

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 8 June 2022

CDDG(2022)8

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE
(CDDG)**

REPORT OF THE 15th PLENARY MEETING

21-22 April 2022

Strasbourg and by videoconference

Secretariat Memorandum
prepared by the
Directorate General of Democracy
Democratic Governance Division

1. Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda

Mr Paul Rowsell (United Kingdom), Chair of the CDDG, opened the meeting and welcomed members and other participants. The list of participants appears in Appendix 1. The Committee adopted its agenda (document [CDDG\(2022\)OJ1](#)) as it appears in Appendix 2.

2. Information on recent activities and developments

The Chair briefed participants about the outcome of the Bureau meeting of 24-25 March 2022 (document [CDDG-Bu\(2022\)5](#)) during which, in particular, the work plan of the Committee were discussed and an exchange of views took place on general working methods with representatives of another Council of Europe committee. The Chair also referred to the recent adoption by the CDDG of a [statement](#) on the Russian Federation's ongoing aggression against Ukraine, which stressed i.a. that good democratic governance was key to the maintenance of peace and security. The Bureau further discussed potential impact of the exclusion of Russia Federation on the work of the CDDG.

The Secretariat also provided additional information about the organisation of the meeting. The CDDG took note of the above.

Exchange of views with Ms Claudia Luciani, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance

Ms Luciani provided information about the process which had led to the exclusion of the Russian Federation from the Council of Europe, with immediate effect, following the Committee of Ministers' decision of 16 March 2022. The legal and financial implications had been outlined in [Resolution CM/Res2022\(3\)](#), whilst the many political dimensions and implications of the situation were still under discussion by the Committee of Ministers. In the current context, the CDDG had an important contribution to make in terms of promoting the organisation's values and that the work on principles of good democratic governance and on deliberative democracy were particularly relevant. Ms Luciani also informed the Committee about the launching of work by the newly established Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI), pointing out that there were opportunities for the CDDG to contribute to this work given its democracy-related aspects. In the ensuing discussion, Ms Luciani referred to the downward trends regarding the level of democracy, observed in periodic assessments such as those of Human Rights Watch and the Economist, which showed once again the importance of the CDDGs work in 2022-2023. The Chair reiterated the CDDG's continued support to Ukraine, in particular to its local authorities, as these were often on the frontline regarding crisis management. Participants also discussed matters such as the participation of non-Council of Europe member States in a possible future convention on AI and the financial implications of the Russian Federation's expulsion.

The Committee took note of the above information.

3. Work in 2022

3.1 Information by the Secretariat; updated workplan

The Secretariat presented an updated workplan and timetable for CDDG activities in 2022 (document [CDDG\(2022\)1](#)). It recalled that in the Bureau's view, the tasks of the working group on good democratic governance (GT-BG) and the working group on deliberative and participatory democracy (GT-DD) should remain the priorities for 2022. The benefits of digital technologies for the CDDG's work were highlighted, in particular for an additional informal meeting of each working group before the summer. The Committee took note of the above information.

3.2 State of implementation of activities according to the CDDG's terms of reference 2022-2023 (-2025)

Principles of good democratic governance

The Committee heard an oral presentation by Mr Peter Andre, Chair of the GT-BG, and additional information by Ms Siobhan Smyth, Vice-Chair of the GT-BG, about the [terms of reference](#) of the working group, the results of its first meeting of 24-25 February 2022 (document [GT-BG\(2022\)4](#)) and the structure and content of the first draft of a Committee of Ministers' recommendation on principles of good democratic governance as set out in [CDDG\(2022\)2](#). This first draft contained options for grouping the various principles in six or seven areas (as a result of the first meeting), or for addressing them as stand-alone principles. The GT-BG was paying attention to the national level.

The Chair emphasised that this future new recommendation could become a pillar for the Council of Europe's work on democracy, next to the standards on human rights and the rule of law. M. Dan Popescu, Head of the Democracy and Governance Department pointed out that the CDDG could innovate with regard to working methods; in particular, a public consultation could be organised when the draft is sufficiently advanced. Also, it was preferable to have an ambitious document content-wise from the outset and to delete certain parts later rather than expanding the document in the final stages of discussion.

In the ensuing discussion, participants highlighted inter alia the importance of a professional administration (and thus of awareness-raising and training) as well as the need to avoid inconsistent overlapping with existing documents and standards of the EU or OECD. Some welcomed the grouping of principles but expressed reservations on the proposals made in some cases (e.g. human rights and the rule of law encompassed too many aspects) and on a suggestion to relabel the first principle "representative democracy". The representative of the INGO Conference supported more explicit language on the principles in the operative part of the recommendation (rather than in the annex). It was also stressed that compared to the current 12 Principles of good democratic governance at local level, this recommendation would address new audience because of the inclusion of the state level and thus a different approach was needed. Another delegation recalled that an explanatory report could be drafted if the recommendation itself were not too detailed.

At the closure of discussions, it was agreed that delegations willing to submit additional proposals or comments should do so by the 1st of June, in time for a revised draft to be considered by the GT-BG at its additional informal meeting of 9-10 June.

