

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 3 December 2018

**DH-BIO/abr RAP 14**

**COMMITTEE ON BIOETHICS**

**(DH-BIO)**

**14<sup>th</sup> MEETING**

**Strasbourg, 20-22 November 2018**

**ABRIDGED REPORT**

## **I. Adoption of the agenda**

1. The Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO) held its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting in Strasbourg from 20 to 22 November 2018. The agenda of the meeting and the list of participants appear in Appendix I and Appendix II to this report.

## **II. Developments in the field of bioethics**

2. The DH-BIO took note of the developments in the field of bioethics within the member states, as well as in international organisations. It also took note of the relevant developments in other Council of Europe bodies.

## **III. Chart of signatures and ratifications of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, the Protocol on the Prohibition of Cloning Human Beings, the Protocol concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin, the Protocol concerning Biomedical Research and the Protocol concerning Genetic Testing for Health Purposes**

3. The DH-BIO took note of the information sent in written form on the current process towards signature and/or ratification of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (Oviedo Convention) and/or its Additional Protocols in some member and observer states.

## **IV. Working methods and future activities of the DH-BIO**

4. The DH-BIO held an exchange of views with Mr Christophe Poirel, Director for Human Rights, on the reflection process launched by the Secretary General on the role and impact of intergovernmental committees. Mr Poirel underlined the determining role of the Committee's work, emphasized the particular importance of its visibility in the current context and encouraged Delegations to maintain close contact with their respective Permanent Representations.
5. The Chair of the DH-BIO, Dr Beatrice Ioan (Romania), informed the DH-BIO on the first meeting between the Secretary General and the chairs of the intergovernmental committees which took place on 20 September 2018.

## **V. Public Debate**

6. The Chair of the drafting group, Ms Tesi Aschan (Sweden), together with other members of the Drafting Group, recalled the reasons and objectives for the guide on public debate and summarized the progress made, which included a hearing with selected experts and practitioners that was held in Paris on 4 October 2018.
7. The DH-BIO heard presentations by two invited experts on practical examples of public debate processes which had taken place in Ireland and Poland, respectively.
8. The DH-BIO welcomed the preliminary draft guide prepared by the drafting group on public debate and supported its orientation. The Committee invited the drafting group to take note of the specific comments and proposals provided by delegations. **Delegations were invited to provide their written comments on the current draft to the Secretariat at the latest by 10 December 2018.**
9. The DH-BIO welcomed the general approach of the draft concept note and provisional draft programme for a high-level seminar on public debate, to be held in Strasbourg on

4 June 2019 under the auspices of the French Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers. It agreed to entrust the development of the programme of the seminar to the drafting group on public debate in cooperation with the Bureau, and with the assistance of the Secretariat.

10. **Delegations were also invited to provide their comments and proposals to the current draft programme to the Secretariat at the latest by 10 December 2018.**

#### **VI. HELP course**

11. Delegations were informed that the English version of the new HELP (Human Rights Education for Legal Professionals) course on key human rights principles in biomedicine, targeting both legal and medical professional, is now freely available on the HELP platform (<http://help.elearning.ext.coe.int/>). Other language versions were in preparation (Armenian, Italian, Romanian and Spanish). The Russian version of the course will be presented in Moscow on 29 November 2018 and launched in Minsk on 7 December 2018 within the framework of the Action Plan for Belarus.

12. **The Secretariat invited Delegations to convey any expression of interests from national training institutes to cooperate with the Council of Europe to launch this course in their country.**

#### **VII. Cooperation with other committees**

##### Ad Hoc Committee for the Rights of the Child (CAHENF)

13. The DH-BIO held an exchange of views with the Chair of the CAHENF, Ms Maria-Andriani Kostopoulou, with the aim of identifying areas of future co-operation between the two Committees, including in view of the current development, by the DH-BIO, of a Strategic Action Plan. Delegations raised a number of issues relating to children's rights in biomedicine.
14. The Chair of CAHENF thanked the DH-BIO for valuable expert contribution to the CAHENF's work on age assessment of migrant children and invited the DH-BIO to contribute, by June 2019, to the mid-term evaluation of the Strategy for the rights of the child 2016 - 2021.
15. In this context, the DH-BIO agreed to designate a rapporteur on children rights. Ms Ritva Halila (Finland) and Mr Miguel Oliveira Da Silva (Portugal) expressed their interest in this task.

##### European Committee on Organ Transplantation (CD-P-TO)

16. Ms Ritva Halila (Finland), representative of the DH-BIO to the CD-P-TO, informed the DH-BIO about the current work of that committee.

##### Consultative Committee of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (T-PD)

17. The DH-BIO was informed that the T-PD had presented the text of the draft Recommendation on Health-related data to the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) with a view to its approval and presentation to the Committee of Ministers for adoption. The draft explanatory report was being finalised.

