INTERCULTURAL CITY

MAKING THE MOST OF DIVERSITY

PROFILE OF INTERCULTURAL INNOVATORS

Jude Bloomfield

I Defining Intercultural Innovators

The study started out from the premise that intercultural people had crossed cultural boundaries drawing on elements from different cultures. The consequence is that they are adept at seeing their own culture as either relative or composite, valuing the different ways of seeing and doing things in the other cultures. This openness to different cultures gives a heightened propensity to select and absorb elements of other cultures into their own cultural make-up and produce new ways of thinking, seeing, imagining and creating. (Hannerz, 1996) So the hypothesis was that intercultural people would be innovators in whatever field of endeavour.

The intercultural actors were defined as people who, for whatever reason, cross over boundaries between ethnic minority and mainstream cultural, social, economic and civic/political networks. (Wallman,.2003) The reasons for this were not defined *a priori* and could, and did, vary from mixed parentage, bilingualism, postcolonial migration, having travelled or lived abroad and been exposed to other cultures for a prolonged period of time, or through the nature of their work. As the criterion was focused on practice, on what people *do*, rather than on an ascribed ethnicity, people in mainstream institutions who acted across cultural boundaries could be included as well as ethnic minorities. Such a criterion could also encompass different generations, whether first or second generation immigrants or others born here. We found our intercultural innovators through their reputation which made them stand out in some way to our city researchers, or to innovators who suggested other innovators. The means of selection of the sample of innovators may, of course, be biassed towards the research team's areas of specialist knowledge and contacts and is not a scientific cross-section. The hypothesis could be further tested by research which specifically selects intercultural people in the sciences, professional, managerial and technical occupations to see whether it holds true there too. Such targetted research was however beyond our scope.

II Profile of Work and Innovative Practice

What do Innovators do? -

The sample of 33 people interviewed in 6 cities: London, Birmingham, Leicester, Newcastle, Huddersfield and Bradford, fell into three broad types: artists and animateurs, those involved in community development including local politicians and entrepreneurs.

Artists and Animateurs

A high proportion of the innovators (10 out of 33) are involved in the arts.
Many of them would be classified as community artists, not of the old style, but involved in high quality, collaborative projects with diverse communities. They are inherently cross-cultural, like Brian Cross, who developed as a peripatetic photographer and screenprinter with Northern working class communities, developing a mobile print van, Artivan using his print skills and his collaborator's design skills to get people from pit villages like Woolliery Colliery to estates like Windy Bank, disabled people, the elderly, to tell their stories which were then produced as books and exhibitions. This led on to working with ethnically diverse communities and electronic technologies producing Awaz – a community newspaper in Batley, using desktop

publishing skills to produce the first images of black performers. (Interview with Brian Cross, 15.11.05)

The intercultural artists deliberately set out to cross over boundaries between people and cultures. As Cheryl Creaghan Roberts, a cultural animateur and entrepreneur from Huddersfield summed up work as black arts development officer for the Lawrence Batley Theatre "*The work was diverse,I went out and worked not with the black community, but everyone and anyone…… with young people, children, old people, people from the drugs and sexual health community …. with artists, poets and storytellers and with schools.*"

Her company Kreative Response sets out to provoke, '*bringing people together to create something different'* such as an environmental project working with an affluent, predominantly white rural community bringing in black artists, but '*taking them out of their safety zone.*…..." Such work is inherently transgressive, aiming to challenge and shift outlooks and relationships through critical, creative engagement. *I've' always thought out of the box, I've always challenged* " Cheryl Creaghan Roberts said. (Interview with Cheryl Creaghan Roberts 17.11.05.)

The artists are strikingly versatile and interdisciplinary as well as intercultural, often engaging in multiple occupations and blurring distinctions between different fields. Yve Ngoo, a multicultural arts programmer for BBC Radio Newcastle is also a playwright, Adam Strickson, a community-based intercultural artist, schooled in Japanese theatre and use of puppets, masks and dance is also a poet and playwright.

Art forms which do not rely on language – but music, performance, visual image or other sensory experience, are inherently more universal. They have been successfully deployed in schools- nearly twenty years ago, Adam Strickson was employed by Bradford Story Box, on a project funded by the local educational authority, to encourage the use of mother tongue and diverse cultural knowledge across the curriculum, including science, maths and geography. As the only white artist, with his skills in non-verbal theatre, he learnt about Islamic views of the universe and astronomy, and other ideas, translating them into dance with dancers from the Asian community. (Interview with Adam Strickson, 18.11.05.)

As artistic innovation and breakthrough depends on different ways of seeing and doing, artistic projects with different groups, schools and neighbourhoods serve as a great resource for cities in the process of urban regeneration, problem solving and social transformation.

Community development

The second field where intercultural innovators predominated is community development. This attracts or creates people with a capacity to communicate across boundaries, who are first of all good listeners, can find commonalities across cultural barriers and work with people to improvise solutions and ways of improving things.

