

STANDING COMMITTEE (T-RV)

EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON SPECTATOR
VIOLENCE AND MISBEHAVIOUR AT SPORT EVENTS
AND IN PARTICULAR AT FOOTBALL MATCHES

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 21 July 2017

T-RV (2016) 21 FINAL

**Standing Committee
Consultative visit to the Russian Federation**

Moscow, 20-21 May 2016

Report by the Consultative Team
(including the National report by the Russian Federation)

Adopted at the 44th Standing Committee meeting on 23-24 May 2017

Contents

PART 1 :	National report of the monitoring visit of the Standing Committee to the Russian Federation (Moscow, 20-21 May 2016)	5
A.	Physical culture and sport management system in the Russian Federation	6
B.	Legal regulation of public order and safety during official sporting events	8
C.	Incidents in the Russian football main trends. preventive activities for promotion of public order and safety at the stadia	17
D.	Information on sports venues in the Russian Federation	19
PART 2 :	Report of the visiting Team	21
A.	Executive Summary	23
B.	Visit Background and Explanation	25
B.1	Structure of Report	25
B.2	Purpose of Visit	26
B.3	Visit Itinerary	26
B.4	Standing Committee Delegation	27
B.5	Supporting Documentation	27
B.6	Status of Report	28
C.	Council of Europe Convention on an Integrated Safety, Security and Service Approach at Football Matches and Other Sports Events	30
Article 1	Scope of the Convention	30
Article 2	Aims of Convention	30
Article 3	Definitions	31
Article 4	Co-ordination Arrangements	32
Article 5	Safety, Security and Service in Stadiums	34
Article 6	Safety, Security and Service in Public Places	40
Article 7	Contingency and Emergency Planning	41
Article 8	Engagement with Supporters and Local Communities	42
Article 9	Police Strategies and Operations	44
Article 10	Prevention and Sanctioning of Offending Behaviour	46
Article 11	International Co-operation	47
D.	Concluding Remarks and Summary of Recommendations	48
D.1	Concluding Remarks	48
D.2	Summary of Recommendations	49

Appendices

A	Draft Action Plan	53
B	Council of Europe Convention CETS n° 218- Policy Articles	57
C	Stadium Safety – Technical Report and Observations	63
D	Role of Supporter Liaison Officers (SLOs) in the Russian Federation	66
E	FIFA 2018 World Cup – Policing Preparations	69
F	Programme of the visit	72
PART 3:	Comments by the Russian Federation	75
	including the answers to the Draft Action Plan	

PART 1

National report of the monitoring visit of the Standing Committee to the Russian Federation

A. PHYSICAL CULTURE AND SPORTS MANAGEMENT SYSTEM IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

The following organizations and parties fall into the scope of the physical culture and sports management system in the Russian Federation (Annex 1):

1. Public authorities of the Russian Federation operating at the federal, regional and local levels:

a) **President of the Russian Federation**, the highest public position in the Russian Federation, he is the head of the State, guarantor of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, and of human and civil rights and freedoms and Supreme Commander-in-Chief of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation. He undertakes measures regarding the security of sovereignty of the country, its independence and state integrity, ensures the coordinated functioning of and interaction between the public bodies, determines the trends in domestic and foreign policy. As for the physical culture and sports management system in the Russian Federation, the Constitution guarantees the adoption of certain measures aimed at development of physical culture and sports in the country.

b) **Presidential Council of the Russian Federation for Promotion of Physical Culture and Sports**, an advisory body under the President of the Russian Federation created to ensure interaction between federal authorities, authorities of constituent subjects of the Russian Federation, local authorities, public associations, physical culture and sports associations and organizations as well as other organizations. Its focus lies in the sphere of development and implementation of national policy in the field of physical culture and sports, high performance sports and preparation for the Olympic and Paralympic Games, World Universiades, World Championships in different sports and participation of Russian athletes in them (Paragraph 1 of the Regulation on Presidential Council of the Russian Federation for Promotion of Physical Culture and Sports, approved by Decree No. 1058 of the President of the Russian Federation dated July 28, 2012);

c) **The Council of the Federation Committee on Social Policy**, a permanent body within the Council of the Federation of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation which is responsible for the implementation of the Council of the Federation policy in the sphere of physical culture and sports. The basic responsibilities of this body are as follows: drafts of legal opinions regarding the laws enacted by the State Duma of the Federal Assembly, review of federal and regional target programs, international cooperation, participation and preparation of the 'governmental hour' during the Council of the Federation sessions on physical culture and sports matters.

d) **The State Duma Committee on Physical Culture, Sports and Youth Affairs**, a permanent inter-fractional body of the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation authorized to carry out legislative activity in the field of physical culture, sports and youth affairs. It aims to improve the constitutional, administrative and civil legislation regarding physical culture and sports; to draft bylaws on the state budget allocation; to elaborate federal targeted programs on promotion of mass physical culture and sports, health improvement of the citizens of the Russian Federation through physical culture and sport; to give opinions on drafts of federal laws in this sphere.

e) **The Government of the Russian Federation**, a supreme body of executive power in the Russian Federation authorized, *inter alia*, to approve the Development Strategy of physical culture and sports in the Russian Federation;

f) **The Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation**, a federal executive body exercising the following functions: development and implementation of State Policy and legal regulation in the sphere of physical culture and sports, as well as providing public services (including activities to prevent and fight doping in sport) and managing public property in the sphere of physical culture and sports (Paragraph 1 of the Regulation on the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation, approved by Decree No. 607 of the Government of the Russian Federation dated June 19, 2012). The Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation holds a key position in the system of physical culture and sports management in the country;

g) **Other federal bodies of executive power**¹ have certain departments in their organizational structure that are responsible for the development of state targeted programs in physical education and sport and for the organization of compulsory physical training for the employees in respective spheres;

h) **Executive power bodies in constituent subjects of the Russian Federation in the field of physical culture and sports**², whose powers are defined by Federal Law No. 329-FZ: Physical Culture and Sport in the Russian Federation dated December 04, 2007, (hereinafter referred to as ‘the Law’). In particular, the powers of the subjects of the Russian Federation in the sphere of physical culture and sport include the following: organization and execution of official regional and intermunicipal sport events the aim of which is to promote public order and public security when holding official sport events in the territory of the subjects of the Russian Federation (paragraph 1.3.c, article 8 of the Law);

i) **Local government bodies (committees, offices, departments) in the sphere of physical culture and sports**³ with their powers defined by the Law. In particular, in order to address local issues to ensure conditions for development of physical culture and sports, organization of official sporting events, fitness and health recreation events on municipal territories, the following shall fall within the powers of the local government bodies: promoting public order and public security when holding official physical culture and sport events in the municipal territories (paragraph 1.6, article 9 of the Law).

2. All-Russian and regional public organizations operating in the field of physical culture and sports⁴ are involved in the implementation of state policy in the sphere of youth sport development in the Russian Federation and development of individual sports activities, promoting physical education and sports in educational facilities. It is important to note that the organizational structure of the aforementioned organizations includes the representatives of the public authorities. Namely, the supervisory committee of the DOSAAF Russia organization, which is a permanent supervisory and coordination body within the organization, includes the representatives of the Presidential Administration, Central Office of the Government, Security Council, Ministry of Defence, Ministry of Education and Science, Ministry of Sport, Ministry of Economic Development, the chairman of DOSAAF Russia and one of his deputies (councils)⁵.

¹ The Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Emergency Situations of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation.

² The Department of Physical Culture and Sport of Moscow, the Ministry of Sport of the Samara Region.

³ Committee of physical culture of the city district Khimki, Department of physical culture, sport and tourism of City of Chelyabinsk and etc.

⁴ Voluntary Association for Assistance to Army, Air Force and Navy (DOSAAF Russia), public organization physical culture and sports association «Yunost Rossii» etc.

⁵ <http://www.dosaaf.ru/home/ustav-dosaaf> - the official website of DOSAAF Russia

3. Public organizations

a) **The Russian Olympic Committee.** The status and role of the Russian Olympic Committee are determined by the terms of the International Olympic Committee (IOC) Charter on non-governmental nature of the National Olympic Committees. The Russian Olympic Committee acts as a federal public body that coordinates management activities and performance of public sports organizations. The Russian Olympic Committee exercises its powers in the sphere respect of development of high performance sport and mass sport in collaboration with the federal executive body in the field of physical culture and sports, national sports federations and sports associations.

b) Taking into account the importance of global development of adaptive sports, the following organizations have been founded in our country as independent public organizations: the **Paralympic Committee of Russia** (1996), the **Russian Committee of Deaf Sports** and the **Special Olympics of Russia** (the Special Olympics of Russia – is an all-Russian public charitable organization for mentally impaired people who are actively engaged in promoting ideas of the Olympic movement and sport for the disabled) (2001).

c) **All-Russian and regional sports federations**⁶. The aforementioned organizations are created to encourage a healthy lifestyle, to develop and promote a particular kind of sport, to organize and hold sporting events, to recruit and train national teams of the Russian Federation and regional teams. Pursuant to the Russian legislation, a public organization has to pass State Accreditation procedure in order to become an All-Russian or regional sports federation (paragraph 2 article 14 of Federal Law No. 329-FZ Physical Culture and Sport in the Russian Federation)

d) **Local sports federations**⁷. Accreditation procedure of local sports federation is not regulated by the Russian legislation.

B. LEGAL REGULATION OF PUBLIC ORDER AND SAFETY DURING OFFICIAL SPORTING EVENTS

Federal Law No. 329-FZ: Physical Culture and Sport in the Russian Federation dated December 04, 2007.

The law stipulates that the organizers of sporting events when hosting official sporting events together with owners (operators) of sports venues shall ensure public order and security in accordance with the Law and the rules of security at sporting events⁸ (hereinafter referred to as ‘the rules of security at sporting events’). Maintenance of public order and public security during official sports competitions is carried out at the expense of the organizers of official sporting events and/or the owners (operators) of sports venues in accordance with the provisions (regulations) regarding official sporting events and/or contracts concluded by the organizers of such competitions and owners (operators) of sports venues unless otherwise required by the applicable legislation of the Russian Federation. Rights and obligations of the organizers of official sporting events, owners (operators) of sports venues on ensuring public order and safety during official sporting events are

⁶ As of February 1, 2016 120 All-Russian sport federations are registered at the territory of the Russian Federation;

⁷ As of February 1, 2016 the total number of regional sport federations is about 2 500;

⁸ «The rules of security when hosting official sports competitions», approved by the Order of the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation No.353 on April 18, 2014.

established by the Law and the rules of security at official sporting events (paragraph 1, article 20 of the Law).

The organizers of official sporting events shall notify the appropriate regional office of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation about the place, date and terms of holding such an event and shall immediately notify of any changes in the information previously submitted. Such notification is made in order to ensure public order and security and to comply with the administrative regulation that prohibits to attend the sports venue during a certain period (up to 30 days) before the day when the sporting event is held (paragraph 1.7, article 20 of the Law).

In order to provide public order and safety during official sporting events, the organizers of such competitions and/or the owners (operators) of sports venues are entitled to use the services of stewards. The stewards may be recruited via specialized training agencies and organizations that provide services of securing public order and safety at mass events. The Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation establishes requirements for the organizations engaged in special training for stewards and/or issuing of steward licenses and licensing records⁹. Requirements to the Syllabus of the Stewards' Training Program are approved by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation in coordination with the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation¹⁰. Issuance and record keeping of steward licenses shall be performed in accordance with the procedure established by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation. A standard template for a steward license is also approved by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation¹¹ (paragraph 7.1, article 20 of the Law).

The law stipulates that a steward shall be a natural person who has completed special training under the procedure established by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation and has obtained a steward license under the procedure established by the federal executive body in the field of physical culture and sports. Such stewards shall be invited on a contractual basis by the organizer of official sporting events and/or the owner (operator) of the sports venue to ensure public order and safety during official sporting events (paragraph 3.4, article 2 of the Law).

Pursuant to paragraph 3.6.3 article 16 and paragraph 2.6.1 article 16.1 of the Law, All-Russian and regional sports federations are obliged to prevent and fight the use of doping as well as any types of discrimination and violence in sports. In case this requirement is not fulfilled, an organization can lose its state accreditation¹².

Federal Law No.3-FZ: on Police dated February 07, 2011.

One of the basic objectives of the Police is, *inter alia*, to guarantee public order in public places, prevention and suppression of crimes and administrative offenses.

In order to fulfill its goals, the Police has, *inter alia*, the following obligations:

- to ensure public order and security in the streets, squares, stadia, parks, on traffic (railway stations, airports, sea and river ports) and other public places;

⁹ Order No. 997: Requirements to the Stewards' Training Organizations. Requirements to the Stewards' Licenses: Procedure and Recording, by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation dated October 30, 2015.

¹⁰ Order No. 998: Requirements to the Syllabus of the Stewards' Training Program, by the Ministry of Sport dated October 30, 2015;

¹¹ Order No. 996: Steward License: Procedure, Recording and Standard Template, by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation dated October 30, 2015;

¹² Article 23 of the Order No. 662: Accreditation procedure for public organizations to gain the status of All-Russian sports federation and forms of documents confirming such status in the Russian Federation, dated August 01, 2014.

- to provide security and public order together with the representatives of executive bodies of constituent subjects of the Russian Federation, local authorities and organizers of meetings, demonstrations, marches and other public events, as well as to render security and public order assistance to the organizers of sport or other spectacular mass events on the sight of the event (paragraph 1, article 12 of the Law).

Federal Law No 195-FZ: The Code of Administrative Offenses of the Russian Federation dated December 30, 2001.

The Code of Administrative Offenses of the Russian Federation stipulates a special administrative punishment that shall be applied to all and everybody who has violated public order and threatened public security during sporting events. Such administrative punishment shall constitute an injunction to visit places where such sporting events are held during the whole period of such sporting events.

The administrative injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events implies that the person suffering this injunction is temporarily not allowed to visit the place of the sporting events on the days when the official sporting events are held. This administrative injunction shall be applied when the Code of Conduct for Spectators at the official sporting events is violated. The injunction shall be imposed by the judge and is set for the period varying from 6 (six) months to 7 (seven) years (article 3.14).

Should the injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events be violated, such violation shall result in the recovery of the fine varying from 20 (twenty) to 25 (twenty five) thousand RUB or in administrative arrest for the period up to 15 (fifteen) days (paragraph 5, article 20.25 of the Code).

Herewith it should be noted that the Code provides for the separate *corpus delicti* of this administrative offense.

Should the Code of Conduct for Spectators at the official sporting events be violated, such violation shall result in an administrative fine varying from 3 (three) to 10 (ten) thousand RUB or, alternatively, in mandatory community service for 160 hours together with an administrative injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events for the period varying from 6 (six) months to 3 (three) years.

Should the offense mentioned above be repeated by the same offender or should such offense result in suspension and/or cancellation of the official sporting event – the administrative fine varying from 10 (ten) to 15 (fifteen) thousand RUB shall be applied, or, alternatively, the administrative arrest for the period up to 15 (fifteen) days together with (optionally) an administrative injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events for the period varying from 6 (six) months to 7 (seven) years shall be applied (article 20.31).

Should the organizers of the official sporting event or the owners/operators of sports venues violate the safety management rules during the official sporting events, or should the organizers of the official sporting event or the owners/operators of sports venues use any sports venue that is not registered in the Russian Sports Venues Register (Register of the venues for regional, state and international sporting events planned and held by the subjects of the Russian Federation), - such violation shall result in the following penalties: the officials shall suffer the administrative fine varying from 50 (fifty) to 100 (one hundred) thousand RUB, the private businessmen shall suffer the administrative fine varying from 50 (fifty) to 100 (one hundred) thousand RUB or, alternatively, their activities shall be suspended for the period up to 90 (ninety) days, the companies shall suffer the

administrative fine varying from 100 (one hundred) to 300 (three hundred) thousand RUB or, alternatively, their business activities shall be suspended for the period of up to 90 (ninety) days.

Should the actions stated above result in personal injury and/or damage to property given that such actions do not constitute any criminal offense, - the following administrative fine shall be applied: the officials shall suffer the administrative fine varying from 100 (one hundred) to 200 (two hundred) thousand RUB, the private businessmen shall suffer the administrative fine varying from 100 (one hundred) to 200 (two hundred) thousand RUB, or, alternatively, their activities shall be suspended for the period up to 90 (ninety) days, the companies shall suffer the administrative fine varying from 300 (three hundred) to 500 (five hundred) thousand RUB or, alternatively, their business activities shall be suspended for the period of up to 90 (ninety) days (article 20.32).

The offender accused of the administrative offense shall comply with the ruling on administrative injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events.

The law-enforcement bodies shall keep the register of the offenders bearing this administrative punishment. Keeping such register shall ensure the observance of the ruling on administrative injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events (article 32.14).

Resolution No. 1156: Code of Conduct for Spectators at the Official Sporting Events, by the Government of the Russian Federation dated December 16, 2013.

This present Resolution states that the personal dignity of all the spectators visiting the official sporting event shall be respected and protected by the organizers and participants, venue owners/operators and public security guards of such sporting event at the time of such sporting event.

The spectators visiting the official sporting event are obliged to:

- respect the other spectators, organizers and participants of the official sporting event, the owners/operators of the sports venue and the security guards ensuring the public order and safety at the place of the official sporting event;
- immediately inform the stewards and/or other representatives of the security guards at the time of the sporting event of any suspicious objects and/or misconduct and/or smoke or fire break-outs and/or situations requiring urgent medical help;
- demonstrate appropriate social behaviour and treat carefully the property of other spectators and/or organizers and/or participants and/or owners (operators) of the sports venue and/or security guards at the time of such sporting event; the spectators shall take good care of all the assets installed at the sports venue;
- comply with the lawful requests made by the organizers of the sporting event and/or owner (operator) of sports venue and/or stewards at the sporting event and/or other representatives of the security service at the time of the sporting event;
- stay calm and keep order when receiving signal of evacuation from the place where the sporting event is held. The spectators shall act according to the instructions (directions) received from the security guards at the sporting event pursuant to the rules of fire safety and under the existing evacuation plan.

