

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

Decisions adopted

No decision

- 1.2 Preparation of forthcoming meetings
- 1.5 Communication by the Committee of Ministers' Presidency
- 2.1 The Council of Europe and the conflict in Georgia
- 2.2 Situation in Cyprus
- 2.3 Consequences of the aggression of the Russian Federation against Ukraine
- 2.5 Other current political questions
- H46-1 Kavala v. Türkiye (Application No. 28749/18): Situation of the applicant – Supervision of the execution of the European Court's judgments

Item postponed

- 4.1 "Transnational repression as a growing threat to the rule of law and human rights" – Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2257 (2023)

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024 / 1505^e réunion, 3 septembre 2024

List of those present / Liste des présents

The 1505th meeting of the Ministers' Deputies opened on 3 September 2024 at 9.30 a.m. under the chairmanship of Mr A. Krivas, Deputy for the Minister for Foreign Affairs of Lithuania.

La 1505^e réunion des Délégués des Ministres est ouverte le 3 septembre 2024 à 9h30 sous la présidence de M. A. Krivas, Délégué du ministre des Affaires étrangères de la Lituanie.

ALBANIA / ALBANIE

Mr/M. D. Koreshi
Ms/Mme B. Koço
Mr/M. A. Xhoi

ANDORRA / ANDORRE

Mr/M. A. Jordi
Ms/Mme O. Torres Barros

ARMENIA / ARMÉNIE

Mr/M. A. Khachatryan
Ms/Mme M. Simonyan
Mr/M. A. Grigoryan
Ms/Mme M. Manucharyan

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Ms/Mme K. Enzesberger

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Mr/M. F. Ismayilov
Mr/M. A. Aghayev
Mr/M. P. Rustamov
Ms/Mme E. Alizada

BELGIUM / Belgique

Ms/Mme D. Delieux
Ms/Mme S. Van Buggenhout
Mr/M. S. Billard

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZÉGOVINE

Mr/M. H. Bašić

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Ms/Mme E. Tomova

CROATIA / CROATIE

Ms/Mme L. Vizek Mrzljak
Ms/Mme N. Bečirević
Ms/Mme B. Pavliček Budimir

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Mr/M. D. Hatziargyrou
Mr/M. K. Psevdiotis
Ms/Mme H. Josephides
Ms/Mme M. Kampouridou

CZECH REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE

Mr/M. P. Válek
Ms/Mme K. Gatica Gronská

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Mr/M. J. Kisling
Mr/M. A. Berahmand
Ms/Mme K. Thorndahl

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Ms/Mme A. Leppik von Wirén
Ms/Mme K. Anipai-Töniste

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Ms/Mme S. Paukkunen-Mykkänen

FRANCE

Mr/M. P. Ndiaye
Ms/Mme C. Vuillet
Ms/Mme L. Cornu
Mr/M. G. Boumediene-Trainoir

GEORGIA / GÉORGIE

Ms/Mme T. Taliashvili
Ms/Mme S. Salukvadze

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Ms/Mme H. Thiele
Ms/Mme F. Steglich

GREECE / GRÈCE

Mr/M. P. Beglitis
Mr/M. G. Dontas
Mr/M. M. Nakos
Mr/M. A. Zachilas

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Mr/M. H.A. Rusz
 Mr/M. C. Major
 Ms/Mme E. Grünwald
 Mr/M. Z. Turai
 Ms/Mme B. Hochmann

ICELAND / ISLANDE

Ms/Mme R. Arnljótsdóttir

IRELAND / IRLANDE

Ms/Mme C. Doyle
 Mr/M. M. Ó Cearnaigh
 Ms/Mme R. Clarke
 Ms/Mme H. Harman Conlon
 Mr/M. N. Fitzgerald

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr/M. R. Martini
 Mr/M. F. Forte
 Mr/M. R. Festa

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Ms/Mme A. Vilde
 Ms/Mme J. Tuļina
 Mr/M. E. Dzenītis

LIECHTENSTEIN

Ms/Mme H. Lorez-Schweig

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Mr/M. A. Krivas, President
 Ms/Mme I. Galdikaitė
 Mr/M. A. Tumėnas
 Ms/Mme A. Martinez

LUXEMBOURG

Mr/M. P. Engelberg
 Ms/Mme C. Wiseler
 Mr/M. D. Verdin-Pol

MALTA / MALTE

Ms/Mme F. Camilleri Vettiger
 Ms/Mme F. Abela
 Ms/Mme J. Cuschieri
 Ms/Mme G. Marchetti
 Ms/Mme L. Chetcuti

