

Steering Committee on Media and Information Society – CDMSI

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

09/12/2016

CDMSI (2016)015

11th meeting of the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society

29 November – 02 December 2016

(Strasbourg, Agora building, room G01)

Meeting report

1. Opening of the meeting

The Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) held its 10th meeting from 29 November to 02 December 2016 in Strasbourg chaired by Elfa Ýr Gylfadóttir, (Iceland). The gender distribution among 74 participants was 26 women (35%) and 48 men (65%).

The meeting was opened by Patrick Penninckx, Head of the Information Society Department, who informed the plenary about the main events in the Council of Europe since its last meeting. In particular, he informed the committee of a round table held in Paris on 25 November, which gathered representatives of major Internet companies and of several departments of the Council of Europe to discuss how to engage the internet industry in fostering human rights principles on the internet (see item 5.5).

Furthermore, he emphasized the need for the CDMSI to continue their strong engagement in promoting freedom of expression and freedom of the media as fundamental elements of democracy, also by addressing the new challenges created by technologies. In that respect, he highlighted the work undertaken on internet intermediaries and on algorithms (see item 3.1).

Mr Penninckx signalled also the on-going study "*Journalists at risks*" and particularly thanked the CDMSI and its bureau for their active support in promoting this study (cf. item 5.4). He mentioned the conference on internet freedom, held in Strasbourg on 9 September and co-organised with the Estonian Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers and the German Chairmanship of the OSCE (cf. item 8.3) and a conference in Prague on 10-11 November 2016, jointly organised with the Parliamentary Assembly, EBU, Česká Televize on "Public Service Media and Democracy" in which the chairperson of the CDMSI took an active part. Lastly, he highlighted the recent meeting of the Committee on Cybercrime and the Octopus Conference (16-18 November 2016), where parties came close to adopting a guidance note on cloud evidence.

Together with a Council of Europe delegation, Mr Penninckx would attend the IGF meeting in Mexico (6-9 December), where the Council of Europe would again actively take part (cf. item 5.5).

2. Adoption of the agenda

The CDMSI adopted the agenda of the meeting without changes; it appears in appendix I.

3. Standard setting

3.1 Committee of experts on media pluralism and transparency of media ownership (MSI-MED)

Urška Umek, secretary of the MSI-MED, informed the CDMSI about its second meeting (27-28 September 2016) and progress of work in this committee.

Draft Recommendation on media pluralism and transparency of media ownership

The MSI-MED took on board comments made by the CDMSI at their last meeting on the structure and outline of the draft. The CDMSI discussed the current draft and gave guidance as to its further development.

In general, the draft recommendation was found relevant in the context of a changing media environment and the need to give more prominence to the role and impact of the new media on pluralism, including the consumption of media content, financing of media organisations and distribution of revenues. Media literacy is considered to be closely related to pluralism as it enables the public to understand media ownership data. In this regard, the role of the PSM was pointed out as being highly important, and with it the importance of its sustainable financing. Delegates also emphasised the need for national regulators and for the public to have access to information on the beneficial ownership of media and their financing; hence clear, precise, concise and strict recommendations were necessary in that regard. Nevertheless, it should also be made clear which media outlets would be subjected to the transparency of ownership requirements.

A revised draft will be made available to the CDMSI for their next meeting in June 2017.

Feasibility studies on the role of the internet in the media coverage of electoral campaigns and on gender equality in the media coverage of elections

The CDMSI discussed the study and acknowledged its importance, allowing for deeper reflection on issues that may not (yet) necessitate standard-setting. It also emphasised the need for such cross-sectorial studies to be coordinated with other relevant CoE departments in order to maximise the results.

Specifically, regarding the use of the internet in electoral campaigns, the study exceeds purely media related issues. In this regard, caution must be exercised in making specific recommendations needing regulation, since a number of member states have very liberal models of political advertising although, in some parts of Europe, there may be wishes for clear guidelines on how to address the shift of electoral advertising to the internet.

The chair invited members to send to the secretariat any information they think could be relevant to add to, correct or enrich the study.

3.2 Committee of experts on internet intermediaries (MSI-NET)

Charlotte Altenhöner-Dion, secretary of the MSI-NET, reported on its second meeting (29-30 September 2016) and progress of work in this committee. She pointed to the current interest in the responsibilities of intermediaries at national and regional level, and mentioned the participation of internet business representatives at the meetings and their valuable contributions to the work.

As regards the possible update of the 2008 Human Rights Guidelines for Internet Service Providers, she reported that the European Association of Internet Service Providers (EuroISPA), which was represented at the meeting, had proposed to consider internally whether the up-dating could be dealt with in the framework of the draft recommendation on internet intermediaries, currently been prepared by the MSI-NET.

