# Media and Protection of Minors in France TV and Cinema

Mathias Grenier

#### Introduction

All along the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the cultural landscape in France has known many evolutions and continues changing with the development of new media such as Connected TV. In cinemas, this evolution is especially marked by the types of films shown and the violence an increasing number of works contain. New technologies and techniques available for the creation of filmed art enabled creators to express fully their artistic desires and this leads sometimes (and more often than before) to more realistic depiction of violent scenes in films. The dominance of US action films in France especially has brought a new meaning to "violent films" with a banalisation of killings and other physical abuses. Pornography and erotic films also took an important place in the media landscape through time, first in cinemas and then on television.

Television partly mirrors cinema because it repeats movies that were first shown in cinemas. Additionally, it also produces its own content, with TV films and different types of shows. But television is special in that, since the 1950s, it became one of the most powerful media in terms of influencing audiences, and especially children. This influence was made clear when Patrick LeLay, former CEO of TF1 – the first television channel in France – said "the first job of TF1 is to help Coca-Cola to sell its products. For an advertisement to be perceived, the viewer's brain has to be available. Our shows are cut to make it available [...] What we sell to Coca-Cola, is time of available brain". Even if this quotation is very controversial, it is a good example of what kind of power television can have on our minds and even more on the evolving minds of children.

The integration of an increasing amount of violence and pornography in these two media led to concerns about the protection of minors against content that could harm their development. The reason why television and cinema are regulated with a view to protect minors is clear: both TV and cinema are powerful cultural tools and their influence on youths' development should be controlled.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> http://lexpansion.lexpress.fr/entreprise/patrick-le-lay-president-directeur-general-de-tf1 105361.html

# 1. The regulation of television

#### 1.1. Historical background

## 1.1.1. The beginnings of regulation: le carré blanc

In the 1960s, the television market was booming. In 1960, 13.1% of the French population owned a TV set; in 1966, this proportion was raised to more than half of the population.<sup>2</sup> The spreading of television was followed by the availability of new types of programmes and a new diversity that confronted the viewers with TV programmes they had not been used to see at the time. Violence and eroticism appeared on domestic screens.

In order to protect children, a new regulation was introduced with the goal to help parents to prevent their children from watching unsuitable content. The decision was taken by the State on the 26<sup>th</sup> of March, 1961 through the governing body "Radiodiffusion-télévision française" (RTF which became ORTF – "Office de Radiodiffusion Télévision Française" – in 1964). At the time RTF was in charge of the regulation of TV but lacked any autonomy given the strict control of its actions by the State. The regulation made it obligatory for broadcasters to show a pictogram when broadcasting programmes containing scenes with any sexual connotation. The pictogram took the form of a "carré blanc" (white square) and had to appear on the bottom right hand corner of the screen. This warning had the goal of informing viewers about the type of programme they were watching and, furthermore, to enable parents to protect children against violent or erotic/pornographic content that could harm their development. In addition, programmes necessitating a carré blanc could be shown only during certain hours of the night – it was therefore not possible to see a white square during the day.

This regulation appeared early in the development of TV. Indeed, even while diversity of programmes was developping, viewers still did not have a choice between different programmes because only one channel was available. The regulation illustrates the high concern in French politics for the protection of minors in TV broadcasting.

#### 1.1.2. Law of the 30 September 1986 and the creation of the CSA

The CSA (*Conseil Supérieur de l'Audiovisuel*) is the current instance of regulation of television and radio in France. It was created by the law of 17<sup>th</sup> January 1989<sup>3</sup>, which modified the law of 30<sup>th</sup> September 1986<sup>4</sup> on the Freedom of Communication. It is conceived as an Independent Administrative Authority (*Autorité administrative indépendante*) separated from the head of State in its action. Its task is mainly to make television and radio actors respect the principles of the law of the 30<sup>th</sup> September 1986.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://www.cairn.info/revue-le-temps-des-medias-2003-1-page-65.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Law n° 86-1067 http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930

Its missions are manifold. One of these missions is to take measures in order to compel television broadcasters to protect minors against programmes that could harm their development. In order to regulate programmes, the CSA operates a monitoring system of what is broadcast on French channels and especially on programmes that could go against the protection of childhood and adolescence.<sup>5</sup> It is an *a posteriori* control, hence the CSA is only assessing the legality of a programme after it was shown on TV.