Should any person be identified as a person being subject to a court ruling on administrative injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events (such identification includes CCTV monitoring as well), the organizer and/or stewards of the sporting event are entitled to restrict the entrance for such person or to expel such person from the sports venue with his/her ticket/other entrance

document being null and void with no compensation being paid for the ticket/other entrance document. The organizers and/or stewards shall explain to such person the reason for entrance denial or expel him/her from the sports venue. The organizers and/or stewards shall pass such person to the representatives of local law-enforcement bodies (regional offices of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation) that ensure the public safety and order at the sports venue during the official sporting event.

The organizer of the official sporting event or the authorized representatives of the organizer shall inform (in writing) the local law-enforcement bodies (regional offices of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation) that bear responsibility for ensuring public safety and order at the sports venue during the official sporting event of the number and places approved for supporting forces deployment at the time of the official sporting event.

Resolution No. 353: Public Security Management during Official Sporting Events, by the Government of the Russian Federation dated April 18, 2014.

Organizers and owners (operators) of sports venues shall share responsibility for public order and safety. Organizers and owners (operators) of sports venues shall cooperate with the state bodies and local authorities.

There are certain standards and criteria that places for sporting events and sports venues must meet. Namely, the places for sporting events shall have the following infrastructure (with no limitation): parking lot, medical station, sanitary units, entrance security-check points (for persons and vehicles), and sports venues shall be equipped with information screens and/or info-stands, emergency communication system, security lighting and alarm system, etc.

There is a specific list of documents that an owner (operator) of a sports venue must possess. Some of these documents are: venue safety passport, medical stations location plan, emergency exits scheme, temporary vending stands scheme, etc.

Public order and safety at the time of sporting event shall be secured in accordance with the applicable instructions and event schedule. Such instructions shall be elaborated by the owner (operator) of the sports venue (against the Standard Instruction) and shall be updated at least once in 3 years. The event schedule shall be elaborated by the organizer of a sporting event together with the owner (operator) of the sports venue.

The rights and obligations of owners (operators) of the sports venues and the organizer of a sporting event are clearly stated and fixed. There is a list of places where the sporting events cannot be held at any time. Such places include (with no limitation): border zones (with exception to the cases when the special approval to hold an event at that territory exists), pipelines (gas, oil and petroleum-products) right-of-way.

Order No. 234: Special Training Program for Stewards at Official Sporting Events to Ensure Public Safety and Order, by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation dated April 14, 2014

The Order sets out the training mechanism for stewards as well as the minimum requirements. The special training is carried out by the All-Russian and regional sports federations either by its own efforts or by turning to the organizations engaged in special training for stewards and (or) in providing security services in mass events venues.

Thus, Special training of stewards is performed by the All-Russian and regional sports federations.

Special training of stewards is carried out according to the program approved by the organization that conducts stewards' training, and shall include both theory and practice, final exams and licensing.

Final assessment and licensing is carried out by the organization which conducts stewards' training in order to grade the mastery level of the students as well as the skills gained under the approved training program.

A person that has passed the final examinations shall receive a steward's license and a steward's identity card.

Stewards shall:

- control the spectators' access to the venue of the official sporting events and their placing;
- meet and accompany the spectators to the seats specified in the purchased entrance tickets/other entrance documents, and after the end of official sporting events – to the exits from the sports venue;
- ensure public order and safety together with representatives of local law-enforcement bodies (regional offices of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation) by performing personal inspection of spectators and their belongings at the entrance to the venue of the official sporting events with the use of technical means (if necessary). Should the spectators refuse to be subjected to the personal examination – the stewards shall block their entrance to the sports venue;
- restrict the passage of spectators into the zones defined by the organizer of official sporting events and/or the owner (operator) of a sports venue as barred zones for the spectators in accordance with the rules of security when conducting official sporting events;
- call the spectators for respect to the public order and rules of behaviour of spectators during official sporting events¹³;
- inform spectators of the action plan in case of risk or any emergency situations and evacuations;
- undertake all the necessary measures to ensure public order and safety during official sporting events according to the Law and the rules of security at official sporting events. A steward shall undertake all the measures to suppress the possible spectators' misconduct and shall block the entrance to the venue should there be any situations of misconduct. Stewards shall also remove spectators from the specified places if such spectators violate the Code of Conduct for spectators during the official sporting events;
- block the entrance to the venue for those persons who suffer an administrative injunction to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events.

Pursuant to paragraph 3.3 article 2 of the Law “Spectators are natural persons who are present at the venue of an official sporting event and are not the participants of such sporting event and who are not otherwise involved in the competition (including processes of ensuring public order and safety at such sporting events)”. In order to ensure public order and security during official sporting events and to prevent offenses during such competitions stewards are obliged to:

- monitor the movement of spectators before and after an official sporting event;
- examine tickets/other entrance documents at the entrance to the venue of an official sporting event;

¹³ The Code of Conduct for Spectators was approved by the Resolution of the Russian Federation Government No. 256 on April 22, 2014

- inform the spectators about optional services available at the sports venue during an official sporting event;
- inform the spectators about the obligatory observance of the Code of Conduct for spectators during the official sporting event and to appropriately control such observance;
- inform the organizers of the official sporting event and/or the owners (operators) of a sports venue of any cases when the public order and safety were violated, of any cases of personal/public injury or property damage, as well as of any accidents, which occurred during the official sporting event;
- participate in the evacuation of spectators if any emergency situations occur;
- perform other duties assigned to stewards by the organizers of an official sporting event and/or by the owner (operator) of a sports venue in accordance with existing agreements and under the applicable legislation of the Russian Federation (paragraphs 3 and 4, article 20.2 of the Law).

Order No. 948: Standard Instruction for Public Order and Safety Management at Sports Venue during Official Sporting Events, by Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation dated November 26, 2014.

Each and every owner (operator) of a sports venue shall make an instruction for public order and safety management based on the Standard Instruction. Such instruction shall regulate the procedures for public order and safety management at the sports venues during the official sporting events. This instruction shall include a detailed description of the sports venue.

The persons/bodies responsible for public order and safety management at the sports venues during the official sporting events are clearly stated in the instruction. The document also governs all the aspects of access control and internal security procedures.

The Standard Instruction regulates the obligatory procedures that must be observed to ensure public order and safety at the sports venue during the official sporting event. It also states the aspects that must be included into the event schedule on public order and safety management process at a sports venue during the official sporting event.

Order No. 996: Steward License: Procedure, Recording and Standard Template, by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation dated October 30, 2015.

To ensure public order and safety at the time of sporting events, the organizers of a sporting event and/or the owners (operators) of sports venues have the right to use the services of stewards. Stewards must have a special license. Such licenses shall be issued according to the established procedure.

The license for stewards shall be issued by the Russian National Sports Federation or by the organization where the stewards undertook the corresponding training course (such organizations are entitled to train and license the stewards solely against the corresponding contract with the Russian National Sports Federation). The template of the license is approved and standardized.

Order No. 997: Requirements to the Stewards' Training Organizations. Requirements to the Stewards' Licenses: Procedure and Recording, by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation dated October 30, 2015.

To ensure public order and safety at the time of sporting events, the organizers of a sporting event and/or the owners (operators) of sports venues have the right to use the

services of stewards. The aforementioned Order establishes the criteria that the training organizations must meet when training and licensing the stewards.

Stewards may be trained and licensed by national or regional sports federations or by the qualified organizations based on a corresponding contract with such a national or regional sports federation.

The stewards training program must be stated as a basic type of activity in the relevant bylaws of the organization. The training program for stewards must comply with the training program of the Russian National Sports Federation. Trainers working under the stewards training programs shall meet all the criteria on the education background and specific working experience. Web-sites of these organizations shall conform to the specific standards as to the content.

Order No. 998: Requirements to the Syllabus of the Stewards' Training Program, by the Ministry of Sport dated October 30, 2015.

The Order establishes specific criteria for the content of training programs for stewards.

Such training programs shall be elaborated and approved by the Russian National Sports Federation and shall include both theory and practice on the following modules: legal basis for public order and safety management; mental training; cooperation with secret service; specialized training. Future stewards shall pass a final exam as soon as the training program is over.

Russian national sports federations are entitled to set disciplinary regulations to specify the degree of liability of persons involved in the process of public order and safety management at official sporting events.

For example, Article 101 of the Disciplinary Regulation of the Russian Football Union states: «should the host party fail to ensure public order and safety at the stadium and should such failure result in spectators' social misconduct or disorder and/or threaten the safety of those present at the stadium, such failure shall carry fine. Should the circumstances be of severe nature – the additional interdiction to admit spectators to the stadium for 1 (one) – 5 (five) matches shall be applied, or, alternatively, 1 (one) – 5 (five) matches may be held without any spectators at that stadium, or, alternatively, 1 (one) – 5 (five) matches may be held at the neutral stadium in another host-city».

The aforementioned Regulation determines the liability of the spectators for the offences during the match (for example, chanting foul language and abusing slogans, throwing objects at the spectators' stands or field and adjacent territory, use and throwing any pyrotechnic items, misconduct and turmoil at the stadium, demonstration of abusive or offensive visual propaganda, any illegal actions).

National Football Information Point (NFIP) was established and has been successfully functioning since 2015 in the Russian Federation. This NFIP was established by the Public Safety Department for Public Safety Management Administration of the Office of Interior of the Russian Federation.

Order No. 1092: Requirements for official sport competition venue infrastructure and technical equipment of the stadia for the purposes of public order and security, by the Ministry of Internal Affairs dated October 17, 2015.

The adoption of the aforementioned requirements is derived from the need for a uniform approach towards the issues of technical equipment and infrastructure of competition venues for the purposes of public order and security.

Based on the level of technical equipment and infrastructure there is a five-grade categorization of sports venues:

- category 1 to 4 venues depending on the number of spectators a venue can hold;
- category 5 venues, which is a specially prepared sight for a certain event with a permanent or temporary construction for spectators, e.g. a road section, an area within a square, a street, a body of water.

The category of a stadium is determined by an inspection of a commission 30 days prior to the event and approved by the person who owns, controls or manages the venue pursuant to the Russian legislation. The establishment of the aforementioned commission is subject to a decision of the owner or legitimate user of the venue.

Thus, the overall trend of the Russian legislation is the increased role of the organizers, owners or managers of the venues in providing security during official competitions. Alongside with that, the Police is taking a big part in security enforcement during official sports competitions, thus executing its powers by organizing security checks together with the organizers in order to be able to react to possible threats right away.

All the provisions of the articles 2-5 and 8 of the European Convention on Spectator Violence and Misbehaviour at Sports Events and in Particular Football Matches adopted on August 19, 1985 in Strasbourg (hereinafter referred to as 'the Convention') and fully ratified in the USSR on April 01, 1991, have been implemented into the Russian legislation in their entirety, namely the obligations:

- to develop state policy on coordinated actions of all the bodies involved in combating violence and hooliganism of the spectators;
- to enact legislation that contains liability for misbehaviour of the spectators;
- to prohibit bringing any alcohol products to the stadia;
- to promote sport and ideals of sport via educational and other campaigns;
- to actively participate (via the corresponding representatives of Russia) in the Permanent Committee of the Convention.

According to Article 4, Paragraph 2 of the Convention, state authorities of the Russian Federation shall cooperate with foreign authorities by sending respective requests before the international matches or competitions involving Russian sports clubs. A new so-called 'spotters' service has been introduced and is now successfully operating in the sphere of public order.

Thus, every professional football club has attached police officers who travel to the match venues, including international matches in order to provide assistance for the fans that travel with the team. In a framework of such cooperation the Russian officers of law-enforcement bodies go to foreign countries where international matches are held and perform a linking function between the Russian spectators and local law-enforcement bodies. Such cooperation is of regular nature and is applied to high-risk matches.

In 2015 Russian Police officers had more than 50 trips (including foreign trips to Albania, Belgium, Great Britain, Germany, Moldova, the Netherlands, Czech Republic) the aim of which was to provide assistance to local authorities and exchange experience.

For example, such measures were implemented during the preparation to the 1/16 UEFA Europa League match between Fenerbahçe (Turkey) and Locomotive (Russia), which helped to prevent massive conflicts between the both teams' fans.

C. INCIDENTS IN THE RUSSIAN FOOTBALL. MAIN TRENDS. PREVENTIVE ACTIVITIES FOR PROMOTION OF PUBLIC ORDER AND SAFETY AT THE STADIA

According to the information stated in the ‘Accidents in the Russian Football’ Review (published in May 2015), sporting events, namely, football games, tend to be ‘fair play’, peaceful, tolerant and spectacular events. Although, there are certain situations when public order and safety at the stadia are disturbed.

Having analyzed the statistics shown in the Review we can affirmatively state that the number of matches with incidents is declining year by year.

In the season of 2011/2012 half of the matches (22 out of 44) witnessed certain negative incidents. In 2012/2013 and 2013/2014 there were 44% of matches with incidents (24 out of 54 and 23 out of 52 respectively). And in the season of 2014/2015 only 34.6% of matches involved incidents (18 out of 52). The statistics in each separate season accounted both for UEFA Champions League and UEFA Europa League tournaments involving participation of Russian football clubs.

Obviously, the number of severe and serious incidents connected with the behaviour of Russian fans at the football games during the UEFA tournaments is reducing. 9 incidents were placed on record in 2011/2012 season, 6 incidents in 2012/2013 and 2013/2014 seasons, and 4 incidents in the season of 2014/2015. Together with that, the number of minor incidents at the stadia remain at a stable average level. But this aspect also tends to reduce. In the season of 2012/2013 and 2013/2014 17 and 18 minor incidents were recorded correspondingly, and during the season of 2014/2015 we had only 14 minor incidents.

It should be noted that the major part of incidents during these matches were committed by the most active part of spectators, namely, by the fan groups. Other spectators showed almost zero-rate of misconduct at the stadia and other sports venues.

The most typical incidents at the Russian stadia are:

- Spectators excessively use the pyrotechnics and throw flares on the playing field;
- Spectators block exits/aisles and use stadium constructions inappropriately.

Herewith, we get rare cases of racist chanting, prohibited mnemonics demonstration and fights of competing teams’ fans.

In 2015, 4311 people were arrested for committing administrative offenses during sporting events (in 2014, 4417 people were arrested for the same reason).

As of December 31, 2015 the Courts ruled out 122 administrative injunctions to visit the places where the official sporting events are held on the days of such sporting events varying from 6 months to 3 years. Also, the Court ruled 10 times against the violation of the aforementioned injunction.

The awareness of Russian fans is rising and that is definitely a positive trend. The constant decrease of the Football Fans Social Responsibility Index (developed by UEFA) supports that fact.

The average level of incidents severity (for the matches with participation of Russian football clubs) was 2.41 for the season of 2011-2012. That indicator was higher than the one (1.91) for the UEFA Champions League and UEFA Europa League matches.

The average level of incidents severity (for the matches with participation of Russian football clubs) was 1.75 for the season of 2012-2013. That indicator was lower than the one (1.92) for the UEFA Champions League and UEFA Europa League matches.

The average level of incidents severity (for the matches with participation of Russian football clubs) was 1.94 for the season of 2013-2014. That indicator was lower than the one (2.03) for the UEFA Champions League and UEFA Europa League matches.

The average level of incidents severity (for the matches with participation of Russian football clubs) was 1.31 for the season of 2014-2015. That indicator was lower than the one (2.00) for the UEFA Champions League and UEFA Europa League matches.

The aforementioned data shows that the nature and the scale of incidents (offenses against public order and security) by the Russian football clubs at the stadia are not crucial. Moreover, the average level of incidents severity during the games of Russian football clubs in the European tournaments is generally lower than the average index for football matches. That level exceeded the average index only once over the last 4 seasons.

For the purposes of cooperation with fans and fan groups, there has been created a workgroup within the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation, the aim of which is to tackle off-field aggression. This workgroup includes the representatives of football community and authorities.

Thus, it would be fair to acknowledge the fact that the Russian Federation is constantly promoting the fan-culture and respect towards other spectators and players among the fans via its national sports clubs. Public order and security at the stadia during big sporting events is rising – and it is obviously a positive trend.

Russian Football Union, Russian Football Premier League, football clubs and other stakeholders hold various campaigns (with sponsors' support) aimed at establishing a positive atmosphere for further football development in general and matches development in particular. *Inter alia*, such campaigns include: “STOP SWEARING” and “THIS IS THE PLACE TO BE AND WE DO NOT SMOKE IN HERE” movements, targeted anti-racist videos starring football players. Such campaigns are held on a regular basis. Individual social projects are also there, for example, “PLAY AGAINST RACISM” by the Sports and Social Projects Directorate (Autonomous Non-Profit Organization).

In addition to that, the Russian Football Union together with the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation, the Organizing Committee ‘Russia-2018’ and the Ministry of External Affairs cooperates with the anti-discrimination unit of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, namely by organizing seminars about the possible incorporation of international experience for the creation of racism- and discrimination-free atmosphere in Russian football. These events involve representatives of the football clubs, fan associations, sports media, human-rights ombudsmen of the 2018 FIFA World Cup host-regions, FIFA and UEFA units as well as some specialized NGOs, including FARE (‘Football Against Racism in Europe’).

At the same time, the International Sports Forum ‘Russia is a sporting nation’ shall be held in Vladimir region of the Russian Federation in October 2016. This forum has been held regularly since 2009 after being founded by the President. This forum is a good platform for discussion of the most pressing issues in the world of sports. It involves multiple stakeholders, like national and foreign sports authorities, national and international sports federations and organizations, public figures and prominent scientists. There are plans to organize a round table under the topic of ‘World experience. Creating a discrimination-free space’ together with the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, the Russian Olympic Committee and the Russian Football Union.

In 2015 the National Football Information Point (NFIP) was established within the Ministry of Internal Affairs.

The NFIP was included in the European network of NFIPs. In January 2016, foreign employees were hired for the purpose of teaching Russian employees of the NFIP to interact with the specialized website in order to make contacts in this field.