Draft recommendation on internet intermediaries

Work on the draft submitted by the rapporteur has progressed in line with the discussions of the MSI-NET experts and input received also from the bureau of the CDMSI in October. Efforts have been made in particular to streamline the structure of the text in order to clearly indicate the obligations of states, both negative and positive, vis-à-vis users and intermediaries and the responsibilities of the intermediaries themselves.

The CDMSI confirmed the high interest of the topic and gave guidance for the further elaboration of the draft recommendation. In particular, several comments were made regarding the need to introduce a definition of intermediaries to clarify its scope. Besides, caution should be exercised to stay in line with previous work of the CoE and the CDMSI in terms of language and emphasis. The Committee also shared the sense that the first draft placed too much emphasis on the rights of intermediaries and the protection of free market business models rather than on the human rights at stake and the responsibilities of intermediaries. Furthermore, appropriate liability regimes regarding the editorial functions performed by intermediaries should be considered, as their active role in the ranking and dissemination of content was not foreseen in the framework of the limited liability established by the notice and take down regime. Lastly, delegates mentioned the need to clarify the difference between social media platforms and news portals inviting comments because of commercial interests and to provide guidance as to when social media platforms should restrict content and with what safeguards.

The delegates from the Russian Federation and Greece made remarks, both in general terms and on specific paragraphs of the draft; these will be forwarded to the rapporteur and the MSI-NET for consideration. The chair invited the members to send further specific comments in writing to the secretariat.

Report on human rights dimensions of algorithms

Currently, algorithms and other data processing techniques and their impact on the daily lives of citizens are equally high on political agendas and a variety of reports and studies are in preparation. It is therefore particularly important that

the Council of Europe contribute its specific human rights perspective to the debate.

The CDMSI expressed its overall support for the report as being highly topical and relevant to policy makers. It also underlined that the report covered a fast evolving field and therefore needed to be forward-looking, and to consider a variety of issues arising from automation and robotics and their increasing impact on daily lives. In order for the CDMSI and more generally the Council of Europe to stay ahead of the curve, it would be important to seek feedback also from software designers and technological communities. It was further considered that the report should be clear on its scope and provide some clarification as to what functions automated data processing techniques can fulfil, what their varying levels of complexity are, and how that affects their respective impact on the exercise and enjoyment of human rights. A link to the draft recommendation was made and to the editorial roles performed by intermediaries through algorithms, for instance, in the creation and dissemination of newsfeeds, thereby exerting considerable influence.

The committee further raised the challenges posed to transparency by the use of algorithms. A suggestion was made for labels to be issued by internal audit mechanisms of companies to certify compliance with established human rights standards.

The delegates from Greece and the Russian Federation provided specific comments on the text which will be forwarded to the rapporteur and the MSI-NET for consideration, jointly with the other CDMSI comments and suggestions for the further development of the report.

4. Co-operation activities

The CDMSI took note of the information by the secretariat on on-going and future co-operation programmes and activities, as reflected in document MEDIA-COOP (2016)02. Currently twelve co-operation projects are being implemented on external funding (voluntary contribution or jointly funded by the European Commission) for a total of 7 229 398 Euros over two or three years, according to projects. Since the last plenary meeting, around 150 activities were carried out, with a total of approximately 4 500 participants (judges, prosecutors, lawyers, journalists, media professionals, representatives of the civil society, of self-regulation bodies, government officials, and press students).

The secretariat presented a recently started regional project on "*Reinforcing Judicial Expertise on Freedom of Expression and the Media in South-East Europe*" (JUFREX). It is a Council of Europe / European Union joint project for a total of 3.1Mio € over three years aiming at drawing a situation of the implementation of the ECtHR case law regarding Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights and at running targeted training activities for the judiciary of the beneficiary countries and locations. Besides, the project comprises also specific activities for regulatory authorities and for journalists. The beneficiaries are

Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Montenegro, the « former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia” and Serbia, as well as Kosovo¹.

The CDMSI also took note of specific information on the co-operation EU/CoE joint project in the framework of the European Cooperative Framework (PCF).

Furthermore, the CDMSI heard a presentation of the recent reform of the legislation on the press and publishing in Morocco by Ms Meriem Khatouri, Director of studies and media development at the Ministry of Communications, and held an exchange of views with her.