In order to fulfill this mission, the CSA disposes of different tools. It should be noted that some of the restrictive measures which the CSA can use differ according to the type of channel which conflicted with the law. To this end, the law of 1986 distinguishes between private and public broadcasters and defines public broadcasters in its article 44.

- Formal notice: both public and private broadcasters must be formally notified.<sup>6</sup> the CSA can ask a broadcaster to comply with the obligations of the law of 1986 within a certain time. Different registered associations and organisations can ask the CSA to start this procedure against a broadcaster<sup>7</sup> if they consider that the latter has broken a rule concerning the protection of minor.
- Sanctions: there are different types of sanctions that the CSA can impose if the broadcaster does not apply to the requirements contained in the formal notice:
  - Suspension of the edition, diffusion or distribution of the service(s) of a category of programmes, of a part of a programme or of one or several advertising sequences for a maximum time of one month. Both public and private broadcasters can be subjected to this sanction.<sup>8</sup> The extent of the sanction is defined by different rules expressed in the article 42-2 of the law.
  - Reduction of the time of the authorisation or convention for a maximum of one year (the CSA has the power to grant the authorisation for a private broadcaster to use the French network; this authorisation is stated more precisely in conventions signed between the CSA which in so far is acting on behalf of the State and the channel<sup>9</sup>). This sanction can only be imposed upon private broadcasters.<sup>10</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> http://www.csa.fr/Le-CSA/Presentation-du-Conseil/Des-missions-diversifiees/Le-suivi-des-programmes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 42 paragraph 1 for private channels and article 48-1 paragraph 1 for public channels <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 42 paragraph 3 for private channels and article 48-1 paragraph 3 for public channels <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 42-1 1° for private channels and article 48-2 for public channels <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 28 <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 42-1 2° <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?</a> cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930

- A pecuniary sanction. This applies to both private and public broadcasters;<sup>11</sup> this sanction can be associated with the first sanction (see above).
- Withdrawal of the authorisation or unilateral termination of the convention. This applies only to private broadcasters. 12
- Insertion of a communiqué under the terms and conditions of transmission set by the CSA. If the broadcaster refuses to show this message, a pecuniary sanction (in the limits of article 42-2 see above) can be pronounced against it.<sup>13</sup>

## 1.2. The protection of minors in the French TV sector nowadays

Regulation is set by the law of 30<sup>th</sup> September 1986. This regulation was modified through a succession of laws. Article 15 of the latest version of the law<sup>14</sup> creates two levels of regulation in order to protect the youth against harmful content. The first one is the banning of programmes that are considered not to be suitable for everyone (see table below) during certain hours. The second one is the use of warning signs on the screen in order to inform viewers about the content they are watching. The two measures may be combined for certain types of programme.

The CSA makes a distinction between cinema channels and other channels; some rules of the regulation are different according to which channel broadcasts the programme. The regulation is contained in the recommendation of 7<sup>th</sup> June 2005. <sup>15</sup> The programmes are divided in categories, from I to V. <sup>16</sup> The following table summarises this regulation.

 $\underline{\text{http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do;jsessionid=4B395873B7A88759F4448687313EBF88.tpdjo07v\_3?}\\ \underline{\text{cidTexte=JORFTEXT000000446802\&categorieLien=id}}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 42-1 3° for private channels and article 48-2 for public channels <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 42-1 4° <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?</a> <a href="cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930">cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 48-3 <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068930</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The latest modification was made by the law of July 9th, 2010 (law n° 2010-769) http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000022454032

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Recommandation n° 2005-5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Articles 2 and 3 of the recommendation (7/6/05)

