

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 8 April 2015

ACFC/SR/IV(2015)004 rev

**FOURTH REPORT SUBMITTED BY UNITED KINGDOM  
PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 25, PARAGRAPH 2  
OF THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR  
THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES**

Received on 26 March 2015

**THE UNITED KINGDOM'S 4th  
REPORT TO THE COUNCIL OF  
EUROPE UNDER THE FRAMEWORK  
CONVENTION FOR THE  
PROTECTION OF NATIONAL  
MINORITIES**

## Article 1

The protection of national minorities and of the rights and freedoms of persons belonging to those minorities forms an integral part of the international protection of human rights, and as such falls within the scope of international co-operation.

1. The UK continues to play a constructive role on race equality and minority issues in a range of international forums including the Council of Europe, the European Union, the United Nations, and the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe.

2. The Government has continued to meet its obligations under international human rights conventions, including:

- The International Convention for the Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination. The UK Government is currently preparing its next report under the Convention.
- The UN International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. The UK Government is due to be examined in Committee in July 2015 to determine how it is fulfilling its obligations under this Covenant
- The UN International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The UK Government submitted its last report in June 2014, but does not yet have a date for the examination.
- UN Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women. The UK was examined on its implementation of this Convention by the UN committee in 2013 and is due to provide the Committee with follow-up information by November 2015.
- Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. The UK expects to be examined by the UN Committee on its implementation of the Convention later in 2015.
- Convention on the Rights of the Child. The UK expects to be examined by the UN Committee on its implementation of the Convention in 2016.
- Convention against Torture. The UK is due to submit its next periodic report in May 2017.
- Universal Periodic Review. The UK is next due to be examined by the Human Rights Council in 2016.

## **Article 2**

The provisions of this framework Convention shall be applied in good faith, in a spirit of understanding and tolerance and in conformity with the principles of good neighbourliness, friendly relations and co-operation between States.

## **Article 3**

- 1 Every person belonging to a national minority shall have the right freely to choose to be treated or not to be treated as such and no disadvantage shall result from this choice or from the exercise of the rights which are connected to that choice.
- 2 Persons belonging to national minorities may exercise the rights and enjoy the freedoms flowing from the principles enshrined in the present framework Convention individually as well as in community with others.

## **Scope of Application**

1. The Government has given careful consideration to the comments by the Advisory Committee about the scope of application of the Framework Convention in the UK<sup>1</sup>. In April 2014, the Government announced that it had modified its position on the application of the Framework Convention to bring the Cornish within its scope, in recognition of the unique identity of the Cornish.<sup>2</sup> The Framework Convention continues to apply to member of groups defined by colour, nationality, ethnic or national origins. In extending the Framework Convention to the Cornish, the Government made clear that this was without prejudice as to whether the Cornish meet the definition of racial group in the Equality Act 2010, as only the courts may decide that.

## **2011 Census – ethnic and national identity**

2. The most recent census in the United Kingdom took place in 2011 and again included a question on ethnic origin. The response categories identified have been developed from the frame of the 2001 Census question to meet changing user requirements, but the question continues to adopt that mix of geographic origin and colour characteristics that testing in the 1980s and 1990s had shown to be publicly most acceptable and from which the most useable statistics could be obtained.

3. However, in order to make provision for those people, regardless of their broad ethnic group, to indicate their identity as being British, English or Welsh (or Scottish or Northern Irish, etc), a new additional and separate component to the question was asked about national identity.

---

<sup>1</sup> Advisory Committee 2011 Opinion on the UK

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/cornish-granted-minority-status-within-the-uk>

4. New response categories for ‘Gypsy and Irish Traveller’ and ‘Arab’ were introduced into the ethnicity question. Publicity was also given to the option available to respondents to record their identity using the write-in facility in either or both questions. The write-in option will enable information to be recorded on persons from other minority groups or with other self-expressed identities for whom it has not been possible, within the space constraints of the census questionnaire to provide a separate tick box response in every case.<sup>3</sup>

5. Though, as in the 2001 Census, different forms of the ethnicity questions were used in Scotland<sup>4</sup> and in Northern Ireland<sup>5</sup> (to reflect different information requirements there), the variants nevertheless allow statistics to be produced which will be broadly comparable both throughout the UK and with statistics from the 2001 Census.

6. The 2011 census questions on ethnic and national identity did not include Cornish as a specific category. However, respondents were free write it in as their chosen identity if they wished to do so, and the Office for National Statistics has recorded and published the number who did so. The overall number of people in England and Wales who identified as Cornish (on its own or combined with other identities) in England and Wales was 83,000 (0.1 per cent). However, within Cornwall 13.8 per cent of the population associated themselves with a Cornish identity.<sup>6</sup>

## **2011 census - language**

### *Welsh language*

7. The Census collects information on Welsh language skills (understanding, speaking, reading and writing), but does not collect information on fluency or usage.

8. In 2011, 19.0 per cent of people aged 3 and over in Wales were able to speak Welsh. This equates to around 562,000 people, and is a decrease from 2001 when 20.8% (582,000) people were able to speak Welsh. But, the proportion and number of Welsh speakers in 2011 were higher than the equivalent figures for 1991 (18.7% and 508,000 people). The proportion of people able to speak Welsh varies considerably by age, with higher proportions of children able to speak Welsh.<sup>7</sup>

### *Gaelic language*

---

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/dcp171776\\_290558.pdf](http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/dcp171776_290558.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.scotlandscensus.gov.uk/documents/censusresults/release2a/rel2asbtable2.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.ninis2.nisra.gov.uk/public/Theme.aspx?themeNumber=136&themeName=Census+2011>

<sup>6</sup> [http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/dcp171776\\_290558.pdf](http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/dcp171776_290558.pdf)

<sup>7</sup> <http://wales.gov.uk/statistics-and-research/census-population-welsh-language/?lang=en>

9. The 2011 census showed that the historical decline of the number of Gaelic speakers has significantly slowed. Between 1991 and 2001 the number of speakers fell from around 65,000 to around 58,500. The 2011 census however, showed that over the last 10 years the number had only fallen by approximately 1,000 with around 57,500 fluent speakers remaining. The 2011 census also showed that there had been an increase in those speaking, reading and writing the language between the ages of 3-18.

### *Scots language*

10. For the first time, a question was asked on Scots language in the 2011 census. The results demonstrated that over 1.5 million people in Scotland had some skills in the Scots language.

#### Article 4

- 1 The Parties undertake to guarantee to persons belonging to national minorities the right of equality before the law and of equal protection of the law. In this respect, any discrimination based on belonging to a national minority shall be prohibited.
- 2 The Parties undertake to adopt, where necessary, adequate measures in order to promote, in all areas of economic, social, political and cultural life, full and effective equality between persons belonging to a national minority and those belonging to the majority. In this respect, they shall take due account of the specific conditions of the persons belonging to national minorities.
- 3 The measures adopted in accordance with paragraph 2 shall not be considered to be an act of discrimination.

### **Legislation**

1. The UK continues to have a very strong legal framework and effective remedies for the protection of human rights and for combating discrimination against all individuals including person belonging to ethnic minorities.

#### *England, Scotland and Wales*

2. In Great Britain, the Equality Act came into force from October 2010 providing a modern, single legal framework with clear, streamlined law to more effectively tackle disadvantage and discrimination. The primary purpose of the Act is to codify the numerous of Acts and Regulations, which formed the basis of anti-discrimination law in Great Britain. As such, The Equality Act supersedes and consolidates previous discrimination law in Great Britain including the Race Relations Act 1976. In this way it makes the law easier to understand and strengthens protection. The Equality Act covers nine protected characteristics, including race, which is defined as including colour, nationality (including citizenship), and ethnic or national origins.

3. In April 2011, the remaining general positive action provisions in section 159, relating specifically to recruitment and promotion in employment, came into force. These provisions mean that it is not unlawful discrimination to take special measures aimed at alleviating disadvantage or under-representation experienced by certain groups. The provisions permit employers in their recruitment or promotion processes to treat individuals with a protected characteristic more favourably when faced with two or more candidates of equal merit, if the more favourable treatment is intended to address under-representation in the workforce or a disadvantage that is connected to the protected characteristic.

4. Positive action in recruitment and promotion can be used where an employer reasonably thinks that people with a protected characteristic are under-represented in the workforce, or suffer a disadvantage connected to that protected characteristic. In practice it allows an employer faced with making a

choice between two or more candidates who are of equal merit to take into consideration whether one is from a group that is disproportionately under-represented or otherwise disadvantaged within the workforce. But this kind of positive action is only allowed where it is a proportionate way of addressing the under-representation or disadvantage.

5. The Equality Act includes a new public sector equality duty, replacing the separate duties relating to race, disability and gender equality. The public sector equality duty is made up of a general equality duty supported by specific duties. The general equality duty is set out in section 149 of the Equality Act 2010. This is the same for England, Scotland and for Wales and it came into force on 5 April 2011. The Equality Duty applies across Great Britain to the public bodies listed in Schedule 19 and to any other organisation when it is carrying out a public function. Public bodies have to consider all individuals when carrying out their day-to-day work – in shaping policy, in delivering services and in relation to their own employees. It also requires that public bodies have due regard to the need to eliminate discrimination; advance equality of opportunity and foster good relations between different people when carrying out their activities. The General Equality Duty describes fostering good relations as tackling prejudice and promoting understanding between people from different groups. It explains that compliance with the general equality duty may involve treating some people more favourably than others. The general equality duty is not prescriptive about the approach a public authority should take. The specific duties are limited to requirements about publishing equality information and objectives.

6. The Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) Regulations 2011 came into force in September 2011. The specific duties are created via secondary legislation and require public bodies to publish relevant, proportionate information showing compliance with the Equality Duty, and to set equality objectives. These are different for England, Scotland and Wales. In England (and non-devolved authorities in Scotland and Wales), each public authority is required to publish information to demonstrate its compliance with the general equality duty at least annually. This information must include, in particular, information relating to people who share a protected characteristic who are its employees and people affected by its policies and practices. Additionally, each listed public authority (including schools and pupil referral units) must prepare and publish one or more objectives that it thinks it needs to achieve to further any of the aims of the general equality duty at least every four years. The objectives must be specific and measurable but there is no set number required. Public authorities should take a proportionate approach. This means that the number of objectives a public authority sets, and their level of ambition, will be different depending on their size and role.

## **Race Equality and Integration policy**

9. The UK Government and the devolved administrations in Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland are committed to achieving integrated communities, and creating the conditions for everyone to live and work successfully alongside each other. The UK authorities believe that people can come together in strong,



united communities, if we encourage and support them to have shared aspirations, values and experiences; take part in local and national life and decision-making; fulfil their potential to get on in life and challenge extremism and hate crime. This approach does not just apply to minority communities, but to all of society.

10. Our approach to tackling the challenges posed by racial inequality and discrimination in England is therefore not based on singling out individual ethnic groups, but instead on promoting social and economic integration with support from our Equality Strategy and Social Mobility Strategy. The devolved administrations in Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland are pursuing analogous policies appropriate to their own circumstances.

### *England*

11. The Government is committed to creating a fair society in which all people are valued and able to participate fully. It is committed to achieving equality through social mobility programmes in order to give everyone the best life chances regardless of background. We are making sure we protect the most vulnerable and have increased the personal tax allowance, cutting tax for 25 million people. We have increased child tax credits for low to middle income families and we have protected pensions so the oldest and frailest in our society are getting the support they need and deserve. We have also announced a new single state pension that will in the future improve the lives of many of our lowest paid workers.

12. The Government has made a deliberate shift away from interventions based on single issues, such as ethnicity, and the focus instead is on increasing the impact of core policies and programmes for people with the greatest needs. Tackling inequalities is a responsibility that is addressed across government and public bodies as reflected in the Government's strategies and measures to tackle disadvantage: the Social Mobility Strategy; the Equality Act 2010 and the Equality Strategy; the Child Poverty Strategy; the Social Justice Strategy; the 'Troubled Families' programme; the Disability Strategy and the Integration approach.

13. In February 2012, the UK Government published a paper setting out its approach to integration: *Creating the Conditions for Integration*.<sup>8</sup> In this paper, the Government makes clear that it sees integration as the process by which millions of individuals come together around common values, aspirations and interests. It is these shared legal and social norms, such as respect and equality, which provide the foundation for society. The Government is clear that integration means everyone playing a full part in local and national life, and this requires a society which is fair, open and equal to all; one which challenges all forms of extremism and intolerance; and one which widens access to jobs and training and encourages educational aspiration and enterprise. There is therefore a clear link to our aim of improving social mobility and race equality.

