem to be a model for integration policy in Spain and Europe.

In **Lyon**, promotion of cultural diversity forms part of the 2001-2007 City Council Plan in the section devoted to culture.⁴¹ However, the issue of interculturalism is addressed less directly in France than in Spain, Switzerland or the United Kingdom - nations consisting of various different peoples and communities. Thus the intercultural dynamics very much in evidence in the conurbation are less apparent in public discourse: the idea of cultural democracy is highlighted instead. However, a cultural cooperation task force (originally called the 'community cultural development task force') set up by three municipal offices to combine local, festive, artistic and cultural approaches is gradually moving towards recognition of diversity and rights.⁴² During the city council's current term of office (the mayor was re-elected in March 2008 and the executive underwent some change), the cross-disciplinary approach to interculturalism seems set to be

⁴⁰ *Barcelona Strategic Plan for Culture. New Accents 2006*, approved by Barcelona City Council in December 2006.

⁴¹ *Plan de Mandat 2001-2007*, Lyon City Council.

⁴² *Journées Nos Cultures de la Ville, 5^e édition. Des politiques culturelles et artistiques à l'heure de la prise en compte des diversités*, Lyon City Council, June 2007.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

strengthened by a number of municipal offices, including the new Office for New Urban Lifestyles and Citizens' Rights.

Liverpool City Council has adopted a more assertive position by drawing up a strategic plan making the promotion of cultural diversity a priority for its cultural policy. 'The City Council's vision for the city is reflected in the objectives of the Cultural Strategy, where empowerment is explicitly mentioned as one of the three main objectives. The goal is "to empower an inclusive and dynamic community" by:

- building on the strengths of the City's cultural diversity and rich heritage;
- encouraging high quality and excellence in all aspects of culture;
- enabling local people to take an active part in planning the future of their communities;
- increasing opportunities for people of all ages, abilities, and circumstances to experience or take part in a wide range of high quality activities.'⁴³

E) Cross-subsidisation

Intercultural projects are covered by complex institutional arrangements. The cross-subsidisation that they require is much greater than for other cultural and arts projects and involves public and private partnerships and all levels of local government.

It is also regrettable that intercultural projects are more readily accommodated under 'social' policies than under cultural policies and that the share of cities' cultural budgets earmarked for intercultural projects remains small. Lyon city council, which allocates 19% of its municipal budget to culture (over 110 million euros), provides a sum of 500,000 euros for the cultural strand of

its urban policy; to which should be added the contribution from institutions, which is harder to assess. Ultimately a relatively small share is allotted to promotion of interculturalism. More detailed studies would be necessary to assess cities' outlay in this field.

The *Parade* and *Neuchàtoi* are typical of cross-subsidisation. It was a programme called 'Neighbourhood cultural projects' launched by the French Ministry of Culture in 1995 as part of a declared national policy to 'bridge the social divide' that made it possible to raise the initial funds to launch the *Parade*. Twelve years on, in 2008, the approximately one million euro budget is divided between four levels of government - Greater Lyon, the Rhone-Alpes region, the *département* and central government - and a smaller amount of financial support is received from private partners. This budget does not include the outlay by the region's various local authorities to support the groups taking part in the parade, nor does it take account of the contribution made by local associations and their volunteers. The festival's true budget is therefore much larger in reality.

In total, the *Neuchàtoi* project is said to have cost 680,000 Swiss francs (roughly 450,000 euros) and was subsidised by the Canton of Neuchâtel and the Confederation (Federal Commission for Foreigners) and supported by the Banque Cantonale Neuchâteloise and the Loterie Romande. Many local stakeholders made logistical contributions as well.

The participation of a large number of local businesses and residents creates a genuinely alternative, community-based economy in many neighbourhood intercultural projects. The *Tot Raval Foundation* employs 8 people and a significant share of its activities are funded by its 33 active members; cultural organisations pay a subscription, while neighbourhood traders do not contribute for lack of resources. A hundred or so organisations are involved, and each makes a financial contribution.

