



Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe Evaluation Cycle 2017-2018

The European Cemeteries Route

SAMARA Evangelia-Antonia, PhD
ea_samara@yahoo.com,
004915227271291

Cultural route
of the Council of Europe
Itinéraire culturel
du Conseil de l'Europe



The opinions expressed in this independent expert report are those of the author, and do not engage the Council of Europe's Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes nor the European Institute of Cultural Routes.

1. Executive Summary

The European Cemeteries Route, founded by the Association of Significant Cemeteries of Europe (ASCE), is a certified member of the Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe since 2010. The Route's Headquarter is situated in Bologna, Italy.

The methodology used for the regular evaluation of the Route included the study of Route's publications, internet research (official ASCE and European Cemeteries Route websites, The Symbols Project website, Facebook posts, YouTube uploads, #europeancemeteriesroute on Instagram, the official sites of all members of the Network, touristic sites such as Tripadvisor etc), constant communication with the management of the Route (for further questions and information) and Field visit to three members of the Network (Athens First Cemetery, Rennes North Cemetery, Rennes Eastern Cemetery).

The Route's operation complies with all criteria for themes, fields of action and networks. The goals and objectives of the network, such as the promotion of the funerary heritage, the raise of the public awareness on the cemeteries as European cultural heritage, the promotion of research on cemeteries and education through cultural exchanges, the promotion of cultural tourism and collaboration among different European Countries are well elaborated and achieved through many Route's activities.

However, the visibility of the Network on the internet could be improved. For this reason, the use of the European Cemeteries Route logo is recommended for all Network members. Furthermore, a stronger presence in the social media (Facebook, Instagram) is advised to raise awareness of the Route and improve its visibility. Additionally, the use of a sign informing visitors about the existence of the ARtour application could be useful not only to the visitors, but also to raise public interest on the European Cemeteries Route.

Summary of the conclusions

The theme still complies with the eligibility criteria for themes, CM/Res(2013)67, I. List of eligibility criteria for themes.

The Cultural Route still complies with the criteria listed in CM/Res(2013)67, II. List of priority fields of action, CM/Res(2013)67.

The Cultural Route still complies with the criteria for networks, as in CM/Res (2013)67, III. List of criteria for networks.

2. Introduction

The European Cemeteries Route, founded by the Association of Significant Cemeteries of Europe (ASCE) is a certified member of the Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe since 2010. The Headquarter of the Route is in Bologna, Italy. In May 2011 the Route was awarded with the special Jury of World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO) Ulysses Award. The network involves 21 European countries, and 78 cemeteries in 63 cities.

The goals and objectives of the network, according to the European Cemeteries Route website are: the promotion of the significant funerary heritage for its artistic and historic value, the public and private awareness to an irreplaceable and highly important heritage for the European cultural movement and the promotion of cultural tourism through the establishment of collaboration among European countries and regions.

Moreover, the Route encourages the restoration of funerary landscape and provides an itinerary that not only offers a route to visit but a tool for knowledge and continued research. The Route wishes to be the starting point for other initiatives of study, promotion, training and awareness-raising activities. Among the objectives of the Route is the promotion of education in schools by incorporating the Route to the schools' ordinary cultural visits in a dynamic and pedagogic manner.

There are numerous events taking place every May (since 2013) during the 'Week of Discovering European Cemeteries (WDEC). These events (guided tours, concerts, video and photography exhibitions, youth forums etc) 'celebrate the cemeteries, their culture, history and funerary heritage' (see Attachment 3).

Moreover, multidisciplinary experts attend every year the Annual General Meetings of ASCE to present and discuss their work on cemeteries. The last three Annual General Meetings took place in Barcelona (2015), Dublin (2016) and Athens (2017).

In the last three years the network carried out new projects to achieve its objectives and to raise public's interest. The development of the ARtour platform, is an ambitious project held by the Route. The smartphone application allows visitors to explore not only the Route's cemeteries but also other touristic attractions in many European cities. Furthermore, the network developed 'The Symbols Project' as an effort to raise public and youth awareness over cemeteries. Through the Symbols Project's platform many funeral symbols from different European countries are explained (e.g. crosses, angels, plants etc.) and compared with other symbols in other cemeteries of the network, showing the differences and similarities between several countries members of the European Cemeteries Route. The Symbols Project fosters youth exchanges, through pedagogical and artistic activities.