Programmes classification	Cinema channels <sup>17</sup>	Other channels
"Suitable for all age groups" <u>Category I</u>	No signs	No signs
"Not suitable for children under 10". Category II Programmes with scenes that are likely to hurt the	- No broadcasting in shows for children.	- No broadcasting in shows for children.
sensibility of children under 10. Sign inserted during 5 minutes at the beginning of the programme and 1 minute after each commercial break or during 12 minutes at the beginning of the programme.	- Broadcasters should pay attention to the trailers of these programmes when they are shown in or close to programmes for children.	- Broadcasters should pay attention to the trailers of these programmes when they are shown in or close to programmes for children.
"Not suitable for children under 12". Category III Programmes forbidden for minors under 12 in cinemas or programmes that are likely to harm children under 12 (scenes of physical or psychological violence)  The sign is inserted during the whole transmission of the programme.	No broadcasting before 20.30 on Wednesdays.     Trailers should not contain any scene that could hurt children's sensibility and cannot be shown close to programmes for children	- No broadcasting before 22.00; exceptionally, these programmes can be shown at 20.30 but only on Mondays, Wednesdays and Thursdays <sup>18</sup> and never before a bank holiday (only 4 times per year and per channel for programmes forbidden for minors under 12) - Trailers should not contain any scene that could hurt children's sensibility and cannot be shown close to programmes for children
"Not suitable for minors under 16". Category IV Programmes forbidden to minors under 16 in cinemas or containing erotic scenes or scenes of great violence that are likely to harm minors under 16. The sign is inserted during the whole diffusion of the programme.	- No broadcasting before 20.30 No trailer that contains scenes that are likely to harm minors' under 16 sensibility before 20.30 on free view time slots.	- No broadcasting before 22.00 No broadcasting of trailers containing scenes that are likely to harm sensibility of minors under 16. No broadcasting before 20.30.
"Not suitable for minors under 18". 19 Category V Programmes forbidden for minors in cinema or programmes of pornographic nature or containing scenes of high violence reserved to an experienced audience.  The sign is inserted during the whole transmission of the programme.	- Only certain channels are authorised to broadcast these programmes, a limited number of times per year Broadcasting of these programmes and their trailers only between 12.00 and 5.00 The access to these programmes is technically restricted. Parents must personalise a password and keep it secret.	- No broadcasting allowed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Cinema channels are defined by the decree n°90-66, January 17<sup>th</sup>, 1990, art 6-2 as such: "a cinema service is a television channel whose main purpose is to broadcast films of cinema and shows dealing with cinema and its history".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> These days correspond to the periods when children are less likely to stay up late – and then be in contact with harmful content – because they have school the day after.

19 The recommendation of the CSA of 15th December 15th, 2004 gives further advice to channels that show

programmes "not suitable for minors under 18", especially about the technical issue that involves the restricted access to this type of program.

The classification is determined by law. The channels have to assess themselves what sign they must attach to each programme. The CSA monitors the programmes after they have been broadcast. This control can be exercised upon every authorised channels (from Hertzian waves or broadcasting satellite). The control consists in the verification that the sign chosen by a channel for a given programme was pertinent and that the period of showing does not contravene with the timing rules (see table above).

The CSA may act either on its own initiative or upon seisin by a viewer or a series of registered associations.<sup>20</sup> Viewers and associations must therefore precise the channel and time of broadcast or alternatively mention the title of the programme.<sup>21</sup>

If a programme appears to be "under-rated", it is sent to the commission in charge of the sign regulation within the CSA. The conclusions of the Commission are discussed by the working group "Youth and Protection of Minors" (Jeunesse et protection des mineurs).

If the CSA establishes that the sign used was not appropriate, it can apply one of the restrictive measures in its power. In the vast majority of cases, the CSA opts for dialogue.<sup>22</sup> It uses sanctions only when the channel at issue does not comply with an advice or when the channel commits other offences.

It should be noted that the freedom of broadcasting which is the principle set by the law of 1986 can also be limited by the necessity to protect the *ordre public*<sup>23</sup> (*l'ordre public* is a complex concept referring to the good functioning of society – in France, the administrative judicial power has the right, in certain circumstances, to prohibit an event or any action that could intervene with this concept).

The CSA also produces an annual advertising campaign shown on TV with the aim to warn viewers of the dangers of harmful content in media and to educate them on the importance to follow pictograms.<sup>24</sup> The broadcasters are required to braodcast this campaign.<sup>25</sup> The campaign of 2011 was titled "Let's all be responsible in front of screens". For the first time in 2011, VOD

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 42 paragraph 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> The whole procedure is explained on the CSA's website <a href="http://www.csa.fr/Television/Le-suivi-des-programmes/Jeunesse-et-protection-des-mineurs/La-signaletique-jeunesse/Le-controle-opere-par-le-Conseil">http://www.csa.fr/Television/Le-suivi-des-programmes/Jeunesse-et-protection-des-mineurs/La-signaletique-jeunesse/Le-controle-opere-par-le-Conseil</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> In a decision of 19<sup>th</sup> March 2012, the CSA notified the channel Ciné Novo that a film which was shown under the "-12" should have been submitted to rules proper to "-16" films (category IV) because of its sexual character. The CSA asked the channel to see that the rules in this domain are respected for the future.