5. Implementation of Council of Europe adopted standards

5.1 High level seminar: Freedom of expression – role and powers of national human rights institutions and other national mechanisms – 15 December 2016, Strasbourg

The CDMSI took note with interest of the information delivered by the secretariat on a high level seminar: Freedom of expression – role and powers of national human rights institutions and other national mechanisms that will take place in Strasbourg on 15 December 2016. Stemming from the Secretary General’s *Report on the State of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law 2015*, this seminar is a follow-up to a first meeting in October 2015 between the SG and ombudspersons. Organised in collaboration with the European Network of National Human Rights Institutions, its primary objective is to provide a platform for the exchange of experience and practice of the participant organisations related to human rights, safety of journalists, the issue of impunity for crimes against journalists, and hate speech. It will bring together representatives of national human rights institutions of 30 countries as well as of journalist organisations and human rights defenders (AEJ, EFJ, Reporters without Borders, Article 19, Index on Censorship, the Committee to Protect Journalists and the International Press Institute).

5.2 Initiatives in member states

The CDMSI took note of information provided by some of its members on initiatives and developments related to its area of work, namely from

- France: the adoption of a new law on media independence;
- the Netherlands: a report on *“The public core of the Internet, an international agenda for Internet governance”* and on *“The Internet: a global free space with limited state control”*, as well as the response by the Dutch Government;
- Ukraine: a series of legislative developments on television and radio broadcasting of Ukraine.

It also took note of the translation by the German authorities of the CM Recommendation on Internet Freedom and of the Recommendation CM/Rec(2016)1 on protecting and promoting the right to freedom of expression and the right to private life with regard to network neutrality.

¹ All references to Kosovo, whether to the territory, institutions or population, in this text, shall be understood in full compliance with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and without prejudice to the status of Kosovo.

This information is published on the web site of the CDMSI, together with a form designed to help delegates to report on similar developments in their respective countries.

5.3 Defamation

The CDMSI took note of the recent publication of a study on the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights titled "*Freedom of expression and defamation*". An up-date of the study on criminalisation of defamation is planned.

Delegates are invited to share with the secretariat any information on developments that may occur in their country on the topic.

5.4 Fear in journalism

The CDMSI held a discussion with Prof Marilyn Clark, from Malta University, author of a study on "Journalists at risk: part of the job?" commissioned by the Council of Europe. She presented the main findings of the study, which show worrying percentages of various kind of pressure on journalists in the whole of Europe, leading to equally high levels of self-censorship. The survey was conducted by internet, with the help of the partner organisations of the Council of Europe Platform to promote journalism and safety of journalists, and reached 940 journalists in Europe, between April 2015 and June 2016. It will be published in spring 2017, to coincide with the 4th SG's report on the State of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law in Europe.

5.5 Internet governance

Council of Europe Internet Governance Strategy 2016-2019

The Secretariat informed the CDMSI on the implementation of the Internet Governance Strategy 2016-2019 as referred to in document CDMSI(2016)005rev. This work is based on the contributions received by a number of Council of Europe services dealing with the digital dimensions of areas regarding inter alia education, child protection, hate speech, crime, security, terrorism, etc.

European Dialogue for Internet Governance (EuroDIG).

The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the secretariat and the representative of Switzerland on preparations for the next EuroDIG event to be held in Tallinn on 6 and 7 June 2017. The event will be hosted and supported by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Estonia. The secretariat underlined the need for EuroDIG to secure strong partners for the future, including the CDMSI.

Internet Governance Forum (IGF)

The CDMSI took also note of the up-coming meeting of the Internet Governance Forum in Jalisco, Mexico, on 6 to 9 December, under the overarching theme "*Enabling Inclusive and Sustainable Growth*" and information was provided by the secretariat on the Council of Europe's involvement in it.

ICANN

The UK delegate reported on the last meeting of ICANN, held in Hyderabad, India, on 3-9 November 2016, where he presented the Council of Europe expert report on *"The Future of Community top-level Domains (TLDs) and ICANN Opportunities and Challenges for non-profit Communities from a Human Rights Perspective"*. This report was previously submitted to ICANN and well received by ICANN communities, in particular the Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC). CDMSI members were encouraged to consider the report and make recommendations to their national representatives participating in the GAC.

5.6 Internet freedom conference

The members of the CDMSI who took part in it and the secretariat informed the Committee on a conference on internet freedom held in Strasbourg on 9 September which was co-organised with the Estonian Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers and the German Chairmanship of the OSCE. The conference was very well attended, with over 200 participants in the room, nearly 400 people on line and a steady flow of twitter exchanges.

As a follow-up, the CDMSI had an exchange of views with ECtHR Judge Robert Spano, who was one of the speakers of the conference, on the topic. He shared with the CDMSI reflexions on different liability models for internet intermediaries, re-purposing of online collected data, how to better enable member states to implement the internet freedom recommendation by defining more clearly the boundaries between positive and negative obligations of states in respect of protecting individuals from cybercrime.

