

## 1356<sup>th</sup> meeting, 9 October 2019

10 Legal questions

### 10.4 European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

a. Fifth report of the Committee of Experts in respect of Spain

Item to be considered by the GR-J at its meeting on 19 September 2019

---

In accordance with Article 16 paragraph 3 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages submits its fifth report on the application of the Charter in Spain to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe. The report contains proposals for recommendations to be addressed by the Committee of Ministers to Spain. The Spanish Government has been given the opportunity to comment on the content, in accordance with Article 16 paragraph 3 of the Charter.

---

<sup>1</sup> This document has been classified restricted at the date of issue. In accordance with the Deputies' decision (CM/Del/Dec(2001)765/10.4), it will be declassified after examination by the Committee of Ministers.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the State and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the State in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the State in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the State concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective State Party for possible comments within a given deadline. Subsequently, the evaluation report is submitted to the Committee of Ministers, together with suggestions for recommendations that, once adopted by the latter, will be addressed to the State Party. The full report also contains the comments which the authorities of the State Party may have made.

## CONTENTS

<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Spain – Recent developments and trends</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Spain</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>Chapter 2 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>2.1 Basque</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>2.1.1 Basque in the Basque Country</b> .....	<b>10</b>
2.1.1.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Basque in the Basque Country .....	12
2.1.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Basque in The Basque Country .....	16
<b>2.1.2 Basque in the Foral Community of Navarre</b> .....	<b>18</b>
2.1.2.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Basque in Navarre .....	19
2.1.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Basque in the Foral Community of Navarre .....	24
<b>2.2 Catalan</b> .....	<b>25</b>
<b>2.2.1 Catalan in the Balearic Islands</b> .....	<b>25</b>
2.2.1.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Catalan in the Balearic Islands .....	25
2.2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Catalan in the Balearic Islands.....	30
<b>2.2.2 Catalan in Catalonia</b> .....	<b>32</b>
2.2.2.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Catalan in Catalonia.....	32
2.2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Catalan in Catalonia .....	37
<b>2.2.3 Valencian/Catalan in Valencia</b> .....	<b>39</b>
2.2.3.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community.....	39
2.2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community .....	45
<b>2.2.4 Catalan in Aragon</b> .....	<b>46</b>
2.2.4.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Catalan in Aragon .....	46
2.2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Catalan in Aragon.....	47

<b>2.2.5</b>	<b>Valencian/Catalan in Murcia .....</b>	<b>48</b>
2.2.5.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia .....	48
2.2.5.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia .....	49
<b>2.3</b>	<b>Galician .....</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>2.3.1</b>	<b>Galician in Galicia .....</b>	<b>50</b>
2.3.1.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician in Galicia .....	50
2.3.1.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Galician in Galicia .....	55
<b>2.3.2</b>	<b>Galician/Galician-Asturian in Asturias .....</b>	<b>56</b>
2.3.2.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician-Asturian in the Principality of Asturias .....	56
2.3.2.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Galician-Asturian in the Principality of Asturias .....	57
<b>2.3.3</b>	<b>Galician in Castile and León .....</b>	<b>58</b>
2.3.3.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician in Castile and León .....	58
2.3.3.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Galician in Castile and León .....	59
<b>2.3.4</b>	<b>Fala/Galician in Extremadura .....</b>	<b>60</b>
2.3.4.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician in Extremadura .....	60
2.3.4.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Fala/Galician in Extremadura .....	61
<b>2.4</b>	<b>Occitan of the Aran valley / Aranese in Catalonia .....</b>	<b>62</b>
2.4.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Occitan of the Aran valley / Aranese in Catalonia .....	62
2.4.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Occitan of the Aran valley / Aranese in Catalonia .....	67
<b>2.5</b>	<b>Amazigh in Melilla .....</b>	<b>68</b>
2.5.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Amazigh in Melilla .....	68
2.5.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Amazigh in Melilla .....	69
<b>2.6</b>	<b>Arabic/Darija in Ceuta .....</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>2.7.</b>	<b>Aragonese in Aragon .....</b>	<b>71</b>
2.7.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Aragonese .....	71
2.7.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Aragonese in Aragon .....	72

<b>2.8</b>	<b>Asturian .....</b>	<b>73</b>
2.8.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Asturian .....	73
2.8.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Asturian in Asturias .....	74
<b>2.9</b>	<b>Caló .....</b>	<b>75</b>
<b>2.10</b>	<b>Estremeño in Extremadura .....</b>	<b>76</b>
<b>2.11</b>	<b>Leonese in Castile and León .....</b>	<b>77</b>
2.11.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Leonese in Castile and León .....	77
2.11.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Leonese in Castile and León .....	78
<b>2.12</b>	<b>Portuguese .....</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>2.12.1</b>	<b>Portuguese in Extremadura.....</b>	<b>79</b>
2.12.1.1	Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Portuguese in Extremadura .....	79
2.12.1.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Portuguese in Extremadura.....	80
<b>2.12.2</b>	<b>Portuguese in Castile and León .....</b>	<b>81</b>
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>[Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe .....</b>	<b>82</b>
	<b>Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification .....</b>	<b>83</b>
	<b>Appendix II: Comments from the Spanish authorities .....</b>	<b>84</b>

## Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Spain in 2001. Basque has official status in the Basque Country and in part of Navarre, Catalan in the Balearic Islands and Catalonia, as well as under the name Valencian/Catalan in Valencia, and Galician in Galicia. Together with Occitan of the Aran Valley in Catalonia (Aranese), these languages are covered by Parts II and III of the Charter.

The following languages are covered only by Part II of the Charter: Amazigh in Melilla, Arabic/Darija in Ceuta, Aragonese in Aragon, Asturian in Asturias, Caló as a non-territorial language, Catalan in Aragon, Estremeño in Extremadura, Fala/Galician in Extremadura, Galician-Asturian in Asturias, Leonese in Castile and León, Portuguese in Extremadura and Valencian/Catalan in Murcia.

The presence of all these languages in education depends on their legal status. However, even for some official languages, not all undertakings are fulfilled. Languages without any legal status are practically absent from education.

The same status dependency applies for language use in the judiciary and administration. Official languages are used especially in regional and local administration, but there are still deficiencies at judiciary level and State administration level. The situation of the Part II languages is critical; some of them have no presence at all in administration.

Media provision for speakers of official languages remains satisfactory albeit with some unsolved problems, notably the missing inter-regional television reception between the Catalan-speaking territories and the Valencian/Catalan region. Digital media are gaining more and more importance. The use of Part II languages mainly depends on speakers' initiatives.

Some problems remain in the field of economic and social life, particularly with respect to the use of languages in social and health care facilities.

This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Spain in December 2018.

## Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Spain – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its States Parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. Spain signed the Charter on 5 November 1992 and ratified it on 9 April 2001. The Charter entered into force in Spain on 1 August 2001. The instrument of ratification is set out in Appendix I of this report.

2. Article 15 (1) of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports about the implementation of the Charter. The Spanish authorities submitted the Spanish version of their fifth periodical report on 9 February 2018 and the English version on 28 September 2018. This fifth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (10-14 December 2018) and submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in Spain and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the Spanish authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the fourth monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of Spain in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the Spanish authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Spain, as provided in Article 16 (4) of the Charter.

4. As far as the detailed legal examination of each undertaking is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its **fourth evaluation report on the application of the Charter in Spain (ECRML (2016) 7<sup>2</sup>)**.

5. This fifth report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to Spain in December 2018. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 20 March 2019.

### 1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Spain

#### *Scope of application of the Charter*

6. According to the declaration contained in the instrument of ratification, the languages recognised as official languages, sometimes also referred to as co-official languages, in the Statutes of Autonomy of the Autonomous Communities of the Basque Country, Catalonia, Balearic Islands, Galicia, Navarre and Valencia are protected under Part III of the Charter. Consequently, this protection applies to Basque in the Basque Country and Navarre, to Galician in Galicia, to Catalan in the Balearic Islands, Catalonia and under the name Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community, and Occitan of the Aran Valley (Aranese) in Catalonia.

7. Protection under Part II of the Charter applies to Amazigh in Melilla, Arabic/Darija in Ceuta, Aragonese in Aragon, Asturian in Asturias, Caló as a non-territorial language, Catalan in Aragon, Estremeño in Extremadura, Fala/Galician in Extremadura, Galician-Asturian in Asturias, Leonese in Castile and León, Portuguese in Extremadura and Valencian/Catalan in Murcia.

8. Furthermore, in the previous evaluation reports and during the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts observed that some other languages have a traditional presence in Spain and, therefore, are covered by Part II of the Charter: Arabic/Darija in the Autonomous City of Ceuta, Caló as a non-territorial language, Estremeño, Fala/Galician and Portuguese in the Autonomous Community of Extremadura, and Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>2</sup> <https://rm.coe.int/16806f0658>

<sup>3</sup> The situation of each of these languages is dealt with in detail in Chapter 2.

9. The Committee of Ministers recommended Spain to consider extending the recognition of those regional or minority languages with a co-official status in Autonomous Communities to other Autonomous Communities provided that there is a sufficient number of users of the regional or minority language involved. The Committee of Experts did not receive information on the extension of the protection of these languages to other territories.

#### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in education***

10. Languages with official status in the Autonomous Communities and protection under Part III of the Charter are widely used in education. The offer did not change in general. Following the last monitoring period, the Committee of Ministers recommended Spain to ensure that the offer of trilingual education introduced in 2013 does not affect the protection and promotion of regional or minority languages. During the current monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts has been informed that this model still hampers the implementation of language immersion for bilingual education in Catalonia. In Galicia, current legislation does not allow more than 50% of the courses to be offered in Galician in non-university education. New legislation in 2018 eliminated the programme of language immersion in Valencia. Only the new government in the Balearic Islands withdrew legislative measures adopted in the previous monitoring period that intended to decrease the use of Catalan in educational institutions.

#### ***Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities***

11. The Committee of Ministers recommended the Spanish authorities to amend the legal framework with a view to making clear that the criminal, civil and administrative judicial authorities in the Autonomous Communities can conduct the proceedings in co-official languages at the request of one party. Despite this recommendation, adopted in every monitoring period since the first cycle, and recent amendments to the legislation, no progress has been made in this respect. Article 231 of the Organic Law of Judicial Power still hampers the application of Article 9 of the Charter. It states that the use of a co-official language is only allowed if neither of the parties objects to it. Although the use of co-official languages is not forbidden in principle, their use requires translation and thus lengthens the procedures. This situation is a barrier to the practical application of co-official languages in the judiciary.

12. The Committee of Ministers also recommended the continuation of measures to ensure that judicial staff in Autonomous Communities with co-official languages concerned by the application of Article 9 of the Charter have a working knowledge in these languages. Despite efforts made in the organisation of language courses for judges, prosecutors and other judicial staff, the overall situation has not changed.

#### ***Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities***

13. In its fourth cycle recommendations, the Committee of Ministers recommended the Spanish authorities to continue to implement legal and practical measures to ensure an adequate presence of co-official languages in the State administration at the level of the Autonomous Communities. Despite language courses offered to State officials in Spain's General State Administration, knowledge and use of co-official languages remains insufficient.

14. A new law on the Common Administrative Procedure of the Public Administrations entered into force in 2015. It allows General State Administration bodies located in the territory of an Autonomous Community to use the co-official language. The interested party's language of choice shall be used in procedures, documents or statements. In procedures carried out by the administrations of the Autonomous Communities and of the local entities, language use shall be following the provisions of the Autonomous Community's legislation.

15. NGOs criticised the low frequency of meetings of the Council of Official Languages, which is an inter-ministerial collegiate body which should meet at least once a year and is attached to the Secretariat of State for Regional Administrations at the Ministry of the Presidency and Territorial Administrations. In 2017 the Council held its first meeting since 2010.

16. Efforts have been made to increase the use of minority languages in police and health care services. Nevertheless, the presence of co-official languages in public services, especially in health care institutions, remains low.



***Use of the regional or minority languages in the media***

17. Digitalisation has a significant influence on minority language media. For instance, the reception of television broadcasts between the Catalan-speaking Autonomous Communities is currently impossible. Navarre compensates the lack of own programmes with the possibility of receiving transmissions from the Basque country. In general, the number of programmes from State broadcasters is lower than in the previous cycle. Radio broadcasts are increasingly moving from terrestrial stations to online productions. Minority language speakers widely use opportunities offered by new media to share content among them. However, in Navarre, following many years of illegality, a private radio station obtained a licence to broadcast in 2015. Compared to the previous monitoring cycle, the number of printed media has slightly decreased.

***Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities***

18. In cultural activities, the use of regional or minority languages with an official status is well developed. The Cervantes Institute continues to promote regional or minority languages worldwide. It offers language courses and organises events related to the cultures represented by co-official and minority languages of Spain. The Ramon Llull Institute, founded by the Government of Catalonia, also offers language courses and cultural programmes worldwide. At regional level, Fes Cultura is the recently established framework for cultural policy in Valencia. The Galician Agency for Cultural Industries manages the distribution of theatre and music productions, in collaboration with numerous local authorities and private entities throughout Galicia.

***Use of the regional or minority languages in economic life***

19. Autonomous Communities with co-official languages have adopted acts and strategic plans to encourage the use of their co-official languages in economic life. In Navarre, companies participate in the implementation of the language strategy. The Catalan Government continues to collaborate with numerous entities to promote the use of Catalan in the socio-economic sphere and to inform the public of consumers' language rights.

***Transfrontier exchanges***

20. The Basque Government's Department of Culture and Language Policy, the Navarre Government's Department of Institutional and Public Relations, and the French Basque Country's Public Office for the Basque Language established cultural co-operation, including education. Moreover, the Foral Community of Navarre participates in the European Grouping of Territorial Co-operation "Euroregion New Aquitaine/Euskadi" which offers possibilities for transfrontier co-operation through grants in various fields.