 $<sup>\</sup>underline{http://www.csa.fr/Television/Le-suivi-des-programmes/Jeunesse-et-protection-des-mineurs/Orange-Cine-Novo-sous-classification-du-film-A-l-aventure}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Law of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 1986, article 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> You can see the campaign of 2011 and its description at this address: <a href="http://www.csa.fr/Television/Le-suivi-des-programmes/Jeunesse-et-protection-des-mineurs/La-signaletique-jeunesse/Les-campagnes-de-sensibilisation-a-la-signaletique-jeunesse">http://www.csa.fr/Television/Le-suivi-des-programmes/Jeunesse-et-protection-des-mineurs/La-signaletique-jeunesse/Les-campagnes-de-sensibilisation-a-la-signaletique-jeunesse</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Article 5 of the recommandation (7/6/05)

broadcasters<sup>26</sup> (*Service de médias audiovisuels à la demande* – *SMAD*) were required to show this campaign on their platform since they are submitted to the same classification system.<sup>27</sup>

Three main directions are hence taken by the CSA in order to protect minors against harmful and shocking content in media:

- the use of a system of classification of programmes that conveys the information to viewers (parents and children) with pictograms. This aims to educate minors about how they should use television and inform parents about what programmes they should prevent their children from watching.
- the development of actions and campaigns in order to inform viewers of the danger of harmful content in media and the necessity of action of the CSA in this matter.
- the use of technical systems of control and restriction of access to most shocking programmes. According to the recommendation of 15<sup>th</sup> December 2004, <sup>28</sup> a technical system must comply with 6 requirements in order to be considered as "efficient":
  - Programmes of category V, in addition to the control of access to the audiovisual service (see table above), must be subjected to a specific locking mechanism from the first use and without the action of the user (the locking must be set by default). This mechanism is managed directly from the decoder and must make it impossible to access the programme (category V) without the input of a password and the message "This programme is locked because of its harmful character for minors" must be attached to it.
  - The access to programmes of category V must be locked again after each change of the situation (changing of channel, standby or switching off the decoder, changing of decoder or of the functioning card). The locking mechanism must be active during each new showing of a programme of category V.
  - The locking mechanism must be perfectly synchronised with the programme of category V and must be active during its whole length.
  - The password must be composed of at least four digits (0000 is not acceptable), not visible on the screen.
  - The password should be exclusively dedicated to this use.
  - The subscriber should not have the possibility of disabling the locking mechanism.

 $\underline{\text{http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do;jsessionid=942146C363832DCD797C1C1AA0634D86.tpdjo05v\_1?}\\ \underline{\text{cidTexte=JORFTEXT000000785725\&categorieLien=id}}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> The CSA defines VOD broadcasting as follows: "Is considered as a *SMAD* every service of communication to the public by an electronic way giving access to the viewing of programmes at the time chosen by the user and on his demand, from a catalogue of programmes which selection and organisation are controlled by the provider of the service". <a href="http://www.csa.fr/Services-interactifs/Services-de-medias-audiovisuels-a-la-demande-SMAD/Definition">http://www.csa.fr/Services-interactifs/Services-de-medias-audiovisuels-a-la-demande-SMAD/Definition</a>
<sup>27</sup> See Délibération du 20 décembre 2011 relative à la protection du jeune public, à la déontologie et à l'accessibilité des programmes sur les services de médias audiovisuels à la demande <a href="http://www.csa.fr/Espace-">http://www.csa.fr/Espace-</a>

juridique/Deliberations-et-recommandations-du-CSA/Recommandations-et-deliberations-du-CSA-relatives-a-d-autres-sujets/Deliberation-du-20-decembre-2011-relative-a-la-protection-du-jeune-public-a-la-deontologie-et-a-l-accessibilite-des-programmes-sur-les-services-de-medias-audiovisuels-a-la-demande