Another important point is the establishment of working relationships with some European partners regarding the exchange of information on Russian citizens who are willing

to travel to football matches in Europe and, *vice versa*, regarding European fans traveling to Russia for the same reasons

The formalized liability of the organizers of events for public order and security helped to reduce the number of Police officers engaged in official sporting events by 15,2% (in 2015 789,8 thousand policemen were involved).

The application of laws regarding stewards will lead to reduction of Police officers involved by another 10%.

In 2016 the number of sporting events is expected to be the same as in 2015 with a 5-10% attendance growth. This situation is due to putting new comfortable and better-equipped sports sights.

For security purposes at 2017 FIFA Confederations Cup and 2018 FIFA World Cup matches and for tackling hooliganism during those matches, the following measures are being taken by the 'Russia - 2018' Organizing Committee:

- In cooperation with FIFA, non-commercial organization 'Arena-2018', representatives of host-cities and force structures changes to the projects of the stadia are made in order to increase the level of security for the spectators, including, inter alia, effective communication system, enough entrance and exit gates, evacuation plans etc.
- Preparation and execution of a steward training program (who will be responsible for maintaining public order during matches) in cooperation with the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation, the Russian Football Union and UEFA. Additional training sessions for stewards will be held before the 2017 FIFA Confederations Cup and 2018 FIFA World Cup.
- Preparation of measures to tackle the possible smuggle of pyrotechnics, prohibited substances, placards and banners of racist or hooligan nature in cooperation with the Ministry of Internal Affairs.

Cooperation with international experts and representatives of Police dealing with the unlawful phenomena in football. An agreement about coordination of actions during the 2017 FIFA Confederations Cup and 2018 FIFA World Cup has been reached.

D. INFORMATION ON SPORTS VENUES IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Russian Sports Venues Register is kept to arrange the data on the number, purpose and status of the sports venues in the Russian Federation. Such sports venues shall be used for regional, national and international sporting events that are scheduled in the General Sporting Event Plan and are held by the constituent subjects of the Russian Federation. (Article 37.1 of the Law). On September 12, 2014, the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation released the Order No.766 that regulates the procedure for introducing, updating and extracting information from the Register¹⁴.

Any official sporting event shall be held only at the sports venue registered in the Russian Sports Venues Register, with the only exception to the events that are held at the newly opened sports venues.

¹⁴ Order No. 766: Russian Sports Venues Register – introducing, updating and extracting information from the Register; by the Ministry of Sport of the Russian Federation dated September 12, 2014.

All the information on sports venues registered in the Russian Sports Venues Register is generally available and open to public. Personal data on the sports venues' owners is not available to the public.

Any sports venue that does not provide for the safe public sporting event shall not be used for the official sporting event (Part 1.6 of Article 20 of the Law).

As of February 01, 2016 there are 2241 sports venues listed in the Russian Sports Venues Register.

PART 2

Report of the visiting team

Moscow, 20-21 May 2016

Section A Executive Summary

As a result of discussions between the Secretariat of the Standing Committee on Spectator Violence and T-RV representatives of the Russian Federation, it was agreed that a delegation of European experts, including the head of Stadium and Security at UEFA, would visit Moscow on 20-21 May 2016 in order to monitor the safety, security and service arrangements in connection with football events held in the Russian Federation.

The purpose of the visit was to provide advice to the Russian Federation in respect of:

- demonstrating compliance with the Council of Europe Convention on an integrated approach at football matches and other sports event, to be launched on 3 July;
- preparing for hosting the FIFA 2018 World Cup; and
- ensuring that football stadia (and other sports venues) provide a safe, secure and welcoming experience for all spectators.

This report and its recommendation set out the outcome of that visit. For ease of reference, the term "football events" is used throughout, however the delegation's observations and findings can, where appropriate, also be applied to other major and international sports falling within the scope of the Convention.

In accordance with the delegation's mandate, the report compares the current safety, security and service arrangements in connection with football events played in the Russian Federation with the core principles and outcomes enshrined in each of the policy articles contained in the Convention. Full account is also taken of the established good practices on safety, security and service contained in Standing Committee Recommendation 1/2015. The report also provides an assessment of the preparations for hosting the FIFA 2018 World Cup.

In the event, the delegation was impressed by the current safety and security arrangements observed during the visit and by the high degree of commitment demonstrated by all parties in the Russian Federation in respect of adopting established good practices in a customised and innovative manner.

This positive assessment is reflected throughout the report and in the limited number of recommendations. Among the report's 12 recommendations, there are just three where legislative or administrative change is considered necessary in order to demonstrate compliance with the Convention. These are:

- establishing standing local/regional multi-agency co-ordination arrangements (Articles 4 and 6);
- obliging each stadia hosting a professional football match to have a designated stadium safety (security) officer tasked with responsibility for all in-stadia safety and security matters (Article 5); and

- extending the current exclusion (banning order) arrangements to cater for football-related criminality outside of stadia and beyond the borders of the Russian Federation. (Article 10).

The report recommends consideration of some other thematic areas but the refinements proposed are designated as "desirable", "optional" or "ongoing" as the proposals are not considered important in terms of demonstrating compliance with the Convention.

Overall, the delegation is of the view that the current safety and security arrangements in the Russian Federation comply with the Convention to an extent which compares favourably with most European States.

The delegation is also confident that the extensive investment underway in the preparations for hosting a safe, secure and welcoming FIFA 2018 World Cup will go a long way to ensuring that the event is a successful and festive occasion for all concerned.