Deliberative democracy

In preparation of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on deliberative and participatory democracy (GT-DD), the Committee held an exchange of views with:

- Mr Art O'Leary, Secretary General of the Electoral Commission and Secretary to the Citizens' Assembly of Ireland, who presented his country's experience with deliberative processes and highlighted that a citizens assembly provided a safe and open space to discuss sensitive and highly contested issues. So far, Ireland had run four such assemblies, including on abortion and climate change, and they had become ingrained in the political system and even led to constitutional changes. Transparency, fairness, equality of voice, efficiency, and collegiality were of utmost importance for the success of the process. The selection of participants in a manner that ensures unbiased representation of the population, as well as the assurance that due consideration and follow-up will be given to the result of deliberations were particularly important. Thus, in Ireland, citizens' assemblies had been set up by the parliament with a clear commitment to discuss the outcomes of those assemblies. The ensuing discussion centred around issues such as the criteria for recruiting participants, including how to reach marginalised groups; the importance of political backing and how to ensure it; the change in the mindset of citizens and politicians and fostering mutual understanding; the role of digital technology, as well as mechanisms for recommendations to be fed into the overall political process.
- Mr George Papandreou, Chair of the sub-committee on Democracy, Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy of the Parliamentary Assembly underlined that deliberative democracy had the potential to complement representative democracy and revive trust in democratic institutions, yet it was no panacea in itself. He cautioned against the tendency of governments to see current crises, e.g. climate change or the pandemic, as technical problems to be solved by technical means, thus ignoring citizens' collective wisdom. Mr Papandreou also highlighted the potential of digital technology and innovation in designing participatory processes. The discussion addressed questions such as how to counterbalance lobbying and vested interest and ways to reflect the diversity of democratic traditions in member States. The Chair also invited Mr Papandreou to join the work of the GT-DD.

- Dr Andy Williamson, Council of Europe Expert, then presented a “Study on Deliberative Democracy”, (document [CDDG\(2022\)3](#)), highlighting that deliberative processes had distinct characteristics and were one form of participatory democracy. For deliberative processes to be effective, among other conditions, the mandate must be clear and transparent; likewise, findings must have impact otherwise deliberative processes lack credibility. Mr Williamson also pointed out that deliberative processes required new skills and a change of culture by public authorities, when it comes to interactions with citizens, how to listen to their needs etc. Furthermore, the evidence collected throughout a deliberative process needed to be well balanced and to reflect the plurality of perspectives. The subsequent discussion addressed the appropriate timing of deliberative processes; the relations and interaction between deliberative and representative democracy; the mandate of the deliberative body; the recruitment of participants; factors of success such as facilitation of discussions, a flexible design, the level of resources as well as the provision of balanced information; how to mitigate the risk of manipulation.

At the closure of discussions, the Committee entrusted the working group with the drafting of a report focusing on the position of deliberative democracy in the context of representative democracy; by identifying preconditions for deliberative processes to be effective, taking into account that democracy was not monolithic, and that democratic maturity and culture differed across member States; and by adding case studies where necessary.

The CDDG also agreed that, in addition to the Report, a draft recommendation on deliberative democracy should be prepared, provided that there is no objection from the Committee of Ministers.

4. Promoting democratic governance through shared experience

4.1 Reports by members about pertinent developments

Presentation of a research project by Professor Joachim Beck, Dean of the University of Applied Sciences in Kehl, Germany

After recalling the key tasks of his University (including the initial and in-service training for civil servants and employees taking up management duties and for staff of local and regional authorities), Professor Beck presented the research project for which a questionnaire on “Practical examples of administrative modernisation at the macro level of European countries” had been circulated through the CDDG’s [Rapid Response Service](#). This will result in a study providing a snapshot of trends across Europe regarding administrative modernisation with regard to: public task policies (e.g. privatisation/re-nationalisation, de-/reregulation, strategic planning, impact-assessment etc.); organisational policies (e.g. territorial reform, functional reform, new forms of organisation etc.); personnel policies (e.g. status, career structure, remuneration systems, personnel recruitment and development etc.); financial management (e.g. budgeting, controlling, accounting, double-entry budgeting, vertical financial relations etc.); digitalisation management (introduction of electronic record keeping, digital infrastructures, e-government and other “e”-solutions/offers etc.); open government (new approaches to promote transparency, participation of target groups and citizens; collaborative

approaches with other administrations etc.); other approaches to administrative modernisation.

At the end of his presentation, professor Beck recalled that the deadline for responses was 15 June and he offered to present the results of the study at a future CDDG meeting. The Chair concurred that the study would be of interest to many countries and members were encouraged to provide responses.

Information from CDDG members

The Delegation of **Azerbaijan** updated the Committee on: 1. new legislative amendments to improve the collection of local taxes and contributions, 2. new legislative provisions in the Law on the Status of Municipalities, which eases the possibility for local officials to share experience with each other and with foreign counterparts; 3. a legislative package to improve local self-government; 4. the launching – as a pilot project - of an e-portal for municipalities and citizens to facilitate access to updated information on legislation, international cooperation etc., 5. a new project to prepare electronic maps (upon a recommendation from the Congress), 6. a new automated information system for municipalities. Reference was also made to two general priorities: increasing State subsidies to the municipalities and increasing women representation in local self-governance bodies.