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Recommandation n° 2004-7

# 2. Regulation of cinema

## 2.1. Regulation and control – Historical background

In 1946 the *Conseil National de la Cinématographie* (CNC) was created in order to regulate the diffusion of films on screens, including to classify films according to their nature or to simply prohibit their showings.<sup>29</sup>

The 1960s in France are marked by a growing opposition between creators who work for a certain liberalisation of "good customs" (*bonnes moeurs*) and associations / authorities who fight for a more rigid morality and a strict protection of minors. This opposition may be illustrated by the evaluation of Roger Vadim's *Les liasons dangereuses*. The film does not contain scenes that are "visually" shocking but it depicts a certain image of adultery that is rejected by a large number of critics and politics who sometimes considered it as "morbid" and "sinful". Examples as such are numerous.

In 1961 a legislative answer to this new flow of "immorality" was given by the decree of January 18th, 1961<sup>30</sup>. This decree, among other measures, gave to the president of the "Films Control Commission" (*Commission de contrôle des films* is the entity within the CNC that is charged with regulation of the showings of films in France), the power to issue a decision that could be unfavourable to the shooting of a film. In other words, the president could stop any project of full-length film in case it was likely to approach a dangerous subject for the youth or the society in general.

In parallel to this wide policy of control, the wave of pornographic cinema broke down on France during the late 1960s and 1970s. At the time, erotic and pornographic films were allowed in every cinema with the classification "forbidden under 18". But in 1975, Valéry Giscard d'Estaing, the president of the Republic at the time, asked the Parliament to adopt the law n°75-1278,<sup>31</sup> sometimes called "law X" that created a new status for this type of "X-rated" films. X-rated films also include films that extol the virtues of violence. Under this statue X-rated films are not generally prohibited but their creators face a discouraging environment. Indeed, this law prohibits any State aid for this type of films and furthermore imposes a different tax regime on the pornographic industry and X-rated films.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Law n°46-2360 October 25<sup>th</sup>, 1946,

 $<sup>\</sup>underline{\text{http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do;}} \underline{\text{jsessionid=754D635AA597EB1244950317AB6DAEB4.tpdjo13v}}\underline{2?} \underline{\text{cidTexte=JORFTEXT000000508989}} \underline{\text{kcategorieLien=id}}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Decree n°61-62, January 18th, 1961, <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006070759&dateTexte=&categorieLien=cid">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006070759&dateTexte=&categorieLien=cid</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Law n°75-1278, October 30th, 1975, see article 12, <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?</a> cidTexte=JORFTEXT000000333963&categorieLien=cid

# 2.2. The legal control over cinema nowadays

Since 1990, the "Films control commission" was replaced with the "Films classification commission".<sup>32</sup> The change of adjective is symbolic of the new will of the State to "liberalise" cinematographic culture in France.

One of the legacies of the strong control that the State in France had for years over the cinema medium is the *a priori control*. Indeed, contrary to the control imposed upon TV diffusion, the Commission of control of cinema makes a verification of films before the showing in cinemas, by the way of the grant of visas which is the condition for a film to be shown on screens.<sup>33</sup>

Based on article 3 of the decree of February 23<sup>rd</sup>, 1990<sup>34</sup> the films are classified according to the following categories: suitable for all; forbidden for minors under 12; forbidden for minors under 16; X-rated films (according to the law of October 30th, 1975), forbidden for minors under 18; prohibition of the film. Trailers are also subject to this classification. Each of these classifications – except "suitable for all – can be issued with a specific warning about the content of the film (shown at the entrance of cinemas where the film is shown).

Each classification relates to a visa given by the *Commission de classification* and the Ministry of Culture. The first "layer" of the Commission, called *sous-commission*, makes a first decision about the classification that should be given to a film. The *sous-commission* is composed of "men and women whose diversity of age and professional origin ensures the confrontation of different opinions".<sup>35</sup> If, after the viewing of a film, the *sous-commission* unanimously decides for the "suitable for all" character of the film, the work is granted a visa and can be shown on screens. If the decision is not unanimous and at least one member of the commission recommends a stricter classification for the film, then the work has to be viewed by the whole commission for a new decision.