---

<sup>8</sup> <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/creating-the-conditions-for-a-more-integrated-society>

14. While we make clear that integration is predominantly a local issue, we also set out actions for Government, including initiatives to celebrate shared values, promote a strong sense of personal and social responsibility, improve social mobility, encourage participation, and challenge all forms of extremism and intolerance.

15. The Government has also further developed thinking on the relationship between race and socio-economic disadvantage. We believe it is a mistake to see inequalities only in terms of race and ethnic origin, since socio-economic status and poverty affect people's chances in life, regardless of racial or ethnic background. We have therefore made a deliberate shift away from interventions specifically on the basis of race or ethnicity, and towards increasing the impact of mainstream policies and programmes for disadvantaged communities, in disadvantaged areas. Integration is very much a local issue, and should be determined by local people. We have been clear about the role of central government in creating the conditions for this to happen and in supporting local areas, rather than drawing up a national, top-down race strategy

16. The Government's approach to Integration gives people the opportunities to come together and play an active role in society, emphasising the things they have in common. The policy is based around five key themes. To kick-start the approach, the Government support a list of practical exemplar projects which demonstrate positive or pioneering ideas that are community-led and create the conditions for people to live successfully alongside each other:

- Common ground - a clear sense of shared aspirations and values, which celebrates what we have in common rather than our differences.
- Responsibility - a strong sense of citizens' mutual commitments and obligations, which brings personal and social responsibility.
- Social mobility - people are able to realise their potential to get on in life. The Government seeks to widen access to jobs and training and encourage educational aspiration and enterprise.
- Participation and empowerment –people of all backgrounds should have the opportunities to take part, be heard and take decisions in local and national life. It is important that people feel that they have some control or influence in their daily lives and in their community, particularly if they think they are being treated unfairly.
- Tackling intolerance and extremism – The Government seeks to ensure a robust response to threats, whether discrimination, extremism or disorder, that deepen division and increase tensions.

17. The Government believes that integration is achieved when neighbourhoods, families and individuals come together on issues which matter to them. The Government recognises that local communities know their own local areas best and so have moved away from a top-down approach with targets and

inspections. Instead, Government's involvement is by exception and enables local authorities, communities, businesses and voluntary bodies to lead integration in their local areas.

18. The Government is supporting a range of projects which set direction and pioneer innovative ideas in order to encourage leadership and mobilise action at a local level. These were set out by the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government in a Written Ministerial Statement to Parliament in December 2014.<sup>9</sup> The Government encourages programmes which treat people as equal British citizens, regardless of their background, race or faith. People's potential should not be determined by their background. The Government believes that programmes and funding aimed at specific communities risk further separating people along community lines.

### *Scotland*

19. The Scottish Government published its Race Equality Statement for 2008-11 in December 2008, whose main objective was to ensure that the Scottish Government and its stakeholders were addressing the pressing race equality issues in Scotland at that time. The principles of the Statement remain valid and continue to guide much of what the Scottish Government does.

20. The Scottish Government is now working to refresh its approach to race equality. Officials remain in discussion with stakeholders to develop a shared understanding of the process. Over the coming months the Scottish Government Equality Unit, aided by its race equality partners and Scotland's communities, will coordinate a consultative approach, seeking to involve and engage with as wide a range of individuals and organisations as possible. This is with a view to publishing a final approach by spring 2016.

21. The Scottish Government has provided £24 million since 2008 to organisations and projects working on the ground, and developed strong relations with a range of communities and intermediary bodies to deliver race equality and better outcomes for Scotland's minority ethnic and faith communities.

22. A strategy for integration of refugees, *New Scots: Integrating Refugees in Scotland's Communities*, was published in December 2013. A conference to mark the end of the first year of implementation and its impact was held in January 2015. The Scottish Government believes that integration of refugees and asylum-seekers in the community should begin from 'Day one' and is providing £2.81 million for the period 2012-15 to organisations working with refugees and asylum-seekers in Scotland.

### *Wales*

23. The Welsh Government has an on-going community cohesion strategy, *Getting on Together*, which was launched in 2009 and is now in phase two of

---

<sup>9</sup> <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/integration-update>

delivery. Funding of £5million supported the strategy and over 650 projects across Wales in 2009-12. Phase two of delivery is focused on how support can be provided through the Equality Act 2010 to promote good relations. The Welsh Government also funded Regional Community Cohesion Officer Posts across all 22 local authority areas. Additional funding has been agreed to extend these to 2016 and to deliver a national Community Cohesion Work Programme. The Welsh Government has established a Wales Race Forum, to engage and understand the key issues and barriers facing black and minority ethnic communities in Wales, and a Faith Communities Forum, bringing together representatives of different faith groups to discuss key inter-faith issues.

24. The Welsh Government has agreed to fund the Welsh Refugee Council from January 2015 to March 2017 to provide a strategic approach to support migration issues.

25. The specific equality duties in Wales are set out in Equality Act 2010 (Statutory Duties) (Wales) Regulations 2011. The regulations were approved by the National Assembly for Wales and came into force on 6 April 2011. The specific duties, as in England and Scotland, aid public sector bodies to implement the public sector equality duty.

26. The specific duties aid public sector bodies to implement the public sector equality duty in Wales and place duties on the devolved public sector (as listed in Schedule 19 of the Equality Act 2010) covering the duty:

- To publish Equality objectives and Strategic Equality Plans and reviewing every four years
- To engage with people with protected characteristics
- To carry out Equality Impact Assessments
- To have due regard to pay differences
- Staff training around the general and specific duties
- To include equality considerations in procurement, where appropriate
- To publish an annual report reporting on progress against the equality objectives and a Welsh Ministers report every 4 years
- To identify relevant equality information it holds and to fill any gaps
- To collect and publish staff diversity data annually
- To take reasonable steps to ensure that any document/information it publishes is accessible.

27. Public authorities in Wales published their equality objectives and their Strategic Equality Plans in April 2012 which clearly laid out the actions the public sector is taking.

## **Employment**

38. The Government's strategy for increasing ethnic minority employment and participation in the labour market is based around mainstreaming opportunity through locally delivered flexible provision.

39. The help and services delivered through Jobcentre Plus and through Work

Programme providers are designed to allow flexibility and not to treat people according to ethnic groups. Jobcentres and providers need to support all their customers to achieve their targets and outcome payments. So it is in everyone's interest to provide the help needed. The Government does not dictate from the centre what provision is required in each area or for each provider or customer group. Local autonomy and flexibility has replaced the one-size-fits-all approach that has dogged previous employment schemes. Where there are significant numbers of local claimants with a shared ethnic background and common barriers to employment, a provider or Jobcentre may, however, choose to put in place provision designed to help that group.

40. From September 2012, the Department for Work and Pensions has been capturing ethnicity data in line with the Census 2011 categories (which includes, amongst other groups, Gypsies and Irish Travellers) in its Universal Credit Pathfinder districts.

41. The Government Department for Work and Pensions Ethnic's Minority Employment Stakeholder Group shares insight, advice and expertise with policy makers to ensure the Government is developing and implementing policies in a way that will enable us to tackle some of the persistent challenges that remain.

42. The latest ethnic minority employment figures (up to and including December 2013) are encouraging. The ethnic minority employment rate of 59.8% is at its highest since 2008. Ten years ago, the employment rate gap was 15.1 percentage points, while today the gap between the ethnic minority employment rate and the overall employment rate stands at 11.9 percentage points, close to the historical low of 11.0 percentage points in 2010.

43. Ethnic minority businesses in the UK are highly successful and contribute up to £25 billion to the economy, and there are particularly high aspirations to start-up in business among black African and black Caribbean groups. However, a Government-commissioned report on access to finance by ethnic minority business, which was launched by the Deputy Prime Minister in July 2013, shows that, although the banking industry is working hard to ensure ethnic minority businesses have access to finance, there is more to be done to help under-represented groups reach their goals. The Government has therefore encouraged the banking industry to take steps to support ethnic minority entrepreneurs. The British Bankers' Association has agreed to support a range of initiatives to improve the access to finance for ethnic minority businesses.

## Youth Employment

44. The Government's Youth Contract was introduced in April 2012 to provide additional support, worth almost £1 billion, to young unemployed people over three years. The Youth Contract builds on existing support to provide young people with more intensive adviser support and work experience, as well as providing employers with wage incentives and apprenticeship grants to encourage them to recruit young people.

45. Apprenticeships are available to anyone aged 16 or over. The Apprenticeship Grant for Employers was introduced to encourage employers to take on young (16-24) apprentices. Employers with less than 1000 employees may be eligible for a grant of £1,500 for each new apprentice they take on, up to a maximum of 10 apprentices.

### *Wales*

46. The Welsh Apprenticeship programme offers individuals in Wales the opportunity to earn money while they learn, obtain vocational training and build a sustainable career. Apprenticeships also help employers to build a professionally skilled workforce, equipped with the knowledge and experience that their business needs to succeed and compete. Apprenticeships are available at all levels in a wide range of occupations. Some Higher Apprenticeships may include options to study Higher Education qualifications.

47. Under its Annual Remit (2013-14) the Welsh Government commissioned Estyn to conduct a two year thematic review of equality issues relating to the Apprenticeship programmes. The review was to consider engagement and participation barriers facing black, minority ethnic and disabled groups and specifically identify and report on sectoral, ethnicity and gender issues. The interim report and recommendations were published in November 2014, together with the Welsh Government's response. The final report will be published in spring 2015.

48. In Wales, the Traineeship programme for 16-18 year olds aims to support young people gain sustained employment by helping them confidence and motivation, improve their skills levels through the delivery of National Vocational Qualifications in any chosen occupational area, as well as gaining employability skills and valuable work experience, aiding transition into employment. The programme seeks to improve skills levels through the delivery of entry level qualifications up to National Vocational Qualification Level 1 in their chosen occupational area, and elements of National Vocational Qualification Level 2 delivery. This includes the delivery of essential skills qualifications to enhance their learning experience. They also receive valuable work experience and the support and help they need to learn at a pace suitable to them. This can sometimes be with a dedicated employer or through a simulated work environment, depending on the level of support the young person requires.

49. In January 2014, the Welsh Government published its Policy Statement on Skills setting out the ten year ambition for employment and skills policy in Wales. A commitment within the statement was to produce a Skills Implementation Plan which was launched in July 2014. The Welsh Government's ambition is to develop a skills system that supports future competitiveness, helps Wales evolve into a highly skilled society as well as tackle poverty and is sustainable; the primary focus being on raising productivity, reducing barriers into work and supporting people into sustainable employment. An integral part of the Skills Implementation Plan is for the Welsh Government to ensure it can continue to track its employment and skills position relative to the UK and beyond to ensure that Wales remains competitive as a nation and that interventions are delivering

the right outcomes linked to future jobs and growth opportunities. This work will be underpinned by specific Skills Performance Measures (published in September 2014) which focus on:

- Jobs and growth – Monitoring improvements in employment and productivity levels.
- Financial sustainability – Ensuring an appropriate and sustainable balance of funding is available to support the skills system sourced from government, employers, individuals and European funding.
- Equality and equity – Providing equality of opportunity for individuals in accessing post-19 employment and skills support - focussed on age, ethnicity, gender and disability.
- International skills benchmarking – Improving the skills profile of Wales to ensure that we remain competitive as a nation.

50. Jobs Growth Wales will give unemployed young people aged 16-24 work experience for a 6-month period. This will be paid at or above the National Minimum Wage for a minimum of 25 hours per week. The programme aims to create 16,000 jobs over four years. Jobs Growth Wales has been developed to ensure opportunities are available for all job ready young people, including those from ethnic minorities, and will also provide access to opportunities which offer experience through the medium of Welsh.

## **Health**

### *England*

58. The National Health Service is a universal service for the people of the UK, yet there are longstanding inequalities in access to services, in the quality of care, and in health outcomes for patients. Promoting equality and reducing health inequalities lie at the heart of the reformed health service. People have a right to high quality services, irrespective of who they are, where they live, or what condition they have. The Government has introduced the first ever legal duties on health inequalities in England. Since April 2013, the Secretary of State for Health has had a duty to have regard to the need to reduce inequalities between the people of England. National Health Service England and each clinical commissioning group must have regard to the need to reduce inequalities in access to health services and the outcomes achieved for patients.

59. In April 2013 Department of Health refreshed its Equality Objectives 2012 to 2016 and strengthened its Equality Assurance Process. The Health and Social Care Act 2012 introduces the first ever statutory duties relating to addressing inequalities in health. It is critical that work to advance equality and eliminate discrimination is central to all Government work to ensure equitable policy-making and improved health outcomes.