The delegation of **Belgium** referred to the development of a framework for deliberative democracy which is aimed at giving the possibility to individual citizens, organisations, associations, partnerships, and entrepreneurs to submit policy proposals and to work closely with local authorities.

The **Cypriot** delegation presented the recent local government reform, including the adoption of amendments to the Law on municipalities, which was aimed at strengthening the financial independence and administrative autonomy of municipalities. The Law on Communities had also been amended to better reflect requirements of the European Charter of Local Self-Government; local government organisations at district level would have direct responsibility to deal with water supply, waste management, urban planning permits among others. The implementation of the reform would be carried out with support from the Centre of Expertise, through capacity building and training of local authorities, among others.

The delegation of **Finland** presented a recent report of the government on the future of local self-governance in Finland, summarised in a shorter paper made available to all participants. The report was included three strategical orientations for the Finnish municipalities: 1. a scenario in which the challenges of the operating environments are tackled with the municipalities' operational reform; 2. a scenario in which criteria for services are set up and the equal provision of services is ensured; 3. a scenario in which the model of uniform municipalities is abandoned.

The delegation of the **United Kingdom** provided information on a recent White Paper on Levelling Up, which included four pillar definitions concerning the main implications of levelling up: 1. boosting productivity jobs and living standards; 2. providing equal access to opportunities and improving public services; 3. restoring the sense of community; 4. empowering local leaders and communities.

The **Serbian** delegation referred to the adoption of a five year-programme for the reform of local self-governance and the adoption of the first 3-year action plan for its implementation. The programme includes a series of measures connected with the planned ratification of the additional Protocol to the European Charter of Local Self-Government.

Members sought further clarification on some of the reforms and the CDDG took note of the above information.

4.2 Exchange of views with senior officials from member States

Exchange of views with Mr Viacheslav NEHODA, Deputy Minister for Communities and Territorial Development, Ukraine

The Committee heard a presentation by Mr Viacheslav Nehoda, Deputy Minister for Communities and Territorial Development of Ukraine about the impact of war on local authorities. Reforms of local self-governance had been put on hold and many cities were particularly affected by the attacks of the Russian Federation (Kharkiv, Mariupol, Bucha, Trostyanets). Local authorities faced a variety of challenges including the kidnapping of mayors, decreasing revenues and handling the increase of population due to the arrivals of internally displaced persons. Regions under attack had to focus on the evacuation of civilians and supplying essential goods while regions located farther from the frontline had to provide support to the former. Mr Nehoda thanked the Council of Europe for its support and called for the continuation of the project on the decentralisation reform in Ukraine launched before the war.

The CDDG expressed full support to Ukraine and took note of the call for the continuation of the Council of Europe project.

Exchange of views with Ms Mzia GIORGOBIANI, Deputy Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure, Georgia

Ms Giorgobiani updated the Committee on the decentralisation reform in Georgia, based on a Decentralisation Strategy adopted for the years 2020-2025 together with an action plan. The strategy was based on increasing municipal capacities, providing municipalities with additional funding through fiscal decentralisation, and allocating property rights for unregistered properties. Echoing Mr Nehoda, Ms Giorgobiani referred to the situation of the 5 municipalities in the Georgian territories of South Ossetia and Abkhazia where Russian troops have been stationed since the war of 2008. Ms Giorgobiani noted that public engagement in decision-making processes and intensifying inter-municipal cooperation remained high on the agenda and welcomed the cooperation with international partners.

The Centre of Expertise for Good Governance was ready to provide further support to Georgia. The Committee expressed full support for the reforms and offered assistance.

Exchange of views with Mr Dumitru UDREA, the Government's General Secretary, Republic of Moldova

Mr Udrea updated the Committee on recent developments in local government reform and the implementation of a resilience and recovery plan which was currently in its final stage. He stressed that the Russian Federation's attack on Ukraine had also impacted the Republic of Moldova in multiple ways, among others through a sudden influx of Ukrainian refugees, an increase in food and energy prices. Mr Udrea informed the Committee on progress with regards to promoting good governance in the Republic of Moldova and noted that a new strategy on public administration reform was currently being developed. Transparency and access to information were priority areas of the reforms. Multi-functional centres and unified public service delivery centres had been set up at local level; efforts were also made to develop the delivery of public services through digitalisation.

The Committee expressed full support for these reforms and offered assistance.

5. Review of implementation of treaties falling under the responsibility of the CDDG

The CCDDG held an exchange of views on the current status regarding the signature, ratification and implementation of the seven treaties falling under its responsibility, in the light of document [CDDG\(2022\)4](#). The Belgian delegation informed the Committee that it expected to ratify Protocol No. 3 to the European Outline Convention on Transfrontier Co-operation between Territorial Communities or Authorities concerning Euroregional Co-operation Groupings (ECGs) (CETS 206) by the end of the year. In the context of Belgium, it remained a procedural challenge. The UK delegation mentioned the recent evaluation under the monitoring procedure of the Congress and that the ratification of the Additional Protocol to the European Charter of Local Self-Government on the right to participate in the affairs of a local authority (CETS 207) was under consideration; it remained a lengthy and difficult process due to lots of cross-governmental work and interactions with local and regional partners.