Elaine Apelbee, the dynamic director of Bradford Vision, the key community regeneration body in the city, learnt from the Urban Hearings that the Faith in the City Forum set up, the common themes of poverty, crime, their young people, race, culture and religion and for the first time consultation and decision-making: "*We can all tell you*

in Bradford how different we are from each other. What this was showing was that the issues, or rather sets of issues, were the same so there was a lot of commonality." She explains the strategic approach behind neighbourhood action planning and community development based on empowerment – of firstly '*letting people define who they are, then bringing them together.*' and then a third stage of '*looking at the institutions to make them fit*' to respond to the demands of engaged communities. (Interview with Elaine Appelbee 9.1.06., Bradford Faith in the City Forum,1998)

Ali Mantle, the Neighbourhood Renewal Officer for the Frizinghall Partnership in Bradford for a year, and now an area co-ordinator, defines a broad, non-ethnic approach thus: *Anything about Bradford is put in a race frame. I approach working across different ethnic groups in the same way as any other group, not in terms of race*…"She defines the growing need for :*'bridge builders'* indicating from her own experience where they might come from…"*Because of my outsider status as a child I've always been more open to building those*." (Interview with Ali Mantle, 10.1.06.)

Innovation in community work also involves what Ali Mantle called, in the context of Frizinghall, the brick, i.e. the financial resources to enable projects to be realised. In Frizinghall, an area excluded from Single Regeneration Budget resources, they set up the Taskforce which mobilised £300,00 over a year, and included a police community support officer and a children's centre by getting Frizinghall included in Shipley Sure Start programme. This kind of transversal approach to funding, targetting and pooling resources brings hope and a sense in deprived areas that "Oh my goodness, something is happening in relation to what we've asked for."(in Strickson, 2005, 211)

Intercultural community development intersects also with gender, in that those most open to collaboration are often the women, Rita Patel, the founder of the Peepul Centre in Leicester, an intercultural arts, community, health and training centre, describes her strategic approach from the first women's centre they opened in 1983, based at first on Asian women "*Right from the start we believed in building links with African and African Caribbean women*". (Interview with Rita Patel, 30.11.05) Huwaran Hussain, the first Bangladeshi woman councillor for the Greens, embodies a new style of community politics in her innovative approach to community health, She set up a Gardening for Health project to counter heart disease among Bangladeshis from rural Sylhet, by getting the women to grow vegetables, taking advantage of their rural knowledge (they had stored seeds from the imported vegetables they bought locally) and applying it in an English context of allotments. In a walking project, she took women, even in slingbacks, hijab or burka, to experience the Yorkshire Dales, a place where they had never ventured viewing it as territory belonging to white middle class people. To avoid these same alien connotations, instead of walking, she called such activities going on a trip, or a picnic(Interview with Huwaran Hussain, 9.1.06.)

All the politicians emerged through community politics – whether of the radical communitarian Liberal kind of the 1970s such as Councillor David Faulkner in Newcastle, the London new Left of the 1980s in alliance with Bangladeshis in the East End as in the case of Michael Keith, leader of Tower Hamlets Council, or Green local politics of the 19990s with Councillors David Ford and Huwaran Hussain. Their politics link people across divides around issues that affect them all that cut across the usual bureaucratic or policy definitions of the problem.

For this reason arts and sport figure prominently in the work.
In relation to Pakistani and Muslim young men, sport can play a fundamental role in reaching them. As Ali Mantle found out from a group of young Pakistani men who were not into education and did not go to libraries, they wanted "*' a place to hang out, 'just for us.*" When all else failed, sport *'gives them a structure … it gives them a choice…'.* Interview with Ali Mantle, 10.1.06.)

Maza Dad in Birmingham set up the Local Leagues in 1994-5, with boys from deprived areas like Balsall Heath, that now trains and organises football matches all over the city. He recalls the first fifteen young men '*misfits if you like*'…*Black, white, Asian – the beauty of it is that by the time I finished with these kids they understood that the team they belonged to should mean everything to them… that the whole team should be there.. I can proudly say that these youngsters .. you'd say Winsome Green* (i.e.prison) *but everyone of them bar one…. has gone to university and on to fantastic jobs."*

Again typifying the transversal or lateral way of thinking and commitment to empowerment of local people "*I think a lot more can be achieved looking at things from a multidimension…. Any opportunity of helping other people on the ground to get out of the rut, and I do…"*(Interview Maza Dad, 12.1.06.)

Entrepreneurs
The third category of innovators in our group are composed of entrepreneurs are primarily in pubs, clubs, food & drink and catering.

Their intercultural background appears to be source of innovation. Even for Muslims where family networks play a stronger role in learning the business, the entrepreneurs are distinctively innovative. For example Parvin Ali who learnt business from her father's textile firm, and relied on the family's reputation for suppliers, did not want to travel round the country but combine her work with raising her two children. A woman-centred approach informed the setting up of the Fatima network in Leicester –which provides free business services services to women, especially from disadvantaged and diverse commmunities. It operates as a private company what Parvin calls '*more than profit*.', financing the services to women by doing contract research, training and consultancy. It is distinct in treating women's needs integrally – catering for personal, social, educational, training, technology and financial needs. This often enables women to turn domestic and craft skills into small businesses, in for example beauty therapy and alternative health. Unlike conventional business services it provides follows-through from start-up to subsequent phases of development. It also promotes women in science and engineering jobs and researches women in low-paid jobs. As a Muslim woman who came from a very intercultural background as third generation Malaysian, with an Indian mother and Iranian forefathers, and herself married to a man with Turkish and Pakistani parents, she never felt she fitted into the British Asian community. The milieu her parents had grown up in of Chinese, South Asians and indigenous Malaysians she defines as '*more in keeping with the way of Islam*' in contrast to the Muslims in this country who she finds a bit aloof and elite *'looking down on other people's different ethnicity.."* An alternative woman-centred approach also informs her work with Muslim organisations, the Muslim Federation and the first regional Muslim Women's Forum and is reflected in her work on the Women and Diversity network (Interview with Parvin Ali, 21.11.05). An innovative Muslim-influenced approach has also been applied as director of FWN to develop a community