5.7 Regional conference with EBU in Prague on "Public Service Media and Democracy"

A representative of the European Broadcasting Union (EBU) reported on the conference co-organised by EBU, the Council of Europe and Česká Televize and hosted by the Czech Parliament. The participants discussed the importance and impact of public service media for democracy and raised, inter alia, the main issues of independence and funding. The conclusions of the conference were fed into the European Commission Annual Colloquium on Fundamental Rights held in Brussels a week later.

6. CDMSI Workshop: "The future of news: media and journalism in the age of digital convergence", 1 December 2016

In the framework of the 3rd aspect of its terms of reference, i.e. Reflexion and dialogue on freedom of expression at the age of digital convergence, the CDMSI held a half-day workshop. In preparation of this event, an expert report had been commissioned to the Reuters institute for the study of journalism of Oxford university, under the title: *"Challenges and opportunities for news media and journalism in an increasingly digital, mobile and social media environment"*. One of the authors of the report, Rasmus Kleis Nielsen, framed the topic of the workshop by explaining the rationale for preserving journalism as a public good and the challenges news and media journalism are facing as a consequence of digital disruption: advertising revenue shifting to online companies, decreasing investment in journalism, the dominant place of online companies in media

content distribution, polarisation of how readers and users relate to content. He also raised concerns about filter bubbles (recently coined phrases 'algorithmic segregation'), which would need further evidence-based discussion. CDMSI members engaged with the topic and issues analysed in the report.

The introduction was followed by two panels. The first panel was composed of representatives from two major European newspapers, Le Monde and The Guardian, the online news organisation Rue 89, News Media Europe and the European Federation of Journalists. They exposed how media organisations are experiencing the challenges and what adaptation strategies they have undertaken (real time coverage tools, instant connection with readers, producing attractive format for news, better use of data about and from readers, alternatives to digital advertising business model, contribution-based readership (increased after Brexit and U.S. elections); smaller media seeking direct reader subscription, crowd funding). CDMSI members then engaged in discussions with the panellists.

During the second panel a representative from Google Digital News Initiative presented Google's activities in funding media operations, training and product innovation and discussed with CDMSI members about the motivations behind this initiative. Upian – a content production company – presented a documentary 'Do Not Track' on privacy issues explained to broader audiences as an example of how new technologies can raise public awareness and stimulate the debate on the media convergence issues.

Rasmus Kleis Nielsen concluded the workshop by giving ideas for further reflection and media policy: public funding for public service media, indirect and direct support for private sector news media, legal responses such as VAT exemptions for both traditional and digital media content, support for non-profit news media. Lastly, a representative of the European Commission presented different legal (e.g. copyright directive revision, including ancillary copyright for news snippets) and non-legal initiatives to support media pluralism (funding research carried out by EU).

The secretariat will prepare a report on this workshop.

7. Data Protection

The CDMSI took note with interest of the information provided by Sophie Kwasny, secretary to the T-PD, on the on-going work in the field of data protection. She pointed out the growing interest internationally to the Convention 108 and the Council of Europe work on data protection, with currently 50 countries parties to it (it has very recently entered into force in Senegal, and Burkina Faso has requested accession) as well as a strong support by the EU.

Modernisation of Convention 108: a draft amending protocol of Convention 108 has been finalised by the CAHDATA and all outstanding issues were discussed by the Committee of Ministers group of rapporteurs on legal co-operation (GR-J), together with the abridged report of the meeting of the CAHDATA. These issues relate to the exceptions and restrictions to the convention, to transborder data flows, to voting rights in the Committee of Convention 108.

Work of the Consultative Committee of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (T-PD):

- *The opinion of the T-PD on "the Data protection implication of the processing of Passenger Name Records (PNR)"* was finalised and adopted on 15 September 2016 by written procedure.
- *Draft CM Recommendation on the protection of health data:* a last version of the draft was discussed and the T-PD could approve it at its next plenary meeting in spring 2017. As a following step, the draft will be submitted to the CDMSI for its consideration and further transmission to the Committee of Ministers.
- *Draft guidelines on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data in a world of big data:* the CDMSI as well as other observers were invited to provide comments; Sophie Kwasny, secretary to the T-PD, thanked it for its contributions. The draft will be finalised by the bureau of the T-PD (meeting from 30 November to 2 December) and will be submitted to adoption by written procedure. It will then be communicated for information to the CDMSI. Members of the CDMSI and the secretariat also emphasised the synergies between that work and the work of the MSI-NET on human rights and algorithms.