## **Chapter 2 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations<sup>4</sup>**

### **2.1 Basque**

21. Basque is protected under Part III of the Charter in the Basque Country and in a part of Navarre. In the whole territory of Navarre and as well as in the Basque Country it is protected under Part II. In general, the situation of the Basque language is satisfactory. According to the 6<sup>th</sup> Sociolinguistic Survey on the Basque language carried out in 2016, the number of Basque speakers has even increased - 33.9% of the population of the Autonomous Community of the Basque Country aged 16 or older were Basque Speakers (bilingual). In the case of Navarre, 12.9% of the same age group are bilingual. A collaboration fund is set up annually in order to intensify the use of Basque by subsidising the work of private actors in the French Basque Country. The Basque Country and the Navarre Governments co-authored the 2016 Collaboration Protocol on Basque language policy. The two governments also support the Euskaraldia social initiative, which aims to activate language use. Cross-border educational and student exchange projects also contribute to the provision of Basque in the Spanish-French border region.

#### **2.1.1 Basque in the Basque Country**

22. The increase in the number of speakers in the 2016 survey is significant. The change is even more noteworthy in the age group 16-24, where 71.4% were Basque speakers compared to 62% in 2006 and 25% in 1991.

23. The education system, introduced by Act 1/1993 on Basque Public Schools ensures the application of the Charter. The model in which the syllabus is taught in Basque with Castilian as a subject is prevalent in pre-school, primary and secondary education in the Basque Country, where the number of students participating in Basque-medium education is increasing. According to the law, all pupils must be fluent in both official languages by the time they finish compulsory education. According to NGOs, the number of courses offered in Basque in technical and vocational training does not cater for the increasing number of students coming from institutions using this model. Similar issues have been reported concerning university education. Although there are some advances in the three universities, some difficulties remain. For law and medicine students, who completed their secondary studies in institutions using this model, the number of theoretical and practical courses offered in Basque is insufficient. Furthermore, it is necessary to increase the offer of Basque in postgraduate courses. Adult and continuing education courses are financed through grants offered by public authorities and private actors. NGOs expressed criticism about the inequality of costs of the courses in different parts of the country and argued in favour of free language courses for adults.

24. It is still not guaranteed that criminal, civil and administrative proceedings will be conducted in Basque at the request of one party. The number of Basque-speaking officials in the judiciary remains low - according to NGO reports, only 16 judges and three prosecutors out of a total of 343 are bilingual.

25. According to the government, the Basque Court Document Normalisation Committee achieved an increase in the number of bilingual documents. Digital documents and their processing in small claims are bilingual. This progress in the use of bilingual digital documents might facilitate the use of Basque in higher courts too. The number of translations and the number of interpreting sessions has also risen during the monitoring period. Basque is considered favourable for the recruitment of administrative staff in judiciary, but only of optional merit for secretaries, judges and prosecutors. In co-operation with the National University for Distance Education, the General Council for the Judiciary offers language courses for members of the judiciary. Annually more than 40 people (members of the judiciary as well as prosecutors and lawyers) participate in non-compulsory language training in Basque.

---

<sup>4</sup> The tables under this chapter deal with possible changes in policies, legislation and practice in relation to previous monitoring periods. Even without such changes and for exceptional cases, the Committee of Experts reserves the right to revise its evaluations from previous monitoring periods, taking into account for example new information.

26. State administrative authorities took steps to comply with Article 10 of the Charter in the offer of bilingual forms and bilingual signage on their premises. However, the number of staff in the general State administration with knowledge of Basque is too low (14%). Government websites offer an option to change to Basque, however, according to NGOs, in the majority of cases, the user can only access second level titles. The Spanish Government reported that 42.4% of the Basque Autonomous Community's police force (Ertzaintza) has language proficiency in Basque (in 2012 the percentage was 32.1%). Currently, the knowledge of Basque is compulsory in 43% of the positions. However, cases were reported of non-respect of the citizens' language rights and abusive attitudes from police officers.

27. Language use in the health care system (Osakidetza) has improved. In 2016, the number of employees with language proficiency sufficient for their position was 34% compared to 11% in 2006. It is not clear how many of these professionals work in administration and how many are directly involved in medical care. Furthermore, Basque language knowledge is only mandatory for 37% of the Osakidetza positions. Patients in health care institutions have the right to ask for Basque in oral communication. In 2016, 11.9% of the patients opted for Basque; 6.9% more than in 2015. Basic guidelines and training modules to foster the use of Basque in health care institutions have been produced. Progress also has been made in translating clinical records into Basque, as well as in the standardisation of laboratory reports. However, NGOs still reported about complaints from patients being denied medical treatment in Basque.

28. The Department of Language Policy runs a call centre and an online platform to guarantee language rights. It receives and deals with complaints, requests and suggestions regarding the normalisation of Basque language.

29. The Public Basque Radio Television EITB broadcasts remain satisfactory. However, NGOs expressed concerns about the unequal distribution of time slots between news broadcasts in Castilian and Basque. None of the existing private state-wide television channels uses Basque. According to NGOs, despite the decision of the Constitutional Court, the presence of Basque in the State public television channels (RTVE) is too low. In the period 2013 to 2016, subsidies for the only community-wide Basque language newspaper, Berria, were continuously reduced.

### 2.1.1.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Basque in the Basque Country

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in the Basque Country <sup>5</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Basque as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Basque	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Basque	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Basque, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Basque</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Basque at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Basque to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Basque at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Basque	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Basque	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Basque among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Basque among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Basque</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Basque</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Basque	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Basque	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Basque	=				
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Basque	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Basque or of facilities for the study of Basque as an university or higher education subject	=				

<sup>5</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in the Basque Country<sup>5</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Basque	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Basque	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Basque	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Basque and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Basque is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Basque at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Basque in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Basque in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Basque in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Basque in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Basque in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Basque and the related use of documents and evidence in Basque, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in the Basque Country<sup>5</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Basque	=				
9.3	make available in Basque the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Basque	=				
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Basque		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Basque or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Basque	=				
10.2.a	use of Basque within the framework of the regional or local authority		↗			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Basque to submit oral or written applications in Basque to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Basque	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Basque	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Basque in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Basque in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Basque	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Basque is used in the provision of public services	=				
10.3.b	allow users of Basque to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Basque <sup>6</sup>					
10.4.a	translation or interpretation	=				
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Basque		= <sup>7</sup>			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Basque to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Basque	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Basque	=				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Basque	=				
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Basque	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Basque	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Basque	=				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Basque	=				

<sup>6</sup> Covered by Art. 10.3.a

<sup>7</sup> As local and regional authorities usually meet the requirements of Article 10.4.b, the evaluation as partly fulfilled mainly results from shortcomings in the responsibility of state administrative bodies.

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in the Basque Country<sup>5</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Basque	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Basque</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Basque</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Basque</li> </ul>	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Basque are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Basque	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Basque by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Basque to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Basque language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Basque	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Basque in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Basque	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Basque	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Basque is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Basque	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Basque and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Basque in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Basque	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Basque in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Basque in economic and social life	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in the Basque Country <sup>5</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Basque in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents	=				
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Basque in economic and social life	=				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Basque		=			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Basque	=				
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Basque	=				
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Basque is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Basque in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Basque, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Basque is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

30. The overall situation in the Basque Country remains satisfactory in general. Some improvements have been achieved in the language normalisation process on the use of Basque within the police forces of the autonomous community (Ertzaintza). Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers Article 10.2.a partly fulfilled.

#### 2.1.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Basque in The Basque Country

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>8</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

<sup>8</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)



**I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| a. | <b>Amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of Basque in judicial proceedings when requested by one of the parties.</b> |
| b. | <b>Use Basque in State administration in the Basque Country.</b>  |

**II. Further recommendations**

- c. Increase the use of Basque in the health care system (Osakidetza).
- d. Increase the use of Basque by the police (Ertzaintza).

### 2.1.2 Basque in the Foral Community of Navarre

31. Navarre is divided into three language zones. The Basque language only has co-official status in the northern zones where also Part III of the Charter applies. In the mixed zone and the non-Basque speaking zone, it has no official status, and only Part II applies. According to the 6th Sociolinguistic Survey on Basque, the bilingual population in Navarre rose from 40,000 in 1991 to 69,000 in 2016. However, in the mixed zone, where most of Navarre's population is concentrated, only 11.3% are bilingual. In language politics, a positive trend has been observed since 2016. The budget assigned to the Navarre Institute of Basque (Euskarabidea) has increased during the monitoring period. Furthermore, Euskarabidea's structure and functionality have been improved by the Foral Decree 130/2015. The new Foral Act 4/2015 (amending Act 18/1986) enhances the status of Basque in education in both the mixed and non-Basque-speaking zones. In practice, it allows the introduction of teaching in Basque with Castilian as a subject in public schools in both zones.

32. It is still not guaranteed that criminal, civil and administrative proceedings shall be conducted in Basque at the request of one party. There is no information on the knowledge of Basque among judges, prosecutors or other judicial staff. Administrative documents and websites of State public agencies are in the process of translation. Members of Parliament may use Basque and session documents are translated.

33. NGOs demand that Basque is made official on the whole territory of Navarre. Most of the administration is located in Pamplona, where the language has no official status. Nonetheless, the language rights of citizens living in the Basque-speaking zone are ensured in Pamplona by providing services in Basque for them. The Foral Decree 103/2017, which regulates the use of Basque in the public administrations of Navarre, its public bodies and dependent law entities, aims to improve language use on the whole territory, including the non-Basque zone. Despite this, knowledge of foreign languages is regarded as more positive than knowledge of Basque in employment applications for public services. Furthermore, at present, only very few positions in the Navarre government administration and the health sector require language competence in Basque.

34. Currently, no public radio or television station covers the entire territory of Navarre with broadcasts in Basque. Only Xalao Telebista serves the Pamplona area and the northern zone where Basque is co-official. However, based on a 2016 agreement with the Basque Autonomous Community, public radio and television broadcasts from the Basque Country are available on the entire territory of Navarre. Since summer 2015 the private radio Euskalerrria Irratia is registered and broadcasts legally in the Pamplona area. Furthermore, several local radio stations are broadcasting in Basque. Different government funds subsidise Basque language audio-visual productions. There are no daily Basque language newspapers published in Navarre, apart from Berria, the only regular newspaper published in the Basque Country which includes news from Navarre.

35. There are currently no positions with Basque as a precondition at the Directorate General for Culture-Principe of Viana Institution, the body that coordinates and manages the drafting of the Strategic Plan on Culture for Navarre (2017-2023). However, there are currently courses being offered to train the staff to use Basque.

36. The First Basque Language Strategy Plan 2016-2019 aims to strengthen the use of the language in economic and social life. Furthermore, the new Foral Law of public contracts (2/2018) obliges subcontracting companies to use the Basque language when the fulfillment of the contract is essential for the general public.

### 2.1.2.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Basque in Navarre

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in Navarre <sup>9</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Basque as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Basque	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Basque	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Basque, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Basque</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Basque at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Basque to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Basque at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Basque	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Basque	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Basque among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Basque among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Basque</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Basque</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b> <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</i>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Basque	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Basque	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Basque	=				
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Basque	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Basque or of facilities for the study of Basque as an university or higher education subject	=				

<sup>9</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in Navarre<sup>9</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Basque	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Basque	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Basque	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Basque and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Basque is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Basque at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Basque in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Basque in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Basque in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Basque, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Basque in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Basque in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in Navarre <sup>9</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Basque and the related use of documents and evidence in Basque, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Basque	=				
9.3	make available in Basque the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Basque	=				
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Basque		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Basque or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Basque	↗				
10.2.a	use of Basque within the framework of the regional or local authority	↗				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Basque to submit oral or written applications in Basque to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Basque	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Basque	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Basque in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Basque in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Basque	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Basque is used in the provision of public services		↗			
10.3.b	allow users of Basque to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Basque					
10.4.a	translation or interpretation	=				
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Basque		= <sup>10</sup>			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Basque to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Basque	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Basque	↗				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Basque	↗				
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Basque		=			
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Basque	=				

<sup>10</sup> As local and regional authorities usually meet the requirements of Article 10.4.b, the evaluation as partly fulfilled mainly results from shortcomings in the responsibility of state administrative bodies located in the autonomous community.

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in Navarre<sup>9</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Basque		=			
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Basque	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Basque	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Basque</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Basque</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Basque</li> </ul>	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Basque are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Basque	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Basque by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			
12.1.c	foster access in Basque to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Basque language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Basque	↗				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Basque in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Basque	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Basque	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Basque is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Basque	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Basque and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Basque in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Basque	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Basque in Navarre <sup>9</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Basque in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Basque in economic and social life	=				
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Basque in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents	↗				
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Basque in economic and social life	=				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Basque		=			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Basque		=			
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Basque	=				
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Basque is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Basque in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Basque, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Basque is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

37. The Government has increased the budget assigned to Euskarabidea (Navarre Institute of Basque). The new Foral Act 4/2015 strengthens the use of Basque in public schools in zones where the language is not co-official. Important steps have been taken to improve the use of Basque by the government authorities. Bilingual forms and staff training programmes have been introduced, and bilingual signage is used at government office premises. According to Act 39/2015, any documents or statements required by the interested parties shall be issued in their language of choice. At least the major municipalities of the core zone promote the use of Basque in administration. The First Basque Language Strategy Plan 2016-2019 aims to increase the presence and use of the Basque language in public and professional services as well as in economy (including banking) too and society as a whole. The collaboration agreement with the Basque Country government made it possible to receive television and radio broadcasts in the Basque language on the territory of Navarre. Private radio station Euskalerrria Irratia obtained the licence. The creation of the Directorate General for Culture-Principe of Viana Institution resulted in the training of staff in Basque.

