



T +33(0)388412560

www.coe.int

pressunit@coe.int

Ref. DC 106(2013)Rev

## **Committee of Ministers to examine implementation of human rights judgments**

Strasbourg, 20.09.2013 – The representatives of the 47 member states of the Council of Europe will examine implementation of the judgments and decisions of the European Court of Human Rights on 24-26 September 2013.

This supervisory role of the Committee of Ministers is provided for under Article 46 of the European Convention on Human Rights.

The cases proposed for more detailed examination concern Azerbaijan, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Poland, Romania, the Russian Federation, Serbia, Slovenia, Turkey, Ukraine and the United Kingdom (list below).

Decisions and resolutions adopted together with working documents will be made public shortly after the meeting on the website of the [Committee of Ministers](#).

Information regarding the state of execution in *all* cases pending before the Committee of Ministers can be found [on the web site of the Department for the execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights](#).

Below, the updated list of cases proposed for more detailed examination.

### **Cases against Azerbaijan**

- *Mahmudov and Agazade group* (first judgment final on 18/03/2009): Violation of the right to freedom of expression of journalists.
- *Namat Aliyev group* (first judgment final on 08/07/2010): Various irregularities in the context of the 2005 elections and lack of safeguards against arbitrariness.

### **Cases against Belgium**

*Dumont group* (first judgment final on 28/07/2005): Excessive length of civil and criminal proceedings and lack of an effective remedy.

### **Case against Bosnia and Herzegovina**

*Sejdić and Finci* (judgment final on 22/12/2009): Violation of right to free elections and discrimination against minorities.

### **Cases against Bulgaria**

- *Al-Nashif and others group* (first judgment final on 20/09/2002): Lack of adequate protection against arbitrariness in proceedings concerning expulsion based on national security grounds.
- *C.G. and others group* (first judgment final on 24/07/2008): Shortcomings found in the judicial control of expulsion based on national security grounds.
- *Dimitrov and Hamanov, Finger, Kitov group and Djangozov group* (judgments final between 2003 and 2011): Excessive length of judicial proceedings and lack of an effective remedy.

### **Cases against Greece**

*Michelioudakis Diamantides No. 2 group, Glykantzi and Konti-Arvaniti group* (judgments final between 2003 and 2013): Excessive length of criminal and civil proceedings and lack of an effective remedy.

### **Case against Hungary**

*R.R.* (judgment final on 29/04/2013): Violation of the right to life of a mother and her children due to their exclusion from witness protection as a sanction for the father's breach of the protection agreement.

### **Case against Italy**

*Cirillo* (judgment final on 29/04/2013): Inhuman and degrading treatment on account of the inadequacy of the medical care provided to the applicant in prison.

### **Cases against Poland**

- *Kudła group and Podbielski group* (judgments final between 1998 and 2000): Excessive length of criminal and civil proceedings and lack of an effective remedy.
- *Fuchs group* (first judgment final on 11/05/2003): Excessive length of proceeding before administrative courts and bodies and lack of an effective remedy.

### **Cases against Romania**

*Nicolau group and Stoianova and Nedelcu group* (judgments final in 2005 and 2006): Excessive length of civil and criminal proceedings and lack of an effective remedy.

### **Cases against the Russian Federation**

- *Alekseyev* (judgment final on 11/04/2011): Repeated unjustified bans on gay marches.
- *Garabayev group* (first judgment final on 30/01/2008): Different violations related to extradition; abduction and illegal transfer to Tajikistan of applicants despite official refusals of their extradition and, in one case, also an indication by the European Court that no transfer should take place awaiting its examination of the application.
- *Gladysheva* (judgment final on 06/03/2012): Disproportionate dispossession of the applicant's property title to her flat, eviction order not necessary in a democratic society.

### **Case against Serbia**

*Grudić* (judgment final on 24/09/2012): Violation of the applicants' right to property since the payment of their pensions earned in Kosovo\* was suspended for more than a decade in breach of the relevant domestic law.

\* All reference to Kosovo, whether the territory, institutions or population, in this text shall be understood in full compliance with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and without prejudice to the status of Kosovo.

### **Case against Slovenia**

*Kurić and others* (judgment final on 26/06/2012): Violation of right to private and family life following the "erasure" of the resident status of an entire category of former citizens of the Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia at the time of Slovenia's declaration of independence.

### **Cases against Turkey**

- *Oya Ataman group* (judgment final on 05/03/2007): Violation of the right to freedom of assembly, ill-treatment of applicants as a result of excessive force used during demonstrations and ineffectiveness of investigations in this last respect
- *Varnava* (judgment final on 18/09/2009): Lack of effective investigation on the fate of nine Greek Cypriot who disappeared during the military operations by Turkey in Cyprus in 1974.

### **Cases against Ukraine**

- *Oleksandr Volkov* (judgment final on 27/05/2013): Unlawful dismissal of the applicant from his post as judge at the Supreme Court.
- *Naumenko Svetlana group and Merit group* (judgments final in 2004 and 2005): Excessive length of judicial proceedings and lack of effective remedy
- *Vyerentsov* (judgment final on 11/07/2013): Administrative conviction of the applicant for holding peaceful demonstration despite lack of law regulating the holding of public assemblies; several violations of the right to a fair trial.
- *Tymoshenko* (judgment final on 30/07/2013): Violations of the applicant's right to liberty and security and restrictions of this right for other purposes than those permissible under the Convention.

### **Cases against the United Kingdom**

- *Hirst No. 2 group* (first judgment final on 06/10/2005): Blanket ban on voting imposed automatically on the applicants due to their status as convicted offenders detained in prison
- *Othman (Abu Qatada)* (judgment final on 09/05/2012): Deportation of the applicant to

Jordan.