The CDDG took note of the above information. It agreed that in future, the CDDG would carry out a more in-depth review of the implementation of the treaties every two years, instead of updates at every meeting.

6. Centre of Expertise for Good Governance

The Secretariat updated the Committee about the activities of the [Centre of Expertise for Good Governance](#) and its ongoing projects in Armenia, Serbia, Slovak Republic, Estonia, Lithuania, new cooperation projects with Bulgaria, Cyprus, Finland, and Hungary, as well as activities related to the project in Ukraine (a series of webinars had been organised on local government in times of war, giving Ukrainian mayors an opportunity to exchange with their peers). Peer reviews had been carried out or were being planned in Serbia, Finland, Slovak Republic, Lithuania, Hungary, Bulgaria, Cyprus and possibly Albania. Overall, 23 capacity building [toolkits](#) on a wide range of areas were now available to member States. Committee members were encouraged to disseminate them to public authorities possibly interested in their countries and to come forward with proposals of experts to participate in particular in peer reviews.

The Secretariat and the Chair also provided information on the [European Label of Governance Excellence](#) (ELOGE) and the 7th meeting of the ELOGE platform of 25 March 2022 ([DG-AP\(2022\)3](#)). Renewals or new accreditations to run ELOGE had been granted to France, Latvia, Turkey, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Romania ([CDDG\(2022\)5](#)).

The CDDG took note of the above information.

7. Activities of the Committee of Ministers and other Council of Europe bodies

In addition to the general overview of developments since the 14th meeting provided in the information document [CDDG\(2022\)6](#) prepared by the Secretariat, the Committee heard specific interventions.

Mr Christoph Spreng, vice-president of the Conference of INGOs, provided an update on its recent developments and activities in which he referred inter alia to the Conference's concerns regarding the recent dissolution of the International Memorial Society under the Russian Federation's law on foreign agents; on-going work on the legal status of NGOs in Europe; the [Campaign to Uphold Rights in Europe \(CURE\)](#) launched in February this year; a contribution to the World NGO Day 2022 (27 February); the publication in March of a [study](#) on challenges associated with the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights involving freedom of association; the imminent launching of the [Civil Participation Forum \(BePart\)](#); CINGO's General Assembly of 4-6 April, largely devoted to humanitarian matters and the context of war including support to Russian human rights activists; efforts to support a fourth Council of Europe summit devoted to the consequences of the war and a restructuring of the organisation.

Ms Jelena Drenjanin, Chair of the Governance Committee, Congress of Local and Regional Authorities, presented the tasks of her Committee, recalled the [priorities of the Congress for 2021-2026](#) and referred to activities under way and various reports adopted recently including [Report CG\(2022\)42-12](#) "Beyond elections - the use of deliberative methods in European municipalities and regions" and Report [CG\(2022\)42-13](#) "The situation of independent candidates and the opposition in local and regional elections."

The Chair invited the Congress to play an active part in the CDDG's working groups and the Committee took note of the information provided.

The Secretariat of the World Forum for Democracy (WFD) briefed the CDDG about the 2022 edition of the WFD, with a broad approach: "Democracy: a new hope?" (Strasbourg, 7-9 November"). The Committee took note of the invitation made to CDDG delegations to support the organising team of the WFD by disseminating the [call for the submission of initiatives](#) (deadline: 15 June) and by proposing speakers of particular relevance.

The CDDG also agreed to contribute to the Forum in the areas of good democratic governance and deliberative democracy.

Items 8 and 10. Information by the rapporteurs

Edwin Lefebvre (Belgium) and Siobhan Smyth (United Kingdom), the rapporteurs on gender mainstreaming, recalled the value and content of the CDDG [guidelines](#) adopted in 2021. They pointed out that it had been used for the revision of the recent texts produced by the CDDG and that in the coming months, the work pursued in respect of deliberative democracy and principles of good democratic governance would provide further opportunities to reflect on, and take into account the gender perspective.

Mr Peter Andre (Austria), Rapporteur on democracy and technology, reported on the work and first meeting (6-8 April 2022) of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI) which has been tasked to prepare a draft legal instrument on the use of AI by November 2023 on the basis of the previous ad hoc committee's concluding report and feasibility study entitled "Possible elements of a legal framework on artificial intelligence, based on the Council of Europe's standards on human rights, democracy and the rule of law" ([link](#)) which the rapporteur encouraged all delegations to consult.

The CDDG took note of the above information.

