



fcnm

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON THE
FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE
PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES**



COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

ACFC/SRV(2021)002

Fifth Report submitted by the Russian Federation

**Pursuant to Article 25, paragraph 2 of the Framework
Convention for the Protection of National Minorities –
received on 13 April 2021**

The fifth state report submitted by the Russian Federation (ACFC/SRV(2021)002) has been made public by the Council of Europe Secretariat in accordance with Article 22 of Resolution CM/Res(2019)49 on the revised monitoring arrangements under Articles 24 to 26 of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. The report has been prepared under the sole responsibility of the Russian Federation.

Being committed under the relevant Committee of Ministers decisions (e.g. CM/Del/Dec(2014)1196/1.8, CM/Del/Dec(2014)1207/1.5, CM/Del/Dec(2015)1225/1.8, CM/Del/Dec(2016)1254/1.6, CM/Del/Dec(2017)1285/2.1bisb) to uphold the sovereignty and territorial integrity of Ukraine, the Council of Europe does not recognise any alteration of status of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the City of Sevastopol.

Unofficial translation

FIFTH REPORT SUBMITTED BY THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION
PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 25, PARAGRAPH 1 OF THE FRAMEWORK
CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION
OF NATIONAL MINORITIES

Moscow, 2021

CONTENTS

SUMMARY OF THE REPORT³

PREAMBLE⁷

PART I. THE MAIN DIRECTIONS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF THE
FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL
MINORITIES IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION¹³

1. The indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation¹³
2. The work of the Ombudsperson for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples¹⁷
3. Protection of national minorities in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol²⁶

PART II. ARTICLE-FOR-ARTICLE COMMENTARY TO THE
FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL
MINORITIES TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF
THE FOURTH MONITORING CYCLE³⁸

Articles 3 of the Framework Convention³⁸

Article 4 of the Framework Convention⁴⁵

Article 5 of the Framework Convention⁶³

Article 6 of the Framework Convention⁸⁰

Article 7 of the Framework Convention⁸⁴

Article 8 of the Framework Convention⁹⁰

Article 9 of the Framework Convention⁹²

Article 10 of the Framework Convention⁹⁵

Article 11 of the Framework Convention¹⁰²

Article 12 of the Framework Convention¹⁰²

Article 14 of the Framework Convention¹²⁰

Article 15 of the Framework Convention¹²¹

Articles 17 and 18 of the Framework Convention¹²⁴

SUMMARY OF THE REPORT

This report is the national report submitted by the Russian Federation on the implementation of provisions of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (hereinafter referred to as “the Framework Convention”, “the Convention”) within the fifth monitoring cycle.

The report covers the period from 2017 to 2020 and includes a description of the full range of measures aimed at implementing the provisions of the Convention in the Russian Federation since the submission of the fourth national report.

This report was prepared by the Government of the Russian Federation and reflects its position. In preparing the report, consultations were held with non-governmental organizations (federal national cultural autonomies, human rights organizations, religious organizations, etc.) and expert institutions.

Particularities of the geographical position of the Russian State, the specific character of historical, political and legal processes of its formation led to the ethnic and cultural diversity of the population. Russia was historically formed as a multinational State, with the Russian people at its core. "Over the centuries, most of the peoples of Russia were formed on the territory of the Russian State" and for that reason, they are categorized as indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation. The representatives from 193 ethnic groups, speaking 277 languages and dialects, live in the Russian Federation.

Many religions are practiced in the Russian Federation, with Christianity, Islam, Judaism, Buddhism being the most common. The State guarantees freedom of worship.

The Russian Federation focuses on inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations, takes measures to harmonize them, as well as to prevent extremism, xenophobia, to ensure the constitutional rights and freedoms of the Russian

citizens regardless of their nationality, religion, political and other opinions and beliefs.

Russia ensures protection of rights of the Russian citizens, including representatives of national minorities, facilitates their ethnic and cultural development and maintains the national and linguistic identity, unimpeded access to education, participation in public associations, use of mass media and exercise of voting rights. The Russian Federation enforces the policy towards national minorities within the implementation of the provisions of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities.

The key approaches to the State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation towards national minorities, achievements in this area, as well as in the area of improvement of the Russian legislation on the prevention of, responding to and suppression of inter-ethnic intolerance or hatred are specified in the thematic sections of the report. A special emphasis is given in the report to the preservation and development of the culture of the peoples of the Russian Federation, as well as to the maintenance of linguistic diversity.

The activity of the state authorities of the Russian Federation aimed at protecting national minorities is based on the coherent legal and regulatory framework, including the Constitution of the Russian Federation, federal laws, other legal acts, as well as regional legislation of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation. The report contains information on the areas of the state authorities' activity to enhance legislation and public administration system with a view to improving the situation of national minorities and their comfortable existence in the Russian Federation.

The Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs was established under the Government of the Russian Federation by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 168 of 31 March 2015, to perform the following functions:

- to develop and implement the State nationalities policy, state policy on social and cultural adaptation and integration of foreign nationals in the Russian Federation, as well as to regulate and provide public services within the State nationalities policy, social and cultural adaptation and integration of foreign nationals in the Russian Federation;
- to implement measures aimed at enhancing the unity of the multinational people of the Russian Federation (Russian nation), to ensure inter-ethnic harmony, ethnic and cultural development of the peoples of the Russian Federation, to protect the rights of national minorities and indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation;
- to interact with national and cultural autonomies, Cossack societies and other civil society institutions;
- to develop and implement the state and federal target programs in the area of inter-ethnic relations;
- to control the enforcement of the State nationalities policy;
- to implement the state monitoring in the area of inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations;
- to prevent any forms of discrimination on racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic grounds;
- to prevent attempts to incite racial, ethnic and religious dissension, hatred or hostility.

The Russian Federation recognizes and respects the leading role of civil society in the development and enforcement of the national and ethno-cultural state policy.

The financing of the ethno-cultural activities, support of indigenous small-numbered peoples, including those living under extreme conditions in the North,

Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation, measures to maintain and develop native languages, increase access to quality education and health care are stipulated in the budget of the Russian Federation, as well as the budgets of the constituent entities and municipalities in specific lines.

Separate sections of the report are devoted to practical steps aimed at the development of ethnic culture, ethnically-oriented education, mass media broadcasting in minority languages.

It is emphasized herein that the Russian Federation considers the Framework Convention as a genuine instrument to ensure the protection of rights of national minorities, and takes into account its provisions during enforcement of the state policy towards national minorities. The Russian Federation also takes into account the relevant international commitments undertaken, and the Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe received following the fourth stage of monitoring of implementation of the provisions of the Framework Convention (hereinafter referred to as the Recommendations). The Framework Convention is implemented, *inter alia*, by adoption and implementation of all strategic planning documents in the Russian Federation.

The above documents provide not only the tools for implementing nationalities policy, but also specify the vector of further development.

The fourth opinion on the Russian Federation adopted by the Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention on 20 February 2018 was published on official websites of the relevant federal state authorities and sent to the authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation for its elaboration, consideration and practical implementation.

PREAMBLE

The Framework Convention was ratified by the Russian Federation by Federal Law No. 84-FZ of 18 June 1998, *On Ratification of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities* and is an integral part of the legal system of the Russian Federation.

Article 15, paragraph 4 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation stipulates that "if an international agreement of the Russian Federation establishes rules, which differ from those stipulated by law, then the rules of the international agreement shall be applied". This approach is also inherent in the State Nationalities Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation for the Period until 2025¹ (hereinafter to as "the Strategy"). Paragraph 3 of the Strategy states that it "is based on the provisions of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, generally recognized principles and rules of international law, and international treaties to which Russia is a party."

According to the Constitution of the Russian Federation, the regulation of rights of national minorities is under the jurisdiction of the Russian Federation, and the protection of rights of national minorities is under the joint jurisdiction of the Russian Federation and the constituent entities of the Russian Federation (Article 71(c), Article 72(b) of the Constitution of the Russian Federation). The responsibility of the Russian Federation and the constituent entities of the Russian Federation is based on the generally accepted principles of democracy, as well as principles of equal rights and self-determination of the peoples of the Russian Federation (Article 1, paragraph 1, Article 5, paragraph 3 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation), the obligation of the Russian Federation to protect human and civil rights and freedoms in its territory regardless of nationality

¹ Approved by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 1666 of 19 December 2012 (rev. on 6 December 2018).

(Article 19, paragraph 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation), the obligation of the Russian Federation to preserve native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation (Article 68, paragraph 3 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, Article 8 of Federal Law No. 74-FZ of 17 June 1996, *On National and Cultural Autonomy*, Article 14 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 129 December 2012, *On Education in the Russian Federation*).

Ban on propaganda and agitation causing social, racial, national or religious hatred and hostility, as well as propaganda of social, racial, national, religious or linguistic supremacy, is directed toward the protection of rights of national minorities (Article 29, paragraph 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, Article 1, paragraph 1 of Federal Law No. 114-FZ of 25 July 2002, *On Combating Extremist Activity*, Article 282 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation No. 63-FZ of 13 June 1996).

An expansive interpretation of the term "national minority" is used in this report, and "rights of national minorities" mean the rights of ethnic communities in general and the rights of an individual citizen of the Russian Federation claiming to belong to a national minority in the territory of the Russian Federation under the principle of self-determination. "The protection of rights of national minorities" in the Russian Federation means not only prevention, detection and suppression of unlawful extremist acts, but ensuring of exercise of rights of national minorities on the preservation of their traditions, culture, language and identity.

Improvement of the legal and regulatory framework in the protection of rights of national minorities is one of the priorities of the State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation.

The period, since the previous report was submitted within the fourth monitoring cycle, has been characterized by a stepping-up of efforts of the state and civil society to improve the legal coverage and preserve the resource

provision of activities in the area of inter-ethnic relations, to establish the inter-agency cooperation and coordination.

The organizational and legal fundamentals for activities of the law enforcement agencies to enforce the legislation related to inter-ethnic relations, to prevent and investigate the extremist crimes have been strengthened.

The state authorities of the Russian Federation focus on meeting the social, economic, ethnic and cultural needs of national minorities in culture, science and education.

The cultural wealth of the Russian Federation consists in diversity of the peoples inhabiting its territory, and, according to President of the Russian Federation Vladimir Putin, the national question is fundamental for Russia². The understanding of the importance of these processes determines the state policy in preservation and development of languages of peoples of the Russian Federation, their identity, study of the culture of the various ethnic communities, harmonization of inter-ethnic relations.

Every people has contributed and seamlessly participated in the formation of the Russian national identity, and the Russian culture has absorbed the traditions and ethnic culture of the peoples of Russia. Thus, maintenance of unity in diversity is a long-term vector of development of the national policy in Russia.

The relevant sections of the report contain information on the basic area of enforcement of the State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation and implementation of the provisions of the Framework Convention.

During the reporting period, considerable work has been done in the Russian Federation to improve the activity of public institutions in the field of preventing and combating racial discrimination, ethnic dissension by various forms of extremism. The federal and regional legislation has been considerably

² Article by Vladimir Putin. "*Russia: The National Question*", January 23, 2012, *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*)

developed. Initiatives in the adoption of new laws and regulations were accompanied by public social discussion, which made it possible to take into account the views of representatives of civil society, including those representing the interests of national minorities, as much as possible.

On 6 December 2018, the President of the Russian Federation Vladimir Putin signed a decree amending the State Nationalities Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation for the period until 2025, approved by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 1666 of 19 December 2012. The new version specifies the priorities of State nationalities policy, takes into account best practices and new mechanisms for implementing the Strategy at the federal, regional and local levels.

The Strategy is supplemented with definitions of key concepts, such as "state nationalities policy," "civic unity," "the Russian nation," "cross-national (inter-ethnic) relations," and other concepts elaborated by the Research Council Scientific of the Russian Academy of Sciences dealing with systemic issues related to ethnicity and inter-ethnic relations.

The new version of the Strategy reflects the current state of cross-national (inter-ethnic) relations, the results achieved in ensuring inter-ethnic peace and harmony in the country, new challenges and threats in the area of State nationalities policy, as well as instruments and mechanisms for implementing the policy. Furthermore, the Strategy sets targets and expected results in the implementation of the State nationalities policy in order to ensure oversight in addressing pressing issues.

Following the approval of the Strategy, the constituent entities of the Russian Federation adopted regional guidelines on the implementation of State nationalities policy.

The basic principles of the Strategy include, in particular:

- ensuring the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples (small ethnic communities), including support of their economic, social and cultural development, protection of native habitat and traditional ways of life;
- ensuring the rights of national minorities.

According to Federal Law No. 284-FZ of 22 October 2013, *On Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation with regard to Determination of the Powers and Responsibilities of State Authorities of the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation, Local Authorities and their Officials in the Area of Inter-Ethnic Relations*, the powers of the authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation include a set of measures to ensure the state guarantees of the equality of human and civil rights, freedoms and legitimate interests, regardless of race, nationality, language, religion and other circumstances. The regional authorities are empowered to preserve and develop the ethnic and cultural diversity of peoples, their languages and culture, protect the rights of national minorities, ensure social and cultural adaptation of migrants, prevent inter-ethnic conflicts. The law also stipulates that the chief executive of a municipality or the local administration may be dismissed in case of mass violation of human rights and freedoms on racial, ethnic, religious grounds, or restriction of the rights on racial, national, linguistic or religious grounds occurred.

Genuine mechanisms for taking into account the interests of ethnic communities and preventing ethnic conflicts have been established at various government levels in the form of advisory and coordinating councils within executive bodies, parliamentary assemblies, working groups, public chambers, etc. Effective support on the part of the state authorities for specific initiatives and projects of nongovernmental organizations has been provided.

The following sections of the report provide information on the main areas of implementation of State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation and the fulfillment of the basic provisions of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities.

PART I. THE MAIN DIRECTIONS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

1. The indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation

Among the peoples living in the Russian Federation, the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation (hereinafter referred to as "indigenous peoples") have a special place. The Russian legislation provides for the special status of indigenous small-numbered peoples with a population of less than 50,000. Today, 40 such peoples are clustered in 28 constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

The existing legislation of the Russian Federation on non-profit organizations provides for the formation of indigenous communities of the Russian Federation to protect their native habitat, preserve and develop traditional ways of life, economy, trades and culture.

Under Article 6.1 of Federal Law No. 7-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Non-Profit Organizations*, indigenous communities are recognized as forms of self-organization of persons belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation united according to the blood relationship (family or kind) and/or territorial and neighborhood principles.

At present, 1,543 communities of indigenous small-numbered peoples are registered in the territory of the Russian Federation.

Federal Law No. 104-FZ of 20 July 2000 *On General Principles for Organization of Communities of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East* is the basis for the legal regulation of relations with regard to the organization, activities, reorganization, and liquidation of indigenous communities.

Improvement of the legal and regulatory framework in the protection of rights of national minorities is one of the priorities of the State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation. The process of improving the legislative framework covers all government levels, including the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

In 2019, Federal Law No. 234-FZ *On Amendments to Article 5 and 8 of the Federal Law "On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation"* granting the Government of the Russian Federation authority to establish procedures for compensating losses incurred by small-numbered peoples and their associations as a result of damage to their native habitat was adopted.

A draft federal law *On Amendments to the Federal Law "On General Principles for Organization of Communities of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East"* was elaborated to improve the procedures for the organization and activities of indigenous communities.

The Russian Federation adopted Federal Law No. 11-FZ of 6 February 2020, *On Amendments to the Federal Law "On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation" with regard to Establishing the Procedure for Registration of Persons Belonging to Indigenous Minorities*", under which amendments were made to Federal Law No. 82-FZ of 30 April 1999, *On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation*, providing for the register of persons belonging to the small-numbered peoples, the grounds for keeping a list of such persons, which is used by state authorities, local governments and state off-budget funds as a source of information required to ensure the enjoyment of social and economic rights by persons belonging to the small-numbered peoples, as well as defining the composition of and procedure for submitting information contained

in the list and designating the Russian Government as the body empowered to determine the procedure for keeping the list and for providing the information contained in it.

The adoption of this Federal Law is aimed at enhancing the social protection of persons belonging to the small-numbered peoples and at facilitating the full enjoyment of their social and economic rights enshrined in the legislation of the Russian Federation.

In order to implement Federal Law No. 11-FZ, the following laws and regulations have been adopted:

1. Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 882 of 19 June 2020 *On Amendments to the Regulation of the FAEA of Russia*, stipulating the authority of the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs to keep records and elaborate a list of persons belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation.

2. Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 752 of 26 May 2020 *On Amendments to the Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 255 of 24 March 2000*, stipulating the authority of the FAEA of Russia to prepare proposals for the approval of the Unified Register of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation by the Government of the Russian Federation.

3. Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1257 of 19 August 2020 *On Amendments to the Regulation on the State Information System for Monitoring in the Sphere of Interethnic and Inter-Confessional Relations and Early Prevention of Conflict Situations*, supplementing the System for Monitoring with the task of forming a list of persons belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation and maintaining it in accordance with the established procedure.

4. Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1520 of 23 September 2020 *On Adoption of the Rules for Maintaining the List of Persons Belonging to Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation, for Providing Information Contained therein and Inter-Agency Cooperation Related to its Maintenance.*

According to this resolution, starting from 7 February 2022, state and local authorities will use the information on persons on the list to ensure their social and economic rights.

To provide public services, the FAEA of Russia will keep the list in electronic form using a special module of the State System for Monitoring of the FAEA of Russia.

The list will be based on information and documents submitted by citizens, indigenous communities, as well as by federal executive authorities and local self-government bodies at the request of the FAEA of Russia.

The annual provision of state support for economic and social development of indigenous peoples by means of subsidies from the federal budget to the budgets of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation is envisaged by the State Program of the Russian Federation entitled *Implementation of State Nationalities Policy*, approved by Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1532 of 29 December 2016 (RUB 156.2 million annually).

In accordance with Federal Law No. 82 of 30 April 1999 *On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation*, a list of places of the native habitat and traditional economic activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation was approved by Order of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 631-r of 8 May 2009 to preserve the native habitat, traditional ways of life and traditional, economy and trades of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation.

In accordance with Article 11, paragraph 6 of Federal Law No. 166-FZ of 15 December 2001 *On State Provision of Pensions in the Russian Federation*, a list of areas of residence of small-numbered peoples of the North was approved by Government Decision No. 1049 of 1 October 2015 to provide the social old-age pension.

To prevent negative manifestations in the environment of indigenous small-numbered peoples and develop constructive civic, informational, and international engagement, the FAEA of Russia has elaborated long-term projects entitled "Indigenous Small-numbered Peoples. School of Public Diplomacy" and "Institutional Development of Indigenous Small-numbered Peoples and Social Responsibility of Industrial Companies" aimed at enhancing interaction between industrial companies and indigenous small-numbered peoples.

2. The work of the Ombudsperson for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples

Protection of the rights of national minorities is an important part of the activities of the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Russian Federation (hereinafter referred to as the Commissioner) and is carried out in accordance with the provisions of Federal Constitutional Law No. 1-FKZ of 26 February 1997 *On the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Russian Federation* as part of the work to consider complaints from citizens, improve Russian human rights legislation, develop international cooperation on human rights, and to provide legal education with respect to human rights and freedoms.

All citizens (including representatives of national minorities) have the right to appeal to the Commissioner.

From 2017 to 2020, the Commissioner devoted considerable attention to the protection of the rights of representatives of national minorities in advocating their interests, solving social and economic problems, issues of cultural

development, education and other areas enshrined in the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities.

The Commissioner receives appeals from representatives of national minorities, primarily migrants, stateless persons, and indigenous small-numbered peoples.

The main migration-related issues are: decisions on unauthorized entry into the Russian Federation, requests for assistance in obtaining temporary residence permits and residence permits, as well as legalization on the territory of Russia.

Analysis of the work on appeals shows that one of the causes of difficulties in the area of migration is foreign nationals' insufficient knowledge of Russian legislation regulating their stay in Russia. At the same time, the most important element of the integration process of a foreign citizen into a new society is, among other things, acquiring skills and knowledge of the basics of the legislation of the country of residence necessary for a temporary stay in the Russian Federation for employment and temporary or permanent residence in the Russian Federation.

The Commissioner has decided to launch a new legal education project entitled "Days of Legal Literacy for Migrants". The project aims to provide basic legal education for migrants coming to Russia from CIS countries, help them to integrate into the legal space of the Russian Federation, and to enhance legal literacy for the families of migrants with Russian citizenship. The project's objectives include creating an environment for integrating migrants into society and for their social and legal adaptation; providing prompt professional legal assistance to citizens, migrants, stateless persons, and foreign nationals in critical situations.