⁴³ Jill Robinson (ed.), *Eurocult21, Integrated Report*, Helsinki, 2005.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

Cross-subsidisation weakens the economic basis of intercultural projects, whose organisers must spend valuable time raising funds from a variety of sources. This approach does, however, have advantages in terms of project methodology, since it makes it necessary to think about the cross-cutting aspects of a project that will be part of various local processes: town-planning, social, educational, economic, security-related and cultural. To cope with this complexity, the organisers of the *Parade* have set up a steering committee bringing together various public entities as well as associations with a focus on multiculturalism (Inter Services Migrants, ISM), social integration and helping people find employment (local plan for the long-term unemployed). This committee is not just advisory; it selects participating groups on the basis of synopses of cultural and arts projects following a region-wide request for proposals. Discussion and the reaching of a consensus make it necessary to go beyond what are sometimes very narrow professional practices.

It should be noted that metropolitan areas - the result of local-authority mergers - are on their way to becoming major players in the reorganisation of local government in Europe. They have occasion to play an active part in questions of citizenship and quality of life and to transform institutional cultural policy. In this respect, intercultural dialogue might actually become a genuine priority.

Lastly, national policies and support have proved to be crucial in a good many cases. Arts Council England has been promoting diverse communities and minority groups for many years and has thus helped to justify recognition of this priority at

local level.⁴⁴ In France, the cultural strand of urban policy, which promotes social cohesion and restores the local balance within metropolitan areas, has enabled a large number of intercultural projects to emerge. Recently the calling into question of this policy at national level and the resulting adjustments have worried local officials, since urban social cohesion contracts - commitments signed between various local authorities - are currently cross-subsidising local cultural policies. More serious still is the recent refusal to support arts initiatives in foreign languages on the pretext that residents of multicultural neighbourhoods first need to master French to integrate better.⁴⁵ National policies must therefore be coherent and not convey contradictory messages, such as flagship promotion of cultural diversity on the one hand and denial of local use of minority languages on the other.

F) New types of policy engineering for 'intercultural culture'

Two phenomena are worth noting: the establishment of ad hoc bodies to meet the challenges of urban cultural diversity, and the participation of major cultural institutions in promoting interculturalism.

The cities studied in this report have devised innovative types of policy engineering to bridge local institutional divides. In **Barcelona**, the *Council for Culture* was set up as a tool for

⁴⁴ *Black, Asian and minority ethnic leadership in the creative and cultural sector*, Cultural Leadership Programme, Arts Council England, 2008.

⁴⁵ Minutes of a meeting between the Gertrude Production company and the Chief Equal Opportunities Officer of the Rhone-Alpes Region, March 2009.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

dialogue between the city council, the various sectors of the culture industry and individuals recognised in the fields of culture, the arts, and public cultural policy. Being mixed in nature - both an advisory and an executive body - the Council provides a forum for discussion and consultation while at the same time acting as a British-type Arts Council.

In **Neuchâtel**, on the other hand, promotion of interculturalism is part of a highly structured migrant reception policy. The forty-strong Working Party on Integration of Foreigners is an advisory body for the canton's State Council. Neuchâtel's Migration Department is run by people from various ethnic backgrounds who speak a range of foreign languages and have the task of working horizontally with local institutions. It is nevertheless regrettable that promotion of cultural diversity does not form part of the cultural policies of the relevant public entities in Switzerland.

In **Lyon**, various bodies are working to promote diversity. The city council has adopted a *Diversity Charter* to combat recruitment discrimination in its own departments and to encourage local businesses to do the same. A group on urban equality initiatives (*Groupe d'initiatives pour l'égalité dans la ville*, GIPEV) unites the council's own departments round this priority. This approach consists in championing cultural diversity on the grounds of rights and equal opportunities in the national republican tradition. The *Cultural Cooperation Task Force* set up in 2004 within the Cultural Affairs Directorate forms part of GIPEV. This task force, which is atypical for France, has the twofold task of managing the culture strand of urban policy⁴⁶ and helping

⁴⁶ Now known as cohesion policy, urban policy emerged in the late 1980s as a response to tensions in French suburbs. In the form of contractual arrangements between various levels of government (central, regional, metropolitan and city), it provided greater resources

cultural institutions to expand their activities for disadvantaged people and areas in the city. Twenty-two institutions - museums, the opera house, theatres, cinemas, conservatoires, dance academies, libraries, festivals, records offices and institutes - have pledged through a *Cultural Cooperation Charter* to target new audiences as a priority. The *Cultural Cooperation Task Force* provides advice to persons put forward by their institutions and puts them in contact with the relevant local bodies. Recognition of cultural diversity in all its forms is one of its priorities, as are exploring the potential of personal memories and providing assistance to emerging arts.