9. Presidencies of the Committee of Ministers

The Committee heard information on the **priorities of the Italian presidency**, including commitment to shared principles and values, *inter alia*, dialogues about cultural heritage, sport, social cohesion, etc.; women empowerment, fighting discrimination and gender-based violence, and promoting youth policies; building a people-centred future based on technology and science, including with regard to artificial intelligence. The Italian delegate highlighted the successful launching event of ELoGE on 11 April 2022 in Venice, noting that given the high number of municipalities involved (106), this might be the largest ELoGE process run in a country so far.

Mr Shane Griffin, Deputy Permanent Representative of Ireland to the Council of Europe briefed the Committee about the **priorities of the upcoming Irish presidency** (20 May-November 2022 - [link](#)). Given Ireland's strong commitment to defending human rights and promoting peacebuilding across Europe, the Irish presidency will focus on the three core areas of the Council of Europe values with a view to renewing the 'conscience of Europe'. One focus area would be reinforcing the human rights protection of civilians in Europe in a context of war as this had taken on a new salience and urgency in relation to the Russian Federation's invasion of Ukraine. On the 1st September, Ireland would host a conference in Galway on this subject. The conference would also reflect on the protection of human

rights both in “active” and in “frozen” conflicts. In September, in cooperation with the Venice Commission, Ireland would host a high-level event in Strasbourg on the application of European standards on freedom of association in modern societies. Furthermore, the Irish presidency intends to focus on promoting participatory democracy, in particular drawing on the Irish experience with citizens’ assemblies. A keynote at the World Forum of Democracy by a high-level official was planned as well as additional contributions on the experience with deliberative democracy during the Forum. Ireland was also planning over 30 events to highlight and foster inclusiveness and celebrate diversity across Europe.

The CDDG took note of the above information.

11. Election of two Bureau members

The CDDG took note of the resignation from the CDDG and Bureau of Ms Monika Kurian (Slovak Republic) and Ms Stefania Traustadottir (Iceland). It thanked them for their long-standing contribution to the CDDG’s work and wished them luck. Using the Kudo platform, the CDDG elected Ms Puck Gorrissen (Netherlands) for the period 2022-2023, and Mr Georgios Chrysafis (Greece) for the remainder of the year 2022, to complete the terms of office of Ms Kurian and Ms Traustadottir, respectively.

The CDDG also agreed to suggest to the Committee of Ministers that in case [Resolution CM/Res\(2021\)3 on intergovernmental committees and subordinate bodies, their terms of reference and working methods](#) is further revised, the voting rules for the election of Bureau members be amended to eliminate the need for three voting rounds, given that thresholds are difficult to reach in case of multiple candidatures, making the process unnecessarily cumbersome.

12. Other business

The Secretariat indicated that the Committee of Ministers had just agreed, on 20 April, to transmit to the CDDG, for information and possible comments before 15 June 2022, Congress Recommendation 472 (2022) “Beyond elections: the use of deliberative methods in European municipalities and regions” and Recommendation 476 (2022) “The situation of independent candidates and the opposition in local and regional elections”. The CDDG agreed to prepare and adopt such comments by written procedure.

The Secretariat also informed the CDDG that the European Committee on Legal Cooperation (CDCJ), had recently sent a request for possible comments and/or additional information on a draft evaluation report on Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)7 on the protection of whistleblowers. The CDDG agreed that the draft should be circulated, and possible inputs should be collected within the deadline (15 May).

13 and 14. Date of the next meeting; adoption of the abridged report

The CDDG agreed that its 16th meeting be held on 28-29 November 2022, preferably in-person. It also considered and adopted the draft abridged report. The full report will be sent at a later date. The Chair thanked all participants for the fruitful discussions, the Secretariat and interpreters for their support, and closed the meeting.

APPENDIX 1
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MEMBERS / MEMBRES

CHAIR / PRESIDENT

Mr Paul ROWSELL, Head of Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government, LONDON

ARMENIA / ARMENIE

Mr Vache TERTERYAN, Deputy Minister of Territorial Administration and Infrastructure, YEREVAN

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Mr Peter ANDRE, Ministry of Interior, Senior Expert for Legal Affairs, Wien

Mag. Stefan GÖLLER, Legal expert, Office of the Vienna Provincial Government, Department for European Affairs, Wien

Mr Gregor WENDA, Deputy Head of Electoral Affairs Department, Directorate General of Legal Affairs, Federal Ministry of the Interior, Vienna

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Mr Emin ASLANOV, senior advisor, Department of Foreign Policy Affairs of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Azerbaijan Baku

Mr Seymur NAGHIYEV, Chief Advisor, Ministry of Justice, Centre for Work with Municipalities, Baku

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Mr Edwin LEFEBRE, Deputy Director, Ministry of the Flemish Community, Agency for Home Affairs, Brussels

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

Ambassador Almir ŠAHOVIĆ, Ambassador of Bosnia and Herzegovina to the Netherlands, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Sarajevo

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Mr Mihail VASILEV, State expert, Directorate "Spatial Development and Administrative-territorial Structure", Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works, SOFIA

CROATIA / CROATIE

Ms Leda LEPRI, Senior Advisor – Specialist, Ministry of Justice and Public Administration

Mr Josip ALFIREVIC, Expert Associate, Ministry of Justice and Public Administration