As part of this educational human rights project, on 10 September 2020, the Union of Armenians in Russia hosted its first lecture and workshop entitled "The Institution of the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Russian Federation. Learn to Protect Your Rights."

For several years the human rights community has been paying attention to the practice of long-term stay of foreign nationals subject to administrative expulsion, including those without documents certifying their identity and citizenship, in temporary detention centers. The Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation already outlined this issue in its Decision No. 14-P of 23 May 2017. The Government of the Russian Federation suggested ways to resolve this issue in Draft Law No. 306915-7 *On Amendments to the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation*, adopted by the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation in the first reading on 21 December 2017.

The nature of the appeals to protect the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples relates to the use of hunting areas, performance of traditional economic activities, protection of the rights of persons belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples in criminal proceedings, and provision of additional guarantees for the protection of their rights.

For instance, the Commissioner has assisted in protecting the rights of representatives of the Evenk indigenous small-numbered people to practice their traditional economic activities. Following his request, the environmental prosecutor's office has appealed against the legal act imposing on persons from indigenous small-numbered peoples obligations not stipulated by law and regulations and establishing excessive procedures for controlling their traditional activities. As a result, this legal act has been repealed.

In another case, the inspection carried out at the request of the Commissioner by the prosecutor's office has revealed violations of the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples to the protection of their native habitat, traditional way of life, economy and trades. The Amur Basin Environmental Prosecutor's Office has made recommendations to the Acting Governor of Khabarovsk Territory and the head of the Federal Agency for Fishery, which has

resulted in a complete revision of processes for allocating industrial fishing quotas for indigenous peoples.

The Commissioner has provided assistance to an honorary citizen of the Nizhnekolymsky District of the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), an elder of the Yukaghir people, D.N.Begunov, in terminating criminal proceedings against him and dismissing the criminal case for illegal extraction of aquatic biological resources.

The Commissioner holds personal appointments with representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples as part of his working visits.

Thus, in October 2018 the Commissioner held a meeting with the president of the public movement entitled the "Association of Nenets People 'Yasavey' ", the vice president of the "Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation" LLC and representatives of the indigenous peoples of the North in the Nenets Autonomous District. Various issues relating to the livelihood of indigenous peoples in the region and the observance of their personal and social rights were discussed at the meeting.

The Commissioner takes an active part in meetings of the Coordinating Committee for competitions for grants from the President of the Russian Federation aimed at civil society development; these competitions provide grant support to non-profit organizations, including those that support indigenous small-numbered peoples.

For a long time, the most pressing issue concerning legal regulation for the majority of regions has been the lack of a procedure for classifying citizens as representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples and related difficulties in exercising statutory rights by persons belonging to this category when practicing traditional ways of life and traditional economic activities. In this connection, the Commissioner has appealed to the President of the Russian Federation with a request to expedite the adoption of a federal law defining the procedure for

documenting citizens' belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples. Following the relevant instruction from the President of the Russian Federation, the draft law was submitted to the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation, adopted by the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation, approved by the Federation Council of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation and signed by the President of the Russian Federation. Federal Law No. 11-FZ of 6 February 2020 *On Amendments to the Federal Law "On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation" with regard to Establishing the Procedure for Registration of Persons Belonging to Indigenous Minorities* provides for the establishment of a special list, the information from which will be used independently by state authorities, local governments, and state off-budget funds to ensure the enjoyment of social and economic rights by persons belonging to small-numbered peoples.

Protection of the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples is an important area of the Commissioner's work, and emerging issues of legal regulation in this area are covered in annual reports on the Commissioner's activities, which contain both proposals for their resolution and explicit recommendations for state authorities.

For instance, the Commissioner has proposed to the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation to hold parliamentary hearings, with the participation of the Commissioner, devoted to the improvement of legislation and law enforcement practices in the field of protection of the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples. Such hearings were held in February 2019.

Following the recommendations by the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Russian Federation, Federal Law No. 234-FZ of 26 July 2019, *On Amendments to Article 5 and 8 of the Federal Law "On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation"* was adopted,

and Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 448 of 13 April 2019 introduced amendments to the Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1049 of 1 October 2015, which approved the list of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North and the list of areas of residence of small-numbered peoples of the North to establish social old-age pension, with regard to the inclusion in the list of the Veps people living in the Prionezhsky municipal district of the Republic of Karelia.

The Commissioner together with the staff of the Office holds annual lectures for representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples, which are highly appreciated by the audience. The first lecture course within the Moscow part of the internship was held back in June 2015 and was attended by trainees selected by the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights from various regions of Russia: the Krasnoyarsk and Khabarovsk Territories, the Leningrad Region, the Khanty-Mansi and Chukotka Autonomous Areas.

On 14 June 2019, the Commissioner's Office held a practice-oriented training course as part of the internship for Russian-speaking representatives of indigenous peoples.

This is a specialized human rights training program established by the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights, with the participation of the Commissioner, which aims to enhance indigenous peoples' knowledge of existing human rights mechanisms so that they can be used to better protect the rights and freedoms of communities.

A new youth educational project was launched on 9 August 2020 on the International Day of the World's Indigenous Peoples under the auspices of the Commissioner, aimed at encouraging citizens to be more engaged in the pressing issues of protecting the rights of indigenous peoples and cultivating active citizenship – an online quiz entitled "Know Your Rights" for the indigenous peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East. Students of higher and secondary

vocational educational institutions, as well as young indigenous human rights activists, take part in this quiz.

Commissioners for human rights in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation successfully implementing the educational law enforcement project entitled "Arctic Law School", as well as experts of the Consortium of Russian Universities implementing the master's program "International Protection of Human Rights" were involved in preparing this quiz and drafting its questions.

The institution of commissioners for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples is operating in a number of constituent entities of the Russian Federation. For example, the above-mentioned posts have been established in the Republics of Buryatia and Sakha (Yakutia), Kamchatka and the Krasnoyarsk Territory to ensure legal protection of the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

The Commissioner works on elaborating proposals to improve the legislation in the area of administrative and criminal liability for extremism, i.e. for actions inciting hatred and enmity on the grounds of gender, race, nationality, language, origin, religion, as well as membership in any social group. A working group has been established consisting of staff members of the Commissioner's office and representatives of the human rights community.

A provision of the Code of Administrative Court Proceedings of the Russian Federation came into force on October 15, 2019, according to which the Commissioner issues opinions in administrative cases on recognition of information materials as extremist in cases where the persons whose actions gave rise to administrative proceedings have not been identified.

To date, the Commissioner has issued opinions in 30 administrative cases of the mentioned category, most of which related to discrimination and incitement of hatred on the grounds of nationality and race. In almost all cases, the contested information material was recognized as extremist and prohibited for dissemination on the territory of the Russian Federation. Only in one case was

the administrative case dismissed due to the defendant's voluntary fulfillment of the claim.

Thus, the legislation of the Russian Federation provides an effective mechanism to ensure the protection of the rights of a category of persons by the Commissioner in administrative cases in courts concerning the recognition of information material as extremist.

Separately, Federal Law No. 7-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Non-Profit Organizations* mentioned in the Recommendations with regard to determining the legal status of a non-profit organization exercising functions of a foreign agent, is aimed at regulating the activities of all non-profit organizations irrespective of their form of organization and stated goals. The recognition of specific Russian non-profit organizations as institutions exercising the functions of a foreign agent is objectively determined by the provisions of the existing federal legislation due to their participation (including through funding) in political activities on the territory of the Russian Federation. The absence of political activity excludes the classification of a non-profit organization as a foreign agent, even if the actions organized (carried out) with its participation are impartially associated with criticism of the decisions made by state bodies or have caused negative assessments in public opinion on the state policy carried out by them.

At the same time, the Commissioner participates in discussions on the activities of non-profit organizations exercising the functions of foreign agents, in particular on 15 December 2020 in the Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation.

With regard to paragraphs 36 and 37 of the Recommendations. At present, the Russian Federation adopted Federal Law No. 48-FZ of 18 March 2020 *On Human Rights Commissioners in the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation* (hereinafter referred to as Federal Law No. 48-FZ), the provisions of

which regulate the legal status of commissioners for human rights in constituent entities of the Russian Federation to the fullest extent.

It should be noted that Articles 3 and 17 of Federal Law No. 48-FZ grant commissioners for human rights in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation extensive safeguards for their activities, such as independence from any state agencies and officials, as well as the absence of accountability to them, the inadmissibility of interference in the legal activities of the Commissioner in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation to influence her/his decisions, as well as non-compliance by officials with requirements and obligations established by Russian Federation law, the legislation of a constituent entity of the Russian Federation, obstruction of the lawful activity of the commissioner in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation in a different form under threat of liability established by the legislation of the Russian Federation, the legislation of a constituent entity of the Russian Federation, etc.

Furthermore, in accordance with Article 12, Part 2 of Federal Law No. 48-FZ, the law of a constituent entity of the Russian Federation may assign to the Commissioner for Human Rights in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation functions of the Commissioner for Children's Rights in the Russian Federation, the Commissioner for Rights of Small Indigenous Peoples of the Russian Federation, other officials authorized to protect rights of other categories of citizens in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation.

In accordance with the law of a constituent entity of the Russian Federation, the Commissioner for Human Rights in a constituent entity of the Russian Federation may be entrusted with coordinating the activities of the said commissioners and other officials.

In this regard, we note that the federal nature of Russian statehood is manifested, among other things, in the principle of the autonomy of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation in establishing a system of state

authority in accordance with the basic principles of the constitutional order of the Russian Federation and the general principles of the organization of representative and executive State government bodies which are established by the federal law (Part 1, Article 77 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation).

3. Protection of national minorities in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol

Since Crimea became part of the Russian Federation, the authorities of the Russian Federation, the Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol have been giving systematic attention to ethnic and religious policy in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol.

The Republic of Crimea and the federal-status city of Sevastopol are multinational entities of the Russian Federation. According to the results of the 2014 census in the Crimean Federal District, representatives of 175 nationalities live on its territory.

The third largest ethnic group on the Crimean peninsula after Russians (1.49 million people; 68 per cent of the population with indicated nationality) and Ukrainians (344.5 thousand people; 15.7 per cent of the population) are the Crimean Tatars (232.3 thousand people; 10.6 per cent of the population)³.

For more than two decades of contemporary history, the Crimean Tatar people had been expecting the Government of Ukraine to adopt the law on the status of the Crimean Tatar people and the law on rehabilitation, which would have been the most important background for the preservation and development of the national identity, culture and language.

³ According to the 2014 census in the Crimean Federal District, some of the Crimean Tatars identified themselves simply as Tatars (according to the census, the number of Tatars living in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol is 45,000; 2.1 per cent of the population).

The integration of the Crimean Tatars into the Russian society has become one of the priorities of the Russian Federation since the citizens of Crimea expressed their will for the peninsula to become a part the Russian Federation.

Under the jurisdiction of the Russian Federation, the Crimean Tatar language was recognized as one of the official languages of the Republic of Crimea, which provided the basis for the adoption of appropriate laws and regulations for its preservation and development, for ensuring fully equal rights.

During the transition period, a number of initial issues related to the integration of different groups of the population were solved in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol by searching for agreement and mutually acceptable solutions, respect for equal human rights and freedoms, which in turn required from the executive authorities well-verified and best-informed management decisions, paying special attention to the historical and cultural background of Crimea, as well as ethnic and political specifics.

As a whole, the ethno-confessional situation in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol can be characterized as conflict-free. This is confirmed by the absence of significant ethno-religious controversies, cooperation between ethnic-cultural organizations, religious organizations and the authorities of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol, coordinated response of the leaders of spiritual and ethnic cultural associations to events both outside and inside Crimea, as well as a consolidated position on many important issues. Public consent is evident from numerous joint activities and the establishment of inter-religious institutions.

To restore historical justice, eliminate consequences of illegal deportation of Armenian, Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, Greek and other peoples from the territory of the Crimean Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic and violations of their human rights, on 21 April 2014, the President of the Russian Federation, Vladimir Putin, signed a Decree *On Measures of Rehabilitation of Armenian,*

Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, German, Greek and Italian Peoples and State Support for Their Revival and Development.

Since 2014, the Government of the Russian Federation, together with the relevant federal executive bodies and the executive bodies of the Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol has been implementing a set of measures aimed at restoring historical justice, political, social and spiritual renovation of Armenian, Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, German, Greek and Italian peoples that had suffered illegal deportation and political repression on ethnic or other grounds.

A set of measures involves the activities aimed at meeting linguistic, ethno-cultural and educational needs of repressed peoples of Crimea and improving areas with large populations of these peoples.

The federal target program entitled *Social and Economic Development of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol until 2020* was adopted by Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 790 of 11 August 2014. It provides for the measures aimed at national, cultural and spiritual renewal of Armenian, Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, German, Greek and Italian peoples, as well as at social development of the territory of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol.

On 17 April 2017, the President of the Russian Federation signed a federal law *On Amendments to Articles 8 and 9 of the Federal Law "On the Legal Status of Foreign Nationals in the Russian Federation"*, which grants preferences in obtaining residence permits in Russia to citizens and their immediate family members illegally deported from the territory of the Crimean Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic. The provisions of the law apply both to the citizens deported in 1944 and their relatives. Now citizens of the aforementioned categories may obtain a residence permit without a temporary residence permit.

According to experts, the reporting period saw a great intensification of transformation processes in the Crimean Tatar society, which contribute to further integration into Russian society.

In particular, new public organizations have been established within the legal framework of the Russian Federation with the main goal of protecting the rights of the Crimean Tatar people in cooperation with state authorities.

As of 10 December 2020, the departmental register of the Main Department of the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation for the Republic of Crimea contains information about 3,172 non-profit organizations (hereinafter referred to as NPOs), with 86 national and cultural autonomies (hereinafter referred to as NCAs) and 81 organizations of national character (hereinafter referred to as NGOs), of which 12 are organizations uniting Armenians (11 NCAs and 1 NGO), 12 – Bulgarians (7 NCAs and 5 NGOs), 11 – Greeks (7 NCAs and 4 NGOs), 2 Italians (0 NCA and 2 NGOs), 15 – Germans (13 NCAs, 1 NGO and 1 non-profit organization), and 21 organizations uniting Crimean Tatars (1 NCA and 20 NGOs). Moreover, one of the registered public organizations unites several nationalities of Crimea, namely the "Crimean Public Organization for the Protection of the Rights of Repressed Armenians, Bulgarians, Greeks and Germans."

As of 1 December 2020, the Main Department of the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation for Sevastopol registered 970 NCOs with 31 having an ethnic and cultural focus.

Within the framework of the state program of the Russian Federation entitled "Implementation of State Nationalities Policy"⁴, the FAEA of Russia provides state support for the activities of non-profit organizations in the field of spiritual and awareness-raising work, aimed at reducing inter-ethnic and inter-religious tensions in the Russian Federation, including of non-profit organizations operating in the territory of the Republic of Crimea:

⁴ State Program of the Russian Federation "Implementation of State Nationalities Policy", approved by Resolution No. 1532 of the Government of the Russian Federation of 29 December 2016.

- the autonomous non-profit organization for the construction and operation of the Tavrida Spiritual and Educational Center (a subsidy of RUB 92.4 million was granted in 2019-2020);
- the autonomous non-profit organization for the construction and operation of the Korchev Spiritual and Educational Center (a subsidy of RUB 69.8 million was granted in 2020-2021).

Also, a subsidy of RUB 8,990,740 was allocated from the federal budget in 2020 to the budget of the Republic of Crimea for the implementation of measures to strengthen the unity of the Russian nation and the ethnic and cultural development of the peoples of Russia within the framework of the aforementioned state program.

The revitalization of various forms of the Crimean Tatar public organizations favorably contributes towards focusing public activity on issues within Crimea, promoting public mobilization, involving broad sectors in the discussion on the search for the main directions of development of the Crimean Tatar people in the modern conditions on the territory of Crimea within the Russian Federation.

The federal executive bodies and the executive bodies of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol provide comprehensive support for the activities of ethnic and cultural associations aimed at implementing socially significant programs of ethnic and cultural development, preserving and maintaining the traditions, culture, language and national identity of the peoples of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol, as well as strengthening the civil identity of the Russian nation.

Events in the Republic of Crimea are mostly festival, exhibitional, competitive and scientific in nature, and are held to celebrate national holidays and culture days of the peoples of Crimea; many of them are organized with the participation of national and cultural autonomies and other public associations.

Every year, support is provided for events commemorating the memory of the peoples of Crimea, including: Remembrance Day for the Victims of the Deportation of the Italian (29 January), Day of Revival of the Deported Peoples of Crimea (21 April), Day of Remembrance for the Victims of the Armenian People's Tragedy (24 April), Crimean Tatar Khydyrlez national holiday (the first 10 days of May), Day of Remembrance for Victims of Crimean Peoples Deportation (18 May), Day of Sevastopol Historical Boulevard (first Sunday in June), Greek national holiday "Panair", Armenian national holiday "Vardavar" (July), Crimean Tatar national holiday "Derviza" (21 September), Republican Festival "The Inflorescence of Crimean Cultures" (September – October), Karaite Harvest Festival in Chufut Kale (October), Day of Remembrance of the Jews and Krymchaks of Crimea, victims of Nazism (December 11).

Educational organizations of Sevastopol and the Republic of Crimea fully exercise the rights of students to study their native language and to mother-tongue instruction from among the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation within the capabilities offered by the educational system, in accordance with the procedure established by the legislation on education.

Thus, 547 general educational institutions are operating in the Republic of Crimea in the 2020/2021 school year with a total of 219,600 children.

Of these, 16 schools use the Crimean Tatar language (4,800 students) and one uses the Ukrainian language (162 students).

In general education institutions with Russian as the language of instruction, there are classes in the Crimean Tatar language of instruction (1,809 students) and in the Ukrainian language of instruction (52 students).

Thus, in the 2020/2021 school year, 6.7 thousand students receive instruction in the Crimean Tatar language (3 per cent of the total enrollment), 214 students receive instruction in the Ukrainian language (0.1 per cent).

General educational institutions in the Republic of Crimea provide instruction in the Crimean Tatar language for 30,475 students and in the Ukrainian language for 4,155 students.

In general education institutions located in areas with large Crimean Tatar populations around Sevastopol, conditions are created for the study of the Crimean Tatar language. Students are given the opportunity to study the Crimean Tatar language as a discipline upon request from their parents (legal representatives) about their children's will to learn the language.

In the first half of the 2020/2021 school year, the teaching of the Crimean Tatar language as a native language to 164 students was provided in four general educational institutions in Sevastopol.

70 students learn the Crimean Tatar language in the state budget educational institution of Sevastopol "Secondary General Education School No. 47 named after M.P.Sitko" as part of extracurricular activities.

The executive bodies of the Russian Federation, the Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol provide data on the real state of human rights observance in the republic and the measures taken to ensure it to the mass media with a view to shaping an adequate public opinion and minimizing and eliminating the influence of biased reports on it.

Within the implementation of the universal comprehensive information campaign aimed at securing civil unity of peoples of the Russian Federation, harmonization of inter-ethnic and religious relations, consolidation of civic identity, the State Committee for Inter-Ethnic Relations and Deported Citizens of the Republic of Crimea facilitates the work of the media published in the Armenian, Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, German, and the New Greek languages.

The state media (FSUE VGTRK, FSUE "ITAR-TASS", FSUE IIA "Rossiya Segodnya", FSBI UBU "Editorial Office of Rossiyskaya Gazeta") regularly cover issues related to the life and problems of the peoples living in the

Republic of Crimea and the activities of state authorities to restore historical justice to the peoples that had suffered illegal deportation.

Information on this topic is published on pages of central and regional newspapers, as well as on the official website of the state newspaper "Rossiyskaya Gazeta" (www.rg.ru) under the headings and sections "Human Rights", "Initiative", "the Republic of Crimea", as well as in the magazine "Rodina".

FSUE IIA "Rossiya Segodnya" and "ITAR-TASS" news agencies regularly provide information about the peoples inhabiting Crimea and the activities of state authorities to restore historical justice towards them.

The main resource devoted to Russia's national minorities and their integration into the political, cultural and social life of the state and society is the project by FSUE IIA "Rossiya Segodnya" entitled "Russia for All" (rus4all.ru), which includes a permanent information website in the Crimean Tatar language, and is the first state Internet resource in this language. About 100 pages with various materials in two languages (Crimean Tatar and Russian) are published monthly on the Crimean Tatar version of the "Russia for All" project. The key newsmakers for the audience are representatives of various government agencies and departments of the Republic of Crimea.

The Ministry of Internal Policy, Information and Communications of the Republic of Crimea regularly publishes information materials in the national media, as well as in the news feeds of leading news agencies on the events dedicated to the restoration of historical justice, political, social and spiritual revival of the peoples of Crimea, who had suffered illegal deportation and political repression on ethnic and other grounds.