### **2.1.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Basque in the Foral Community of Navarre**

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>11</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. **Amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of Basque in judicial proceedings at the request of one of the parties.**
- b. **Use Basque in State administration in the Foral Community of Navarre.**

#### **II. Further recommendations**

- c. Increase the use of Basque in the zones where the language is not co-official.
- d. Increase the use of Basque in social and economic life *inter alia* in hospitals and safety instructions.

---

<sup>11</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)



## 2.2 Catalan

38. Catalan is spoken in the Autonomous Communities of Aragon, the Balearic Islands, Catalonia and under the name of Valencian/Catalan in Valencia and Murcia. In the Balearic Islands, Catalonia and Valencia where the language has a co-official status it is protected under both Part II and Part III of the Charter. Although the situation of the language in these three communities is quite satisfying, more measures are needed to protect it in Aragon and Murcia where it is only covered by Part II.

39. Due to technical shortcomings, the mutual reception of Catalan radio and television programmes between the Balearic Islands, Catalonia and Valencia is not possible and this is seen as quite problematic by the representatives of the speakers. The number of programmes in these three communities is lower than in the previous monitoring cycle. Since 2015, there have been good and productive relations between the governments of the three communities where the language is co-official. Outside Spain, Catalan language and culture is also promoted by the Institut Ramon Llull and Instituto Cervantes.

### 2.2.1 Catalan in the Balearic Islands

40. Since 2015 language policy has significantly changed on the Balearic Islands. The new government reintroduced the Directorate-General for Language Policy and withdrew laws and measures that intended to limit the use of Catalan in education and administration. Act 1/2016 on Language Normalisation introduced several legislative changes to promote Catalan. Regional language policy institutions coordinate the language normalisation programmes. Before this, from 2013 to 2015, the Integrated Treatment of Languages governed the curricula and obliged the educational centres (pre-, primary and secondary schools) to teach approximately 33% of subjects in Spanish and 33% in English. With the approval of Decree 45/2016, each centre can independently define teaching and learning of/in foreign languages on the condition that a minimum percentage of the use of Catalan is respected. 48% of university subjects were taught in Catalan at the end of the monitoring cycle. In the judiciary, under the responsibility of the central State, the language is rarely used; this is a general shortcoming in all autonomous communities with co-official languages. Although since 2015 regulations in favour of the use of the Catalan language in public administration have been established, little progress has been made so far. The government of the autonomous community improved the technical conditions of television, and both public and private channels broadcast regularly in Catalan.

#### 2.2.1.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Catalan in the Balearic Islands

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:  
 ↗ improvement    ✓ deterioration    = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in the Balearic Islands <sup>12</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Catalan as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Catalan	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Catalan	=				

<sup>12</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in the Balearic Islands<sup>12</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Catalan, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life	=	=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Catalan</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Catalan at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Catalan to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Catalan at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Catalan	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Catalan	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Catalan among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Catalan among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Catalan</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Catalan</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Catalan	↗				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Catalan	↗				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Catalan	↗				
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Catalan				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Catalan or of facilities for the study of Catalan as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Catalan	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Catalan	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Catalan	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Catalan and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	↗				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Catalan is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Catalan at all the appropriate stages of education	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in the Balearic Islands<sup>12</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Catalan in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Catalan in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Catalan in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Catalan in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Catalan in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Catalan and the related use of documents and evidence in Catalan, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Catalan	=				
9.3	make available in Catalan the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Catalan	=				
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Catalan or in bilingual versions	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in the Balearic Islands <sup>12</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Catalan	=				
10.2.a	use of Catalan within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Catalan to submit oral or written applications in Catalan to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Catalan	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Catalan	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Catalan in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Catalan in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Catalan	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Catalan is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.3.b	allow users of Catalan to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Catalan					
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Catalan		= <sup>13</sup>			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Catalan to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Catalan	=				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Catalan	=				
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Catalan	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Catalan	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Catalan	=				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Catalan	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Catalan	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Catalan</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Catalan</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Catalan</li> </ul>	=				

<sup>13</sup> As local and regional authorities usually meet the requirements of Article 10.4.b, the evaluation as partly fulfilled mainly results from shortcomings in the responsibility of state administrative bodies.

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in the Balearic Islands<sup>12</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Catalan are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Catalan	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Catalan by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Catalan to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Catalan language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Catalan	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Catalan in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Catalan	↗				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Catalan	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Catalan is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Catalan	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Catalan and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Catalan in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Catalan	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Catalan in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Catalan in economic and social life	=				
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Catalan in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents	↗				
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Catalan in economic and social life	↗				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Catalan		=			

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in the Balearic Islands <sup>12</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Catalan	=				
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Catalan is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Catalan in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Catalan, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Catalan is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

41. Although, according to the law, Catalan is used only 50% in schools, in practice this can be overruled by an agreement between parents and schools which can result in the use of Catalan only. The Technical Advisory Committee for Teaching in Catalan reinstated the language normalisation coordinator at schools during the school year 2016-2017. Regarding the collection of audio and video materials, the Committee of Experts received information that this is *inter alia* provided by the Biblioteca Pública de Palma. The Action Plan for the Matter of Language Policy for the period of 2016-2021 specifies the right to use Catalan in commercial relations and the banking service sector.

#### 2.2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Catalan in the Balearic Islands

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>14</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

<sup>14</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

**I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| a. | <b>Amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of Catalan in judicial proceedings at the request of one of the parties.</b> |
| b. | <b>Use Catalan in State administration in the Balearic Islands.</b>  |

**II. Further recommendations**

- c. Ensure the use of Catalan in technical and vocational education.
- d. Ensure that the interests of the speakers of Catalan are taken into account within bodies guaranteeing freedom and independence in the media.
- e. Increase the use of Catalan in social and health care facilities.

## 2.2.2 Catalan in Catalonia

42. The Catalan language has enjoyed strong support from the authorities of the Autonomous Community during the monitoring cycle. New provisions and regulations strengthened the application of the Charter in Catalonia; e.g. recent regional legislation on compulsory secondary education establishes Catalan as the language generally used as a vehicular language and as a language of learning in the education system without neglecting the importance of multilingual education. Catalan is used at all levels of education and pupils finish their compulsory studies with a high proficiency in both Catalan and Castilian. However, Law 8/2013 on the improvement of the Quality of Education challenges the Catalan model by reiterating the right to receive the teaching of non-linguistic subjects in Castilian only. The implementation of this law hampers the system of “linguistic conjunction” and immersion.

43. A tax relief scheme applies to non-government organisations that promote the use of Catalan. The Consortium for Language Normalization, the primary institution for linguistic integration, offers the learning of Catalan to all inhabitants and equally fosters the integration of migrants by offering language courses at all levels. Most of the undergraduate courses at universities were taught in Catalan during the monitoring period; in masters’ studies, this figure is more than 50%. In the judiciary, the number of judgments in Catalan is decreasing, from 12.4% in 2013 to 8.4% in 2016, although the Generalitat has continued to implement extensive training programmes in Catalan for all judiciary staff. In 2014, a Decree on the certification of knowledge in Catalan for the legal and judicial sphere was approved. It proposes that Catalan knowledge, when duly certified, should be taken into consideration in staff recruitments. According to the Catalan Government, State judicial authorities still recruit staff with no competence in Catalan at all levels of administration of justice. In administrative bodies of the autonomous community, 96% of the employees in direct contact with the public are competent in Catalan. However, according to representatives of the speakers, the use of Catalan by State administrative authorities continues to be low.

44. Authorities of the Autonomous Community of Catalonia reported on systematic legal actions against Catalan language legislation. Legal instruments of the autonomous community to implement Catalan in parallel with Castilian are challenged in court. Central authorities continued to impose Castilian in a wide range of areas, e.g. traffic signs, university certificates, sports, advertising. NGOs reported on numerous documented cases of discrimination against language users especially by State police. State legislation on labelling, instructions and documentation imposes the use of Castilian by making Catalan only optional. Despite of efforts made by the authorities, deficiencies in terms of language in the health service and elderly care still exist. The Institut Ramon Llull continues to promote the Catalan language and culture abroad.

### 2.2.2.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Catalan in Catalonia

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:  
 ↗ improvement    ✓ deterioration    = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Catalonia <sup>15</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Catalan as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Catalan	=				

<sup>15</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).



<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Catalonia<sup>15</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Catalan	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Catalan, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Catalan</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Catalan at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Catalan to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Catalan at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Catalan	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Catalan	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Catalan among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Catalan among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Catalan</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Catalan</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Catalan	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Catalan	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Catalan	=				
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Catalan	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Catalan or of facilities for the study of Catalan as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Catalan	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Catalan	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Catalan	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Catalan and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Catalonia<sup>15</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
8.2	in territories other than those in which Catalan is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Catalan at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Catalan in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Catalan in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Catalan in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Catalan in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Catalan in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Catalan and the related use of documents and evidence in Catalan, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Catalan	=				
9.3	make available in Catalan the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Catalan	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Catalonia<sup>15</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Catalan		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Catalan or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Catalan	=				
10.2.a	use of Catalan within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Catalan to submit oral or written applications in Catalan to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Catalan	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Catalan	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Catalan in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Catalan in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Catalan	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Catalan is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.3.b	allow users of Catalan to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Catalan					
10.4.a	translation or interpretation	=				
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Catalan		= <sup>16</sup>			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Catalan to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Catalan	=				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Catalan	=				
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Catalan	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Catalan	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Catalan	=				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Catalan	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Catalan	=				

<sup>16</sup> As local and regional authorities usually meet the requirements of Article 10.4.b, the evaluation as partly fulfilled mainly results from shortcomings in the responsibility of state administrative bodies.

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Catalonia<sup>15</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Catalan</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Catalan</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Catalan</li> </ul>	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Catalan are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Catalan	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Catalan by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Catalan to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Catalan language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Catalan	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Catalan in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Catalan	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Catalan	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Catalan is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Catalan	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Catalan and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Catalan in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Catalan	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Catalan in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Catalan in economic and social life	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Catalonia <sup>15</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Catalan in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents	=				
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Catalan in economic and social life	=				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Catalan		←			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Catalan		=			
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Catalan is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Catalan in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Catalan, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Catalan is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

45. Compared to the previous evaluation report of the Committee of Experts, the situation of the Catalan language in the Autonomous Community of Catalonia remains largely unchanged, even in the complicated political situation. However, the same problems as reported previously still persist. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts has been informed about some deficiencies in the health care system in terms of language.

#### 2.2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Catalan in Catalonia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>17</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

<sup>17</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

**I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| a. | <b>Amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of Catalan in judicial proceedings at the request of one of the parties.</b> |
| b. | <b>Use Catalan in State administration in Catalonia.</b>   |

**II. Further recommendations**

- c. Increase the use of Catalan in social and health care facilities.
- d. Take measures to have safety instructions also in Catalan.

### 2.2.3 Valencian/Catalan in Valencia

46. According to information and documents received from the Generalitat Valenciana and the Acadèmia Valenciana de la Llengua, the dual name 'Valencian/Catalan' is the designation to be used when reference is made to 'the local and historical language of the Valencians'<sup>18</sup>. Although Valencian/Catalan has co-official status on the whole territory of Valencia and the majority of the population has competence in the language, it is in a worrying situation especially in State administration and the judiciary.

47. Linguistic zones (Valencian and Castilian) regulate the administration of education. In both public and private institutions an immersion method in language teaching has been introduced. The Decree 9/2017 has established a Dynamic Multilingual Educational Programme; however, the regional Supreme Court suspended its application. In 2018, a new law on plurilingual education came into force. It establishes that at least 25% of the teaching must be in Valencian/Catalan with a maximum of 60%. According to the information received, most schools do not reach the maximum level. Furthermore, this new law also hampers immersion programmes. Universities offer courses in Valencian/Catalan, although the language of instruction is predominantly Castilian. As a result of political changes since 2015, a new Directorate-General for Language Policy and Multilingualism Management has been set up under the Department of Education, Research and Culture. As for the judiciary, the shortcomings listed for Catalonia and the Balearic Islands apply equally to Valencian.

48. In the second half of 2016, the Valencian Co-operation, a public broadcasting service, was established. Radio À Punt FM operates since 2017; À Punt television since 2018. Private radio and television stations also broadcast in Valencian/Catalan with governmental support. Television from the Autonomous Region of Catalonia and the Balearic Islands cannot be received in Valencia.