In conclusion, the delegation would like to put on record its gratitude for the willingness of all parties in the Russian Federation to engage in open and frank discussion and their evident commitment to sharing experiences and expertise with their European counterparts.

~~~~~



## **Section B Visit Background and Explanation**

### **B.1 Structure of Report**

In addition to the foregoing executive summary (Section A), this report comprises three sections and six appendices, which together provide the main observations and recommendations of the monitoring visit (hereafter described as the “visit”) undertaken in May 2016 by a delegation of the Council of Europe Standing Committee on Spectator Violence (hereafter described as the delegation).

This Section (B) provides essential background to, and an explanation of, the visit and its purpose, while Section D summarises the report’s key conclusions and recommendations, each of which is allocated a status of “important”, “desirable”, “optional” or “ongoing” in respect of the impact each will have in demonstrating compliance with the Council of Europe Convention on an integrated approach at football matches and other sports events (hereafter described as the “Convention”).

The main body of the report is provided in Section C which compares the current safety and security arrangements in connection with football events played in the Russian Federation with the core principles and outcomes enshrined in each of the policy articles contained in the Convention.

In so doing, the report also takes into account the good practices on safety, security and service set out in Consolidated Recommendation 1/2015 of the Council of Europe Standing Committee on the European Convention on Spectator Violence and Misbehaviour at Sports Events and in particular at Football Matches (hereafter described as the “Standing Committee”). Where appropriate, reference is also made to the preparations underway in connection with hosting the FIFA 2018 World Cup.

As indicated above, the report incorporates a number of appendices, including a draft Action Plan at Appendix A to be completed by the authorities in the Russian Federation and sent to the secretariat of the Standing Committee.

The appendices also include three supplementary thematic reports on the stadium safety arrangements at the Lokomotiv (Moscow) Stadium (Appendix C), Supporter Liaison Officers arrangements in the Russian Federation (Appendix D), and observations on the policing preparations underway for the FIFA 2018 World Cup (Appendix E). For ease of reference, Appendix B details the policy Articles of the Convention and Appendix F provides the programme of the visit. The National Report provided by the Russian Federation forms Part 1 of this report.

The term “football” is used throughout the report, however, where appropriate, the delegation’s observations and findings can also be applied to other major and international sports falling within the scope of the Convention.

## **B.2 Purpose of the Visit**

In 2015, as a result of discussions between representatives of the Standing Committee and the T-RV delegation of the Russian Federation, it was agreed that a monitoring visit should be undertaken for the purpose of providing an assessment of the extent to which the current safety, security and service arrangements in the Russian Federation would achieve the inter-related objective of:

- demonstrating compliance with the new Convention, to be launched on 3 July;
- preparing for hosting the FIFA 2018 World Cup; and
- ensuring that football stadia (and other sports venues) provide a safe, secure and welcoming experience for all spectators.

The delegation was aware from the outset that in such a short visit it would not be possible to conduct an in-depth assessment of every aspect of the safety and security arrangements in connection with football events in the Russian Federation, or the preparations for FIFA 2018 World Cup. It was also recognised that some questions or remarks might be misinterpreted, and that the delegation could only comment on what it was told and what it observed which might not necessarily be wholly indicative of the wider situation in the Russian Federation.

Throughout the visit, the delegation stressed that the purpose of the visit was not to criticise, but rather to support the authorities and other relevant stakeholders in the Russian Federation through the provision of external and expert observation in respect of football safety and security.

This is important as safety and security arrangements are and must remain the means of each national State. This report and its recommendations are not intended to undermine that core principle.

The delegation also acknowledged the wide variations in the constitutional, judicial, policing, cultural, and historical circumstances, and the equally varied character and severity of football-related incidents and risks, which exist among and within each national State, precludes universal application of definitive models of good practice. As such, it was recognised that the wide range of established good practices, set out in Standing Committee Recommendation 1/2015 and in EU handbooks on policing football events, will invariably need to be customised to meet national imperatives and circumstances.

## **B.3 Visit Itinerary**

Although the duration of the visit was short and focused exclusively on Moscow, the visit organisers in the Russian Federation were able to provide an intensive and meaningful itinerary comprising a series of meetings with high level representatives of the Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry of Sport, Russian Football Union, Russian Football Premier League, along with a number of key practitioners, including club security officers, and

supporter representatives. The meetings were supplemented by visits to the stadia of FC Spartak and FC Lokomotiv and observation of stadium safety and security arrangements and policing operations in connection with the match FC Lokomotiv (Moscow) versus FC Mordovia (Saransk), though it was disappointing that the subject of the observation was not the higher risk match FC Dynamo Moscow versus FC Zenit Saint Petersburg as originally planned. The delegation were also able to observe the excellent safety and security operation at the International Ice Hockey Federation World Championship semi final match between Canada and the USA at the Ice Palace Arena in Moscow (Appendix F).

#### **B.4 Standing Committee Delegation**

The delegation comprised:

- Ana Criado Contreras, Vice Chair of the Standing Committee, Delegate of Spain and Delegation Leader;
- Adrian Dincă, National Football Information Point of Romania, Delegate of Romania
- Rick Riding, UK Sports Grounds Safety Authority, Delegate of UK;
- Allan Nyring, Danish National Police, Delegate of Denmark;
- Sergey Khrychikov, Head of the Secretariat of the Standing Committee, Council of Europe;
- Marie-Francoise Glatz, Secretariat of the Standing Committee, Council of Europe;
- Stuart Dykes, Supporters Direct Europe;
- Marc Timmer, Head of UEFA Stadium and Security,
- David Bohannon, Chair of the European Group of Football Safety and Security Experts and Visit Rapporteur.

#### **B.5 Supporting Documentation**

To assist the visit, the authorities of the Russian Federation provided a National Report containing a wide range of important background information and data (see Part 1). This proved to be of great assistance prior to and during the visit, not least in terms of setting out the legislative, regulatory, strategic and operational framework governing the safety, security and service arrangements in connection with football events in the Russian Federation.

The delegation was also provided with English translations of the main legislative instruments on stadium safety and security. This was also extremely helpful, though it is recognised that the English translations may not always accurately reflect the aim and content of the original (Russian language) versions.

The documents supplied were:

- 2013 Federal Law 192-FZ, "Maintaining public order and safety during official sports events";

- Government Resolution 1156 of 16 December 2013, "Rules of conduct for spectators during official sports events";
- Government Resolution 353 of 18 April 2014 , "Rules for maintaining safety during official sports events";
- Ministerial Order 234 of 14 April 2014,"Procedure for the training of stewards responsible for public order and safety during official sports events";
- Federal Law No 195-FZ of 30 December 2001, Code of Administrative Offences on the penalties and sanctions which can be imposed on breach of the rules contained in the two Government Resolutions;
- Ministerial Order 996 of 30 October 2015, steward licensing and related procedures;
- Ministerial Order 997 of 30 October 2015, steward training requirements;
- Ministerial Order 998 of 30 October 2015, steward training syllabus; and
- Ministerial Order 1092 of 17 October 2015, venue infrastructure and technical equipment.

## **B6 Status of Report**

As stressed above, the delegation would like to repeat the reassurance offered at every opportunity during the visit that the aim of this report is to support the authorities in the Russian Federation in providing a safe, secure and welcoming environment at football matches generally and during the FIFA 2018 World Cup in particular.

### Convention Compliance

All States who sign, and subsequently ratify, the Convention are obliged to ensure that their legal and operating arrangements comply with the content of the Convention's policy Articles. To assist States achieve this obligation, and in recognition of the diversity of national imperatives and circumstances, the Articles are largely focused on key principles and outcomes.

To support States adopt, and demonstrate compliance with, each Article, the Standing Committee has provided a consolidated Recommendation (1/2015) which provides a wide array of established good practices on designing and delivering an integrated approach to safety, security and service in connection with football events, along with supplementary and detailed annexes on each of the three pillars.

This report therefore, focuses on the extent to which the current legal and operating arrangements in the Russian Federation are in compliance with the content of both the Convention and the Consolidated Standing Committee Recommendation.

The format adopted in Section C of this report is to compare the content of each Article with the current arrangements in order to identify any areas where refinements may be necessary to demonstrate compliance with the Convention.

In the event, the delegation was impressed by the current safety and security arrangements and by the high level commitment on the part of public and football authorities in the Russian Federation to take full account of European experience and expertise in developing and delivering customised versions of established good practices.

This positive impression is reflected in the report and the comparatively low number of recommendations. For example, there are just three thematic areas where legislative change is considered necessary in order to demonstrate compliance. These are:

- local/regional multi-agency co-ordination arrangements (Articles 4 and 6);
- obligation for each stadia hosting a professional football match to have a designated stadium safety (security) officer responsible for all in-stadia safety and security matters (Article 5); and
- extension of current exclusion (banning order) arrangements (Article 10).

Other refinements may be desirable but are not essential. For example, whilst it would be desirable to consolidate the legislative and operational framework governing stadium safety certification, and create an independent stadium safety authority tasked with a range of stadium safety standards and safety certification ("passport") responsibilities, neither the absence of such an authority, nor the content of the current legislative arrangements, represent a barrier to demonstrating compliance with the Convention.

### FIFA 2018 World Cup

The delegation was equally impressed with the high level of commitment towards embracing established good practices in the preparations for the FIFA 2018 World Cup Finals. The public authorities and Russian Football Union adopted a comparable approach when hosting the UEFA 2008 Champions League Final between Chelsea and Manchester United at the Luzhniki Stadium in Moscow before an attendance of 69,500, including 42,000 visiting English supporters. That Final proved to be a great success in terms of: the organisational arrangements inside and outside of the Stadium; the absence of any significant problems; and the welcoming atmosphere provided by all parties to tens of thousands of visiting English supporters.

Whilst the logistical and other organisational challenges involved in hosting the World Cup will be of a much greater magnitude, not least because the tournament will involve matches in 12 stadia located in 11 Federal Districts, the delegation is confident that the 2018 World Cup Finals will be equally successful.

Although the visit was short and focused exclusively on Moscow, the public authorities and the Local Organising Committee (LOC) stressed throughout the visit that an integrated approach towards safety, security and service would be applied at the tournament.

To help ensure consistency of approach, multi-agency co-ordination groups have been established in each city hosting World Cup matches. Although the delegation had no opportunity to observe the preparations outside of Moscow, it is confident that the Russian authorities will succeed in their objective of providing local populations and visiting supporters alike with a safe, secure and festive event.

In conclusion, this report should be seen as an ongoing commitment on the part of the Standing Committee, to provide, on request, further support to the governmental, football authorities, and other competent agencies in the Russian Federation in respect of all matters covered in this report and its recommendations. On the other hand, the Standing Committee would also welcome periodic feedback on the progress made by the authorities in the Russian Federation concerning implementation of the recommendations in this report.

### **Section C: Council of Europe Convention on an Integrated Safety, Security and Service Approach at Football Matches and Other Sports Events - Compliance with Policy Articles**

#### **Article 1 - Scope of the Convention**

Intent: The aim of Article 1 is for States who sign and ratify the Convention to designate the football and (where appropriate) other sports events covered by its Articles, preferably within its legislative or regulatory framework,

#### Compliance

The Russian Federation already embraces this concept in Resolution 353 which makes provision for the current legal arrangements on venue safety and security to be applied in respect of international and national sports events set out in a schedule.

On the assumption that Resolution 353 (or any amending provision) incorporates all domestic and international professional football matches played in the Russian Federation (which the delegation understands to be the case), that provision alone demonstrates compliance with the Article.

In terms of application to other sports events, this is purely optional. However the current legal framework already does and it is assumed, therefore, that this preference will continue. Even so, there is no obligation to apply all of the Articles, only those where it is considered appropriate or necessary.

#### **Article 2 - Aims of Convention**

Intent: Articles 2a and 2b oblige States to adopt, apply, and promote awareness of the need for an integrated, multi-agency and balanced approach to safety and security operations

inside and outside of stadia. Article 2c requires that, in so doing, States take full account of the established good practices set out in CoE Standing Committee Recommendation 1/2015

### Compliance

These are primarily policy and strategic, rather than legal, requirements. However, it is important for the legislative framework to incorporate the provisions necessary to facilitate the delivery of an integrated approach.

The monitoring visit provided ample observational and documentary evidence confirming that the Russian Federation has already embraced the concept of developing a multi-agency approach. It also evidenced that full consideration is being given to the adoption of established good practices, customised to meet national circumstances and imperatives, in further developing football safety and security arrangements.

Whilst not essential, consideration could be given to including a generic commitment in law towards delivering a multi-agency integrated approach to safety, security and service in connection with football events (inside and outside of stadia).

**Recommendation 1 : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of including a generic commitment in law towards delivering an integrated multi-agency approach to safety, security and service in connection with football events (inside and outside of stadia).** [status: optional]

### **Article 3 - Definitions**

Intent: The aim of Article 3 is to encourage European-wide usage of established safety and security terminology.

### Compliance

As with many States, the terminology used in the current legislative framework and associated operating arrangements is not wholly consistent with that contained in the Convention. Whilst the adoption of harmonised terminology, both in law and in practice, is desirable, it is not crucial. The key to compliance is for legal definitions to provide the necessary clarity of role and responsibility and for application of the measures to be universally understood and practised by all safety and security personnel.

However, whilst not essential, it may be desirable to consider the merits of adopting European wide terminology, where possible, as part of the ongoing review of enabling legislation and operating arrangements, not least with the FIFA 2018 World Cup in mind. In so doing it might also be prudent to define terms like "event organiser", "stadium operator" and the other terminology used to describe the parties involved in stadium safety and security management.

**Recommendation 2 : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of adopting in law and in practice European-wide terminology and definitions in respect of the safety, security and service arrangements in connection with football events. [status: desirable]**

#### **Article 4 - Co-ordination Arrangements**

Intent: The aim of Article 4 (1-3) is to oblige States to establish national and local multi-agency safety and security co-ordination arrangements to oversee the development and nationwide application of a comprehensive and integrated strategy. The expectation is that national co-ordination will be government-led, while responsibility for local co-ordination will be vested in a designated municipal or regional authority.

To that end, Article 4.4 requires States to undertake a comprehensive legislative review aimed at ensuring legal clarity in respect of the roles and responsibilities of public and private agencies engaged in making football events safe and secure.

#### National Co-ordination

##### Compliance

The current national multi-agency co-ordination process does not feature in the supplied legislative instruments. This is not surprising because such co-ordination is primarily a matter of policy and high level political commitment rather than legal or regulatory provision.

However, there is widespread evidence demonstrating that the Russian Federation is wholly committed to, and is pursuing a policy of, governmental-led national co-ordination of an integrated, multi-agency approach to safety, security and service both in respect of the 2018 World Cup and football events generally. This is welcome, not least because it is a prerequisite to the development and implementation of an effective national football safety and security strategy. This assessment was reinforced throughout the monitoring visit by high level attendance at, and proactive participation in, visit meetings.

#### **Local Co-ordination**

A key component of any national co-ordination process is to ensure that the national strategy is understood and applied at a regional and local level. This is essential during the preparatory and operational phases of hosting a major multi-venue international tournament, like the 2018 World Cup, but also important in terms of other international and domestic football events.

##### Compliance

The delegation was reassured by the extent to which multi-agency preparations for the FIFA 2018 World Cup are focused on providing local communities and visiting supporters alike with a festive atmosphere and on putting in place an organisational infrastructure that will facilitate delivery of that objective.



This is crucial as ensuring consistency in the preparations for, and subsequent operations during, the tournament will pose an array of major logistical challenges, not least because the event will involve matches in 12 stadia located in 11 Federal Districts.

To overcome these challenges, multi-agency co-ordination groups have been established in each city hosting World Cup matches with the aim, inter alia, of: ensuring continuity between the arrangements of public agencies and the event organiser; providing a holistic infrastructure embracing co-ordinated public transport links, fan zones, public viewing areas and stadia; and striking an appropriate balance between safety, security and service. To provide clarity in respect of the roles and obligations of the agencies involved, a "matrix of responsibility" is being developed.

The delegation is confident that these local co-ordination arrangements will help deliver a well planned and executed tournament. However, it was less clear how local multi-agency co-ordination operates in respect of routine national and international football events. Certainly, the key public and private agencies have established regional and local structural arrangements in place which could (and might already) provide an essential starting point for ensuring effective local co-ordination.

However, the need to develop a "matrix of responsibility" for the FIFA 2018 World Cup suggests that there is scope for the legal framework to formalise regional and local multi-agency co-ordination in a more systematic way.

At present, local multi-agency co-ordination is mentioned sparingly in the current legislative framework and is largely focused on clause 19b of Resolution 353 which obliges the event organiser to arrange co-ordinated action with public authorities in addressing issues pertaining to the maintenance of public order and safety during the event. There is an expectation that such co-ordination will take place and it almost certainly does.

However, this is not consistent with the intent of the Article, nor established good practice, which centres on ensuring consistent nationwide application of an integrated approach at local/regional level through designating a local or regional public agency with responsibility for:

- encouraging and facilitating effective partnerships between public and private bodies engaged in football events (inside and outside of stadia),
- overseeing application of an integrated approach (as set out in the national strategy);
- co-ordinating multi-agency event preparations and post-event reviews;
- ensuring that event-related preparations and operations in public places (e.g. city centres and local transportation etc) are integrated and consistent with stadium operations; and
- assessing emerging trends and challenges, and refining local strategies accordingly.

In order to ensure that these objectives are achieved, it would be desirable for the legal framework to designate a local or regional public authority or agency with overall responsibility for local co-ordination matters. The legal provisions could also stipulate

membership and terms of reference for multi-agency local/regional co-ordination groups. Such provisions could be supplemented as appropriate with authoritative guidance on matters like the organisation of public viewing events.

European experience suggests that, in addition to the participation of the police and other federal/local public authorities, membership of local co-ordination groups should include designated stadium safety officers (see Recommendation 4) and, where appropriate, the event organiser. Membership can be augmented to accommodate an input from all relevant public, private, voluntary and other stakeholders engaged in event preparations.

**Recommendation 3 : As part of the review of the current legislative and regulatory framework, the national co-ordination group should consider i) designating a local (or regional) public authority with responsibility for establishing a local (or regional) multi-agency group tasked with responsibility for co-ordinating preparations for football events held in their locality (or region) and ii) including explicit legal provisions on the structure, role, and membership of such groups, taking into account established European good practice. [status: important]**

## **Article 5 - Safety, Security and Service in Stadiums**

Article 5 is the most demanding and explicit component of the Convention. Current compliance with each element is therefore considered separately below. However, the primary purpose of the Article is to oblige States to ensure that the measures necessary are in place for achieving the ultimate goal of providing a safe, secure and welcoming environment within football stadia.

### General Observations

The delegation had the opportunity to inspect two football stadia in Moscow and supplement that with observation of a Premier League football event (FC Lokomotiv Moscow and FC Mordovia Saransk) and, by way of comparison, a IIHF World Championship ice hockey match (Canada v USA).

The delegation's observation of these events is reflected throughout this report and its appendices, notably Appendix C which provides a technical report on the safety and security arrangements in connection with the match at the Lokomotiv Stadium. Whilst no firm conclusion can be drawn from one observation, it is worth highlighting that the report was highly positive. In summary the stadium was adjudged to be "*extremely well equipped with modern safety features and affords spectators with high standards of facilities to enhance the customer experience*". Similarly, "*the match day operation was well planned with effective safety equipment in the control room, the police and safety management team worked well together, each understanding their respective roles and responsibilities*". Overall, the visit provided impressive evidence of the multi-agency commitment to continue investing in upgrading the physical infrastructure, technical facilities and stadium safety management arrangements in football stadia. The delegation is confident that this will contribute to the

overall success of the FIFA 2018 World Cup and enhance the football experience generally for all concerned.

As indicated above, the wholly positive impact of this investment is reflected in the accompanying technical stadium safety report. It is worth adding that the report was undertaken by a leading European expert on stadium safety who commented that the report compared favourably with those provided in respect of other Standing Committee visit.

This highly favourable assessment needs to be seen as a backdrop to the following Article 5 compliance analysis and recommendations. The aim is not to criticise but to place expert opinion at the disposal of the relevant authorities when considering if and how to build upon an already high level of effectiveness. Implicit in this, is recognition that the primary challenge for the relevant public and private agencies engaged in managing a football event, is the suitability and robustness of the safety and security arrangements when confronting emergency or other unplanned scenarios.

### Article 5.1

Intent: The aim of Article 5.1 is to oblige each State to ensure that the national legal framework provides clarity on the role of the event organiser in terms of working in partnership with the public authorities in making the stadium experience safe, secure and welcoming.

### Compliance

The current legal framework includes comprehensive provision in respect of stadium safety and security roles and responsibilities which, at first glance, appear to overlap, with responsibility shared or joint in character. This impression is compounded by the use of contrary definitions in the Convention and in Russian law.