60. Public Health England is leading work to address equality and health inequality issues relating to dementia in England. The work is being taken forward by a broad partnership of statutory and non-statutory organisations. This

includes providing commissioners of local services and policymakers with evidence on the way different equality characteristics are associated with different needs, and spreading examples of best practice.

61. Gypsies and Travellers have poorer health status and higher proportions of self-reported symptoms of ill-health than other groups. The 2011 Census reports that Gypsy or Irish Travellers had the lowest proportion of any ethnic group rating their general health as 'good' or 'very good' at 70%, compared to 81% of the overall population of England and Wales. They can also face barriers in accessing some health care services. The non-governmental organisation, Friends, Families and Travellers, is receiving funding over three years from the Department of Health for a project to influence the design and implementation of commissioning process to address health inequalities experienced by Gypsies and Travellers. This will report in 2015.

### *Wales*

62. Research and evidence shows that Gypsies and Travellers suffer disproportionately when compared with the general population in relation to health status and access to healthcare. To address this, the Welsh Government has completed a public consultation on Travelling to Better Health – guidance for healthcare practitioners on working effectively with Gypsies and Travellers. 27 responses were received and these are now in the process of being analysed for inclusion in the final version which will be published in the spring of 2015.

63. The guidance is presented in three main parts: advice on cultural awareness for the benefit of practitioners; advice on practice which could encourage greater participation in health and health services; and a summary analysis of the research and evidence base which informs the guidance.

64. The revised Health and Homelessness Standards were launched in 2013. The Standards are designed to ensure that homeless and vulnerable people – including Gypsy and Traveller communities in Wales – are able to access primary care and substance misuse services. A report detailing progress with implementing the Standards will be submitted to Welsh Ministers in spring 2015.

## **Mental Health**

### *England*

88. Over £400 million is being invested over the spending review period to make a choice of psychological therapies available for those who need them in all parts of England. We are also investing in improving provision for children and young people, older people and carers, people from ethnic minority groups, people with long-term physical health problems and those with severe mental illness.

89. The Care Quality Commission's 2012-13 report on the Mental Health Act acknowledges that data from the Mental Health Minimum Data Set analysis continue to show people from all black and minority ethnic groups are



overrepresented within inpatient mental health services. The reasons for this are complex. Research studies indicate that rates of detention reflect the need of patients at the time of detention. We know that rates of psychosis, for example, are higher in some ethnic minority communities and that they have to date been less likely to use psychological therapies. They are also more likely to access mental health services in a crisis. We recognise that more work needs to be done to establish the causes of higher rates of mental illness in some communities and how communities access early intervention services.

90. The Department of Health has no evidence that ethnic minority patients are more likely than other detained patients to be restrained when taking into account age, sex and other criteria. But over-representation and increased likelihood to enter mental health services via police S136 or the criminal justice system means that restraint is a particular concern for ethnic minority groups.

91. The Department of Health and Public Health England on the best way to resource and support campaigns to reduce stigma and discrimination in mental health post-2015, when our current funding for the Time to Change campaign ends. Reducing stigma and discrimination remains an important part of the Government's mental health agenda. Our new mental health action plan, Closing the Gap, sets out 25 priorities for essential change in mental health: the fourth priority listed is that we will tackle inequalities around access to mental health services.

92. We are working with the Race Equality Foundation and other stakeholders to try to understand inequalities around access to other services. National Health Service England is also working with ethnic minority community leaders to encourage more people to use psychological therapies.

93. The Ministerial Working Group on Equality in Mental Health has been established to support the Mental Health Equality work-stream of the Mental Health Strategy programme. The group will report to the Mental Health Strategy Ministerial Advisory Group. This will help to ensure that equality issues directly inform strategy implementation and enable the Government to fulfil their duties under the Equality Act 2010 and the Human Rights Act.

### *Wales*

94. Together for Mental Health, our 10 year strategy for improving mental health and wellbeing in Wales, acknowledges attention should be paid to discrimination based on membership of black and ethnic minority groups. This perspective informs the Strategy and Delivery Plan, and ensure services fully account for age, gender, sexuality, physical disability, race, ethnicity and social, cultural and religious background. The Welsh Government currently provides funding to two organisations that work to support black and minority ethnic people with mental health issues, and to raise awareness of the specific difficulties that they face.

95. The development of a national core mental health data set is a Welsh Government commitment within Together for Mental Health. This will standardise data collected at an individual service user level, and will include measuring

outcomes from a holistic service user perspective. In its first phase it will capture ethnicity data in all NHS psychiatric inpatient settings. We are continuing to develop this aspect of the data set in conjunction with the National Health Service Equality and Human Rights Unit and Diverse Cymru. The work has been piloted across Wales in a variety of settings and with all ages. It will be rolled out across the NHS from September 2014.

96. Time to Change Wales has carried out numerous targeted activities within ethnic minority communities to raise awareness of the campaign and to understand the issues and challenges that face individuals when disclosing mental health issues, stigma and discrimination. The campaign has engaged a wide range of groups representing ethnic minority communities to organise awareness-raising events and to encourage their respective members and clients to talk about their experiences of mental health stigma. Time to Change Wales have also attended cultural events organised or led by ethnic minority community groups to gain a deeper understanding of how stigma and discrimination affects diverse communities.

### **Traveller accommodation**

#### *England*

97. The Government believes that local authorities are best placed to assess the needs of their communities and so we have placed responsibility for traveller site provision back with them. Rather than imposing top-down targets which fuelled opposition to development, we are offering local authorities real incentives to develop additional traveller sites in their areas.

98. The Government also provided £50,000 to support a training programme by the Local Government Improvement and Development Agency to raise awareness amongst local councillors of their leadership role in relation to traveller site provision and planning applications for sites.

99. The Government conducts a twice-yearly count of traveller caravans in England which provides information of the number of traveller caravans on authorised private and socially rented sites and the number of unauthorised sites. The Traveller Caravan Counts take place in January and July and are published a few months later.

100. From 2011 to 2015 the Government is providing funding as part of the Affordable Housing Programme to help local authorities and other registered providers in England provide new and refurbished traveller sites in consultation with local communities. It is forecast that the Traveller Pitch Fund is forecast to deliver around 1,000 new and refurbished pitches by March 2015 at a cost of £50 million. Local authorities are given incentives through the New Homes Bonus scheme to deliver new housing, including traveller sites.

#### *Scotland*

101. The Scottish Government believes that decisions about Gypsy/Traveller sites are best made locally. The Scottish Government issues guidance to assist local authorities in making decisions about sites and is currently reviewing much of that guidance and taking forward other related work. It has established a national Gypsy/Traveller Site Working Group, which includes representatives from local authorities, the police, and bodies with close links with the Gypsy/Traveller community. In relation to Gypsy/Traveller sites, the Scottish Government:

- has published revised guidance for Housing Need and Demand Assessments. This guidance has been strengthened in relation to specialist provision, which should include an assessment of current and future need for sites/pitches for Gypsy/Travellers;
- has strengthened the Local Housing Strategy guidance to help to ensure that the needs of Gypsy/Travellers both in relation to availability of sites/pitches and site management and housing related services are adequately addressed in local housing strategies;
- will be publishing guidance to local authorities on a recommended core tenancy agreement for those living on Gypsy/Traveller sites, including information on their rights and responsibilities. We will also be publishing revised guidance to local authorities on the quality standards Gypsy/Traveller sites are expected to meet;
- will review the current guidance on managing unauthorised encampments in Scotland; and
- will investigate the most effective ways for local authorities to share good practice in achieving good outcomes for Gypsy/Travellers and the settled community near Gypsy/Traveller sites.

### *Wales*

102. The Welsh Government published revised guidance on Managing Unauthorised Camping in December 2013 to assist local authorities and stakeholders when responding to encampments in their local area. The Welsh Government also funded the development of the first new local authority Gypsy and Traveller site in Wales since 1997, which opened in April 2014.

103. The Housing (Wales) Act 2014 introduces a new Statutory Duty on local authorities to develop new local authority Gypsy and Traveller sites where there is unmet need. This includes need for both permanent residential and transit sites. Royal Assent was received in September 2014.

104. Residents of local authority owned Gypsy and Traveller sites now also benefit from improved security of tenure as a result of implementing the Mobile Homes (Wales) Act 2013 on these sites. The Welsh Government consulted residents of all affected sites during the consultation process. The Welsh Government has continued to provide at least £1.5 million per annum in grant funding to improve the living conditions of Gypsies and Travellers by supporting a number refurbishment projects on local authority owned sites since 2011. In 2013, it provided £1.75 million for the development of a new local authority

owned Gypsy and Traveller site, the first of its kind in Wales since 1997. In 2015-16 £3.5million will be provided for new sites and refurbishment of existing sites.

## Article 5

- 1 The Parties undertake to promote the conditions necessary for persons belonging to national minorities to maintain and develop their culture, and to preserve the essential elements of their identity, namely their religion, language, traditions and cultural heritage.
- 2 Without prejudice to measures taken in pursuance of their general integration policy, the Parties shall refrain from policies or practices aimed at assimilation of persons belonging to national minorities against their will and shall protect these persons from any action aimed at such assimilation.

## Languages

### *Welsh language*

1. The Welsh Language Board was abolished on 31 March 2012, and its functions were split between the newly formed Welsh Language Commissioner and the Welsh Government. Meri Huws was appointed as the Welsh Language Commissioner and started in the role on 1 April 2012.

2. The principal aim of the Welsh Language Commissioner, an independent body established by the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011, is to promote and facilitate use of the Welsh language. This entails raising awareness of the official status of the Welsh language in Wales and imposing Welsh language standards on organisations.

3. The proposed Welsh-language standards are being created in order to give Welsh-speakers improved, enforceable rights in relation to the Welsh language. They will do this by imposing standards on organisations in relation to service provision, policy making, operations, promotion and record keeping.

4. The first set of standards deal specifically with Local Authorities, National Park Authorities and Welsh Ministers and are due to be made through Regulations by April 2015. Standards will be imposed on other organisations according to a rolling programme set by the Welsh Language Commissioner.

The standards have been prepared with the aim of:

- improving the services Welsh-speakers can expect to receive from organisations in Welsh;
- increasing the use people make of Welsh-language services;
- making it clear to organisations what they need to do in terms of the Welsh language;
- ensuring there is an appropriate degree of consistency in terms of the duties placed on bodies in the same sectors.

### *Gaelic language*

5. The Gaelic Language Act Scotland (2005) established Bòrd na Gàidhlig<sup>10</sup>, with functions to promote the use of Gaelic in Scotland. Among other things Bòrd na Gàidhlig is responsible for preparing a National Gaelic Language Plan 2012-2017 which lists a number of areas for development such as; Arts, Media and Heritage, Workplace, Community and Education. Bòrd na Gàidhlig receives funding directly from the Scottish Government and subsequently funds other Gaelic organisations and specific projects.

6. In 2014, the Scottish Government consulted on the manifesto commitment to explore a parental entitlement to Gaelic medium education for their child. A Bill is currently being prepared and will be introduced to the Scottish Parliament in 2015.

### *Cornish language*

7. The Cornish Language Partnership<sup>11</sup> was set up in 2005 to oversee the implementation of the Cornish Language Development Strategy.<sup>12</sup> The Partnership includes language organisations, local authorities and a number of other organisations who have come together with the aim of promoting Cornish and developing it further in Cornish life. The programme of work it is undertaking is funded by the Department for Communities and Local Government and by Cornwall Council.

8. The Government has provided following funding to the Cornish Language Partnership since 2006:

2006-07	£80,000
2007-08	£80,000
2008-09	£150,000
2009-10	£150,000
2010-11	£150,000
2011-12	£140,000
2012-13	£120,000
2013-14	£100,000
2014-15	£120,000

9. In recent years, there has been an increased interest and participation in celebrating Cornwall's cultural heritage. For example, 5,000 people attended the St Piran's Day celebrations in Redruth in 2014, and many thousands more celebrated across Cornwall, the UK and in communities of Cornish descent around the world. Similarly, the recent excavation of St Piran's Oratory, an important early medieval chapel, has attracted international interest and this will help to develop and maintain the distinct cultural heritage of the Cornish.

10. Cornwall Council's plans for a new Archive for Cornwall, Kresen Kernow,

<sup>10</sup> <http://www.gaidhlig.org.uk/bord/en/>

<sup>11</sup> <http://www.magakernow.org.uk/default.aspx>

<sup>12</sup> <http://www.magakernow.org.uk/default.aspx?page=406>

which will collate the collections, held in the Heritage Environment Record, Cornwall Record Office and the Cornish Studies Library are well advanced. The new resource will significantly improve access to, and understanding of, Cornwall's traditions and cultural heritage through primary sources.