#### 2.2.3.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community <sup>19</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Valencian/Catalan as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Valencian/Catalan	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Valencian/Catalan	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Valencian/Catalan, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			

<sup>18</sup>

<http://www.avl.gva.es/documents/31983/0/Dictamen+sobre+els+principis+i+criteris+per+a+la+defensa+de+la+denominaci%C3%B3+i+l%E2%80%99entitat+del+valenci%C3%A0/986f8d4d-89b2-4a12-826c-c7386f92f289>

<sup>19</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community<sup>19</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Valencian/Catalan</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Valencian/Catalan at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Valencian/Catalan to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Valencian/Catalan at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Valencian/Catalan	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Valencian/Catalan	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Valencian/Catalan among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Valencian/Catalan among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Valencian/Catalan</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Valencian/Catalan</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Valencian/Catalan				↙	
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Valencian/Catalan				↙	
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Valencian/Catalan				↙	
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Valencian/Catalan				↙	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Valencian/Catalan or of facilities for the study of Valencian/Catalan as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Valencian/Catalan	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Valencian/Catalan	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Valencian/Catalan	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Valencian/Catalan and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				



<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community<sup>19</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
8.2	in territories other than those in which Valencian/Catalan is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Valencian/Catalan at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Valencian/Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Valencian/Catalan in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Valencian/Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Valencian/Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Valencian/Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Valencian/Catalan in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Valencian/Catalan in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Valencian/Catalan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Valencian/Catalan in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Valencian/Catalan in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Valencian/Catalan and the related use of documents and evidence in Valencian/Catalan, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Valencian/Catalan	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community<sup>19</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
9.3	make available in Valencian/Catalan the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Valencian/Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Valencian/Catalan		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Valencian/Catalan or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Valencian/Catalan		=			
10.2.a	use of Valencian/Catalan within the framework of the regional or local authority	↗				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Valencian/Catalan to submit oral or written applications in Valencian/Catalan to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Valencian/Catalan	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Valencian/Catalan	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Valencian/Catalan in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Valencian/Catalan in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Valencian/Catalan	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Valencian/Catalan is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.3.b	allow users of Valencian/Catalan to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Valencian/Catalan					
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Valencian/Catalan		=			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Valencian/Catalan to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Valencian/Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Valencian/Catalan	↗				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Valencian/Catalan	↗				
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Valencian/Catalan	↗				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Valencian/Catalan	=				

<sup>20</sup> As local and regional authorities usually meet the requirements of Article 10.4.b, the evaluation as partly fulfilled mainly results from shortcomings in the responsibility of state administrative bodies.

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community<sup>19</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Valencian/Catalan	↗				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Valencian/Catalan	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Valencian/Catalan	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Valencian/Catalan</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Valencian/Catalan</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Valencian/Catalan</li> </ul>	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Valencian/Catalan are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media					=
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Valencian/Catalan	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Valencian/Catalan by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Valencian/Catalan to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Valencian/Catalan language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Valencian/Catalan	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Valencian/Catalan in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	↗				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Valencian/Catalan	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Valencian/Catalan	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Valencian/Catalan is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Valencian/Catalan	↗				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Valencian/Catalan and the culture it reflects	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community <sup>19</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Valencian/Catalan in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Valencian/Catalan	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Valencian/Catalan in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Valencian/Catalan in economic and social life	=				
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Valencian/Catalan in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents				=	
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Valencian/Catalan in economic and social life	=				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Valencian/Catalan				=	
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Valencian/Catalan	=				
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Valencian/Catalan	=				
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Valencian/Catalan is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Valencian/Catalan in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Valencian/Catalan, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Valencian/Catalan is used in identical or similar form	↗				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

## Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

49. The Law on plurilingual education of 2018 is not in conformity with the ratification instrument since it makes, *inter alia*, immersion programme models impossible. The use of Valencian/Catalan in local and regional administration has improved significantly. With the creation of the Valencian Co-operation, a public body broadcasting in Valencian/Catalan was re-established, for radio in 2017 (À Punt FM) and for television in 2018 (À Punt). Private radio and television stations are also operating on the territory with governmental support. Some Castilian printed newspapers have supplements in Valencian/Catalan. However, the language is much more present in the digital press. The co-operation of the Valencian Institute of Culture with other institutions, town councils and NGOs guarantees the inclusion of speakers in the planning of cultural activities. In 2015, the Balearic Islands, Catalonia and Valencia agreed to coordinate efforts in all fields related to Catalan including cultural events. Furthermore, there is close co-operation with speakers of Valencian/Catalan in Murcia.

### 2.2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Valencian Community

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>21</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendations for immediate action

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| a. | <b>Amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of Valencian/Catalan in judicial proceedings at the request of one of the parties.</b> |
| b. | <b>Use Valencian/Catalan in the State administration of the Valencian Community.</b>   |
| c. | <b>Make education available in Valencian/Catalan at all levels of education.</b>   |

#### II. Further recommendations

- d. Ensure the use of Valencian/Catalan in economy, especially in the financial and banking system.
- e. Use Valencian/Catalan in social and health care facilities.

<sup>21</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## 2.2.4 Catalan in Aragon

50. The situation of Catalan in Aragon has changed significantly since the last monitoring round. In 2015, Aragon established a General Directorate of Language Policy which also promotes Catalan in Aragon. In 2016, a legal act re-instated Aragonese and Catalan, recognising them with these names as minority languages of Aragon. Since then some progress has been made in the protection and promotion of Catalan. Since 2016, the language is present in pre-school, primary and secondary education. The Language Academy of the University of Aragon founded in 2013 has an institute for Catalan. Furthermore, the language enjoys support in culture, especially concerning literature and events. There is good co-operation with the authorities of the other Catalan-speaking territories.

### 2.2.4.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Catalan in Aragon

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:  
 ↗ improvement    ✓ deterioration    = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Aragon <sup>22</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Catalan as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Catalan	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Catalan	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Catalan, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Catalan</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Catalan at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Catalan to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Catalan at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Catalan	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Catalan	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Catalan among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Catalan among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				

<sup>22</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Catalan in Aragon <sup>23</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Catalan</li> <li>establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Catalan</li> </ul>	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

#### 2.2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Catalan in Aragon

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>24</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

##### I. Recommendation for immediate action

- a. **Include the name of Catalan in the Statute of Autonomy of Aragon.**

##### II. Further recommendations

- b. Raise awareness among the general population of Aragon of the presence of Catalan.  
c. Take measures for the use of Catalan in local and regional administrations.

<sup>23</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<sup>24</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## 2.2.5 Valencian/Catalan in Murcia

51. The fifth state report provides almost no information on the situation of Valencian/Catalan in the Autonomous Community of Murcia. Nevertheless, the Government of Valencia, which supports speakers in Murcia as well as representatives of the speakers of the El Carxe region have informed the Committee of Experts about the situation. There is a limited offer of extra-curricular courses to learn the language. However, as there is no protection from the authorities of Murcia, the language is in a very precarious situation. Valencian/Catalan is not present in administration, in the media or in public life. Furthermore, it is also absent from public education in the Autonomous Community of Murcia.

### 2.2.5.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:  
 ↗ improvement    ✓ deterioration    = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia <sup>25</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Valencian/Catalan as an expression of cultural wealth			=		
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Valencian/Catalan					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Valencian/Catalan				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Valencian/Catalan, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Valencian/Catalan • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Valencian/Catalan at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Valencian/Catalan to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Valencian/Catalan at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Valencian/Catalan					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Valencian/Catalan					=

<sup>25</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).



The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia <sup>25</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Valencian/Catalan among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Valencian/Catalan among their objectives</li> </ul>					=
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Valencian/Catalan</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Valencian/Catalan</li> </ul>				=	

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### 2.2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>26</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendations for immediate action

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| a. | <b>Recognise Valencian/Catalan as an expression of cultural wealth in the Region of Murcia.</b> |
| b. | <b>Take urgent measures to protect and promote Valencian/Catalan in the Region of Murcia.</b>   |

#### II. Further recommendations

- Promote relations of the Region of Murcia with the Autonomous Community of Valencia to foster the language.
- Offer education in Valencian/Catalan in El Carxe/Murcia at all appropriate levels.
- Include the name of the language in the Statute of Autonomy.

<sup>26</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## 2.3 Galician

52. The Charter protects the Galician language under Parts II and III in Galicia and, furthermore, under Part II in the Principality of Asturias where it is recognised as Galician-Asturian, in Castile and León and, under the name Fala in Extremadura. While the protection of Galician in Galicia is better than in the Part II territories, severe problems with the implementation of the Charter exist in all territories.

### 2.3.1 Galician in Galicia

53. The level of application of the Charter in the Autonomous Community of Galicia did not significantly improve since the last monitoring cycle. Sociolinguistic studies show a decrease in the numbers of speakers. Language transmission from parents to children is no longer guaranteed, and thus the proportion of pupils with proficiency in Galician as the language of everyday life has also fallen significantly. The presence of Galician is insufficient in education, particularly at pre-school level. Major scientific subjects are not taught in Galician at secondary schools. 23% of the university courses are offered in Galician, and about 30% in masters' studies. In non-university education, the current regulation does not allow to provide more than 50% of courses in Galician. There is still no possibility to offer a curriculum in Galician at any pre-school, primary or secondary institution. Decree 79/2010 which defines subjects that shall be taught in Galician excludes the possibility of education in Galician as a language of instruction with Castilian as a subject.

54. Galician legislation is now available online with the LEX.GAL resources, created by the government of Galicia in co-operation with the University of Santiago de Compostela. Language use in the administration has not improved at all. It is still not sufficient to serve the needs of the Galician-speaking population. In addition to the regional public provider, there are also local private radio and television stations broadcasting programmes in Galician. Although the situation of printed and online newspapers in Galician is still problematic due to limited public funding, progress has been made with online publications.

#### 2.3.1.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician in Galicia

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:  
 ↗ improvement    ✓ deterioration    = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician in Galicia <sup>27</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Galician as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Galician	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Galician	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Galician, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Galician</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				

<sup>27</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician in Galicia<sup>27</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Galician at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Galician to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Galician at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Galician	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Galician	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Galician among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Galician among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Galician</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Galician</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Galician				=	
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Galician				=	
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Galician				=	
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Galician				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Galician or of facilities for the study of Galician as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Galician	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Galician	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Galician	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Galician and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Galician is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Galician at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Galician, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Galician in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician in Galicia<sup>27</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Galician, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Galician, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Galician, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Galician in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Galician in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Galician, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Galician in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Galician in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Galician and the related use of documents and evidence in Galician, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Galician	=				
9.3	make available in Galician the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Galician	↗				
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Galician		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Galician or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Galician	=				
10.2.a	use of Galician within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Galician to submit oral or written applications in Galician to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Galician	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Galician	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Galician in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Galician in debates in their assemblies	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician in Galicia<sup>27</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Galician	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Galician is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.3.b	allow users of Galician to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Galician					
10.4.a	translation or interpretation	=				
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Galician		=28			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Galician to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Galician	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Galician	=				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Galician		=			
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Galician		=			
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Galician	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Galician	↗				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Galician	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Galician	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Galician</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Galician</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Galician</li> </ul>					=
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Galician are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Galician	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Galician by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Galician to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Galician language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				

<sup>28</sup> As local and regional authorities usually meet the requirements of Article 10.4.b, the evaluation as partly fulfilled mainly results from shortcomings in the responsibility of state administrative bodies located in the autonomous community.

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician in Galicia<sup>27</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Galician	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Galician in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Galician	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Galician	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Galician is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Galician	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Galician and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Galician in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Galician	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Galician in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Galician in economic and social life	=				
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Galician in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents		=			
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Galician in economic and social life					
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Galician		=			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Galician				=	
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Galician	=				
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Galician is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Galician in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Galician, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Galician is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* **The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### **Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle**

55. The new legal resource LEX.GAL includes the main statutory texts in Galician. Besides the weekly newspaper supplement, there are several daily online newspapers in Galician.

#### **2.3.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Galician in Galicia**

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>29</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. **Remove the limitations to teaching in Galician at all appropriate levels of education.**
- b. **Amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of Galician in judicial proceedings at the request of one of the parties.**
- c. **Use Galician in State administration in Galicia.**

#### **II. Further recommendations**

- d. Increase the use of Galician in the provision of public services.
- e. Make public the evaluation reports of the supervisory body in education.
- f. Ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Galician.

<sup>29</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

### 2.3.2 Galician/Galician-Asturian in Asturias

56. The political change in 2015 resulted in more support for Galician-Asturian in the Principality of Asturias. The teaching of Galician-Asturian at primary and secondary levels is possible, however, the implementation of it is still in development. The language can be used in local administration and in social life. There are programmes both on radio and television, but there are no printed newspapers. There are contacts with speakers in neighbouring regions. The language is also used for toponymic signs.

#### 2.3.2.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician-Asturian in the Principality of Asturias

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician-Asturian in the Principality of Asturias <sup>30</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Galician-Asturian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Galician-Asturian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Galician-Asturian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Galician-Asturian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Galician-Asturian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Galician-Asturian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Galician-Asturian to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Galician-Asturian at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Galician-Asturian					
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Galician-Asturian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Galician-Asturian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Galician-Asturian among their objectives	=				

<sup>30</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).



The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician-Asturian in the Principality of Asturias <sup>30</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Galician-Asturian</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Galician-Asturian</li> </ul>	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### 2.3.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Galician-Asturian in the Principality of Asturias

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>31</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendations for immediate action

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| a. | <b>Develop a structured policy for the protection of the language on the territory where it is spoken (Eo-Navia region).</b> |
| b. | <b>Include the name of Galician-Asturian in the Statute of Autonomy of Asturias.</b>   |

#### II. Further recommendation

- c. Establish co-operation with neighbouring autonomous communities where the language is used.

<sup>31</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

### 2.3.3 Galician in Castile and León

57. The Statute of Autonomy of Castile and León explicitly mentions the protection of Galician in the territories where it is in use. However, the Committee of Experts has received very little official information on the situation of the language. There is an agreement of Castile and León with Galicia about the use of the language in education. According to the speakers, language use is rapidly decreasing, which makes immediate action necessary to protect it.

#### 2.3.3.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician in Castile and León

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Galician in Castile and León <sup>32</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Galician as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Galician	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Galician				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Galician, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Galician • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Galician at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Galician to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Galician at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Galician		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Galician	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Galician among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Galician among their objectives					=
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Galician • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Galician					=

<sup>32</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

\* **The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### **2.3.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Galician in Castile and León**

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>33</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendation for immediate action**

<b>a. Take immediate action to protect Galician in Castile and León.</b>
--

#### **II. Further recommendations**

The Committee of Experts has no further recommendations at present.