For example, Convention usage of the term "event organiser" is intended to cover the party responsible for actually hosting a specific football match or other sporting event. However, Federal Law 192-FZ and associated Resolutions/Ministerial Orders uses the term "proprietors or users" of stadia (in a football context) to cover this role. The term "organiser" appears to apply to the body under whose auspices the match/event is being held. If this interpretation is correct, then the roles currently ascribed to the event organiser would not be wholly consistent with the aim of the Convention (see below).

However, the delegation recognise that the apparent duplication in law regarding the roles of the various safety management actors appears, at least in part, to be a consequence of the scope of the legal framework, which makes provision for ensuring safety and security at a wide range of different sporting events, hosted in a diverse range of stadia/arenas/venues, under the auspices of different organisational and management structures.

It also appears that the intent and legal obligation is for application of the generic provisions to be determined by the character of the event and for roles and responsibilities to be designated in event or stadium operating arrangements. This is an unusual but pragmatic

approach which would be consistent with the Convention, especially if it could be demonstrated to always work effectively in every situation.

### Role of the Organiser

In terms of football events, the current legal arrangements requires the role of the organiser to be represented by a delegate appointed by the league under whose auspices the event is being held. It is the delegate who evaluates the match day preparation the day before the match; convenes meetings with stadium operators, security companies, supporter groups, police, fire and ambulance services; and prepares a report of actions to be completed prior to the match. A pre-match meeting between all parties is also arranged to ensure all safety planning, checks and records are in place and all actions identified have been undertaken.

There is nothing which suggests that the current role of the organiser (as represented by the league delegate) is not working satisfactorily. Indeed, as long as there is continual professional development and structured training for these delegates the process is commendable.

The only issue generating some concern centered on the independence of the league delegate. European experience evidences that it is not generally good practice for the organiser (as applied in the current legislative framework) to be involved in the safety and security process, largely because, in extremis, it can result in potential conflicts of interest.

Whilst the insertion of a provision making it explicit in law that safety and security responsibilities must take primacy over, and not be undermined by, commercial pressures or interests, would provide a safeguard, it would not provide the legal clarity regarding role and responsibility required by Article 5.1 of the Convention.

For example, Federal Law No. 329-FZ and Resolution 353 both place responsibility for public order and safety on the event organisers, in conjunction with the proprietors and users of the sports venue. Similarly, both entities can recruit and deploy stadium stewards. This current absence of legal clarity is not in compliance with the intent of the Convention or established good European practice.

### Role of Designated Stadium Safety Officers

An alternative approach, compliant and consistent with the Convention, would be to adopt established good practice, whereby all stadia hosting professional football matches are required to have a designated stadium safety officer, appointed by the stadium operator/user, tasked with responsibility for all in-stadia safety and security arrangements. This would represent an upgrade on the current role, responsibility and accountability of stadium safety (security) officers.

Clearly to undertake such an expanded role, stadium safety officers would first need to be trained and assessed as competent to undertake their many important and varied tasks. To that end, it would be desirable for the RFU to invite UEFA to deliver their state of the art

joint training of stadium safety officers and police match commanders (if not already planned). Nevertheless, the delegation envisages that a transitional period would be necessary before the recommendation could be fully implemented.

**Recommendation 4 : As part of a wider legislative review, the national co-ordination group should consider imposing a requirement that all stadia hosting a professional football event should have in place a trained and assessed as competent stadium safety officer designated with responsibility for all in stadia safety and security arrangements.** [status: important]

#### In-Stadia Role of Public Authorities

Notwithstanding any current legal ambiguity, the Russian Federation has made impressive strides in ensuring that primary responsibility for in-stadia safety and security arrangements are vested in the various parties engaged in hosting football events. There is also mutual recognition that the role of the police and other public authorities is essentially supportive unless a major, or potentially significant, public safety or security incident occurs.

There are numerous references to the role of the police and other public agencies throughout the legislative and regulatory framework and the delegation is of the view that it would be desirable, though not essential for Convention compliance purposes, if the current provisions were consolidated in the form of fewer but more specific provisions covered in one thematic section within the legal framework.

Similarly, there are a number of dispersed references to the role of the public authorities in the event of an emergency and, in particular, emergency evacuation of stadia. It would be preferable for these provisions to be set out in thematic section on the arrangements for dealing with emergencies (see Article 7 below).

Consolidating these provisions would also provide opportunity to clarify in law the procedure to be applied in circumstances where the (proposed) designated stadium safety officer is required, or considers it appropriate, to formally transfer in-stadia safety and security responsibility to the relevant public authority (e.g. in the event of a major safety or security incident). This can be vitally important because major incidents can emerge over a period of time and having a legal procedure designed to identify when responsibility was formally transferred can be extremely useful should it become necessary to determine accountability.

**Recommendation 5 : As part of the legislative and regulatory review, the national co-ordination group should consider consolidating current provisions on the in-stadia role of public authorities, and establishing formal arrangements for the police or other public agency to assume responsibility in the event of an actual or potential emergency scenario or other significant public safety or security incident.** [status: desirable]

#### Articles 5.2 and 5.3

Intent: The aim of Articles 5.2 and 5.3 is to place an obligation on States to ensure the effectiveness of stadium safety arrangements (stadium safety certification in particular) by

ensuring that national standards in respect of stadium design, infrastructure and associated crowd management arrangements are in place, applied, monitored and enforced by competent public authorities.

### Compliance

The crucial theme of stadium safety is comprehensively covered in a number of legislative instruments, notably: Ministerial Order 1092, Ministerial Order 948, and Resolution 353. Taken together, the instruments oblige designated agencies to ensure that a stadium hosting, say, a professional football event, is compliant with a range of national (minimum) mandatory standards and operating criteria. Across Europe, such compliance is a pre-requisite to what is described as a stadium safety certificate.

The term "passport" is used in the English translation of current law, however application of the law, rather than terminology, is the critical factor in terms of Convention compliance. At present, application of the certification/passport process, requires various governmental and other organisations and individuals to each fulfil various parts of the process. The delegation is of the view that to ensure enhanced robustness of the current arrangements, it would be desirable to develop a documented framework with terms of reference, guidance, model checklists or templates to ensure this newly introduced process is consistent and comprehensive. It would also be desirable, given the direct link between a stadium's infrastructure and technical equipment and its safety management arrangements, if Resolution 353 and Ministerial Orders 948 and 1092 were consolidated both in law and in practical application.

However, the Convention obligation to review the existing legislative and regulatory framework provides opportunity to adopt a more comprehensive and sustainable approach. This would centre on transferring the MIA inspection commission and associated Sports Ministry and other responsibilities to a (new) independent public body (with regional/territorial offices given the geographical spread of stadia within the Russian Federation) designated with responsibility for overseeing sports stadium safety and security.

Such an authority could be tasked to ensure that all stadia hosting football (and other scheduled) events are designed, constructed and managed in accordance with national standards and operating criteria. Thereafter operating regulations (possibly contained in a Ministerial Order) could set out standards, technical imperatives, and independent inspection arrangements in respect of stadium infrastructure, technical equipment and stadium safety management arrangements. The designated authority could also assume responsibility for delivering an independent safety certification (or "passport") process. One condition for the issue of a stadium safety certificate could be a mandatory obligation on the part of the stadium operator to appoint a designated stadium safety officer tasked with responsibility for all in-stadia safety and security matters.

**Recommendation 6 : The national co-ordination group should consider refining the current legislative framework to establish an independent, public authority tasked with**

**responsibility for: i) issuing standards on the physical, technical and safety management arrangements in stadia hosting professional football events; ii) monitoring application of those standards; and iii) issuing stadium safety certificates to all stadia in compliance with the national standards.** [status: desirable]

#### Article 5.4

Intent: The aim of Article 5.4 is to stress the importance of service arrangements in stadia, including the need to accommodate all sections of society, including the disabled and infirm, through the provision of appropriate sanitary, refreshment and viewing facilities.

#### Compliance

There are references in the legal instruments to service considerations but these, and wider matters regarding inclusiveness, are best dealt with in national and local strategies and in stadium hospitality and safety management arrangements. However, stadium design and associated standards should incorporate specific provision regarding the need for appropriate facilities for the disabled and other vulnerable groups.

Indeed, the only negative issue arising from the technical inspection of the Lokomotiv stadium centred on the inadequate accommodation and facilities provided for wheelchair users and other disabled people. There were only 8 designated wheelchair spaces with acceptable viewing sightlines, which were served by two accessible toilets and a steward to transfer purchased refreshments from an inaccessible outlet. Although only two wheelchair spaces were occupied at that match, if the stadium was full for a highly appealing fixture then the accommodation provided would almost certainly be insufficient, especially if a proactive policy of accessibility for all is pursued.

It was not clear to the delegation if the Sports Ministry has a strategy for encouraging increased diversity in terms of attending football events, including disabled people. The Russia Football Union sets minimum standards for disabled accommodation and facilities, however it wasn't apparent from the match observation if the standards are being adopted in all stadia.

**Recommendation 7 : The Sports Ministry, in consultation with the Russian Football Union, should consider recommending or requiring venue owners to undertake an access audit and develop a plan for complying with minimum standards in respect of stadium access and facilities for disabled spectators.** [status: desirable]

#### Article 5.5

Intent: The aim of Article 5.5 is to oblige States to ensure that stadium authorities, in consultation with public authorities and other stakeholders, develop effective arrangements for identifying, preventing and tackling established and/or emerging in-stadia safety and security risks, notably in respect of supporter behaviour.

#### Compliance

In terms of supporter conduct, Resolution 1156 provides a comprehensive and explicit, legal instrument which is wholly consistent with European good practice and the intent of the Convention. The extensive data included in the National Report also suggests that this, and related measures, are having a significant and positive impact on in-stadia behaviour, both at domestic and international matches. The challenge is to keep on top of any emerging trends and the setting up of a multi-agency working group on promoting positive fan behaviour is evidence of the proactive commitment of the public and private agencies involved, and a demonstration of compliance with the Article.

#### Article 5.6

Intent: The aim of Article 5.6 is to ensure that stadium safety and security personnel are trained and equipped to undertake all of their activities effectively.

#### Compliance

The stewarding operation observed at the Lokomotiv Stadium was highly effective, albeit in relatively undemanding circumstances. The stewards were professional both in appearance and practice and readily identifiable in terms of personal identification. A number of the stewards were questioned, and each was able to confirm that they had received training, been assessed as competent, and had received instruction and briefing on their respective roles and responsibilities. They were also aware of the emergency alert and response arrangements.

This high standard reflects the commitment demonstrated by the Russian Football Union to ensure that stadium stewards deliver all of their various functions in a professional manner. This commitment was evidenced by the provision of UEFA training for stewards and reflected in the legal framework, notably Ministerial Orders 234, 996, 997 and 998 which make specific provision for the recruitment and training of stewards.

The RFU and the FIFA 2018 World Cup Local Organising Committee recognise that the challenge confronting them is to ensure that up to 18,000 stewards nationwide are trained to a standard comparable to those deployed and observed at the Lokomotiv Stadium.

#### Article 5.7

Intent: The aim of Article 5.7 is to encourage sports authorities and clubs to insist that their representatives (on and off the playing area) adopt an approach that reflects tolerance and respect in order to avoid generating safety and security problems.

#### Compliance

This is not a major issue in terms of legal provision but is rather a matter that can be, and is being, given a high priority by the agencies concerned.

### **Article 6 - Safety, Security and Service in Public Places**

Intent: The aim of Article 6 is to build upon the obligation in Article 4, regarding local/territorial multi-agency co-ordination, through encouraging all agencies and



stakeholders involved in football related activity (organised or spontaneous) in public spaces (city centres, transit routes etc.) to co-operate in assessing risk and preparing appropriate preventative measures designed to create a safe, secure and welcoming environment whilst minimising disruption and providing reassurance to local communities.

### Compliance

The delegation did not have the opportunity to observe football related operations in public places during the visit. In discussion, all parties recognised that the police and other public authorities have primary responsibility for events in public places. There also appeared to be a high level of awareness of the potential overlap between what happens inside and outside of stadia, and the need to adopt a multi-agency approach towards minimising safety and security risks in all locations. This commitment was expressed by all public and private agencies engaged in football operations.

However, as indicated under Article 4 above, the current local multi-agency co-ordination arrangements do not appear to be compliant with the Convention, or established good practice, which highlight the need to establish in law a standing local/territorial multi-agency co-ordination structure.

Adoption of Recommendation 3 above would ensure compliance with the Convention. It would also facilitate the preparation of comprehensive, multi-agency safety, security and service preparations for organised and spontaneous events, including public viewing arrangements, in public places, notably but not exclusively in respect of higher risk domestic and international football events. It would also effectively replicate on a permanent basis the local co-ordination arrangements deemed necessary for hosting the FIFA 2018 World Cup.

### **Article 7 – Contingency and Emergency Planning**

Intent: The aim of Article 7 is to ensure that stadium multi-agency contingency plans (prepared by the stadium operator) and local emergency plans (prepared by the relevant public authorities) are complementary and tested in regular joint exercises.

### Compliance

The importance of contingency and emergency planning has never enjoyed a higher profile, especially in respect of the threat of terrorist incidents. However, European experience evidences that emergencies and, in particular, other challenging scenarios can occur at every football event. This was reflected in discussions during the visit and the delegation is in no doubt that this issue will feature heavily in the preparations for the FIFA 2018 World Cup. However, as indicated above, the development of a tournament specific "responsibility matrix" suggests that emergency and contingency planning arrangements are not already in place, or universally understood, in respect of other domestic and international football events.

The delegation discussed this matter at length during the visit and it became clear that, in extremis, the police and other public authorities would assume overall control and responsibility for dealing with a major incident. However, emergencies manifest in different forms and can evolve at variable speeds. European experience demonstrate the importance of

all public and stadium agencies, and their personnel, having a clear understanding of their respective roles and responsibilities in undertaking remedial activity during all stages of an emergency, including any embryonic phase. The delegation was not wholly convinced that this is currently the case.

This perception may not be accurate, of course, and it may be that the emergency planning of public authorities falls under the responsibility of an agency which did not participate in visit discussions. It is also recognised that responsibility for ensuring harmonisation of public authority emergency plans and stadium specific contingency plans may already fall under the remit of one of the territorial agencies cited in the legal framework and be covered in associated operating standards and guidance. Understandably, prior to the visit, no specific legal instruments were supplied on public authority emergency plans, or the associated testing and exercising arrangements. However, the football-specific instruments currently incorporate numerous references to emergencies and emergency evacuations.

In terms of stadium emergencies, an important role for the proposed designated stadium safety officer (see Article 5 and Recommendation 4 above) would be to develop, refine as necessary, and maintain a record of the contingency plans to be applied when dealing with all types of in-stadia emergencies and unexpected scenarios, including emergency evacuation arrangements. Clearly all such plans would need to be prepared in consultation with the police, fire and rescue, and medical services, and counter terrorism advisers, and take full account of municipal or territorial emergency plans for dealing with emergencies in public places impacting upon stadium facilities and/or operations.

In the absence of definitive advice, it would be remiss of the delegation not to raise this vital issue in its report and in its recommendations, especially as the Russian Federation are clearly intent on demonstrating compliance with all Convention Articles.

A related issue, covered in the recommendation below, centres on ensuring that if and when in place, or refined as necessary, the contingency and emergency plans need to be tested in multi-agency table top and full-scale exercise with steps taken to ensure the roles of each agency in an emergency are clear and widely understood at practitioner level.

**Recommendation 8 : The national co-ordination group should review the current arrangements for preparing and testing comprehensive multi-agency stadium contingency and public authority emergency plans for incidents at or nearby stadia hosting football events. [status: desirable]**

#### **Article 8 – Engagement with Supporters and Local Communities**

Intent: The aim of Article 8.1 is to highlight the importance of encouraging all national and local agencies engaged in football related planning and operations to communicate effectively with supporters, resident communities in host cities and territories, and other stakeholders. Article 8.2 extends beyond event-related communication and falls under the generic umbrella of community development. It commits States to encouraging public and private agencies and other stakeholders to initiate or participate in multi-agency social,

educational, crime-prevention and other community projects designed to foster mutual respect and understanding, especially among supporters, sports clubs and agencies responsible for safety and security.

## Compliance

### Supporter Liaison

The public and private authorities in the Russian Federation fully recognise the potential for reducing risk through effective liaison with supporters. This important component of all effective football-related safety and security strategies was stressed by all of the authorities and other bodies participating in visit discussions. The National Report supplied prior to the visit also highlights initiatives being pursued with the aim of generating a positive atmosphere within stadia. This high level awareness and commitment was reinforced during informal discussions with key practitioners during the visit.

The delegation would like to pay particular tribute to the extent to which the Russian football authorities have embraced the concept of Supporter Liaison Officers (SLOs).

The report at Appendix D outlines the scale of the investment in the SLO concept and the character of its application. In almost all respects, progress on this front significantly exceeds that achieved in most European States. Notwithstanding the highly positive character of the appended report, it does identify four areas considered worthy of further consideration.

**Recommendation 9 : The Football Union, in consultation with the Russian Football Premier League and the Association of Russian Professional Football Leagues, should review the current SLO arrangements, to ensure that i) the positions of club safety officer and club supporter liaison officer are not occupied by the same person; ii) a national team SLO (team) is appointed; iii) any individual felt to pose an ongoing risk of violence or disorder is disqualified from being a SLO; and iv) SLOs from different countries be invited to exchange experiences and good practices with their Russian counterparts. [status: desirable]**

In addition to the SLO concept, the Russian Football Union has facilitated the establishment of a fans embassy in accordance with European good practice and is providing substantive funding for its activities at international matches played abroad.

The high priority accorded to supporter liaison activity extends to embracing the established good practice of frontline safety and security practitioners, notably the police, proactively engaging with supporters. This is not easily achieved and can pose cultural and other challenges en-route, but the process is underway and is to be welcomed and encouraged. Government is also playing its part in a substantive way. For example, the Ministry for Internal Affairs consulted supporters in preparing the Code of Conduct for Supporters (Resolution 1156).

In terms of wider fan engagement, the Russian Football Union, Russian Football Premier League, football clubs and other stakeholders hold various campaigns aimed at encouraging

fans to create a positive atmosphere in stadia, including anti-racist initiatives featuring football players. NGOs are also encouraged to develop comparable projects.

### Community Engagement

European experience demonstrates the importance of developing and implementing a range of social and preventative projects designed to lure young supporters away from negative fan behaviour, not least through promoting a culture of tolerance and respect for others irrespective of team supported and other manifestations of diversity.

Similarly, European experience evidences that the participation of professional football clubs and national federations in a range of community-based social, crime prevention, educational and other projects can assist in developing closer links between the clubs and the wider community. Such projects not only promote a very positive public image of the club but can also add value to the delivery of the project, for example, by using club facilities to encourage disaffected or alienated young people to participate in educational and other initiatives. Moreover, and importantly, community engagement can help encourage a wider, cross-section of people to attend football events, particularly if such initiatives are accompanied by the kind of high profile improvements to stadium facilities observed by the delegation during the visit.

In terms of the link between football and community programmes, there is evidence that this concept has already been adopted by the football authorities. For example, the Russian Football Premier League runs a project called the "League of Kind Hearts" which focuses on activities aimed at children. The most popular module was "The Day at the Stadium", which includes information on the Laws of the Game and the history of the team, etc. This is a good start and one that will no doubt be further explored.

**Recommendation 10 : The national co-ordination group should encourage all stakeholders to consider the scope for developing preventative, social and educational projects connected with football events at both national and local level. In particular, activities aimed at children and junior supporters should incorporate the promotion of values such as respect, tolerance, anti-violence and non-discrimination. [status: desirable]**

### **Article 9 – Police Strategies and Operations**

Intent: The aim of Article 9 is to encourage the adoption of established good practices in respect of policing strategies and operations in public places and within stadia. These practices have proven to be highly successful (when adopted) at a series of international football tournaments and UEFA competition finals over the past decade.

### Compliance

There is ample evidence of the extent to which the Ministry of Internal Affairs (MIA) is working to adopt customised versions of established good policing football practices. This was reinforced during the visit both in discussions and in observation of policing operations. This highly impressive commitment is already producing some innovative results and a