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA /
RÉPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Ms/Mme D. Cujbă
 Mr/M. N. Coşleţ

MONACO

Mr/M. G. Revel

MONTENEGRO / MONTÉNÉGRO

Ms/Mme B. Krunić
 Ms/Mme V. Berišaj

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Ms/Mme T. Gonggrijp
 Mr/M. L. Ten Hagen

NORTH MACEDONIA /
MACÉDOINE DU NORD

Ms/Mme S. Geleva
 Ms/Mme S. Mitrovska
 Mr/M. N. Rechi

NORWAY / NORVÈGE

Ms/Mme K. Riisøen

POLAND / POLOGNE

Ms/Mme I. Marczyk-Stępniewska
 Mr/M. R. Czarski

PORTUGAL

Mr/M. G. Jeronimo
 Mr/M. C. Oliveira

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Mr/M. I. Jinga
 Ms/Mme B. Mina
 Ms/Mme R.M. Ciucă
 Mr/M. C. Ciobanu
 Ms/Mme A.-M. Bărbieru

SAN MARINO / SAINT-MARIN

Ms/Mme M. Bovi

SERBIA / SERBIE

Ms/Mme S. Grubješić
 Mr/M. D. Cicović

SLOVAK REPUBLIC /
RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Ms/Mme O. Tomova
 Ms/Mme A. Longauerova

SLOVENIA / SLOVÉNIE

Ms/Mme B. Mrak
 Mr/M. G. Pajnkihar

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Mr/M. J.I. Morro
 Mr/M. C. Lucini Baquerizo

SWEDEN / SUÈDE

Mr/M. C. Bergdahl

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Mr/M. C. Wild
 Mr/M. U. Beer

TÜRKIYE

Ms/Mme N. Bayraktar Golder
 Ms/Mme Y. Gündoğdu Cobanoğlu
 Ms/Mme G. Sarıgül
 Ms/Mme S. Çimen
 Mr/M. F. Gündoğdu
 Mr/M. A.E. Bal
 Ms/Mme D. Çevik Bal
 Ms/Mme S. Erdeviren
 Mr/M. Ö. Yilmaz
 Mr/M. M. Celayir

UKRAINE

Mr/M. B. Tarasyuk
 Mr/M. V. Nikitiuk

*

* *

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Mr/M. S. Moss
 Ms/Mme N. Hashmi

*

* *

EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPÉENNE

Ms/Mme V. Batistić Kos
 Ms/Mme S. Kammerer
 Mr/M. E. Tziokas
 Ms/Mme F. Scheppach

CANADA

-

HOLY SEE / SAINT-SIÈGE

Mgr M. Ganci

JAPAN / JAPON

Mr/M. Y. Uchikawa

MEXICO / MEXIQUE

Mr/M. J.A. Suárez del Real y Aguilera
 Ms/Mme L. Antonio de la Garza

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA /
ÉTATS-UNIS D'AMÉRIQUE

Ms/Mme Y. Gonzales

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

Introduction

At the start of the meeting, the Committee of Ministers observed a minute's silence in memory of the former Permanent Representative of Malta, Ambassador Lorenzo Vella, who passed away this summer.

The Chair then welcomed Ambassador Andreu Jordi, Permanent Representative of Andorra, Ambassador Delphine Delieux, Permanent Representative of Belgium, Ambassador Aino Leppik von Wirén, Permanent Representative of Estonia, Ambassador Agnese Vilde, Permanent Representative of Latvia, Ambassador Michela Bovi, Permanent Representative of San Marino, Mr Afshin Berahmand, Deputy Permanent Representative of Denmark, Ms Friederike Steglich, Deputy Permanent Representative of Germany, Ms Jekaterina Tuļina, Deputy Permanent Representative of Latvia, Mr Grega Pajnkihar, Deputy Permanent Representative of Slovenia, Mr Urs Beer, Deputy Permanent Representative of Switzerland, Ms Yeşim Gündoğdu Cobanoğlu, Deputy Permanent Representative of Türkiye, Ms Marianna Manucharyan, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Armenia, Mr George Yiangou and Ms Maria Kampouridou, Deputies to the Permanent Representative of Cyprus, Ms Merit Kaasik, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Estonia, Ms Elina Soininen, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Finland, Ms Claire Vuillet, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of France, Ms Bettina Kohler, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Germany, Ms Suzan Beek, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Netherlands, Mr Matija Vidmar, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Slovenia, Ms Bibi Gramson, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Sweden, Ms Olena Shtepa, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Ukraine. He wished them a pleasant stay in Strasbourg and a successful mission within the Committee.