#### **VIII. Strategic Action Plan**

18. The Chair of the drafting group, Ms Siobhan O'Sullivan (Ireland), together with other members of the drafting group, presented an overview of the mission and strategic

objectives for the action plan. She highlighted the challenges posed by converging/emerging technologies for human dignity and liberty and addressed how established practices were being challenged (e.g. informed consent, migrants access to healthcare, autonomy of the child). She also questioned whether there was a need to examine and reinterpret existing bioethical principles and norms, including those referred to in the Oviedo Convention.

19. The DH-BIO welcomed the general approach of the preliminary draft Strategic Action Plan (SAP), comprising four pillars: “governance”, “equity”, “integrity” and “cooperation” and thematic areas under each of them. Within this framework, the Committee decided to entrust the drafting group on the SAP with the elaboration of a list of possible actions and to consult, where appropriate, other Council of Europe committees and other intergovernmental organisations.
20. The DH-BIO took note of the need to identify priorities for the next biennium (2020-2021) with a view to their presentation, in June 2019, to the Steering Committee on Human Rights (CDDH) for approval and then to the Committee of Ministers.
21. To these ends, **delegations were invited to send to the Secretariat, at the latest by 21 December 2018, proposals for specific actions regarding the pillars, and, among these, to identify those actions proposed for the next biennium (2020-2021).**

**IX. Additional Protocol on the protection of the human rights and dignity of persons with mental disorder with regard to involuntary placement and involuntary treatment**

22. The DH-BIO took note of the opinions submitted by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture (CPT), the Commissioner for Human Rights, the Parliamentary Assembly (PACE) Committees on Equality and Non-Discrimination and on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable development and the Conference of INGOs. Delegations were informed that the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) and the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC) would submit their opinions after their respective plenary meetings, which would take place in the end of November.
23. The DH-BIO heard oral statements from the Chair of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable development, from the Representative of the Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights, from the Representative of the Conference of INGO’s, from representatives of the European Disability Forum (EDF) and from the European Association of Service Providers for Persons with Disabilities (EASPD).
24. The DH-BIO held an exchange on the general objective and the general approach to be adopted in its further work, in the light of the comments received. With few exceptions, delegations agreed that the objective of the work remained relevant and should be further explained, when need be. In view of the opinions received and the oral statements given, delegations further agreed that the draft had to be carefully reviewed, having particular regard to strengthening the aspect of alternative and preventive measures. Particular attention had also to be given to further developing the collaboration with all relevant stakeholders.
25. In view of these considerations, the DH-BIO decided to invite the INGO’s represented during the session to submit drafting proposals on alternative and preventive measures. The DH-BIO further decided to invite the European Psychiatrist Association (EPA) and other professional organisations, which had been represented during the first consultation hearing with INGO’s in march 2014, to comment on specific aspects of the draft text. The

DH-BIO entrusted the Bureau, with the assistance of the Secretariat, to draft a cover letter with relevant questions on the draft text.

26. **Delegations were invited to submit their contributions together with their comments on the text of the Draft Additional Protocol, accompanied by drafting proposals, at the latest by 31 January 2019.**
27. The Bureau would examine all comments and contributions received during its next meeting (March 2019) in view of making a proposal(s) on the modalities of the further work to the 15<sup>th</sup> DH-BIO (4 – 7 June 2019).
28. In accordance with the intent expressed earlier, the DH-BIO entrusted the Secretariat with exploring the possibilities for further action in the field of alternative and preventive measures, in particular in the form of a mapping exercise of best practices within member States. Cooperation with relevant INGO's and other actors in the field would be of particular importance for the achievement of the objective.

#### **X. Cooperation activities**

29. The DH-BIO was informed about activities carried out as part of the Action Plan in Belarus.

#### **XI. Bureau Elections**

30. The term of Dr Beatrice Ioan coming to an end, the DH-BIO elected by acclamation Ms Tesi Aschan (Sweden) as its new Chair for a one year term, renewable once.
31. As the two candidates to the vice-chairmanship obtained the same number of votes, the DH-BIO decided to proceed again to the election of the Vice-Chair at its next plenary meeting (4-7 June 2019).
32. The DH-BIO re-elected by acclamation Ms Ritva Halila (Finland) and Prof. Miguel Oliveira da Silva (Portugal), for new terms of two years as members of the Bureau. Following the end of term of Dr Givi Javashvili (Georgia) and Ms Maria Concepcion Martin Arribas (Spain), the DH-BIO elected by acclamation Ms Rodica Gramma (Moldova), Prof. Pierre Mallia (Malta), and Ms Sarah Rueda (France) as new members of the Bureau for a term of office of two years, renewable once.

#### **XII. Dates of next meetings**

33. The DH-BIO agreed on the following dates for its next meetings to be held in Strasbourg:
  - 15<sup>th</sup> meeting of the DH-BIO: 4 – 7 June 2019
  - 16<sup>th</sup> meeting of the DH-BIO: 19-21 November 2019

#### **XIII. Decisions taken by the DH-BIO at its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting**






34. The DH-BIO agreed exceptionally to proceed by written procedure for the adoption of the decisions. In the absence of objections to the draft sent by the Secretariat, the decisions are adopted on 30 November 2018.