reduction in the number of police officers deployed in connection with football events. As in all European States, this approach is and will remain work in progress with periods of transition necessary as operational strategies are refined.

In terms of demonstrating tangible application of the Article, and compliance with the new Convention, the MIA is clearly meeting this fundamental objective. To assist in this process, Appendix E provides a brief aide memoire on some potentially important considerations for the MIA to consider as part of its ongoing preparations for the FIFA 2018 World Cup and operations in connection with international football events generally. Key issues highlighted during the visit included the desirability of the MIA:

- negotiating bilateral protocols with States participating in the FIFA 2018 World Cup based on a risk assessment of logistical and operational imperatives, such as number of supporters likely to travel and potential behavioural considerations, along with visiting police delegation preferences and practices on matters like uniforms, weapons, evidence gathering and supporter liaison - adopting a policy of equality (one-size fits all approach) is not considered appropriate given that risk is intrinsically unequal;
- continuing to take account of the established good practices, set out in EU and Standing Committee documentation, which have proven to be very effective (when applied) at previous tournaments in terms of significantly reducing escalation of tensions and isolating the influence of any persons seeking confrontation - this includes pursuing policing strategies based on proactive engagement (dialogue) with supporters, ongoing dynamic risk assessment, proportionate police deployment, and targeted interventions;
- exploring internally and within the European Think Tank, the scope for providing match commanders, football intelligence officers and spotters with specific training on policing football events;
- ensuring that effective measures are taken to minimise any potential threats posed by Russian risk groups ;
- examining how tourist police units can be more visible in appearance (distinctive uniforms or vests/bibs) and be encouraged (on the basis of a dynamic risk assessment) to adopt a higher profile and more proactive dialogue and liaison role in areas where supporters can be expected to gather;
- using mounted police officers to play a high visibility supporter communication role in the environs of stadia and in city centres through the provision of training in basic language skills (notably English, which is widely understood by supporters from all countries), and dialogue/liaison techniques.
- encouraging and training front line officers to engage in welcoming and friendly dialogue with spectators.

None of these issues are new to the MIA and each has almost certainly received detailed consideration. The primary purpose of highlighting the above themes is to place the views of the delegation at the MIA's disposal.

**Recommendation 11 : The Ministry of Internal Affairs should continue to discuss with European colleagues the international police-cooperation and policing preparations in connection with the FIFA 2018 World Cup, taking into account issues highlighted in the visit report. [status: ongoing]**

### **Article 10 - Prevention and Sanctioning of Offending Behaviour**

Intent: The aim of Article 10 is to oblige all States to review its existing arrangements for preventing and sanctioning persons who act in a violent or other unacceptable manner in connection with football events at home and abroad, notably, though not exclusively, through consideration of how to ensure that individuals committing offences receive appropriate and effective sanctions excluding them (temporarily) from the football experience..

#### Compliance

The effectiveness of any exclusion strategy centres on the character and content of its enabling legislation and, in the case of the Russian Federation, this is provided in Government Resolution 1156 ("Rules of Conduct for Spectators during Official Sports Events") and the Code of Administrative Offences, which makes provision for the imposition of exclusion measures (banning orders) on individuals convicted for a breach of the Rules of Conduct by Spectators inside stadia.

The Code sets out the penalties for such misbehaviour and makes provision for the possibility of an imposition of a banning order precluding stadium entry for a period of between six months and three years. The maximum period can be extended to seven years on conviction of a further administrative offence. However, the legal framework appears to be silent on exclusion for football related criminal offences committed outside of stadia.

The delegation consider that this apparent gap in provision should be addressed in respect of offending behaviour both within the Russian Federation and abroad. In practice, and in law, there can be evidential and other obstacles to prosecuting individuals for criminal offences committed in another State. However, there is no such inherent difficulty in making legal provision within the Criminal or Administrative Code empowering a designated judicial or administrative body to impose preventative exclusion measures on the basis of evidence of criminality provided by the State in which the offence was committed or gathered, for example, by visiting Russian police delegations.

Whilst it is recognised that exclusion measures can be supplemented by other strategies designed to prevent and counter football related criminality, especially in the context of hosting a major international tournament, the availability of an effective and tough, albeit proportionate, legislative option can be crucial in influencing the behaviour of any individuals or groups who are immune to persuasion.

Good practice suggests that in reviewing exclusion options, account should be taken of the need to deter football-related criminality, prevent repeat criminality and, importantly, transform the behaviour of the individuals concerned. Excluding offenders from the wider

football experience, rather than just the match, has proven to be an effective means for achieving these objectives.

Consideration should also be given to making legal provision which would prevent travel to matches held in other Federal jurisdictions or national States and, importantly, including incentives designed to encourage rehabilitation through making provision for exemptions and early withdrawal of the exclusion measure.

Overall, the delegation is of the view that the current exclusion measures require strengthening if compliance with this Article is to be achieved.

**Recommendation 12: The national co-ordination group should consider the merits of, and scope for, extending the current exclusion measures to include provision for imposing banning orders on individuals who i) commit criminal or administrative offences outside of stadia in connection with a scheduled football event played in the Russian Federation, and/or ii) commit comparable offences in connection with football events played in another State. [status: important]**

#### **Article 11 - – International Co-operation**

Intent: Article 11 sets out a number of ways in which States are obliged to demonstrate a commitment to working in partnership on the international stage.

#### Compliance

Full compliance with this Article has already been demonstrated:

- the Ministry of Sport and MIA are already active and highly regarded participants in the meetings of the Standing Committee;
- the NFIP, MIA and World Cup 2018 Organising Committee are represented in the European group of football safety and security experts ("European Think Tank") and active participants in group discussions; and
- the MIA has already established a NFIP which is now fully operational and integrated into the wider European network of NFIPs.

These crucial steps have been taken in a relatively short time period which is highly impressive.

The establishment of the Russian NFIP is already proving to be mutually beneficial to the Russian Federation and the European-wide network of NFIPs. The effectiveness of the Russian NFIP, in terms of sharing information and arranging and hosting visiting police delegations, has received excellent feedback from European counterparts following operational missions. The NFIP is well placed to develop the expertise and deliver the wide range of functions envisaged in the Article and set out in associated EU and Council of Europe good practice documentation. It is the view of the delegation that the MIA should consider further investment in the NFIP, especially having in mind the central role this

structure will play in facilitating the international police cooperation for the FIFA 2018 World Cup and other future major sport events.

International co-operation naturally goes wider than policing issues, and the delegation would like to pay tribute to the extent to which this wider concept has been embraced by governmental and other agencies in the Russian Federation. This view was reinforced by high level discussions throughout the visit, all of which were conducted in an open, friendly, positive and comprehensive manner. There is a clear commitment on the part of the Russian Federation to share its experiences and expertise and, in turn, to take full account of available knowledge and experience (good and bad) gleaned from colleagues across Europe and beyond.

## **Section D Concluding Remarks and Summary of Recommendations**

### **D.1 Concluding Remarks**

In conclusion, the delegation would like to again stress that the report and accompanying Action Plan is intended to:

- support the authorities in the Russian Federation in developing an integrated approach to safety, security and service at football events based on established good practice customised to fit national circumstances;
- assess the extent to which the current safety and security arrangements are compliant with the Articles of the Convention and the good practices contained in Standing Committee Recommendation 1/2015; and
- assist and support the relevant public and private agencies engaged in the preparations for hosting the FIFA 2018 World Cup.

This report, and the accompanying appendices, aim to be comprehensive and accurate. However, it is recognised that some of the explanations provided in meetings and other discussions may have been misinterpreted. That is why the report retains a draft status until such times as the authorities in the Russian Federation have had opportunity to comment on points of accuracy.

However, the delegation is in no doubt of the commitment of all parties within the Russian Federation to work together in developing an integrated approach to safety, security and service in connection with football events (and other sports where appropriate). The delegation was also hugely impressed by the willingness of all parties to engage in open and frank discussion regarding all issues and the high degree of commitment to share experiences and expertise with their European counterparts.

The delegation would like to stress, once more, that the Standing Committee is committed to providing the governmental and football authorities, and other competent agencies, in the Russian Federation with further support in meeting the challenges that lie ahead. On the other hand, the Standing Committee would also welcome periodic feedback on the progress



made by the authorities in the Russian Federation concerning implementation of the recommendations in this report.

Finally, the delegation would like to thank, once again, all of the colleagues in the Russian Federation who provided much appreciated help and support and demonstrated impressive levels of patience throughout the visit.

## **D.2 Summary of Recommendations**

### **Article 2 - Aims of Convention**

Recommendation 1 : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of including a generic commitment in law towards delivering an integrated multi-agency approach to safety, security and service in connection with football events (inside and outside of stadia). [status: optional]

### **Article 3 - Definitions**

Recommendation 2 : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of adopting in law and in practice European-wide terminology and definitions in respect of the safety, security and service arrangements in connection with football events. [status: desirable]

### **Article 4 - Co-ordination Arrangements**

Recommendation 3 : As part of the review of the current legislative and regulatory framework, the national co-ordination group should consider i) designating a local (or regional) public authority with responsibility for establishing a local (or regional) multi-agency group tasked with responsibility for co-ordinating preparations for football events held in their locality (or region) and ii) including explicit legal provisions on the structure, role, and membership of such groups, taking into account established European good practice. [status: important]

### **Article 5 - Safety, Security and Service in Stadiums**

Recommendation 4 : As part of a wider legislative review, the national co-ordination group should consider imposing a requirement that all stadia hosting a professional football event should have in place a trained and assessed as competent stadium safety officer designated with responsibility for all in stadia safety and security arrangements. [status: important]

Recommendation 5 : As part of the legislative and regulatory review, the national co-ordination group should consider consolidating current provisions on the in-stadia role of public authorities, and establishing formal arrangements for the police or other public agency to assume responsibility in the event of an actual or potential emergency scenario or other significant public safety or security incident. [status: desirable]

Recommendation 6 : The national co-ordination group should consider refining the current legislative framework to establish an independent, public authority tasked with responsibility

for: i) issuing standards on the physical, technical and safety management arrangements in stadia hosting professional football events; ii) monitoring application of those standards; and iii) issuing stadium safety certificates to all stadia in compliance with the national standards. [status: desirable]

Recommendation 7 : The Sports Ministry, in consultation with the Russian Football Union, should consider recommending or requiring venue owners to undertake an access audit and develop a plan for complying with minimum standards in respect of stadium access and facilities for disabled spectators. [status: desirable]

### **Article 7 – Contingency and Emergency Planning**

Recommendation 8 : The national co-ordination group should review the current arrangements for preparing and testing comprehensive multi-agency stadium contingency and public authority emergency plans for incidents at or nearby stadia hosting football events. [status: desirable]

### **Article 8 – Engagement with Supporters and Local Communities**

Recommendation 9 : The Football Union, in consultation with the Russian Football Premier League and the Association of Russian Professional Football Leagues, should review the current SLO arrangements, to ensure that i) the positions of club safety officer and club supporter liaison officer are not occupied by the same person; ii) a national team SLO (team) is appointed; iii) any individual felt to pose an ongoing risk of violence or disorder is disqualified from being a SLO; and iv) SLOs from different countries be invited to exchange experiences and good practices with their Russian counterparts. [status: desirable]

Recommendation 10 : The national co-ordination group should encourage all stakeholders to consider the scope for developing preventative, social and educational projects connected with football events at both national and local level. In particular, activities aimed at children and junior supporters should incorporate the promotion of values such as respect, tolerance, anti-violence and non-discrimination. [status: desirable]

### **Article 9 – Police Strategies and Operations**

Recommendation 11 : The Ministry of Internal Affairs should continue to discuss with European colleagues the international police-cooperation and policing preparations in connection with the FIFA 2018 World Cup, taking into account issues highlighted in the visit report. [status: ongoing]

## **Article 10 - Prevention and Sanctioning of Offending Behaviour**

Recommendation 12: The national co-ordination group should consider the merits of, and scope for, extending the current exclusion measures to include provision for imposing banning orders on individuals who i) commit criminal or administrative offences outside of stadia in connection with a scheduled football event played in the Russian Federation, and/or ii) commit comparable offences in connection with football events played in another State.  
[status: important]



## APPENDIX A

## DRAFT ACTION PLAN

## REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE MONITORING VISIT

**Based on the Council of Europe Convention  
on an Integrated Safety, Security and Service Approach  
at Football Matches and Other Sports Events (CETS 218)**

This (Draft) Action Plan incorporates recommendations included in the monitoring visit report undertaken by the Standing Committee on 20-21 May 2016.

The purpose of the monitoring visit, and the recommendations within this Action Plan, is to support the Russian Federation:

- demonstrate compliance with the new Convention;
- prepare for hosting the 2018 World Cup; and
- ensure that football stadia (and other sports venues) provide a safe, secure and welcoming experience for all spectators.

In so doing, full account is taken of the established good practices on safety, security and service contained in Standing Committee Recommendation 1/2015.

To assist in consideration of the 12 recommendations, each has been provisionally allocated a status of "important", "desirable", "optional" or "ongoing" along with a tentatively proposed timescale target for implementation. The recommendations are presented under the relevant Convention Article.

For ease of reference, the term "football events" is used throughout the report and in this Action Plan. However, where appropriate, the delegation's observations and findings can also be applied to other major and international sports falling within the scope of the Convention.

**Article 2 - Aims of Convention**

Recommendation 1 : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of including a generic commitment in law towards delivering an integrated multi-agency approach to safety, security and service in connection with football events (inside and outside of stadia). **[Status: Optional - Target: May 2017]**

Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Article 3 - Definitions</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Recommendation 2 : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of adopting in law and in practice European-wide terminology and definitions in respect of the safety, security and service arrangements in connection with football events. <b>[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>Article 4 - Co-ordination Arrangements</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Recommendation 3 : As part of the review of the current legislative and regulatory framework, the national co-ordination group should consider i) designating a local (or regional) public authority with responsibility for establishing a local (or regional) multi-agency group tasked with responsibility for co-ordinating preparations for football events held in their locality (or region) and ii) including explicit legal provisions on the structure, role, and membership of such groups, taking into account established European good practice. <b>[Status: Important - Target: December 2018]</b> |
| Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>Article 5 - Safety, Security and Service in Stadiums</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Recommendation 4 : As part of a wider legislative review, the national co-ordination group should consider imposing a requirement that all stadia hosting a professional football event should have in place a trained and assessed as competent stadium safety officer designated with responsibility for all in stadia safety and security arrangements. <b>[Status: Important - Target: December 2018]</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Recommendation 5 : As part of the legislative and regulatory review, the national co-ordination group should consider consolidating current provisions on the in-stadia role of public authorities, and establishing formal arrangements for the police or other public agency to assume responsibility in the event of an actual or potential emergency scenario or other significant public safety or security incident. <b>[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]</b>                                                                                                                                          |
| Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Recommendation 6 : The national co-ordination group should consider refining the current legislative framework to establish an independent, public authority tasked with responsibility for: i) issuing standards on the physical, technical and safety management arrangements in stadia hosting professional football events; ii) monitoring                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| application of those standards; and iii) issuing stadium safety certificates to all stadia in compliance with the national standards. <b>[Status: Desirable - Target: December 2018]</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Recommendation 7 : The Sports Ministry, in consultation with the Russian Football Union, should consider recommending or requiring venue owners to undertake an access audit and develop a plan for complying with minimum standards in respect of stadium access and facilities for disabled spectators. <b>[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Name and response of the Sports Ministry .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Article 7 – Contingency and Emergency Planning</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Recommendation 8 : The national co-ordination group should review the current arrangements for preparing and testing comprehensive multi-agency stadium contingency and public authority emergency plans for incidents at or nearby stadia hosting football events. <b>[Status: Desirable - Target: September 2017]</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| <b>Article 8 – Engagement with Supporters and Local Communities</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Recommendation 9 : The Russian Football Union, in consultation with the Russian Football Premier League and the Association of Russian Professional Football Leagues, should review the current SLO arrangements, to ensure that i) the positions of club safety officer and club supporter liaison officer are not occupied by the same person; ii) a national team SLO (team) is appointed; iii) any individual felt to pose an ongoing risk of violence or disorder is disqualified from being a SLO; and iv) SLOs from different countries be invited to exchange experiences and good practices with their Russian counterparts. <b>[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]</b> |
| Response of the Russian Football Union .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| Recommendation 10 : The national co-ordination group should encourage all stakeholders to consider the scope for developing preventative, social and educational projects connected with football events at both national and local level. In particular, activities aimed at children and junior supporters should incorporate the promotion of values such as respect, tolerance, anti-violence and non-discrimination. <b>[Status: Desirable - Target Ongoing ]</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Article 9 – Police Strategies and Operations</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| <p>Recommendation 11 : The Ministry of Internal Affairs should continue to discuss with European colleagues the international police-cooperation and policing preparations in connection with the FIFA 2018 World Cup, taking into account issues highlighted in the visit report. <b>[Status and Timescale : Ongoing]</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| <p>Response of the Ministry of Interior .....</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| <b>Article 10 - Prevention and Sanctioning of Offending Behaviour</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| <p>Recommendation 12: The national co-ordination group should consider the merits of, and scope for, extending the current exclusion measures to include provision for imposing banning orders on individuals who i) commit criminal or administrative offences outside of stadia in connection with a scheduled football event played in the Russian Federation, and/or ii) commit comparable offences in connection with football events played in another State. <b>[Status: Important - Target: May 2017]</b></p> |
| <p>Name and response of the designated lead governmental authority .....</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| <p>Any Other Remarks .....</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |



## **APPENDIX B**

### **Council of Europe Convention on an Integrated Safety, Security and Service Approach at Football Matches and Other Sports Events (CETS 218)**

#### **Policy Articles**

##### **Article 1 – Scope**

1 The Parties shall, within the limits of their respective constitutional provisions, take the necessary steps to give effect to the provisions of this Convention in respect of football matches or tournaments played in their territory by professional football clubs and national teams.

2 The Parties may apply the provisions of this Convention to other sports or sports events hosted in their territory, including non-professional football matches, especially in circumstances where safety or security risks are involved.

##### **Article 2 – Aim**

The aim of this Convention is to provide a safe, secure and welcoming environment at football matches and other sports events. To that end, the Parties shall:

a adopt an integrated, multi-agency and balanced approach towards safety, security and service, based upon an ethos of effective local, national and international partnerships and co-operation;

b ensure that all public and private agencies, and other stakeholders, recognise that safety, security and service provision cannot be considered in isolation, and can have a direct influence on delivery of the other two components;

c take account of good practices in developing an integrated approach to safety, security and service.

##### **Article 3 – Definitions**

For the purposes of this Convention, the terms:

a “safety measures” shall mean any measure designed and implemented with the primary aim of protecting the health and well-being of individuals and groups who attend, or participate in, a football match or other sports event, inside or outside of the stadium, or who reside or work in the vicinity of the event;

b “security measures” shall mean any measure designed and implemented with the primary aim of preventing, reducing the risk and/or responding to any violence or other criminal activity or disorder committed in connection with a football or other sports event, inside or outside of a stadium;

c “service measures” shall mean any measure designed and implemented with the primary aim of making individuals and groups feel comfortable, appreciated and welcome when attending a football match or other sports event, inside or outside of a stadium;

d “agency” shall mean any public or private body with a constitutional, legislative, regulatory or other responsibility in respect of the preparation and implementation of any safety, security or service measure in connection with a football match or other sports event, inside or outside of a stadium;

e “stakeholder” shall mean spectators, local communities or other interested parties who do not have legislative or regulatory responsibilities but who can play an important role in helping to make football matches or other sports events safe, secure and welcoming, inside and outside of stadiums;

f “integrated approach” shall mean recognition that, irrespective of their primary purpose, safety, security and service measures at football matches and other sports events invariably overlap, are interrelated in terms of impact, need to be balanced and cannot be designed or implemented in isolation;