In the Lyon conurbation, the culture strand of the cohesion policy has always been a shared concern. However, it took three years to prepare the *Cultural Cooperation Charter*, which reiterates the duties and obligations of cultural institutions towards people alienated from these institutions. Some directors had already taken interesting initiatives along these lines, following the examples of the opera house and the Maison de la Danse, and have shown themselves allies in this process of persuasion. The design of the charter is heavily indebted to the project engineering used for urban policy measures, although it aims well beyond a local approach. Cultural stakeholders are to be helped to bring about a change of attitude higher up the chain. To do this, it has proved essential to have a suitable support body - the *Cultural Cooperation Task Force* - which has encouraged policy-makers, technical experts and cultural officials to share the same vision and find a balance between quality, a detailed local approach and the particularities of the people concerned. **A policy consensus has been reached on this new process, which remains a priority during the city council's current term of**

for socially and economically disadvantaged neighbourhoods. It considered cultural questions in terms of their contribution to social cohesion and how they helped to build individuals' personal skills.

office but will probably require more financial resources and clearer political support.

Liverpool City Council has also heavily backed this process of relying on the city's cultural institutions: 'Community arts also include projects initiated from above by city administrations or cultural institutions such as museums and libraries. Where the self-organised artistic expression often encompasses the right of difference, the more top-down organized projects more often aim at ensuring the right of equality.'⁴⁷

Involving a city's major cultural and arts institutions in promoting interculturalism has many advantages and is probably the key challenge for cities' cultural policies in future:

- they concentrate high-quality skills and resources that can be used to promote cultural diversity.
- they can make available venues and significant logistic resources which are already included in the city's cultural budget.
- they have substantial symbolic significance, which give intercultural projects considerable legitimacy.

G) Interculturalism: a challenge for local democracy and sustainable development

'Power must follow the threefold requirement of distancing itself from partisan positions and individual interests (legitimacy of impartiality), recognising multiple expressions of the general good (legitimacy of reflexivity) and recognising every

*type of particularity (legitimacy of proximity).'*⁴⁸ Pierre Rosanvallon thus reminds us of the duties entailed by the exercise of power in modern-day democratic societies and explains the political challenges: determining the general good while recognising citizens' diversity. This is the complex task confronting today's authorities, and especially local elected representatives since they work at local level in proximity to citizens.

However, the concept of proximity with regard to cities cannot be reduced to a geographical and spatial approach. Pierre Rosanvallon identifies three variables inherent in it: *'a position variable, an interaction variable and an intervention variable. Proximity firstly defines an attitude of power towards society. Proximity here means presence, attention, empathy and compassion, physical data combined with psychological elements; it refers to being side by side in the different senses of the term. Secondly, as interaction, proximity is one form of the relationship between governed and governing. For the latter, proximity means being accessible, responsive and in touch as well as pro-active and ready to explain without sheltering behind the letter of tradition; it therefore means taking risks and acting transparently out of the public gaze while in return giving society the opportunity to be heard and taken into consideration. Thirdly, proximity implies attention to the particularity of each situation. It here means being concerned about everyone.'*

Intercultural policy, by making it necessary to rethink proximity with a city's citizens, can make an important contribution to democratic legitimacy at a time when politics is in crisis.

⁴⁸ Pierre Rosanvallon, *La légitimité démocratique : impartialité, réflexivité, proximité*, Seuil, 2008.

⁴⁷ Jill Robinson (ed.), *op. cit.*

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

In conclusion, it should be added that cultural diversity has now become established as the fourth pillar of sustainable development, and some cultural operators receive local-authority support for this purpose.⁴⁹ City councils are gradually accepting their responsibilities in this field through action plans and landmark documents such as Agenda 21, Agenda 21 for Culture and the Aalborg Charter.