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Ms Kakia DEMETRIOU, Administrative Officer A, Ministry of the Interior, NICOSIA

CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Mr Petr FEJTEK, Senior Administrative Advisor, Department for Strategic Development and Coordination of Public Administration, Ministry of Interior of the Czech Republic, PRAHA

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Mr Mads HOLT, Special Advisor, Department of Public Administrative Law, Ministry of the Interior and Housing, COPENHAGEN

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Mr Mart UUSJÄRV, Head of Local Governance Department, The Ministry of Finance

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Mr Markku MÖLLÄRI, Ministerial adviser, Department for Local Affairs and Regional Administration, Ministry of Finance, HELSINKI

FRANCE

M. François CHARLOTTIN, Chef du Bureau des structures territoriales, Direction générale des collectivités locales, Ministère de la cohésion des territoires et des relations avec les collectivités territoriales, PARIS

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Ms Mzia GIORGOBIANI, Deputy Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia

Mr Giorgi DIDIDZE, Head of Department of Regional and Mountainous Areas Development, Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia, TBILISI

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Ms Ruth GRUNE, Federal Ministry of the Interior, BERLIN

Mr Andre SCHMODE, Policy officer, Program management, Federal Ministry of the Interior and Community, BERLIN

Ms Alexandra MESSERLE, Cheffe d'unité, Ministère de l'Intérieur, de la Construction et des Sports de Sarre

Ms Jasmin BENYAHAYA-LÖB, Greffière, Ministère de l'Intérieur, de la Construction et des Sports de Sarre

GREECE / GRECE

Mr Georgios CHRYSAFIS, Directorate of Organising and Functioning of Local Government, Ministry of the Interior, ATHENS

Mr Ioannis MATHIOUDAKIS, Head of the Independent Department of International and European Relations, ATHENS

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Mr David KOJSZA, Government Officer for International Relations, Prime Minister's Office, Cabinet of the State Secretariat for Public Service, BUDAPEST

ICELAND / ISLANDE

Mr Guðni Geir EINARSSON, Head of the Department and Local Government and Regional Policy, Ministry of Transport and Local Government, REYKJAVÍK

IRELAND / IRLANDE

Mr Shane GRIFFIN, Deputy Permanent Representative, Permanent Representation of Ireland to the Council of Europe

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Francesco GIUSTINO, Presidenza del Consiglio dei Ministri, Ufficio Attività Internazionali, ROMA

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Ms Agnese PABERZA DRAUDINA, senior expert, Local Governments Department, Local Governments Supervision Division, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development, RIGA

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Mr Paulius SKARDŽIUS, Senior Adviser, Public Administration and Self-Government Policy Group, Ministry of the Interior, VILNIUS

LUXEMBOURG

Mme Mireille CRUCHTEN, Conseillère, Chargée de direction, Ministère de l'Intérieur

MALTA / MALTE

Mr Natalino ATTARD, Director General (Local Government), Local Government Division, Ministry for Justice, Culture and Local Government, VALLETTA

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Mr Dumitru UDREA, Secretary General of the Government of the Republic of Moldova

Ms Daniela SORAHMETOV, Main consultant of the Public Administration

MONTENEGRO

Ms Zorana POPOVIC, Head of Department for eGovernment, Directorate for Local Self-Government, Ministry of Public Administration, digital society and media, PODGORICA

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Ms Puck GORRISEN, Policy Officer Democracy, Democracy and Governance Division, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

NORTH MACEDONIA / MACEDOINE DU NORD

Ms Gordana GAPIKJ-DIMITROVSKA, State Advisor, the Ministry of Information Society and Administration, SKOPJE

NORWAY / NORVEGE

Ms Nina Britt BERGE, Senior Adviser, Norwegian Ministry of Local Government and Regional Development, OSLO

POLAND / POLOGNE

Mr Grzegorz NAWROT, Leading Specialist, National Institute of local self-government

PORTUGAL

Ms Tânia MOURATO, Head of Department, Directorate-General for Local Authorities, LISBOA

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Mr Laurentiu BUCSOIU, Ministry of Public Works, Development and Administration, Directorate General of Public Administration, Romanian Government, BUCHAREST

SERBIA / SERBIE

Milica MARKOVIĆ, Senior Advisor, Head of Group for LSG system, Ministry of Public Administration and Local Self-government, BELGRADE

SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Ms Nad'a KURILOVÁ, Head of Local Self-Government Unit, Local State Administration, Self-Government and Foreign Relations Department, Public Administration Section, Ministry of Interior of the Slovak Republic

SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

Mr Saša JAZBEC, acting Director General, Local self-government, non-governmental organisations and political system directorate, Ministry of public administration

Mr. Roman LAVTAR, Head of the Sector of Local self-government, Local self-government, non-governmental organisations and political system directorate, Ministry of public administration, LJUBLJANA

Mr Jurij MEZEK, Senior Advisor, Ministry of Public Administration, Local Self-Government Service, LJUBLJANA

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Ms Raquel TABARA ANTON, technical councillor, Ministry for Territorial Policy, MADRID