g “multi-agency integrated approach” shall mean recognition that the roles and actions of each agency involved in football or other sports planning and operational activities must be co-ordinated, complementary, proportionate and designed and implemented as part of a comprehensive safety, security and service strategy;

h “good practices” shall mean measures applied in one or more countries that have proven to be very effective in meeting the stated aim or objective;

i “relevant agency” shall mean a body (public or private) involved in the organisation and/or management of a football match or other sports event held inside or outside of a sports stadium.

#### **Article 4 – Domestic co-ordination arrangements**

1 The Parties shall ensure that national and local co-ordination arrangements are established for the purpose of developing and implementing a multi-agency integrated approach to safety, security and service at national and local level.

2 The Parties shall ensure that co-ordination arrangements are established to identify, analyse and evaluate the risks pertaining to safety, security and services, and to allow the sharing of updated information on risk assessment.

3 The Parties shall ensure that the co-ordination arrangements involve all key public and private agencies responsible for safety, security and service matters connected with the event, both inside and outside of the venue where the event is taking place.

4 The Parties shall ensure that the co-ordination arrangements take full account of the safety, security and service principles set out in this Convention and that national and local strategies

are developed, regularly evaluated and refined in the light of national and international experience and good practices.

5 The Parties shall ensure that national legal, regulatory or administrative frameworks clarify the respective roles and responsibilities of the relevant agencies and that these roles are complementary, consistent with an integrated approach and widely understood at strategic and operational levels.

#### **Article 5 – Safety, security and service in sports stadiums**

1 The Parties shall ensure that national legal, regulatory or administrative frameworks require event organisers, in consultation with all partner agencies, to provide a safe and secure environment for all participants and spectators.

2 The Parties shall ensure that the competent public authorities put in place regulations or arrangements to guarantee the effectiveness of stadium licensing procedures, certification arrangements and safety regulations in general and ensure their application, monitoring and enforcement.

3 The Parties shall require the relevant agencies to ensure that stadium design, infrastructure and associated crowd management arrangements comply with national and international standards and good practices.

4 The Parties shall encourage the relevant agencies to ensure that stadiums provide an inclusive and welcoming environment for all sections of society, including children, the elderly and those with disabilities, and incorporate, in particular, the provision of appropriate sanitary and refreshment facilities and good viewing conditions for all spectators.

5 The Parties shall ensure that stadiums' operating arrangements are comprehensive; make provision for effective liaison with the police, emergency services and partner agencies; and incorporate clear policies and procedures on matters that might impact on crowd management and associated safety and security risks, in particular:

- the use of pyrotechnics;
- any violent or other prohibited behaviour; and
- any racist or other discriminatory behaviour.

6 The Parties shall require the relevant agencies to ensure that all personnel, from the public or private sectors, involved in making football matches and other sports events safe, secure and welcoming are equipped and trained to fulfil their functions effectively and in an appropriate manner.

7 The Parties shall encourage their competent agencies to highlight the need for players, coaches or other representatives of participating teams to act in accordance with key sporting principles, such as tolerance, respect and fair play, and recognise that acting in a violent, racist or other provocative manner can have a negative impact on spectator behaviour.

## **Article 6 – Safety, security and service in public places**

1 The Parties shall encourage all agencies and stakeholders involved in organising football matches and other sports events in public spaces, including the municipal authorities, police, local communities and businesses, supporter representatives, football clubs and national associations, to work together, notably in respect of:

a assessing risk and preparing appropriate preventative measures designed to minimise disruption and provide reassurances to the local community and businesses, in particular those located in the vicinity of where the event is taking place or public viewing areas;

b creating a safe, secure and welcoming environment in public spaces that are designated for supporters to gather before and after the event, or locations in which supporters can be expected to frequent of their own volition, and along transit routes to and from the city and/or to and from the stadium.

2 The Parties shall ensure that risk assessment and safety and security measures take account of the journey to and from the stadium.

## **Article 7 – Contingency and emergency planning**

The Parties shall ensure that multi-agency contingency and emergency plans are developed, and that those plans are tested and refined in regular joint exercises. National legal, regulatory or administrative frameworks shall make clear which agency is responsible for initiating, supervising and certifying the exercises.

## **Article 8 – Engagement with supporters and local communities**

1 The Parties shall encourage all agencies to develop and pursue a policy of proactive and regular communication with key stakeholders, including supporter representatives and local communities, based on the principle of dialogue, and with the aim of generating a partnership ethos and positive co-operation as well as identifying solutions to potential problems.

2 The Parties shall encourage all public and private agencies and other stakeholders, including local communities and supporter representatives, to initiate or participate in multi-agency social, educational, crime-prevention and other community projects designed to foster mutual respect and understanding, especially among supporters, sports clubs and associations as well as agencies responsible for safety and security.

## **Article 9 – Police strategies and operations**

1 The Parties shall ensure that policing strategies are developed, regularly evaluated and refined in the light of national and international experience and good practices, and are consistent with the wider, integrated approach to safety, security and service.

2 The Parties shall ensure that policing strategies take account of good practices including, in particular: intelligence gathering, continuous risk assessment, risk-based deployment, proportionate intervention to prevent the escalation of risk or disorder, effective dialogue

with supporters and the wider community, and evidence gathering of criminal activity as well as the sharing of such evidence with the competent authorities responsible for prosecution.

3 The Parties shall ensure that the police works in partnership with organisers, supporters, local communities and other stakeholders in making football matches and other sports events safe, secure and welcoming for all concerned.

#### **Article 10 – Prevention and sanctioning of offending behaviour**

1 The Parties shall take all possible measures to reduce the risk of individuals or groups participating in, or organising incidents of violence or disorder.

2 The Parties shall, in accordance with national and international law, ensure that effective exclusion arrangements, appropriate to the character and location of risk, are in place to deter and prevent incidents of violence or disorder.

3 The Parties shall, in accordance with national and international law, co-operate in seeking to ensure that individuals committing offences abroad receive appropriate sanctions, either in the country where the offence is committed or in their country of residence or citizenship.

4 Where appropriate, and in accordance with national and international law, the Parties shall consider empowering the judicial or administrative authorities responsible to impose sanctions on individuals who have caused or contributed to incidents of football-related violence and/or disorder, with the possibility of imposing restrictions on travel to football events held in another country.

#### **Article 11 – International co-operation**

1 The Parties shall co-operate closely on all matters covered by this Convention and related matters, in order to maximise collaboration in respect of international events, share experiences and participate in the development of good practices.

2 The Parties shall, without prejudice to existing national provisions, in particular the allocation of powers among the different services and authorities, set up or designate a National Football Information Point within the police force (NFIP). The NFIP shall:

a act as the direct and single contact point for exchanging general (strategic, operational and tactical) information in connection with a football match with an international dimension;

b exchange personal data in accordance with the applicable domestic and international rules;

c facilitate, co-ordinate or organise the implementation of international police co-operation in connection with football matches with an international dimension;

d be capable of fulfilling efficiently and promptly the tasks assigned to it.

3 The Parties shall further ensure that the NFIP provides a national source of expertise regarding football policing operations, supporter dynamics and associated safety and security risks.

4 Each State Party shall notify the Committee on Safety and Security at Sports Events, created by this Convention, in writing, of the name and contact details of its NFIP, and any subsequent changes with regard to it.

5 The Parties shall co-operate at international level in respect of sharing good practices and information on preventative, educational and informative projects and the establishment of partnerships with all agencies involved in the delivery

## APPENDIX C

### Technical Report and Observation of Safety Operations at the Lokomotiv Stadium

#### Summary

##### Background

- The match was the final round (Round 30) of the Premier League season between two club sides with little at stake.
- The match was designated as a low risk in terms of public order.
- This was reflected in the attendance which was reported as 8,000 in a 30,000 capacity stadium, of whom 150 were visiting (away) supporters.
- The Lokomotiv stadium was reconstructed in 2002.
- The stadium is extremely well equipped with modern safety features and affords spectators with high standards of facilities to enhance the customer experience.
- The control room is well equipped and capable of hosting representatives of all the key club and public authority bodies. The only drawback is that it is located within the stadium and has no view of the playing area or stands, though it is well served by an effective and sophisticated CCTV system enabling events to be monitored in real time

##### Safety and Security Personnel

- The key safety and security managers in attendance were the Premier League delegate (representing the event organiser), stadium security officer, supported by 3 deputies, the police match commander, chief fire and rescue service officer, head of the in-house fire team and the chief ambulance service officer. [Note: the terms used here are generic in character as used across Europe].
- The number of stadium safety and security personnel was reported as 418 stewards
- The number of police officers deployed outside of the stadium and at first security entry points was reported as 300 police officers, plus 12 mounted officers and a squadron of tourist police officers (specialists in languages and spectator liaison duties).
- No police were deployed inside the stadium.
- Although the terrorist risk throughout Europe is high, the number of police officers deployed was considered excessive given the associated low risk of the event.

##### Lokomotiv Stadium

- The infrastructure of the stadium was well maintained.
- The stadium electricity supply is provided by 4 separate power lines, which are unlikely to trip, and are backed up by an emergency generator.
- The Public address (PA) system was clearly audible in all parts of the stadium
- There was a direct link from the control room to the commercial PA with safety override.
- The CCTV was in place and operated by trained personnel with 3 operators monitoring a total of 139 cameras.

- The introduction of new face recognition CCTV facility was undergoing tests.
- The radios of stewards, supervisors, medical staff, and police were working correctly, there being 8 different channels in use with the stadium security officer team in contact with all.
- All designated fire doors/closing devices were found to be working effectively
- The fire alarm system was checked pre-match and found to be working effectively.
- Means of escape routes throughout the stadium were kept clear.
- Exit doors/gates could be opened without difficulty with no unauthorised holding devices present.
- Highly visible emergency exit and exit route signage was in place
- Stairways were slip resistance, well lit, free of trip hazards and in good repair.
- All public areas were clear of accumulated litter, with adequate provision for waste storage/disposal in place.
- All exit doors and gates were as per stadium plan and properly marked?
- Clear exit signage was observed throughout except the wheelchair accommodation area.
- All exits were unlocked and staffed.
- All barriers and separating elements were sound and risk free.
- The stadium environment was free of any potential missiles.
- There were no defective structural elements
- Directional / advice signs were in place and visible
- Medical staff were briefed and their roles designated as part of pre match briefing
- Number of first aiders was two ambulances with paramedics and an extra ambulance just for players 3 in total.
- First Aid posts were not clearly identified but ambulances was visible on 3 corners of the stadium
- Accident records were maintained and inspected.
- Fire safety plans were maintained in the control room and inspected.

### Stadium Operations

- The match day operation was well planned with effective safety equipment in the control room, the police and safety management team worked well together, each understanding their respective roles and responsibilities. The stadium safety management team undertook and recorded 3 pre-event safety checks and stewards were observed searching stadium seating areas.
- An emergency power check was undertaken and recorded.
- Entry flow rates were satisfactory - however there was a slow build up of spectators on entry due to robust searching by police.
- Numbers of spectators admitted to each section of the stadium was recorded and monitored in the control room.
- Maximum capacity was within permitted numbers in place for all stands and sections
- In view of the low attendance, some stadium areas were closed to the public.



- All turnstiles worked satisfactorily with pilot face recognition linked to turnstile entry to ensure no banned supporters entered.
- Stewards were easily identifiable and a central record of ID numbers were recorded and maintained for inspection as and when necessary or appropriate.
- All stewards were trained, qualified, instructed & briefed, and aware of the emergency alert and response arrangements.
- All gangways were kept clear and stewards were present on each vomitory.
- There was persistent standing behind the home end throughout, however no action was taken or necessary because the attendance was low, seating areas were relatively sparsely occupied and the crowd was in good humour.
- No pinch points evident from crowd observation or scrutiny of stadium plans.
- No signs of crowd discomfort or unrest though crowd density was low.
- Quick exiting was possible, although most spectators stayed behind for end of season rituals with the team.
- Appropriate plans were in place for crowd segregation where required - however, there was only 150 away support who were kept separate inside the stadium.

#### Access for Disabled Spectators

The one negative issue arising from the technical inspection of the Lokomotiv stadium centred on the accommodation and facilities for wheelchair users and other disable people which was poor. There were only 8 designated wheelchair spaces with acceptable viewing sightlines, which were served by two accessible toilets and a steward to provide refreshments from inaccessible level. Only two wheelchair spaces were occupied. This reflected the low interest in the fixture, however if the stadium was full for a highly appealing fixture then the accommodation provided would almost certainly be insufficient, especially if a proactive policy of accessibility for all is pursued.

**Proposals regarding the stadium safety and security arrangements in the Russian Federation are included as Recommendations 4-7 in the covering report.**

## **APPENDIX D**

### **Role of Supporter Liaison Officers (SLOs) in the Russian Federation**

#### Compliance with UEFA Regulations

The RFU has fully implemented the UEFA requirement on football clubs competing in UEFA competitions to appoint a Supporter Liaison Officer (SLO) as laid down in Article 35 of the UEFA Club Licensing and Financial Fair Play Regulations.

#### Application to Domestic Matches

The RFU has extended the SLO requirement to cover all clubs competing in the top two tiers of Russian football by including a comparable provision in its domestic club licensing arrangements. As of the 2015-16 season, a total of 36 clubs (16 in the RFPL and 20 in the RNFL) are required to appoint at least one SLO.

#### Implementation

Overall responsibility for implementation of the SLO licensing regulation and compliance therewith rests with the RFU. However, at club level day-to-day operational responsibility has been delegated to the supporter liaison departments at the RFPL and the NFL, who liaise with the SLOs at the clubs in their respective leagues.

The RFU supporter liaison department focuses primarily on working at matches of the Russian national teams and oversees the “organisation of public order and security operations”. There is no dedicated SLO for the senior national team.

#### SLO Training

In terms of training and development, the RFU supporter department holds two seminars a year in conjunction with the corresponding departments at the leagues. These seminars are attended by club SLOs, either jointly from both leagues or separately by leagues. After the seminars the RFU carries out certification of the SLOs based on various qualification tests and set tasks.

#### SLO Remit

The position of the SLO, as determined by the Russian club licensing regulations, is consistent with the roles and functions recommended in the UEFA SLO handbook. The regulations go somewhat further than those of other national associations in that they require the SLO job description to contain 16 paragraphs outlining the main tasks to be performed. The RFPL has also developed a set of recommendations for club SLOs.

### SLO Discussions

During the visit delegation had the opportunity to discuss supporter liaison issues with representatives of the RFU and the RFPL, the lead SLOs of Lokomotiv Moscow and FC Mordovia Saransk, and the safety officer of Lokomotiv Moscow. However, as no conversations were held with supporter representatives, some important insights may not have come to the attention of the delegation.

### Match Observation

SLOs of both clubs were in attendance at the pre-match organisation meeting and both provided input to the meeting on the relationship between the fans of the two clubs and the various activities planned by the home supporters on the day. The lead SLO of Lokomotiv Moscow was also present at the pre-match briefing of the police deployed on the day.

Following the pre-match meetings, a visit was paid to the Lokomotiv Moscow "fan house", which is situated just a short walk from the stadium. The fan house is where the club SLOs have their offices and it is also used by fans as a meeting point and for various activities, such as preparing tifo displays, sewing banners, etc.

Unfortunately, the match was played in a very low-key atmosphere in front of a relatively sparse crowd. As such, there was no opportunity to observe the SLOs in a rather more challenging environment.

### Discussion with Lokomotiv Moscow SLO

Lokomotiv currently employ four full-time SLOs. The lead SLO has been in office since 2009, a year before the UEFA Executive Committee approved the adoption of Article 35 in the UEFA Club Licensing Regulations and a full three years before said article entered into effect.

Four full-time SLOs represents an above-average commitment to the role on the part of the club and is matched only by a handful of clubs in the Bundesliga in Germany, the country generally regarded as embodying best practice when it comes to supporter liaison.

The lead Lokomotiv SLO said that he had an excellent working relationship with other club employees, in particular with the safety officer. He was responsible for overall co-ordination of the supporter liaison work at this club, while his three colleagues looked after specific areas of work, such as dealing with the club's ultra support, dealing with "problem fans" and other general tasks.

All members of the SLO team were recruited from the fan base rather than being internal club appointments. The lead SLO was a former leader of the fans. According to the lead SLO this meant that he and his colleagues were accepted by the supporters and had a constructive dialogue with them.

Contacts with his colleagues at other clubs were reported as being good. All were willing to help each other out and understood that they were there to achieve the same things. He claimed there had been reduction in tensions in recent years.

In terms of the relationship with the police, the lead SLO said he was known to the police in all the cities across Russia which host a Premier League club and that the interaction between them was good. This had contributed to a significant reduction in the number of incidents involving fans at Lokomotiv matches.

The Lokomotiv SLO said he felt confident to carry out the tasks entrusted in him because he had attended all the training courses staged by the RFU/RFPL and had obtained all the necessary certificates.

#### Discussion with FC Mordovia Saransk SLO

A brief exchange with the SLO of FC Mordovia Saransk after the pre-match organisation meeting revealed that he also has other functions at the club, including that of the safety officer. While this reflects a European-wide temptation for many smaller clubs with limited financial means, it is not consistent with UEFA recommendation in the 2011 SLO handbook which highlight that these two areas of responsibility should be treated separately at both club and national level.

**Proposals regarding the SLO arrangements in the Russian Federation are included as Recommendation 9 in the covering report.**

## APPENDIX E

### FIFA 2018 World Cup: Policing Preparations

The commitment demonstrated by the MIA in active participation in the work of European Think Tank and NFIP network, and the CoE Standing Committee is highly impressive and a tangible demonstration of a willingness to adopt and adapt established European good practices in policing major football events, such as the FIFA 2018 World Cup.

The potential importance of this commitment cannot be exaggerated in terms of reducing and managing risks. There are a range of inter-related strands to the good practice model which the MIA are actively pursuing.

#### International Police Co-operation

The proposal to base international police co-operation arrangements on customised bilateral protocols is especially welcome. Such protocols have proven to be hugely important at previous tournaments, not least in terms of clarifying a wide range of practical matters well in advance of the tournament. The model protocol included in the draft revised European (football) handbook, which is based on extensive previous experience, provides a good starting point for the MIA.

The prospect of negotiating such protocols can appear daunting in resource terms but it is a sound investment and can be rationalised to reduce the logistical burden. For example, a standard format and content can be prepared and applied to all non-European States who qualify for the tournament finals. These can be pursued via Interpol or diplomatic channels.

In terms of European States who qualify, preliminary discussions on the content of protocols and the process to be applied (it varies across Europe in accordance with national law and operating arrangements) can be pursued in discussion within the European Think Tank and NFIP network.

In terms of the content, experience demonstrates that to be of value, the protocols need to be based on a risk assessment process, incorporating consideration of logistical and operational imperatives, such as number of supporters likely to travel and potential behavioural considerations, and visiting police delegation preferences and practices on matters like uniforms, weapons, evidence gathering and supporter liaison. Adopting a policy of equality (one-size fits all approach) is not appropriate given that risks are intrinsically unequal.

In terms of maximising the benefit from resources allocated for international police co-operation, it would be operationally and financially sound for the size of visiting police delegations to reflect a risk assessment process with smaller delegations invited from those States (especially outside of Europe) where the potential risk is minimal. In effect, to use the resources in the manner that will best support host police operations.

There are other important international police co-operation preparations, like police information co-ordination centres etc., which can be resolved at an early stage and facilitated by MIA participation in the European experts group (i.e. Think Tank).

### Policing Strategy

There are a wide range of good practice options set out in EU and CoE documentation which is available to, and which is already being actively explored by, the MIA. For example, European experience evidences that policing strategies based on proactive engagement (dialogue) with supporters, ongoing dynamic risk assessment, proportionate police deployment, and targeted interventions can significantly reduce the risk of escalation of tensions and assist in isolating the influence of any persons seeking confrontation.

Adopting such good practices can pose challenges, not least in terms of transforming the culture of frontline officers, and there will inevitably be a transitional phase, however, the monitoring visit evidenced that the MIA is making rapid strides on all fronts. European experts stand ready to provide whatever support and advice may be required. MIA participation in the European Experts Group (Think Tank) provides the ideal forum for discussing all related matters and facilitating tangible support.

In the meantime, the following observations of the visit delegation may be of interest and value:

### Training

MIA could initiate a discussion within the Think Tank about the provision of training on European good practices for match commanders, football intelligence officers and spotters;

### Tourist Police

The tourist police concept is an excellent initiative. The officers could play a key liaison role at stadia, fan zones and tourist areas during the World Cup, and at international football matches generally.

It would be desirable if the tourist police were more visible in appearance (uniform or coloured vests/bibs) in order to be readily identifiable to visiting supporters. They could also be encouraged to play a higher profile and more proactive dialogue and liaison role in terms of risk based deployment in areas where supporters are expected to gather.

