

SECRETARIAT / SECRÉTARIAT

SECRETARIAT OF THE COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS
SECRÉTARIAT DU COMITÉ DES MINISTRES

COMMITTEE
OF MINISTERS
COMITÉ
DES MINISTRES



Contact: Zoë Bryanston-Cross
Tel: 03.90.21.59.62

Date: 20/10/2021

DH-DD(2021)1077

Document distributed under the sole responsibility of its author, without prejudice to the legal or political position of the Committee of Ministers.

Meeting: 1419th meeting (December 2021) (DH)

Communication from an NGO (Alevi Philosophy Centre (ADO)) (11/10/2021) in the cases of ZENGİN, MANSUR YALCIN AND OTHERS, CUMHURİYETÇİ EĞİTİM VE KÜLTÜR MERKEZİ VAKFI and İZZETTİN DOĞAN AND OTHERS v. Turkey (Applications No. 1448/04, 21163/11, 32093/10, 62649/10).

Information made available under Rule 9.2 of the Rules of the Committee of Ministers for the supervision of the execution of judgments and of the terms of friendly settlements.

* * * * *

Document distribué sous la seule responsabilité de son auteur, sans préjuger de la position juridique ou politique du Comité des Ministres.

Réunion : 1419^e réunion (décembre 2021) (DH)

Communication d'une ONG (Alevi Philosophy Centre (ADO)) (11/10/2021) relative aux affaires ZENGİN, MANSUR YALCIN ET AUTRES, CUMHURİYETÇİ EĞİTİM VE KÜLTÜR MERKEZİ VAKFI et İZZETTİN DOĞAN ET AUTRES c. Turquie (requêtes n° 1448/04, 21163/11, 32093/10, 62649/10) **[anglais uniquement]**

Informations mises à disposition en vertu de la Règle 9.2 des Règles du Comité des Ministres pour la surveillance de l'exécution des arrêts et des termes des règlements amiables.



ADO Alevi Philosophy Center

Date: 11.10.2021

The Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

Directorate of Human rights

Department for the execution of judgments.

RE: 1419th.CoM meeting

CUMHURİYETÇİ EĞİTİM VE KÜLTÜR MERKEZİ VAKFI GROUP of cases (32093/10- 62649/10),
ZENGİN HASAN AND EYLEM GROUP (1448/04)

We are thankful to Committee of Ministers for including our cases to the agenda of CoM 1419th meeting.

As it is rightfully stated in the agenda, item 36 Alevi Group of Cases have been subject to:
“Structural and administrative problems leading to various differences in treatment between followers of the Alevi faith and adherents of the majority branch of Islam, including compulsory religious education classes.”

Alevi group of cases have been standing idle for a long term without any satisfactory implementation of judgments. As it was pointed out among decisions of CoM meeting 1362, failure to link individual measures to the general measures and only paying penalties to applicants without correcting the related legislation and procedures is still going on and provides a major obstacle in completion of implementations and just satisfaction issues.

Status of Cemevis (32093/10) is still an open problem,

Partial reimbursement of lighting costs of cemevis is still not subject to a regulation and/or administrative guide, therefore in order to benefit from a minor fraction of state supports provided to worship places, each of the thousands of Cemevis are forced to open separate court cases and complete/replicate same procedures that has already been completed several times in Turkish Courts. Although discussions are focusing on electricity bills as a symbolic indicator, Court judgment actually points out to this fact that there are many other supports than electricity bills and this fact was again mentioned in 1362 meeting decisions by reminding our authorities that; **“partial reimbursement of lighting costs to cemevis is insufficient to resolve the**

www.aleviocagi.org



İstiklal Cad. No 76 Fl 4-13 Beyoğlu- İstanbul 34435
Ph:+90 532 513 2795 Fax:+90 212 212 0129

www.alevicenter.org

Turkey
dbermek@gmail.com

discrimination identified by the Court arising from the blanket exclusion of the Alevi community from State religious subsidies and other benefits,

including tax exemptions.” In other words, we are still standing at the first small step of State religious subsidies problems.

Status of religious groups:

Izzettin Dogan and others (62649/10)

In spite of the Court judgment dated 2016, we do not have any progress related to implementations yet;

- Religious groups are not allowed to have legal identity, (Para 92,94 and 95 of judgment)
- Religious groups may not train their clergy, (Para 110,124)
- Non- Sunni and minority belief groups does not benefit from state supports provided to Sunni group. (Blanket exclusion as referred above)

Conditions stated in Para 124.of judgment are still persistent in Turkey; **“Court considers that the attitude of the State authorities towards the Alevi community, its religious practices and its places of worship is incompatible with the State’s duty of neutrality and impartiality and with the right of religious communities to an autonomous existence.”**

“Denial of the autonomous existence of Alevi community” is going on with all implications of the situation as stated in Para 135 of judgment.

1362th CoM requested Turkish authorities to; **“Draw up a comprehensive action plan with a concrete calendar indicating specific legislative and administrative measures and, in view of the passage of time since the first of these judgments became final, to provide it to the Committee of Ministers by 1 June 2020.”**

Such a ROAD MAP has not yet been delivered till September 2021 according to our knowledge and no reference or declaration of will has been announced by authorities.

Educational Judgments: Hasan and Eylem Zengin (1448/04), Mansur Yalcin and others (21163/11)

Educational cases were transferred to enhanced supervision procedures during Dec.2019.

However as Turkish educational system is in a chaotic situation due to pandemic inconveniences no progress has been noted so far.

Curriculums remain as they were, electives are now being used as a tool for additional religious training, there are even some initiatives suggesting to include fundamentalist religious lessons to pre-school educations of under 6 years old children. The Norwegian Helsinki Committee’s “Freedom of Belief Initiative” have submitted a wide report to CoM on educational matters dated 2. March.2021, we agree and confirm many points of their findings and wait start-up of a communication with Turkish authorities.

www.aleviocagi.org

İstiklal Cad. No 76 Fl 4-13 Beyoglu- İstanbul 34435
Ph:+90 532 513 2795 Fax:+90 212 212 0129

www.alevicenter.org



Turkey

dbermek@gmail.com

Naturally Educational applications are representing the biggest threat to the future of Alevi community with its assimilative nature.

Turkey's Judiciary reform about human rights:

There is no progress on Human Rights Action Plan (HRAP) of Turkey in relation with Religious Freedom issues, since our last report submitted to Dept. for the execution of judgments on 7. May.2021 with confirmation ref: DGI/IB/OFN/bk

As a short note, on 8. Ocatober.2021 we have met with European Parliamentary Assembly, Turkey rapporteur Mr. Nacho SANCHEZ AMOR and exchanged ideas with him, thanks to arrangements made by EU Delegation in Turkey.

We are now expecting 1419th meeting with great enthusiasm.

Kindest regards

Dogan Bermek .

Alevi Philosophy Center Association