#### **XIV. Other business**




35. Delegations were reminded of the importance of assuring the quorum necessary for taking decisions (31 delegations) until the end of each plenary session.

36. The gender equality Rapporteur, Mr Constantinos Phellas (Cyprus), expressed his intention to prepare a draft action plan in order to mainstream gender equality into areas and activities of the DH-BIO. The Chair took note of the rapporteur's intention and **invited delegations to send him their comments and suggestions by email.**
37. The DH-BIO agreed to entrust the Secretariat with the task of preparing a questionnaire to assess the impact, at national level, of Rec(2016)8 on processing of health related data for insurance purposes, including data resulting from genetic tests with a view to be presented to the Bureau for approval before it is send to delegations.

**APPENDIX I**  
**Agenda of the 14<sup>th</sup> meeting of the DH-BIO**

- I. Adoption of the agenda
-  II. Developments in the field of bioethics (to be dealt with in writing)
-  III. Chart of signatures and ratifications of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, the Protocol on the Prohibition of Cloning Human Beings, the Protocol concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin, the Protocol concerning Biomedical Research and the Protocol concerning Genetic Testing for Health Purposes (to be dealt with in writing)
- IV. Working methods and future activities of the DH-BIO
- V. Public debate
-  VI. HELP course
-  VII. Cooperation with other committees
- VIII. Strategic Action Plan
- IX. Additional Protocol on the protection of the human rights and dignity of persons with mental disorders with regard to involuntary placement and involuntary treatment
-  X. Cooperation activities
- XI. Bureau election
- XII. Dates of the next meetings
- XIII. Decisions taken by the DH-BIO at its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting
- XIV. Other business

**Tuesday 20 November 2018 (9.30-13.00)**

<b>9.30</b>	<b>1. Adoption of the draft agenda</b>
	<b>2. Developments in the field of bioethics</b> Delegations, including observers, are invited to send information in writing. a. Developments in member states and other states b. Developments in the field of bioethics in international organisations c. Relations with other international organisations: list of meetings d. Developments in other Council of Europe bodies e. Developments at the European Court of Human Rights
To be dealt with in writing	
	<b>3. Chart of signatures and ratifications of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, the Protocol on the Prohibition of Cloning Human Beings, the Protocol concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin, the Protocol concerning Biomedical Research and the Protocol concerning Genetic Testing for Health Purpose</b>
To be dealt with in writing	
	<b>4. Working methods and future activities of the DH-BIO</b> - Exchange of views with Mr Christophe Poirel, Human Rights Director - On-going evaluation of Council of Europe intergovernmental committees
	<b>5. Public debate</b> a. Draft Guide - Presentation of the draft Guide prepared by the Drafting Group - Discussion with a view to providing guidance for the Drafting Group and agreement on the approach for the further development of the draft guide b. Presentation of examples of public debate in Ireland and Poland illustrating their achievability, added value and relevance with regard to the draft guide on public debate c. High-level seminar on public debate (4 June 2019)
<b>Tuesday 20 November 2018 (14.30-18.00)</b>	
	<b>5. Public debate (to continue)</b>
	<b>6. HELP course</b> - Update on the HELP course on essential human rights principles in biomedicine
	<b>7. Cooperation with other committees</b> a. European Committee on Organ Transplantation (CD-P-TO) b. European Committee on Blood Transfusion (CD-P-TS) c. Consultative Committee of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (T-PD) d. Ad Hoc Committee For the Rights of the Child (CAHENF)



**Wednesday 21 November 2018 (9.00-13.00)**

**8. Strategic Action Plan**

- Presentation of a preliminary draft
- Discussion with a view to providing guidance for the Drafting Group and agreement on the approach for the further development of the draft Strategic Action Plan

**Wednesday 21 November 2018 (14.30-18.00)**

**8. Strategic Action Plan (to continue)**

**9. Additional Protocol on the protection of the human rights and dignity of persons with mental disorders with regard to involuntary placement and involuntary treatment**

- Brief update on the result of the request for opinions from:
  - o the Steering Committee on Human Rights (CDDH)
  - o the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture (CPT)
  - o the CoE Commissioner for Human Rights
  - o the CoE Parliamentary Assembly
  - o the Conference of INGOs
  - o as well as from the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC) and the CPT, regarding the applicability to persons subjected to an involuntary measure to address a mental health condition while serving a prison sentence or in detention, but without any link between the measure and a criminal offence (whether the offence at the origin of the prison sentence or detention or a different one).
- Agreement on the organization of the work with a view to the finalisation of the draft additional Protocol in the light of the opinions received.
- Information on PACE hearing and other relevant developments at UN level.