<sup>33</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

### 2.3.4 Fala/Galician in Extremadura

58. The Statute of Autonomy of Extremadura acknowledges the linguistic diversity of Extremadura, but does not explicitly protect Fala/Galician in the territory where it is used. The Committee of Experts has received very little information on the situation of the language. According to the speakers, language use is rapidly decreasing, which makes immediate action necessary to protect it.

#### 2.3.4.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Galician in Extremadura

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Fala/Galician in Extremadura <sup>34</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Fala/Galician as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Fala/Galician					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Fala/Galician				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Fala/Galician, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Fala/Galician</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Fala/Galician at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Fala/Galician to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Fala/Galician at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Fala/Galician					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Fala/Galician	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Fala/Galician among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Fala/Galician among their objectives</li> </ul>					=
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Fala/Galician</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Fala/Galician</li> </ul>					=

<sup>34</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

\* **The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### **2.3.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Fala/Galician in Extremadura**

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>35</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendation for immediate action**

<b>a. Take immediate action to protect Fala/Galician in Extremadura.</b>
--

#### **II. Further recommendations**

The Committee of Experts has no further recommendations at present.

<sup>35</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## 2.4 Occitan of the Aran valley / Aranese in Catalonia

59. Catalonia's Statute of Autonomy recognises Aranese/Occitan as co-official in Catalonia. Approximately 80.7% of the 10,000 inhabitants of the Aran valley in Catalonia understand Aranese, and 55.6% speak it. Aranese is considered a particular educational field within Catalonia's educational system. Courses of Aranese are offered at the secondary and adult education levels. A coordination committee of the governments of Catalonia and Aran (Consell de Política Lingüística de l'Occità Aranès) was set up in 2012 and meets annually, alternately in Barcelona and Vielha. The use of Aranese in the judiciary is not explicitly regulated. Using Aranese in local administration is possible. The Catalan Government translates forms and websites into Aranese. Catalan public radio and television broadcasters offer programmes in Aranese. One private radio channel broadcasts 20 minutes per day in the language. There are daily television programmes on private channels. There is support for audiovisual production. There is one online newspaper in Aranese. By law, place names in Val d'Aran are only official in their Aranese form. The Catalan Government established the Institute of Aranese Studies in 2016. One of its activities is the production of terminology in Aranese for schools.

### 2.4.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Occitan of the Aran valley / Aranese in Catalonia

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Aranese/Occitan <sup>36</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Aranese/Occitan as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Aranese/Occitan	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Aranese/Occitan	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Aranese/Occitan, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Aranese/Occitan • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Aranese/Occitan at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Aranese/Occitan to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Aranese/Occitan at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Aranese/Occitan	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Aranese/Occitan	=				

<sup>36</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Aranese/Occitan<sup>36</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Aranese/Occitan among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Aranese/Occitan among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Aranese/Occitan</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Aranese/Occitan</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Aranese/Occitan				=	
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Aranese/Occitan	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Aranese/Occitan				=	
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Aranese/Occitan				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Aranese/Occitan or of facilities for the study of Aranese/Occitan as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Aranese/Occitan	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Aranese/Occitan	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Aranese/Occitan					=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Aranese/Occitan and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	↗				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Aranese/Occitan is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Aranese/Occitan at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Aranese/Occitan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.aid	guarantee the accused the right to use Aranese/Occitan in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned					=
9.1.aiaii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Aranese/Occitan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned					=
9.1.aiaiii	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Aranese/Occitan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned					=

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Aranese/Occitan<sup>36</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Aranese/Occitan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Aranese/Occitan in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations					=
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Aranese/Occitan in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Aranese/Occitan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		=			
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Aranese/Occitan in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations					=
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Aranese/Occitan in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations					=
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Aranese/Occitan and the related use of documents and evidence in Aranese/Occitan, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned					=
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Aranese/Occitan	=				
9.3	make available in Aranese/Occitan the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Aranese/Occitan		=			
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Aranese/Occitan					=
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Aranese/Occitan or in bilingual versions					=
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Aranese/Occitan					=
10.2.a	use of Aranese/Occitan within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Aranese/Occitan to submit oral or written applications in Aranese/Occitan to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Aranese/Occitan	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Aranese/Occitan	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Aranese/Occitan in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Aranese/Occitan in debates in their assemblies	=				



<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Aranese/Occitan<sup>36</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Aranese/Occitan	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Aranese/Occitan is used in the provision of public services					=
10.3.b	allow users of Aranese/Occitan to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Aranese/Occitan					
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Aranese/Occitan		=			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Aranese/Occitan to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Aranese/Occitan	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Aranese/Occitan	↗				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Aranese/Occitan	↗				
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Aranese/Occitan	↗				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Aranese/Occitan	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Aranese/Occitan	↗				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Aranese/Occitan		↗			
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Aranese/Occitan				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Aranese/Occitan</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Aranese/Occitan</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Aranese/Occitan</li> </ul>					=
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Aranese/Occitan are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Aranese/Occitan	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Aranese/Occitan by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Aranese/Occitan to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			

<sup>37</sup> As local and regional authorities usually meet the requirements of Article 10.4.b, the evaluation as partly fulfilled mainly results from shortcomings in the responsibility of state administrative bodies located in the autonomous community.

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of Spain concerning Aranese/Occitan<sup>36</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Aranese/Occitan language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing		↗			
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Aranese/Occitan			↗		
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Aranese/Occitan in providing facilities and planning cultural activities					=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Aranese/Occitan	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Aranese/Occitan	↗				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Aranese/Occitan is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Aranese/Occitan	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Aranese/Occitan and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Aranese/Occitan in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Aranese/Occitan	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Aranese/Occitan in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Aranese/Occitan in economic and social life			=		
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Aranese/Occitan in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents					=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Aranese/Occitan in economic and social life					=
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Aranese/Occitan					=
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Aranese/Occitan			↗		
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Aranese/Occitan			=		
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Aranese/Occitan is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Aranese/Occitan in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Aranese/Occitan <sup>36</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
14.b	for the benefit of Aranese/Occitan, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Aranese/Occitan is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

60. A joint coordination committee between the governments of Catalonia and of Aran elaborated legislative amendments and propositions on the creation of a language authority for the Aranese/Occitan language by Decree 10/2014. Newly translated forms and official webpages facilitate the use of Aranese/Occitan by administrative authorities. The situation of private media is satisfactory and the financial assistance for audiovisual production has improved. The Catalan Government established the Institute of Aranese Studies, which started its work in 2016. One of its activities is the production of lexicographic reference works in Aranese/Occitan for Schools. Another outcome is the possibility of the use of Aranese in safety instructions.

#### 2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Occitan of the Aran valley / Aranese in Catalonia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>38</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendation for immediate action

a. **Take measures to ensure education in Aranese at all appropriate levels.**

#### II. Further recommendations

- b. Amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of Aranese in judicial proceedings at the request of one of the parties.
- c. Use Aranese in State administration in Catalonia.

<sup>38</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## 2.5 Amazigh in Melilla

61. In July 2014, the Melilla Assembly recognised Amazigh as “a traditional language that is an inseparable part of the intangible cultural heritage common to all of Melilla’s citizens”. According to the 5th periodical report, the authorities of Melilla took essential steps to improve the situation of the language. Courses for teacher trainers and for language and grammar training for university graduates have been started during the reporting period. A pilot project has been envisaged for 2018 to teach children the Amazigh language. However, there is no reliable information on the number of speakers. The government affirmed that the sociolinguistic census of 2018-2019 - conducted by the Institute of Cultures and the Department of the Presidency of Melilla in co-operation with Spanish Central Administration - will provide the numbers of speakers of Amazigh.

### 2.5.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Amazigh in Melilla

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Amazigh in Melilla <sup>39</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Amazigh as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Amazigh	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Amazigh		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Amazigh, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Amazigh • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups				=	
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Amazigh at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Amazigh to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Amazigh at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Amazigh					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Amazigh	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Amazigh among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Amazigh among their objectives					=

<sup>39</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Amazigh in Melilla <sup>39</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Amazigh</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Amazigh</li> </ul>					=

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

## 2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Amazigh in Melilla

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>40</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### I. Recommendation for immediate action

#### a. **Take immediate action to protect Amazigh in Melilla.**

### II. Further recommendations

The Committee of Experts has no further recommendations at present.

<sup>40</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## **2.6 Arabic/Darija in Ceuta**

62. The question of whether to protect Arabic/Darija under the Charter is still open. However, as it is a language spoken traditionally in North Africa, it seems quite clear that the language has a traditional presence on the territory of Ceuta. According to the State authorities, Arabic/Darija has no continuous presence in that territory. In the fourth evaluation report (2015), the Committee of Experts emphasised that the obligation to offer promotion and protection to a regional and minority language depends solely on the traditional presence of the language on the territory. Therefore, the Committee of Experts reiterates its findings and proposes a scientific project to clarify the status of Arabic/Darija in Ceuta under the Charter. Due to the lack of information, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to evaluate this language in tabular form at this stage.

### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

The Committee of Experts has no recommendations for immediate action at present.

### **II. Further recommendation**

- a. Initiate an academic research project in order to clarify the situation of Arabic/Darija in Ceuta in co-operation with the speakers.

## 2.7. Aragonese in Aragon

63. According to the “Population and Housing Census” of 2011, 44,439 people understand Aragonese and 25,556 speak it. After the 2015 elections, the Government of Aragon introduced a new regulatory framework on languages. Aragonese (together with Catalan) has been recognised as part of the cultural heritage of Aragon, albeit without a co-official status. A Directorate-General for Language Policy has been established within the Department of Education, Culture and Sports of the Government of Aragon. A programme has been launched to include Aragonese in education, in the respective areas where the language has a traditional presence. Syllabi for the teaching of Aragonese at primary and secondary education have been elaborated together with courses for teachers of the language.

### 2.7.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Aragonese

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:  
 ↗ improvement    ✓ deterioration    = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Aragonese <sup>41</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Aragonese as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Aragonese	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Aragonese	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Aragonese, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Aragonese • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Aragonese at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Aragonese to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Aragonese at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Aragonese					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Aragonese	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Aragonese among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Aragonese among their objectives		=			

<sup>41</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Aragonese <sup>41</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Aragonese</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Aragonese</li> </ul>	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### 2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Aragonese in Aragon

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>42</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendation for immediate action

a. **Include the name of Aragonese in the Statute of Autonomy of Aragon.**

#### II. Further recommendations

- b. Continue to incorporate Aragonese at all levels of education in Aragon.
- c. Take measures for the use of Aragonese in local and regional administrations.

<sup>42</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)



## 2.8 Asturian

64. Asturian is not official in Asturias; however, there is strong public support in society to make it official. The language is protected under the name of Bable in the Statute of Autonomy while Law 1/1998 uses the name Bable/Asturian. The speakers insist that the language should only be called Asturian. The language is learned as an elective subject in primary education and is optional in secondary education where it competes with foreign languages. Approximately 90% of the pupils in primary and 80% in secondary (public) education learn Asturian. Currently, six schools also offer courses in Asturian. The University of Oviedo offers teaching in and research on Asturian as well as a master's programme for secondary school teacher training. There are no regulations for the use of Asturian in administration, but it is present in contact with local authorities. The Academy of the Asturian Language advises the government on language issues. In co-operation with the Centre for Terminology, the Academy developed vocabulary collections for various domains of public life. Asturian is not used in broadcasting media.

### 2.8.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Asturian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement    ✓ deterioration    = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Asturian <sup>43</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Asturian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Asturian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Asturian	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Asturian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Asturian</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Asturian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Asturian to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Asturian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Asturian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Asturian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Asturian among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Asturian among their objectives</li> </ul>		=			

<sup>43</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Asturian <sup>43</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Asturian</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Asturian</li> </ul>	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

## 2.8.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Asturian in Asturias

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.8.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain<sup>44</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### I. Recommendation for immediate action

a. **Include the name of Asturian in the Statute of Autonomy of Asturias.**

### II. Further recommendations

- b. Enhance the offer of Asturian at all levels of education.
- c. Use Asturian in regional and local administration.
- d. Increase the use of Asturian in the media.

<sup>44</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## **2.9 Caló**

65. The status of Caló, i.e. the traditional (non-territorial) language of the autochthonous Romani population of the Iberian Peninsula, called Calé, is still unclear. There are at least two varieties spoken in Spain: Castilian Caló and Catalan Caló so they might even be treated as two languages. On the other hand, they also might be classified as varieties of Castilian and Catalan with lexical elements from Romani. In its last evaluation report, the Committee of Experts encouraged the authorities to revitalise Caló within the framework of the Comprehensive Plan for the Romani Population in Catalonia 2009-2013. However, there is no information on this undertaking or on Caló in general in the Fifth Periodical Report. Due to the lack of information, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to evaluate this language in tabular form at this stage.

### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

The Committee of Experts has no recommendations for immediate action at present.

### **II. Further recommendations**

- a. Clarify the status of Caló by means of academic research in co-operation with the speakers.
- b. Provide information on the revitalisation of Caló.

## **2.10 Estremeñu in Extremadura**

66. During the on-the-spot visit to Spain, representatives of the speakers of Estremeñu informed the Committee of Experts about the existence of this language in Extremadura. Due to lack of information the Committee of Experts is not in a position to evaluate this language in tabular form at this stage.

### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

The Committee of Experts has no recommendations for immediate action at present.

### **II. Further recommendation**

- a. Clarify the status of Estremeñu by academic research in co-operation with the speakers.

## 2.11 Leonese in Castile and León

67. Despite the definition of Leonese as part of the linguistic heritage of the Community of Castile and León and its recognition in the Statute of Autonomy, the language is in a fragile situation. Estimations of the number of speakers range between 25,000 and 50,000, however there are no official data available. Despite continuous efforts on the part of the speakers, Leonese has no public presence in Castile and León, nor any presence in education, in the media or in administration.