Thus, the public Crimean Tatar TV channel "Millet" constantly covers the life of the Crimean Tatar people and all Crimeans, the activities of the Government of the Republic of Crimea, the executive and legislative authorities,

and provides information important to the entire population, thus promoting inter-ethnic peace and good neighborly relations.

Programs of "Millet" TV channel and "Vatan Sedasy" radio are structured around the interests of all peoples living in the Republic of Crimea.

The programs "Crimean Consensus", "Achyk Laf", "Our Right", "Janly Khatyralar", "Ateshli Yellar", "Qadylnar Alemi", thematic telethons on "Millet" TV channel and radio "Vatan Sedasi" are designed to develop and strengthen good neighborly relations among peoples living in Crimea. Activities of national communities are also covered in the news items of "Haberler" program and "Saba" morning program.

The programs "Chalgyji LIVE", "Yaila Boyu!", "Aile Mavile ile", "Sofraga Buyurniz B", as well as the series of programs "My Story" are devoted to social and cultural revival.

To develop the Crimean Tatar language, programs such as "Biz Bilemiz!", "Hashtag, ishte!", "Mamateke", and the travel project "KrymoMania" are broadcast.

The television and radio broadcasting company actively cooperates with the Centralized Organization "Spiritual Board of the Muslims of Crimea and Sevastopol" and other religious associations in terms of coverage of religious events, activities and holidays (daily program "Meraba, Ramadan!" during the entire holy month of Ramadan, special reports in the "Habeler" program).

Also, the TV channel "Millet" broadcasts public service announcements by the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs.

At present, about 70 per cent of the territory of the republic is covered by analog television and 90 per cent by digital. The TV channel "Millet" broadcasts through the Yamal-401 satellite and covers most of the Russian Federation, Ukraine, Central Asia and other Eastern European countries.

With the participation of the Ministry of Internal Policy, Information and Communications of the Republic of Crimea together with the editorial board of the "Krymskaya Gazeta" newspaper, materials on the above topic are regularly published on pages of the "Krymskaya Gazeta". Moreover, the newspaper also published articles about the Crimean Tatars, Germans, Armenians, Greeks, and Bulgarians in the "We are Crimeans" column on its pages and website.

The authorities of the Russian Federation, the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol give systematic attention to the settlement of deported citizens in order to effectively solve the problem of rehabilitation and revival of peoples subjected to unlawful deportation.

One of the main tools for the social and economic development of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol is the federal target program "Social and Economic Development of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol until 2022⁵" (hereinafter referred to as the Program, FTP).

The federal target program "Social and Economic Development of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol until 2024" includes an area for ensuring interethnic unity that provides for the implementation of measures aimed at the national, cultural and spiritual revival of Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek, Italian, Crimean Tatar and German peoples, as well as the social development of territories of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol (hereinafter referred to as the Measures).

As part of the Measures to improve areas densely populated by the peoples of Crimea and to provide other support to citizens belonging to the peoples of Crimea, as of August 2020, 19 capital construction facilities, including 17 facilities in the Republic of Crimea (a residential building with 72 apartments, 4 pre-school educational institutions, 12 network facilities of engineering

⁵ Adopted by Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 790 of 11 August 2014.

infrastructure) and two facilities in Sevastopol (the building of the municipal archive and roads to the village of Polyushko) were commissioned.

At the same time, 52 more facilities with total funding of RUB 7,439.25 million are to be built in 2021 – 2024 as part of the FTP, of which RUB 7,067.25 million will be financed from the federal budget.

Public opinion of the peninsula residents on the situation in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol⁶

Residents of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol have developed basic principles of inter-ethnic relations based on respect and goodwill. A benevolent or neutral attitude towards people of other nationalities is a social norm. 90 per cent of Crimean residents assess inter-ethnic relations as benevolent, conflict-free, and normal (this significantly exceeds the planning all-Russian indicator for 2018 – 80 per cent). There are no fluctuations in the assessments by different ethnic groups. There is a positive trend in terms of the state and development of inter-ethnic relations in Crimea. Almost half of Crimeans (48 per cent) believe that the relations have improved over the past year or two, and another 43 per cent note their stability. Among Crimean Tatars, the improvement of relations is noted by 32-44 per cent, stability – by 44-51 per cent. Only one in twenty (5 per cent) notes that relations have deteriorated.

92 per cent of Crimean residents assess inter-religious relations as benevolent, conflict-free, and normal. Only 4 per cent of the population (including 4 per cent among Crimean Tatars) say that there is tension in this area. In the survey, 7 per cent of Russians and Crimean Tatars reported discrimination on religious grounds or atheistic beliefs, and this figure is identical among Russians and Crimean Tatars.

⁶ According to the survey by the FAEA of Russia "Sociological Monitoring of the State of Inter-Ethnic Relations in the Republic of Crimea" Moscow – Republic of Crimea – Sevastopol, June-August 2018.

The level of Russian civic identity, i.e. citizens' conscious sense of belonging to Russia and its people, empathy and responsibility for what is happening in the country, solidarity in achieving the goals of society and state development is 76 per cent, which is slightly higher than the planning all-Russian indicator for 2018 (73 per cent).

According to 78 per cent of the residents of the Republic, from 2015 to 2018, the life in Crimea changed for the better. This opinion is more common among ethnic Russians (81 per cent) and Ukrainians (75 per cent).

The vast majority of respondents (94 per cent) cast their lot with Crimea, while only a few have plans to change their place of residence: five per cent would like to move to another region of the Russian Federation, and one per cent would like to go abroad. Readiness to move is slightly more often expressed by ethnic Russians (7 per cent) and Crimean Tatars in personal interviews (7 per cent), including 1 percent – to Ukraine, and 5 per cent – to other countries.

Given the above, we can state that a systematic work to preserve, strengthen and develop the traditions of different peoples, ethnic groups and confessions of Crimea on the basis of mutual respect for national and cultural specificities is carried out in the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol with the active support of the federal center, together with religious organizations and civil society institutions. The issues of preserving inter-ethnic peace and harmony on the territory of Crimea are subject to special and constant monitoring by the State authorities of the Russian Federation.

**PART II. ARTICLE-FOR-ARTICLE COMMENTARY
TO THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION
OF NATIONAL MINORITIES TAKING INTO ACCOUNT
THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE FOURTH
MONITORING CYCLE**

Articles 3 of the Framework Convention

Personal scope of application and census

In accordance with the national legislation of the Russian Federation, identity documents do not have an entry for nationality (ethnic background). Under the Constitution of the Russian Federation (Article 26), no one may be forced to determine or to indicate his/her ethnic identity.

The Federal Law *On Acts of Civil Status* provides for an entry on nationality (ethnic background) in a birth certificate at the applicant's, as well as in a death certificate if there is an entry to that effect in the deceased's identity document. The official statistical forms used to record migration flows do not include an entry for ethnic background. Given the above, it is not possible to systematically capture data broken down into ethnic groups from the current statistics.

The All-Russian Population Censuses is the sole source of information on the ethnic composition of the population.

Data on the national (ethnic) composition, according to the 2010 All-Russian Population Census (including basic social and demographic characteristics), as well as the population census in the Crimean Federal District, are publicly available on the Federal State Statistics Service website (www.gks.ru) and include information on the main social and demographic characteristics (marital status, level of education, sources of livelihood, economic activity) of the various nationalities. In particular, information is available on

educational attainment, sources of income and employment, including information disaggregated by the different territories traditionally inhabited by indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation.

After the 2002 and 2010 censuses, a special online census website and a hotline for questions, suggestions, and complaints were available on the Internet. All comments and requests from the public undergone verification, up to contacting the respondent directly. Following the verification's results, each complainant was given a response on the measures taken. Some of the questions contained a request to check the accuracy of filling in the entry on nationality by census takers; according to verifications, no violations in the record of nationality were found. The same control procedure will be implemented in the next census.

According to Article 1, paragraph 4 of Federal Law No. 8-FZ of 25 January 2002 *On the All-Russian Population Census* (hereinafter referred to as Law No. 8-FZ), participation in the census is a social responsibility of individuals and citizens, i.e. participation in the census is not obligatory. In this regard, the interviewee could refuse to answer any question on the census form.

All citizens of the Russian Federation, foreign nationals and stateless persons permanently residing in Russia on the date of the census, including those who temporarily left the country for up to one year, are subject to census.

Guidelines on census procedures and on how to fill in census documents provide a detailed census specification for each population category to ensure the completeness of the census records. For instance, persons (regardless of citizenship) who arrived to the Russian Federation from foreign countries for permanent residence or to seek asylum (irrespective of whether they received a residence permit or not) were recorded as permanent residents of Russia at the location where they happened to be on the date of the census.

In the course of preparatory work, much attention was given to the organization of censuses of populations living in hard-to-reach areas, nomads

(e.g., reindeer breeders, Roma), diasporas, migrants, and homeless persons. Specific activities were designed for each of these groups. A different census date was set for hard-to-reach settlements since communication with them could be only in a certain month of the year; itineraries were developed and types of transport were designated. The sites of the nomadic population and their forthcoming location on the census date were clarified; the census of the nomadic population was timed to coincide with national holidays when nomads gathered in a certain place. Considerable work was done with national and cultural associations of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation, as well as with diasporas.

Interpretation services were used during population censuses (in accordance with Article 6(4) of Law No. 8-FZ) in cases where respondents did not speak Russian; census-takers with a knowledge of two languages (Russian and an indigenous language) were selected to work in national entities of the Russian Federation (especially in rural areas) and areas with large indigenous populations. Moreover, questions in the census form were translated into eight foreign languages.

Microcensuses and separate sociological studies are carried out during intercensal periods. In particular, the following sociological surveys and studies were conducted during the reporting period:

- All-Russian Population Survey "Inter-Ethnic and Inter-Religious Relations", conducted by the Public Opinion Foundation at the request of the FAEA DN of Russia in the summer of 2018;
- four comprehensive sociological surveys in the Republic of Crimea entitled "Sociological Monitoring of the State of Inter-Ethnic Relations in the Republic of Crimea" in 2015, 2016, 2018 and 2019;
- all-Russian population survey "Russians about Inter-Ethnic and Inter-Religious Relations" conducted by the All-Russian Public

Opinion Research Center (VTsIOM) at the request of the FAEA of Russia in September 2018;

- "Sociological Monitoring of the Main Indicators of Interethnic Relations" conducted by VTsIOM at the request of the FAEA of Russia in 2019.

In September 2021, the All-Russian Population Census will be taken throughout the Russian Federation. The legal basis for the population census is Federal Law No. 8-FZ of 25 January 2002 *On the All-Russian Population Census* and order of the Government of the Russian Federation.

This census will be the twelfth in the history of Russia and its results will be included in the 2020 World Population Census.

Most of the indicators collected during the census cannot be obtained from other sources of information. Only the results of the upcoming census will provide unique information on the number of inhabitants, size and structure of households, ethnic composition, and educational attainment of the country's population.

Recommendation

26. *The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to ensure that the 2020 population census is prepared in consultation with national minority representatives and that it safeguards free and voluntary self-identification. The census methodology should provide for the possibility to declare more than one ethnic affiliation and to process and reflect them in the census results. The processing of the data and categorization into ethnic groups and "subgroups" should be carried out in consultation with representatives of those concerned.*

The 2021 All-Russian Population Census program – a set of questions that that will allow information on the population to be obtained in accordance with Article 6 of Federal Law No. 8-FZ of 25 January 2002 *On the All-Russian Population Census* – was approved by the Commission of the Government of the

Russian Federation on the 2021 All-Russian Population Census (Protocol No. 1 of 18 June 2019). The 2021 All-Russian Census Program includes the following questions to permanent residents:

- nationality;
- native language;
- Russian language proficiency and use;
- proficiency and use of other languages.

The census methodology provides for strict compliance with Article 26 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation with regard to people's right to decide whether or not to identify themselves as members of a particular ethnic group and to refuse to answer questions on this issue

To ensure that the census covers ethnic groups living in isolated areas (in densely populated areas), the territorial agencies of the Federal State Statistics Service undertake in advance explanatory and organizational work with local administrations and the elders and leaders of these groups.

In the period of preparation and conduct of the census, a large-scale information and explanatory work organized according to a unified concept at the federal level is carried out. The informational and explanatory work aims to make people understand that the 2021 All-Russian Population Census is the most important statistical observation of the decade, the results of which will determine the social and demographic policy of the state for many years ahead, including the importance of the census results for each resident of the country and thereby eliminate doubts about participation in the census among respondents and motivate them to give information about themselves on the Public Services Portal of the Russian Federation.

To carry out awareness-raising work, the Federal State Statistics Service uses all available traditional channels of mass communication – print and electronic media, advertising and digital communications taking into account the

specifics of the target audiences, which determine both media preferences and attitudes toward government initiatives and projects.

The preparation of information and reference materials on participation in the census intended for explanatory work by the heads of national cultural autonomies and other public associations participating in the implementation of State national policy will be carried out by the Federal State Statistics Service in cooperation with the expert community.

A special feature of the 2021 All-Russian Population Census will be a new option that will allow people to fill in electronic census forms for themselves and members of their households online via the Unified Portal of State Services. The Federal State Statistics Service, together with experts in ethnology and linguistics, are developing metadata for questions on ethnicity and languages in order to ensure full and robust collection of data on ethnic and linguistic characteristics that census participant provides when using this method of participation in the census: strict order of questions, filling techniques, reference materials used in the system, means of navigation, etc.

There are no multiple-choice options for the following questions: "What is your native language?", "What is your nationality?" and "What other languages do you speak?" (unlike for all other questions available in the electronic census form). Respondents formulate their answers and fill in the answer field for questions about nationality and languages exactly the way they want to.

To carry out the census of persons who do not speak Russian, the Federal State Statistics Service has made an order for translation of census forms into a number of languages of the peoples of Russia and foreign languages (the need for translations is determined by the territorial bodies of the Federal State Statistics Service in cooperation with regional and municipal executive authorities). In addition, not only questions from census forms and response options will undergo translation, but also metadata available to respondents.

The metadata includes information on the possibility to register several answers to the question about nationality and mother tongue.

All versions of the population's answers to the question about nationality will be recorded in the processing of census forms, including those that have nothing to do with the concept of "nationality". Although the number of such responses is usually insignificant, it will also be recorded by the census.

The results of the 2021 All-Russian Population Census will provide a full range of replies from the population to the question on nationality, as well as a breakdown of these answers into ethnic groups and subgroups. Among the group categories, there are nationalities and ethnic groups, which are categorized according to the respondent's native language. The group categories and their composition will be determined in cooperation with specialists in ethnology for processing the results of the 2021 All-Russian Population Census.

The full census results will be published in the form of spreadsheets with detailed characteristics of the population on all issues covered under the census program in the course of 2022-2023.

27. The authorities are encouraged to open a dialogue with persons having expressed an interest in recognition as indigenous peoples. The existing criteria to this effect should be applied flexibly and they should not create unnecessary obstacles in practice.

28. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities, when establishing a register of persons belonging to indigenous peoples, to develop it in consultation with indigenous peoples' representatives and to take a flexible approach based on the right to free self-identification and on actual shared practices.

Information on paragraphs 27, 28 of the Recommendations is set out in Part I, Section 1 of the Report.

Article 4 of the Framework Convention

Legislative and institutional framework protecting national minorities

32. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to adopt comprehensive legislation on the rights of persons belonging to national minorities in line with the Framework Convention and to refrain from unduly limiting access to minority rights through incremental changes in sectoral legislation.

The Russian Federation condemns all forms of discrimination and implements a consistent policy to eliminate them. Anti-discrimination provisions enshrined in the Constitution of the Russian Federation provide the policy framework in this field. They are core principles on which the entire Russian legal system is built and, in accordance with Article 18 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, "determine the meaning, content and implementation of laws, the functioning of legislative and executive authority and local self-government, and shall be guaranteed by law."

Article 19 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation establishes the principle of equality before the law and the court. Under this article, the Russian Federation "guarantees the equality of human and civil rights and freedoms regardless of sex, race, nationality, language, origin, material and official status, place of residence, attitude to religion, convictions, membership of public associations, or of other circumstances. All forms of limitations of human rights on social, racial, national, language or religious grounds shall be prohibited". At the same time, provisions of a general nature that prohibit discrimination against persons on the basis of their national (ethnic) identity are applied in conjunction with the human rights in a particular area – the exercise of labor rights, the right to education, people's right to use their native language, the right to enjoy the benefits of culture, and others.

The legal system of the Russian Federation belongs to the Romano-Germanic legal family, and therefore its national legislation is built along sectoral lines, i.e. the entire body of legal instruments is divided into individual sectors, and each sector includes a set of rules governing a specific area of homogeneous public relations by specific methods. The anti-discrimination principles enshrined in the Constitution of the Russian Federation have been systematically incorporated in each branch of law, and are reflected in the basic principles of a particular branch.

Anti-discrimination rules are included in laws and regulations at different legal levels. They are reflected in:

- Federal Constitutional Laws: *On Courts of General Jurisdiction in the Russian Federation* (Article 5), *On Referendum in the Russian Federation* (Article 2), *On the Government of the Russian Federation* (Article 3); *On the Judicial System of the Russian Federation* (Article 7), etc.;
- codifying regulations: Tax Code (Article 3), Code of Administrative Court Proceedings (Article 8), Housing Code (Article 1), Code of Civil Procedure (Article 6), Code of Arbitration Procedure (Article 7), Labor Code (Article 2), the Code of Criminal Procedure (Article 11), Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (Article 4), Civil Code of the Russian Federation (Article 1), etc.
- Federal Laws: *On Education in the Russian Federation* (Article 3), *On Free Legal Aid in the Russian Federation* (Article 5), *On the Fundamentals of Health Care for Citizens in the Russian Federation* (Article 5), *On Physical Culture and Sports in the Russian Federation* (Article 11); *On Basic Guarantees of the Right of the Child in the Russian Federation* (Article 4); *On Freedom of Conscience and Religious Associations* (Article 3), *On Ethnic and*

Cultural Autonomy (Article 4), On Trade Unions, Their Rights and Guarantees of Their Activities (Article 9); On Public-Private and Municipal Partnership in the Russian Federation and Amendments to Selected Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation (Article 4), and others.

- Decrees of the President of the Russian Federation: *On the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs, On the State Nationalities Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation for the Period until 2025, On Measures to Coordinate Action by State Authorities to Combat Manifestations of Fascism and Other Forms of Political Extremism in the Russian Federation*, as well as decrees and orders of the Government of the Russian Federation, departmental statutes and other instruments.

Recognizing the important role played by legal forms of protection from discrimination, the Russian Federation views the further improvement of the system of laws and regulations to ensure the rights of national minorities as a matter of priority for domestic policy. The process of improving the legislative framework covers all levels of government, including the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

Russian legislation against all forms of racial discrimination is constantly being enhanced with the adoption of new laws and regulations and the amendment of legislation already in force.

During the reporting period, Russia continued to improve its legislation as part of systematic efforts to eliminate all forms of racial discrimination and adopted anti-discriminatory laws, including the following:

- Federal Law No. 467-FZ of 29 December 2017 *On Amendments to Articles 30 and 31 of the Code of Criminal Procedure of the Russian Federation and Article 1 of the Federal Law "On Amendments to the Code of Criminal Procedure of the Russian Federation to Expand*

the Use of Juries". The implementation of Article 1 of Federal Law No. 467-FZ (on 1 June 2018) has brought the provisions of the Code of Criminal Procedure of the Russian Federation (hereinafter referred to as the CCP of Russia) in line with the constitutional principles established by Article 19 of the Constitution, and has eliminated discrimination in jury trials of criminal cases.

- Federal Law No. 234-FZ of 26 July 2019 *On Amendments to Article 5 and 8 of the Federal Law "On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation"*, aimed at improving the procedure for compensating losses incurred by small-numbered peoples, associations of small-numbered peoples, persons belonging to small-numbered peoples as a result of damage to the native habitat of small-numbered peoples caused by the business activity of organizations with any form of ownership or by private individuals. The Federal Law establishes the authority of the Government of the Russian Federation to approve the procedure for compensating such losses.
- Federal Law No. 11-FZ of 6 February 2020 *On Amendments to the Federal Law "On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation to Establish the Procedure for Registering Persons Belonging to Indigenous Minorities"*, pursuant to which a mechanism was introduced to record the citizens of the Russian Federation belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples for the purpose of fulfilling their social and economic rights, including the right to protection of their native habitat, preservation of their traditional ways of life, economic activities and trades, replacement of military service with alternative civilian service, preservation and development of their

distinctive cultures and to local popular self-government based on ethnic, historical and other traditions.