**Thursday 22 November 2018 (9.00-13.00)**



**10. Cooperation activities**

- Cooperation activities within the framework of the Council of Europe Action plan for Belarus 2017-2018

**7. Cooperation with other committees**

- Exchange of views with Ms Maria-Andriani Kostopoulou, Chair of the Ad Hoc Committee for the Rights of the Child (CAHENF)

**11. Bureau election**

Delegations are invited to proceed to the election of :

- the Chair and the Vice-Chair for a one year term.
- subject to the outcome of the Chair and Vice-Chair election, 4 Bureau members for a two years term.

**Submission for nominations should be sent in writing to the Secretariat by 14.00 on Wednesday 21 November 2018.**

	<p><b>12. Dates of the next meetings</b></p> <p>Dates proposed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 15<sup>th</sup> meeting of the DH-BIO: 4-7 June 2019</li> <li>- 16<sup>th</sup> meeting of the DH-BIO: November 2019</li> </ul>
	<p><b>13. Decisions taken by the DH-BIO at its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Approval of the list of decisions</li> </ul>
	<p><b>14. Other business</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Update on gender equality</li> <li>- Follow up to Rec(2016)8 on the processing of health related data for insurance purposes, including data resulting from genetic testing</li> </ul>

**APPENDIX II**  
**List of participants**

MEMBER STATES / ETATS MEMBRES
-------------------------------

**Albania/Albanie** -

**apologised/excusé**

**Andorra/Andorre** – Mme Imma RODRIGUEZ, BATLLIA D'ANDORRA, Av. Tarragona, Ed. Les Columnes 62, Andorra, la Vella, AD 500 PRINCIPAUTÉ D'ANDORRE

**Armenia/Arménie** – Mr Igor MADOYAN, Phd, President of National Center of Bioethics, n.24, ave Sayat-Nova, apt. 14, entrance 1, 0001 YEREVAN

**Austria/Autriche** – Mag. Martina ERLEBACH, juge, référendaire de la section civile, droit national de la famille, département I 1, 1070 Vienne, Museumstraße 7, Autriche

Dr. Isabelle HASSLER, Federal Chancellery of Austria / Co-ordination Science, Research, Technology, Education, Social issues, Health, Secretariat of the Austrian Bioethics Commission, Ballhausplatz 2, 1010 Vienna, Austria

**apologised/excusé**

Dr Renate FALLY-KAUSEK, Medical Officer, Federal Ministry of Health, Department III/8– Health of children and young people, gender aspects, nutrition, Radetzkystasse 2, A-1030 WIEN

**Azerbaijan/Azerbaïdjan** – Dr. Gulnara BALAKISHIYEVA, Ph.D. in molecular biology, Senior Researcher at Department of Fundamental Problems of Biological Productivity, Institute of Molecular Biology and Biotechnology, Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences, 2a Matbuat avenue, Az-1073, Baku, Azerbaijan

**Belgium/Belgique** – Mme Régine WILMOTTE, Juriste au sein de la direction générale des Etablissements de Soins du Service public fédéral « Santé publique », Place Victor Horta 40, boîte 10, 1060 Bruxelles, Belgique

**Bosnia and Herzegovina/Bosnie-Herzégovine** – Dalibor PEJOVIC, Head of Unit for Statistics and Analytical Affairs and Reporting in Health, Department for Health

**apologised/excusé**

Dunja ŠMITRAN, Ministry of Civil Affairs of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Trg BiH 1, 71000 Sarajevo

**apologised/excusée**

**Bulgaria/Bulgarie** – Ms Sylvia TOMOVA, Ministry of Health, Legal Directorate, Chief Legal Advisor, Place St Nedelia 5, Sofia 1000

**apologised/excusée**

**Croatia/Croatie** – Dr. Vanja NIKOLAC, Head of Service, Service for blood, tissues and cells inspection, Ministry of Health, Ksaver 200a, 10 000 Zagreb, Croatia

**apologised/excusée**

**Cyprus/Chypre** – Prof. Constantinos N. PHELLAS, Chair of the Cyprus National Bioethics Committee, University of Nicosia, 46, Makedonitissas Ave. P.O. Box 24005, 1700 Nicosia

**Czech Republic/République Tchèque** – doc. JUDr. Tomáš DOLEŽAL, Ph.D., LL.M., Head of the Department of Private Law and Head of the Research Unit for Medical Law and Bioethics, Czech Academy of Science, Institute of State and Law

(Ms) doc. PhDr. Ing. Hana KONEČNÁ, Ph.D., Jihočeská univerzita v Českých Budějovicích, Zdravotně sociální fakulta, Katedra klinických a preklinických oborů, J. Boreckého 167/27, 370 11 České Budějovice, Czech Republic

**Denmark/Danemark** – Emilie SORENSEN, The Ministry of Health, Holbergsgade 6, Copenhagen

**apologised/excusée**

**Estonia/Estonie** – Prof Hele EVERAUS, Head of the Clinic, Haematology and Oncology Clinic, Tartu University, Tartu University Hospital, Puusepa 8, 51014 Tartu, Estonia