### 2.11.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Leonese in Castile and León

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Leonese in Castile and León <sup>45</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Leonese as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Leonese	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Leonese				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Leonese, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Leonese</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Leonese at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Leonese to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Leonese at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Leonese				=	
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Leonese				=	
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Leonese among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Leonese among their objectives</li> </ul>					=
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Leonese</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Leonese</li> </ul>					=

<sup>45</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

**\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### **2.11.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Leonese in Castile and León**

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.11.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain <sup>46</sup>remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendation for immediate action**

<p><b>a. Take resolute action to protect and promote Leonese in Castile and León, particularly in education.</b></p>
--

#### **II. Further recommendations**

The Committee of Experts has no further recommendations at present.

---

<sup>46</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)

## 2.12 Portuguese

68. Portuguese has a traditional presence on the Spanish territory. There are speakers in Extremadura, however, it is unclear if there are any speakers left in Castile and León.

### 2.12.1 Portuguese in Extremadura

69. Portuguese has a traditional presence in Extremadura and is still spoken in the town of Olivenza/Olivença and some villages, mostly by elderly people. As the language is in a very precarious situation, private initiatives started a revitalisation process.

#### 2.12.1.1 Compliance of Spain with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Portuguese in Extremadura

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Portuguese in Extremadura <sup>47</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Portuguese as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Portuguese					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Portuguese				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Portuguese, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Portuguese • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Portuguese at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Portuguese to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Portuguese at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Portuguese				=	
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Portuguese	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Portuguese among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Portuguese among their objectives					=

<sup>47</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Spain concerning Portuguese in Extremadura <sup>47</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Portuguese</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Portuguese</li> </ul>					=

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### 2.12.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Portuguese in Extremadura

The Committee of Experts encourages the Spanish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.12.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Spain <sup>48</sup>remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendation for immediate action

- |  |
|--|
| a. <b>Take resolute action to promote and revitalise Portuguese in Extremadura, particularly in education.</b> |
|--|

#### II. Further recommendations

The Committee of Experts has no further recommendations at present.

<sup>48</sup> [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c1bea)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9c11)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d20de)  
[https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805d98c6)



### **2.12.2 Portuguese in Castile and León**

70. Portuguese has had traditional presence in Castile and León. However, as the Committee of Experts did not receive any information on the use nor on the protection of the language, it is not in a position to conclude on its present situation. Due to this lack of information, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to evaluate this language in tabular form at this stage.

#### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

The Committee of Experts has no recommendations for immediate action at present.

#### **II. Further recommendation**

- a. Clarify the situation of Portuguese in Castile and León.

### **Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe**

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Spanish authorities have undertaken to protect the regional and minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16, paragraph 4 of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Spain.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages,

Bearing in mind the instrument of ratification deposited by Spain on 9 April 2001;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Spain;

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Spanish authorities on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Spain in its fifth periodical report, supplementary information given by the Spanish authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Spain and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

Recommends that the Spanish authorities take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. amend the Organic Law on the Judiciary so as to ensure the use of the co-official languages in judicial proceedings at the request of one of the parties;
2. use the co-official languages in State administration in the Autonomous Communities;
3. remove the limitations to the teaching in Galician in Galicia and Valencian/Catalan in Valencia;
4. Include the names of Part II languages in the Statutes of Autonomy of the Autonomous Communities where these languages are spoken;
5. Clarify the status and situation of Arabic/Darija in Ceuta, Caló as a non-territorial language of Spain, Estremeño in Extremadura and Portuguese in Castile and León.

The Committee of Ministers invites the Spanish authorities to submit the information on the recommendations for immediate action by 1 August 2020 and on the next periodical report by 1 August 2023.

## Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification

Status as of 20/03/2019



Spain

### Declarations contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 9 April 2001 - Or. Spa.

Spain declares that, for the purposes of the mentioned articles, are considered as regional or minority languages, the languages recognised as official languages in the Statutes of Autonomy of the Autonomous Communities of the Basque Country, Catalonia, Balearic Islands, Galicia, Valencia and Navarra.

For the same purposes, Spain also declares that the languages protected by the Statutes of Autonomy in the territories where they are traditionally spoken are also considered as regional or minority languages.

The following provisions of the Part III of the Charter will apply to the languages mentioned in the first paragraph:

#### Article 8:

- paragraph 1 sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(i), d(i), e(iii), f(i), g, h, i.
- paragraph 2.

#### Article 9:

- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), b(i), b(ii), b(iii), c(i), c(ii), c(iii), d.
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a.
- paragraph 3.

#### Article 10:

- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b, c.
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g.
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b.
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs a, b, c.
- paragraph 5.

#### Article 11:

- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(i), d, e(i), f(ii), g.
- paragraph 2.
- paragraph 3.

#### Article 12:

- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g, h.
- paragraph 2.
- paragraph 3.

#### Article 13:

- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d.
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e.

#### Article 14:

- sub-paragraph a.
- sub-paragraph b.

All the provisions of Part III of the Charter, which can reasonably apply according to the objectives and principles laid down in Article 7, will apply to the languages mentioned in the second paragraph.

**Period covered: 01/08/2001** - Articles concerned : 2, 3, 7

## Appendix II: Comments from the Spanish authorities

Once examined the Report from the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages related to the fifth periodical Report from Spain on the implementation of the Charter, and according to clause 16 thereof, the Government of Spain proceeds to present the following comments.

In the elaboration of this Report there has been requested the participation of all the Autonomous Regions that have at least one regional or minority language as well as the Cities of Ceuta and Melilla and all the Ministries and public bodies with special relevance in this matter.

### General remarks

The Government of Spain will continue to make efforts to improve language policy in a manner which is favourable to the enforcement of the points of the Charter.

This summer, the publication of the Diagnostic Report on the use of co-official languages in the General State Administration is planned. The Report will help the Government to take measures to promote and improve the use of regional languages in the General State Administration.

### General situation concerning the regional or minority languages in Spain

#### **1. Reference of non-respect of the citizen's language rights and abusive attitudes from police officers.**

Both in the on-the-spot visit that took place in Madrid on December 14th and in the Report adopted by the Committee of Experts on April 2019, there can be found several references to discriminatory acts against citizens carried out by the State security forces and bodies only due to the use of regional languages. During the on-the-spot visit, Spanish authorities denied having knowledge about these events, and they insured in such cases agents would have incurred in disciplinary responsibility. Spanish authorities required some proof or evidence of such events, but the Committee of Experts did not have any evidence at all and just had this information received by some NGOs. Bearing in mind that there is no knowledge of these facts beyond partial comments and that they do not provide any evidence, we ask the Committee of Experts to withdraw these comments or support them with more specific information.

#### **2. Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities.**

The right to use a regional language in judicial procedures is already recognized by the Organic Law of the Judicial Power (hereinafter LOPJ), guaranteeing the fundamental right to effective judicial protection, proclaimed in article 24 of the Spanish Constitution. The Spanish Justice Ministry understands that the article 231 of the LOPJ is in accordance with article 9 of the Charter. This article allows the use of regional languages in judicial procedures in Autonomous Regions with more than one official language, without needing to translate it into Spanish to be legally valid, as long as these effects are limited into Regions where the regional language is official. Article 9 establishes that it will be the judicial authority to accept the use of a regional language by one of the parties if the right to effective judicial protection is assured and not an obstacle to the judicial procedure.

Regarding the use of the regional languages by the justice staff, it is reported that the *Consejo General del Poder Judicial* (government body for judges and public prosecutors in Spain) has signed an agreement with the National Distance Education University (UNED), in addition to already existing programs carried out by *Servicio de Formación Continua*, *Servicio de Formación de la Escuela Judicial* and *Centro de Estudios Jurídicos* in the Ministry of Justice. All of them conducting actions in the training of Justice staff, including language courses.

Finally, the Regulation 2/2011 of the Judicial Career contemplates the evaluation of the knowledge of regional languages and regional Civil Law (*Derecho Foral*), as a preferential merit in the competitions for jurisdictional bodies in certain Autonomous Regions.

**3. In relation to the use of regional languages by the General State Administration (AGE)**, it should be noted that important efforts continue to be made to guarantee the right of citizens to use the regional languages, especially in those territories that have more than one official language.

First of all, it should be mentioned several measures applicable to all State Administration, both central services and regional services (those located in the Autonomous Communities): It is remarkable the recent approval of the Agreement on the application of the additional funds provided for in the Second Agreement for the Improvement of Public Employment and Working Conditions of March 9, 2018, reached between the Ministry of Territorial Policy and Public Administration and trade union organizations on March 5th 2019. Precisely within the framework of the European Charter on regional or minority languages, this Agreement increases the remuneration of the AGE staff occupying positions in the territory of an Autonomous Community with regional languages when it is proved that this person has a specific knowledge of the regional language. This supposes a clear incentive to the linguistic training of public employees.

Also, INAP (National Institute for Public Administration) continues to play an important role in the training of public employees in Catalan, Valencian, Galician and Basque languages. Training courses continue in these languages as it can be examined on their website: <https://www.inap.es/lenguas-cooficiales>

By INAP Resolution of October 22, 2018, training actions for the learning and improvement of regional languages were announced: Catalan, Basque, Galician and Valencian (Official Gazette of the State No. 257, of October 24). These formative activities for the learning and the improvement of the languages, that will be conducted between January and September of 2019, suppose an average dedication for the students estimated in 150 hours.

Courses can be developed by an online platform accessible 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. In addition, each student will have a tutor to address any possible concerns, as well as to monitor and evaluate the student, except during the months of July and August, which will be considered non-class.

The number of positions for each language is the following:

- Basque: 530 students
- Catalan: 1200 students
- Galician: 625 students
- Valencian: 625 students

These courses, which are adapted to the provisions of the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (MECR) and cover the levels between A1 and C1, are designed for the development of both oral and written skills.

All public employees of the General State Administration who provide services through an official, labor or statutory relationship, regardless of the territory in which they are assigned, may participate in these training activities, and it is not necessary to have previous knowledge in the language.

Secondly, in relation with regional services depending on State Administration, and more specifically those located in the Autonomous Communities with minority languages, the Ministry of Territorial Policy and Public Administration has carried out a survey in order to prepare a Report about the situation of regional languages in the State Administration. The Report, which has not yet been published, contains questions on 5 thematic blocks:

- Staff – language skills
- Printed and standardized models in regional languages
- Posters and signs in regional languages
- Institutional campaigns, service letters, complaints and suggestions in regional languages.
- Use of official place names when their original form is in a regional language.

From the information provided by the Government Delegations, interesting conclusions can be drawn:

- The regional language skills are very high among employees in general terms, reaching more than 90% in Galicia and in Catalonia. It only has an insufficient range in the Basque Country and Navarre, but this is supplemented by the existence of translators. This difference between regions is due to the difficulty of the Basque language, very different from Spanish, and the fact that the majority of public employees assigned to these Communities are not originally from there, unlike what happens in other locations.

- Printed and standardized models in regional languages are translated in 100% of the cases according to many units. Some units, however, admit not all versions are bilingual, and those who declare fewer level of translation assure at least 25% of these models are translated.
- In relation to posters and signs in regional languages, on average, 80% are translated according to the information provided, always supported by graphic evidence.
- Finally, the institutional campaigns from the Delegations are between 100 and 50% translated to the regional language.

#### **4. Reference to the low frequency of Council of Official Languages meetings.**

The Council of Official Languages has held five meetings so far. The last one took place on December 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2018, in Bilbao, presided by the Minister of Territorial Policy and Public Administration, and the presence of representatives from the Basque Government and Euskaltzandia (Basque Language Academy). This day, December 3<sup>rd</sup>, is also the official Euskera day. It is in the aim of the Government to recuperate the annual frequency of its meetings.

#### **5. Use of the regional or minority languages in the media**

The Report of the Committee of Experts assures that the mutual reception of Catalan radio and television programs between the Balearic Islands, Catalonia and Comunitat Valenciana is not possible due to technical shortcomings. But this is not accurate, since Law 7/2010 of General of Audiovisual Communication, in section 4 of its Article 40 establishes:

*"The broadcasting of the public service of audiovisual communication by terrestrial hertzian waves of a Community or Autonomous City in another borderline and with linguistic and cultural affinities may be made provided that they so agree by agreement, and there is reciprocity."*

Indeed, these conventions are not only contemplated as a possibility in the aforementioned article, but they have been signed and executed on several occasions, so it is possible to use this instrument in those Autonomous Regions that so wish, as long as the possibilities of using the scarce resource that turns out to be the radioelectric public domain allows it.

#### **Comments to the regional languages protected by Part III of the Charter.**

#### **BASQUE OR EUSKERA IN THE BASQUE COUNTRY**

##### *Section 23.*

The Basque Government (through HABE) subsidizes the activity of euskaltegis (adult Basque-speaking centers). The euskaltegis can be both privately or publicly owned (municipal depending on the town councils). In the case of the municipal euskaltegis the prices of the courses are established autonomously by the municipalities through fees, as well as establishing rates for other types of municipal public services. Besides, the private euskaltegis or social initiative establish the prices of the registration of the courses according to their economic balance being a determining factor of the economic conditions offered to their teachers. Therefore, each euskaltegi establishes a specific price for the registration of the courses.

The Basque Government has defined as a commitment to fulfill for the 2016-2020 Legislature the culmination of the free learning of the Basque language up to the B2 level, always linked to the improvement of the academic level. Therefore, all students who pass a level of Basque up to level B2 (starting at the beginning of the course of a lower level) will get a subsidy of 100% of the cost of registration, although the enrollment paid by the students is diverse. The total free of charge enrollment will end in 2020, and this year 2019, 80% will be exceeded in the goal of 100% free enrollment.