SWEDEN / SUEDE

Mr Daniel WOHLGEMUTH, Deputy Director, Ministry of Culture, Division for Media and Democracy

Mr Lars KARLANDER, Desk Officer, Local Government Unit, Ministry of Finance

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Mr Bertrand BISE, Chef suppléant de l'unité Projets législatifs I, Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Domaine de direction Droit public, BERNE

TÜRKIYE

Mr Sertac SEZGIN, Controller of Municipalities, General Directorate of Provincial Administrations, Ministry of Interior, ANKARA

Mr Çağatay Emre KILINÇ, Expert, Union of Municipalities of Türkiye, Department of International Affairs

UKRAINE

Mr Viacheslav NEHODA, Deputy Minister for Communities and Territorial Development of Ukraine

Mr Ruslan POPIUK, Acting Head of the Expert Group for Interaction with the Council of Europe Institutions of the Directorate for the Development of Local Self-Government, Territorial Organization of Power and Administrative-Territorial Structure, Ministry for Communities and Territories Development of Ukraine

Ms Olha KAVUN, Permanent Representation of Ukraine to the Council of Europe

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Ms Siobhan SMYTH, Senior Policy Adviser, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government, LONDON

Ms Kirsty BROWN, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government, LONDON

Mr Matthew BRANNEN, Senior Policy Adviser, Governance Reform and Democracy Unit, Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities, Local Government & Communities Directorate, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government, LONDON

PARTICIPANTS**PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr George PAPANDREOU, Chair of the sub-committee on Democracy, Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy

Mr Jean-Pierre GRIN, member of PACE (Switzerland, ALDE)

Ms Sibel ARSLAN, General Rapporteur on local and regional authorities, member of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONGRES DES POUVOIRS LOCAUX ET REGIONAUX DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Ms Jelena DRENJANIN, Chair of the Governance Committee

Mr Roman CHLAPAK, Secretary of the Committee, Governance Committee

Ms Mathilde GIRARDI, co-secretary a.i., Governance Committee

CONFERENCE OF INGOS OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONFERENCE DES OING DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Mr Christoph SPRENG, Representative of the INGOs Conference to the CDDG, Initiatives of Change-International

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS**EUROPEAN UNION TO THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / UNION EUROPEENNE AUPRES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Ms Angela Hadil MAWED, Legal Affairs Trainee

BENELUX UNION/UNION BENELUX

Mr Hans MOOREN, Team Interne Market and Economie, Brussels

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS**COUNCIL OF EUROPEAN MUNICIPALITIES AND REGIONS (CEMR) / CONSEIL DES COMMUNES ET REGIONS D'EUROPE (CCRE)**

Ms Maeva DEJUAN, stagiaire, Territoires

CONSULTANT EXPERT / EXPERT CONSULTANT

Dr Andy WILLIAMSON, Parliaments, participation and innovation, United Kingdom

GUEST SPEAKERS / INTERVENANTS

Professor Joachim BECK, Dean of the University of Applied Sciences in Kehl, Germany

Mr Art O'LEARY, Secretary General of the Electoral Commission and Secretary to the Citizens' Assembly

SECRETARIAT

Secretariat of the CDDG / Secrétariat du CDDG

Ms Alina TATARENKO – Head of the Democratic Governance Division / Secretary of the CDDG / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy

Mr Christophe SPECKBACHER, Administrator – Democratic Governance Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy

Ms Judith ORLAND, Democratic Governance Division – Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance - Directorate General of Democracy

Ms Isabelle ETTER, Assistant

Ms Nino MAKHAURI, Trainee

Other Secretariat participating in the meeting /Autre Secrétariat participant à la réunion

Ms Claudia LUCIANI, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy

Mr Daniel POPESCU, Head of Democracy and Governance Department / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy

Ms Mary Ann HENNESSEY, Head of the Democratic Innovation Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy

Ms Cornelia PERLE, Elections and Participatory Democracy Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy

Mr Niall SHEERIN, Administrator – Democratic Governance Division / Directorate of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance / Directorate General of Democracy

