EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS COMITE EUROPEEN DES DROITS SOCIAUX



8 October 2004

Collective Complaint No. 15/2003 European Roma Rights Center v. Greece Case Document No. 8

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FROM THE EUROPEAN ROMA RIGHTS CENTER (ERRC) ON THE MERITS

registered at the Secretariat on 8 October 2004



RIGHTS CENTER

1386 Budapest 62, P.O. Box 906/93, Hungary Phone: (36-1) 413-2200; Fax: (36-1) 413-2201 E-mail: ccahn@errc.org http://errc.org

8 October 2004

Mr. Regis Brillat Secretariat General Directorate General of Human Rights -- DG II Secretariat of the European Social Charter The Executive Secretary Council of Europe F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex France

Fax: (33 3) 88 41 37 00

Dear Mr. Brillat,

Attached please find written responses, as provided by ERRC partner organisations in Greece, to the questions posed by the Committee to the ERRC. Attached please also find a table detailing actions undertaken in individual settlements, also provided by ERRC partner organisations. We would be grateful if you would provide these to the Committee. We will also bring paper copies for the President, as well as for the Greek government delegation, for Monday's hearing.

Thank you in advance for all efforts.

Sincerely,

Claude Cahn Programmes Director

ANSWERS BY ERRC PARTNER ORGANISATION GREEK HELSINKI MONITOR (GHM) AND COORDINATED ORGANIZATIONS AND COMMUNITIES FOR ROMA HUMAN RIGHTS IN GREECE (SOKADRE)

TO THE QUESTIONS ADDRESSED TO THE ERRC AND TO THE GREEK GOVERNMENT BY THE EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS:

1. Please provide information on the estimated number of Roma in Greece, settled and itinerant, and as a percentage of the total population.

In the Greek census, there are no questions on ethnicity, language or religion; hence no official figures exist for Roma or any other minority. Greek state estimates vary widely from 250,000-300,000¹ down to 63,000.² NGOs estimate Roma population at about 300,000-350,000, i.e. around 3% of the total population.

2. Please provide information on the percentage of settled Roma whose housing needs have been met, and on the percentage of itinerant Roma whose housing needs have been met.

No official statistics are available. It is known that there are no housing facilities for itinerant Roma created anywhere for the – small in any case – population of Roma who maintain an itinerant or nomadic lifestyle, Ministerial Decision No.23641/3/7/2003 [hereafter "MD"] notwithstanding. Among settled Roma, it is estimated that around half live in what can be considered as adequate housing.

3. Please provide information on how many "camping sites/settlement sites" are available for itinerant Roma.

No such sites meeting the criteria of the MD exist. The state DEPOS agency's 1999 study found 8,800 itinerant Roma mostly camping in sub-standard settlements inhabited by settled Roma.

4. Please provide information on the number of Roma who are currently living in sub-standard housing/settlements.

No official statistics are available. If one considers sub-standard all housing not meeting the United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights criteria for adequate housing, then it is estimated that about 100,000 Roma live in sub-standard conditions. It should be noted that the state has already announced that it will give 9,000 housing loans to Romani families living in sub-standard conditions (which should correspond to over 50,000 Roma), and it is known that numerous Romani families have not applied for loans, for the most part apparently because they fear that they will not be able to repay such loans.

¹ See document by the Hellenic Agency for Local Development and Local Government (EETAA), *Integrated Action Plan for the Social Integration of the Greek Gypsies (Olokliromeno Programma Drasis gia tin Koinoniki entaxi ton Ellinon Tsinganon*), Athens: April 2001, p 5.

² See Greek Ministry of Interior, Public Administration and Decentralization letter to GHM Ref No 26477 of July 10, 2003.

5. Please provide information on any significant improvements to the living conditions or relocation to better settlements for any of the communities cited in the ERRC's submission.

In its Third Report on Greece, published in June 2004, the Council of Europe's European Commission Against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) noted:

"67. ECRI notes with concern that since the adoption of its second report on Greece, the situation of the Roma in Greece has remained fundamentally unchanged and that overall they face the same difficulties – including discrimination - in respect of housing, employment, education and access to public services. As concerns housing in particular, there still remain numerous Roma camps removed from all infrastructure in which the Roma live under unacceptable conditions. This is true, for example, of the Aspropyrgos camp near Athens. At the end of 2002 the Greek authorities informed the Commissioner for Human Rights of the Council of Europe that "all necessary measures have been taken in order that the Roma/Gypsy settlement of Aspropyrgos is provided with all public facilities"³. Having visited the spot, it can nevertheless be ascertained that in October 2003 the people living in this camp had not been re-housed and the authorities had still not provided them with access to running water or electricity. Moreover, they are under constant threat of expulsion without any alternative accommodation being offered to them. The Spata camp near Athens is clearly situated on a giant waste site covered only by a layer of earth a few centimetres high. Roma that were expelled from their camps were resettled in prefabricated houses at Spata by the authorities. This camp is still not connected to electricity or running water, three years after the relocation. This situation poses inter alia serious health problems, particularly for the children who live in the camp.",4