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

1.1 Adoption of the agenda

Decision

The Deputies adopted the agenda of their 1505th meeting, as it appears in document CM/Del/OJ(2024)1505.

1505th meeting of the Ministers' Deputies (Strasbourg, 3 September 2024 (9.30 am))

Agenda

In application of the rules for the dispatch of reference documents and Notes on the Agenda, the deadlines are:
CM: 7 August 2024
Notes: 23 August 2024

1. **General questions**

- 1.1 Adoption of the agenda
CM/Del/OJ(2024)1505
- 1.2 Preparation of forthcoming meetings
- 1.3 Dialogue with the Secretary General and the Deputy Secretary General – Staff matters
SG/Com(2024)1505, SG/Inf(2024)25
- 1.4 Report of the Bureau
CM/Bur/Del(2024)1505
- 1.5 Communication by the Committee of Ministers' Presidency

2. **Current political questions**

- 2.1 The Council of Europe and the conflict in Georgia
CM/Del/Dec(2024)1498/2.1, SG/Inf(2024)13
- 2.2 Situation in Cyprus
- 2.3 Consequences of the aggression of the Russian Federation against Ukraine
- 2.4 Co-operation between the Council of Europe and the United Nations –
Draft Resolution on co-operation between the United Nations and the Council of Europe for the
agenda of the 79th Session of the United Nations General Assembly
(Item prepared by the GR-EXT on 4.7.2024 and by written procedure)
CM(2024)79-prov4
CM/Notes/1505/2.4 of 24.7.2024
- 2.5 Other current political questions

4. Human rights

- H46-1 Kavala v. Türkiye (Application No. 28749/18): Situation of the applicant – Supervision of the execution of the European Court’s judgments
DH-DD(2022)1079, DH-DD(2022)544, CM/ResDH(2021)432, CM/ResDH(2022)21, CM(2022)57-final, DH-DD(2023)793, DH-DD(2023)861, CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-34
CM/Notes/1502/H46-1 of 17.6.2024
- 4.1 “Transnational repression as a growing threat to the rule of law and human rights” – Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2257 (2023)
(Item prepared by the GR-H on 9.7.2024 and by written procedure)
CM/AS(2024)Rec2257-prov2

(Item postponed)

- 4.2 “Pegasus and similar spyware and secret State surveillance” – Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2258 (2023)
(Item prepared by the GR-H on 9.7.2024)
CM/AS(2024)Rec2258-prov
CM/Notes/1505/4.2 of 18.7.2024

11. Programme, Budget and Administration

- 11.1 Co-ordinating Committee on Remuneration (CCR) – Special adjustments at 1 April 2024 for Türkiye – 344th report
(Item prepared by the GR-PBA by written procedure)
CM(2024)116
CM/Notes/1505/11.1 of 30.8.2024
- 11.2 People Strategy 2024-2027
(Item prepared by the GR-PBA by written procedure)
CM(2024)63, CM(2024)63-corr
CM/Notes/1505/11.2 of 30.8.2024

13. Any other business

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

1.3 Dialogue with the Secretary General and the Deputy Secretary General

Staff matters

Reference documents

SG/Com(2024)1505, SG/Inf(2024)25

Decisions

The Deputies

1. took note of the Secretary General-elect's intention to appoint Mr Stefano Piedimonte Bodini to the job of Director of the Private Office of the Secretary General and the Deputy Secretary General (Grade A6), in accordance with Article 5120 of the Staff Rule on career development, with effect from 18 September 2024;
2. took note of the communication of the Secretary General (SG/Com(2024)1505) and the exchange of views under this item.

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

1.4 Report of the Bureau

Reference document
CM/Bur/Del(2024)1505

Decisions

The Deputies

1. approved the Bureau's recommendations with regard to the agendas of their 1506th (11 September 2024) and 1508th (25 September 2024) meetings, as they appear in appendix 1 to the Bureau report;
2. approved the draft agenda for their 1506bis meeting (17 (12.30 p.m.) September 2024), as it appears in document CM/Del/OJ(2024)1506bis;
3. approved the draft agenda for their 1506ter meeting (18 (2.30 p.m.) September 2024), as it appears in document CM/Del/OJ(2024)1506ter;
4. approved the Bureau's recommendations as regards use of the Committee of Ministers' meeting room and Foyer, as set out in items 3 and 4 of the Bureau report;
5. took note of the report of the meeting of the Bureau of 2 September 2024 (document CM/Bur/Del(2024)1505) as a whole.