11. BBC Radio Cornwall broadcasts An Nowodhow, a five-minute news programme on a Sunday afternoon. In addition, presenters occasionally use phrases in Cornish to introduce programmes and there are occasional items concerning Cornish or teaching a few words.

12. Radyo an Gernewegva is a web-based service which provides an hour of programming a week, consisting of a mix of chat, news and interviews in Cornish plus music in Cornish or instrumental passages from Cornwall and the other Celtic nations. The programme is now also broadcast by several community radio stations – Source FM, St Austell Bay Radio, Penwith Radio. There is no televised broadcast provision in Cornish.

13. Cornwall Council has adopted a policy of bilingual street names, which is implemented on an incremental basis, with all new or replacement signs carrying both Cornish and English. In addition the policy encourages new street names in Cornish only. To date approximately 14% of the street names in Cornwall are bilingual. Recently the policy has been expanded to include junction names. Some developers are requesting translation services and recently there has been work on a major development scheme by the Duchy of Cornwall, which will have Cornish street names.

14. Business is increasingly using Cornish to brand their products and within their advertising. This is particularly noticeable in the food industry, but also applies to other sectors. In addition large scale attractions, such as Heartlands, are providing bilingual material and using the language in their marketing. This is partly aimed at the visitor, showing the distinctiveness of Cornwall but also because of the sense of ownership of the language and culture among local people. Notable recent developments have been the adoption of bilingual signage by a major supermarket at their Hayle store, working with English Heritage on signage at Tintagel and signage at police headquarters, Cornwall Council and other public buildings.

15. The Sense of Place initiative provides schools with an extensive online library of learning materials relating to Cornish culture, history, language and religion. It also provides teacher training opportunities and supports the curriculum development process within schools. However, schools participation in such initiatives is not mandatory.

16. In 2013, Cornwall Council completed the development of its Agreed Syllabus for Religious Education which places a strong emphasis on the distinctive narrative of religion in Cornwall through its Curriculum Kernewek (Cornish Curriculum) units. Amongst other things, the syllabus helps Cornish children to understand the origins of local celebrations, how Christianity came to Cornwall,

the Celtic Church, the Prayer Book War of 1549, the growth of non-conformity, especially Methodism and Quakerism, and the translation of the New Testament into Cornish.

17. Cornwall Council collects information on the ethnicity of school children, including those identifying as Cornish (48% in 2014 – a rise of 102% since 2006). Monitoring the achievement of those children identifying as Cornish based on individual pupil records does not currently take place in Cornwall, but would not be difficult to implement.

18. Cornwall Council is currently developing a project to create an interactive web-based resource, extending access for everybody to existing and previously unpublished heritage content, including primary source material which will be held at the National Library of Cornwall. Primarily aimed at schools and youth groups, the resource will explore a range of themes including landscape, built environment, religion, politics, language and literature, industry, culture and social change.

19. Courses in Cornish are available to adults through evening classes, intensive courses and online study. A portal website provides information on all options available to the learner and also provides basic learning material. Numbers enrolling on the online course, which began in 2013, stand at 580 at the time of writing. Day schools to support online learners will start in 2015.

20. Education officers from the Cornish Language Partnership provide training for teachers wishing to acquire the skills to teach basic Cornish. Some schools are now providing basic Cornish lessons on a regular basis, while others run after school clubs with a visiting tutor. Currently an accredited assessment system is being developed with the help of the Welsh Joint Education Committee to ensure that public qualifications can be offered to all.

21. The Cornish are involved with and contribute to various and diverse cross-frontier events and festivals and these include:

- Celtic Media Festival, with work submitted each year.
- Lorient festival in Brittany. In 2015 the festival will focus on Cornwall and the Isle of Man.
- Lowender Peran. Cornwall-based Celtic festival which welcomes performers from all the Celtic nations each year.
- Aberfest – Cornish-Breton exchange.



- Cornish traditional musicians and dancers visit festivals in the other Celtic countries every year.
- Pan Celtic Song Festival

22. Cornwall has Observer Status on the British Irish Council which it holds courtesy of its distinct language and takes part in the British Irish Council's Indigenous and Minority Languages working group. It is also a member of the Network for the Promotion of Linguistic Diversity, which promotes and encourages the exchange of good practice, links and practical joint projects.

## Article 6

- 1 The Parties shall encourage a spirit of tolerance and intercultural dialogue and take effective measures to promote mutual respect and understanding and co-operation among all persons living on their territory, irrespective of those persons' ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious identity, in particular in the fields of education, culture and the media.
- 2 The Parties undertake to take appropriate measures to protect persons who may be subject to threats or acts of discrimination, hostility or violence as a result of their ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious identity.

### *England*

1. The Government's policies to help create the conditions for integration (see Article 4 above) include supports for projects which encourage faith communities to find common ground.

2. Launched in 2011, Near Neighbours uses the infrastructure of the Church of England to build productive working relationships between people of different faiths at local level in five key localities in England, thus maximising the impact of faith based social action and creating more integrated communities. It aims to bring people from different faith backgrounds (and of no faith) together to help improve their neighbourhoods around the country.

3. The Together in Service Fund is supported by the Government and administered by the charity FaithAction. Up to £300,000 is available over two years in small grants to facilitate new multi faith social action projects at the local level. The aim is to build understanding between faith groups and those without religious beliefs, and celebrate what faith groups contribute to neighbourhoods and to wider society.

4. Many Muslim organisations hold events around the country to coincide with Ramadan. This includes 'Big Iftar' events where Muslims break fast with neighbours from all walks of life and all faiths in order to engage with their local community. It is about inviting other communities in to experience and share the spirit of Ramadan. Multi-faith iftars can happen inside mosques, community centres, public places (subject to prior approval) and even hosted by Muslim families. Many Big Iftar events are taking place in high profile mosques in London, Leicester, Leeds and other cities.

### *Scotland*

5. The Scottish Government values its diverse faith communities and the important role they play in making Scotland the place we want it to be - a safer,

stronger and more inclusive society where all can live in peace and realise their potential both as individuals and as members of wider society.

6. Scottish Government continues to work closely with organisations within the Jewish and Muslim communities, such as the Muslim Council of Scotland and the Scottish Council of Jewish Communities. Scottish Government Ministers engage frequently in bi-lateral meetings with these organisations and attend a variety of national and community based events as part of a programme of support, which shows a clear commitment to countering intolerance and promoting inclusion. Since 2014, Scottish Government ministers have undertaken over 50 public engagements with faith communities, fully recognising their positive contribution to Scotland's civic life.

7. The Scottish Government has allocated funding of over £1,265,500 to faith projects over the period 2012-15 from the Equality Fund.

8. Interfaith Scotland and interfaith projects across Scotland bring together faith communities and create opportunities for interfaith and cross-cultural awareness and understanding. The Scottish Government funded Interfaith Scotland with £360,000 for 2012-15 to provide a range of services, including interfaith dialogue seminars and events, faith awareness training and interfaith resources and advice to local and national government and other private, voluntary and statutory bodies.

9. Faith in Community Scotland was established in 2005 as an anti-poverty organisation which supports local faith-based anti-poverty initiatives to develop and flourish. Faith in Community Scotland aims to increase the capacity of faith communities to engage with the public sector and other third sector providers to reduce inequality and promote equality, through the provision of information, training, networking and advice.

10. The Scottish Government has provided Faith in Community Scotland with £300,476 (2013-15) to fund its project Tackling Sectarianism Together which will contribute to tackling intra-Christian sectarianism in Scotland. The work focuses on local churches in vulnerable communities working together to develop a range of local activities which help build positive relationships across religious divides.

11. The Scottish Government provides funding to the Scottish Council of Jewish Communities to support the production of Minority Ethnic Matters Overview, a weekly digest aimed at informing minority ethnic communities about issues at the UK and Scottish Parliaments, media coverage, funding and training opportunities, consultations and publications; and an outreach project which makes contact and builds connections with isolated Jewish people throughout Scotland.

12. The Faith and Belief Scotland Project focused on local authority provision for people of faith and belief in terms of Public Sector Equality Duty requirements – including investigating any concerns and difficulties local authority face in their attempts to accommodate people of faith, and the perceived level of provision and inclusion by people of faith and belief.

## *Wales*

13. The Welsh Government's Faith Communities Forum meets twice a year and is attended by representatives of all the major faith groups in Wales. It is chaired by the First Minister with the Minister for Communities and Tackling Poverty as deputy chair.

## **Tackling Hate Crime**

### *England*

23 The Government is committed to tackling all hate crime. Its short- to medium-term strategy is to marginalise extremists by building community resilience, out-flanking and isolating perpetrators, and by preventing and tackling hate crime head-on. The Government has built and funded a range of projects aimed at preventing and tackling hate crime. In the long run, the Government believes that integration is the solution, and measures to promote integration are covered earlier in this report. It is important to note that the Government believes that there should be no "hierarchy of hate" and that no single strand - be it race, sexual orientation, religion, disability or gender identity - is more important than any other. The Government is striving to ensure that all victims of hate crime receive the same high level of service and support, as we all have a right to live free from targeted abuse.

24. In addition to the specific aggravated offences under the Crime and Disorder Act 1998, section 145 of the Criminal Justice Act 2003 places a general duty on courts to treat more seriously any offence that can be shown to be racially or religiously aggravated or motivated or where the perpetrator demonstrated such hostility.

25. The Government's hate crime strategy, Challenge it, Report it, Stop It was published in January 2012 and updated in May 2014. This cross-Government action plan brings together the work of a range of Departments and agencies under three core principles to: prevent hate crime happening in the first place; increase reporting and victims' access to support; and improve the operational response to hate crimes.

26. The hate crime action plan outlines local initiatives as well as activity across Government. Completed action include: publishing a new Hate Crime Manual for police officers; supporting Show Racism the Red Card to work with school children; supporting the True Vision website for reporting hate crime online, supporting civil society to challenge those who use inappropriate language on social media; backing Holocaust Memorial Day Trust, which promotes learning lessons from all genocides since the Holocaust and working alongside the Anne Frank Trust with school children to challenge prejudice and discrimination.

27. Show Racism the Red Card is an anti-racism education charity which utilises the high profile of professional footballers as anti-racism role-models to educate

against racism in society. The campaign has been very successful and now involves hundreds of top footballers and managers. They produce a number of educational resources including; films, education packs, posters and magazines. The Government funded Show Racism the Red Card a total of £201,000 over two years (2012-14) to provide workshops to young people in schools and to produce an education pack aimed at young people to equip them to reject the narratives used by the English Defence League. The education pack is designed for long term use by teachers working with young people to challenge such narratives and will be distributed to schools across England.

28. We have strengthened our legal framework to ensure that the aggravating factors available to the courts at the sentencing stage are consistent across all five monitored strands of hate crime. We believe that getting the response to hate crime right depends on deep local knowledge so the lead must come from professionals at the front line, working with Police and Crime Commissioners, the voluntary sector and communities to respond to local issues and priorities.

29. The Government continues to work with the police and criminal justice agencies, local partners and voluntary agencies to address under-reporting, particularly in isolated communities, by encouraging victims to come forward. This will give us a better picture of the scale of the problem, and also help the police to focus their resources to better protect victims. The inclusion of hate crime questions in the extensive 'Crime Survey of England and Wales' provides an accurate indicator of the extent of under-reporting and we believe that transparent reporting of recorded crime allows the community to see evidence of progress and to challenge performance locally.

30. Tackling internet hate crime is a challenging task, but one that the Government is committed to. Many Internet Service Providers, including all reputable UK Internet Service Providers, will remove on request material that is illegal or where it breaches their wider terms and conditions for acceptable use. We have contributed to the International Cyber-Hate Working Group to collaborate with the internet industry leaders to identify opportunities to reduce the harm caused by hate material on the Internet, while protecting the right to freedom of speech.

31. We acknowledge that hate crime is under-reported and are committed to establishing better hate crime data. Having better data is crucial in building effectively and efficiently on our efforts to prevent and tackle it, and to protect and support victims.

32. Police forces in England, Wales and Northern Ireland started collecting separate data on the five monitored strands of hate crime (race; religion (including atheism); disability; sexual orientation; and gender identity) in April 2008. These were added to the National Crime Statistics from April 2011. Crime survey findings and court proceedings and convictions were published in December 2013 and are available on the UK Government's website. The latest annual hate crime statistics were published in October 2014.