8. Work of other Council of Europe institutions and bodies

8.1 Secretary General's initiatives

3rd Secretary General's Annual report on Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law

The CDMSI took note of information provided by the secretariat on activities undertaken by the Information Society Department as well as by other bodies and departments of the Council of Europe as a follow-up to the *3rd Secretary General's Annual report on Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law in Europe 2016*. It noted that, in June, the Committee of Ministers had a discussion on concrete follow-up to be given but had not taken a decision.

In respect of the *Study on blocking, filtering and take down of illegal content on the internet*, the CDMSI noted that the study had a significant impact and is well received.

The secretariat also informed the committee that it is currently working on the 4th edition of the SG's report, which is expected by April 2017.

8.2 Committee of Ministers

The CDMSI took note of the information by the Cypriot delegate on priorities of the Cyprus Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe (22 November 2016 – 19 May 2017) and in particular of two events relevant to CDMSI work: the spring conference of European Data Protection Authorities (Limassol, 27-28 April 2017) and an international conference on the freedom of expression and the judgments of the ECtHR related to internet (Nicosia, 28 April 2017).

8.3 Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

The secretariat informed the CDMSI on the state of play of its comments on PACE Recommendation 2092(2016) "Fighting the hyper-sexualisation of children". The comments were processed by written procedure in order to meet the deadlines given by the Committee of Ministers. They were duly forwarded on time and the committee will be informed of any follow-up. Additional information on this topic was provided by the UK delegate.

The CDMSI also held an exchange of views with a member of the secretariat to the PACE Committee on Culture, Science, Education and the Media on the activities of the Committee and its collaboration with the CDMSI.

8.4 Commissioner for Human Rights

The CDMSI held an exchange of views with Anne Weber, representative of the Office of the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights on his mission and areas of work. It took note of the Commissioner's report on Croatia.

The delegates and observers expressed disappointment and concerns about the low number of replies by member states to alerts published on the Platform to promote the protection of journalism and safety of journalists, and asked the representative of the Office of the Commissioner what actions the Commissioner could take in this respect.

8.5. Conference on INGOs of the Council of Europe

The CDMSI had an exchange of views with Anna Rurka, Chairperson of the Council of Europe Conference of INGOs, on the activities of the Conference and possible collaboration with the CDMSI.

8.6 Committee of Experts on Terrorism (CODEXTER)

Kristian Bartholin, co-secretary of CODEXTER, informed and had an exchange with the CDMSI about on-going work, in particular the revision of the 2005 Recommendation on special investigation techniques. The CDMSI was represented by Maja Raković and Mr Bartholin thanked her for her constructive input. The draft has been finalised and approved by CODEXTER and will be submitted to the Committee of Ministers for adoption in 2017. Mr Bartholin had also taken part in the round table organised in Paris on 25 November with internet industry representatives. He emphasized the need and the interest to work with the private sector, but stressed that the responsibility for policing the internet should remain with states.

8.7 European Audio-visual Observatory

Maja Cappello, Head of the Legal Information Department of the Observatory, informed the CDMSI about on-going and future work as well as developments and had an exchange of views with the committee.

8.8 European Committee on Legal Co-operation (CDCJ)

The secretariat informed the CDMSI of the state of play of a draft recommendation on the legal regulation of lobbying activities in the context of public decision making. The draft is currently being finalised and should be submitted to the Committee of Ministers for adoption early March 2017.

8.9. Participation of CDMSI members in meetings and events

The CDMSI took note of information provided by CDMSI members on their participation in activities, meetings and events relating to media and Internet issues, as well as by the secretariat, in particular,

- PACE conference on "Media freedom as a cornerstone for democratic elections", Berlin, 4 July 2017, attended by Elfa Ýr Gylfadóttir;
- "1st Global Internet and Jurisdiction Conference" Paris, 14-16 November 2016;
- the 2016 Annual Colloquium on Fundamental Rights focused on "Media Pluralism and Democracy".

It discussed some of the topics of these events in relation with on-going and future work.

8.10 EPRA (additional sub-item)

The CDMSI also had an exchange of views with Emmanuelle Machet, secretary to EPRA, who presented the EPRA *Statement of Strategy*, which will be followed by a three-year EPRA Work Programme to give practical effect to the strategic goals and objectives.

9. Other organisations

European Union

The secretariat presented information sent out by the delegate of Slovakia, who could not attend the meeting, on the activities carried out under the out-going Presidency of the European Union.

The CDMSI also took note of a presentation by the delegate of Malta on priorities and activities of the future Presidency of the European Union.