3. Main Body Evaluation

3.1 Cultural Route Theme

The theme of the Route is representative of the European memory, history and heritage. The Route as a cultural tourism destination helps visitors to discover the common European cultural heritage and history (such as both World Wars, migration, the legacy of great European thinkers, artists, politicians, funeral traditions, art etc.), it reminds of the European values (the coexistence of different cultures, the evolution of human rights, the struggle for freedom and democracy) and demonstrates not only the diversity but also the mutual understanding between Europeans.

Furthermore, the Route offers a solid basis for youth cultural and educational exchanges (e.g. The Symbols Project), provides innovative activities and develops cultural tourism products (e.g. ARtour application).

The Theme of the Route has been intensively researched by multidisciplinary experts from different regions of Europe (see list of bibliography provided by the Route) and academic work was presented in ASCE Annual General Meetings (9/2015 Bucharest, 10/2016 Dublin, 10/2017 Athens).

3.2 Fields of Action

3.2.1 Co-operation in research and development;

The European Cemeteries Route offers a platform for co-operation in research and development of European cultural values via the annual conferences (Annual General Meetings) which attract multidisciplinary European scholars interested on cemeteries. It has a multidisciplinary scientific committee which works on its theme at the European level and which carries out research and analysis of the issues relevant on its theme on theoretical and practical level. The Route involves a network of universities working on its theme.

Furthermore, the official website of ASCE provides to everyone interested, the opportunity to contribute to the bibliography, enabling therefore dispersed knowledge to be brought together.

Through this cooperation in research and development, the European Cemeteries Route succeeds in the promotion of the European values and illustrates the development of these values and the variety of forms they may take in Europe.

3.2.2 Enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage;

The Route activities (guided tours, thematic tours, The Symbols Project platform) consider and explain the historical significance of tangible and intangible European heritage. Consequently, they identify, preserve and develop European heritage.

The Route actively and successfully contributes to a better understanding of the concept of cultural heritage, the importance of its preservation and sustainable development, highlighting its similarities in different European regions.

3.2.3 Cultural and educational exchanges of young Europeans;

The European Cemeteries Route's activities are focused on young Europeans and encourage exchanges between young people from different social backgrounds and regions of Europe, aiming to a better understanding of the concept of European citizenship.

Through several activities held in network's cemeteries during the year, through special activities taking place during the 'Week of Discovering European Cemeteries' and through The Symbol Projects activities, the Route offers collaborative opportunities for educational institutions at various levels and emphasizes the value of personal experience.

The ARtour application, addressing mainly to young people and visitors familiar with new technologies, facilitates this personalised experience by providing an innovative way of sightseeing.

3.2.4 Contemporary cultural and artistic practice;

The Route's many cultural activities promote intercultural dialogue and multidisciplinary exchange between various artistic expressions in European countries. In March 2016, 39 European artists participated in an exhibition in Genoa (Italy) based on the interpretations of symbols in the cemeteries. The exhibition explored the links between heritage and contemporary culture through various cultural and artistic expressions (printmakers, dance, music, performance). Other exhibitions took place in Limerick (Ireland), Maribor (Slovenia), Dundee & Angus College (UK) and Avilés (Spain).

The artistic activities of the European Cemeteries Route explore innovative and creative practices and encourage the collaboration between amateurs and professionals (e.g. workshops with professional artists).

3.2.5 Cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development.

One of the Route's main goal is the promotion of the European cultural diversity and cultural heritage by fostering cultural activities relevant to sustainable cultural tourism development.

For that reason, the Network uses print (posters, flyers), broadcast (YouTube) and social media (Facebook), develops and offers quality cultural tourism products (the ARtour application provides dynamic maps, smart notifications etc.), provides services or activities transnationally (guided tours, museum activities) and builds partnerships with public and private organizations active in the field of tourism (such as universities, municipalities, trusts, institutes).