development fund offering loans which comply with Muslim principles of not charging or paying interest. However, this is not seen of relevance only to Muslims: "*By offering an alternative ethical banking, many non Muslims would also benefit from the fund*." (Fatima, 2005.)

A second feature of intercultural innovation is the development of 'value-led business' where the commitment to the enterprise is driven by a consciously articulated ethos, to which profit is the means, rather than the goal.

This is not quite the same as social enterprise or 'more than profit', it is profit to realise intercultural, social or environmental objectives. Geetie Singh set up the first ecological gastro pub in London, the Duke of Cambridge and was awarded Asian Business Woman of the Year. She is committed to organic produce, local suppliers and recycling, while reviving the history and place names of English pubs and the philanthropic traditions of their owners. Although originally intending to roll out twelve such pubs, after three, she stopped and sold two of them when she realised '*you have to standardise it, brand it. It's all about making money."* Now she concentrates on quality, working with local schools in Islington, with London Food and the mayor and London Remade, a recycling and reusing initiative. (Interview Geetie Singh, 8.12.05.)

Tom Caulker's intercultural pub the Trenthouse and World Headquarters nightclub in Newcastle is similarly a value-driven enterprise based on the *'positive side of black music',* a logo of '*Newcastle-on-Tyne-World Headquarters uniting all communities* in fornt of the decks, messages of love and tolerance, in the bar, an interactional dance floor, '*all inclusive so anyone could get into it'* and club nights for disabled people once a month, women like the Digital Women's Network and Them Wifies an all women drama group, and charities such as one sending doctors ot Africa."*They can come and make a significant amount of money for their causes. There are very few clubs who can be bothered to do that*." (Interview Tom Caulker, 19.07.05.) As well as value-driven, such intercultural entrepreneurs are creating intercultural spaces where they themselves feel at home. This seems to be a key driver behind the innovation.

The role interculturalism in refugee innovativeness is well illustrated by the sole refugee entrepreneur in our sample, Said Mansoor in Newcastle. Arriving with nothing from Iran and having no English, he was a radical outsider, because of the racism, exclusion from language training, university and employment as a computer programmer for which he was highly qualified and exploited he met as an asylum seeker Through a combination of his own extraordinary effort and persistence and the external negative economic opportunity industrial decline afforded, he acquired a closed down pub and then a pizzeria for a song. The initial stage of development was confined to ensuring high quality, and gaining competitive advantage by applying his previous computer programming skills to an automated order, supply and delivery system for the pizzeria. Only in a second stage of development, now his three businesses are assured, has he gone on to purchase a fourth business –which will produce Persian beer.

In the first phase he was concerned with economic survival rather than innovation "*You're gambling already, I go for what his country already likes*."

However, in a second phase he is preparing a product which draws on his cultural background - each bottle will have a label with two lines of poetry by Ferdosi on it - and will fill a market niche " *No-one has done it, nowhere in the UK, not in Europe*." (Interview with Said Mansoor, 19.7.05.

III Personal Profiles - backgrounds and development

Childhood
It is clear from the interviews with people of mixed origin who experienced racism and hardship in childhood that they retreated into art or music as an escape. As Yve Ngoo, a multicultural arts programmer for BBC Radio Newcastle put it:
" *I started creating in my head from a very early age, constantly living in my own little world. No-one could get into it* …".(Interview with Yve Ngoo 18.7.05)
The arts offered self-affirmation and an alternative identity to that of colour or race.

Cultural Capital
Most our the innovators had unorthodox educational careers.
For some, informal cultural capital, know-how acquired outside of formal education or training became the school of innovation and interculturalism
Tom Caulker collected black, Noprthern soul and indie music as a kid from a troubled home and this provided an unconventional career path for him via DJing at 'innocent hippy parties', at Club Africa and for the strong underground gay scene in Newcastle, working his way round the Northern clubs.