At a seminar⁵⁰ organised by UNESCO's Division of Cultural Policies and Intercultural Dialogue in July 2009 to review the framework for cultural policy in the light of the international Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions, four principles to guide the work of intercultural cities emerged from the experts' discussion: **human rights, diversity and intercultural dialogue, democracy, and sustainable development.**

H) Defining culture means defining a cultural policy

By way of conclusion, I shall take the above maxim coined by Jordi Marti, a **Barcelona** city councillor with responsibility for culture, in a recent publication.⁵¹ The examples used in this report

⁴⁹ For example, the **EOLO association** for *Partage des eaux*, a performance put on in the amphitheatre of the Lyon opera house.

⁵⁰ Tu Weiming, professor at Harvard University and Peking University, 'Intercultural dialogue: cultural diversity and ecological consciousness'.

⁵¹ Jordi Marti and Carles Giner, 'Barcelone : des politiques culturelles pour le développement culturel de la ville', in special report on 'Comment les métropoles font-elles vivre la culture ?', *L'Observatoire. La Revue des politiques culturelles*, December 2008.

show that the idea of culture adopted at local level predetermines the type of public policy that is to be promoted.

Let us borrow a definition of cultural globalisation from the philosopher Gérard Leclerc: '*Cultural globalisation consists of two distinct fields: on the one hand, products that are symbolic, attractive, recreational, etc., conveyed chiefly by the media, and, on the other, core values and basic norms that take many different and less obvious paths (individual contacts, face-to-face meetings and sacred group rituals but also events carried by the global media).*'⁵² We thus find a lay dimension, an '*international supermarket of culture*', coexisting with a spiritual dimension, '*the museum of the imagination*'. Cities' cultural policies today generally hinge on these two dimensions, present in differing proportions. Through this approach, intercultural projects can take place in many different forms and venues if city councils encourage a variety of processes.

The need for active policies is becoming apparent, since we should remember that 'benevolent neutrality in itself is just an illusion, an abstraction and a myth and entirely fails to answer the discrimination and rejection experienced by dominated groups in metropolitan areas.'⁵³ While city councils may find encouragement in national or regional policies and cannot divorce themselves from the international policy context, the fact remains that they have direct and immediate responsibility for managing local intercultural policy. **To exercise this responsibility fully, they must effect a paradigm shift in their public cultural policies by making promotion of diversity and intercultural dialogue a priority and even a matter of urgency.**

⁵² Gérard Leclerc, 'Mondes émergents et civilisations à l'épreuve', *Esprit*, No. 12 (*L'envers et l'endroit du monde*), December 2000.

⁵³ Bernard Jouve and Alain-G. Gagnon (eds), *Les métropoles au défi de la diversité culturelle*, Presses Universitaires de Grenoble, 2006.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

By promoting the Intercultural Cities programme, the Council of Europe has once more shown its ability to innovate and anticipate and will have a positive impact on local and national authorities. However, the programme still gives too little consideration to culture and the arts. Policy discourse also reflects this void. In Jens Nilsson's report for the Council of Europe,⁵⁴ cultural policies and their ability to promote interculturalism are not even mentioned. This may be the consequence of an approach that is too 'culturalist' and does not leave enough room for imagination and creativity.

It is to be hoped that this report will help to restore the balance and encourage recognition of interculturalism in arts initiatives and cultural policies.

⁵⁴ Congress of Local and Regional Authorities, plenary session, March 2008. Launch of Intercultural Cities programme.

5 - Recommendations on intercultural urban governance

Three ideas must guide design of present-day cultural policies at local level: **democracy, citizenship and diversity**. These may nevertheless take many different forms while striving for civic and social innovation.

Strategies

- ↳ In city-council planning documents, **adopt a specific strategy (identifiable as such but tied in with other fields of public action)** for culture and intercultural activities.
- ↳ Make **interculturalism a priority** for cultural policies (**as one aspect of collective action rather than a specific sector**) rather than sidelining it.
- ↳ **Understand the different meanings of interculturalism:** in relation to ethnic group, social background, the arts, gender, generation, age, occupation, etc., in order not to confuse 'intercultural' with 'cross-community'.
- ↳ Promote a **culture- and arts-based approach to all the city council's sectoral policies** by urging elected representatives, technical experts and authority employees to adopt a shared cultural vision. Build the city-council plan for culture on horizontal links between the city council's various departments.
- ↳ Set up **resident participation bodies** at both neighbourhood and city-council level in order to build cultural policies jointly and help the public grasp the strategy and master the cultural tools. Provide for the setting-up of a council for culture (Barcelona).