*Scotland*

33. In December 2008, the Scottish Government published its Race Equality Statement for 2008-11 (see above). In 2009, the Scottish Government supported legislative change to strengthen the criminal law in dealing with hate crime, and current data collection in Scotland includes a variety of statistics relating to hate crime. This encompasses statistics about people convicted in court for "aggravated" crimes, including hate crimes relating the protected characteristics of race, religion, disability, sexual orientation and gender reassignment. Working with key partners, the Scottish Government developed the Speak Up Against Hate Crime campaign in February 2014. The campaign raised awareness about the nature of hate crime and encouraged reporting of all incidents.

### *Wales*

34. The Welsh Government launched Tackling Hate Crimes and Incidents: A Framework for Action in May 2014, following a period of consultation where 120 responses were received. The Framework aims to tackle hostility and prejudice across the protected characteristics of race, religion, disability, sexual orientation and gender reassignment. It identifies how the Welsh Government can work with partners across three key objectives on prevention, supporting victims and increasing the multi-agency response. The Welsh Government underpinned the development of the framework with evidence from a three year study with the victims of hate crime in Wales (the "All Wales Hate Crime Research Project").

35. Outside of the recorded strands of hate crimes, the Welsh Government has also extended the scope of the Framework to include age, cyber-hate, hate crime and far right hate. Delivery is being monitored through an annual delivery plan and is being overseen by an Independent Advisory Group with representatives from the Third Sector who will provide advice to the Minister for Communities and Tackling Poverty.

36. To support delivery of the Framework the Welsh Government has funded a national Third Party Reporting Centre through Victim Support Cymru from 2014-17. This aims to increase recording of hate crimes in Wales and to provide enhanced advocacy and support for hate crime victims. The Welsh Government has established a Hate Crime Criminal Justice Board to work with non-devolved partners, including the police, the Crown Prosecution Service and prisons to tackle hate crime. The Board has a delivery programme which contributes to the Hate Crime Framework's annual deliver plan.

37. The Welsh Government supports Show Racism the Red Card and in 2014-15 has provided a grant of £60,000 for sports related anti-bullying activities along with a new project to develop a toolkit and teacher training on settling Gypsy, Roma and Traveller children in school, with particular reference to means of tackling stigmatisation and bullying.

### **Tackling anti-Semitism**

42. The Government is strongly committed to tackling anti-Semitism. The UK's

Jewish community, like all communities, must be able to live their lives free from fear of verbal or physical attack. The Government believes the best way to tackle anti-Semitism is through effective implementation of strong legislation against racial and religious discrimination and racially and religiously motivated crime.

43. The cross-government working group on anti-Semitism brings together departments from across Government, the Jewish community and other partners; the group ensures a joined-up approach to implementing the accepted recommendations of the All-Party Inquiry into Anti-Semitism. The expertise in the group and practical output lends itself to benefiting other communities that suffer from hate crime.

44. The National Community Tension Team carries out community impact assessments for Counter Terrorism operations and almost always identifies Jewish communities for reassurance activity. The National Community Tension Team coordinates a national operation to ensure security and reassure Jewish communities during High Holy Days. There formalised exchanges of data between the Jewish community's Community Security Trust and police forces covering the majority of the UK's Jewish population.

45. Online anti-Semitism is a serious concern. The Community Security Trust is part of the Ministry of Justice's Hate Crime IAG participation in the International Cyberhate Working Group, which published Best Practices for Responding to Cyberhate, in cooperation with the social networks in 2014. The Government have also funded the Society of Editors to develop a best practice guide for on-line moderators of user generated content.

### **Tackling anti-Muslim hatred**

46. The Government has set up the first ever cross-Government working group on Anti-Muslim Hatred. The working group has been established to consider and take forward proposals to tackle anti-Muslim hatred. The Group will review trends in anti-Muslim sentiment and hatred and make recommendations to Government. They have since inception:

- Assessed the role of the media – there is on-going work being done with the Society of Editors to tackle anti-Muslim hatred.
- Strengthened the evidence base of anti-Muslim prejudice.
- Helped to highlight the contributions and sacrifice made by Muslim soldiers in the First World War.
- Involved in commemorating the UK's first ever Srebrenica Memorial Day.
- Supported Integration road shows held by Ministers.

47. Though anti-Muslim hatred is not explicitly a race issue, it does affect those of other faiths but similar ethnicities, either due to ignorance or mistaken identity. Measures to eradicate anti-Muslim hatred therefore also protect others of Asian descent. They are thus to some extent also anti-racist measures. The Government has:

- Promoted projects to highlight the contributions and sacrifices of

Commonwealth (and especially Muslim) soldiers during the First World War;

- Funded Tell MAMA (measuring Anti-Muslim Attacks) project, first service to record incidents of anti-Muslim hatred and support victims. Tell MAMA provides a one stop service for those who have suffered anti-Muslim attacks. It links victims to appropriate support services; collects and collates data on attacks; and works with the police to improve reporting and recording. Tell MAMA has been well received by police; endorsed by the Metropolitan, Greater Manchester and British Transport Police Forces

### *Scotland*

48. The Scottish Government values the Muslim community and the important role it plays in making Scotland the place we want it to be – a safer, stronger and more inclusive society where all can live in peace and realise their potential, both as individuals and as members of wider society. We work to ensure that efforts to demonise or commit hate crime against Scotland's Muslim community, or any other community, are met with zero tolerance.

49. Hate crime statistics published for 2013-14 show that there has been a 15% reduction in charges reported in Scotland with a religious aggravation compared to 2012-13, including a reduction in offences which were derogatory towards Islam, from 80 charges (12% of the total) in 2012-13 to 48 charges (8% of the total) in 2013-14. These reductions are encouraging and a testament to the hard work taking place to tackle these offences. The Scottish Government recognises, however, that there is still more work to be done, including encouraging increased reporting of hate crime incidents.

50. Good interfaith relations make an important contribution to the improvement we have seen. Scotland is highly regarded in the international interfaith community as a leader in this field and the Scottish Government supports the development of inter faith dialogue through its intermediary stakeholder, Interfaith Scotland. Scottish Government Ministers have regular meetings with representatives and members of the Muslim community. Since the launch of Islam Awareness Week in Glasgow on 17 March 2014, at which the Minister for Community Safety and Legal Affairs delivered a speech, there have been ten Ministerial meetings with members of the Muslim community, including a visit to the Glasgow Central Mosque by the First Minister; a meeting between the Cabinet Secretary for Justice and representatives of the Muslim Council of Scotland to discuss third party reporting; and a visit by the Cabinet Secretary for Justice to the Aberdeen Mosque and Islamic Centre. Following the terrorist attacks in Paris in January 2015, the Scottish Government liaised closely with the Muslim Council of Scotland to ensure the most appropriate response.

### *Wales*

51. The Welsh Government has been working closely with Muslim communities to provide them with reassurance of support following high profile news stories about the Muslim community in Cardiff. There have been a number of meetings with representatives of the community by the Minister for Communities and



Tackling Poverty in 2014. The Minister for Public Services spoke at a conference which was organised by the Cardiff Prevent Stakeholder Group to look at issues around extremism. Muslim communities have been informed of the Welsh Government's framework for action on hate crime and how to contact Victim Support to receive advocacy and support. The national hate crime reporting centre, funded by Welsh Government and run by Victim Support, works closely with TELL MAMA to increase reporting among Muslim communities.

### **Ethnic minorities and the criminal justice system**

52. In December 2011, the Government commissioned Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary to carry out an inspection into the use of stop and search legislation by police forces in England and Wales. Much of the debate about stop and search has focused on the disproportionate impact it has on black and minority ethnic people. For example, black people were stopped and searched seven times more than white people in 2009-10. Concerns about this led to the Equality and Human Rights Commission examining the use of powers of stop and search in five forces in March 2010 and later initiating enforcement action, using their regulatory powers, on two forces that had high levels of race disproportionality. Following this, a larger number of forces agreed with the Commission to address the race disproportionality, which resulted in the report '*Stop and think again: Towards race equality in police PACE stop and search*'.

53. Following an extensive public consultation in the summer of 2013, the Home Secretary announced a comprehensive package of reform measures to ensure that these powers are used fairly, effectively and with the confidence of local communities. The measures announced included a College of Policing review of national training on stop and search for all ranks of officer, an amendment to Police and Criminal Evidence Code of Practice A to make clear what constitutes 'reasonable grounds for suspicion', the legal basis of most stop and searches, mapping stop and searches on Police. UK and the creation of a voluntary Best Use of Stop and Search Scheme, which, amongst other things, will restrict and reduce the section 60 "no suspicion" stop and search powers and improve transparency and accountability. Other measure included a Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary commissioned thematic on other stop powers, such as those used in road traffic legislation, to understand whether these are being used effectively, fairly and proportionately.

54. Since 2010, the Equality and Human Rights Commission has been working with five police forces on unfair use of stop and search powers and Dorset Police, Leicestershire Constabulary, Thames Valley Police and the Metropolitan Police Service all saw drops in their disproportionate use of stop and search against Black and Asian people. This work will continue and there is a continuing reduction in crime rates.

### **Representation of Black and Minority Ethnic people in Police Forces and the Criminal Justice System**

57. Equality and diversity are vitally important in the context of policing our

diverse communities. Improved diversity in the police is vital in the fight against crime. The Government recognises that the police have made significant progress on equality and diversity, but it is essential that more and faster progress is made in these areas.

58. Change is being driven locally. Each police force manages its own recruitment process, deciding when and how many officers to recruit. All candidates to join the police are judged according to a nationally standardised recruitment and selection process. The local accountability provided by Police and Crime Commissioners will ensure that public priorities are acted upon, victims are consulted, and the needs of the most vulnerable groups and individuals are heard and understood.

59. As at 31 March 2014, there were 6,715 minority ethnic police officers in England and Wales, up 178 from 6,537 at 31 March 2013. The proportion of black and minority ethnic officers has remained constant at 5%. This is in the context of an overall decrease of full-time equivalent police officers in the 43 police forces of England and Wales as at 31 March 2014 to 127,909, a decrease of 1.3% or 1,674 officers compared to a year earlier.  
Northern Ireland

### **Police Code of Conduct and Police complaints**

64. Under the police code of conduct police officers have a particular responsibility to act with fairness and impartiality in all their dealings with the public. Officers are required to treat members of the public with courtesy and respect, act in a professional manner at all times and avoid favouritism and all forms of harassment, victimisation or unreasonable discrimination. Racist behaviour by members of the police service is unacceptable and will not be tolerated. Anyone who believes they have been a victim of police misconduct has the right to make a complaint. Complaints are first made to the Chief Officer of the Force concerned, or the Independent Police Complaints Commission. The Commission is the statutory guardian of police complaints system and is an independent body, independent of the police and government.

65. The legacy of the racist murder of Stephen Lawrence and his family's fight for justice have profoundly changed the way the UK Government and citizens see and deal with racism, racial justice and tackling hate crime. The Commission revised its Statutory Guidance on 1 April 2010. Allegations are now upheld where the findings of an investigation show that the service provided was below the standard a reasonable person could expect, rather than as formerly hinging on evidence of misconduct being found.

66. The Independent Police Complaints Commission 2011-12 confidence survey found that 40% of respondents from ethnic minorities feared police harassment if they made complaints, compared to 17% of white respondents.

67. Research commissioned by the Independent Police Complaints Commission asked a representative sample of the British public about their awareness of the

Commission, willingness to complain, and knowledge of how to complain. The percentage of people willing to complain was up from 59% in 2009 to 68% in 2011. The survey also showed that public perceptions of the police complaints system and the Independent Police Complaints Commission are positive and stable, but that some key groups remain more sceptical of the system and less inclined to use it - young people, ethnic minorities, and people from lower socio-economic backgrounds. 40% of people from ethnic minorities had reported compared with 17% of White respondents.

68. The Macpherson Report's recommendations have led to improved treatment of victims and witnesses, including provision of police Family Liaison Officers, and keeping victims informed at all stages of the criminal justice process. Figures from the Crime Survey for England and Wales 2012 show satisfaction and confidence figures are the same for black and minority ethnic communities as they are for white communities.

### **Counter-terrorism**

69. Following a review in 2010-11, the Government changed the counter terrorism powers to make them more effective and targeted. The Government repealed terrorism stop and search powers under section 44 of the Terrorism Act 2000. These were replaced with a much more limited power to enable the police to stop and search people and vehicles without reasonable suspicion, but only in exceptional circumstances where there is a real threat of terrorist attack.