In order to raise the number of visitors in the network's cemeteries, the Route management developed the ARtour application which helps to attract more visitors and can have an economic impact on the territories crossed. The application allows the visitor not only to discover more about cemeteries, but at the same time provides information about the city,

sightseeing, information about Gluten free restaurants etc. supporting this way, the local economy of the network's members.

3.3 Cultural Route Network

The Route represents an extensive network involving twenty-one (21) Council of Europe's member states. The network is a project of the Association of Significant Cemeteries of Europe (ASCE) and operates democratically, through a governing board, a steering committee and a secretariat. It clearly specifies its objectives and working methods, the regions concerned by the project, its partners and participating countries, the fields of action involved, the overall strategy of the network in the short and long term.

The Route is financed by a special fee for ASCE members who wish to join the Route. Only the fees of Route members can be used for the Route management and development.

3.4 Communication tools

The title of 'Cultural Route of the Council of Europe' is present on all communication materials (including press releases, webpages, publications etc).

The Route has its own dedicated website, which is translated both into English and French. Information in other languages is available for several members of the network. The network publishes brochures in English (the official language of the Association) although there are flyers available in Slovenian. The management intends to update the European Cemeteries Route brochure and publish it in 2019. It will be an in open format, so the members could make a translation into their own language.

The logos (Cultural Route-Council of Europe) are provided for all the members of the Route and they are used in accordance to the guidelines for its use (size and position). The logos are present in all communication materials of the Route (website, Facebook).

However, not all members of the network use the logos on their communications tools (website).

Although there is a signposting system indicating the Route (see Attachment 4: Insignia) the CEMR's logo doesn't appear yet in the entrances of all cemeteries (see Field visit programme).

Even though the Network uses the social media (Facebook), its presence is not very active (e.g. the last post on Facebook: June 2017). The Facebook account of ASCE is very active, but the Facebook account entitled 'European Cemeteries Route' has a weak presence.

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

The European Cemeteries Route complies with all the criteria of CM/Res (2013) 67, (List of eligibility criteria for themes, list of priority fields of action and list of criteria for networks).

The Theme of the Route remains representative of a common cultural, historical European heritage and it offers a solid basis for cultural, educational and scientific exchanges.

The network is very active in research and development (Annual General Meetings, The Symbols Project, ARtour), its activities are orientated in the enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage. The Route offers many educational activities (such as guided tours for schools), exchanges between young Europeans (The Symbol Project) and fosters cultural and artistic activities (theatre, concerts, exhibitions, performances).

The European Cemeteries Route is very committed to its goals and objectives, the management is very active and has a solid strategy for development. However, there are few issues concerning the visibility of the network that could be improved. It is therefore recommended:

1. That all the cemeteries of the network use the logo of the Route on their websites to raise awareness of the Route.
2. That the Route has a stronger presence in the social media to attract more visitors. It would be useful to upload more posts *specifically* to the European Cemeteries Route account (there is regular posting on ASCE's Facebook account) with e.g. biographical information on famous people buried in the network cemeteries, scientific information (historical, ethnological etc.) on funeral art in different countries of the network, quizzes or contests.

A strong presence in Instagram is recommended because Instagram is nowadays very popular among young travellers. The use of Instagram could be a good way to raise publicity and awareness about the Route between travellers and promote its goals.

3. That members of the network place the 'European Cemeteries Route-Council of Europe' road sign/ board at the entrances of all cemeteries to increase visibility and to inform about the existence of the Route.
4. That there is a discrete sign in all cemeteries informing visitors of the existence of ARtour application. The use of the application could introduce random cemetery visitors to the European Cemeteries Route, its goals and its activities.

5. List of references

ARtour. Learn by moving. Available at: <https://ar-tour.com/mobile-guide.aspx>

ASCE official website: <http://www.significantcemeteries.org/>

ASCE on facebook: <https://www.facebook.com/significantcemeteries/>

Attachment 3: Projects, ASCE_ European Cemeteries Route Dossier submitted to the European Institute of Cultural Routes for the regular Evaluation.

Attachment 4: Insignia, ASCE_ European Cemeteries Route Dossier submitted to the European Institute of Cultural Routes for the regular Evaluation.