**Finland/Finlande** – Ms Ritva HALILA, M.D., Ph.D., docent, Senior Medical Officer, General Secretary, National Advisory Board on Social Welfare and Health Care Ethics (ETENE), Ministry of Social Affairs and Health, P.O. Box 33 (Meritullinkatu 10), FI-00023 Government, Finland

Ms Katja FOKIN, Legal Officer, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions, Legal Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Ms. Krista OINONEN, Government Agent before the ECtHR, Director, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions, Ministry for Foreign Affairs **apologised/excusée**

**France** – Mme Isabelle ERNY, Attachée principale d'administration centrale, Ministère des solidarités et de la Santé, Direction Générale de la Santé, Secrétariat Général, Division droit, éthique et appui juridique, 14 avenue Duquesne, 75350 PARIS 07 SP

Mme Anne FREUDENREICH, Sous-direction des droits de l'Homme, Direction des affaires juridiques, Ministère de l'Europe et des affaires étrangères, 57 Boulevard des Invalides, 75700 Paris 07 SP

Mme Marie-Aude RECHER, Bureau du droit des personnes et de la famille (C1), Direction des affaires civiles et du Sceau, Ministère de la Justice

Mme Sarah RUEDA, Chargée de mission bioéthique et droits des usagers, Ministère des solidarités et de la santé, Direction générale de la santé, Division des droits des usagers et des affaires juridiques et éthiques, 14 avenue Duquesne, 75350 PARIS 07 SP

Melle Mathilde FORMET, Ministère des solidarités et de la santé, Direction générale de la santé, Division des droits des usagers et des affaires juridiques et éthiques, 14 avenue Duquesne, 75350 PARIS 07 SP

Dr Jacques MONTAGUT, Directeur de l'IFREARES, 20 route de Revel, 31400 Toulouse

**Georgia/Géorgie** – Dr Givi JAVASHVILI, Head of Family Medicine Department, State Medical Academy of Georgia, Chairman of the National Council on Bioethics, 29 I. Chachavadze Avenue, 0179 TBILISI

**Germany/Allemagne** – Prof. Dr. Elmar DOPPELFELD (Honorary chair of the "Permanent Working Party of Research Ethics Committees in Germany Inc."), Lenaustraße 15, D-50858 Köln

Dr Nils GODENDORFF, Legal Officer, Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz, Unit III B 6, Division for Insurance Law; IOPC; Genetic Diagnostics; UNCITRAL, Mohrenstrasse 37, 10117 Berlin

Dr. Ingo HÄRTEL, Federal Ministry of Health, Division 317, Friedrichstraße 108, D-10117 Berlin

Prof. Dr. Dr. Thomas HEINEMANN, Philosophical-Theological University of Vallendar (PTHV), Pallottistraße 3, D-56179 Vallendar

Dr. Stefan OSSEGE, Federal Ministry of Education and Research, Division 612, Friedrichstraße 130 B, D-10117 Berlin **apologised/excusé**

**Greece/Grèce** – Dr Stamatia GARANIS-PAPADATOS, Lecturer, National School of Public Health, 196 Alexandras Avenue, 11521 Athens

Dr Foteini A. TZAVELLA, PhD, Assistant Professor of Health Sociology, Department of Nursing, University of Peloponnese, Efsthathiou and Stamatikis Valiotti & Plateon str., Sparta 231 00, Greece

**Hungary/Hongrie** - Ms Eszter MAROSI, Head of Secretariat, Medical Research Council, H-1051 Budapest, Arany János utca 6-8. 3/334 **apologised/excusée**

Prof. Ernő Bácsy, MD, PhD, DSc, Medical Research Council of Hungary, Arany János utca 6-8., 1051 Budapest, Hungary

**Iceland/Islande** – Ms. Thorunn STEINSDOTTIR, Legal Advisor, Ministry of Welfare, Hafnarhúsinu við Tryggvagötu, 101 Reykjavík **apologised/excusée**

Mr Rögnvaldur G. GUNNARSSON, Legal Advisor, Ministry of Welfare, Skógarhlíð 6, 105 Reykjavík

**Ireland/Irlande** – Dr Siobhan O’SULLIVAN, Chief Bioethics Officer, An Roinn Sláinte Department of Health, Teach Hawkins, Sráid Hawkins, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 VW90 Hawkins House, Hawkins Street, Dublin 2, D02 VW90

**Italy/Italie** - Prof. Assunta MORRESI, Prof. Associato di Chimica Fisica, Dipartimento di Chimica, Biologia e Biotecnologie, Università degli Studi di Perugia, V. Elce di Sotto, 8, 06123 PERUGIA (IT)

Laura PALAZZANI, Lumsa, Facoltà di giurisprudenza, via Pompeo Magno 22, 00192 Roma **apologised/excusée**