The Commmission in its plenary assembly (*Assemblée pleinière*) is composed of four groups<sup>36</sup>:

- group of ministries with representatives of the Ministries of the Interior, Justice, National Education, and associations of defense of family and youth.
- group of representatives of Cinema professionals appointed by the Ministry of Culture.
- group of experts with representatives of the medical profession working in the area of protection of minors and youth, a representative of the Ministry of Justice, a representative of the CSA, two representatives appointed after the consultation of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Décret n°90-174 of Febrary 23<sup>rd</sup>, 1990, <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?</a> cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006075464&dateTexte=20110630

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Article L211-1 Code de la cinématographie et de l'image animée, <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do;jsessionid=951E47957A3BA05D4B6477D5E823F484.tpdjo10v27:idArticle=LEGIARTI000020908699&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000020908868&dateTexte=20091125</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Decree n° 90-174, article 3 modified by the decree n°2003-1163 of December 4<sup>th</sup>, 2003, http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000000531243

<sup>35</sup> http://www.cnc.fr/web/fr/composition-de-la-commission39

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Décret n°90-174 of February 23<sup>rd</sup>, 1990, article 1, <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?</a> cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006075464&dateTexte=20110630

National Group of Family Associations and of the Union of Mayors, and one representative of the Defenser of children.

• group of youth, aged between 18 and 24.

If a film has been viewed by the *Assemblée pleinière* its classification is voted upon. The vote does not have to be unanimous. In case of an equal division of votes, the President of the Commission has a decisive vote. The debate is not open to the public but the motivation of the opinion is published.

The result of the vote is not called a decision but an opinion, which is given to the Minister of Culture who has the power to take the final decision as to what classification should be imposed upon a film – if he decides to impose a sign other than "suitable for all", the decision must be justified.<sup>37</sup> The Minister can ask, with a proper reason, for a new viewing and opinion by the *Assemblée pleinière*. If he wishes to impose a stricter classification to a film than the one recommended by the Commission, he has to request a new viewing from the *Assemblée pleinière*. In all circumstances, the decision to deliver a visa belongs to the Minister of Culture. This implies that the decision of what classification to apply to a film also belongs to the Minister of Culture because the granting of the visa is the condition for a film to be legally shown on screens.<sup>38</sup>

## 2.3. Differences in the regulation of TV and cinema

Both regulations in TV and cinema have the aim to protect the youth from seeing harmful content. But even though the method used is similar in both sectors, the differences between the two media also lead to differences in the practical application and in the aim of their regulation.

First, the cinema age-classification is not based on a rigid scale with predetermined criteria. According to the CNC, "this classification is mainly based on subjectivity and is hard to theorise". The CNC adds that it "deals with the work in its entirety". Contrary to the TV sector, the classification is not only made according to scenes that the film contains but also according to the theme that it deals with.

The second difference takes form in the efficiency of the regulation. Cinema has the advantage of being a public place, where external control can be put into action by the simple checking of an ID at the entrance of the cinema. For TV, the efficiency of the measures is more difficult to verify and it is hard for institutions to calculate the effectiveness of the classification. "TV gets into homes without knocking at the door. We can prohibit the access to cinemas to children but we can't prohibit Hertzian waves from coming in our houses". <sup>39</sup> This sentence is a good illustration of the differences of regulation between cinema and television.

It is therefore important not to put TV and cinema regulation at the same level. TV regulation clearly has the aim of education and instruction of both children and parents; by the use of signs, authorities want to inform viewers about the content of the programme but don't

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Decree of February 23rd, 1990, article 4 paragraph 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Article L211-1 Code du cinéma et de l'image animée, <a href="http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000020908868&idArticle=LEGIARTI000020907879&dateTexte=&categorieLien=cid">http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000020908868&idArticle=LEGIARTI000020907879&dateTexte=&categorieLien=cid</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> http://www.cairn.info/revue-le-temps-des-medias-2003-1-page-65.htm

wish to concretely prevent a child from watching a harmful programme. In cinema, however, regulation has the clear goal of preventing children from being in contact with any film that could harm their development either by its content or by its theme. The control is much stronger here and consequently the logic appears to be different.

This difference does not hold true, however, for content unsuitable for minors under 18. With the development of technical tools, authorities impose a significant amount of control over this type of content on television. A control which is similar to the one imposed upon X-rated films that are reserved to specific cinemas. The State demonstrates here its will to keep youth away from pornography and highly violent movies and be less tolerance than with other contents.