Attachment 6: Publications, ASCE_ European Cemeteries Route Dossier submitted to the European Institute of Cultural Routes for the regular Evaluation.

European Cemeteries Route brochure. Available at: <https://cemeteriesroute.eu/brochure.aspx>

European Cemeteries Route flyer in English. Available at: <https://cemeteriesroute.eu/about-cemeteries-route/marketing-materials/flyer-about-route.aspx>

European Cemeteries Route flyer in Slovenian. Available at: <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1n6jdy2FBVYyT33bKSQ6CtGRmF6jEjma/view>

European Cemeteries Route official website: <https://cemeteriesroute.eu/about-cemeteries-route.aspx>

European Cemeteries Route on Facebook: <https://www.facebook.com/CemeteriesRoute/>

The Symbols Project official website: <https://symbolsproject.eu/explore.aspx>

6. Field visit programme

28.11.2017

Visit to Athens First Cemetery (Greece). Meeting with Mr. Pouloudis, Head of the Department of Cultural Heritage in Municipality of Athens. The sign 'Cultural Route of the Council of Europe' was in front of the main entrance. The Athens First Cemetery has no website yet, according to Mr. Pouloudis the website is under construction and will be activated this year (2018). The Cemetery intends to join ARtour this year as well. Guided tours are organized by the municipality and other organizations (Friends of the Archaeological Museum, Friends of Benaki Museum, private walking tours in English booked on TripAdvisor). Students of the National Technical University of Athens, Athens University of Applied Sciences, Athens School of Fine Arts) work in a regular basis at the Cemetery.

Remarks: The lack of funds is evident, especially in the domain of publicity. There is no extra publicity to raise awareness about the Cemetery to attract tourists, although the guided tours in Greek are regularly announced in the Website of Athens Municipality.

5.12.2017

- Harokopio University, Kallithea Athens. Meeting with Professor Ms Georgitsogianni. The Harokopio University hosted the last Annual General Meeting of ASCE (5-7 October 2017). Ms Georgitsogianni informed me in detail about university's scientific work on Athens First Cemetery and other important cemeteries in Greece.

-Visit to Kifisia Cemetery (recent member of ASCE, not yet a European Cemeteries Route member). Meeting with Ms Politi, President of the Local Council of Kifissia.

19.01.2018

-Visit to Northern Cemetery, Rennes (France). The official sign 'Cultural Route of the Council of Europe' was missing, but the logo of the Route was attached in the information office. Mrs. Bidan, the contact person, informed me that the sign was took away due to restoration works and it would be back in place within a week.

- Visit to Eastern Cemetery Rennes. The official sign was missing, there was only the ASCE sign on the wall. The logo of the Route was nevertheless attached to the door of the information office. Mrs. Bidan informed me that they are waiting of a fund approval and they are expecting the sign to be in place on March-April 2018.

-Rennes Tourist Office. There are plenty of activities involving both cemeteries, especially during the Week of discovering and All Saints: concerts, guided tours for schools and they are planning a lot of activities in November 2018 for the celebrations of the anniversary of the end of the First World War.

21.01.2018

Visit to Père-Lachaise, Paris (France). The visit was spontaneous and there was no prior communication with ASCE. There was no sign of the Route in the entrance. After communication with Mr. Faudot (contact person in the list of European Cemeteries Route Partners) I was informed that the Père-Lachaise is no longer member of the Route. Nevertheless, the visit was an opportunity to test the ARtour application.