**Latvia/Lettonie** – Dr.Vents SĪLIS, Assistant Professor at Riga Stradins University, Department of Humanities, Dzirciema street 16, Riga, LV- 1007

**Liechtenstein** - **apologised/excusé**

**Lithuania/Lituanie** – **apologised/excusé**

**Luxembourg** – Delphine STOFFEL, Ministère de la Santé, Division des Affaires Juridiques, Villa Louvigny, Allée Marconi L-2120 Luxembourg

**Malta/Malte** - Prof. Pierre MALLIA, MD PhD, CBiol MPhil MA(Law) DipICGP MMCFD MRCP FRCGP, Professor of Family Medicine, Bioethics & Patients’ Rights, Chairperson, National Health Ethics Committee, Dept. of Health, Chairperson, Bioethics Consultative Committee, Ministry of Health, Coordinator, Bioethics Research Programme, Univ. of Malta, President, Malta College of Family Doctors

**Republic of Moldova/République de Moldova** – Ms Rodica GRAMMA, Associate Professor, State University of Medicine and Pharmacy (USMF) "Testemitanu"

**Monaco** - **apologised/excusé**

**Montenegro/Monténégro** – Ms Olivera MILJANOVIC, Prim. doc., Director of the Centre for Medical Genetics and Immunology, Medical Centre of Montenegro, Krusevac bb, 81000 Podgorica

**Netherlands/Pays-Bas** – Ms Sanne VAN WEEZEL, Ministry of Health, Welfare and Sports, PO Box 20350, 2500EJ, The Hague **apologised/excusée**

**Norway/Norvège** – Mrs Anne FORUS, Senior Adviser, ph.d, Biotechnology and health legislation department, Division of specialised health care services, Norwegian Directorate of Health, P.O.Box 7000, St Olavs plass, N-0130 Oslo

Camilla Closs WALMANN, Senior Adviser, Department for Biotechnology and Health Law, Norwegian Directorate of Health, P.O.Box 7000 St Olavs plass, N-0130 Oslo, Norway **apologised/excusée**

Vårin HELLEVIK, Norwegian Directorate of Health, Department of Specialized Mental health care and Addiction Treatment, Pb. 7000 St. Olavs plass, 0130 Oslo, Norway **apologised/excusée**

**Poland/Pologne** – Ms Mariola GROCHULSKA, Département des droits de l’homme, Ministère de la Justice, Al. Ujazdowskie 11, 00-950 WARSAW

**Portugal** - Prof. Miguel OLIVEIRA DA SILVA, Medical Ethics Full Teacher at Lisbon Faculty of Medicine Av. Prof. Egas Moniz 1640-028, Lisboa, Portugal

**Romania/Roumanie** – Mrs Beatrice Gabriela IOAN, Associate Professor, President of the Bioethics Commission of the Romanian College of Physicians, Institutul de Medicina Legală, str. Bunavestire nr. 4, IASI

Mr. Gheorghe BORCEAN, President de L'Ordre des Medecins et Prof. Ass.a L'Universite de Medecine et Pharmacie " Victor Babes" de Timisoara, Vice-President of the Romanian College of Physicians, Spitalul Municipal Caransebes, str. Gradinilor nr. 36<sup>a</sup>, CARANSEBES, jud. CARAS-SEVERIN 325400

**Russian Federation/Fédération de Russie** – Ms Maria ORESHINA, 1st secretary of the Department of European cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

**San Marino/Saint-Marin** - Dr Luisa BORGIA, Vice-President of the National Ethics Committee, Contrada Le Grazie, n.3, 62029 Tolentino (MC), Italia

**Serbia/Serbie** - Prof. Dr Zvonko MAGIC, Head of the Institute for Medical Research in the MMA (Military Medical Academy), professor of the human genetics at the Medical Faculty and Cochairmen of the National Committee for bioethics of UNESCO Commission of Serbia, Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts, 11000 Belgrade, Serbia

**Slovakia/Slovaquie** – Prof. Jozef GLASA, MD, PhD, PhD; Institute of Pharmacology and Clinical Pharmacology, Institute of Health Care Ethics, Slovak Medical University in Bratislava; Institute of Medical Ethics and Bioethics n.f.; Ethics Committee (NEC), Ministry of Health SR; Limbová 12-14, 83303 Bratislava

**Slovenia/Slovénie** – Prof. Marjeta TERČELJ ZORMAN, Dr.Med. Na Griču 14, Mlaka Pri Kranju,4000 Kranj

**Spain/Espagne** – M<sup>a</sup> Concepción MARTIN ARRIBAS, Subdirección General de Investigación en Terapia Celular y Medicina Regenerativa – Instituto de Salud Carlos III – ISCIII, Avda. Monforte de Lemos 5, 28029 Madrid

Carlos ALONSO BEDATE, Centro de Biología Molecular, Member of the National Committee for Bioethics, C/ Alberto Aguilera, 21. 28015 Madrid, Spain **apologised/excusé**