70. Following a review of counter-terrorism powers, the Prevention of Terrorism Act 2005 was repealed in 2011 and replaced with the Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures Act 2011. The Government continues to reject the view that control orders and Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures have had a negative effect on certain groups and has seen no evidence to support this view. Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures notices may only be imposed when the conditions laid down in the Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures Act 2011 are met. The Counter-Terrorism and Security Act increases the threshold for the imposition of a Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures notice in recognition of the stringent preventative measures which may be imposed. The threshold is that the Secretary of State must be satisfied on the balance of probabilities that an individual is, or has been, involved in terrorism-related activity and it is necessary and proportionate to impose a Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures notice in order to protect the public from a risk of terrorism by preventing or restricting the individual's involvement in terrorism-related activity.

71. The Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures Act sets out exhaustively the types of measures which may be imposed and, like control orders, the order itself and the measures within it are automatically subject to intense, detailed and automatic scrutiny by the court. In every case reviewed to date, the Court has decided that the Secretary of State had reasonable grounds for believing that the subject is or has been involved in terrorism related activity and that it was necessary and proportionate to impose a Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures notice to protect the public from the risk of terrorism.

72. The operation of the Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures Act is reviewed annually by the Independent Reviewer of Terrorism Legislation. His most recent report was published in March 2015. A Written Ministerial Statement is also laid before Parliament quarterly, reporting on the operation of the Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures Act during the previous three month period. These publicly available documents provide extensive detail on the use of Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures, however we do not routinely collect data on the religious belief or ethnic origin of Terrorism Prevention and Investigation Measures subjects.

## Article 7

The Parties shall ensure respect for the right of every person belonging to a national minority to freedom of peaceful assembly, freedom of association, freedom of expression, and freedom of thought, conscience and religion.

## Article 8

The Parties undertake to recognise that every person belonging to a national minority has the right to manifest his or her religion or belief and to establish religious institutions, organisations and associations.

1. The rights to freedom of expression, association, peaceful assembly and thought, conscience and religion are longstanding and well-respected rights in the UK, which has a long tradition of religious tolerance and diversity. They are all guaranteed under the Human Rights Act 1998. These rights are further reinforced by the UK's legislation on equalities and hate crime which protects all individuals from discrimination on grounds of religion or belief and religiously aggravated hate crime (see Articles 4 and 6 above).

## Article 9

- 1 The Parties undertake to recognise that the right to freedom of expression of every person belonging to a national minority includes freedom to hold opinions and to receive and impart information and ideas in the minority language, without interference by public authorities and regardless of frontiers. The Parties shall ensure, within the framework of their legal systems, that persons belonging to a national minority are not discriminated against in their access to the media.
- 2 Paragraph 1 shall not prevent Parties from requiring the licensing, without discrimination and based on objective criteria, of sound radio and television broadcasting, or cinema enterprises.
- 3 The Parties shall not hinder the creation and the use of printed media by persons belonging to national minorities. In the legal framework of sound radio and television broadcasting, they shall ensure, as far as possible, and taking into account the provisions of paragraph 1, that persons belonging to national minorities are granted the possibility of creating and using their own media.
- 4 In the framework of their legal systems, the Parties shall adopt adequate measures in order to facilitate access to the media for persons belonging to national minorities and in order to promote tolerance and permit cultural pluralism.

## Article 10

- 1 The Parties undertake to recognise that every person belonging to a national minority has the right to use freely and without interference his or her minority language, in private and in public, orally and in writing.
- 2 In areas inhabited by persons belonging to national minorities traditionally or in substantial numbers, if those persons so request and where such a request corresponds to a real need, the Parties shall endeavour to ensure, as far as possible, the conditions which would make it possible to use the minority language in relations between those persons and the administrative authorities.
- 3 The Parties undertake to guarantee the right of every person belonging to a national minority to be informed promptly, in a language which he or she understands, of the reasons for his or her arrest, and of the nature and cause of any accusation against him or her, and to defend himself or herself in this language, if necessary with the free assistance of an interpreter.

### *Welsh language*

1. S4C is the Welsh language broadcaster. As a public service broadcaster, it commissions independent producers from across Wales to make the majority of its programmes. ITV Cymru Wales is also commissioned to produce programmes. BBC Cymru Wales provides around 10 hours of programming per week for S4C, including news and daily soap *Pobol y Cwm*, funded out of the licence fee. S4C broadcasts over 115 hours of programmes each week.

2. From April 2013, the BBC became S4C's majority funder, through the licence fee (S4C was previously majority-funded by the UK Government through grant-in-aid). An operating agreement in place between S4C and the BBC Trust protects the editorial, managerial and operational independence of S4C. The change in funding arrangements was implemented through the Public Bodies Act 2011, which also placed a new statutory duty on the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport to ensure that S4C's funding is sufficient to fulfil its remit.

3. On 26 June 2013 the Chancellor announced spending plans for the year 2015 to 2016, and confirmed that the Department for Culture, Media and Sport settlement would include 'support for minority language broadcasting – maintaining S4C funding and investing in BBC Alba'. In 2015/16 S4C will continue to receive £6.787m of funding the Department for Culture, Media and Sport. S4C's funding is outlined below:

Year	Total funding (£m)	From DCMS (£m)	From BBC (£m)
2012-13	83	83	0
2013-14	82.861	6.561	76.3
2014-15	82.787	6.787	76

4. In addition to this, the current operating agreement between the BBC and S4C sets out further licence fee funding for 2016-17 (£74.5m). In December 2013 as part of the Autumn Statement it was announced that S4C had been protected from any budget reductions and that funding for S4C would be maintained at the levels set out in the Spending Review earlier that year.

### *Gaelic language*

5. MG ALBA is a public body, set up by UK legislation. Its principal functions relate to the provision of Gaelic programmes. MG ALBA is funded predominantly by the Scottish Government, who are under an obligation to provide such funding as they determine to be appropriate (currently £11.8 million p.a.), with further support from the BBC in the form of £4m programme funding p.a. (including news) and distribution and in-kind support.

6. In the Autumn Statement, December 2013, the UK Government confirmed that the £1 million of extra funding in 2016 for MG Alba, set out in the Spending Review earlier that year, would not be affected by budget reductions. This was

then followed by a further £1 million for 2014-15 announced in August 2014 – doubling Government's commitment for the period 2014-16. In addition, the Scottish First Minister announced £1m further funding from the Scottish Government in 2014-15 towards the production of original programming.

7. MG ALBA works in partnership with the BBC to operate the channel, BBC ALBA. The channel has been available on the Freeview Digital Terrestrial Television platform since 2011. Scottish viewers receive the live stream from BBC ALBA, and its programmes are also available on-demand via iplayer for the rest of the UK.

#### *Scots language*

8. The Scots Language Centre continues to receive funding from the Scottish Government and take the lead in promoting Scots through social media. The Scots Language Centre also runs a regular Scots Radio Podcast. Recently some graphic novels and children's books have been translated into Scots and are proving to be popular with parents and children. This includes some Roald Dahl children's books and recently Tintin and Asterix graphic novels.

9. The National Library of Scotland in association with DC Thompson Publishers produced a website in 2014 entitled Oor Wullie's guide tae Scots Language that was officially launched by Dr Allan, Minister for Learning, Science and Scotland's languages. This website aims to help primary school pupils studying Scots language in schools and help older parents and grandparents rekindle their love of Scots language as their child learns interactively.

#### *Irish and Ulster Scots languages*

10. The UK Government confirmed in the 2013 Autumn Statement the continued funding of the Irish Language Broadcast Fund (£3million) and the Ulster Scots Broadcast Fund (£1million) into 2016. The length of the funding settlement, up to the end of the spending review period 2015-16, is in line with that for all UK publicly-funded bodies.

*Cornish language- see Article 3 above.*



## Article 11

- 1 The Parties undertake to recognise that every person belonging to a national minority has the right to use his or her surname (patronym) and first names in the minority language and the right to official recognition of them, according to modalities provided for in their legal system.
- 2 The Parties undertake to recognise that every person belonging to a national minority has the right to display in his or her minority language signs, inscriptions and other information of a private nature visible to the public.
- 3 In areas traditionally inhabited by substantial numbers of persons belonging to a national minority, the Parties shall endeavour, in the framework of their legal system, including, where appropriate, agreements with other States, and taking into account their specific conditions, to display traditional local names, street names and other topographical indications intended for the public also in the minority language when there is a sufficient demand for such indications

### *Welsh language*

1. Signage is covered by the Welsh Language Schemes of public bodies in Wales, and is therefore routinely provided bilingually in Welsh and English. Signage is listed in Schedule 9 of the Welsh Language Measure 2011 as an activity to which service delivery standards must be specified. The regulations to make standards are currently being prepared and will include duties regarding signage.

### *Gaelic language*

2. Ainmean-Àite na h-Alba is an advisory body on Gaelic place names. It was set up in 2003 to provide Gaelic translations of place names for bilingual road signs. They continue to assist local authorities who are erecting new, or replacing old, bilingual signs. At present there are plans to place bilingual signs on the A9 and Ainmean-Àite na h-Alba is again assisting with this.

3. *Cornish language- see Article 3 above.*

## Article 12

- 1 The Parties shall, where appropriate, take measures in the fields of education and research to foster knowledge of the culture, history, language and religion of their national minorities and of the majority.
- 2 In this context the Parties shall inter alia provide adequate opportunities for teacher training and access to textbooks, and facilitate contacts among students and teachers of different communities.
- 3 The Parties undertake to promote equal opportunities for access to education at all levels for persons belonging to national minorities.

## Education

### *England*

1. The Government's approach is to move away from treating people as groups or 'equality strands' who get special treatment. Instead we have developed frameworks that help create fairness and opportunities for everyone. This includes measures to improve literacy, numeracy and the quality of teaching; overhauling the Special Educational Needs Programme so that children's needs are identified and addressed early and targeting resource (now some £2.5 billion a year) through the pupil premium to help break the link between socio-economic background and educational achievement. The programme disproportionately benefits pupils from black and minority ethnic communities.

2. The aim of the pupil premium is to raise the attainment of disadvantaged pupils, and thereby improve social mobility in the longer term, breaking the cycle of disadvantage from one generation to the next. It is provided to state maintained schools for every disadvantaged pupil on roll.

3. Disadvantaged pupils are defined as pupils who are currently registered for free school meals or have been at any point in the last six years; have been looked after by the local authority for a day or more; have been adopted from care or who left care under a Special Guardianship, Residence or Child Arrangements Order. There is no adjustment for ethnicity.

4. In 2012-13, at the end of key stage 4, 78.8% of Traveller of Irish Heritage pupils; 65.2% of Gypsy/Roma pupils; 45% of Black Caribbean pupils; 44.4% of Pakistani pupils; and 23.4% of White British pupils were eligible for the pupil premium. The pupil premium is additional funding granted to schools to raise the attainment of children from low income families, irrespective of their background or their current level of achievement. The criterion used for allocating the pupil premium includes the number of pupils eligible for free school meals during the past six years.

5. Many Black and minority ethnic minority pupils in England attain well at school.

In 2014, at the end of primary school (key stage 2), Chinese (88%), Indian (86%), Irish (84%) and Bangladeshi (81%) pupil groups performed above the national average (79%) in terms of reaching or exceeding the expected level (level 4) in Reading, Writing and Mathematics. At key stage 4, Chinese (74.4%), Indian (72.9%), Irish (65.9%), Bangladeshi (61.3%) and Black African (56.8%) pupil groups attained 5 or more GCSEs at grades A\*-C, including English and Maths. These groups attained above the national average for all pupils of 56.6%.

6. As a group, Black Caribbean and Pakistani pupils perform below the national average at both key stage 2 and 4, although they have generally made more progress than other pupils in recent years. In 2014, 73% of Black Caribbean pupils and 75% of Pakistani pupils attained or exceeded the expected level for Reading, Writing and Mathematics compared to the national average of 79%. At key stage 4, 47% of Black Caribbean pupils and 51.4% of Pakistani pupils achieved the standard GCSE, measure compared to the national average of 56.6%.

7. Gypsy, Roma and Traveller of Irish Heritage pupils are the lowest performing ethnic group. In 2014, 29% of Gypsy/Roma pupils and 38% of Traveller of Irish Heritage pupils reached or exceeded the expected level in Reading, Writing and Mathematics, compared to the national average of 79%. At key stage 4, 8.2% of Gypsy/Roma and 14% of Traveller of Irish Heritage pupils achieved the standard GCSE measure, compared to the national average of 56.6%. However, it should be noted that the attainment data on Gypsy/Roma and Traveller of Irish Heritage pupils within this report should be treated with caution due to the very small pupil numbers.