Deputy Minister of Interior, Public Administration and Decentralization Athanasios Nakos, stated on 25 June 2004: "All of us remember the commitments made in 1996, to the effect that within ten years, no Gypsy will be living in a tent. Unfortunately today, 8 years later, the everyday reality of the Greek Gypsies belies, in the most unequivocal manner, those commitments. (...) In the field of housing and infrastructure, the steps that were made are small. It can also be said that the intervention in the sectors of education, health, employment, culture and sports was minimal or non-existent. In light of the above, today's situation of the Greek Gypsies and the problems they face daily, do not make us proud. Reports by international organizations and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO) describe the situation with dark colors."

In an appendix we list the 27 settlements referred in the submission and the (almost invariable absence of any) improvement in each.

6. As regards forced evictions: please provide recent statistics on the number of Roma forcibly evicted from settlements or land they occupy.

ECRI's Third Report on Greece notes as follows:

³ See Report by Mr Alvaro Gil-Robles, Commissioner for Human Rights, on his visit to the Hellenic Republic from 2 to 5 June 2002, CommDH(2002)5

⁴ The report is available at http://www.coe.int/T/E/human_rights/Ecri/1-ECRI/2-Country-by-country_approach/Greece/Greece_CBC_3.asp#TopOfPage

http://www.mpa.gr/article.html?doc_id=464049

"68. ECRI is concerned over allegations that forcible collective evictions of Roma families have taken place without any resettlement alternative being proposed. ECRI finds especially alarming reports to the effect that some of these evictions are unlawful and/or are followed by immediate destruction of the camps by bulldozer, despite the fact that all the personal possessions of the families remain there."

The Greek state's response to the statement cited above was: "concerning the statement in the ECRI's report "that forcible collective evictions of Roma families have been taken place without any resettlement being proposed" we would like to draw your attention to the fact that such incidents, if occurred occasionally, concerned cases of land-grabbing of private or public spaces by the Roma who have been pushed back by virtue of relevant judicial decisions." ⁶

There are no statistics on forced evictions in Greece, aggregate or disaggregated by ethnicity, and to the best of our knowledge the government is not monitoring this issue. This issue alone is cause for concern. Numerous forced evictions of Roma without the effective provision of alternative adequate housing have taken place in recent years, including in the country's three main cities' Romani communities: Aspropyrgos, Spata, Marousi – next to the Olympic Stadium, in Athens; Evosmos, Kalamaria in Thessaloniki; and Riganokampos in Patras.

⁶ The report is available at http://www.coe.int/T/E/human_rights/Ecri/1-ECRI/2-Country-by-country_approach/Greece/Greece_CBC_3.asp#TopOfPage

	Romani communities	Main problems observed	Improvements/relocations
			carried out,
			measures implemented, updated information
1	Gerambella, Pyrgos (Peloponesse)	settlemenent	None
		destroyed	
		following arson	
		attack	2.7
2	Ano Liosia, Greater Athens	bad living	None
		conditions,	
		evictions carried	
2	Agnronymag Craatar Athans	out	None
3	Aspropyrgos, Greater Athens	appalling living conditions, lack	None
		of access to	
		water/electricity,	
		multiple actual	
		or attempted	
		evictions	
4	Aghia Paraskevi, Greater Athens	bad living	None
		conditions, lack	
		of access to	
		water/electricity,	
		attempted	
		evictions	
5	Halandri, Greater Athens	bad living	None
		conditions, lack	
		of access to	
_	Marayai Craatar Athana	water/electricity	None monthly subsidy
0	Marousi, Greater Athens	non-honouring of agreement	None, monthy subsidy payment delayed;
		signed between	relocation not initiated
		the Roma and	refocation not initiated
		the Mayor	
7	Nea Alikarnassos, Herakleion, Crete	appalling living	None, municipality
		conditions, lack	prevents relocation of
		of access to	Romani community
		water/electricity,	
		attempted	
		evictions,	
		prevention of	
		relocation	
8	Riganokampos, Patras (Peloponesse)	appalling living	None
		conditions, lack	
		of access to	
		water/electricity,	
		attempted eviction	
0	Halastra, Greater Thessaloniki	appalling living	The Roma were to be
7	Tranastra, Oreator Triessalulliki	appaning nying	The Roma were to be