Thus, the provisions of Article 4 of the Framework Convention are implemented in Russian legislation to the full extent, and this interrelated body of law and regulations, combined with the Constitution of the Russian Federation and the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, constitute anti-discrimination legislation, which is constantly being improved in response to the realities of today's world.

33. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to base the implementation of their "nationalities policy" on guaranteeing access to rights for persons belonging to national minorities as enshrined in the Framework Convention, to provide the necessary financial resources and to strengthen this aspect in the mandate and daily work of the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs.

The management system for the State nationalities policy covers the regional as well as the federal level. Deputy heads of regions with responsibility for inter-ethnic relations have been appointed in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation. On 22 October 2013, Federal Law No. 284-FZ was adopted, which defines the powers and responsibilities of the public authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, local authorities and officials in the area of inter-ethnic relations; an expanded list of the duties of municipal officials in the implementation of the State nationalities policy was also expanded, and the legal penalties for failure to perform these duties were specified.

At the beginning of 2021, the following bodies were in operation in all 85 constituent entities of the Russian Federation:

- separate departments or subdivisions of regional executive bodies with competence for implementation of the State nationalities policy;

- standing working groups or (interdepartmental) coordinating bodies for promoting inter-ethnic harmony;
- expert advisory bodies on inter-ethnic and ethno-religious relations.

A funding instrument has been set up to implement the Strategy through the development and adoption of the State program to implement the State nationalities policy.

The State program has the following objectives:

- increase the effective involvement of civil society institutions in the implementation of State nationalities policy in the Russian Federation;
- develop and improve the system of partnership between the State and civil society with regard to the implementation of State nationalities policy in the Russian Federation;
- strengthen the unity of the Russian people and the ethno-cultural development of the multi-ethnic population of the Russian Federation;
- ensure the right to preserve, study and develop one's native language from among the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation;
- support the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation, including through the preservation and protection of their native habitats and traditional ways of life;
- facilitate the smooth and effective social and cultural adaptation and integration of migrants into Russian society;
- reduce conflict situations in the area of inter-ethnic and ethnoreligious relations.

The State program is to be implemented from 2017 to 2025 at the expense of budgetary allocations from the federal budget, the total amount of which is RUB 22,001,547.1 thousand.

Legislative and institutional framework to combat discrimination

38. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to further develop and consistently implement anti-discrimination legislation covering all spheres of life and raise awareness, including among persons belonging to national minorities, of available remedies.

The Russian Federation has a body of law that contains norms prohibiting manifestations of racial discrimination in all spheres of social relations.

For example, Article 19 of the Constitution safeguards the equality of human and civil rights and freedoms, regardless of sex race, nationality, language, origin, property, official status, place of residence, attitude to religion, opinions, membership in public associations or other circumstances. It prohibits any form of restriction of citizens' rights on the grounds of social, racial, ethnic, linguistic or religious identity. In the Constitution, the principle of equality is not merely recognized in its technical, legalistic sense (equality of rights and freedoms), but is also established as the obligation of the State to ensure rights and freedoms for all regardless of physiological, ethnic, cultural, social, political, property-related and other circumstances. This means that the State should guarantee equal rights and freedoms for all, which implies active and targeted government activity to organize by means of a system of legal, political, economic, ideological and organizational measures a social environment in which everyone would have real opportunities on an equal basis with other members of society to enjoy the rights and freedoms recognized in the Russian Federation and to ensure their effective protection, including by means of justice.

The constitutional understanding of national equality derives not only from the provisions of Article 19 of the Constitution on the equality of human and civil rights and freedoms regardless of nationality but also from constitutional provisions on the multi-ethnic population of the Russian Federation, the recognition of equal rights and self-determination of peoples in Russia as one of the foundations of the constitutional order of our country, the complex ethno-national features of the population, as well as the complex national-territorial composition of Russia. This implies increased attention from the State to ensuring equal rights and freedoms for representatives of different nationalities, ethnic communities, and ethnicities living on the territory of the Russian Federation, in order to maintain the unity of the country's multinational population and social stability of the Russian statehood.

Thus, national equality in political and legal relations implies, in particular, a balanced representation of large and small ethnic groups in the elected authorities, which eliminates the predominance of some groups to the detriment of others thereby ensuring the political integrity of public authorities. This results, *inter alia*, in a ban on the establishment of ethnically-based parties (legal position of the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation No. 18-P of 15 December 2004).

In the constitutional system, ethnic equality, expressed in the State guarantee of equal rights and freedoms regardless of race, ethnicity or language, is also manifested in specific elements of the constitutional and legal status of the individual, such as the rights of all persons to determine and indicate their ethnic affiliation (Article 26, paragraph 1 of the Constitution) to use their language and to choose freely their language of communication, upbringing, education and creative work (Article 26, paragraph 2 of the Constitution). It is important to keep in mind that equality in relation to language rights means, among other things, the equal right of all persons to use the official language, and therefore a situation

where the establishment of the status of this or that language in the Russian Federation and the guarantee of related rights would call into question the use and study of the Russian language as the official language of Russia is unacceptable. A different approach would be a violation of the principle of equal rights and would contradict Article 19, paragraph 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation.

A specific institution for ensuring national equality is ethnic and cultural autonomy, the legal status of which is determined by Federal Law No. 74-FZ of 17 June 1996 *On Ethnic and Cultural Autonomy*. The principle of human and civil equality regardless of any grounds is enshrined in and developed by substantive and procedural national legislation. Thus, Article 1 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation states that civil legislation is based on recognizing the equality of participants in the relationships regulated by it.

Article 4 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation establishes the principle of equality of individuals before the law, according to which persons who have committed crimes are equal before the law and are subject to criminal liability, regardless of their sex, race, nationality, language, origin, property or official status, place of residence, attitude to religion, beliefs, membership of voluntary associations or other circumstances.

Article 1.4 of the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation states that natural persons are liable for administrative offences, regardless of their sex, race, nationality, language, origin, property or official status, residence, attitude to religion, opinions, membership of voluntary associations or other circumstances. Legal entities are liable for administrative offences, regardless of location, organizational-and-legal form, subordination, or other circumstances. In accordance with Article 6 of the Civil Procedural Code of the Russian Federation, justice on the civil cases is carried out on the principles of equality before the law and the court of all the citizens, irrespective of their

sex, race and nationality, of the language, the origin and the property or the official status, of their place of residence, of their relation to religion and convictions, membership of voluntary associations and other circumstances. According to Article 7 of the Arbitration Procedural Code of the Russian Federation, justice in arbitration courts is carried out on similar principles of equality. In this case, an arbitration court ensures equal judicial protection of rights and legitimate interests of all persons participating in a case. The principle of equality is subject to special state-legal protection in the Russian Federation. There is criminal liability for its violation.

According to Article 136 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, violation of the rights, freedoms and legitimate interests of a man and a citizen based on gender, race, nationality, language, origin, property or official status, place of residence, attitude to religion, convictions, or membership of voluntary associations, which has caused harm to the rights and legally protected interests of individuals, shall be punishable

The list of circumstances where the Russian state guarantees equal rights is in public domain. This means that these circumstances can be found in other provisions of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, and the state can expand the list of circumstances in the current law-making process, as well as in the application of this constitutional norm in delivering judgment, which should be considered as grounds on which unequal treatment is inadmissible. Thus, another circumstance established by the Constitution of the Russian Federation is the residence of a person and a citizen on the territory of different entities of the Russian Federation given that Russia is a federal state. The guarantee of the equality of persons and citizens regardless of the territory of their residence is the responsibility of the Russian Federation to regulate human and civil rights and freedoms, citizenship in the Russian Federation, as well as regulate the rights of

national minorities (Article 71, paragraph "c" of the Constitution of the Russian Federation).

The main principle of the legal regulation of labor relations is ensuring equality of opportunities of employees without any discrimination in promotion taking into account labor productivity, qualification and tenure in the occupation, as well as in professional training, retraining and professional development (Article 2 of the Labor Code of the Russian Federation).

In addition, the principle of equality is enshrined in many laws and regulations of the Russian Federation (Article 12 of the Federal Law *On Education in the Russian Federation*, Article 21 (a.1) of the Federal Law *On General Principles of Organization of Legislative (Representative) and Executive Bodies of State Authority of the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation*, Article 4 of the Federal Law *On Citizenship of the Russian Federation*, Article 2 of the Law *On Languages of Peoples of the Russian Federation* and others).

As for the introduction of comprehensive anti-discrimination laws in the legislation of the Russian Federation, we note that Russian legislation operating on a sectoral basis contains anti-discrimination norms in all fundamental laws and regulations of the Russian Federation, both substantive and procedural.

39. *The Advisory Committee calls on the High Commissioner for Human Rights in the Russian Federation and the regional ombudspersons to undertake targeted activities raising the awareness of persons belonging to national minorities, including indigenous peoples, of their right to turn to an ombudsperson in cases of discrimination.*

The protection of the rights of national minorities is an important part of the work of the Commissioner on Human Rights in the Russian Federation (hereinafter referred to as "the Commissioner") and is carried out by the Commissioner in accordance with the provisions of Federal Constitutional Law No. 1-FKZ of 25 February 1997 *On the Commissioner on Human Rights in the*

Russian Federation as part of his work on examining complaints from citizens, improving Russian Federation legislation on human rights, developing international cooperation in the field of human rights and legal awareness with regard to human rights and freedoms, as well as the forms and methods for protecting them.

All citizens (including representatives of national minorities) have the right to appeal to the Commissioner.

Written appeals to the Commissioner can be sent per post, by e-mail, through the official website, or submitted in person at the office for citizens' reception.

Given the challenging epidemiological situation, a telephone hotline has been set up for verbal appeals from citizens.

There is a reception of citizens in video-conferencing mode.

All necessary information on the procedure for appealing to the Commissioner, his/her competence, progress and results of activities and other information is posted on his/her official website, as well as publicly available in the mass media and the Internet.

The Commissioner's work complements the existing means of protecting the rights and freedoms of citizens, does not repeal or imply a revision of the competence of state bodies providing protection and restoration of violated rights and freedoms (Article 3 of Federal Constitutional Law No. 1-FKZ).

Given that the Commissioner's work is carried out to guarantee state protection of citizens' rights and freedoms, their observance and respect by state bodies, local self-government bodies and officials (Article 1, part 1 of Federal Constitutional Law No. 1-FKZ), the resolution of private conflict situations that do not require an appeal to the above bodies or officials may be carried out by the conflicting parties themselves, including through special mechanisms of pre-trial dispute resolution (for example, with the participation of a mediator).

For more information on the work of the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Russian Federation, see Part I, Section 2 of the Report.

Promotion of full and effective equality of the Roma

43. *The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to develop a multi-year action plan on full and effective equality of the Roma. The action plan should be designed in consultation with a broad spectrum of Roma representatives, including Roma women, based on a thorough assessment of the situation and evaluation of existing pilot projects, include a gender dimension and be sufficiently funded. Responsibilities should be clearly designated, target indicators defined and regular monitoring of its implementation in co-operation with Roma representatives and civil society ensured.*

In the Russian Federation, the rights of Roma, like those of citizens from other ethnic groups, are protected under article 19, paragraph 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, whereby all citizens of the Russian Federation are guaranteed equal rights and freedoms regardless of sex, race, ethnicity, language, origin, property or official status, place of residence, attitude to religion, beliefs, membership of voluntary associations or other circumstances.

On 31 January 2018, the Deputy Prime Minister, Alexander Khloponin, approved another comprehensive plan of action for the socio-economic and ethno-cultural development of the Roma in the Russian Federation. In 2019, the plan was amended by the Deputy Prime Minister, Vitaly Mutko, and, as a result, the comprehensive plan of measures for the socio-economic and ethno-cultural development of the Roma in the Russian Federation was expanded to include:

- measures to issue members of the Roma community with passports certifying their identity as citizens of the Russian Federation in the territory of the Russian Federation;

- organization and holding of a round table, as part of the Roma under Russian Skies Festival, on current issues relating to the social and cultural development of the Roma community in the Russian Federation, with the participation of representatives of Roma voluntary associations and the authorities of constituent entities of the Russian Federation with large Roma populations;
- inclusion of topics related to the socioeconomic and ethno-cultural development of the Roma in the agenda of seminars and meetings on the implementation of State ethnic policy in the federal districts of the Russian Federation;
- involvement of representatives of Roma communities in activities aimed at strengthening national identity;
- facilitation of a thematic visit by a group of Council of Europe experts to Russia in the second and third quarters of 2019 to study the issue of the State's support for Russian Roma culture and traditions and prepare a related report;
- development and testing of a further training program for teachers of preschool educational and general educational institutions to teach Russian to children for whom it is not their native language, including children of preschool age not attending educational institutions;
- development of traditional handicrafts of the Roma population by involving children and youth in arts and crafts clubs;
- development of social and cultural infrastructure in areas with a large Roma population;
- provision of methodological support to the *Roma of Russia* magazine;

- organization and conduct of a comprehensive study on the socio-economic, ethno-cultural and legal aspects of Roma integration in Russia;
- monitoring of the situation in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation with large Roma populations, such as situations involving the demolition of buildings built illegally by the Roma, and taking measures to address the underlying factors that make the situation worse, including monitoring publications in the news media and the Internet;
- assistance in the coverage by the State media of the socioeconomic and ethno-cultural development of Roma in the Russian Federation;
- provision of State support to organizations that issue, distribute or reproduce print and electronic media projects with a significant social impact devoted to the socioeconomic and cultural development of the Roma in the Russian Federation, to be chosen from among the organizations concerned.

Compared to the initial Comprehensive Plan of Action, which set out individual activities, the current plan is more general in nature, highlighting the main areas of work for social and cultural integration of the Roma, along with specific activities.

An important positive outcome of the Comprehensive Plan of Action has been the institutional development of Roma society through assistance in registering public organizations (counseling, assistance in preparing documents). Various prevention, ethno-cultural, social, and organizational activities have been carried out, making it possible to analyze the current state of affairs in places with dense Roma populations, the level of provision of Roma with social, educational, and other services, and to establish interaction with formal and informal Roma community leaders. Improvements in the issue of identity documents and

registration at the place of residence and place of stay on the territory of the Russian Federation are particularly noteworthy.

The Roma public organizations participate in the work of various advisory and coordinating central authorities, including at the highest level. The representatives of the Federal National and Cultural Autonomy of the Russian Roma are included in the Presidential Council of the Russian Federation, the Advisory Board for National and Cultural Autonomies under the FAEA of Russia. The Roma association is locally represented in the boards under regional and local authorities.

The International Romani Day dedicated, *inter alia*, to the memory of the World War II victims among Roma is annually celebrated in the Russian Federation (on 8 April). The ethno-cultural events aimed at introducing the traditional culture of the peoples of Russia are regularly held.

As part of the implementation of the Comprehensive Plan of Action and also the plan of action to implement the State program on the implementation of State nationalities policy, approved by Decision of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1532 of 29 December 2016, the FAEA of Russia is providing funding for the Roma under Russian Skies Festival and organizing and conducting comprehensive research into the socio-economic and ethno-cultural and legal aspects of integrating the Roma into Russia.

In 2019, the FAEA of Russia developed guidelines for the executive authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and local authorities for work with the Roma population⁷.

- in developing the Guidelines, the provisions of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial

⁷ Methodological guidelines for the executive authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and local authorities for work with the Roma population approved by order of the head of the FAEA of Russia No. 78 of 9 August 2019.

Discrimination and the Framework Convention of the Council of Europe for the Protection of National Minorities were taken into account. The Methodological Guidelines are aimed at assisting State authorities in organizing work to improve the living standards of the Roma population, including the following objectives;

- ensuring that the authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and local authorities meet the international obligations undertaken by the Russian Federation and implement national law on the protection of human and civil rights and freedoms;
- contributing towards the improvement of the living standards of the Roma population;
- promoting the ethno-cultural development of the Roma population;
- promoting the successful social, cultural and economic integration of Roma into public life;
- implementing measures aimed at overcoming discrimination and negative social stereotypes against the Roma population;
- monitoring of the situation of the Roma population in the Russian Federation.

Quarterly monitoring was organized to control the Roma situation in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and implementation of the Methodological Guidelines for the executive authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and local authorities dealing with the Roma population.

In order to identify the main problems and assess the level of social engagement of the Roma population, the Comprehensive Plan provided for comprehensive research of the socioeconomic, ethno-cultural and legal aspects of Roma integration in Russia. The research was conducted by the FAEA of Russia together with the All-Russian Center for the Study of Public Opinion in 2018. The research covered the Roma population aged 16 and older in the

territory of 30 constituent entities of the Russian Federation. The socio-economic and socio-political situation of the Russian Roma, their lifestyle, ethno-cultural and legal awareness, public opinion on the key issues of development of the Russian society and their degree of integration into the Russian society were studied within the research.

44. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to abstain from forced evictions and demolitions of houses and to take measures to regularize informal Roma settlements and ensure they have access to basic services instead. If resettlement is necessary, adequate alternative housing should be ensured in advance in consultation with the persons concerned.

One of the most pressing issues affecting social tensions has to do with infrastructure, namely illegally constructed buildings, squatting and unlawful connections to public utilities.

The most critical of these issues is illegal buildings. As of 2020, there were more than 250 buildings in the Russian Federation with unregistered property titles housing members of the Roma community.

One solution to the problem of illegal structures is to document buildings that already exist, although this is not always possible, most often because they are located in areas where there are main gas pipelines and other networks. In such cases, the provision of alternative accommodation or land or tenant buyouts is considered.

Regular raids are carried out by utility providers to check unauthorized connections to the gas and electricity supply system in areas with large Roma populations.

Full and effective equality of indigenous small-numbered peoples

48. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to take both legal and practical measures to ensure full and effective equality of indigenous peoples, in

close consultation with their representatives. Sufficient funding should be provided for the implementation of the Concept Paper for the sustainable development of indigenous peoples and efforts should be strengthened in order to reach its objectives. Various models of economic activities should be supported, both traditional and not traditional, in accordance with the needs and interests of the indigenous peoples.

Information on paragraph 48 of the Recommendations is set out in Part I, Section 1 of the Report.

Article 5 of the Framework Convention

Support for minority cultures

54. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to increase their support and simplify access to funds, including by providing sustainable baseline funding for the preservation and development of minority cultures. Support should be extended to contemporary manifestations of culture. Separate funding lines should be made available for projects on minority cultures so that national minority organizations do not have to compete with others under "nationalities policy".

The promotion of civil identity and unity of the multinational people of the Russian Federation is essential for the preservation of Russia's single cultural space.

The Government of the Russian Federation annually implements a set of measures within the framework of the Strategy of the State National Policy, the State Program "Implementation of the State Nationalities Policy", and the Concept of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation aimed at preserving and promoting the cultural heritage of the peoples of Russia.

The FAEA of Russia regularly carries out activities aimed at harmonizing inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations, as well as fostering respect for representatives of other nationalities and cultures. In the reporting period, the FAEA organized the following events.

The annual All-Russian Forum "Zoloto Turkov" (Turkic gold), was held from 2016 to 2020 to harmonize interethnic relations among young people, cultivate an all-Russian civic identity, and promote mutual enrichment of the cultures of the peoples of Russia.

"Rossiysky Kavkaz" (Russian Caucasus) political science forum is held annually. As part of the forum, educational workshops on harmonization of interethnic relations, prevention of extremism, and consolidation of society against negative propaganda in social networks were carried out.

In order to find, promote and disseminate examples of best practices of local government activities in municipal governance and addressing municipal issues of local importance, a national contest "Best Municipal Practice" is held annually in the category – strengthening interethnic peace and harmony, and other activities in the field of national policy at the municipal level.

During the reporting period, the international educational campaign "Great Ethnographic Dictation" was held annually. In 2020 it was held online. 1,742,661 people from 85 regions of the Russian Federation and 123 foreign countries took part in the Dictation.

As part of the state program "Development of Culture and Tourism", the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation provides support for large-scale inter-ethnic and inter-regional cultural events, touring projects all over Russia, national festivals and holidays, days of culture exchange, exhibitions of national art, forums and conferences on the problems of preserving and developing the culture of small-numbered peoples and preserving the languages of the peoples

of Russia within the framework of the State program on the development of culture and tourism.

More than 200 such events are held annually under the auspices of the Ministry. Among them are: festival "Alluring Worlds. Ethnic Russia", International Festival of Arts "Peace to the Caucasus", international artistic events "With Russia in My Heart", All-Russian Festival of Folk Art "Springs of Russia", inter-regional festival of children's and youth arts of indigenous small-numbered peoples "Northern Lights", International Ethno-Social Project "The Volga Delta without Borders", "International Festival of Art and Folk Arts "Finno-Ugric Transit", All-Russian Festival of Art of Small Finno-Ugric and Samoyedic Peoples; All-Russian literary and folklore festival "Sholokhov Spring" and such large-scale annual events as the Cultural Review of Ethnocultural Centers of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation and the Cultural Forum of National Minorities.