Maurice Coles, who runs the Leicester Schools development Support Agency, as a teacher took a career break for two years and travelled round the areas his pupils came from, Sri Lanka, India, Bangladesh, East Africa and the Caribbean. On his return, working as a school's community liaison officer in East London, a Jamaican recognised him as an '*afiwy man*' – a 'for we' man, i.e. one of us. His intermarriage to a Hindu, lifelong adherence to Sufism and conversion six years ago to Islam, have enabled him to develop an intercultural curriculum for schools and is now working on a new relationship between Islam and education as he has become, in his own words ' *an afiwy Muslim',* (Interview with Maurice Coles, 10.10.05)

A number of our subjects fought very hard to attain further and higher education against parental opposition –and strong racism from careers advisors and higher educational institutions. For example Cheryl Creaghan Roberts found that when she applied to art school "*My dad was furious, my mum was furious*." (Cheryl Creaghan Roberts, 17.11.05.) At Cumbria School of Art and Technology she faced racism on the street where she was called '*a nigger, a black Pakistani*' and in her digs people spraypainted 'nigger' on her door and threatened to burn the house down. She faced racism from the lecturers and discimination through marking her work down which on protest was successfully reassessed but she left without completing her degree.

For Yve Ngoo *"Higher education was what I really wanted to do – going to art college then was something looked on for rich kids*." but she eventually made it to Film School by way of the army and window dressing, and graduated in scriptwriting and direction. (Yvea Ngoo, 18.7.05)

For refugees, their higher education and qualifications did not help because they were not recognised. Zenebu Hailu, an Ethiopian community worker at the Kirklees Sylum Seekers Centre in Huddersfield, is a multilingual librarian, with a degree from Russia but who could not, despite her best attempts, requalify here. "*If you've been highly educated, you should be respected as an educated person. Africans are treated as though they know nothing… are treated as 'nobody*.' (Interview Zenebu Hailu,

16.11.05.)

Likewise, Said Mansoor was barred from employment as a qualified computer programmer and also could not afford to requalify at Newcastle University as the cost was prohibitive. However he wasa able to utislise his skills by setting up a computer programming business over the internet and apply it to competitive advantage in his pizza business.

Social Capital
The literature on social capital emphasises the particular importance of broad social networks to transnational migrants and their entrepreneurship for mobilising resources through family and community networks and trade circuits through diasporic links. (Portes, 1995;1998)

- international travel
Although export was not prominent among our entrepreneurs, international travel was a marked feature of those born abroad or enmeshed in a diaspora. Such is the case of Tim Haq, a businessman, journalist and urban renegeration worker of Pakistani and English origin, who moved to England when he was ten and then to Germany where his father set up a spice business serving the Turkish migrant and Indian and Pakistani refugee communities. This influenced his own model of business as serving the community '*by finding the common denominator*' . He is now utilising his links with Pakistan to develop a furniture business with his brother and to use his business advice skills to help in the earthquake reconstruction in Pakistani Kashmir. (Interview with Tim Haq, 11,10.05.)

However it is also evident in the openness and international outlook of others born in the UK. For example Yve Ngoo finds ". *Europe is fascinating there are more people like me –Norwegian African, Italian African ..It makes me feel a much more rounded person. I like travelling and talking to people and I've met people like me.*" (Yve Ngoo, 18.7.05) Tom Caulker defines his nightclub as having *'an Amsterdamy feel.'* and attracts Scandinavian seamen from the port.

- fragmented career itineraries Another characteristic of these actors is that having travelled to many different places and experienced many different cultures, they have met a wide range people & organisations. Although they were often thwarted by racism and low expectations, paradoxically this led to highly developed networks of contacts, interdisciplinary knowledge and know-how and multi-skilling. Under the right conditions or with luck, these could be turned to advantage, if the knocks and setbacks did not deter them from pursuing their goal. Yve Ngoo sums this up in how she arrived at being multicultural arts programmer for BBC Newcastle radio

'*I saw the job for the BBC in the paper and thought 'that's my job.'I've waited , you know, 20 years to get into the media, and you know, I'm actually going to get this job. And I applied for it and everything in my past seemed to lead to me, to track me, to get this job. I seemed to be able to tick many boxes when it comes to work with the community, had an arts background, being a writer, personal experience, personal triumph and adversity , all seemed to go in my favour*." All her different experiences created the wide social network she now uses in her job.

- informal supports
Mentors and organisations appear to have played an important role in supporting these intercultural actors. In the case of Councillor David Faulkner , his contact with Chris Mullard, a Black Londoner and the first Community Relations officer appointed in Tyneside in 1976, helped him become aware of institutional racism and challenge attitudes in the white establishment. (Interview with David Faulkner, 18.7.05) For Cheryl Creaghan Roberts, *her art teacher was I owe it all to my art teacher ….He was my rock really."*(Cheryl Creaghan Roberts, 17.11.05) encouraging to go to art college, fighting to have her work reevaluated by the governing bodies. The Church also played an important role in offering support for her. Likewise for Zenebu Hailu, she found support form various churches in Huddersfield. For her fellow refugee in Newcastle, Said, it was the Refugee Council that slipped him money for expenses which was ' *a good friend who always support me*.' and friends he made at the university who also helped him learn English. (Said Mansoor, 19.7.05)

Political Capital
- trust relations
Although many of our subjects insist on their independence and the autonomy that entrepreneurial status allows, some have relied on political support to get projects started or in a crisis situation. Tom Caulker, despite shying away from politics, relied on council backing to prevent the compulsory purchase of his former nightclub, the support of the Cultural Department in finding new premises and their intervention to prevent foreclosure and bankruptcy when the deal to buy the new premises Curtis Mayfield House, risked falling through. (Tom Caulker, 19.7.05.)