Prof. Carlos M. ROMEO – CASABONA, Professor of Penal Law, Head, Inter-University Chair in Law and the Human Genome, Avda. de las Universidades 24; 48007 BILBAO, Spain

**Sweden/Suède** – Mrs Tesi ASCHAN, Legal Adviser, The National Board of Health and Welfare, Socialstyrelsen, 106 30 Stockholm

**Switzerland/Suisse** - Dr Martin GÖTZ, Office fédérale de la santé publique, Division Biomédecine, collaborateur scientifique, Seilerstrasse 8, 3003 Bern

**"The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"/« L'ex-République yougoslave de Macédoine »** - **apologised/excusé**

**Turkey/Turquie** – Prof. Ergun ÖZSUNAY, Professor of Civil, Comparative Law and EU Private law, Istanbul Culture University, Faculty of Law, İstiklal cad. 245, Tunca Apt. Daire 7, 34430 Istanbul

**Ukraine** - Prof Zoreslava SHKIRYAK-NYZHNYK, Vice-president of Bioethics Committee of National Academy of Medical Sciences, Chief of the Department of Family Health Problems, Academy of Postgraduate Education, Institute of Paediatrics, Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Mayborody str., 8, 04050 Kyiv

**United Kingdom/Royaume-Uni** - Dr Mark BALE, Deputy Director, Health Science & Bioethics Division, Department of Health, Richmond House, Whitehall, London SW1A 2NS

INVITED GUESTS
----------------

Ms Anna BIALEK, Constitutional, International and European Law Department, Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights (Ombudsman), Al. Solidarności 77, 00-090 Warszawa, Poland

Dr Peter MILLS, Nuffield Council on Bioethics, 28 Bedford Square, UK-London WC1B 3JS

Dr Eoin O'MALLEY, Director of MSc. in Public Policy, School of Law and Government, Dublin City University, Dublin 9, Ireland

Mme Marie-Hélène MOUNEYRAT, Secrétaire Générale, Comité Consultatif National d'Éthique, 66 rue de Bellechasse, 75016 Paris

Mr Kristof VAN ASSCHE, Postdoctoral researcher, Bioethics Institute Ghent, Ghent University, Blandijnberg 2, B-9000 Gent

PARTICIPANTS
--------------

**CDCJ** – **apologised/excusé**

**CDDH** – Mme Brigitte KONZ, Juge de Paix directrice, Cité judiciaire, Plateau du St Esprit, Bâtiment JP - L-1475 Luxembourg **apologised/excusée**

**CD-P-TS** – Dr. Guy RAUTMANN, Secretary of the European Committee on Blood Transfusion (CD-P-TS), European Directorate for the Quality of Medicines and HealthCare, Department of Biological Standardisation and OMCL Network **apologised/excusé**

**CD-P-TO** – Ms Marta LOPEZ FRAGA, Secretary of the CD-P-TO **apologised/excusée**

**T-PD** – Ms Sophie KWASNY, Administrator **apologised/excusée**

**CPT** – Michael NEURAUTER, Head of Division of the Secretariat of CPT **apologised/excusé**

**CAHENF** – Ms Livia STOICA, Administrator

Ms Maria-Andriani KOSTOPOULOU, Chair of the Ad Hoc Committee for the Rights of the Child (CAHENF)

**PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY/ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE** – M. Stefan SCHENNACH, Chair of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Ms Tanja KLEINSORGE, Head of Secretariat, Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Ms Ayşegül ELVERİŞ, Secretary, Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

**OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS / BUREAU DU COMMISSAIRE AUX DROITS DE L'HOMME** - Mr Hasan BERMEK, Adviser, Council of Europe, F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex

**CONFERENCE OF INGOS/ CONFÉRENCE DES OING** – Dr André CLAVERT, Docteur en Médecine, docteur d'Université, Membre de Médecins du Monde, Membre du CEERE Centre européen d'enseignement et de recherche en éthique, 22 rue Schwendi, 67000 Strasbourg

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS

**EUROPEAN COMMISSION/COMMISSION EUROPEENNE** – Dr Jim DRATWA, Head of Ethics and Head of the EGE Secretariat, Member of the Bureau of European Policy Advisers (BEPA), European Commission, Rue de la Loi 200 Wetsraat, BERL 8/358, B-1049 Brussels **apologised/excusé**

**EUROPEAN UNION/UNION EUROPEENNE** - Stéphanie TOSCHI, Political officer, Delegation of the European Union to the Council of Europe

**Canada** – Dr. Peter MONETTE, Manager of Bioethics, Department of Health Canada, Science Policy Directorate, Strategic Policy Branch, Health Canada, Brooke Claxton Building, 70 promenade Colombine Driveway, Tunney's Pasture, Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0K9 , Postal Locator: 0909C **apologised/excusé**

**Holy See/Saint-Siège** – Mgr. Jacques SUAUDEAU, Cure Saint Bruno, 5 Place Saint Bruno, 38500 Voiron, France

**Japan/Japon** – Mr Takaaki SHINTAKU, Consul, Attorney Consulat Général du Japon à Strasbourg, 20, place des Halles, 67 000 STRASBOURG **apologised/excusé**