Libraries' holdings include literature in national languages and organize related book exhibitions and presentations. For example, the National Fund of the Sverdlovsk Regional Inter-Ethnic Library contains more than 10,000 documents in national languages. The collection of the Far Eastern State Scientific Library of Khabarovsk has more than 80,000 books in 64 languages of the peoples of Russia and the former Soviet Union. Nekrasov Central Universal Scientific Library in Moscow is the only library in the city with a Department of National Literatures of Russia possessing unique book collections in 100 languages of peoples of Russia.

Libraries hold readers' conferences, interactive games, connoisseurs' tournaments, language lessons, linguistic evenings, didactic games aimed at popularizing knowledge and the Russian language, informative and educational seminars, organize family Sunday reading groups and native language clubs.

The Maxim Gorky Literature Institute, subordinate to the Ministry of Culture of Russia, provides training for students in translation from Tatar, Bashkir, and Buryat languages.

In addition, subordinate scientific institutions carry out activities aimed at preserving and developing the languages of the peoples of Russia, popularizing the values of traditional folk culture, and promoting an appreciation of the spiritual heritage of the peoples of the Russian Federation:

- International Forum "Cultural Heritage of the North Caucasus as a Resource of Interethnic Harmony" (Likhachev Russian Research Institute for Cultural and Natural Heritage);
- Conference "Folklore Field Season" and International Congress "Folklore of the Peoples of Russia and the CIS Countries" (Russian Institute of Art History).

The Russian Ministry of Culture also sponsors the "Dialogue of Cultures" forum for children's art (Vladikavkaz) and the international contest-festival of traditional art culture "Ethnomiriada" (Kazan), aimed at finding and supporting creative teams.

Conservatories and art schools in national republics have departments and divisions tutoring national musical instruments.

Almost every school or municipal museum of multinational republics and regions has a decent collection devoted to the ethnography of the peoples of their region. There are ethnographic museums in places of residence and traditional activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples, where classes on the native language and national culture as well as exhibitions devoted to national creativity are held.

A vivid example of acquaintance with traditional architecture and everyday life can be experienced in the Ethnographic Open-Air Museum in the Mari El

Republic, and the Mari Museum of Fine Arts and the National Gallery is an example of introduction to the Mari fine arts.

Each republic has its national theater. For instance, the Mari El Republic has six theaters performing in Mari, Hill Mari and Russian languages, which is a considerable number for a relatively small region. Plays in national languages are available to Russian-speaking audiences, as they are all performed with simultaneous translations into Russian.

The Ministry of Culture of Russia supports film festivals devoted to national unity and preservation of the native language. Thus, every year since 1995, the Russian Film Festival "Literature and Cinema" has been held in Gatchina, the Leningrad Region, with the support of the Ministry.

The All-Russian Film Festival "Man Exploring the World" devoted to strengthening interethnic unity of the peoples of the Russian Federation is a permanent cultural project, which has been held since 2008 with the support of the Ministry of Culture of Russia.

Every year, the Ministry of Culture of Russia approves priority topics subject to state financial support to film production, thereby determining the amount of subsidies from the federal budget to support cinematography. They always include topics aimed at strengthening the unity and spiritual commonality of the multinational people of Russia, harmonizing national and inter-ethnic (cross-national) relations, and building friendship between the peoples of Russia.

The country's leading film studios (Mosfilm, Lenfilm, and the Maxim Gorky Central Film Studio for Children and Youth), as well as many other film agencies pay, particular attention to the issues of inter-ethnic relations.

There is a whole range of live-action films of the last decade created with State funding, that address the most acute national issues of our time, including the past and present of the peoples of Russia ("Kuktau" by Ildar Yagafarov), "Latifa" by Rinat Tashimov and "Bibinur" by Yuriy Feting in the Tatar language,

"The Gulls" by Ella Manzheeva in Kalmyk, "Kitoboy" (The Whaler Boy) by Philipp Yuriev in Chukot, "Mot Ne" by Sergei Oldenburg-Svintsov in Yakut, "Brothers" by A.Galibin in Chechen, "My Little Sister" by A.G.Galibin in Bashkir, "The White Moss" by Vladimir Tumaev in Nenets, "The First" by Dmitry Suvorov in the Yakut Language, and others).

National cultural centers, with its highly branched structure, play an important role in preserving national cultures. The Center of Culture of the Peoples of Russia of the Russian House of Folk Art has been doing a great deal of work to support the activities of ethno-cultural centers since 2016. The Center aims to preserve and develop the cultures of the peoples of Russia in cooperation with national and cultural centers and associations; strengthen the unity and spiritual commonality of the multinational people of Russia; and promote patriotic education of the younger generation on the basis of inter-ethnic tolerance and mutual respect.

The work with young people remains one of the most important activities of the Center. That is why the Center has implemented the idea of setting up a youth ethno-club.

Also, by a decree of Vladimir Putin, a branch of the Finno-Ugric Cultural Center of the Russian Federation was established at the State Russian House of Folk Art in 2006.

With the help of the centers, regular comprehensive interdepartmental projects are organized: Interregional Contest of Creative Teams and Soloists "Trinity Charms", All-Russian Open Festival "We are Slavs", all-Russian International Festival "Friendship of Nations", Roundtable "Strengthening Russian civic identity by means of culture within the framework of the festival movement and folk art", Interregional Festival of National Cultures of the Far East "Faces of Heritage", Festival of Culture of Russian Germans "German Quarter", etc.

Taking into account Russia's long experience and sharing the approaches of the international community to the problem of protection and development of intangible cultural heritage, the Russian Committee for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (under the State Russian House of Folk Art) has been set up by Russia among the first Member States of UNESCO.

In a number of regions, such as the Tomsk Region and Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Area-Yugra, multifunctional ethno-cultural centers, including children's centers, are successfully operating.

Historically, cultural life has been concentrated in large cities and capital cities. The ideology of the National Project "Culture" is aimed at redressing this injustice – residents of the smallest and most remote villages of our vast country should also have access to cultural benefits.

The National Project provides support for creative projects aimed at strengthening Russian civic identity on the basis of spiritual, moral, and cultural values of the peoples of the Russian Federation, including activities with the following aims:

- popularize the Russian language and literature, folk arts and crafts, and maintain fine arts;
- improve the legal and regulatory framework and allocate funds to introduce cultural heritage objects consisting of manor complexes into productive use, and to revive and enhance public interest in manors;
- produce and disseminate content on the Internet aimed at strengthening civic identity and spiritual and moral values among young people.

One of the main targets is to increase attendance at cultural institutions through the modernization of cultural infrastructure and the creation of conditions for creative self-realization and leisure time.

In this connection, the national project is improving access to domestic cultural values and the tangible and intangible historical heritage of the peoples of Russia (virtual concert halls, a national electronic library, multimedia guides to exhibitions and exhibition projects, cultural and educational and museum complexes, cultural and leisure institutions in rural areas, car clubs for servicing rural population, cinemas).

From 2019 to 2024 it is planned to launch 500 virtual concert halls in 500 cities of the Russian Federation. These virtual concert halls will provide access to cultural treasures to the maximum number of Russian citizens from the most remote regions.

Between 2019 and 2024, 450 multimedia guides for expositions and exhibition projects will be created, where visitors will be able to learn about the works using augmented reality technology. Residents of the Russian Federation will be able to experience a modern format of interaction with museum objects, which will popularize museums, including among children.

Also, between 2019 and 2024, 48,000 books will be digitized and included in the National Electronic Library (hereinafter referred to as NEL). First of all, the publications considered most valuable by the professional community will be subjected to digitalization.

The National Electronic Library brings together the collections of Russian public libraries at the federal, regional and municipal levels, the libraries of scientific and educational institutions, as well as the rights holders. The main goal of NEL is to provide the citizens of the Russian Federation with free access to all publications and scientific works published, as well as to those that are being published now and preserved in the collections of Russian libraries.

Under the federal Creative People project of the National Project "Culture" between 2019 and 2024, non-profit organizations will receive 600 subsidies (100 subsidies each year) for creative projects aimed at strengthening Russian civil

identity based on the spiritual, moral, and cultural values of the peoples of the Russian Federation, including activities aimed at promoting the Russian language and literature, folk arts and crafts, and maintaining fine art.

Sixty grants (ten grants annually) will be awarded to non-profit organizations for the implementation of all-Russian and international creative projects in music and theater during this period. Over these years, 150 cultural and educational programs will be held for 500,000 schoolchildren.

One of the objectives of the State Nationalities Policy Strategy to promote national and cultural development is the strengthening of the volunteer movement in the area of cultural heritage preservation.

As part of the "Creative People" federal project, the "Volunteers of Culture" program has been designed and launched, involving the active development of a volunteer movement in the field of cultural heritage preservation, including the restoration of cultural assets. The program aims to support volunteer movements, including those that preserve the cultural heritage of the peoples of the Russian Federation, including projects to preserve the historical appearance of small towns.

In accordance with the objective of the State Nationalities Policy Strategy, the national project includes, among other things, the improvement of the system for training national staff in culture.

Young representatives of national minorities traditionally participate in the All-Russian Forum Campaign, in competitions, projects and initiatives for implementing priority state tasks developed within the framework of federal platforms, and act as experts in the work of relevant events.

In order to involve young people in creative activities and social practices, increase civic engagement, promote healthy lifestyles and unleash the potential of the younger generation, as well as to develop an effective system of social mobility for the self-realization of young people, Rosmolodezh provides state

support for socially significant projects on a competitive basis. Information about the timing, rules and procedure for competitions is published on the official website of Rosmolodezh (fadm.gov.ru) and in the automated information system "Youth of Russia" (myrosmol.ru).

Representatives of indigenous peoples always take part in the competitions. For example, in 2020, as part of the All-Russian Youth Forum "The Arctic. Made in Russia" and the "Russian North" Youth Forum of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation, 48 projects aimed at promoting the culture, languages and traditions of indigenous small peoples were presented to the competition commission. Thirteen of them became winners and were granted state support for a total amount of RUB 5,093,000.00.

Ivan Sandrin's "Khanty Mons" Comics Collection project is among the winners (the amount of support is RUB 55,000.00). As part of this project, it is planned to create and publish a collection of comics in the Khanty language. The comics will be based on Khanty tales collected during folklore expeditions.

The "Voices of Our Ancestors" Folklore Expedition project presented by Lyubov Salamaschenko was granted state support in the amount of RUB 250,000.00. A number of activities aimed at the preservation and development of Sámi culture are planned to be carried out within the project: The Sámi National Day, the Festival of Children and Youth Performances in the Sámi Language "Moainas lann" (a Fairytale Town), Festival of Sámi Music and Culture, International Indigenous Day, recording and processing of Sámi legends and tales. The outcome of the expedition will be a documentary film about the history of the Sámi traditional songs.

National and cultural autonomies

57. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to grant more rights of independent decision-making to National Cultural Autonomies, to strengthen their independence through multi-year baseline funding, and to ensure that diversity within national minorities can be reflected in the form of organization and representation of national minorities at all levels.*

The Russian Federation guarantees the right of national minorities to unite in national and cultural autonomies (Federal Law No. 74-FZ of 17 June 1996 *On National and Cultural Autonomy*) and other types of NPOs. According to Article 1 of the mentioned Federal Law, national and cultural autonomy is a form of national and cultural self-determination representing a union of the Russian citizens considering themselves as a certain ethnic community being in the situation of a national minority in the respective territory on the basis of their voluntary self-organization for the purpose of independent solution of questions related to the preservation of identity, development of language, education, national culture.

According to the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation, 1,157 national and cultural autonomies are registered in Russia as of December 2020.

As part of the implementation of the State Nationalities Policy of the Russian Federation, the FAEA of Russia is engaged in comprehensive cooperation with institutions of civil society. The main focus of interaction with the non-profit sector is placed on ethnic cultural autonomies (21 federal and 1,136 regional) and all-Russian organizations carrying out their activities in the area of State nationalities policy.

Since 2015, the Advisory Council for National and Cultural Autonomies under the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs, which includes the heads of 21 federal national and cultural autonomies, as well as the heads of all-Russian organizations, such as the All-Russian Cossack Society, Association of Finno-

Ugric Peoples of the Russian Federation, Assembly of Russia's Peoples, and Association of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia, and the Far East of the Russian Federation, has been operating. The Advisory Council holds an average of 3-4 meetings each year to discuss the current agenda in the field of State nationalities policy and make proposals for improving the legislation and the implementation of relevant initiatives.

Federal and cultural autonomies and all-Russian organizations have been provided with support in the form of subsidies since 2020 in accordance with FAEA Order No. 81 of 25 June 2020 *On Approval of Distribution of Subsidies from the Federal Budget to Support Federal National and Cultural Autonomies and other Non-Profit Organizations Carrying out Activities in the Sphere of Implementation of the State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation for 2020*.

The support for national and cultural autonomies and other public organizations operating in the regions is provided, among other things, in the form of subsidies granted to constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

The FAEA of Russia is responsible for implementing the Comprehensive Action Plan for Socio-Economic and Ethno-cultural Development of Roma and the Package of Measures for the Ethno-cultural Development of Finno-Ugric Peoples.

The current Comprehensive Action Plan for the Socio-Economic and Ethno-Cultural Development of Roma was extended to take into account the most pressing issues on 27 March 2019. It highlights the main areas of work and defines a number of specific activities. These include: organization and holding of the Roma under Russian Skies Festival, as well as organization and carrying out of a comprehensive study on the socio-economic, ethno-cultural, and legal aspects of the integration of Roma in Russia. The above measures are also outlined in the State program to implement the State nationalities policy.

In order to promote the development of Finno-Ugric peoples, it is planned to hold the All-Russian Forum of Finno-Ugric Peoples of Russia once every two years starting from 2021.

The FAEA of Russia implements the Concept of Sustainable Development of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation and the action plan for its implementation in 2016-2025.

To improve the efficiency of decision-making on measures aimed at supporting indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, an Expert Advisory Board for the Social and Economic Development of the Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North operates under the FAEA of Russia. There is active cooperation with the Association of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia, and the Far East of the Russian Federation.

The State program of the Russian Federation to Implement the State Nationalities Policy provides for annual state support by means of subsidies from the federal budget to the budgets of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation in support of economic and social development of the indigenous small-numbered peoples.

In accordance with the Federal Law *On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation*, a list of places of native habitat, traditional way of life, economy, and trades of small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation was approved by the Government of the Russian Federation in order to protect native habitat, traditional ways of life, economy and trades of small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation.

By order of the Government of the Russian Federation, a Federal State Budgetary Institution "House of the Peoples of Russia" was established at the end of 2019. This institution is intended to be a coordinating and methodological center for regional and local organizations of this type, Houses of Friendship, and Houses of Nationalities.

The House of the Peoples of Russia's main objective is to create conditions for the preservation, revival and development of national culture and the enjoyment of national and cultural rights by citizens of the Russian Federation identifying themselves as members of certain ethnic communities, through cultural and mass events and other activities that preserve, create, disseminate and master cultural values of the multinational people of Russia.

Assistance to national and international public associations of citizens in activities aimed at the preservation of national culture and traditions, as well as promoting the full participation of non-profit organizations in the implementation of State nationalities policy are among the main activities of the institution.

The building of the House of the Peoples of Russia is intended to house the management bodies of federal national and cultural autonomies, as well as all-Russian public associations.

In 2020, the House of the Peoples of Russia held a number of all-Russian events and concluded more than 50 agreements with public organizations and regional institutions.

In addition, on 13 November 2020, a Decree of the President of the Russian Federation *On the Establishment of the All-Russian Public-State Organization "Assembly of Russia's Peoples"* was signed.

The Assembly has the following aims:

- strengthen the unity and spiritual commonality of the multi-ethnic population of the Russian Federation;
- preserve and develop ethnic and cultural diversity among the peoples of Russia;
- restore and preserve the national and cultural traditions of the peoples of Russia and ensure their full and harmonious development;
- promote the consolidation and coordination of public, private and state structures in supporting initiatives aimed at developing

comprehensive, mutually beneficial and lasting ties between peoples, as well as at involving the broadest possible segment of society in these processes.

To achieve its statutory objectives, the Assembly has the following tasks:

- preserve and develop cultures, traditions and languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, strengthen their spiritual commonality;
- ensure the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples and national minorities.
- develop inter-ethnic cooperation among the peoples of the Russian Federation.

Indigenous peoples

60. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to ensure, in close consultation with indigenous peoples' representatives, that the land these peoples inhabit and their heritage are effectively protected when large-scale industrial projects are carried out. Decisions on the use of land and resources should not negatively impact on the possibilities of the indigenous peoples to maintain and develop their culture in a broad sense.

National legislation and jurisprudence, in accordance with international principles, provide for the full consideration of the legitimate interests of indigenous peoples and consultation and negotiation in matters involving potential economic activities in their territories.

The relevant requirements are established by federal legislation, including the Land Code, which takes precedence, and by the local laws in indigenous people's ancestral homelands concerning land use and natural resource management.

The fulfillment of any principles, including the principle of prior, free and informed consent in judicial precedents, calls for further exploration of the relevant forms and mechanisms, including through implementation in national legislation.

Given the unprecedented diversity and specific characteristics of indigenous peoples, the protection of their rights has been placed under the joint jurisdiction of the Russian Federation and its constituent entities. Federal legislation sets national minimum standards for the protection of the rights of indigenous peoples, while the constituent entities of the Russian Federation clarify the mechanisms for the realization of the relevant rights on most issues, taking into account the objective needs and requests of indigenous peoples.

Depending on the specific living conditions of indigenous peoples, their traditional uses of natural resources and the degree of industrialization, the appropriate practice may extend to the territories of the regions to varying degrees.

In terms of the general sense and content of national legislation, the requirements for such procedures and the form of participation of indigenous peoples and their community institutions are made more rigorous and expanded on the basis of the specific living conditions, ways of life and means of self-sustainment of any social groups of indigenous peoples. In practice, they take the form of public hearings, including on the Internet, citizen gatherings, etc. and also of private consultations and written agreements separately for each industrial facility.

In cases involving persons who lead a nomadic and semi-nomadic way of life, in order to organize effective and full consultations with them and their duly authorized representatives, the regions may record their names in a register and conduct ethnological and other expert appraisals and procedures aimed at

entering into meaningful negotiations and consultations, including compensation for any losses in prescribed cases and according to established procedure.

Such practices are carried out within the boundaries of the territories of traditional natural resource use of numerically small indigenous peoples. For example, in the Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Area-Yugra, more than 1,100 individual agreements are entered into every year between members of communities of numerically small indigenous peoples (covering about 3,000 persons) and industrial companies on the locations for industrial facilities within the boundaries of territories of traditional natural resource use (about 133,000 km², or 25 per cent of the entire territory of Yugra), amounting to some RUB 650 million per year.

In the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), business entities incur administrative liability for refusing to conduct preliminary ethnological impact assessments to determine the opportunities and consequences of any economic activity in the homeland of the indigenous peoples concerned and possible losses for such peoples. In April 2019, the Supreme Court of the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia) ordered a gold mining company to carry out an appropriate assessment for the sake of the indigenous peoples, based on a preliminary similar decision by the procurator and the court of first instance.

In addition, in accordance with the list of instructions from the President of the Russian Federation of 2019, the State Duma of the Russian Federation adopted a federal law specifying the procedure for compensating indigenous peoples for losses and introduced a federal bill on ethnological assessment in the conduct of economic activities in the territories where indigenous peoples live.

Article 6 of the Framework Convention

Combating racism and hate crimes

69. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to amend the anti-extremism legislation with a view to creating more legal certainty and clarifying the scope of its application in line with Article 6. Awareness should be raised about the need to guarantee protection of human rights, including minority rights, in the implementation of this legislation.*

As defined in Federal Law No. 114-FZ of 25 July 2002 *On Combating Extremist Activities*, extremist activity encompasses: incitement to social, racial, ethnic or religious discord; advocacy of the exceptionality, superiority or inferiority of persons on the basis of their social, racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic affiliation or attitude to religion; and the violation of the rights, freedoms and legitimate interests of persons and citizens on the basis of their social, racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic affiliation or attitude to religion.

The Criminal Code contains a number of articles prohibiting extremist offences. It is a criminal offence to make public calls to carry out extremist activity (Article 280), incite hatred or enmity or diminish human dignity (Article 282), organize extremist associations (Article 282.1), organize the activities of extremist organizations (Article 282.2) or violate human or civil rights or freedoms (Article 136).