The CDMSI took note of the on-going work by the European Union on the revision of the Audiovisual Media Services Directive (AVMSD). The CDMSI recalled the current standstill on the revision of the European Convention on Transfrontier Television and invited member states to communicate their position on this matter at the next CDMSI meeting in June 2017. To prepare the discussions, the secretariat will send an information note accompanied by questions for reflection.

10. CDMSI work programme and working methods

Reflection on a future conference of ministers responsible for media and information society

The CDMSI discussed possible topics for a conference of specialised ministers on the basis of a document prepared by the secretariat following the 10th bureau meeting.

It agreed that further reflection on topics is necessary and that there is a need for an overarching theme. In that respect, members are invited to forward their suggestions and further topics to be developed, to the secretariat, by 15 February 2017.

The CDMSI also raised the issue of a host country. It welcomed the intention expressed by the UK delegates to consult with their authorities on the possibility to host the conference. The chair encouraged all members to also reflect on such a possibility.

11. Elections

Pursuant to the CM/Resolution (2011)24, and the CDMSI elected Elfa Ýr Gylfadóttir (Iceland) as its chair, Emir Povelkić (Bosnia and Herzegovina) as its vice-chair, both for a second one year mandate and Christoffer Lärkner (Sweden) as member of the bureau for a second one year mandate.

12. Any other issue

The CDMSI took note of the dates for its plenary meetings and the meetings of the bureau in 2017 as follows:

11th CDMSI bureau: 11 and 12 May 2017

12th CDMSI plenary: 20 (afternoon) to 23 (morning) June 2017

12th CDMSI bureau: 19 and 20 October 2017

13th CDMSI plenary: 5 (afternoon) to 8 (morning) December 2017

13. Abridged report

Noting the absence of a quorum, the CDMSI finalised the abridged report of the meeting and agreed that in the absence of reactions by 14 December 2016 end of working day, it will be considered adopted by the plenary.

APPENDIX I

Meeting agenda

- 1. Opening of the meeting by Patrick Penninckx, Head of the Information Society Department**
- 2. Adoption of the agenda**
- 3. Standard setting**
 - 3.1 *Committee of experts on Media Pluralism and Transparency of Media Ownership (MSI-MED)*
 - 3.2 *Committee of experts on Internet Intermediaries (MSI-NET)*
- 4. 4. Cooperation activities**
- 5. Implementation of Council of Europe adopted standards and best practices**
 - 5.1 *High Level Seminar: Freedom of expression – role and powers of national human rights institutions (NHRIs) and other national mechanisms – Strasbourg, 15 December 2016*
 - 5.2 *5.2 Initiatives in member states*
 - 5.3 *Defamation*
 - 5.4 *Fear in journalism*
 - 5.5 *Internet governance*
 - 5.6 *Internet Freedom Conference*
 - 5.7 *Regional Conference with EBU in Prague on "Public Service Media and Democracy"*
- 6. CDMSI Workshop: 'The Future of news: media and journalism in the age of digital convergence', 1 December 2016**
- 7. Data protection**
- 8. Work of other Council of Europe institutions and bodies**
 - 8.1 *Secretary General's initiatives*
 - 8.2 *Committee of Ministers*
 - 8.3 *Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE)*
 - 8.4 *Commissioner for Human Rights*
 - 8.5 *Conference of INGOs of the Council of Europe*
 - 8.6 *Committee of Experts on terrorism (CODEXTER)*
 - 8.7 *European Audio-visual Observatory*
 - 8.8 *European Committee on Legal co-operation (CDCJ)*
 - 8.9 *Participation of CDMSI members in meetings and events*
- 9. Other organisations**

European Union
- 10. CDMSI work programme and working methods**

Reflection on a future conference of ministers responsible for media and information society
- 11. Elections**
- 12. Any other business**
- 13. Adoption of the abridged report**

APPENDIX II**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS
11TH MEETING OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE ON MEDIA AND INFORMATION SOCIETY****11EME RÉUNION DU COMITÉ DIRECTEUR SUR LES MEDIAS ET LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION
(CDMSI)****29 NOVEMBER – 2 DECEMBER 2016 / 29 NOVEMBRE – 2 DÉCEMBRE 2016
ROOM/SALLE G01 (AGORA)**

Total number of participants : 75
 Gender distribution : 47 men (66%) / 25 women (34%)
Parité entre hommes / femmes : hommes (66%) / femmes (34%)

ARMENIA / ARMENIE

Ms Kima Khachatryan, First Degree Specialist
 Department of Information and Public Relations - Ministry of Justice of Armenia

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Mr Matthias Traimer
 Federal Chancellery, Media Affairs and Information Society, Federal Chancellery,
 Constitutional Service