- political opportunity structures
In other cases, an institutional base provided a political opportunity structure to disseminate intercultural thinking and embed it as a practice more widely.
Maurice Coles work at the Multicultural Support Service in Birmingham for twenty years, has produced fruit and he can count 35 chief inspectors, professors and heads of Race equality Units who went through the service. In his work at the Schools Development Support Agency in Leicester he is diffusing a model of intercultural education. (Interview Maurice Coles, 10.10.05.)

IV Narratives
Who do intercultural innovators think they are?

- rebels and outsiders
Our intercultural innovators have strong narratives of being 'a rebel' (Cheryl and Yve) 'anti authority' (Tom) 'a thorn in the flesh" (Maurice Coles) and outsiders (Adam Strickson and Ali Mantle) '

Some expressed this in their sense of being a 'loners' or different. Brian Cross refers to his *'fellow mavericks'*. As Ali Mantle expressed it "*I like doing things in a different way*.' They also defied traditional forms of classification:
as Maza Dad put it "*I'm a bit of an all-rounder* " and "*I didn't want to be pigeonholed*" Cheryl Creaghan Roberts.

- insider-outsider dichotomy -
There is a fine line between being an outsider and being marginalised or excluded altogether. Yve Ngoo speaks chillingly of being '*literally on my own*'. For others even the most excluded refugees, found some support structure. Equally if you are too much of an insider, the need and pressure to innovate may diffuse. Having a secure base in family or communal networks undoubtedly helps some of our subjects to resist racism and exclusion, but a number of our most innovative informants could not rely on their families for support. They seem to fall back on art, a passion they have pursued, religious faith or unusually strong faith in themselves. Many of them waver between being outsiders and insiders even now they have succeeded.

- heightened motivation
Recent literature on immigrant entrepreneurship (Kontos, 2004; Kupferberg, 2004) and philsophical work on minority identity (Taylor, 1994; Honneth, 1995) sees heightened motivation derived from the struggle for social recognition as an entrepreneurial resource. Our intercultural actors from mixed backgrounds seem to fit this category whether or not they are entrepreneurs. However, their experience of rejection and belittlement from racism, does not seem to have traumatised them so much as outraged them.

As Geetie Singh testifies, on the first day at her secondary school "*Someone called me Paki and I punched him in the face. and split his lip…..My philosophy was rescuing people with violence, rescusing people from bullying." Although suspended from school three times, the headmaster, 'told my mum whenIleft school that I had wiped out racism from the school*." But it was Geetie's unorthodox homelife, in a white middle class-rural commune that '*gave me the confidence about my colour and I became proud of it."* (Geetie Singh, 8.12.05)

For others art or music provided an alternative source of identity. As Cheryl Creaghan Roberts puts it "For the first time the colour of my skin didn't matter, I was an artist…." (Interview with Cheryl Creaghan 17.11.05.)

This implies that their struggle for social recognition may not be a reaction to trauma but rather to a strong sense of injustice about racism, and may forge a fighting spirit or a search for an alternative expressive outlet.

-sense of destiny –
The narratives show a repeated pattern of a sense of destiny, that makes sense of the struggle with adversity and reinforces the sense that they will win out against the odds. Sometimes this takes an expressly religious form.

However the religious beliefs that are drawn on tend to be open, tolerant, socially oriented to fighting injustice and based on personal inner conviction, whether born-again Christian like Cheryl Creaghan Roberts, socially committed Christian influenced by liberation theology such as Elaine Apelbee, or Hindus such as Pialli Rai. or Rita Patel who expresses it thus' "*The journey to where I am today has been a spiritual journey – finding the greatness of the human spirit*." (Rita Patel, 30.11.05) Some Muslims express a more conventional sense of discipline, family and community, such as Maza Dad or Muhammed Ali of QED in Bradford, while others are more openly reforming, reaching out to find commonality between Islam and the wider civil society like Parvin Ali and Nadeem Khan, the solicitor in Birmingham, who hars worked with the Citizens' Organising Foundation and for the Council for Racial Equality.

- reaction to failure
Finally the reaction to failure seems to be both a high propensity to sacrifice, find a way round obstacles and to turn it to their advantage. They are a remarkably resilient and persistent group of people.

V Cities as Settings

What do the intercultural innovators themselves tell us about the role of cities in helping or hindering their progress?
The innovators told stories that were critical or supportive of the city and of particular institutions, which indicated directions for the city's intercultural development.

Racism figured most prominently in the narratives of those of mixed background or refugees. They generally spoke in the past tense about racism, as something they had had to contend with whilst growing up and a number explicitly recognised that things had changed. Yve, for example, reflects "*Racism is always there, whether institutionalised or in your face ….but awareness has changed …I grew up in a time when on-one was there to protect you…they looked at your face and didn't want a black or brown face….same with the North-South divide, the class divide, black and white divide…. I've seen it all change…a minority out there never change, but the ones who have changed – keep me going*." (Interview, Yve Ngoo, 18.7.05)

A novel view of political correctness was put by Geetie Singh; that it deflects explicit racist utterance onto her white boyfriend "I think that's a wonderful cultural thing about political correctness. It is never said to me because I'm brown but is said to him because they assume he's gonna agree and join in" (Interview Geetie Singh, 8.12.05)

So racism has not gone but cannot be expressed explicitly or openly and is on the retreat in certain contexts. The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry has led to serious changes in the law with the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) and as a consequence in institutions. It is now incumbent on them to eliminate discrimination and actively promote equality of opportunity through active efforts to diversify the workforce, board of management, representation in their institution, and the service provided. However, very few of our innovators are based in mainstream institutions except for two in councils, and six in universities or schools (where five of the six are white and one of Iranian extraction). In other words, they remain strong outsiders. This may be because formal institutions afford little scope for intercultural innovation, but it is also likely to reflect the slow progress of institutions in becoming culturally diverse in the composition of their staff.