7. Checklist

| | | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|------------|-----------|-------------|
| | | | | |
| | COE CULTURAL ROUTES EVALUATION CHECK-LIST | | | |
| 3.1 THEME | Does the theme of the Route | Yes | No | Note |
| | - represent a common value - historical, cultural, or heritage -to several European countries? | 1 | | |
| | - offer a solid basis for | | | |
| | youth cultural and educational exchanges? | 1 | | |
| | Innovative activities? | 1 | | |
| | Cultural tourism products development? | 1 | | |
| | Has the theme been researched/developed by academics/experts from different regions of Europe? | 1 | | |
| | | | | |
| 3.2 FIELDS OF ACTION | 3.2.1 Co-operation in research and development | | | |
| | Does the Route | | | |
| | - offer a platform for co-operation in research and development of European cultural themes/values? | 1 | | |
| | - play a unifying role around major European themes, enabling dispersed knowledge to be brought together? | 1 | | |
| | - show how these themes are representative of European values shared by several European countries? | 1 | | |
| | - illustrate the development of these values and the variety of forms they may take in Europe? | 1 | | |
| | - have a network of universities and research center working on its theme at the European level? | 1 | | |
| | - have a multidisciplinary scientific committee? | 1 | | |
| | Does the scientific Committee | | | |
| | work on its theme at the European level? | 1 | | |
| | carry out research and analysis of the issues relevant to its theme and/or activities on: | 1 | | |
| | - theoretical level? | 1 | | |
| | - practical level? | 1 | | |

| | | | |
|--|---|----------|--|
| | | | |
| | 3.2.2 Enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage | | |
| | Do the Route activities (according with the theme) | | |
| | - take into account and explain the historical significance of tangible and intangible European heritage? | 1 | |
| | - promote the CoE values ? | 1 | |
| | - promote the CoE CRs brand? | 1 | |
| | - work in conformity with international charters and conventions on cultural heritage preservation? | 1 | |
| | - identify, preserve, and develop European heritage sites in rural destinations? | 1 | |
| | - identify, preserve, and develop European heritage sites in industrial areas in the process of economic restructuring? | 1 | |
| | - valorize the heritage of ethnic or social minorities in Europe? | 1 | |
| | - contribute to a better understanding of the concept of cultural heritage, the importance of its preservation and sustainable development? | 1 | |
| | - enhance physical and intangible heritage, explain its historical significance and highlight its similarities in the different regions of Europe? | 1 | |
| | - take account of and promote the charters, conventions, recommendations and work of the Council of Europe, UNESCO and ICOMOS relating to heritage restoration, protection and enhancement, landscape and spatial planning (European Cultural Convention, Faro convention, European Landscape Convention, World Heritage Convention, ...)? | 1 | |
| | | | |
| | 3.2.3 Cultural and educational exchanges of young Europeans | | |
| | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to | | |
| | - develop a better understanding of the concept of European citizenship? | 1 | |
| | - emphasize the value of new personal experience through visiting diverse places? | 1 | |
| | - encourage social integration and exchanges of young people from different social | 1 | |

| | | | | |
|-----------------------------|--|----------|--|--|
| | backgrounds and regions of Europe? | | | |
| | - offer collaborative opportunities for educational institutions at various levels? | 1 | | |
| | - place the emphasis on personal and real experiences through the use of places and contacts? | 1 | | |
| | - set up pilot schemes with several participating countries? | 1 | | |
| | - give rise to co-operation activities which involve educational institutions at various levels? | 1 | | |
| | | | | |
| | 3.2.4 Contemporary cultural and artistic practice | | | |
| | Do the Route's cultural activities (contemporary cultural and artistic practice related) | | | |
| | - promote intercultural dialogue and multidisciplinary exchange between various artistic expressions in European countries? | 1 | | |
| | - encourage artistic projects that establish the links between cultural heritage and contemporary culture? | 1 | | |
| | - encourage innovative cultural and contemporary art practices* connecting them with the history of skills development? | 1 | | |
| | - encourage collaboration between culture amateurs and professionals via relevant activities and networks creation? ** | 1 | | |
| | -encourage debate and exchange - in a multidisciplinary and intercultural perspective - between various cultural and artistic expressions in different countries of Europe? | 1 | | |
| | - encourage activities and artistic projects which explore the links between heritage and contemporary culture? | 1 | | |
| | - highlight the most innovative and creative practices? | 1 | | |
| | - link these innovative and creative practices with the history of skills development? *** | 1 | | |
| | | | | |
| 3.2 FIELDS OF ACTION | | | | |
| | 3.2.5 Cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development | | | |
| | Do the Route's activities (relevant to sustainable cultural tourism development) | | | |
| | - assist in local, regional, national and/ or | 1 | | |