AZERBAIJAN

Ms Jeyran Amiraslanova
 Senior Adviser of the Administration of the President

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

Mr Emir Powlakic
 Head of Division for Licensing, Digitalization and Coordination in Broadcasting,
 Communications Regulatory

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Ms. Nelly Stoyanova
 Head of Information Society Policy Department - Ministry of Transport, IT and
 Communications

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Ms Sofia (Sunny) Papadimitriou Tofa
 Press and Information Officer, Ministry of Interior

CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Mr Artus Rejent
 Media and Audio-vision Department, Ministry of Culture

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Ms Katja Just Maarbjerg, Ministry of Culture

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Mr Mati Kaalep
 Adviser of Audiovisual Affairs of Estonian Ministry of Culture

FINLAND

Mr. Juuso MOISANDER
 Commercial Secretary, Information Society and ICT, Ministry for Foreign Affairs

FRANCE

Ms Joanna Chansel
 Bureau des affaires européennes et internationales

Direction Générale des Médias et des Industries Culturelles
Ministère de la Culture et de la Communication

Mr Julien Plubel
Direction des affaires culturelles, Ministère des affaires étrangères

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Mr George Paniashvili
Deputy Director, International Law Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Ms Annick Kuhl
Representation of the Free State of Bavaria to the EU

GREECE / GRECE

Mr Evgenios Nastos
Secretariat General for Information & Communication

Ms Maria Sfetsa
Secretariat General for Information & Communication

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Mr György Ocskó
International Legal Adviser, National Media and Infocommunications Authority

ICELAND / ISLANDE

Ms Elfa Ýr Gylfadóttir (Chair / Présidente)
Media Commission, Ministry of Education, Science and Education

IRELAND / IRLANDE

Mr Éanna Ó Conghaile
Department of Communications, Energy and Natural Resources

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Pierluigi Mazzella
Director General, Agency for the right to university education, Professor of Information and Communication, University of Rome

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Mr Andris Mellakauls
Information Space Integration, Ministry of Culture

LIECHTENSTEIN

Mr Martin Hasler

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Mr Deividas Velkas
Head of Society Information Policy division, Department of Cultural Policy, Ministry of Culture

MALTA / MALTE

Ms Maria Mifsud
Office Management Assistant, Office of The Permanent Secretary
Ministry for the Economy

MOLDOVA / MOLDOVIE

Mr Serghei Mihov
Counsellor , Global Affairs and Human Rights Division , General Directorate for Multilateral Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integration of the Republic of Moldova

MONACO

M. Serge Robillard
Chef de Division, Direction des Communications Électroniques, Principauté de Monaco

MONTENEGRO

Mr Ranko Vujovic
Executive Director, UNEM

THE NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Mr Nol Reijnders
Senior Adviser for Media Policy

Ms Pien van den Eijnden
Senior Legal Adviser
Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations, Constitutional Affairs and Legislation,
Constitutional Affairs

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Ms Delia Mucica
Professor, University of Theatre and Film
Senior Advisor, Unit for Project Management, Ministry of Culture and National Heritage

RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION RUSSIE

Mr Nadzhaf Abdullaev
Senior Councillor, MFA Press and Information Department

Mr Arseniy Nedyak
Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications

SERBIA / SERBIE

Ms Maja Rakovic
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

Mr Skender Adem
Undersecretary, Ministry of Culture of Republic of Slovenia

SWEDEN / SUEDE

Mr Christoffer Lärkner
Department of Culture

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Mr Thomas Schneider
Federal Office of Communication, Federal Department for the environment, transport,
energy and communication

Mr Pierre Smolik
Federal Office of Communication, Federal Department for the environment, transport,
energy and communication

Mr. Urs Thalmann
Member of EMEK, the Swiss Commission on Media,

**„FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA „/ „EX-REPUBLIQUE
YUGOSLAVE DE MACEDOINE“**

Ms Vesna Poposka
Head of International PR Department, Government of the Republic of Macedonia, PR
Department

TURKEY / TURQUIE

Mr Mehmet Bora Sönmez
Media Expert, Radio and Television Supreme Council of Turkey

Mr. Arif Firtina, Council Member,
Mr. Taha Yücel, Council Member

UKRAINE

Ms Olha Herasymiuk
First Deputy Chair of the National Council of Ukraine for Television and Radio
Broadcasting

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Mr Mark Carvell
Media Team, Department for Culture, Media and Sport

Ms Kathleen Stewart
Media Team, Department for Culture, Media and Sport

* * *

**OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS
PARTICIPANTS**

BELARUS

Mr Dimitry Mironchik
Head of Media Department of MFA Belarus, Press-Secretary of MFA