Specific criticisms of institutions focus on the opposition to, and lack of recognition of, what innovators are trying to do. For example, Cheryl Creaghan Roberts fought against ghettoising the work she was doing for the partnership between the Lawrence Batley theatre and Hadawi Centre which led to her attempted demotion. However, in this case the firm support of the Arts Council led to her reinstatement. (Cheryl Creaghan Roberts, 17.11.05) Work that crosses over professional boundaries, that is difficult to classify in traditional terms, comes up against entrenched professional practices. As Maza Dad indicates many services are hidebound and outdated, like *" the Youth Service, modelled on the old cadets and scout clubs, modelled around church halls"* built on the assumption '*that the kids should come to us, rather than us going out to the kids.*'

In sport he criticises the governing bodies who continue to monopolise power, with '*closed doors to outsiders'* and the bias against recognising sporting achievement in poor areas:

"*One of the kids who I used to coach asked 'Maz, why don't we get any scouts coming here to see how good we are?' His name was Ben and he was white – ….the reason why …..is because we're a deprived community. Regardless of creed or colour, white, black, Asian lads, all of them thought it was racism…. by God they had some talent.*" (Maza Dad, 12.01.06) In criticising the selling off of playing fields and failure to invest in open spaces for twenty years, he proposes building up creating grass roots assets for the community.

The pattern of funding that emerges is patchy, short-term project-based and often shoestring. Particular concern was expressed about the running down of youth services, general neglect of services for young people and of listening to their voices. Both Saleema Hafajee, who runs Bradford Youth Partnership and Maza Dad, have chosen to adopt entrepreneurial models of finance outside the constraints of local government and the Youth Service. Saleema Hafajee points out the downside of total reliance on external funding as the continual treadmill of fundraising which eats up energy, but on the upside, the stimulus to creativity it gives her staff. (Interview Saleem Hafajee, 9.01.2006.)

Bradford Vision, as some other bodies in other cities such as Birmingham (Bloomfield & Bianchini, 2004, 38) has shifted thinking on funding to prevent competition for resources between deprived areas by getting them to listen to each area's case and decide collectively between themselves which should take priority, thus using the funding round to build the strategic capacity of local communities to make decisions. However, resourcing remains competitive and narrowly conceived by government and often cities reflect this. Although ever more constrained by central government, councils are still lacking in imagination about mobilising other kinds of resources – building grass roots community assets as Maza Dad put it, converting and conceding premises to autonomous, voluntary and mixed community groups with conventions and rolling contracts which can promote mixing and ensure accountability in the provision of services. With regard to entrepreneurship, local economic development departments could be involved with partners in developing the kind of one-stop, comprehensive business services for women and other disadvantaged groups whose economic potential is stifled and Muslim-compliant forms of finance for communities that Parvin Ali in the East Midlands and others in the West Midlands have been pioneering.

The case of the refugee entrepreneur is instructive about what it takes to revive failing businesses in a run-down area. It took an outsider, with no immediate assets but extraordinary motivation (working sixteen hours a day for six months below the minimum wage and then working his way up through bars and restaurants, learning the language and the business as he went.)

Surely this kind of dedication could be rewarded at less personal cost and also the waste of other talent prevented, by establishing financial support programmes for small businesses in run-down areas, such as the Access to Finance initiative in London (LDA, 2005) In targetting the entrepreneurial potential of ethnic minorities and framing training packages, refugees need to be included as well.

Our refugees stressed above all the importance that being allowed to work as asylum seekers would have made to their lives, and the difference that recognition of their qualifications would have made. Whilst the government regulation of asylum seekers has forced many of them into destitution and criminalised them, cities can make a difference. They can find ways of welcoming those fleeing persecution and make them feel at home in the city of refuge (Derrida, 2001)

How can cities make the most of intercultural innovators in their midst and ensure a critical mass?
Firstly they need to value the growth of mixed ethnicity and second generation Black British and British Asian population, and draw on their multilingual, intercultural capacities and qualities to nurture them as community-based interpreters, race equality trainers, (Parekh, 2000, 287-91) communicators and mediators in planning and community disputes (Sandercock, 2003,162) as cultural animateurs, youth and community workers of the boundary-crossing kinds whose voices we have heard here. The Intercultural Centre in Turin, which operates as a cultural centre and think tank, disseminating models of work and intercultural practice, has produced a training course for intercultural animateurs that covers narratives and reminiscence, family welfare, therapy, communication, education and conflict resolution. (Ferrero, 2000)

Cities have to accept that people who break the mould may be awkward customers, they may have to be. Thinking the new and acting contrary to convention takes transgressive and rebel persona. But working in partnership to respond imaginatively to difficult to resolve issues will help counter prejudices and weaknesses on both sides – whether about the council's bureaucratic caste of mind or artists' airy fairyness and lack of grasp of social reality. A transversal approach to urban problems will help to infuse the city with new sources of imagination and collaboration.