In accordance with the Criminal Code, the commission of any offence for reasons of political, ideological, racial, ethnic or religious hatred or enmity is deemed to be an aggravating circumstance and entails a harsher sentence.

Federal Law No. 114-FZ of 25 July 2002 *On Combating Extremist Activities* sets out the basic legal and organizational mechanisms for action in this regard, includes a definition of "extremism" and establishes administrative and criminal liability for the commission of unlawful acts of an extremist nature.

It is prohibited to disseminate extremist materials in the Russian Federation or to produce or store them for the purposes of dissemination.

Efforts to improve legislation in this area are ongoing. On 2 December 2019, Federal Law No. 421-FZ was adopted, amending Article 6 of the Federal Law *On the Commemoration of the Victory of the Soviet People in the Great Patriotic War of 1941–1945* and Article 1 of the Federal Law *On Combating Extremist Activities* to provide that the ban on the public display of Nazi symbols and paraphernalia does not apply to works of science, literature and art or to displays for information, teaching or awareness-raising purposes on the condition that Nazism and extremism are condemned.

On 18 February 2020, the State Duma adopted amendments to the Code of Administrative Offences on their third reading, to stipulate that the administrative offence of using Nazi symbols is no longer applicable to works of science, literature and art that do not contain propaganda for Nazism or when used for educational and awareness-raising purposes.

On 27 December 2018, Federal Law No. 519-FZ was adopted, amending Article 282 of the Criminal Code in order to partially decriminalize the activities covered by that article (Incitement to hatred or enmity).

70. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to prevent, identify, investigate, prosecute and sanction effectively all racially and ethnically motivated acts, including against persons from the North Caucasus and against migrants.

The law enforcement agencies of the Russian Federation take measures to prevent, identify and detect offences motivated by racial, religious, ethnic and other forms of hatred or enmity, perform an in-depth systemic analysis, forecast developments in extremist circles and prevent and detect violent crime.

The increase in the number of extremist offences identified in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation is largely the result of the proactive

work done to prevent such crimes by the counter-extremism centers of the internal affairs agencies.

Owing to preventive measures and certain amendments to administrative and criminal legislation (decriminalization of the offences covered in Article 282 of the Criminal Code "Incitement to hatred or enmity and diminution of dignity"), the number of extremist offences is on the decline.

In 2019, 585 extremist offences were registered (-53.8 per cent compared to 2018), of which 285 (-63.9 per cent) were identified by internal affairs officials, which accounts for 48.7 per cent of the total number of this type of offence. The investigation has been completed into 454 offences (-61.8 per cent), of which 370 criminal cases (-61.4 per cent) were referred to court. The number of perpetrators of extremist offences identified (in completed criminal proceedings) was 445 (-50 per cent).

Whereas previously criminal cases initiated under Article 282 of the Criminal Code accounted for more than half of all extremist offences recorded, approximately one half (46.5 per cent) of such offences recorded in 2019 were initiated under Article 280 of the Code (Public calls for extremist activities), a total of 272 (+1.1 per cent).

In 2019, the number of violent extremist offences (55) remained at 2018 levels, the most common among them being death threats (20), criminal mischief (17), battery (6) and the intentional infliction of minor bodily harm (5).

The availability of legal assistance to foreign citizens is ensured by Article 1, paragraph 3 of Federal Law No. 59-FZ of 2 May 2006 *On the Procedure For Handling Applications of Citizens of the Russian Federation* (which extends to foreign citizens and stateless persons), as well as by departmental control over the procedure for registration and accounting of citizens' appeals, established by Order of the Russian Ministry of Internal Affairs No. 707 of 12 September 2013

On Approval of the Instruction on the Procedure For Handling Applications within the System of the Ministry of the Interior of the Russian Federation.

In order to prevent illegal recruitment of foreign workers, the Russian Federation is working to conclude bilateral agreements with a number of states on organized recruitment for temporary employment in the Russian Federation, the provisions of which, among other things, provide for the possibility of integrated pre-departure training of foreign nationals in their country of residence, including issues related to vocational training, retraining and advanced training, Russian language, Russian history and the basics of Russian legislation course, as well as a pre-employment medical examination.

Law enforcement bodies

75. *The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to ensure that persons belonging to national minorities, including persons from the North Caucasus and the Roma, are not subject to discriminatory and intimidatory behavior by law enforcement bodies. Law enforcement staff, including Cossacks, should be trained on human and minority rights standards and how to apply these with respect to persons belonging to minorities.*

Supervision of compliance with the Constitution of the Russian Federation, the execution of laws by representative (legislative) and executive bodies of constituent entities of the Russian Federation, as well as supervision of respect for human and civil rights and freedoms falls under the prosecution authorities of the Russian Federation⁸.

The prosecution authorities have no information on arbitrary identity checks and other discrimination against persons from the North Caucasus and Roma, including by Cossacks.

⁸ Federal Law No. 2202-1 of 17 January 1992 *On the Prosecutor's Office of the Russian Federation.*

Nor have there been any reports of discrimination, mistreatment and torture of persons from the North Caucasus and stateless persons in the penitentiary system.

Article 7 of the Framework Convention

Freedom of assembly and association

83. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to amend the Federal Law on Non-Commercial organizations and other legislation on NGOs in line with international standards and refrain from unduly limiting the freedom of association of persons belonging to national minorities.*

Article 30 of the Constitution establishes the right of association. To ensure the realization of this right, a number of laws have been adopted which are fully conducive to the implementation of the right: the Civil Code; Federal Law No. 82-FZ of 19 May 1995 *On Public Associations*; Federal Law No. 7-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Non-Profit Organizations*; Federal Law No. 10-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Trade Unions, Their Rights and Guarantees relating to Their Activities*; Federal Law No. 3085-1-FZ of 19 June 1992 *On the Consumer Cooperation and Consumer Associations and Unions*; Federal Law No. 95-FZ of 11 July 2001 *On Political Parties*; and the Ethnic and Cultural Autonomy Act Federal Law No. 74-FZ of 17 June 1996 *On National and Cultural Autonomy*.

In accordance with Federal Law No. 272-FZ of 28 December 2012 *On Sanctions for Individuals Violating Fundamental Human Rights and Freedoms of the Citizens of the Russian Federation*, the activities of a foreign or international non-governmental organization which threatens the foundations of the constitutional order of the Russian Federation, national defense or state security may be deemed undesirable in the Russian Federation. The legislation in this part complies with Article 22 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and Article 11 of the Convention for the Protection of Human

Rights and Fundamental Freedoms and is an adequate response to a potential threat to national security and public order.

Freedom of expression and freedom of conscience

87. *The Advisory Committee strongly urges the authorities to abstain from unduly infringing on the freedom of expression and freedom of conscience of persons belonging to and defending the rights of national minorities.*

Under Article 29 of the Constitution, the right to freedom of thought and expression is guaranteed for all. Propaganda or agitation that incites social, racial, ethnic or religious hatred and enmity is prohibited. The advocacy of social, racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic superiority is also prohibited.

Article 31 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation establishes the right of citizens to hold meetings, rallies and demonstrations, and to organize marches and pickets. As part of the system for countering extremism, including on the grounds of racial and ethnic intolerance, conditions for restricting this right have been introduced through the Constitution. Citizens must "assemble peacefully and without weapons".

The same approach has been taken by the specific legislation governing the exercise of this right. Federal Law No. 54-FZ of 19 June 2004 *On Assemblies, Meetings, Demonstrations, Rallies and Pickets*, is the main law establishing standards in this field. Article 3 of the Law sets out the basic principles for the conduct of public events, which include the principle of legality and voluntary participation.

In accordance with Article 15.3, paragraph 1 of Federal Law No. 149-FZ of July 27, 2006 *On Information, Information Technologies and Protection of Information*, the General Prosecutor of the Russian Federation and his deputies can decide to limit access to the websites containing calls for mass riots, extremist activities, participation in mass (public) events held in violation of the established

procedure. This provision covers content shared by foreign or international nongovernmental organizations when their activities have been recognized as undesirable in the territory of the Russian Federation as well as data enabling access to the said information or content.

Such a decision seeks to delete unlawful information. Once the requirements of authorities are fulfilled, access to such websites is restored without delay. A website can be blocked only in case of refusal to delete the banned information, which is fully in line with Article 20 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and Article 10 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, being an adequate response to the potential threat to people's security and safety.

Advisory Committee's allegations that Article 280 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation criminalizes "public, online calls aimed at violating the territorial integrity of the Russian Federation" and that this provision is used to prosecute and intimidate critics of Russia's policy on Crimea to limit the freedom of expression of persons belonging to national minorities, are untrue.

For instance, Andrey B. Bubeyev, whose criminal case is referred to in paragraph 84 of the Recommendations, was prosecuted and convicted for an offence against the foundations of the constitutional order and national security.

In its sentence of 5 May 2016, the Tver Zavolzhsky District Court asserted the fact that he had willfully shared information containing incitement to extremism, i.e.: crimes on grounds of political hatred or enmity; dissemination of content aimed at inciting hatred, enmity or discord in relation to a group of people of a certain ethnicity (Russians), as well as to violation of the territorial integrity of the Russian Federation.

A court of appeal upheld the sentence.

The sentence of the Naberezhnye Chelny City Court (the Republic of Tatarstan) of September 15, 2015, found Rafis R. Kashapov guilty of crimes

provided for in Article 282, paragraph 1 and Article 280, paragraph 2 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. He was sentenced to three years of imprisonment in a penal colony of general regime with no right to use Internet social networks for two years.

The Court proved that he made some relevant posts on his personal page on VKontakte social network during the period from July till December 2014, with a view to violating the territorial integrity of the Russian Federation, inciting hatred or enmity and degrading human dignity and dignity of a group of people on ethnic grounds.

The Court considered that a clear case of abuse by the defendant of his right to freedom of expression as well as of unlawful acts violating Article 29 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation which guarantees freedom of thought and speech and prohibits propaganda or agitation, which arouses social, racial, national, religious or linguistic supremacy.

The court ruling contains no evidence that Mr. Kashapov was found guilty of incitement of hatred towards the Russian authorities as a social group.

According to the ruling of November 13, 2015, made on appeal by a judicial panel for criminal cases of the Supreme Court in the Republic of Tatarstan, the sentence in relation to Mr. Kashapov was overruled to excise the additional punishment, i.e. a two-year ban on the use of social networks.

Regarding paragraph 85 of the Recommendations. Natalya G. Sharina, director of the State Cultural Institution of Moscow "Library of Ukrainian Literature" and later of the State Budgetary Cultural Institution of Moscow "Library of Ukrainian Literature", was convicted by Moscow's Meschansky Court on 5 June 2017 for crimes under Article 282, Part 2, paragraph "b", Article 160, paragraph 3 and 4 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

The sentence of the Court found that while in office, with a view to incite hatred and enmity as well as degrade the dignity of a group of people on ethnic

or origin grounds, she shared some online books by Ukrainian authors, containing humiliating remarks and negative emotional judgments about the Russian ethnic group and certain representatives thereof meant to encourage action against this ethnic group and contribute to nationalist sentiments against Russians as well as songs available on CDs titled "March of UNA-UNSO" and "Khto zhivyi?" (Who's alive?) voicing direct calls for an armed struggle.

All publications on Ukrainian nationalism contribute to a hostile environment against Russians since Ukrainian nationalism suggests an indispensable adversarial relationship between Ukrainians and Russians. The sentence of the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation of November 17, 2014, acknowledged Ukrainian organizations "Ukrainian National Assembly – Ukrainian People's Self-Defense" (UNA-UNSO) and "Ukrainian Insurgent Army" (UPA) extremist, so their activities were prohibited in the territory of the Russian Federation.

In addition, Ms. Sharina was found guilty of two facts of embezzlement of funds she was entrusted with totaling over two million rubles.

Bearing in mind the above facts, the criminal case against Ms. G.Sharina is obviously not politically motivated.

The Court gave Ms. Sharina a four-year suspended prison sentence with a probationary period of four years.

The Moscow City Court, which heard the case on appeal, found the verdict against Ms. Sharina to be lawful and justified.

Article 19 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted on December 16, 1966 at the 1496th plenary meeting of the UN General Assembly by Resolution 2200 (XXI), stipulates that everyone "shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any other media of his choice".

At the same time, it allows for certain restrictions as are prescribed by law regarding the exercise of this right "for the protection of national security or of public order, or of public health or morals".

Pursuant to Article 10, paragraph 2 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of 4 November 1950 "the exercise of these freedoms, since it carries with it duties and responsibilities, may be subject to such formalities, conditions, restrictions or penalties as are prescribed by law and are necessary in a democratic society, in the interests of national security, territorial integrity or public safety, for the prevention of disorder or crime, for the protection of health or morals, for the protection of the reputation or rights of others, for preventing the disclosure of information received in confidence, or for maintaining the authority and impartiality of the judiciary".

Article 55, paragraph 3 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation contains a similar provision which stipulates that human and civil rights and freedoms may be restricted on the basis of the federal law and only to the extent, to which it shall be necessary for the purposes of protecting the foundations of the constitutional system, morality, the health, the rights and the lawful interests of other persons, of providing for the defense of the country and for the state security.

Regarding paragraph 86 of the Recommendations. The authorities of the Republic of Chechnya have issued no regulation obliging public sector workers to wear traditional Muslim headscarves during work; neither have the relevant agencies of the Russian Federation received any complaints about being coerced to do so.

Article 8 of the Framework Convention

Manifestation of religious beliefs and religious associations

Regarding paragraph 91 of the Recommendations. The ruling of the Sochi Lazarevsky District Court of 30 August 2017, found the leader of a group of the Black Sea Adyghians (Shapsugs), Ruslan I. Gvashev, guilty of an administrative offence provided for in Article 20.2 paragraph 5 of the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation (violation by a participant of a public event of the established procedure for conducting a meeting, rally, demonstration, procession or picket) and sentenced him to a fine of ten thousand rubles.

The Court found that on 21 May 2017, following the flower- and wreath-laying ceremony at the monument "To the Adyghians Killed in the Caucasian War" in Kichmaysky rural area of the Lazarevsky District in Sochi, a convoy of vehicles (carrying about 60 people) proceeded to the Tulip Tree located in Golovinka microdistrict. Ruslan I. Gvashev said a prayer which later turned into a rally demanding to recognize the genocide of the Adyghian people and voicing his views on various issues of social life.

The actual prayer and other issues related to their religious affiliation or exercise of religious cult were not considered by the court and had no legal bearing to the offence classification. Therefore, any claims of violation of the said persons' right to freedom of religion are groundless.

By its decision of 16 October 2017, the Krasnodar Regional Court upheld the ruling of the lower court and dismissed Ruslan I. Gvashev's claim.

93. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to refrain from any undue interference with the right of persons belonging to national minorities to express and manifest their religious beliefs freely.*

Article 28 of the Constitution specifies that "everyone shall be guaranteed freedom of conscience and religion, including the right to profess individually or

collectively any religion or not to profess any religion, and freely to choose, possess and disseminate religious and other convictions and act in accordance with them".

Relations in the area of religious beliefs of citizens' religious beliefs are regulated by Federal Law No. 125-FZ of 26 September 1997 *On Freedom of Conscience and Religious Associations*. The preamble to this law affirms "the right of every person to freedom of conscience and religion and to equality before the law, regardless of the person's attitude towards religion and belief". Furthermore, the objective of regulation in this area is defined as the promotion of "mutual understanding, tolerance and respect in matters of freedom of conscience and freedom of religion". Article 3 of the Law establishes that not only citizens, but also foreign nationals and stateless persons, have the right, on an equal footing, to profess any religion, or to profess none. Obstructing the exercise of the right to freedom of conscience and freedom of belief is prohibited and punishable under federal law. Violations of this right are punishable under both administrative law (under the Code of Administrative Offences, Article 5.26, on violation of the legislation on freedom of conscience, freedom of belief and religious associations) and criminal law (under the Criminal Code, Article 148, on violation of the right to freedom of conscience and religious belief).

Article 59 of the Constitution provides citizens with the possibility "in the event that their convictions or religious beliefs run counter to military service and in other cases established by federal law, citizens of the Russian Federation shall have the right to replace it with alternative civilian service". Federal Law No. 113-FZ of 25 July 2002 *On the Alternative Civilian Service* was adopted to ensure the realization of that right.

Article 9 of the Framework Convention

Minority media

99. *The Advisory Committee encourages the authorities to facilitate the access of persons belonging to national minorities to licenses for television and radio broadcasting in minority languages at local level. To cater for the various needs and habits of media consumers, editors of minority media should be supported in the transition from print to online editions, without having to abandon print versions altogether.*

Coverage of the state nationalities policy and related topics, as well as of issues aimed at preserving and supporting the Russian language as the state language of the Russian Federation and the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, is one of the priorities in the work of state mass media and is carried out by them as part of their ongoing activities.

The main role in this matter is assigned to the state and major federal media outlets.

Leading TV channels are watched by more than 85 per cent of the population. On the Internet: IIA "Rossiya Segodnya" and "TASS" news agency of Russia, with a monthly audience of 32 million and 12 million users, respectively, as well as websites of major federal newspapers: "Komsomolskaya Pravda" with 32 million users, "Rossiyskaya Gazeta" with 18 million and "Argumenty i Fakty" with 14 million.

The key role in the coverage of the state nationalities policy is played by the following media outlets:

- FSUE VGTRK – more than two thousand thematic TV programs and four thousand radio programs;

- FSUE IIA "Rossiya Segodnya" – more than 2,500 thematic materials, about 30 roundtables and conferences held, a unique information portal "Russia for Everybody";
- FSUE ITAR-TASS – about 600 thematic materials per year;
- "Rossiyskaya Gazeta" – over 100 thematic materials.

20 all-Russian "must-carry" television channels, which are part of multiplexes I and II, also systematically cover issues related to strengthening inter-ethnic relations and preserving and developing the culture of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

The Russian Federation currently has 146,394 media outlets operating in 87 languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation: 35,822 newspapers; 49,493 magazines; 1,781 bulletins; 1,396 almanacs; 2,502 anthologies; 7,771 TV channels; 7,079 TV programs; 8,076 radio channels; 1,850 radio programs; 275 newsreels, audio programs, video programs; 8,429 electronic periodicals; 1,963 online news outlets; 2,757 news agencies.

FSUE VGTRK places great emphasis on the coverage of ethnic policy issues with its 79 regional branches and 14 local branches broadcasting programs in 54 languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, providing over 5,000 hours of television broadcasting in ethnic languages and about 30,000 hours of radio broadcasting.

On the Internet, the leading sources of information reflecting a true picture of State nationalities policy are the following state news agencies: "Rossiya Segodnya" and "TASS" news agency, with a monthly audience of 32 million and 12 million users, respectively; the websites of major federal newspapers: "Komsomolskaya Pravda" with 32 million users, "Rossiyskaya Gazeta" with 18 million, and "Argumenty i Fakty" with 14 million users.

In 2020, more than 600 news items on interethnic relations were published by FSUE IIA "Rossiya Segodnya".

Among the projects by IIA "Rossiya Segodnya" it is worth mentioning the Portal of National Literatures (created on the basis of the information portal Russia for Everyone) which is unique in its content and format and aims to maintain, preserve and develop the literature of the peoples of Russia and contains about 1,738 publications.

As for the print media, mention should be made of the work of FSBI "Editorial Office of Rossiyskaya Gazeta", which aims to preserve and develop the languages of the peoples of Russia, harmonize inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations, support and promote the Russian language, education in Russian, Russian culture and science in the global information space.

Content dedicated to the issues of preserving and developing Russian languages and the authorities' activities to promote the Russian language is regularly published on pages of federal and regional editions and on the official website of "Rossiyskaya Gazeta" (www.rg.ru) under sections entitled "Culture", "Power", "Domestic Politics", "Public Administration", "Migration", etc.

Various thematic forums, competitions and events, primarily held in the regions of the Russian Federation, also make an important contribution to the informational support of the State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation. In 2019-2020, over RUB 100 million was allocated for about 200 regional events of this kind, which included a bonus award for the best journalistic works on relevant topics.

Subsidies are granted annually on a competitive basis to electronic and printed media that implement socially significant projects aimed at harmonizing interethnic relations, developing interethnic understanding, disseminating knowledge about traditions and culture of the peoples of Russia, promoting ideas of interethnic and interreligious tolerance, preventing extremism on ethnic and religious grounds, including to media in languages of the peoples of Russia.

Thus, in the first half of 2020 alone, 31 projects were granted support worth more than RUB 27 million. In addition, 67 periodicals published in 17 national languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation received state support in the total amount of RUB 55 million.