### Mounted Police

As part of wider crowd management activity, mounted police officers could also play an important supporter communication role in the environs of stadia and in city centres. To maximise the potential impact of their role, it would be desirable for many/some of these officers to have some basic language skills (notably English, which is widely understood by supporters from all countries), and be trained in dialogue/liason techniques.

### Observation of Police Operation

The delegation had the following observations regarding the policing operation at the Lokomotiv match, which might have significance for policing the FIFA 2018 World Cup::

- the number of police personnel deployed was high and seemingly not determined solely on the basis of a risk assessment;
- this is understandable given the relatively recent enhancement of stewarding responsibilities inside stadia - transitional arrangements are inevitable and mutually beneficial;
- the police officers on duty did not appear trained, or were reluctant, to engage in welcoming and friendly dialogue with spectators - an approach that can engender a positive environment within stadia;
- the pre-match police briefing was highly professional and comprehensive, although there was an absence of briefing on co-ordination with stewards in the event of an incident, and no emphasis on the distinctive roles and responsibilities of police and stewards;
- the components of the policing operation at the outer perimeter, and outside of the stadium complex, such as metro stations were explained in an explicit and effective manner;
- the policing presence between the first and second perimeter seemed disproportionate to the risk and the officers concerned appeared to be monitoring events (and ready to support stewards if necessary), but not in a positive or interactive manner which, in more demanding circumstances, could have been a missed opportunity to influence supporter perceptions and behaviour;
- if it is not intended to use frontline officers in this way, then consideration could be given to deploying the units out of sight but ready to intervene if necessary;
- if the intention is to deploy such units in the stadium complex, then there would be benefit in the officers being trained to work in small groups and in supporter and dialogue techniques;

### Counter Terrorism Operations

An increasing dilemma confronting all policing football operations across Europe centres on finding the appropriate balance between CT, public order and public safety imperatives. The reality is that these imperatives can conflict. Extensive searching on entry for CT purposes can and does result in long delays which can generate public order and public safety risks. There are no easy or fail-safe solutions. It must be the preserve of match commanders to determine the entry strategy on the basis of a risk assessment which takes account of all the relevant risks. What is evident is that friendly and welcoming interaction with queuing spectators can reduce tensions and associated risks.

**Proposals regarding the policing preparations for hosting the FIFA 2018 World Cup are included as Recommendation 11 in the covering report.**

## APPENDIX F

### PROGRAMME OF THE MONITORING VISIT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE 20-21 May, 2016, Moscow

*19 May (Thursday)*

Arrival of the Monitoring group to the Russian Federation

Transfer from the airport to the hotel

*20 May (Friday)*

- 09.00 – 09.30** Transfer from the hotels to the Ministry of internal affairs of the Russian Federation
- 09.30 – 11.00** Meeting at the Ministry of internal affairs of the Russian Federation with the Main Directorate of the Moscow department of the Ministry of internal affairs *“Public order measures taken by the Ministry of internal affairs in 2015”*  
*“Security preparations of the Ministry of internal affairs of the Russian Federation for the 2018 FIFA World Cup”*  
*“Security preparations of the Main Directorate of the Moscow Department of the Ministry of internal affairs of the Russian Federation for the 2018 FIFA World Cup”*
- 11.00 – 12.00** Transfer from the Ministry of internal affairs to the 1<sup>st</sup> operative police regiment of the Main Directorate of the Moscow department of the Ministry of internal affairs
- 12.00 – 13.00** Acquaintance with the activities of the 1<sup>st</sup> operative police regiment
- 13.00 – 14.00** Transfer from the 1<sup>st</sup> operative police regiment to the FC Spartak stadium “Otkritie Arena”
- 14.00 – 15.00** Lunch
- 15.00 – 15.15** Press scrum
- 15.15 – 17.00** Round table with the Ministry of sport of the Russian Federation, ANO “Organizing committee “Russia-2018” and Ministry of internal affairs of the Russian Federation  
*“Legislation of the Russian Federation in the sphere of spectator violence and misbehaviour at sport events; coordination of activities at the national level”*  
*“Measures taken by the Organizing committee against spectator violence and misbehaviour for the 2018 FIFA World Cup”*



|                      |                                                                                                                               |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>17.00 – 17.15</b> | Coffee break                                                                                                                  |
| <b>17.15 – 18.00</b> | Trip around the FC Spartak stadium “Otkritie Arena”                                                                           |
| <b>18.00 – 18.15</b> | Coffee break                                                                                                                  |
| <b>18.15 – 19.00</b> | Meeting with security officers of FC Spartak (Moscow), FC Zenit (Saint-Petersburg), FC Lokomotiv (Moscow), FC Dinamo (Moscow) |
| <b>19.00 – 19.30</b> | Transfer from the FC Spartak stadium “Otkritie Arena” to the restaurant                                                       |
| <b>19.30 – 20.30</b> | Dinner                                                                                                                        |
| <b>20.30 – 21.00</b> | Transfer to the hotels                                                                                                        |

*21 May (Saturday)*

|                      | <i>Group 1</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                      | <i>Group 2</i>                                                                                 |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>09.30 – 10.00</b> | Transfer from the hotels to the Russian Football Union headquarters                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | <b>08.45 – 09.30</b> | Transfer from the hotels to the “Lokomotiv” stadium                                            |
| <b>10.00 – 10.15</b> | Visit to the Russian Football Union museum                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <b>09.30 – 10.00</b> | Participation in the pre-match meeting                                                         |
| <b>10.15 – 11.30</b> | Round table at the Russian Football Union with the Ministry of sport of the Russian Federation, NP “Russian Football Premier- League” & Russian Fanembassy<br><i>“Training of stewards”</i><br><i>“Activities of the Russian Fan-embassy on the national and international level”</i> | <b>10.00 – 10.30</b> | Participation in the stewards’ briefing                                                        |
| <b>11.30 – 11.45</b> | Coffee break                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | <b>10.30 – 11.45</b> | Acquaintance with the stadium infrastructure and security measures, including the control room |

|                      |                                                                                                                            |                      |                                                |
|----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| <b>11.45 – 12.30</b> | Transfer to<br>“Lokomotiv” stadium                                                                                         | <b>11.45 – 12.00</b> | Ingress of the<br>supporters to the<br>stadium |
| <b>12.00 – 16.00</b> | Lunch,<br>Russian Football Premier-League Gameweek 30 match between<br>FC “Lokomotiv” (Moscow) and FC “Mordovia” (Saransk) |                      |                                                |
| <b>16.00 – 16.40</b> | Transfer from the stadium to the hotels                                                                                    |                      |                                                |
| <b>16.40</b>         | Stay at the hotels, free time                                                                                              |                      |                                                |

*22 May (Sunday)*

Transfer to the airport

## **PART 3**

# **Comments by the Russian Federation**

The Russian Federation would like to take this opportunity to express gratitude to the Secretariat of the TR-V Standing Committee, the experts of the monitoring group and the members of the TR-V Standing Committee for their support and readiness to continue our cooperation in the sphere of safety and security at sporting events and we hope for future beneficial cooperation.

**DRAFT COMPLETED ACTION PLAN**  
**Filled with the answers of the Russian authorities (February 2017)**

**Based on the Council of Europe Convention  
on an Integrated Safety, Security and Service Approach  
at Football Matches and Other Sports Events (CETS 218)**

**Article 2 - Aims of Convention**

**Recommendation 1** : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of including a generic commitment in law towards delivering an integrated multi-agency approach to safety, security and service in connection with football events (inside and outside of stadia). **[Status: Optional - Target: May 2017]**

**Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:**

Article 3 of the Federal Law dated as 04.12.2007 No. 329-FZ “Physical culture and sport in the Russian Federation” (hereinafter referred to as “the law on sport”) stipulates the basic principles of physical culture and sports in the Russian Federation including the principle of unity of the legal base in the sphere of physical culture and sports.

Paragraph 19 of article 6.1 of the law on sport formalizes the responsibility of the Russian Federation to ensure public order and security during official sporting events on the venues.

Articles 8 and 9 of the law on sport stipulates the responsibility of constituent territories of the Russian Federation and local authorities to cooperate within the sphere of public order and security during sporting events held on the aforementioned territories and municipalities.

Thus, an integrated approach towards security, safety and service is ensured by delegating these responsibilities to the Russian Federation with cooperation on the side of constituent territories and local authorities on the basis of integrated legislation.

**Article 3 - Definitions**

**Recommendation 2** : the national co-ordination group should consider the merits of adopting in law and in practice European-wide terminology and definitions in respect of the safety, security and service arrangements in connection with football events. **[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]**

**Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:**

It appears that adoption of European-wide terminology is hardly accomplishable due to linguistic

peculiarities of Russian language and differences in legal systems.

#### Article 4 - Co-ordination Arrangements

**Recommendation 3** : As part of the review of the current legislative and regulatory framework, the national co-ordination group should consider i) designating a local (or regional) public authority with responsibility for establishing a local (or regional) multi-agency group tasked with responsibility for co-ordinating preparations for football events held in their locality (or region) and ii) including explicit legal provisions on the structure, role, and membership of such groups, taking into account established European good practice. **[Status: Important - Target: December 2018]**

#### Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:

Pursuant to paragraph 1b of article 72 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation public maintenance of public order and safety lies within the responsibilities of the Russian Federation and constituent territories of the Russian Federation. Administrative units of the Russian Federation have anti-terrorist commissions, crisis centers, regional security departments/commissions within executive bodies.

In this sense we believe that it would be reasonable to support this initiative whilst considering potential of the aforementioned bodies in terms of coordinational measures regarding preparation of sporting events.

#### Article 5 - Safety, Security and Service in Stadiums

**Recommendation 4** : As part of a wider legislative review, the national co-ordination group should consider imposing a requirement that all stadia hosting a professional football event should have in place a trained and assessed as competent stadium safety officer designated with responsibility for all in stadia safety and security arrangements. **[Status: Important - Target: December 2018]**

#### Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:

Pursuant to Article 4 of the Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 353 public security management during official sporting events is carried out by the organizers of the event together with the owners (operators) of the venues in cooperation with public authorities of the Russian Federation, regional authorities and local authorities.

Designation of a stadium safety officer does not require a legislative framework, but rather is an organizational issue that can be solved in due course.

However, the Russian Football Union organizes special seminars for security and safety officers of football clubs and carries out testing pursuant to the RFU Standard. A certified security officer (holding an RFU certificate of competence) is an obligatory criterion within the licensing procedure of the RFU.

**Recommendation 5** : As part of the legislative and regulatory review, the national co-ordination group should consider consolidating current provisions on the in-stadia role of public authorities, and establishing formal arrangements for the police or other public agency to assume responsibility in the event of an actual or potential emergency scenario or other significant public safety or security incident. **[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]**

**Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:**

Pursuant to the Federal Law dated as 21.12.1994 № 68-FZ “Population and territory protection against man caused and natural emergency situations” the Integrated state warning and emergency management system (hereinafter referred to as the “ISS”) consolidates the management structure and resources of federal executive bodies, regional executive bodies, local bodies and organizations whose competence includes protection of population and territories during emergency situations.

Management structure of the ISS includes coordinational bodies on each functional level, standing management bodies and day-to-day management bodies.

Whilst managing emergency situations the resources of Russian internal affairs bodies are applied in accordance with relevant objectives assigned by the legislation of the Russian Federation.

**Recommendation 6** : The national co-ordination group should consider refining the current legislative framework to establish an independent, public authority tasked with responsibility for: i) issuing standards on the physical, technical and safety management arrangements in stadia hosting professional football events; ii) monitoring application of those standards; and iii) issuing stadium safety certificates to all stadia in compliance with the national standards. **[Status: Desirable - Target: December 2018]**

**Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:**

Pursuant to paragraph 6 of Article 37 of the law on sport technical support of the venues is assigned to the owners (operators) of the venues in accordance with provisions of technical regulations, sanitary rules and other imperatives set by the state control bodies. They bear responsibility for infliction of harm to health or life of individuals who do sports on these venues.

Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 202 “Requirements for counter-terrorism measures on the venues and the passport of the sports venues” incorporates the requirements for protection of the venues against terrorism which are acknowledged by a security passport of a venue.

Certification of football stadia is carried out by the Russian Football Union which is a non governmental organisation (NGO).

**Recommendation 7** : The Sports Ministry, in consultation with the Russian Football Union, should consider recommending or requiring venue owners to undertake an access audit and develop a plan for complying with minimum standards in respect of stadium access and facilities for disabled spectators. **[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]**

**Answer from the Ministry of sport, Russian Football Union:**

The Order of the Ministry of sport of the Russian Federation dated as August 24, 2015 No. 825 contains the imperatives for accessibility of sport venues and services provided for disabled spectators and the procedure of rendering assistance to disabled spectators such as assistance in access to the venue, assistance in crossing the obstacles that obstruct the use of services and in entering sports venues equally to other individuals. The Ministry of sport together with public organisation in the sphere of physical culture and sport assess the level of accessibility of sport venues and relevant services.

According to the Regulation of Russian Football Premier League every stadium which holds the competition

should have valid Certificate issued by the Russian Football Union. The requirements imposed on the stadia are contained in the standard of the RFU “Football stadia”. For example, Article 4.2.2.5 prescribes specially equipped access gates and seats intended for disabled spectators (including those in wheelchairs) and individuals who assist them; the stadium must be equipped with restrooms for disabled spectators; Article 4.2.2.7 stipulates that 7% of restrooms should be adopted for disabled spectators; Article 4.6.5 prescribes to allocate a minimum 4% of parking spots for disabled spectators in wheelchairs.

The stadia that are being prepared to hold the FIFA Confederations Cup 2017 and the FIFA World Cup 2018 (total of 12 stadia) fully correspond to the requirements of FIFA, including accessibility and services to disabled spectators.

### **Article 7 – Contingency and Emergency Planning**

**Recommendation 8** : The national co-ordination group should review the current arrangements for preparing and testing comprehensive multi-agency stadium contingency and public authority emergency plans for incidents at or nearby stadia hosting football events. **[Status: Desirable - Target: September 2017]**

#### **Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:**

Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 202 “Requirements for counter-terrorism measures on the venues and the passport of sports venues” incorporates the requirements for protection of the venues against terrorism which are acknowledged by a security passport of a venue.

Time schedule of emergency exercises and drills including exercises carried out with federal security and internal affairs bodies is a substantial part of the security passport of a venue.

### **Article 8 – Engagement with Supporters and Local Communities**

**Recommendation 9** : The Russian Football Union, in consultation with the Russian Football Premier League and the Association of Russian Professional Football Leagues, should review the current SLO arrangements, to ensure that i) the positions of club safety officer and club supporter liaison officer are not occupied by the same person; ii) a national team SLO (team) is appointed; iii) any individual felt to pose an ongoing risk of violence or disorder is disqualified from being a SLO; and iv) SLOs from different countries be invited to exchange experiences and good practices with their Russian counterparts. **[Status: Desirable - Target: May 2017]**

#### **Answer from the Ministry of sport, Russian Football Union.**

1. Pursuant to the club licensing regulations of the Russian Football Union football and Criteria for safety officers and SLOs (Chapter 10):

A safety officer of a club cannot occupy the aforementioned position with other positions in the club on terms of secondary employment, except for teaching and scientific practice.

An SLO cannot occupy the aforementioned position with other positions in the club on terms of secondary employment, except for teaching, scientific practice and activity in the official fan club of



licensee.

2. The Russian Football Union has a security and fans liaison department, but the position of a national team SLO has not been created yet.

3. According to the clubs licensing regulations of the Russian Football Union:

A person cannot hold a position of SLO if: he is found guilty for a criminal offence and the criminal record has not yet expired; he is registered with a drug-rehabilitation or psychiatric institution.

4. The SLOs are tested annually by the RFU and the Leagues and are issued a certificate in case they pass all the tests.

It is also worth mentioning that foreign SLOs will be invited to participate in the testing procedure on the 28th of February 2017.

**Recommendation 10** : The national co-ordination group should encourage all stakeholders to consider the scope for developing preventative, social and educational projects connected with football events at both national and local level. In particular, activities aimed at children and junior supporters should incorporate the promotion of values such as respect, tolerance, anti-violence and non-discrimination. **[Status: Desirable - Target Ongoing ]**

#### **Answer from the Ministry of sport:**

The Russian Federation organizes various preventive, social and educational projects linked with football events on a regular basis. For example, on the 4th Ceremony of the “Best social projects of Russia” award, which is held pursuant to the course of the Government of the Russian Federation aimed at development of social cooperation between the state, society and businesses, the “Stadium – our common home” project carried out by the Russian Football Premier-League together with the European Legal Service won the first place in the “best social project” nomination. This project is aimed at education of supporters of different age in the sphere of law and at development of safety and comfort at the stadia.

The Russian Football Premier-League and the Football National League clubs have their own social projects which are, inter alia, aimed at attraction of “civilized supporters” and at popularization of football (e.g. “League of kind hearts” project aimed at bringing up a new generation of supporters). There is a public movement of supporters “RU” which was founded in Saint Petersburg for the purposes of supporting national teams of the Russian Federation in various kinds of sports.

As for the international sports cooperation, the representatives of the Russian Federation have taken part in UEFA “Respect Diversity” conference which touched upon the issues of racism and discrimination in football (September 2014, Rome). There was also a round-table on the issues of ethnic and socio-cultural diversity in football, security at the stadia and reduction of activity of nationalistic fan movements with the representatives of public and human rights organizations held during the FARE week on the 10th October, 2014 in Saint-Petersburg. In June 2015 the Ministry of sport (together with the Russian Football Union, the Organizing Committee “Russia-2018” and the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights) organized an international seminar “Creation of a discrimination-free environment in football”. Representatives of the Russian Federation have also taken part in the international seminar organized by the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights on the topic of “Role of human rights ombudsmen in the fight against racism and discrimination in football” (October 2015, Saint-Petersburg). There were also 2 round tables organized by the Ministry of sport (together with the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights and other international organizations) within the “Russia – country of sport” forum on the following topics: “Tackling global threats. Creation of a discrimination and violence free environment” and “Tackling global threats. Fight against match-fixing: bet on fair sport”.

### Article 9 – Police Strategies and Operations

**Recommendation 11** : The Ministry of Internal Affairs should continue to discuss with European colleagues the international police-cooperation and policing preparations in connection with the FIFA 2018 World Cup, taking into account issues highlighted in the visit report. **[Status and Timescale : Ongoing]**

#### Answer from the Ministry of internal affairs:

The Ministry of internal affairs would like to express its readiness for future cooperation with its European partners in the sphere of security.

The representatives of the Ministry have been regularly participating in the European “safety during football matches” expert group where they have been involved in preparation of public order measures at the stadia and in countering the misbehaviour of supporters.

Gained experience is, where possible, incorporated in the practice of bodies of the Ministry of internal affairs.

### Article 10 - Prevention and Sanctioning of Offending Behaviour

**Recommendation 12:** The national co-ordination group should consider the merits of, and scope for, extending the current exclusion measures to include provision for imposing banning orders on individuals who i) commit criminal or administrative offences outside of stadia in connection with a scheduled football event played in the Russian Federation, and/or ii) commit comparable offences in connection with football events played in another State. **[Status: Important - Target: May 2017]**

#### Answer from the Ministry of sport, Ministry of internal affairs:

Paragraph “b” of article 5 of the Code of Conduct for Spectators at the Official Sporting Events, by the Government of the Russian Federation (Resolution No. 1156 dated as December 16, 2013) spectators cannot act in a way that threatens their own security, health and lives and of other spectators that are at the venue and surrounding area.

The liability for unlawful acts outside the venues is established by Article 20.31 of the Code of administrative offences of the Russian Federation.

Criminal liability towards individuals who commit a criminal offence outside the Russian Federation is established by Article 12 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation and contains criminal liability towards:

Citizens of the Russian Federation and stateless persons permanently residing in the Russian Federation who have committed outside the Russian Federation a crime against the interests guarded by the present Code shall be subject to criminal liability in accordance with the present Code, unless a decision of a foreign state's court exists concerning this crime in respect of these persons;

Foreign nationals and stateless persons who do not reside permanently in the Russian Federation and who

have committed crimes outside the boundaries of the Russian Federation shall be brought to criminal liability under this Code in cases where the crimes run against the interests of the Russian Federation or a citizen of the Russian Federation or a stateless person permanently residing in the Russian Federation, and also in the cases provided for by international agreements of the Russian Federation, and unless the foreign citizens and stateless persons not residing permanently in the Russian Federation have been convicted in a foreign state and are brought to criminal liability on the territory of the Russian Federation.

As for administrative liability, pursuant to Article 1.8 of the Code of administrative offences of the Russian Federation and individual who has committed an administrative offence outside the Russian Federation is subject to administrative liability pursuant to the Code and to the relevant international treaties of the Russian Federation.