↳ **Confront dissension by organising debate** about conflicts and cultural images and highlighting individual prejudices. Foster discussion on intercultural questions. Do not confine this to intellectual circles; organise it in working-class neighbourhoods.

↳ Encourage **cultural and arts teams to become involved** in producing and publicising intercultural projects. Alert artists to intercultural work and explore the potential of their existing practices.

↳ **Strengthen the educational dimension** of cultural, arts and especially intercultural policies through formal education (in schools), informal education (in centres for extracurricular activities and out-of-school education) and lifelong learning (in lifelong learning centres, open universities, universities of the third age, etc.).

↳ **Rethink international cultural relations** through the prism of cooperation and co-development, taking account of the origins of the people living in the local area. Rely on support from diasporas and individuals from other countries to explore the potential of their cultures, set up exchanges abroad and demonstrate within the city the reality of living cultures from elsewhere while identifying 'fantasised' identities.

↳ **Seek a balance**, especially in terms of funding, between high-profile actions (public events, festivals, celebrations in public spaces, etc.), more 'behind-the-scenes' activities (collection and preservation of heritage and personal memories, educational activities, research, etc.) and sundry facilities, large and small.

Resources

↳ Introduce **specific tools to promote and support interculturalism** in the city council's cultural affairs department

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

in liaison with other city-council departments: **horizontal support task force** (Lyon's cooperation task force), **study and discussion workshops, awareness groups, etc.**

↳ **Involve the city's most prestigious institutions in the intercultural adventure** by helping them forge ties with multicultural neighbourhoods and their residents: commitment to a charter, organisation of periods of evaluation and exchange of practices, drafting of compendia of case studies, symbolic activities by the mayor and elected representatives, etc.

↳ **Encourage emergence of intercultural provision** through high-profile and neighbourhood events: redirect the city budget for culture to these priority activities by setting up a cross-subsidised fund for intercultural initiatives.

↳ **Promote diverse forms of action bringing together stakeholders of various types and sizes:** network highly specialised institutions (city records office) with non-specialist centres (schools), and mass celebrations (National Music Day) with collections (City Ethnology Museum), etc.. Decentralisation is needed to encourage meeting of people from different worlds.

↳ **Provide time for artists and cultural mediators:** periods in residence that may be short- or long-term (several years), collection of personal memories, researching of an area's cultural resources, studies of residents' practices, etc.

↳ **Jointly build shared evaluation procedures:** mobilise existing resident-consultation bodies (neighbourhood councils, development councils, users' associations, etc.) regarding evaluation criteria for cultural and arts activities. Be careful to evaluate the processes at work as well as the results.

↳ **Offer training to cultural and public policy-makers:**⁵⁵ make time for this and invite intellectuals, researchers and teachers specialising in intercultural matters to discuss the challenges, ambiguities and riches of interculturalism.

The author

Pascale Bonniel Chalier has been teaching cultural policy, project methodology and international cultural cooperation since 1984 in universities and vocational training centres in France and Europe, and in particular at the Université Lumière Lyon 2 and ENSATT (the National College of Theatrical Arts and Techniques). She is a founder member of ENCATC (European Network of Cultural Administration Training Centres), a network set up in 1992 under the auspices of the Council of Europe and today supported by the European Union and UNESCO. She participated in the expert committee on redesigning UNESCO's cultural policy framework and is a member of the United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) Committee on Culture. She was a Lyon city councillor from 2001 to 2008 and in April 2008 was elected to the Greater Lyon Council.

⁵⁵ In October 2009 the council of the 8th arrondissement of Lyon, the *Maison des Passages* intercultural centre and the *Ecarts d'identité* magazine organised a meeting on 'Culture smugglers and the dynamics of mixing' in the *Espace Citoyen* of the 8th arrondissement's town hall. A DVD is being produced.