Article 10 of the Framework Convention

Use of minority languages in private, in public and with administrative authorities

105. The Advisory Committee calls on the Russian authorities to take legal and practical measures ensuring that the rights contained in Article 10 of the Framework Convention are guaranteed and implemented effectively in all regions. They should develop a comprehensive strategy for the promotion of minority languages in different areas of public life and actively encourage and support the use of minority languages in all the areas covered by Article 10 of the Framework Convention including through the allocation of necessary financial and human resources.

Article 2 of Federal Law No. 1807-1 of 25 October 1991 *On the Languages of the Peoples of the Russian Federation* setting out State guarantees of equal rights for languages in the Russian Federation, specifies that "the Russian Federation guarantees everyone the right to use his or her native language and to freely choose the language of communication, upbringing, education and creativity, irrespective of his or her origin, social and property status, racial and ethnic affiliation, sex, education, attitude towards religion and place of residence."

Laws of the Russian Federation guarantee access to education in the official language of the Russian Federation and also guarantee a choice of language of instruction and education, to the extent possible within the capabilities of the education system. The teaching and study of the official

languages of the constituent republics of the Russian Federation may be introduced at the State and municipal schools in those republics in accordance with their local laws.

There are 193 ethnic groups in Russia, and 277 languages and dialects are used. The Russian education system alone includes over 100 languages; 24 languages are used to educate children and 81 are studied as optional subjects.

At the legislative level, Russia guarantees all its peoples, irrespective of their number, equal rights to preserve and comprehensively develop their native languages and the freedom to choose and use their language of communication.

Preserving ethnic, cultural, and linguistic diversity in the Russian Federation is one of the priorities of the State Nationalities Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation.

As part of the International Year of Indigenous Languages, the Foundation for the Preservation and Study of the Native Languages of the Peoples of the Russian Federation⁹ (hereinafter referred to as the Foundation) has been established.

Federal Law No. 459-FZ of 29 November 2018 *On the Federal Budget for 2019 and for the Planning Period of 2020 and 2021* provided the Fund with budget allocations of RUB 282.0 million, including: for 2019 – RUB 88.0 million, for 2020 – RUB 96.0 million and for 2021 – RUB 98.0 million.

Financial support for the Fund's activities is provided by the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation within the framework of the State Program of the Russian Federation "Development of Education".

Thus, in anticipation of the International Year of Indigenous Languages, the Foundation has launched large-scale projects to promote the study of native

⁹ Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 611 of 26 October 2018 *On the Establishment of the Foundation for the Preservation and Study of the Native Languages of the Peoples of the Russian Federation*.

languages of the peoples of Russia, including support for authors working on textbooks, teaching manuals, and dictionaries in native languages.

In 2019, 64 original layouts of textbooks in the subject "Native Language and Literature-based Reading in the Native Language" in 17 languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation were designed with the help of the Foundation.

They include:

- seven completed series of textbooks on mother tongue instruction in seven languages (Komi Izhemi, Mansi, Nenets, Selkup, Olcha, Evenki, Yakut);
- nine completed series of textbooks on literature-based reading in the native language in nine languages (Veps, Nanai, Sámi, Tofalar, Tuvan-Todzhán, Udehe, Olcha, Evenki, Yukaghir);
- primers for grade 1 in six languages (Dolgan, Itelmen, Sámi, Soyot, Tuvan-Todzhán, Udehe).

In 2019, the Foundation held a seminar-meeting entitled "Languages of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East in the General Education System of the Russian Federation: Current Status and Development Prospects" (Naryan-Mar), which outlined the key vector of the Foundation's work in 2019 and the first half of 2020, namely support for languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation. In 2019, the II All-Russian Congress of Teachers of Native Languages, Literature and Culture of Indigenous Minorities of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation (St. Petersburg) was held with the financial support of the Foundation.

In 2020, in accordance with its charter, the Foundation held competitions for the creation of original layouts of dictionaries and textbooks in the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation. Projects in the following

languages participated in the competition: Avar, Altai, Dargin, Juhuri (Mountain Jewish), Koryak, Kumandin, Mansi, Nenets, Nivkhi (Amur dialect), Selkup, Tabasaran, Olcha, Chechen, Chukot, Evenki, Even, Yukaghir, Yakut, Udihe and Tofalar.

The Foundation also held a contest to support pilot projects and youth start-ups to promote, study, and popularize the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation. The projects submitted to the contest were aimed at making the Buryat, Tuvinian, Yukaghir, and Yakut languages more accessible.

The Foundation provided financial and informational support for a series of board games under the general name "Nomad Camp"; among other things, it assisted in delivering published copies of the game to 12 regions that are home to the Even, Evenki, and Koryak peoples.

Work is underway to support the "Grandmother's Tales" project in nine languages (Russian, Tatar, Yakut, Evenki, Komi, Tuvian, Mari, Bashkir, and Chechen). The results of the project involve creating opportunities for a dialogue of cultures at preschool age, establishing a bilingual educational environment in educational institutions, and preserving the cumulative function of the native language.

The Foundation, together with the Institute of Linguistics of the Russian Academy of Sciences, is working to elaborate information content on the widespread languages of the Russian Federation, as well as on the languages used in the Russian Federation and being state or official languages in other countries.

In 2019, the Ministry also established the Institute for the Development of Native Languages of the Peoples of the Russian Federation with the aim of creating the conditions for instruction in the native languages and for the study of the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, and in order to improve accessibility and the quality of instruction and study.

The Ministry of Education is systematically working to ensure the rights of citizens to receive education in their native languages and to learn the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation. It has worked on a draft policy framework for teaching the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

Work has been carried out to improve educational programs, textbooks and teaching aids for the native languages and literature of the peoples of the Russian Federation, with the aim of incorporating them into the educational process.

Currently, 37 ethnic languages of the peoples of Russia have the status of State languages in the respective constituent republics and may be used on an equal basis with the Russian language.

The status and development of the languages of the peoples of Russia in the 2019/2020 school year were monitored, producing the following findings:

- in 28 constituent entities of the Russian Federation, Russian has been chosen as the native language.
- in 57 constituent entities, the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation are studied as native languages; in 12 of these constituent entities, various levels of general education are taught in 16 native languages at 2,402 general education schools with 339,405 students.

As at February 2020, the State register of exemplary general education programs included 68 programs devoted to native languages for 16 languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation and also 33 programs in literary reading and native literature for 15 such languages. The federal list of textbooks currently includes 222 textbooks in 11 native languages.

Pursuant to the international agreements to which the Russian Federation is a party, the State helps representatives of the country's ethnic groups living abroad to obtain basic general instruction in their native languages.

In addition, literature is studied as an educational subject in the languages of the native peoples of the Russian Federation, and in some of the country's constituent entities, geography or local history is also studied in local languages.

*Regarding paragraph 100 of the recommendations, we would like to note that the status of the Russian language as the state language of the Russian Federation on the entire territory of the Russian Federation, as well as the language of the state-constituting people who are part of the multinational union of equal peoples of the Russian Federation, is confirmed by Article 68, paragraph 1 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation (as amended by Law of the Russian Federation on Amendments to the Constitution of the Russian Federation No. 1-FKZ of 14 March 2020 *On Improving the Regulation of Certain Aspects of the Organization and Functioning of Public Authority*).*

At the same time, according to the position of the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation, stated in its Opinion No 1-Z of 16 March 2020, the inclusion of these provisions in the text of the Constitution of the Russian Federation cannot be seen as being incompatible with the provisions of Chapters 1 and 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, in particular its Articles 1, 13, 14, 28 and 29, since, being designed to reflect the substantive character and constitutional and legal conditions of public authorities of the Russian Federation and, to a great extent, of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation the proposed regulations are not political, partisan or confessional in nature and cannot be regarded, interpreted or applied as establishing a state or obligatory ideology, changing the principles of pluralistic democracy and the secular nature of the Russian state, introducing any restrictions on human and civil rights and freedoms that are impermissible in terms of Chapters 1 and 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation and interference in them.

According to the results of the nationwide voting on the changes to the Constitution of the Russian Federation, as stated in Resolution of the Central

Election Commission of the Russian Federation No. 256/1888-7 of 3 July 2020 *On the Results of the Nationwide Vote on Amendments to the Constitution of the Russian Federation*, the proposed amendments to the Constitution of the Russian Federation No. 1-FKZ of March 14, 2020 *On Improving the Regulation of Certain Aspects of the Organization and Functioning of Public Authority* were approved by 77.92 percent of the citizens of the Russian Federation who had taken part in the nationwide voting and came into force.

In this connection, we draw attention to the fact that the adoption of any decision by national plebiscite, which is a form of direct democracy, expresses the will of the multinational people of the Russian Federation, which in accordance with Article 3, paragraph 1 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation is the bearer of sovereignty and the sole source of power in the Russian Federation, and does not require any additional legitimization.

Choice of alphabet

108. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to adopt federal legislation granting exceptions to the use of the Cyrillic script for second official languages.

The Russian Federation continues to adhere to the position that the Cyrillic alphabet has been traditionally and reasonably used in writing systems of the Russian languages. Many writings were initially created on the basis of the Cyrillic alphabet. The Cyrillic alphabet consists of 33 letters and allows using different letter combinations indicate in writing all the sounds used in the languages of the peoples of Russia.

Bearing in mind the scientific data and expert opinion, the government of the Russian Federation does not share the view that Latin script is particularly convenient for the Turkic or Finno-Ugric languages since its introduction would

mean using a significant number of diacritical marks and letter combinations which slow down rather than facilitate the transliteration of speech.

Article 11 of the Framework Convention

Topographical indications and other signs and inscriptions

112. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to establish clear procedures for the display of topographical signs in minority languages, including in those that are not official languages of the republics, in close consultation with the representatives of national minorities and take measures to promote use of minority languages in display of topographical indications, signs, and other inscriptions.

In the Russian Federation, where in addition to the Russian language the status of the state language and languages of the peoples of Russia (in the Republic of North Ossetia – Alania – Ossetian, in the Republic of Crimea – Ukrainian, etc.) topographical signs are duplicated in Russian and in the language of a national minority.

Article 12 of the Framework Convention

Equal access to education

121. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to take measures so that the practice of undue placement of Roma children in separate or remedial classes or schools is stopped. Existing positive practices of including Roma children in mainstream education should be evaluated and, if they were effective, applied on a larger scale. The use, teaching and learning of Romani should be encouraged.

According to Article 3, Part 1, paragraph 2 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29 December 2012 *On Education in the Russian Federation* (Law No. 273-FZ),

public policy and the legal regulation of education issues relations are based, *inter alia*, on the principles of ensuring the right of everyone to education, non-discrimination in education. Thus, under Article 5, paragraph 2 of Law No. 273-FZ, the right to education in the Russian Federation is guaranteed without distinction as to sex, race, ethnic background, language, origin, property or social status, place of residence, attitude to religion, beliefs or other circumstances.

In accordance with Article 78 of Law No. 273-FZ, foreign nationals and stateless persons have equal rights with citizens of the Russian Federation regarding access to preschool, primary general, basic general and secondary education, as well as to vocational training programs for trades and white-collar jobs offered as part of the curriculum of universal and free secondary education.

In this regard, with a view to upholding the right to education of children, including Roma children, and other national minorities, pursuant to Article 5, paragraph 4, Article 9 of Law No. 273-FZ, Articles 15, 16 of Federal Law No. 131-FZ of 6 October 2003 *On General Principles of Organization of Local Self-Government in the Russian Federation*, local authorities have created the appropriate social and economic conditions for education, drawn up a register of all children aged 6-15 who should be attending school, taking into account foreign nationals (stateless persons), and steps have been taken to consolidate municipal educational establishments for specific territories.

Within the framework of the above-mentioned measures and on the basis of Article 14, paragraph 1.4 and 2.2 of Federal Law No. 120-FZ of 24 June 1999 *On Basics of the System for the Prevention of Child Neglect and Juvenile Delinquency*, the education authorities and organizations carry out educational activities, identify and keep a record of young people who do not attend or are regularly absent from school without a reasonable excuse and take measures to guide them and ensure that they receive a general education. Under Article 11 of

the Law, juvenile affairs and children's rights commissions exercise their powers as mechanisms for the protection of the rights and redress for violations of the rights and legitimate interests of children in receiving an education.

Where necessary, children from Roma families that have difficulty coping with basic educational programs, and with the challenges of personal development and social adaptation, receive psychological, educational, medical and social assistance, in accordance with the requirements of Article 42 of the Federal Law No. 273-FZ.

In line with the federal State standard for basic general education, approved by Order No. 1897 of 17 December 2010 of the Ministry of Education and Science, programs are carried out in the different constituent entities of the Russian Federation in response to the individual needs of students and schoolchildren, including members of the Roma population, by building their social skills and promoting their character development through extracurricular activities in such areas as health and fitness, moral and social education, general knowledge and culture.

Roma children have equal rights and opportunities to attend educational institutions, where they receive textbooks, stationery and meals. Buses are made available to transport schoolchildren to general educational establishments located in rural areas.

There are 867 Roma children enrolled in 69 general education institutions in the Vladimir Region in the 2020/2021 school year. Children from Roma families are engaged in clubs at educational institutions, including amateur art groups (vocal, choral, and dance), crafts (patchwork, weaving, embroidery, etc.), and sports clubs (333 Roma students in the current school year). The key issue is the need for quality education for Roma children. Many problems are solved by teaching teams with the help of Roma community leaders. An example of targeted work in this area is the experience of the municipal budget educational institution

Glubokovskaya Secondary General Education School in Petushinsky District, in which more than 30 per cent of the students are Roma children.

In order to create an environment for children from Roma families to receive a basic general education, general education institutions use flexible forms of implementing educational programs: individual curriculum, distance learning, and part-time study.

Various supplementary education programs, such as "Teaching Russian to Children as a Second Language" etc., are implemented in general education institutions with the largest number of children from Roma families.

Children from Roma families are engaged in hobby clubs offered by educational institutions. 333 Roma children attend amateur art groups (vocal, choral, and dance), crafts and sports clubs.

Leaders and activists of the Regional Public Organization "Roma Cultural Center of Vladimir Region" make house-to-house visits once a year to update the lists of school-age children and to educate the Roma population about the necessity of obtaining a general education.

For the same purpose, schools in municipalities with a large Roma population, together with the heads of educational institutions, hold parent-teacher conferences with the parents of Roma children.

In 2020, to help teachers working with Roma children, the "Vladimir Institute of Education Development named after L.I.Novikova" carried out the following activities:

- webinar on how to organize the education of foreign-language children;
- webinar on the topic "Organization of Activities to Form the Multicultural Competence of Educational Process Participants";
- conference "Upbringing of Patriots in a Multicultural Society".

In January-February 2020, professional development courses entitled 'Current Problems of a Social Education Specialist in the Context of the Professional Standard 'Parenting Support Professionals. Working with foreign language children' (18 hours), 21 teachers were trained.

Events involving Roma amateur groups take place in the region's municipalities on a regular basis.

In Tula Oblast, for children experiencing difficulties in general education programs, the educational process is supervised by specialists in psychology, psychological training on issues of self-development and self-knowledge is provided, and extracurricular activities involve additional Russian language classes, including the study of the Russian language:

- Municipal budgetary general education institution (hereinafter referred to as MBGEI) "Educational Center No. 6" implements the program "Promotion of Tolerance in the School Environment and Prevention of Extremism" and the project "Prevention of Interethnic Conflicts in the Socio-Cultural Space" to overcome negative stereotypes against the Roma population. Ethno-cultural development of children is ensured through the inclusion in the curriculum of the course "Subculture of the Roma people," in the literary reading program of the section "Acquaintance with Roma folk art". There are consultations for parents on "How to help your child adapt to the school environment", "How to organize a safe leisure time";
- MBGEI "Educational Center No. 51" has adaptation groups for the study of the Russian language; additional group lessons on subjects of the curriculum are organized with low-performing pupils, and Roma children are actively encouraged to participate in hobby and sports clubs. Monthly psychological consultations are held on family

relationships and academic performance, as well as talks on drug abuse prevention, family upbringing, and the adaptation of children to learning;

- the library of the Plekhanov Elementary School has a collection of printed and electronic versions of Roma folk tales and methodological literature for organizing extracurricular activities and introducing children to the culture of the Roma people. Specially designed aids are used in the teaching process (Russian-Gypsy ABC books, cursive workbooks).

Work is being done to involve representatives of the Roma diaspora in city, regional, and inter-regional festivals of inter-ethnic art.

Within the framework of interdepartmental cooperation between prevention entities, program activities aimed at shaping inter-ethnic and inter-religious tolerance, rejection of ideas of nationalism and extremism, and discrediting terrorist ideology are held.

According to the monitoring results, in the 2020-2021 school year, in 52 of the 55 municipalities of the Rostov Region, children from Roma families attend general education institutions and their number is 4,389. 2,795 children from Roma families receive supplementary education.

Educational organizations of the region carry out methodological and informational work with children and their parents (legal representatives) to explain their rights and obligations, the procedure for protecting their rights established by the legislation of the Russian Federation.

In the Rostov Region, in areas with large Russian Roma populations, there are crafts clubs for children, including traditional crafts, attended by a total of 305 children from Roma families.

The Republic of North Ossetia-Alania has a well-developed social infrastructure in settlements with a large Roma population: rural community

centers, pre-school educational institutions, secondary and general educational institutions, medical and obstetrical units.

In order to provide social support to the population, the Department of Social Protection for the Mozdok District makes the following payments to ethnic Roma upon submission of relevant documents: child allowances, childcare allowances for children under one and a half years of age.

The infrastructure necessary for life and development (roads, utilities, schools, kindergartens, clinics, and recreational clubs) has been established and is operating in areas with large Roma populations (the cities of Tambov and Michurinsk, Tambov and Michurinsk Districts of the region). The majority of Roma living in the region make full use of the existing infrastructure of municipalities.

Young Roma families found to be in need of better housing conditions participate in the subprogram "Affordable Housing for Youth" of the municipal program "Providing the Citizens of the Rasskazovsky District with Comfortable and Affordable Housing and Public Services" for 2014-2022.

The Muchkap District of Tambov Region has one Roma family with members-citizens of the Russian Federation. The guardianship and educational authorities are constantly working on the patronage of this family. Comfortable housing has been allocated, and the family has been with material and advisory assistance.

There are 239 Roma children enrolled in general educational institutions in Tyumen in 2020/2021. The work to ensure socio-cultural adaptation of Roma children is carried out as part of educational work to develop skills for conflict-free communication and a tolerant attitude toward others. There are classes aimed at promoting traditional Russian cultural values, interethnic and interfaith friendship; there is also training in how to resist extremist manifestations. Weeks of prevention and weeks of tolerance are held, in the framework of which issues

of legal literacy of minors and inter-ethnic harmony are addressed. For Roma pupils, individual and group counseling is provided in the study of the Russian language and Russian history, as well as individual and group remedial learning classes; consultative and educational work with parents (individual discussions, parent meetings) and their involvement in extracurricular activities together with children is carried out.

There are more than 30,000 Roma in the Stavropol Territory, with the largest Roma communities living in the Alexandrovsky, Kochubeyevsky, and Krasnogvardeysky municipal districts and the city districts of Blagodarnensky, Georgievsky, Izobilnensky, and Ipatovsky.

In the second half of 2020, the cultural and leisure institutions of the region continued to work with Roma children and youth.

In the Kochubey city district, 10 village cultural centers have clubs with members of the Roma population. These are vocal, choreographic, folk arts and crafts clubs, as well as sports grounds. Of the 346 club associations, 18 have 44 Roma members, including 16 children's club associations with Roma members – 37 children.

Roma of all ages are permanent library users in rural areas. More than 500 Roma are members and readers of the region's libraries.

The Procurator General of the Russian Federation has received no reports of violations of the right of Roma children to receive an education in accordance with federal education standards nor of discrimination against Roma children in the field of education or the establishment of separate classes or remedial classes for Roma children in general education establishments. There have been no established cases of the segregation of Roma children. In some rural schools, so-called Roma classes have been organized at the request of parents, taking into account the ethnic traditions and nomadic lifestyle of this ethnic group. For the

same reasons, in some educational institutions, distance learning and after-hours classes have been set up for these children.

Indigenous small-numbered peoples

123. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to strengthen their efforts and develop, in close consultation with representatives of the indigenous peoples, further alternatives to boarding schools that would adequately meet the educational needs of persons belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples.

Free general secondary education is guaranteed to everyone. In many regions, access to free higher education is subsidized, the students from indigenous families are supported in the form of a monthly scholarship, the costs of the first and second higher extramural education are reimbursed, graduate students are provided with material assistance.

The education is a crucial factor of social integration of the indigenous small-numbered peoples, as well as the preservation of the native language and ethnic identity. On the one hand, the conditions for raising the level of education of indigenous small-numbered peoples are created, on the other hand, their right to study and use their native language is provided.