| | | | | |
|--------------------|--|----------|--|--|
| | European identity formation? | | | |
| | - actively involve 3 major means to raise awareness of their cultural projects: print, broadcast and social media? | 1 | | |
| | - promote dialogue between | | | |
| | urban and rural communities and cultures? | 1 | | |
| | developed and disadvantaged regions? | 1 | | |
| | different parts (south, north, east, west) of Europe? | 1 | | |
| | majority and minority (or native and immigrant) cultures? | 1 | | |
| | - open possibilities for co-operation between Europe and other continents? | 1 | | |
| | - draw decision makers' attention to the necessity of protecting heritage as part of sustainable development of the territory? | 1 | | |
| | - aim to diversify of cultural product, service and activities offers? | 1 | | |
| | - develop and offer quality cultural tourism products, services or activities transnationally? | 1 | | |
| | - develop partnerships with public and private organizations active in the field of tourism? | 1 | | |
| | Did the network prepare and use tools all along the route to raise the number of visitors and the economic impacts of the route on the territories crossed? | 1 | | |
| | | | | |
| 3.3 NETWORK | Does the Route represent a network involving at least three Council of Europe's member states? | 1 | | |
| | Was the theme of the network chosen and accepted by its members? | 1 | | |
| | Was the conceptual framework for this network founded on a scientific basis? | 1 | | |
| | Does the network involve several Council of Europe member states in all or part of its project(s)? | 1 | | |
| | Is the network financially sustainable? | 1 | | |
| | Does the network have a legal status (association, federation of associations, EEIG,)? | 1 | | |
| | Does the network operate democratically? | 1 | | |
| | | | | |

| | | | | |
|--------------------------------|---|----------|----------|---|
| | Does the network | | | |
| | - specify | | | |
| | its objectives and working methods? | 1 | | |
| | the regions concerned by the project? | 1 | | |
| | its partners and participating countries? | 1 | | |
| | the fields of action involved? | 1 | | |
| | the overall strategy of the network in the short- and long term? | 1 | | |
| | - identify potential participants and partners in CoE member states and/or other world countries? | 1 | | |
| | - provide details of its financing (financial reports and/or activity budgets)? | 1 | | |
| | - provide details of its operational plan? | 1 | | |
| | - append the basic text(s) confirming its legal status? | 1 | | |
| | | | | |
| 3.4 COMMUNICATION TOOLS | Does the Route have its own logo? | 1 | | |
| | Do all partners of the network use the logo on their communication tools? | | 0 | |
| | Does the Route have its own dedicated website? | 1 | | |
| | Is it the website translated into English and French? | 1 | | |
| | Is it the website translated into other languages? | 1 | | Partially |
| | Does the network use effectively social networks and web 2.0? | | 0 | They use them but not very effectively |
| | Does the network publish brochures on the Route? | 1 | | |
| | if yes, are the brochures translated in English? | 1 | | |
| | if yes, are the brochures translated in French? | | 0 | |
| | <i>For Certified Cultural Routes only:</i> | | | |
| | Is the title of “Cultural Route of the Council of Europe” present on all communication materials (including press releases, webpages, publications, etc.)? | 1 | | |
| | Is the logo of the Council of Europe present on all communication materials? | 1 | | |
| | Is the CoE logo used in accordance to the | 1 | | |

| | | | | |
|--|---|-----------|----------|------------------|
| | guidelines for its use (size and position,)? | | | |
| | Are the logos (Cultural Route + CoE) provided for all the members of the Route? | 1 | | |
| | Does the Council of Europe logo appear on road signs/ boards indicating the cultural route? | | 0 | Partially |
| | | | | |
| | SCORE | 78 | 0 | |
| | | | | |
| Note : | Please insert 1 for every positive answer and 0 for a negative one. See your total score at the bottom of the column. | | | |
| * E.g. visual arts, the performing arts, creative crafts, architecture, music, literature, poetry or any other form of cultural expression | | | | |
| **Particularly in terms of instruction for young Europeans in the relevant fields | | | | |
| ***Whether these fields include visual arts, performing arts, creative crafts, architecture, music, literature or any other field | | | | |
| | | | | |