The city can foster the intercultural innovators in its midst, by creating conducive settings for them to operate and therefore to become embedded in the urban fabric. It is clear that for refugees, outsiders and rebels these need to be informal spaces, meeting places where they can mix and find kindred spirits and so form networks and access support services. Scottish Carnival Arts in Glasgow exemplifies such an open welcoming space, that was not conceived as a social centre but as a place to celebrate and reinvent carnival. The intercultural appeal of the festival has drawn Latin American immigrants, Chilean political exiles, young people looking to party at the weekend, as well as asylum seekers and refugees. There they find a space where they can socialise, make vital social contact with already settled refugees and local residents and contribute their knowledge, skills and crafts to the workshops whether in music, carpentry, mask-making, costume design or whatever. The council gave them the premises – a large disused warehouse – but otherwise it has no core funding.

Bearing in mind the commitment of government minister, David Miliband, in his recent Scarman lecture (Miliband 2005) to Local Area Agreements to unlock new resources for the voluntary sector and end reliance on short-term *ad hoc* funding, such centres should be a priority for investing in intercultural innovation, staffing and equipping them, ensuring them a secure presence.

Whilst the openness and innovativeness of such spaces relies on them being autonomously run, the city could also access people whom it is traditionally 'difficult to reach', by siting services – legal advice, social, health and educational in such informal settings.It could learn from the transversal approach to problems adopted by the Peepul Centre in Leicester which brings together a nursery, healthcare, community enterprise training services with a theatre, music and dance venue. Even local meeting places, the mundane spaces of interaction, (Amin, 2002) neighbourhood community centres, parks and swimming pools, FE colleges can be rethought and revised with the collaboration of managers and user groups with animateurs. Planners need to think about locating these facilities strategically between communities which live apart to blur the borders and create mixed spaces of overlap. (Blomfield & Bianchini, 2004, 80-82)

In the literature on community cohesion, government policy has drawn heavily on Robert Putnam's threefold typology for building social capital: bonding, bridging and linking – i.e. connecting people within their own (ethncially defined) communities, connecting people across communities (i.e. interculturally) and thirdly connecting them to the institutions (access, public representation, mainstreaming). (Putnam, 1993; 2000) Too much emphasis, has been placed on bonding communities and not enough on bridging or linking to institutions. Even where bridging is advanced, as a two way process, the only concrete indicator proposed for measuring this is the number of refugees undertaking voluntary work !(Home Office, 2003*,* 18) As we have seen from our intercultural innovators as a whole, including refugees, they already have a high propensity to give back through ongoing voluntary work, as well as educational dissemination and political cum strategic contribution to boards and national networks. The deficit is in a the receptiveness of institutions and civic organisations to show reciprocity and for the media to recognise the openness and generosity of intercultural actors, especially refugees.

Cities can undertake bridging initiatives from funding for cross communal, intercultural activities, from small to large scale. The Diversity Exchange in Bradford, under the umbrella of Bradford Vision has actively gone out to find groups, too small or marginal to apply for funding under normal circumstances, which want to meet up with a group different from themselves, whether it be between different ethnicities, localities, faiths and also activity groups. It has given out small pots of money to fuel such interactions that cross boundaries and help people to get to know people who are different from them. (Interview Julie Whiting, Diversity Exchange, 9.1.06) It could include linking intiatives to provide training to give access to the local media, both to reshape representation of the other in the newspapers and local broadcasting networks, but also to help diversify the staffing of the local media. It should mean developing animation projects to bring people together in public spaces on an ongoing basis, not just for festivals and special occasions. On a larger scale it could include competitions for intercultural design of parks and public spaces, and iconic architecture mixing cultural forms.

For intercultural innovators to develop the city needs to commission research to find our about their needs and their milieux and it needs scouts to identify existing and potential intercultural innovators. Cities can strengthen their existing base by providing mentoring, linking up innovators who have come through the system and can smooth the path for younger successors, Research on social capital points to the importance of widening networks for social and ethnic entrepreneurs to grow. Here cities can play a

role in widening networks through linking initiatives which give innovators access to institutions and national networks. For example the city could use the occasion of the Olympics to pressurise national sporting bodies to come and scout for talent in unlikely quarters and turn it into a media event.