6 - Select bibliography

Books, articles and dissertations

Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, Verso, 1991.

Appadurai, Arjun, *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*, University of Minnesota Press, 1996.

Autissier, Anne-Marie (ed.), *Intercultural Dialogue(s) in Europe. Intersecting Outlooks on the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue*, Culture Europe International, 2009.

Banlieues d'Europe (ed.), *La place et le rôle de la fête dans l'espace public. Nouvelles fêtes urbaines et nouvelles convivialités en Europe*, CERTU, 2006.

Blouët, Christelle, 'L'Agenda 21 de la culture en France : état des lieux et perspectives', unpublished master's dissertation, University of Angers, 2008.

Bonet, Lluís, 'Diversitat cultural i polítiques interculturals a Barcelona', *Documentos CIDOB: Dinámicas interculturales*, No. 6, 2006.

Bonet, Lluís and Emmanuel Négrier (eds), *La fin des cultures nationales ?*, La Découverte/Pacte, 2008.

Chaouite, Abdellatif, *L'interculturel comme art de vivre*, L'Harmattan, 2007.

Costanzo, Elsa, 'Quelles possibilités pour les projets interculturels de répondre aux enjeux du désir contemporain de reconnaissance ? Étude de trois cas', unpublished master's dissertation, Université Lumière Lyon 2, 2008.

Donzelot, Jacques, *Faire société*, Seuil, 2003.

Dragisevic-Sesic, Milena, *La culture en tant que ressource du développement urbain*, Fondation Marcel Hicter pour la Démocratie Culturelle, March 2007.

Guibal, Jean, 'Patrimoines, diversité culturelle et dynamique territoriale', *L'Observatoire. La Revue des politiques culturelles*, No. 29, winter 2006.

Honneth, Axel, *The Struggle for Recognition: Moral Grammar of Social Conflicts*, Polity Press, 1996.

Hurstel, Jean, *Réenchâter la ville*, L'Harmattan, 2006.

Jouve, Bernard and Alain-G. Gagnon (eds), *Les métropoles au défi de la diversité culturelle*, Presses Universitaires de Grenoble, 2006.

Khaznadar, Cherif, 'Diversité culturelle et accueil des cultures étrangères', *L'Observatoire. La Revue des politiques culturelles*, No. 30, summer 2006.

Laaksonen, Annamari, 'Local Policies for Cultural Diversity. With Emphasis on Latin America and Europe', in *Local Policies for Cultural Diversity*, a study commissioned by the UNESCO Division of Cultural Policies and Intercultural Dialogue from the Working Group on Culture, UCLG, September 2006.

Leclerc, Gérard, 'Mondes émergents et civilisations à l'épreuve', *Esprit*, No. 12 (*L'envers et l'endroit du monde*), December 2000.

Lucas, Jean Michel, *La critique des politiques culturelles à l'aune de la diversité culturelle*, Bordeaux, January 2006.

Lucas, Jean Michel, 'Le médiateur culturel : héros malheureux de la culture universelle ou hardi négociateur dans la société de la diversité culturelle ?', lecture in Montreuil, April 2006

Marti, Jordi and Carles Giner, 'Barcelone : des politiques culturelles pour le développement culturel de la ville', in special report on 'Comment les

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

métropoles font-elles vivre la culture?', *L'Observatoire. La Revue des politiques culturelles*, December 2008.

Moulin, Raymonde, *L'artiste, l'institution et le marché*, Flammarion, 1992.

Morin, Edgar, 'Vitalité de la diversité culturelle et mondialisation', *L'Observatoire. La Revue des politiques culturelles*, No. 33, May 2008.

Pascual, Jordi and Sanjin Dragojevic, *Guide to Citizen Participation in Local Cultural Policy Development for European Cities*, European Cultural Foundation, 2007.

Pascual, Jordi, 'Exploring Local Policies for Cultural Diversity', in *Local Policies for Cultural Diversity*, a study commissioned by the UNESCO Division of Cultural Policies and Intercultural Dialogue from the Working Group on Culture, UCLG, 2006.