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

2.4 Co-operation between the Council of Europe and the United Nations

Draft Resolution on co-operation between the United Nations and the Council of Europe for the agenda of the 79th Session of the United Nations General Assembly

Reference document
CM(2024)79-prov4

Decisions

The Deputies

1. approved the text of the draft United Nations General Assembly Resolution on co-operation between the United Nations and the Council of Europe, as it appears in document CM(2024)79-final;
2. invited the Presidency of the Committee of Ministers to forward it, through its mission in New York, to the Secretary General of the United Nations;
3. encouraged the promotion and co-sponsorship of the draft resolution, in consultation with the Presidency of the Committee of Ministers, in the United Nations;
4. recalling that the Presidency of the Committee of Ministers has considerable room for manoeuvre in order to have this text adopted by the United Nations General Assembly, asked the Presidency to keep them informed in good time of the discussions, which will take place in the United Nations General Assembly on the draft resolution;
5. decided to forward the draft resolution to the Parliamentary Assembly and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe for information.

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

4.2 “Pegasus and similar spyware and secret State surveillance”

Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2258 (2023)

Reference document
CM/AS(2024)Rec2258-prov

Decision

The Deputies adopted the reply to the above-mentioned recommendation, as it appears in document CM/AS(2024)Rec2258-final.

“Pegasus and similar spyware and secret State surveillance” Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2258 (2023)

(Reply adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 3 September 2024
at the 1505th meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)

1. The Committee of Ministers has carefully examined Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2258 (2023) on “Pegasus and similar spyware and secret State surveillance” and has forwarded it to the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) and the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) for information and possible comments.
2. The Committee of Ministers shares the Assembly's concern at the deeply intrusive nature of Pegasus and similar spyware tools which turn targeted smartphones into 24-hour surveillance devices. Given the role played by mobile phones in collecting, storing and processing large amounts of highly sensitive personal data, there is a resulting risk of serious violations of the right to private and family life, as protected by Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights.
3. In view of the gravity of this threat, the Committee of Ministers considers the Assembly's recommendation in paragraph 1.1 to prepare a non-binding instrument on secret surveillance and human rights to be feasible and to have genuine added value. It invites the CDDH to bear this in mind for the mid-term review of its terms of reference, if appropriate. Such an instrument – a recommendation or guidelines – should apply principles from the Court's jurisprudence to the case of spyware, include examples of existing national good practices, and take into account subsequent developments in the Court's case law and the Protocol amending the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (CETS No. 223).
4. As regards the Assembly's proposal in paragraph 1.2 to examine the feasibility of a Council of Europe convention on the acquisition, use, sale and export of spyware, and in light of Recommendation CM/Rec(2016)3 on human rights and business which recalls that States have a duty to protect individuals against human rights abuses by third parties, including business enterprises, the Committee of Ministers is of the view that this should only be considered following any work on a non-binding instrument as indicated above, where necessary.
5. In respect of the recommendation in paragraph 1.3 to co-ordinate efforts with other international organisations, the Committee of Ministers assures the Assembly that this is done systematically in standard-setting and co-operation work. Moreover, at their 133rd Ministerial Session on 16 and 17 May 2024, the Committee of Ministers reiterated the importance of the reinforcement of the Council of Europe's external dimension and co-operation with the EU and the UN among other international organisations.

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

11.1 Co-ordinating Committee on Remuneration (CCR)

Special adjustments at 1 April 2024 for Türkiye – 344th report

Reference document
CM(2024)116

Decisions

The Deputies

1. took note of the 344th report of the Co-ordinating Committee on Remuneration (CCR), as it appears in document CM(2024)116;
2. decided that, as a special adjustment, the remuneration, as adjusted at 1 February 2024, as well as the monthly amounts for the allowances/supplements expressed in absolute value and the ceilings of the installation allowance, at 1 February 2024, be increased by 7% for Türkiye with effect from 1 April 2024;
3. noted that, in accordance with the interpretation given to paragraph 3 of the 34th report by the CCG (CCG(65)5), the remuneration of auxiliary staff serving in the co-ordinated organisations will be adjusted in accordance with the provisions of this report.

1505th meeting, 3 September 2024

11.2 People Strategy 2024-2027

Reference documents
CM(2024)63, CM(2024)63-corr

Decisions

The Deputies

1. took note of the Council of Europe People Strategy 2024-2027, as it appears in document CM(2024)63-final
2. in this context, invited the Secretary General to duly take into account the various issues raised during the informal and formal discussions of their Rapporteur Group on Programme, Budget and Administration (GR-PBA), including in documents GR-PBA(2024)CB3, GR-PBA(2024)CB4 and GR-PBA(2024)CB4-add;
3. invited the Secretary General to report regularly on the implementation and evaluation of the People Strategy and its action plans and not later than the last quarter of 2024.