8. The Government's ambition is for every child, whatever their background or circumstance, to have the opportunity to attain well at school. The Government recognises the variation that exists between different groups of pupils, including in relation to disadvantage, ethnicity and gender. Those variations reflect a complex and interwoven range of factors including, but not limited to, socio-economic; cultural; linguistic; geographical; and inter-generational aspects. The Government believes that a school led system underpinned by strong accountability measures offers the best way forward in improving pupil attainment and addressing underperformance of particular groups of pupils.

9. There is strong evidence of the impact of high quality early education on children's development and future attainment. The Government extended funded early education for all three- and four-year-olds to 570 hours a year (usually taken as 15 hour a week for 38 weeks) in September 2010. But children from disadvantaged families are less likely than their peers to access early education. Improving outcomes for these children is the focus of the Government's early learning for two-year-olds programme.

10. Since September 2013, approximately 20% of all two-year-olds (primarily those from families that meet the criteria used for the provision of free school meals) have been entitled to a funded early learning place. From September 2014, the programme was extended to include low income working families to reach around 40% of two-year-olds in England. To support this programme the

Government provided local authorities with £755million in 2014-15.

11. By October 2014, local authorities reported that around 150,000 two-year-olds were already accessing a place. The Government is continuing to work with local authorities to ensure that parents of all eligible children are made aware of the entitlement and supported to take up a place. In this, the Government is aware that cultural factors play an important role in decisions about whether children participate in early education.

12. From April 2015 the Government will make £50 million available for an Early Years Pupil Premium which will support disadvantaged three and four year olds in early years settings to help them close the attainment gap between children from disadvantaged backgrounds and their peers from more affluent backgrounds. Early years providers will have the flexibility to spend this extra funding on the strategies that they think will be most effective at improving the quality of early years education for their disadvantaged children.

13. The Government publishes comprehensive performance data on pupil attainment and progress, including differences between groups of pupils. The Government has also reformed the school inspection arrangements to ensure that inspectors focus on core issues, including how well the school meets the needs of the range of its pupils. In addition, the Government is introducing new measures to ensure that schools are held to account for the attainment and progress of all their pupils and to discourage disproportionate attention being given to pupils on the threshold of particular exam grade boundaries.

14. The Government's approach to bullying now provides a reformed legal framework to give teachers greater scope to tackle bullying and a clear remit for the Office for Standards in Education (Ofsted) to hold schools to account.

15. The Government has given Ofsted the powers to hold schools to account on how well they deal with behaviour and bullying. Since 2012, inspectors have had to consider pupils' freedom from bullying, harassment and discrimination. Inspectors consider amongst other things: types, rates and patterns of bullying and the effectiveness of the school's actions to prevent and tackle all forms of bullying and harassment. In addition, inspectors consider the effectiveness of the school's actions to prevent and tackle discriminatory and derogatory language, and pupils' (and different groups of pupils') views, of their experiences and others' behaviour and attitudes towards them.

16. The Government is providing £4 million of funding over two years from 2013 to four anti-bullying organisations through the Voluntary Sector Community Enterprise awards. These are: £1.5 million for Beatbullying to train 3,500 11-17 year olds over two years to act as mentors; £800,000 for the Diana Award to identify and train 10,000 pupils to act as anti-bullying ambassadors; just over £250,000 to Kidscape who will work in nine of London's most economically deprived boroughs to train primary school professionals to effectively deliver preventative and remedial strategies; and £1.5 million to The National Children's Bureau consortium who will work with around 900 schools, parents, carers and school staff to reduce the bullying of children and young people with Special

Educational Needs and/or disabilities.

17. Ofsted is bound by the public sector equality duty, its strategic plan and values to advance equality through its inspection of schools and regulation of early education and childcare providers. The promotion of equality of opportunity for all pupils underpins the school inspection and other frameworks. The school inspection framework as a whole looks at how a school meets diverse needs and advances equality through its focus on how schools:

- secure and maintain excellent teaching, learning and assessment for all pupils;
- 'narrow the gaps' in achievement between different groups and national standards;
- ensure pupils are free from bullying including all types of prejudice-based bullying;
- deal with unacceptable behaviour and disruptions to learning;
- build cohesive school communities where all pupils can thrive.

18. An evaluation of how effectively the school actively advances equality of opportunity will contribute to the key judgements. How well the school is promoting the pupils' spiritual, moral, social and cultural development is a key aspect of equality that is inspected and reported on. If inspection evidence raises concerns about the school's promotion of equality of opportunity and tackling discrimination, then inspectors may examine the school's policies to determine whether these are sufficiently robust, and if so, whether they have been adhered to. Ofsted's inspection of spiritual, moral, social and cultural education also includes an assessment of how well schools are promoting the fundamental British values, defined as "democracy, the rule of law, individual liberty, and mutual respect and tolerance for those with other faiths or none."

19. Senior staff and governors should know about the relative attainment and progress of different groups of pupils, monitor their performance and other data relevant to improving outcomes. For example, the school should be aware of gender imbalances in 'upper ability' groups. It is expected that schools track and analyse progression information, for example, the proportions of pupils who continue education, training or enter employment and identify whether there are any barriers for particular groups of pupils. This will enable schools to evaluate the curriculum and the subject choices of pupils.

20. The issues that underlie the disparities seen in school exclusion rates for different groups of pupils, including those from Gypsy, Roma, Traveller and African Caribbean communities, are complex, longstanding and often inseparable from those that lead to other educational inequalities, including academic achievement.

21. Use of permanent and fixed period exclusion has decreased considerably in recent years and is now at its lowest recorded levels. Following a slight increase in 2011-12, the number of permanent exclusions fell again in 2012-13 from 5,170 in 2011-12 to 4,630. This represents 0.06% of the school population. Pupils of 'Gypsy/Roma' and 'Traveller of Irish Heritage' ethnic groups have the highest rates of permanent exclusion (0.26% and 0.35% of the relevant school

population respectively). The rate of permanent exclusion for Travellers of Irish Heritage rose slightly from 0.28% in 2011/12 to 0.35% in 2012/13, though this still represents a 0.18% point reduction since 2007/08, when the rate was 0.53%. Long term trends in the rate of exclusion for Travellers of Irish Heritage are slightly erratic. This is in part explained by the very small size of the relevant population. The figures should therefore be treated with caution.

22. The rates of permanent exclusion for pupils of 'Black Caribbean' and 'White and Black Caribbean' ethnic groups were 0.22% and 0.19%, respectively. These rates both represent a reduction from 2011-12 and are 0.14 and 0.13 percentage points lower, respectively, from the rates seen in 2007-08.

23. Under the Equality Act, schools must not discriminate against a pupil by treating them less favourably on the basis of race, and must also have due regard to the need to eliminate discrimination, advance equal opportunity and foster good relations between children. The Government published non-statutory advice to help schools to understand how the Equality Act 2010 affects them, and how to fulfil their duties under the Act.

24. Statutory guidance on exclusion, issued by the Department for Education, emphasises the need for all exclusions to be lawful, reasonable and fair; the importance of schools adhering to their responsibilities under equalities legislation; and the value of early intervention to address behavioural issues before they escalate to the point that exclusion becomes necessary. The Government has also refocused school inspection arrangements so that stronger emphasis is given to the evaluation of behaviour in schools, including schools' use of exclusion and differential rates of exclusion for groups of pupils.

25. The Government is introducing radical reforms to improve the quality of alternative provision for excluded pupils. In education, the Government's approach is to move away from treating people as groups or 'equality strands' who get special treatment.

### *Scotland*

26. As part of the Scottish Government's Equality Outcomes and Mainstreaming Report specific equality outcomes were set for education. The outcomes for education focus on disability, Gypsy/Travellers, sex and bullying.

27. Pupils from ethnic minorities (including those categorised as white from outwith UK) make up around 10% of all pupils in Scottish schools. The number of pupils from ethnic minority backgrounds means that year on year fluctuations in numbers can have a huge impact on statistical rates, therefore caution in drawing conclusions must be exercised.

28. Curriculum for Excellence aims to provide the right environment to enable young people to develop as informed and responsible global citizens with knowledge of Scotland and its place in the world and an understanding of different beliefs and cultures. It addresses the exercising of rights and

responsibilities within communities at local, national and global levels, encompassing the development of informed decision making and the ability to take thoughtful and responsible action, locally and globally.

29. Curriculum for Excellence also seeks to provide flexibility so that teachers, schools and local authorities can identify and creatively pursue their own approaches. Within that context, it would not be appropriate for the Scottish Government to prescribe any one programme for any specific issue.

30. The Education (Additional Support for Learning) (Scotland) Act 2004 (as amended) provides the legal framework for the system which identifies and addresses additional support needs of children and young people who face a barrier, or barriers, to learning, including Gypsy and Traveller children. The Act aims to ensure that all children and young people are provided with the necessary support to help them work towards achieving their full potential. It promotes collaborative working among all those who support children and young people and sets out parents' rights within the system.

31. The Scottish Government will continue to support the work of the Scottish Traveller Education Programme, which supports members' promotion and development of inclusive educational approaches for mobile and settled Gypsy and other travelling families.

32. Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education produced a publication in 2005 which builds on self-evaluation guidance given in a previous report on meeting the needs of Gypsies and Travellers. This guide can be used by schools to evaluate the quality of their approaches to inclusion and equality relating to Gypsies and Travellers, and also provides examples of best practice.

33. The Scottish Government is clear that bullying of any kind is unacceptable, regardless of the motivation, and should be tackled quickly. Racism can be addressed across the curriculum for example in art, wellbeing, English, religious education and social studies. We continue to support the national anti-bullying service, *respectme*, which works with schools, authorities and communities in preventing and tackling bullying effectively. The service provides advice, information and training to those who work directly with children and young people to support improvement in preventing and tackling bullying of any kind. The service works to raise awareness of all types of bullying, including prejudice bullying.

34. Education Scotland is the Scottish Government's Executive Agency responsible for the national development and improvement of education, from early years to adult learning. Education Scotland has taken a focus on equality and diversity and recently published best practice from Scottish education. Education Scotland also highlighted aspects of equality and diversity in an event connected to the Commonwealth Games held in Glasgow in 2014.

35. Guidance published in 2011 aims to keep all children and young people fully included, engaged and involved in their education and to improve outcomes for those most at risk of exclusion. It is the responsibility of the local authority to

devise and implement policies and procedures on exclusions. The Scottish Government also funds the Pupil Inclusion Network Scotland to promote good practice across the wide range of local authority and independent partners who provide provision beyond the school for young people at risk of disengaging from their learning.

## *Wales*

37. Pupils from Chinese, or British Chinese, backgrounds are consistently the highest attaining learner group of all achieving GCSE grade A\*-C in English or Welsh First Language and Mathematics with an average of 77.8% at age 16 compared with a national average of 51.7% (over 2011-13).

38. However, some ethnic minority groups do under-perform. The worst performing group are Gypsy/Gypsy Roma children; over 2011-13 only 12.3% of these pupils reached the required level at age 16.

39. Given the small numbers of many ethnic minority groups in Wales identifying trends in the data can be more problematic. However, generally attainment gaps for certain ethnic groups are closing as performance improves.

40. The Minority Ethnic Achievement Grant supports local Ethnic Minority Achievement Services whose role is to promote pupils' English, or Welsh, language acquisition and to tackle ethnicity related underachievement. Eligible children include asylum seekers, refugees and the children of migrant workers. Authorities may also bid for funding to support the education of Gypsy and Traveller children, and may use this to improve attendance and progression to secondary school.

41. Both funding streams cover children aged 3 to 18 years of age; due to their dual needs, European Roma children are eligible under both grants. More Gypsy, Roma and Traveller children are at school in Wales than ever before. Local authorities report 2,447 of these children on school rolls, an increase of 600 pupils over the last 5 years.

42. The most significant impact of the Minority Ethnic Achievement Grant is in supporting pupils' English as an additional language needs so that they are able to access the curriculum. 2013 statistics on the performance of children with English as an additional language needs show that a higher proportion of those learners who have achieved a 'competent' or 'fluent' level of English achieve the Level 2 threshold (including a GCSE Grade A\*-C in English or Welsh First Language and Mathematics than their non-English as an additional language counterparts (63.9%, 64% & 53.9% respectively).

43. The Welsh Government considers it to be of vital importance that the education system in Wales gives all learners the chance to reach their potential. To this end, 'Unity and Diversity' guidance was issued which encourages schools to recognise and celebrate diversity so that all learners feel included and empowered.



44. In March 2013, the Welsh Government ran two major conferences on culturally mediated community cohesion and safeguarding in education. In March 2014, a major all Wales conference on minority ethnic achievement 'was attended by over 140 delegates. In September 2012, an all-Wales conference focused on how to encourage more effective transition to secondary school for Gypsy and Traveller children and better retention.