According to the results of the monitoring of the state and level of development of the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation in the 2020/2021 school year, the implementation of educational programs in the languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation within the subject areas "Native Language and Literature-based Reading in the Native Language" and "Native Language and Native Literature" is carried out in the general education institutions of 12 constituent entities of the Russian Federation (the Zabaikalye Territory, the Irkutsk Region, the Kamchatka Territory, the Krasnoyarsk Territory, the Magadan Region, the Nenets Autonomous District, the Republic of Buryatia, the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia),

the Khabarovsk Territory, the Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District) in 17 native languages from among the languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples (Abazin, Veps, Dolgan, Itelmen, Koryak, Nanai, Nganasan, Nenets, Nivkhi, Selkup, Tofalar, Olcha, Khanty, Chukot, Evenki, Even, Yukaghir).

In the 2020/2021 school year, the total number of pupils learning their mother tongue from among the languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples in the subject areas "Native Language and Literature-based Reading in the Native Language" and "Native Language and Native Literature" in general education institutions of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation is 13,795 people.

In the 2020/2021 school year, the total number of teachers of native language from the languages of indigenous minorities working within the subject areas "Native Language and Literature-based Reading in the Native Language" and "Native Language and Native Literature" in general educational organizations of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation is 356 people.

In the next three years, eight constituent entities of the Russian Federation (the Zabaikalye Territory, the Kamchatka Territory, the Krasnoyarsk Territory, the Nenets Autonomous District, the Republic of Buryatia, the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), the Khabarovsk Territory, the Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District) will require to varying degrees training of new teaching staff in the subject areas of "Native Language and Literature-based Reading in the Native Language" and "Native Language and Native Literature" in 12 native languages from among the languages of indigenous minorities (Dolgan, Koryak, Nanai, Nganasan, Nenets, Selkup, Olcha, Khanty, Chukot, Evenki, Even and Yukaghir). The total number of native language teachers to be trained in the next three years is 58.

In secondary vocational education institutions, the training of teachers of native languages from among the languages of indigenous minorities (Abazin, Nanai, Nivkhi, Olcha, Evenki, Even) is carried out in the Karachayev-Cherkessian Republic and the Khabarovsk Territory).

In higher education institutions, the training of teachers of native languages of indigenous peoples (Abazin, Chukot, Evenki, Even and Yukaghir) is carried out in the Karachayevo-Cherkessian Republic, the Republic of Buryatia, and the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia).

The implementation of educational programs in native languages of indigenous minority languages as part of elective classes in the 2020/2021 school year is carried out in 21 constituent entities of the Russian Federation (Amur Region, Vologda Region, Zabaikalye Territory, Irkutsk Region, Kamchatka Territory, Karachayevo-Cherkessian Republic, Kemerovo Region – Kuzbass, Krasnoyarsk Territory, Magadan Region, Nenets Autonomous District, Primorsky Territory, Republic of Buryatia, Republic of Karelia, Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), Sakhalin Region, Sverdlovsk Region, Tyumen Region, Khabarovsk Territory, Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Area-Yugra, Chukotka Autonomous District, Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District) in 22 native languages (Abazin, Veps, Dolgan, Ket, Koryak, Mansi, Nganasan, Negidal, Nenets, Nivkhi, Teleut, Tofalar, Udehe, Ulta (Orok), Khanty, Chukot, Shor, Even, Evenki, Enets, Eskimo, Yukaghir).

The total number of students learning their native language from among the languages of indigenous peoples in the 2020/2021 school year as part of elective classes in general education institutions in constituent entities of the Russian Federation is 7,000.

The implementation of educational programs in native languages from among the languages of indigenous minorities in institutions of supplementary education for children in the 2020/2021 school year is carried out in six constituent entities of the Russian Federation (Kamchatka Territory, Kemerovo Region – Kuzbass, Leningrad Region, Magadan Region, Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Area-Yugra, Chukotka Autonomous District) in seven native languages (Veps, Koryak, Mansi, Koryak, Chukot, Even). The total number of

children learning their native language in additional education establishments for children is 653, and the total number of native language teachers in these organizations is 38.

The federal list of textbooks admitted for use in state-accredited educational programs of primary general, basic general, and secondary general education, approved by Order of the Ministry of Education of Russia No. 695 of 18 December 2019 includes four textbooks on the Abazin language, four on the Veps language, four on the Khanty language, and eight on the Nenets language.

At present, the Registry of Model Basic General Education Programs contains five model educational programs for the Abazin, Veps and Udehe languages.

According to the All-Russian Population Census conducted in 2010, 98 per cent of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation above 15 years of age are covered by the general education system, 40 per cent – by the professional education system, including 12 per cent of those who have higher education, 0.3 per cent – by post-graduate education system, and only 2 per cent of indigenous people do not have basic education.

Such high indexes were achieved by efforts to modernize the regional general education systems, development of new forms of education for nomadic peoples, socio-economic support of students and professional advancement of teachers working with indigenous small-numbered peoples.

Even in the most remote northern territories, educational institutions are re-equipped, vehicles for travel of students are purchased, funds of school libraries are replenished.

The boarding schools for children in which they spend most of the year, while their parents migrate were created in the Soviet period for people living in the harsh climatic conditions and those who lead a nomadic lifestyle. This

approach has proved its effectiveness as a tool to improve the general level of education of citizens.

The boarding schools were gradually transformed into institutions of family type, in which not only general subjects are studied but also the classes on traditional creativity, decorative and applied arts, natural resource management are given in order to strengthen the ties of indigenous children with the traditional culture. This approach, to a greater extent, allows preserving indigenous culture, gives children the opportunity to return to parents after training and engage in traditional activities, but with basic school knowledge. Therefore, such project as a mobile-nomadic school is implemented in Russia. These schools play a key role in introducing children to their native language and culture, in preserving of the environment of language functioning. Such schools are opened on Yamal, on Taimyr, in Evenkia, in the Nenets Autonomous Area, on Chukotka, in Yakutia.

In 2019, a regional project entitled "IT Nomad Camp" was launched in Yugra. The District became the first territory in Russia to provide broadband Internet access to nomadic residents engaged in traditional trades.

About 1,090 indigenous children live in the Surgut District of Yugra, 773 of them are of school age and 313 are preschoolers. 145 attend kindergartens, and 168 attend "home-based" kindergartens. There are 112 children under the age of seven being brought up at nomad camps.

In 2020, Yugra opened its first camp kindergarten. Preschool education in the region has become more accessible to indigenous children who live on tribal lands.

To provide targeted training for persons belonging to indigenous peoples of the Russian Federation, higher education institutions offer courses within education and training programs, which are part of larger groups, such as "Education and Pedagogical Sciences", "Linguistics and Literature Studies", "Culture Studies and Sociocultural Projects", as well as opportunities for further

employment of these persons in educational institutions and other social organizations operating in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

FSBI HE "Petrozavodsk State University" in the Republic of Karelia has a Department of Baltic-Finnish Philology of the Institute of Philology, which provides training in the field of "Finnish Language and Literature, Veps Language". The number of state-funded places for this specialty is four, including employer-sponsored education. In addition, the Department enrolls students to study on a fee-paying basis.

In the 2019/2020 academic year, the number of students studying at the Department in the specialty "Finnish Language and Literature, Veps Language" is:

Year 1: 7 people (2 – state-funded, 3 – fee-paying basis, 1 – employer-sponsored, 1 – quota (children without parental care));

Year 2: 4 people (3 – state-funded, 1 – fee-paying basis);

Year 3: 3 people (2 – state-funded, 1 – employer-sponsored);

Year 4: 2 people (state-funded).

Since September 2014, by a decision of the Academic Council of the Petrozavodsk State University, students studying Karelian and Veps have been paid a supplementary scholarship of RUB 3,000 in addition to the basic scholarship provided that they have good academic performance.

In the Republic of Komi, the interregional public movement of Komi-Izhemi "Izvatas" has established cooperation with FSFEI HPE "the Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I. Herzen" on the training of highly qualified pedagogical staff in Izhemsky District.

At present, 11 Komi-Izhemi receive pedagogical education at this university, including on the following fields: "Technology in Education" – 2, "Philological Education" – 2, "Cultural Education" – 1, "Education in the Field of Native Language and Literature" – 1.

In the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), the priority areas of training are education and pedagogical sciences. At present, 62 indigenous students attend universities in Russia and the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia) on the basis of employer-sponsored training agreements. Of them: Dolgans – 4 people (Yakutsk – 3, Moscow – 1), Chukchi – 1 (Yakutsk – 1), Evenki – 41: (Yakutsk – 30, Vladivostok – 1, Yekaterinburg – 2, Moscow – 3, St. Petersburg – 2, Khabarovsk – 3), Even – 14 (Yakutsk – 10, Khabarovsk – 1, Novosibirsk – 1, Yekaterinburg – 1, Ulyanovsk – 1), Yukaghir – 2 (Yakutsk – 1, Yekaterinburg – 1).

In the Republic of Tuva, the breakdown by fields of education of students in higher education institutions shows that the largest number of students are studying in the areas: "Education and Pedagogical Sciences" – 30, "Education and Pedagogical Sciences" and "Art and Culture" – 2 persons in each area.

In the Republic of Khakassia, systematic vocational guidance work is carried out among school graduates from indigenous minorities (Shors) in order to encourage them to become professionals in teaching and subsequently be enrolled in colleges and higher educational institutions, including the Shor division of the Novokuznetsk Institute (Branch) of the FSBEI HPE "Kemerovo State University".

In the places of native habitat and traditional economic activities of indigenous minorities in Askizsky and Tashtypsky districts of the Republic of Khakassia, the most demanded specialty is "Teacher of the Shor Language and Literature".

In the Zabaikalye Territory, one student (Evenk) receives a full-time tuition on a state-funded basis at the Aginsky Pedagogical College named after Bazar Rinchino in the study program 44.02.02 "Teaching in Elementary Classes".

In the Kamchatka Region, according to the annual monitoring conducted by the Ministry of Education on targeted training in pedagogical areas, 20 people

have been studying in educational institutions of higher education since 2017 in the framework of targeted training. Training of pedagogical staff within the employer-sponsored education is carried out both in the Kamchatka Region in FSBEI HPE "Kamchatka State University named after Vitus Bering", and outside the Region (Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen, Pacific National University, National State University of Physical Education Sport and Health named after P.F.Lesgaft).

Local self-government bodies act as requestors of employer-sponsored training in teaching and provide social support in the form of payment of travel to the place of education and employment or scholarship.

According to available information, three indigenous students receive employer-sponsored training in teaching at FSBEI HPE "Kamchatka State University named after Vitus Bering", Pacific National University, Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen.

In the 2019/2020 academic year, the following professions (specialties) of secondary vocational education were available for admission without preliminary examinations: "Extra-curricular Teaching (social and educational work)".

In the Amur Region, one citizen from among indigenous peoples receives higher education within employer-sponsored education agreement at the Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen.

In the Kemerovo Region, teacher education with two training programs "Native language and Literature, Russian language" (FSBEI HPE "Novokusnetsk Branch-Institute of Kemerovo State University") and law (FSBEI HPE "Kemerovo State University") are available for students.

In the Murmansk region, the employer-sponsored education in teaching at the university level is provided by the State Federal-Funded Educational Institution of Higher Professional Training "Murmansk Arctic State University".

In 2018 and 2019, no applications for targeted training were received from representatives of indigenous minorities.

In addition, representatives of indigenous minorities may exercise the right to target degree-level education in the State Federal-Funded Educational Institution of Higher Education "Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen"; the quota in 2019 was 3 places.

On the basis of agreements concluded by the municipal budgetary general educational institution "Lovozero Secondary General Education School" on the employer-sponsored degree-level education at the Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen, two people have been admitted to the Institute on a full-time basis, and one of them is a member of the indigenous minorities (Alexander A.Yakovlev). The University has the following programs: a field of education "Teacher Education", specialization "Native Language and Literature Education" and specialization "Philological Education".

In the Khanty-Mansijsk Autonomous District – Yugra, employer-sponsored education is available to representatives of indigenous minorities in the priority areas related to traditional economic activities and native languages of indigenous minorities.

The Federal State-Funded Educational Institution of Higher Education "St. Petersburg State Agrarian University" annually enrolls students in the following fields of study: "Teacher Education", "Education in Native Language and Literature", "Cultural Education".

Every year students are enrolled to receive a degree in the field of "Teacher Education", which has the following programs: "Philological Education", "Education in the field of native language and literature", "Cultural Education". Six persons from indigenous minorities were enrolled in educational institutions of higher education in 2016, 12 persons in 2017, seven persons in 2018, and one person in 2019 (State Federal-Funded Educational Institution of Higher

ACFC/SRV(2021)002

Education "Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen", "Khanty-Mansiysk Technological and Pedagogical College", "Surgut State Pedagogical University").

According to the list of specialties of higher education (specialist's degree), there are ten programs of higher education to prepare highly qualified personnel in scientific and pedagogical fields: teacher training – six persons, psychological and pedagogical education – two persons and philology – two persons.

In the Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District, in order to provide education to indigenous students who lead traditional lifestyles together with their parents (legal representatives), since 2017 a project for the employer-sponsored training of teachers in the field of "Primary Education" and "Education in the field of native language and literature" is implemented in the Autonomous District as an extramural form of study at the State Federal-Funded Educational Institution of Higher Education "Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen".

The Nenets Autonomous District has "Teacher Education (with two education programs)". Employer-sponsored training is carried out at the expense of budgetary allocations from the federal budget in the following educational institutions: Russian State Social University, Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I.Herzen.

In the Chukotka Autonomous Area, the Chukotka Multidisciplinary College provides training in "Teaching in Primary Grades (Native Language and Literature)", "Teaching in Primary Grades (with additional training in "Native Language")", "Vocational Training (Arts and Crafts, Choreography)" in order to replenish the teaching staff of the native language, lower their average age and train the staff from among indigenous minorities.

In the Leningrad Region, Veps language courses are offered in places of Veps native habitat on the territory of the Leningrad Region: Podporozhsky

Municipal District, Boksitogorsky Municipal District, Lodeynopolsky Municipal District, Tikhvinsky Municipal District.

Article 14 of the Framework Convention

Pursuant to Article 68 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, the Russian language shall be the State language on the entire territory of the Russian Federation.

In accordance with Article 14 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29 December 2012 *On Education in the Russian Federation*, education in the state language of the Russian Federation, as well as the choice of language for training and education within the possibilities offered by the education system shall be guaranteed in the Russian Federation.

The teaching and learning of the state languages of the republics may be introduced in state and municipal educational institutions in accordance with the legislation of the republics, which must not be at the expense of the teaching and learning of the state language.

Citizens have the right to acquire pre-school, primary general and basic general education in their native language among the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, as well as the right to study their native language within the possibilities offered by the education system.

The teaching and study of the State language, official languages of the republics of the Russian Federation, and a native language among the languages of the peoples of Russia are carried out in accordance with federal state educational standards and educational standards.

The language, the languages of education are determined by local laws and regulations of the educational institution.

Under Article 30, Part 3 of Law No. 273-FZ, when adopting local laws and regulations affecting the rights of students in an educational organization, the

opinion of the councils of students, parent councils, representative bodies of students should be taken into account.

The State assists in the organization of various forms of education on the languages of the peoples of Russia, including remote ones, for people living outside their national-state and national-territorial subdivisions, as well as citizens who do not have any, representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples and ethnic groups.

In view of the above, citizens, including those belonging to national minorities, are granted the right to study their native languages.

Article 15 of the Framework Convention

Participation of persons belonging to national minorities in cultural, social and economic life

143. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to ensure that existing consultative bodies at federal, regional and local levels are equipped with legally guaranteed consultation rights in all relevant areas. Their composition should genuinely represent a wide range of views amongst persons belonging to national minorities.

In order to effectively and efficiently address issues in the sphere of State nationalities policy and to promote constructive dialogue between state authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and public and religious associations, consultative (advisory) bodies have been established in all constituent entities of the Russian Federation to implement the State nationalities policy.

As a rule, they are established in the form of councils on inter-ethnic and inter-religious issues.

Epy analysis of the practical activities of such bodies has revealed that in 36 out of 77 constituent entities of the Russian Federation, councils are

established under supreme officials or their deputies supervising issues of national policy; in other regions councils operate under bodies of executive power.

The most effective platforms for dialogue between the authorities and society are the councils in the Vladimir, Chelyabinsk, Omsk, and Kemerovo Regions, the Republic of Tatarstan, the city of Sevastopol, and the Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District. The public authorities of these constituent entities of the Russian Federation responsible for implementing the Strategy develop a regional model of relations with the public and religious communities, adhering to scientific criteria of the systemic approach and taking into account the fundamental principles of historicity, arms' length relationships, secularism, and dialogism.

For example, the Council for Inter-Ethnic and Inter-Religious Relations under the Governor of the Vladimir Region has been operating in the Vladimir Region since 20 April 2015.

The Council is composed of leaders of religious and national organizations, representatives of the scientific and expert community. The religious community includes representatives of the Russian Orthodox Church, the Armenian Apostolic Church, the Roman Catholic Church, and the Muslim Spiritual Board of the region. The participation of representatives of territorial bodies, federal executive bodies, bodies and structural subdivisions of the Vladimir Region Administration involved in the implementation of State nationalities policy in the region contributes to the strengthening of the interdepartmental nature of the Council.

The Council has two regional commissions: an inter-ethnic commission and an inter-religious commission, which discuss projects and activities in the field of ethnic and confessional relations, including media projects at their meetings.

The Council of the President of the Republic of Tatarstan on Inter-Ethnic and Inter-Confessional Relations (hereinafter referred to as the Council of the President of the Republic of Tatarstan) was established in 2013. The Council includes representatives of national-cultural and religious organizations, the Civic Chamber of the Republic of Tatarstan and the Russian Federation, the scientific community, the Commissioner for Human Rights in the Republic of Tatarstan, and the heads of state and local governments.

The meetings are held via videoconference involving all municipalities with the participation of deputy heads of municipalities responsible for the ethno-confessional sphere, heads of departments of education, culture, youth and sports, media and public relations departments, members of public councils, leaders of public ethnic-cultural and religious organizations, heads of friendship centers, branches (representative offices) of the Assembly of Tatarstan Nations, heads of cultural institutions and local mass media.

At Council's meetings, topical issues related to the implementation of the State nationalities policy, prevention of extremism and conflict situations in ethnic and religious environment, development of national and polylingual education in the Republic of Tatarstan are considered.

In the Republic of Mordovia, the Council under the Head of the Republic of Mordovia on Ethnic Relations and the Public Council for the development of Orthodox Culture under the Head of the Republic of Mordovia are performing their functions.

Thus, it should be noted that the public authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation have done a considerable amount of work on the improvement of public administration in the sphere of inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations through the establishment of constructive engagement with civil society institutions and involving them in the decision of the State nationalities policy tasks.

Participation in socio-economic life

146. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to ensure effective participation of persons belonging to national minorities, including indigenous peoples, in socio-economic life, by promoting the sustainable economic development of the territories in which they live.

Information on paragraph 146 of the Recommendations is set forth in Part I, Sections 1 and 3 of the Report.

Articles 17 and 18 of the Framework Convention

Cross-border co-operation and bilateral relations

151. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities not to interfere with the right of persons belonging to national minorities to establish and maintain free and peaceful contacts across borders, including through the application of the legislation on "foreign agents". The authorities should ensure that inter-state relations do not negatively affect the enjoyment of minority rights.

The Russian side is setting up working groups on cross-border cooperation with various countries to address issues of ethnic and cultural development of peoples living in border areas. The Russian Federation has concluded a large number of bilateral agreements¹⁰ containing provisions for the protection of national minorities and promotion of cross-border cooperation in the fields of education and culture.

In addition, at the end of 2020, Rosmolodezh, Rossotrudnichestvo and the FAEA of Russia signed a tripartite "Road Map" for communicating to foreign masses the positive experience of Russia in preserving ethnic and cultural identity, the values of inter-ethnic peace and inter-religious harmony, as well as

¹⁰ List of concluded bilateral treaties on the website of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Russia: https://www.mid.ru/ru/foreign_policy/international_contracts/2_contract

for positioning Russia as a multi-ethnic and multi-confessional state in the context of achieving the goals of the State nationalities policy of the Russian Federation until 2025.

The document contains the procedure for organizing and carrying out international projects with the participation of young people and provides for the use of mechanisms for international cooperation in the implementation of the State nationalities policy of Russia.

Within the Road Map, special attention is paid to sharing experiences with foreign partners in preserving and developing the national and cultural features of indigenous and small-numbered peoples living in the Arctic, Caspian, and Asia-Pacific regions. The agencies that signed the Road Map will assist Russian NGOs, including of indigenous and small-numbered peoples, in implementing initiatives in the sphere of ethnic and cultural development of the peoples of Russia.