HOLY SEE / SAINT SIEGE

Mgr John Baptist Itaruma

MOROCCO / MAROC

Mme Chanaz El Akriche
Chef de Division de la Coopération, Ministère de la Communication

Mme Meriem Khatouri
Directrice des Etudes et du Développement des médias, Ministère de la Communication

**PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / ASSEMBLEE
PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Rüdiger Dossow - Secretary of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education

**CONFERENCE OF INTERNATIONAL NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS OF
THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONFÉRENCE DES ORGANISATIONS
INTERNATIONALES NON GOUVERNEMENTALES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Ms Anna Rurka - Chairperson
Mr Didier Schretter
Member of the Standing Committee - Vice-chair Education and Culture Committee

**EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS/ COUR EUROPENNE DES DROITS DE
L'HOMME**

Judge Robert Spano

**OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS / BUREAU DU
COMMISSAIRE AUX DROITS DE L'HOMME**

Ms Anne Weber
Adviser to the Commissioner

**ADVISORY COUNCIL ON YOUTH OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONSEIL
CONSULTATIF SUR LA JEUNESSE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Milosh Ristovski - Centre for intercultural Dialogue

**COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON TERRORISM / COMITÉ D'EXPERTS SUR LE
TERRORISME**

Mr Kristian Bartholin

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE GENDER EQUALITY DIVISION / DIVISION DU CONSEIL DE
L'EUROPE SUR L'EGALITE DES GENRES**

Ms Carolina Lasén Diaz, Head of the Gender Equality division

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE STEERING COMMITTEE FOR HUMAN RIGHTS (CDDH) /
COMITÉ DIRECTEUR DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE POUR LES DROITS DE L'HOMME**

Ms Kristine Līce - Latvian member

**EUROPEAN AUDIOVISUAL OBSERVATORY / OBSERVATOIRE EUROPEEN DE
L'AUDIOVISUEL**

Ms Maja Cappello, Head of Legal Information Department

**ASSOCIATION OF EUROPEAN JOURNALISTS (AEJ) / ASSOCIATION DES
JOURNALISTES EUROPEENS**

Mr William Horsley - Media Freedom Representative

COPEAM

M. Hervé de Haro, Vice-Président

EPRA

Ms Emmanuelle Machet, Secretary

**EUROPEAN BROADCASTING UNION (EBU) / UNION EUROPEENNE DE RADIO-
TELEVISION (UER)**

Mr Michael Wagner

Head of Media and Communications Law, Legal Department

Mr Giacomo Mazzonne

Head of Institutional Relations, Public Affairs & Communications

UNIVERSITY OF MALTA

Ms Marilyn Clark

* * *

**WORKSHOP: THE FUTURE OF NEWS
MEDIA AND JOURNALISM IN THE AGE OF DIGITAL CONVERGENCE**

**ATELIER : L'AVENIR DU JOURNALISME A L'AGE DE LA CONVERGENCE
NUMERIQUE**

Thursday 1 December / Mardi 1 décembre 2016

Ms Benedicte AUTRET - Google's Digital News Initiative

Mr Gabriele BERTOLLI - Team Leader - Future of the Media, Media Freedom and Media
Pluralism, European Commission

Mr Alexandre BRACHET - Upian

Mr Pierre FRANCE - Rue 89 Strasbourg

Mr Rasmus Kleis NIELSEN - Director of Research at the Reuters Institute

Mr Matt ROGERSON - Head of Public Policy of Guardian News & Media

Mr Renate SCHROEDER - European Federation of Journalists

Mr Wout VAN WIJK - News Media Europe
Mr Nabil WAKIM - Directeur de l'innovation éditoriale, Le Monde

* * *

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRETES

Ms Amanda BEDDOWS
Ms Gillian WAKENHUT (29-30/11)
Ms Martine CARALY (1-2/12)
Ms Maryline NEUSCHWANDER (29-30/11)
Ms Christine TRAPP (1-2/12)

* * *

SECRETARIAT

Mr Patrick PENNINGCKX, Head of Information Society Department, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Silvia GRUNDMANN, Head of Media and Internet Division, Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law, Secretary to the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society
Ms Charlotte ALTENHOENER-DION, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Lejla DERVISAGIC, Head of Unit, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Ana GASCÓN-MARCÉN, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Mr Lee HIBBARD, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Mr Christina LAMPROU, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Amélie LEPINARD, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Leila MARSHANIA, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Elvana THAÇI, Head of Unit, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Małgorzata PEK, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Elvana THACI, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Urška UMEK, Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Anne BOYER-DONNARD, Principal Administrative Assistant, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law
Ms Julia WHITHAM, Assistant, Media and Internet Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law