45. 'Travelling Together', a new on-line curriculum resource which celebrates Gypsy and Traveller history and culture has also been launched. The aim is to provide Gypsy and Traveller learners with a more culturally relevant curriculum, at the same time as breaking down myths and stereotypes around them and reducing bullying.

46. The Welsh Government is changing the school accountability measures to encourage schools to motivate all learners to achieve their full potential, whether they are working at a low level or aspiring to the highest grades. The new arrangements focus on qualifications that are known to be most valued by employers, higher education and others. The changes build on the recommendations of the Review of Qualifications and respond to a number of concerns about unintended consequences of the current set of measures. The policy has been informed by significant stakeholder engagement over two and a half years, including a stakeholder survey in 2014. In future, the Welsh Government will place more emphasis on a revised capped points score than on threshold measures, in order to rebalance the undue focus that has emerged on the C grade at GCSE. From 2017, the new measure will be based on nine qualifications, including English or Welsh Language, maths and science. From 2018, measures of attainment of the new Welsh Baccalaureate will replace the current threshold measures.

47. The Welsh Government provides a detailed analysis of the performance of ethnic minorities in education in Wales in tables 5-8 of a statistical release on achievement and pupil characteristics.

48. In addition schools are grouped together into Families of Schools that have similar characteristics. This allows good practice to be shared amongst these Families. English as an additional language is one of the component factors in the allocation of schools into these Families. The Department for Education publishes data on ethnicity through the award winning "My Local School" site for every school in Wales. It often proves difficult to be able to publish data on ethnicity in Wales at a school level as numbers are small. Throughout Wales, the percentage of pupils that recorded their ethnic background as anything other than "White British" was 8.4% (in 2013). This has grown from 6.7% in 2009.

49. Like all public bodies Estyn, the Education and Training Inspectorate in Wales, is bound by the public sector equality duty. Estyn includes in its inspections consideration of how providers meet the particular needs of diverse groups of learners. Inspections include quality indicators on issues such as standards and wellbeing, inclusivity and tolerance, and expectation and performance which can be used to help assess the educational attainment of diverse groups of learners.

50. In addition, Estyn is able to undertake more in-depth, thematic reviews of particular aspects of education and training policy. These reviews can make recommendations aimed at improving equality of access and provision. Over the last five years Estyn has reported on a variety of equality issues including for example:

- The education of Gypsy Traveller pupils;
  - Local authority support for the education of children of migrant workers;
  - How effective is provision for learners aged 16 to 19 years with language acquisition needs;
  - The impact of schools' race equality policies;
  - English for Speakers of Other Languages
- Barriers to Apprenticeships (for people from black and minority ethnic groups and those with disabilities).

51. There were no permanent school exclusions of pupils with Asian or Black ethnic background in 2011-12 or 2012-13. Although pupils with Black ethnic background have the highest rates of fixed term exclusions of five days or fewer since 2008-09, rates have been decreasing over this period. Statutory guidance on exclusion from schools and pupil referral units was issued by Welsh Government in September 2012. The guidance sets out the application of equalities legislation in relation to exclusions. The guidance is set within the context of school behaviour and attendance policies whilst offering alternatives to exclusion. A school's behaviour and attendance policy is an integral part of its curriculum and should tie in with a school's general approach to tackle in equalities and discrimination. In 2013, Edinburgh University undertook research on education provision for children and young people outside the school setting. The Welsh Government is committed to ensuring that children taught outside the school setting have improved outcomes and the opportunity to fulfil their potential and is taking forward recommendations from the report.

52. The Welsh Government commissioned Estyn, the school's inspectorate in Wales, to carry out a thematic survey looking at the effectiveness of action taken by schools to address bullying on the grounds of the protected characteristics of age, disability, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex and sexual orientation. The report, which was published in June 2014, shows that, within the review sample, pupils with certain protected characteristics were more likely to experience bullying, and that although there were instances of good practice by schools in tackling bullying, this was not always the case. The report contains seven recommendations for schools and three recommendations for local authorities and regional consortia. There is one recommendation for the Welsh Government, namely that it should publicise the 'Respecting Others' anti-bullying guidance. The recommendations from this report are being used to inform policy development and improved communications around tackling bullying.

## Article 13

- 1 Within the framework of their education systems, the Parties shall recognise that persons belonging to a national minority have the right to set up and to manage their own private educational and training establishments.
- 2 The exercise of this right shall not entail any financial obligation for the Parties.

## Article 14

- 1 The Parties undertake to recognise that every person belonging to a national minority has the right to learn his or her minority language.
- 2 In areas inhabited by persons belonging to national minorities traditionally or in substantial numbers, if there is sufficient demand, the Parties shall endeavour to ensure, as far as possible and within the framework of their education systems, that persons belonging to those minorities have adequate opportunities for being taught the minority language or for receiving instruction in this language.
- 3 Paragraph 2 of this article shall be implemented without prejudice to the learning of the official language or the teaching in this language

## *Welsh language*

1. The Welsh-medium Education Strategy was published in April 2010. The strategy contains fixed five-year and indicative ten-year targets based on outcomes which will be used to monitor the implementation progress. There is a commitment in the Welsh-medium Education Strategy to monitor progress made against the targets contained in the strategy and to publish an annual report.

2. As a result of the National Assembly for Wales passing the School Standards and Organisation Act (Wales) 2013, each local authority is required to prepare, consult upon and submit a Welsh in Education Plan for approval. The purpose of these Plans is to improve planning for Welsh-medium education, Welsh Second Language and the teaching of subjects through the medium of Welsh. Local authorities began implementing their statutory Welsh in Education Plans and these Plans are updated annually.

3. Over £5.6million will be provided to the regional consortia via the Welsh in Education Grant during 2014-15 to undertake activities on a regional, local and school level in support of the aims and objectives of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.

4. A commissioning programme to enable the production of Welsh-language, bilingual educational and learning resources which encompassed a range of curriculum subjects 3–19 is being undertaken by the Welsh Government. The

projects include developing resources in a variety of formats, including digital resources such as apps. The Welsh Government funded the Royal National Institute of Blind People to produce a Welsh-language speech engine for use in educational software and other areas. The first natural sounding Welsh language text-to-speech voices are now available. These voices will make a real difference to blind and partially sighted Welsh speakers and learners.

5. The voices are being made available free to both individuals and non-commercial organisations, and there is expected to be a significant level of interest from schools and colleges wanting to access the voices to support their learners.

<http://www.rnib.org.uk/wales-cymru-how-we-can-help/welsh-synthetic-voice>

<http://www.rnib.org.uk/cy/cymru-wales-sut-y-gallwn-helpu/llais-synthetig-cymraeg>

### *Gaelic language*

6. In 2010, there were two stand-alone Gaelic schools in Scotland: one in Inverness (primary) and one in Glasgow. The Glasgow school is for young people ages 3-18 and consists of a nursery, primary and secondary. A third Gaelic school was opened in Edinburgh in 2013 and more generally, the number of children entering Gaelic Medium Education at first year of primary school has steadily increased to 561.

7. There are also plans for three new Gaelic schools are to be opened in the near future. These will be a second Glasgow primary (2015), a primary in Fort William (2015) and a primary in Portree (2016).

8. In Comhairle nan Eilean Siar there are a number of schools where there is a higher percentage of pupils learning through the medium of Gaelic than English. The Council intends to designate these schools as Gaelic status schools.

9. Progress is also being made with Gaelic teacher education. This year a new one year course was launched to assist teachers that would like to transfer from English teaching to Gaelic teaching. Another new course, which offers students both Gaelic language learning and a teaching qualification and opportunities to train as teachers, has recently been expanded at the University of the Highlands and Islands.

10. Gaelic Learners in the Primary School has also been received more opportunity recently as the Scottish Government has made a commitment to introduce a norm for language learning based on the European Union 1+2 model to create the conditions in which every child will learn two languages in addition to their mother tongue. The Scottish Governments aims to create the new model of language acquisition for Scotland over the course of two Parliaments. In 2014, the Scottish Government provided the Gaelic Learners in the Primary School consortium (a collection of local authorities) with an extra £140,000 to their budget, allowing 37 teachers to be trained on how to deliver Gaelic language in

primary schools.

### *Scots language*

11. In 2014, the Scottish Government succeeded in appointing 4 Scots co-ordinators at Education Scotland. The Scots co-ordinators, each from a different area of the country and each having a background in a different dialect of Scots language, work together to help promote and support the use and study of Scots language within schools.

12. In 2014, the Scottish Qualifications Authority launched both a Scottish Studies Award and Scots language units. The Award, available to students in high schools and colleges, provides the opportunity to select a wide range of units and courses about Scotland's culture including Scots language units.

13. Scottish Language Dictionaries, funded by the Scottish Government, continues to take the lead in producing dictionaries of the Scots Language. Since 2010 their most notable dictionary, Dictionary of the Scots Language, is now available online. Scottish Language Dictionaries in 2014 launched an app containing the Essential Scots Dictionary. This should assist young people studying the new Scots Language Units. This app will allow students to have access to the dictionary, free of charge, through phones and tablets.

14. *Cornish language- see Article 3 above.*

## Article 15

The Parties shall create the conditions necessary for the effective participation of persons belonging to national minorities in cultural, social and economic life and in public affairs, in particular those affecting them.

### Public Sector Employment

1. The drive to mainstream opportunity covers the entire public sector. For example the Government has launched a number of initiatives to promote equality and increase diversity at all levels of the Civil Service. The Government is committed to creating a Civil Service that reflects the society it serves. For example, the new Positive Action Pathway development programme aims to 'level the playing field' for disabled, minority ethnic and female employees. It aims to equip participants with the skills and confidence to achieve career progression and to realise their full potential. The proportion of minority ethnic civil servants has risen from 5.7% in 1997 to 9.6% in March 2013 and is broadly in line with the current economically active population (10.5%). At senior levels, Civil Service statistics show that the number of Senior Civil Servants from an ethnic minority background has fallen slightly from 4.3% in 2011 (after a period of unbroken growth since 2003) to 3.8% in October 2013. Departments are required to set out clearly how they will achieve progress against the diversity agenda. They are held accountable through publishing objectives as part of the Public Sector Equality Duty.

2. To fulfil the Government's commitment to provide internships in every Government department for under-represented groups, three complementary Government internship schemes have been developed for secondary school students, college level students, and undergraduate/graduate students. In 2013, the College Level Student Internship included 31% from minority ethnic backgrounds and the Undergraduate/Graduate level scheme involved a total of 156 students, of which (54%) came from minority ethnic backgrounds. The 2014 programme was the largest ever with 175 places.

3. Equality analysis of performance ratings of staff in the public sector indicates that minority ethnic employees are more likely than non-minority employees to receive lower performance ratings. This reflects similar findings in external research over a considerable number of years in both the public and private sectors on performance management systems of varying designs. A project set up in September 2013 to tackle race inequality considered the factors which might impact minority ethnic employees entering the organisation, the reasons minority ethnic employees exit and factors that might affect their career progression. As a result of its recommendations, unconscious bias training is now mandated and 75% posts will be filled via anonymised recruitment processes. The "Growing Talent" programme provides opportunities for 12 minority ethnic employees per year at middle management level to receive high level mentoring and leadership development. The programme supports

participants to realise their ambition and potential to become future leaders in the civil service.

## **Article 16**

The Parties shall refrain from measures which alter the proportions of the population in areas inhabited by persons belonging to national minorities and are aimed at restricting the rights and freedoms flowing from the principles enshrined in the present framework Convention.

## **Article 17**

- 1 The Parties undertake not to interfere with the right of persons belonging to national minorities to establish and maintain free and peaceful contacts across frontiers with persons lawfully staying in other States, in particular those with whom they share an ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious identity, or a common cultural heritage.
- 2 The Parties undertake not to interfere with the right of persons belonging to national minorities to participate in the activities of non-governmental organisations, both at the national and international levels.

*For Cornwall, see Article 3 above.*



## **Article 18**

- 1 The Parties shall endeavour to conclude, where necessary, bilateral and multilateral agreements with other States, in particular neighbouring States, in order to ensure the protection of persons belonging to the national minorities concerned.
- 2 Where relevant, the Parties shall take measures to encourage transfrontier co-operation.

## **Article 19**

The Parties undertake to respect and implement the principles enshrined in the present framework Convention making, where necessary, only those limitations, restrictions or derogations which are provided for in international legal instruments, in particular the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, in so far as they are relevant to the rights and freedoms flowing from the said principles.