To embed intercultural innovation, and make it an inherent self-reproducing part of the urban fabric requires creating ' a critical mass' of the kind Ann Constantine identifies in arts organisations in Lewisham which have built trust relations over the long-term with Lewisham council, which understands arts and youth arts and has become '*a centre of excellence in that as a borough'*. (Ann Constantine, 22.12.05)

The way to embed intercultural innovation symbolically is to support the creation and dissemination of intercultural narratives of the city which reconnects its diverse cultural make-up to previous phases of its history. Tina Garavi, for example, the daughter of an Iranian refugee, who works in Newcastle University, in community media and as an independent filmmaker, traces the Arab presence in the North East back to the Roman empire in a film about the Yemeni community which lives in South Shields today. It traces the visit of Mohammed Ali to South Shields to have his wedding blessed in the Yemeni mosque and of a young boy in the audience who is now grown up. The city has not recognised the value and importance of this kind of intercultural rereading of its past which has important ramifications for how the present is seen and presented, what stories are told in school textbooks and histories of the city, in guidebooks and museums. (Interview Tina Garavi, 20.07.05; Bloomfield & Bianchini, 2004 for other examples 97-101) This is just the kind of project to challenge the image of the city as white and to fire new audiences' intercultural imagination.

A further form of embedding that cities need to capitalise on the innovative potential of diversity, is intercultural literacy training for city policy officers and professions. More generally cities need to move towards the realisation that the new kinds of problem solvers in a diverse society are as likely to be animateurs, intercultural mediators and communicators from community development and youth arts as lawyers, psychologists, social workers and probation officers. This calls for a shift in training and mindset when developing projects and also calls into question the validity and effectiveness of old-style administrative divisions of policy areas. To transfer the creative practices of our innovators to the city calls for transversal, lateral thinking, making interconnections between sectors – such as economic development, health and sport, arts, housing, business training and services, media, public relations, and transport.

References

Amin Ash *Ethnicity and the Multicultural City,*Report for the Department of Transport, Local Government and the Regions and the ESRC Cities Initiative, January 2002.

Bloomfield Jude & Franco .Bianchini *Planning for the Intercultural City*, Bournes Green: Comedia, 2004.

Bossuyt T. *With Flying Colours* , VCA Booklets, Flemish Centre for Amateur Arts and Art Education, Brussels, undated c.1999.

Bradford Faith in the City Forum, *Powerful Whispers. The Report of the Bradford Urban Hearings*,1996?.

Derrida J. *On Cosmopolitanism and Forgiveness*, London: Routledge, 2001.

Fatima, "The Challenge of Sharia Compliant Banking for the East Midlands," *For Women Now*, spring edition, March 2005.

Ferrero Anna, *I Quaderni del Centro Culturali: Animatori Interculturali,:un'esperienza di formazione*, April 2000

Hannerz Ulf. *Transnational Connections*, London: Routledge, 1996.

Home Office *Indicators of Intergration,* Development and Practice Report, 2003.

Honneth, Axel, *The Struggle for Recognition: the moral grammar of Social Conflicts*, Cambridge; Polity Press, 1995.

Kantos Maria, 'Biographical' or 'ethnic' resources? The missing dimension of motivation in understanding ethnic business' in Chamberlayne Prue., Joanne Bornat and Ursula.Apitzsch eds. *Biographical Methods and Professional Prcatice*, Bristol: Policy Press, 2004.

Kupferberg Feiwel 'Ethnic entrepreneurship as innovation' in Chamberlayne Prue., Joanne Bornat and Ursula.Apitzsch eds. *Biographical Methods and Professional Practice*, Bristol: Policy Press, 2004.

Miliband David, "Building community in a diverse society" the Scarman lecture, January 31 2005, www.odpm.gov.uk

Portes Alejandro. "Social Capital: Its Origins and Applications in Contemporary Sociology" *Annual Review of Sociology*, 24, 1998, 1-24.

Portès, Alejandro, 'Economic Sociology and the Sociology of Immigration: A Conceptual Overview' in Portès Alejandro (ed.) *The Economic Sociology of Immigration. Essays on Networks, Ethnicity, and Entrepreneurship*, New York, Russel Sage Foundation, 1995,1-41.

Portès Alejandro ed. *Economic Sociology of Immigration*, Russell Sage Foundation, 1998

Putnam R. 1993. *Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy*, Princeton: Princeton University.Press.

Putnam R. 2000. *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, New York

Strickson Adam "The Flowering of Frizinghall "in Deardon S. ed. *Writing Renewal* 2 : *Not sat around looking at bubbles*, Leeds and Huddersfield: Government Office of Yorkshire and the Humber in association with Interculture, 2005.

Taylor Charles, *Multiculturalism and the Politics of Recognition*, Princeton University Press, 1994.

Wallman Sandra *The Diversity of Diversity: Implications of the Form and Process of Localised Urban Systems*, Fondazione ENI Enrico Mattei Working Paper series, KNOW 76. 2003, www.feem.it/Feem/Pub/Publications/WPapers/default.html

Further Research
This inquiry has raised the questions which are beyond its scope that would benefit from further research such as whether :

- intercultural innovators exist in all fields of endeavour which would require the selection of intercultural innovators from targetted professions: scientific, managerial, technical to ascertain the preponderance we found in the arts and community development reflects a bias in the selection procedure and selectors' networks and informants
-
- intercultural innovation will be less evident in jobs and businesses based on traditional disciplines because intercultural innovators are found in communicative professions where social contact plays an important role
.
- all intercultural mixes are as fruitful of innovation or some more than others as in the case of the German-Jewish symbiosis – a question Hannerz raises.(Hannerz, 1996)