Pascual, Jordi, 'Culture and sustainable development: examples of institutional innovation and proposal of a new cultural policy profile', paper for the expert meeting 'Towards a New Cultural Policy Framework', UNESCO, July 2009.

Rautenberg, Michel, 'L' « interculturel », une expression de l'imaginaire social de l'altérité', *Hommes et migrations*, special issue, November 2008.

Rosanvallon, Pierre, *La légitimité démocratique : impartialité, réflexivité, proximité*, Seuil, 2008.

Saez, Jean-Pierre, 'Repères pour mieux comprendre le débat sur la diversité culturelle', *L'Observatoire. La Revue des politiques culturelles*, No. 29, winter 2006.

Said, Edward, *Culture and Imperialism*, Vintage, 1998.

Taylor, Charles, *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition*, Princeton University Press, 1994.

Weiming, Tu, 'Intercultural dialogue: cultural diversity and ecological consciousness', paper for the expert meeting 'Towards a New Cultural Policy Framework', UNESCO, July 2009.

Wood, Phil and Charles Landry, *The Intercultural City: Planning for Diversity Advantage*, Earthscan, 2008.

De la diversité culturelle au dialogue interculturel, Culture et Recherche, No. 114-115, Ministère de la culture et de la communication, Paris, winter 2007-2008.

Démocratisation culturelle, diversité culturelle, cohésion sociale, Culture et Recherche, No. 106-107, Ministère de la culture et de la communication, December 2005.

Journées Nos Cultures de la Ville, 5^e édition. Des politiques culturelles et artistiques à l'heure de la prise en compte des diversités, Lyon City Council, June 2007.

External evaluation report on the Neuchâtois project by KEK-CDC Consultants, March 2007.

Black, Asian and minority ethnic leadership in the creative and cultural sector, Cultural Leadership Programme, Arts Council England, 2008.

Culture and Social Cohesion: Positive Interventions in European Cities, study commissioned by the Directorate General for Community Services of the Department of Welfare and Family Affairs of the Government of Catalonia, Interarts Foundation, 2003.

Draft Charter of Cultural Rights and Obligations, Interarts Foundation and Barcelona Culture Institute, 2003.

Interculturalism in the cultural policies of European cities - Pascale Bonniel Chalier

Reference documents

Barcelona Strategic Plan for Culture, approved by Barcelona City Council, December 2006.

Congress of Local and Regional Authorities, plenary session, March 2008. Launch of Intercultural Cities programme.

Council of Europe, *Intercultural cities: Governance and policies for diverse communities*.

Council of Europe, *Intercultural cities: Progress report 2008*.

Council of Europe, *White Paper on intercultural dialogue*.

Deliverington: Kensington Regeneration Annual Report 2007-2008.

Eurocult21, Integrated Report, Jill Robinson (ed.), Helsinki, 2005.

Groupe de Fribourg, *Declaration on Cultural Rights*, May 2007.

Plan de Mandat 2001/2007, Lyon City Council.

UNDP, *Cultural Liberty in Today's Diverse World*, 2004.

UNESCO, *Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions*, Paris, 20 October 2005.

United Cities and Local Governments, *Agenda 21 for Culture*, Barcelona, May 2004.

United Cities and Local Governments, *Let's Build the Inclusive Cities of the 21st Century*, Committee on Social Inclusion and Participative Democracy, 2008.

Websites

International

Agenda 21 for Culture: www.agenda21culture.net

Council of Europe: www.coe.int

'Observatoire de la diversité et des droits culturels' research group coordinated by Patrice Meyer-Bisch:
<https://www.unifr.ch/iiedh/fr/recherches/current>

UCLG: www.cities-localgovernments.org

UNESCO: www.unesco.org

Cities and cultural organisations

City of Neuchâtel: <http://www.neuchatoi.ch/>

Barcelona Culture Institute:
<http://www.bcn.cat/cultura/dialeg/eng/index.html>
Tot Raval Foundation: www.totraval.org

City of Lyon: www.culture.lyon.fr and www.polville.lyon.fr

Sixth Continent Festival: www.sixiemecontinent.net

Nouveau Théâtre du 8e: www.NTH8.com

City of Berlin: www.intransitos.de

City of Liverpool: www.liverpool08.com