##### *Section 24.*

The successive promotions of law graduates coming out of Basque universities with full knowledge of Basque will, logically, lead to the gradual incorporation of judges, prosecutors and lawyers of the bilingual Administration of Justice. Besides, given the importance in the system of other legal operators, the Basque Government continues to subsidize the master's degree in access to the legal profession with the Basque language option.

*Section 25.*

The Basque Government continues holding Basque courses for judges, prosecutors and lawyers of the Administration of Justice (formerly known as judicial secretaries) and increasing the offer in the online modality.

*Section 26.*

The linguistic normalization measures taken by the Security Department and the generational change that is taking place in the Ertzaintza imply a notable and progressive increase in the knowledge of Basque language in the organization. In 2018, 46.7% of the staff had a level of linguistic competence in Basque and their knowledge is required in 43.9% of the endowments. Citizens' complaints and initiatives regarding the use of Basque demonstrate the existence of a demand for information regarding the Basque Plan and the use of the official languages. In 2016, only 27 complaints were collected and one year later 17, ten fewer than the previous year. After analyzing the complaints received, two are the main reasons given: those related to the lack of attention in Basque in the police stations and those related to written communications or through public announcements.

*Section 27.*

It has been updated the information about Basque knowledge accreditation among Osakidetza's staff and the percentage of working positions where Basque knowledge is compulsory. Furthermore, we have marked which percentage of employees center their activity on healthcare and which percentage of employees are located in nonhealth units (administration and general units).

According to the register of the preferred language, it is necessary to clarify and differentiate on the one hand the total amount of users who already have their preferred language registered, and on the other hand the amount of registered patients who opted for Basque as their language of preference.

Finally, we find it very convenient to leave proof in the report of the satisfaction of patients who use Basque as their common language regarding the use of Basque in care services provided to them. The result given comes out of the average results of surveys carried out in these fields: primary care, emergency services' activities and intensive care patients' hospitalization.

*Section 29:*

On 5 February 2019, the Basque Government Council approved a collaboration agreement between the Basque Government, the Provincial Council of Gipuzkoa, the Provincial Council of Bizkaia and the Provincial Council of Araba for the financing of the media in Euskera.

The collaboration agreement has the following objectives: firstly, to review the system of public financing of these media; secondly, to establish commitments in accordance with the competences and relative weight of the media in each territory; and, finally, to ensure a minimum level of public financing that ensures the continuity of these Basque language media.

As a result, total subsidies for the media in Euskera have risen by more than 50%. This is the context of the agreement that will be signed this year by the Basque Government and the only newspaper published entirely in Euskera: BERRIA. BERRIA will receive, through this new collaboration framework, 2.3 million euro (800,000 euro more than last year).

**BASQUE IN FORAL COMMUNITY OF NAVARRE***Section 31*

In the so-called Basque-speaking area in Navarre, there are not many infrastructures (hospitals or specialized medical care, courts, universities ...) that can actually guarantee compliance with the articles of Part III of the Charter, so that the population living in that area has to move to the capital, Pamplona, located in the called mixed zone, to receive those services. Therefore, the Government of Navarre, through the Regional Decree 103/2017, of November 15, which regulates the use of Basque in the public administrations of Navarra, its public bodies and dependent public law entities, has regulated the use of Basque in the central services, those services of the Administration of the Autonomous Community that, regardless of their location, serve to the entire population of Navarre. The training of these central services to meet the demand for service in Basque is being carried out in the planning contemplated in the I Strategic Plan of Euskera (2016-2019).

*Section 37*

The reference to the creation of the General Directorate of Culture - Institución Príncipe de Viana is not accurate, since it was created more than 40 years ago.

**GALICIAN IN GALICIA***Section 53*

In the 5th Report of Spain, as well as during the visit of the Committee of Experts that took place on December 10, 2018 in Oviedo, sufficient evidence was provided that contradicts the assertion “the level of application of the Charter in Galicia did not significantly improve since the last monitoring cycle”. The Xunta de Galicia, as a public institution, has met its obligations in terms of promoting the Galician language and has strived to achieve a greater degree of compliance with the Charter, which also translated into a greater and obvious degree of protection and promotion of Galician in relation to the previous evaluation period. The Galician Government has a specific department (the General Secretariat for Language Policy) whose purpose is to promote, plan, coordinate, direct and implement linguistic policies aimed at the promotion and social development of Galician. This department allocated more than 15 million euros to this goal in the reference period. Therefore, it is difficult to sustain a statement as generic and as unsubstantiated as the one included in the heading and which, in a way, perverts, as a simplification, a whole policy of promotion of the Galician language that has been out during those years of reference.

In relation with the remark sociolinguistic studies show a decrease in the number of speakers, The Xunta admit a slight decrease in the overall number of speakers in Galician, in light of the available sociolinguistic data (Survey of Living Conditions of Families of the Galician Institute of Statistics) however it should also be admitted that this decrease occurs among people that they had no education in Galician, that is to say, those born before 1970, and to a much lesser extent in the other age groups, in which there was a stagnation.

Besides, the available data show a change in the social model: we have moved from a society in which weighed linguistic uses predominated (monolingualism in Galician and monolingualism in Spanish) to another in which bilingualism increases. This process is especially evident in the acquisition of the first language: initial bilingualism has increased by 13.4%. Another indicative data is that in the population centers of more than 50,000 inhabitants there is a stagnation in the process of reducing the number of children who had Spanish as their only initial language.

As a summary, we can see that:

- Three-quarters of Galicians speak the Galician language to a greater or lesser extent, a fact that places Galician language among the regional languages with the highest rate of use. The more solvent sociolinguistic studies that made predictions in the medium term show that Galician language has a solid strength.
- The presence of Galician increased in teaching levels in the last 10 years. Nearly all students receive classes (besides the Galician language subject itself) in Galician.
- Although the family transmission should be increased, most parents still speak Galician to their children and, consequently, Galician is the predominant language in family transmission.

As mentioned previously, the presence of Galician in education has increased in the last 10 years. Nearly all students who study their non-university studies in Galicia receive classes (other than the Galician language subject) in Galician.

In Galicia the teaching of the Galician language is established by the provisions of Decree 79/2010, of May 20, for multilingualism in non-university education in Galicia. Its inspiring principles are:

- Guarantee the acquisition of an equal competence in the two official languages of Galicia.
- Guarantee the maximum possible balance in the weekly hours and in the subjects taught in the two official languages of Galicia, with the aim of ensuring the acquisition of equal competence in them.



- Acquisition of an effective knowledge in foreign language (s), in a general framework of promotion of multilingualism in the educational system of Galicia.
- Promotion of the revitalization of the Galician language in educational centers. It is mandatory the creation of a team to revitalize the Galician language, which aims to design and implement programs to promote the Galician language.

In pre-school:

- The language used by teachers is the one predominant among students.
- Individual attention is given to students, taking into account their mother tongue.
- Each center must include in its center's linguistic project all the necessary measures to ensure so that students acquire, orally and in writing, knowledge of the two languages.

In primary education:

- Galician is compulsory in the subjects of Social Sciences and Natural Sciences.
- Each educational center, according to the procedure established in the regulations, decides the language in which the other subjects of each course will be taught. This process will be established every four academic years.
- It is guaranteed that the subjects in Galician and Castilian languages will be distributed in the same percentage of weekly hours.

In compulsory secondary education:

- The subject of Biology and Geology is compulsory in Galician, as well as Geography and History, both of scientific content, and both require a broad knowledge of lexicon belonging to scientific fields of knowledge.
- Each educational center, according to the procedure established in the regulations, will decide the language in which the rest of subjects of each course will be taught.

In non-compulsory secondary education (*Bachillerato*):

- Each educational center, according to the procedure established in the regulations, establishes a balanced offer in the same percentage of subjects to be taught in Galician and Spanish.
- This process is carried out every four years

In professional training:

- Each educational center, according to the procedure established in the regulation, establishes a balanced offer of subjects and modules in Galician and Spanish.
- In all the modules it is guaranteed that the students know the specific vocabulary in the two official languages.

In Galicia, there is a single line of public education, with the prohibition of separating students due to language choices (article 13.2 of Law 3/1983, on linguistic normalization). In this educational model, the Galician language is the main language of teaching. The Law establishes a distribution by percentages and does not contemplate the possibility of implementing the total linguistic immersion model. Thus, the Galician model is governed by these principles:

- Curricular distribution of the students in the two official languages. It is guaranteed that the subjects in Galician and in Spanish are distributed in the same percentage of weekly hours
- Imparting up to a maximum of one third of the weekly teaching schedule in foreign languages.

- The language mainly used by the teachers will be predominant among the students

This linguistic model is responsible of the excellent results that the sociolinguistic studies show about the use and knowledge of the Galician language among the young population in Galicia (between 15 and 29 years): more than 95% of these citizens understand the Galician orally and written, and about 90% say they have enough or a lot of capacity to speak and write it.

## **OCCITAN**

### *Section 59*

With regard to the recommendation made by the Committee of Experts for immediate action to "guarantee education in Aranese at all appropriate levels", the Government of Catalonia understand that this is an error of interpretation in relation to the situation of the Aranese language in educational institutions. Educational institutions fully guarantee that Val d'Aran's own language is learnt alongside Catalan and Spanish. Knowledge of Aranese Occitan is mandatory for teachers and it is a language which is a vehicle for teaching in schools, so that students are able to use the three official languages when they have completed their education. Therefore, the Government of Catalonia can ensure that this recommendation is fulfilled.

## **Comments to the regional languages protected by Part II of the Charter.**

### **ARAGONESE AND CATALAN IN ARAGON**

#### *Section 50 and 63*

#### **A. - Incorporating Aragonese to the mass media (7.1 d)**

On May 5th it started the broadcasting of a weekly programme totally recorded in the Aragonese language (Charrin Charrán), for the first time in the history of Aragonese regional TV.

#### **B. - Adult Education (7.1 g)**

Approval of the Law 2/2019 of February 21st, of Longlife Learning in the Autonomous Community of Aragon.

This new Longlife Learning Law that responds to the new needs of the digital era, both in regards to forming citizens with the necessary competences and skills to carry out the jobs of the future and to create an active, participative citizenship, recipient of rights and duties, able to build a fairer and more inclusive society.

All that within the singular context of the Aragonese territory, with a very dispersed population and with a tendency to ageing, in many cases illiterate in their own language, and with some rural population areas with a very low demographic rate, to which it is necessary to give a quality educational answer that strengthens personal and community development and makes it possible to fulfill Incheon Declaration's goal 4.6.

#### Article 6. Educational actions.

In order to get the goals planned in the present Law, the following actions will be carried out:

- Training for personal development and participation in social and cultural life, with particular impact in Aragonese culture and *regional languages*.

#### Article 8. Programmes and Itineraries.

The following programmes and itineraries are considered priority:

a) Programmes of adult early learning, from literacy in *the mother tongue, especially the regional languages*, acquisition and updating of key competences, acquisition of foreign languages and functional basic knowledge on ICT (Information and Communication Technologies) to obtaining the basic educational qualification.

e) Itineraries that promote personal development, social and citizen participation, democratic and solidary values, cultural, musical, artistic and different languages training, *regional languages* and other languages, equality of opportunities between men and women, as well as health and consumption, active ageing and preservation and respect for the environment.

#### Article 21. Definition

The integrated system of learning for personal and social development is the combination of programmes, educational and learning actions that facilitate for adult population to follow processes of acquisition of personal and social contents and competences for the attainment of the qualification on Secondary Education or A levels, the access to training in the Spanish educational system, the acquisition of key competences, languages - including Spanish as a new language and *regional languages* - digital competences and learnings that favour citizenship participation, social inclusion and the improvement of education through an adequate flexible offer for the interests and needs of adult population.

Article 23. Offer within the integrated system of learning for personal and social development.

The offer for the integrated system of learning for personal and social development is made up of the proposals of face-to-face, semiface-to-face and distance learning that include:

e) Programmes for the acquisition of linguistic competences in foreign languages, *Aragonese regional languages* and Spanish for foreigners.

Article 26. Language training and integration.

3. The competent Department on non University education will encourage Spanish for foreigners with the aim that the acquisition and use of Spanish facilitates the integration, inclusion and social and working incorporation of foreign citizens, and it will also encourage the teaching of *Aragonese regional languages*. In order to get that, a flexible offer will be established through the Official Schools of Languages, Educational Centres for Adult People, social agents and other organizations that collaborate with the Aragonese Autonomous Region and it will adjust to the interests and needs of adult population.

### **C) Participation in the European Programme PECTEFA LINGUATEC (7.1.I)**

The EFA 227/16 LINGUATEC Project was approved in the second POCTEFA call with a Budget of 1,225,500 euros and it is financed jointly in a 65% by the European Fund for Regional Development (FEDER in Spanish) through the Interreg Programme V-A Spain- France-Andorra (POCTEFA 2014-2010). The objective of POCTEFA is to reinforce the economic and social integration of the border area Spain-France-Andorra. This fund concentrates on the development of economic, social and environmental cross-border activities through joint strategies in favour of sustainable territorial development.