_			<u> </u>
	condit	ions, lack	provided with 35
	of acce	ess to	prefabricated houses.1
	water/	electricity	

10	y	1 . 11' '	NT
10	Nea Kios (Peloponesse)	bad living conditions	None
11	Karakonero, city of Rhodes,	appalling living	None
111	Ratakonero, etty of Rhodes,	conditions, lack	None
		of access to	
		water/electricity	
12	Kalamaria, Greater Thessaloniki	settlement	None, court case selved
12	Raiamana, Greater Thessaromki	destroyed	without Roma or NGO
		following	testimony
		alleged illegal	testimony
		eviction	
13	Spata, Greater Athens	inadequate	None; residents with no
13	Spata, Oreater Athens	living	tenure certificates as
		conditions, lack of access to	setllement illegal
11	Eahadaras Craatar Thassalaniki	water/electricity roads in	150,000 Euros earmarked
14	Echedoros, Greater Thessaloniki	disrepair	for paving roads 2
15	Menemeni, Greater Thessaloniki	unsuitable	Not known
13	Wellement, Greater Thessaroniki	location	I VOL KIIOWII
16	Mavrika, Karditsa (centralGreece)	unsuitable	None
10	waviika, Kardiisa (centrarGreece)	location	None
17	Mesolonghi, (mainland Greece)	lack of support	Greek Ombudsman ruled
1 ,	West of the state	from local	settlement illegal;
		authorities	relocation necessary.3
18	Akti Dymaion, Patras (Peloponesse)	appalling living	None None
10	71kti Dymaion, 1 atras (1 cioponesse)	conditions, lack	None
		of access to	
		water/electricity	
10	Herakleia, Serres (northern Greece)	bad living	None
1	Tierakiera, Berres (normerin Greece)	conditions, lack	T (one
		of adequate	
		access to	
		water/electricity	
20	Bournazi, Katerini (northern Greece)	appalling living	Not known
20	Bournazi, Raterini (northern Greece)	conditions, lack	TVOCKHOWII
		of access to	
		water/electricity	
21	Zefyri, Greater Athens	partly	100,000 Euros earmarked
1	Zoryri, Grouter runens	inadequate	for infrastructure work.4
		living conditions	101 IIII asa actaic work. 7
22	Komotini, (north-eastern Greece)	appalling living	September 3, 2004,
	realism, (norm custom Greece)	conditions, lack	announcement of future
		of adequate	relocation.4
		access to	Telocation.4
		water/electricity	
23	Lehaina, (Peloponesse)	bad living	None
23	Deliana, (1 croponesse)	conditions	
2.4	Kalamata / Messini, (Peloponesse)	bad living	160 prefabricated houses
[~	remainant messiin, (retopolicise)	conditions	earmarked1; no relocation
		Conditions	initiated to date
Щ		1	minated to date

25	Tripolis, (Peloponesse)	conditions	66 prefabricated houses earmarked1; no relocation initiated to date
26	Serres, (northern Greece)	bad living	Relocation not completed5
		conditions	
27	Argostoli, (island of Cephalonia)	appalling living	None
		conditions	

NOTES

Communities Nos 11, 24 according to the 1996 National Policy Framework for Greek Gypsies, were to be relocated "immediately". Three others -nos 15, 16 and Theba (central Greece)-were also be relocated immediately. They were indeed relocated many years later to, and are still in, unsuitable locations or face significant problems.

SOURCES

- Ministry of Interior, Public Administration and Decentralization letter to GHM, dated July 10, 2003, Ref. No. 26477
- ² September 9, 2004 Ministry of Interior Press Release, available in Greek at http://www.mpa.gr/article.html?doc_id=477541
- ³ Greek Ombudsman's Findings Reports 14178/27.9.2000, 14116/26.9.2000, 8332/18.6.2001; memorandum to the Prefect 19-1-2004
- ⁴ Apogeumatini Athens based daily newspaper, dated September 3, 2004.
- Macedonian Press Agency on September 24,
 2004
 http://www.mpa.gr/grtisle.html?doc.id=4823

http://www.mpa.gr/article.html?doc_id=482377 reported on a fatal incident among Roma living in the settlement