**Mexico/Mexique** – Dr. Manuel H RUIZ DE CHÁVEZ, President of the Council of the National Commission of Bioethics. Calz. Arenal No. 134, Col. Arenal-Tepepan, Deleg. Tlalpan, Mexico D. F., Mexico **apologised/excusé**

**USA/Etats-Unis d'Amérique** – **apologised/excusé**

**Republic of Belarus** – Mr Andrei BABCHANOK, Head of the Legal Department, Ministry of Health, 39 Myasnikova, Minsk, 220048

Ms Valerya SOKOLCHIK, Dean of the Department of Public Health and Healthcare Management, Belarusian Medical Academy of Post-Graduate Education, Minsk

**UNESCO** – Mrs. Dafna FEINHOLZ KLIP, Section de la bioéthique, Division de l'éthique des sciences et des technologies, UNESCO, 1 rue Miollis, 75732 PARIS CEDEX 15

**OECD/OCDE** – Mr David WINICKOFF, STI/STP **apologised/excusé**

**World Health Organisation/Organisation Mondiale de la Santé (WHO/OMS)** – Dr Abha SAXENA (MD), Coordinator, Global Health Ethics, Secretary, Research Ethics Review Committee (ERC), HIS/KER, Cluster of Health Systems and Innovation, World Health Organization, 20, Avenue Appia, CH- 1211, Geneva 27, Switzerland **apologised/excusée**

Dr Andreas REIS, Technical Officer, HIS/KER, Cluster of Health Systems and Innovation, World Health Organization, 20, Avenue Appia, CH- 1211, Geneva 27, Switzerland **apologised/excusé**

Dr Katherine LITTLER, Global Health Ethics, Health Systems and Innovation Cluster, World Health Organization, 20, Avenue Appia, CH-1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

**KEK – Conference of European Churches/Conférence des Eglises Européennes** – Rev. Sören LENZ, Executive Secretary, Conference of European Churches, Strasbourg office, 8, rue du Fossé des Treize, 67000 Strasbourg



## INGOs

**Rehabilitation International (RI)** - Dr Régine ERNST - Project Manager on Rehabilitation and Foreign Affairs, Bundesarbeitsgemeinschaft für Rehabilitation e.V./Rehabilitation International (RI), Solmsstrasse 18, D-60486 Frankfurt am Main **apologised/excusée**

Gemma HOPE, Head of Policy & Research, Shaw Trust (member of Rehabilitation International (RI)), **apologised/excusée**

**European Disability Forum (EDF)** - John Patrick CLARKE, European Disability Forum (EDF), Square de Meeus 35, 1000 Brussels, Belgium

Jolijn SANTEGOEDS, European Disability Forum (EDF)

Marie FALLON-KUND, European Disability Forum (EDF) **apologised/excusée**

Kristijan GRDAN, European Disability Forum (EDF)

Marine ULDRY, European Disability Forum (EDF), Human Rights officer

Stephanie WOOLEY, European Disability Forum (EDF)

**European Association of Service Providers for Persons with Disabilities (EASPD)** - Mr Josep Maria SOLÉ CHAVERO, Board member of EASPD

M. Josep SOLÉ CABALLOL (accompagnateur)

## SECRETARIAT

### **DIRECTORATE GENERAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW HUMAN RIGHTS DIRECTORATE/ DIRECTION DES DROITS DE L'HOMME**

Mr Christophe POIREL, Director/Directeur

### **BIOETHICS UNIT UNITE DE LA BIOETHIQUE**

Ms Laurence LWOFF, Secretary of the DH-BIO / Secrétaire du DH-BIO, Tel: +33 (0) 388 41 22 68, Email: [laurence.lwoff@coe.int](mailto:laurence.lwoff@coe.int)

Mr Lee HIBBARD, Administrator / Administrateur, Tel: +33 (0) 388 41 31 04, Email: [lee.hibbard@coe.int](mailto:lee.hibbard@coe.int)

Ms Katrin UERPMANN, Administrator / Administratrice, Tel: +33 (0) 390 21 43 25, Email: [katrin.uerpmann@coe.int](mailto:katrin.uerpmann@coe.int)

Ms Anna MIKHEDENKO, Project Officer / Chargée de projet, Tel: +33 (0) 390 21 60 49, Email: [anna.mikhedenko@coe.int](mailto:anna.mikhedenko@coe.int)

Ms Catherine FORNÉ, Assistant / Assistante, Tel: +33 (0) 388 41 22 20, Email: [catherine.forne@coe.int](mailto:catherine.forne@coe.int)

Ms Karolina KOLJAJ, Trainee / Stagiaire

## INTERPRETERS / INTERPRETES

Amanda BEDDOWS  
Lucie DE BURLET  
Chloé CHENETIER