The European Project EFA 227/16/LINGUATEC “Development of cross-border co-operation and transfer of knowledge on language technologies” has the objective to develop, show and disseminate new resources, tools and innovative language applications that improve the level of digitalization of Aragonese, Basque and Occitan. For that matter, it counts on a consortium formed by six organizations:

1. ELHUYAR FUNDAZIOA
2. LO CONGRÈS PERMANENT DE LA LENGA OCCITANA
3. UNIVERSITY OF THE BASQUE COUNTRY / EUSKAL HERRIKO UNIBERSITATEA
4. CNRS (CENTRE NATIONAL DE LA RECHERCHE SCIENTIFIQUE) - DELEGATION REGIONAL MIDI-PYRENEES
5. EUSKALTZAINDIA – ROYAL ACADEMY OF THE BASQUE LANGUAGE
6. SOCIEDAD DE PROMOCIÓN Y GESTIÓN DEL TURISMO ARAGONÉS, S.L.U. (SOCIETY FOR THE PROMOTION AND MANAGEMENT OF ARAGONESE TOURISM)

Cross-border co-operation will allow to transfer knowledge and develop linguistic solutions with market power that benefit language professionals and facilitate public multilingual access to contents and promote the development of a cross-border cluster of linguistic technologies.

Thanks to the collaboration of the six partner organizations in the Project, it is expected to obtain the following results:

- One route map of the digitalization of Aragonese.
- Five new language resources (Occitan: Occitan monolingual and bilingual vocabulary / other languages, morphosyntactic and syntactic analysis; Basque: voice recognition)
- Eight developed or improved language tools (vocal synthesis of Occitan, Aragonese and Iparralde Basque, text detector of Occitan and its varieties, automatic translation French-Occitan, Spanish-Basque, Spanish-Aragonese. The development of six innovative applications: downloadable toolbar for automatic translation on websites, Application for automatic translation of CMS, Application for automatic translation between languages in the Pyrenees, Digital Handbook of Unified Basque, On-line dictionary of Aragonese, multilingual semantic web search engine.
- One agreement between University – Enterprise for the commercialisation of solutions.

### **D) Mutual understanding between Aragonese regional languages (7.3)**

- Participation of Catalan teachers in the Seminar for Aragonese Teachers.
- Participation of Aragonese teachers in the Seminar for Catalan Teachers.
- Participation in the contests of Reading in Public – some categories on regional languages that did not exist before have been created.

- Trilingual week between students of Aragonese and Catalan in the recovered village of Búbal for one.
- Recording of the song Únicos/Unics, originally in Aragonese, translated to Catalan by teachers and students of Valderrobres and Fraga.

## **LEONESE IN CASTILE AND LEON**

### *Section 67*

In order to complement the information provided in the 5th Report, the following data should be taken into account:

From the Regional Government (Junta de Castilla y León) different activities have been implemented in order to improve Leonese cultural promotion in León and Zamora mainly through public libraries:

#### **1.-PUBLIC LIBRARY IN LEÓN**

The Library has been systematically acquiring all publications published in Leonese to preserve this bibliographical production for posterity and to make it available to the group of users interested in its learning.

Some examples of actions carried out in this center are outlined below:

##### A) .- In 2016:

- Bibliographic exhibition under the title "From the fala to the feeling: a visit to our llingua", in which works were exhibited in Leonese and studies on the Leonese language published in the four areas in which he speaks: León, Zamora, Asturias and Miranda de Do Douro

##### B) .- In 2017:

- On October 31 it was hosted the presentation of the book "Rellatos y poemas" by La Caleyá, by the General Director of Cultural Policies, Mar Sancho Sanz. The work gathers stories and poems awarded by the association La Caleyá in the contests held annually between 2011 and 2015. The edition of the book was funded by the Junta de Castilla y León.

##### C) .- In 2018:

- In April: presentation of the book "Llón máxicu: leonesa little mythology for children", by María Teresa García Montes.

- During the second half of October and the first of November 2018, several cultural activities have been held in the Public Library of Leon under the title "Encounters with Leonese traditions", in order to promote, defend and disseminate the linguistic heritage autochthonous Leon. The organized activities were:
  - On October 18th, the workshop entitled "The Leon Songbook and Popular Music in the different regions of León" was held by Diego Gutiérrez, Rodrigo Martínez, and Alberto Flecha, during the Asturian-Leonese act. This activity has aimed to review the rich and varied poetic-musical repertoire of the different territories of León. This activity was attended by 96 people, who filled the Assembly Hall of the library.
  - On October 25, the conference "Bruxas y meigas andan xuntas" was held, which was attended by 24 attendees. Nicolás Bartolomé Pérez exhibited in Asturias-León his vision about the mythological beings of the Kingdom of León, such as the goblins, enchanted blackberries, reñubeiros, giants and other fabulous beings.
  - Lastly, on November 7, the film "Territoriu de bandoleros", directed by Néstor del Barco and José Ignacio Cobos, was screened, with the first one's assistance. The presentation of the film was the responsibility of Miguel Ángel Barajas, with an attendance of 67 people. The film, shot in the Serrallano dialect, ascribed to the leonine linguistic trunk in its oriental variant, narrates the life of the bandit "El Cabrerín", who lived during the 19<sup>th</sup> century.

#### **2.-PUBLIC LIBRARY IN ZAMORA**

The Library collaborates every year with the Cultural Association FURMIENTU that hosts the Traditional Culture Days, including Leonese among their activities.

The XIV edition took place on January 2016. The final point of the conference corresponded to José Alfredo Hernández, representative of El Teixu, an association devoted in the promotion of the Asturian language and its varieties. Hernandez also explained the activities carried out by the group, with a presence from Asturias to Zamora, mentioning the translation of several signs and indicators in Leonese.

In 2017 the XV edition took place on February. The conference "Air, Fire and Desire: Falantes en lllionés" was given by Juan Carlos García Hoyuelos, poet and supporter of minority languages, particularly of the Leonese, Aragonese and Ladino languages. He was accompanied by the folk duo Tarna from León.

The XVI edition in 2018 gave an important visibility to the publications that have appeared in recent months in Leonese. The expert in the history of the Kingdom of León, Ricardo Chao and the illustrator Ricardo Escobar, presented the book "Esbardu, Vocabulariu lllionés ilustráu". In addition, the edition of "The speech of the Land of Ready", of José María Baz, the most complete book on the dialect of this region, was presented in an a round table conference participating, among others, Juan Carlos González Ferrero (professor of Spanish Language and Literature at the IES "Cardenal Pardo de Tavera" of Toro, and for more than 30 years a researcher on the language and material culture of the province of Zamora) and the members of FURMIENTU Alfredo Hernández Rodríguez and Pedro Gómez.

The magazine "El Llumbreiru" is still available at the Library. At the same time, all titles that the Association recommends in the "Bibliography" section of its website are still incorporated into the Local Fund Section of the Library.

## **FALA AND EXTREMEÑO IN EXTREMADURA**

### *Section 58 and 66*

Today in Extremadura, three minority languages coexist with Spanish. These languages are Rayano Portuguese, Fala and Extremeño. All three languages are recognized as such by international organizations such as UNESCO or SIL International.

### FALA

- Situation of the language
  - La Fala (in its three varieties: Valverdeiru, Mañegu and Lagarteiru) is the mother tongue spoken by around 10,000 people.
  - It is located in the municipalities of Valverde del Fresno, San Martín de Trevejo and Eljas; the main instrument of dissemination of the language is the family.
  
- Background
  - During the XX century, this language was not well regarded for political reasons; nowadays efforts are being made to remove this misconception.
  - In 2001 it was recognized as an Asset of Cultural Interest of Extremadura.
  - Conferences and seminars have been held in order to promote the language development.
  - It is being studied by Spanish and international universities.
  
- Present
  - Some town halls offer training workshops for tourists and locals.
  - Cultural activities linked to the Fala are carried out such as literary contests, Christmas greetings, book editions, creation of Glossaries, even a YouTube Channel: "Isu lo se di".
  - There have been improvements on its spelling. There is a total normalization in social networks, in which bilingualism (along with Spanish) is not a problem for communication.
  - The Official Language School of Cáceres has been developing language training courses.
  - Hoyos Teachers and Resources Center has been developing training courses for teachers in the region and the rest of Extremadura.

### EXTREMEÑO

The Extremeño, Estremeñu or Castúo is the romance language mainly spoken in the western part of Extremadura, from north to south, with several eastern islands such as Serradilla, Orellana or Las Villuercas, but also in regions of southern Salamanca, the Montes de Toledo or the north of Huelva. Belongs to the group of Western Peninsular languages such as Galician, Portuguese, Asturian or Leonese, belonging to the Asturian-Leonese family.

Since the end of the XIX century it appears in written form, by the hand of José María Gabriel y Galán as well as Luis Chamizo, who is the one that popularizes the name of castúo thanks to his work 'El Miajón de los Castúos '

#### - Educational system:

The Extremeño has no official presence in the educational system in Extremadura, but extracurricular activities related to Extremadura culture are carried out during the Extremadura Day or Week at school, as well as some Teacher and Resource Centers begin to organize courses for teachers around Extremadura culture.

The existence of a collective called OSCEC (Body of Siguimiento and Coordination of the Extremeño and its Coltura), constituted as an association, has developed a standard spelling, as well as various materials for the study and dissemination of the language.

- International recognition:

Several international organizations recognize Extremeño as a language and assign it its own code. Among them:

- UNESCO: In his Atlas of the World Languages he mentions the Extremeño within the Asturias-Leon trunk, and shows it as 'definitely in danger of extinction' since its transmission is only oral.
- SIL International: This American organization assigns the EXT code to the Extremeño according to ISO 639-3.

- Different activities around the Extremeño:

Around the Extremeño we can find press, literature, music, poetry, radio or television programmes as well as associations devoted to its promotion. Here are some examples:

Literature: some of the most recent projects in which the Extremeño is present are:

- Air, fire and desire. Juan Carlos García Hoyuelos. Translations of OSCEC.
- Tales of Iberia. Libres L'Encobert. Collaboration of OSCEC.
- New literature in extremeño (I and II) published by OSCEC.
- The Huélliga. Cruz Díaz Marcos.

A great literature fund in Extremadura can be consulted through the Extremeña Virtual Library at this link: <http://literaturaextremena.blogspot.com/>

Writers: Currently, around a thousand people write in Extremeño, among linguists, poets and storytellers. But, for the moment, most of them in a freelance and not adjusted to the standard developed by OSCEC. Also, through social networks, there are people who learn Extremeño with the spelling published by OSCEC.

We want to mention the remarkable cases of Luis Chamizo and José María Gabriel y Galán, but it is also possible to mention others such as José María Alcón Olivera, Cruz Díaz Marcos, the Herrero Uceda brothers or Luisa Durán. In the following link you can find a list of writers who use Extremeño:

[http://literaturaextremena.blogspot.com/se\\_arch/label/2.LISTAD0%20DE%20ESCRITORES](http://literaturaextremena.blogspot.com/se_arch/label/2.LISTAD0%20DE%20ESCRITORES)

Research: The most outstanding linguists and researchers of the Extremeño have been gathering around groups such as Huéyebra Castúa, Amigos del Extremeño, APLEX and now, OSCEC. Some of them continue working independently as the case of Antonio Garrido, translator of The Little Prince, or Javier Feijoo. Also it is possible to mention others like Nicolás Valley.

Linguistic resources: dictionaries are probably the most important ones. Among those edited on paper, we want to remark the "Extremeño Dictionary" by Professor Antonio Viudas Camarasa published in 1980 by the Publications Service of the University of Extremadura. Also, Ismael Carmona García, as president of the OSCEC, published in 2017 a Spanish-Extremadura dictionary with some 5,000 entries.

A catalog of the material published in relation to Extremeño dialectology can be found at: <https://dialectologiaextremenat.blogspot.com/> by Manuel Trinidad, researcher and compiler of everything related to Extremadura culture and coordinator of the online Extremeño Library.

Translations: There are translations into Extremeño of important pieces such as The Little Prince, chapters of Don Quixote, The Gospel of San Juan or the Spanish Constitution.

Music: At the moment several music bands sing in Extremeño, as is the case of Anhinojo Folk or El Pelujáncanu. There are folk bands that play traditional pieces that remain in Extremeño. The problem has been that compilations during XX century were translated into Spanish and in some cases the original forms have not survived.

Written press: during 2013-2015 period there were weekly reports in Extremeño in the Periódico de Extremadura.

Television: In 2018 small sections have appeared in Extremeño on Canal Extremadura, the regional television, with the name of 'Escuela de Extremeño'. As well as in a national level in programs such as Comando Actualidad, of TVE.

Theater and cinema: Regarding the theater we must highlight a play written by Luis Chamizo and titled 'The Witches' that is still on stage. In relation with cinema, the pioneering experience has been Territoriu de Bandoleros, a film that has been shot in Serrallanu and in Serradilla (La Serrálla).

## **ASTURIAN AND GALICIAN-ASTURIAN**

### *Section 56 and 64*

Some clarifications regarding the evaluation of the Committee of Experts in relation with the section on the languages of Asturias should be made:

Section 7.1g, referred to the teaching of non-speaking adults, both in the case of Asturian and Galician-Asturian, appears valued as "no conclusion". In the 5th Spanish Report, information was provided on Galician-Asturian courses for adults that are organized in collaboration with public and private entities.

Secondly, although this information was not included in the Report, the municipal Linguistic Normalization Services, supported for the most part by public grants, organize learning courses in Asturian for adults. Adult Education Centers also offer and teach the subject of Asturian Language.

Regarding the introductory text on the Asturian, we found a mistake in the data that is offered on the percentage of students who study this subject in Primary and Secondary education. Those 90% in Primary and 80% in Secondary refer to the percentage of centers in which the subject is offered. The percentages of election are actually, as explained in our report, of 50% for Primary and 12% in Secondary.

Finally, it is affirmed in the conclusions that the Asturian is not used in the media, when section 1.4 of our report explained in detail the spaces that existed in the Asturian public broadcasting and all the grants to promote the production of programs in this language in private media.