Interpreters / Interprètes

Mr Grégoire DEVICTOR

Ms Christine TRAPP

Ms Sylvie BOUX

Ms Clarissa WORSDALE

APPENDIX 2

AGENDA

THURSDAY 21 APRIL		
<u>9.30</u>	Welcome coffee and pastry, offered in front of the meeting room	
<u>10.00</u>		
1.	Opening of the meeting and adoption of the agenda	[CDDG(2022)OJ1]
2.	<p><i>For information and discussion</i></p> <p>Information on recent activities and developments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bureau meeting of 24-25 March: report by the Chair • Information by the Secretariat: Claudia Luciani, Director of Human Dignity, Equality and Governance. Exchange of views on the implications of the exclusion of the Russian Federation from the Council of Europe. 	[CDDG-Bu(2022)5]
<u>10.30</u>	<p><i>For information</i></p> <p>3. Work in 2022</p> <p>3.1 Information by the Secretariat; updated workplan</p> <p><i>For discussion</i></p> <p>3.2 State of implementation of activities according to the CDDG's terms of reference 2022-2023 (-2025)</p> <p><i>Good democratic governance:</i> Report of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on principles of good democratic governance (GT-BG) of 24-25 February; Consideration of a draft recommendation</p>	<p>[CDDG(2022)1]</p> <p>[Terms of reference] [GT-BG(2022)4] [CDDG(2022)2]</p>
<u>12.00</u>	<p>Deliberative democracy:</p> <p>Exchange of views with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr Art O'Leary, Secretary General of the Electoral Commission and Secretary to the Citizens' Assembly, Ireland and Mr Shane Griffin, Deputy Permanent Representative of Ireland (upcoming Irish Presidency) - Mr George Papandreou, Chair of the sub-committee on Democracy, Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy of the Parliamentary Assembly - Representative of Iceland - Preparation of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on deliberative and participatory democracy (GT-DD): Presentation of the Study on Deliberative Democracy: Dr Andy Williamson, Council of Europe Expert and the Secretariat of the Division on Elections and Participatory Democracy 	<p>[Terms of reference] [CDDG(2022)3]</p>

<u>13.00-14.30</u>	Lunch break	
<u>14.30</u>	<i>For information and discussion</i>	
4.	<p>Promoting democratic governance through shared experience:</p> <p>4.1. Presentation of a research project by Professor Joachim Beck, Dean of the University of Applied Sciences in Kehl, Germany (rapid response service n°48 on Practical examples of administrative modernisation at the macro level of European countries)</p> <p>4.1 (Cont.) Reports by members about pertinent developments</p>	
<u>15.30</u>	<i>For information</i>	
6.	<p>Centre of Expertise for Good Governance: on-going and new cooperation projects - update by the Secretariat</p> <p>ELoGE (European Label of Governance Excellence): latest developments, new accreditations, ELoGE Platform meeting – Chair of the Platform</p>	<p>[CDDG(2022)5] [DG-AP(2022)3]</p>
<u>16.00</u>	<i>For information and discussion</i>	
5.	<p>Review of implementation of treaties falling under the responsibility of the CDDG: information from members of the CDDG on recent or upcoming signatures and ratifications, and exchange of views on lessons and challenges in the implementation of those instruments</p>	<p>[CDDG(2022)4]</p>
<u>17.30</u>	End of discussions day 1	

FRIDAY 22 APRIL		
<u>9.30</u>	Welcome coffee and pastry, offered in front of the meeting room	
<u>10.00-11.30</u>	<i>For information and discussion</i>	
4.	<p>(Cont.) Promoting democratic governance through shared experience</p> <p>4.2. Exchange of views with senior officials from member States</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mr Viacheslav NEHODA, Deputy Minister for Communities and Territorial Development, Ukraine (on-line) • Ms Mzia GIORGOBIANI, Deputy Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure, Georgia • Mr Dumitru UDREA, the Government's General Secretary, Republic of Moldova • Other officials and CDDG members: Ms Kakia Demetriou, Local Government Directorate, Ministry of interior of Cyprus 	
<u>11.30</u> 7.	<p>(Cont.) Activities of the Committee of Ministers and other Council of Europe bodies</p> <p><i>For information and discussion</i></p> <p>Exchange of views with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ms Jelena Drenjanin, Chair of the Governance Committee, Congress of Local and Regional Authorities • Mr Christoph Spreng, Vice-president of INGO Conference <p><i>For information</i></p> <p>Information from the Secretariat</p>	[CDDG(2022)6]
<u>13.00-14.30</u>	<u>lunch break</u>	
<u>14.30</u>	<i>For information and discussion</i>	
4.	(Cont.) Promoting democratic governance through shared experience	
<u>15.00</u>	<i>For information and discussion</i>	
8.	<p>Democracy and technology: information by the rapporteur on democracy and technology, including on the first meeting of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence; exchange of views on the CDDG contributions to the CAI work</p>	

15.15 9.	<i>For information and discussion</i> Presidencies of the Committee of Ministers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Priorities and agenda of Italy (Nov 2021-May 2022); Discussion on CDDG contributions and involvement	
15.30 7.	(Cont.) Activities of the Committee of Ministers and other Council of Europe bodies <i>For discussion and possible decision</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • World Forum for Democracy 2022: information by the Secretariat; exchange of views on a possible CDDG contribution 	[link]
16.00 10.	<i>For information</i> Information by the rapporteurs on gender mainstreaming and on social matters including rights of persons with disabilities	
16.20 12.	<i>For decision</i> Election of two Bureau members. Following the resignation of Ms Monika Kurian (Slovak Republic and Stefania Traustadottir (Iceland), the CDDG needs to elect two new bureau members who would complete their terms of office for 2022-2023	[CDDG(2022)7 + Addendum]
13.	Other business	
14.	<i>For decision</i> Date of the next meeting (28-29 November 2022; modalities to be confirmed)	
17.15 15.	<i>For decision</i> Adoption of the abridged report	[CDDG(2022)8]
17.30	End of meeting	