CRI(2016)28

ANNUAL REPORT ON ECRI'S ACTIVITIES

covering the period from 1 January to 31 December 2015

COUNCIL OF EUROPE

CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Visit our website: www.coe.int/ecri

ECRI Secretariat
Directorate General II - Democracy
Council of Europe
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex
Tel.: +33 (0)3 90 21 46 62

Strasbourg, May 2016

Preface-		5
Main trer	nds	7
ECRI's a	ctivities in 2015	
1)	Country-by-country approach	19
2)	Work on general themes	21
3)	Relations with civil society	21
4)	Cooperation with national Specialised Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination	23
5)	Other activities	23
	ation with relevant bodies of the Council e and other international organisations	25
Appendic	ces	
-	Membership of ECRI	31
-	Secretariat of ECRI	39
-	Meetings held by ECRI in 2015	41
-	List of publications	45

Preface

The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) is a mechanism which was established by the first Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe member States. The decision to establish ECRI is contained in the Vienna Declaration adopted by the first Summit on 9 October 1993. On 13 June 2002, the Committee of Ministers adopted an autonomous Statute for ECRI and thus consolidated its role as an independent human rights monitoring mechanism specialised in questions relating to racism and intolerance.

ECRI's task is to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at the level of greater Europe and from the perspective of the protection of human rights. ECRI's action covers all necessary measures to combat violence, discrimination and prejudice faced by persons or groups of persons, on grounds of "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin.

ECRI's members are appointed on the basis of their in-depth knowledge in the field of combating intolerance. They should have high moral authority and recognised expertise in dealing with racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. They serve in their individual capacity, are independent and impartial in fulfilling their mandate, and do not receive any instructions from their government.

ECRI's statutory activities are: country monitoring; work on general themes; and relations with civil society. ECRI's strategy for constantly enhancing its activities is to take a step-by-step approach, building on the work it has already accomplished by evaluating, consolidating and extending its action.

Main trends

Introduction

- 1. Each year, as an introduction to its annual report, ECRI outlines the main trends in the fields of racism, racial discrimination¹, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance in Europe. The purpose of this exercise is to show the context in which ECRI must continue its efforts and step up its action in the future. The precise characteristics and extent of these trends, observed in the course of ECRI's various activities, vary from region to region and country to country. They are, however, sufficiently widespread to justify a special mention.
- 2. The year 2015 was characterised by two main separate developments that affected areas of concern to ECRI: the ongoing migration crisis² and the Islamist terror attacks that were carried out in Paris in the months of January and November and in Copenhagen in February.

¹ According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 7, racism is the belief that a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin justifies contempt for a person or a group of persons, or the notion of superiority of a person or a group of persons. Racial discrimination is any differential treatment based on a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin, which has no objective and reasonable justification.

² The term "migration" is used here to cover the broad spectrum of different reasons that led people to leave their country of origin. While many migrants received refugee status in the recipient countries, others had their asylum claims rejected or, in some cases, did not submit an application for asylum in the first place. The term "crisis" is used in order to describe adequately the hardship and the loss of life, especially in the Aegean Sea, that characterises this migration flow. Furthermore, it is also used to denote the situation in which the authorities in the recipient countries find themselves, as they need to provide shelter, health care, daily necessities and administrative support on an unexpected scale.

The migration crisis

- 3. Europe witnessed an unprecedentedly high number of migrants fleeing war, persecution and poverty. In addition to crossing the Mediterranean Sea from North Africa, which was already a common occurrence in previous years, migrants increasingly made their way to western Europe via the so-called "Balkan route". Many of them were Syrians, Iraqis and Afghans. The total number of migrants over the year is unknown. The vast majority of them were headed for just a small number of central and northern European countries as their final destination. It is estimated, for example, that over one million migrants entered Germany, the country that received the largest number during the year. Sweden also received a large number of migrants, making it the European Union country with the highest ratio of new arrivals in proportion to the overall population.
- 4. Some countries along the Balkan route facilitated the passage of migrants northwards, while at the same time succumbing to xenophobic public opinion in their own countries and discouraging them from remaining on their territory. In other cases, governments were openly hostile, resorting to restrictive border regimes and even the construction of fences to prevent migrants from entering their territory. In some cases, governments criminalised the provision of aid to irregular migrants, needlessly blurring the legal boundaries between aiding and abetting human trafficking and providing humanitarian assistance. Over the course of the year, more and more Schengen-area states also reintroduced border controls, initially declaring them to be short-term measures, but subsequently extending them, casting doubt on the future of the Schengen agreement for border-free travel as a whole.
- 5. In the countries of final destination, a mixture of reactions and policies could be observed. On the one hand, several governments announced further measures to deter migrants, such as cuts to benefits for asylum seekers and more restrictive conditions for family reunification. These measures were often part of a deliberate strategy to make their country comparatively less attractive for migrants. Furthermore, discussions were initiated in some countries about establishing upper limits to the number of migrants that a country would receive. The latter prompted criticism

8

that such a move would undermine the right to have one's application for asylum considered.

- 6. On the other hand, a "welcome culture" also developed in several countries, which involved central authorities, municipalities, and many local volunteers who dedicated their time, and often also material resources, to assisting the people who arrived in their towns and neighbourhoods. An outpouring of solidarity spread across many countries, in particular after the pictures of the three-year-old Alan Kurdi, a young Syrian boy who had drowned off the Turkish coast, circulated in the mass media. However, over the course of the second half of 2015, scepticism about countries' and in particular local communities' ability to cope with the increasing number of migrants was voiced more frequently, while at the same time openly xenophobic, in particular islamophobic, voices were heard as well.
- 7. In the context of this situation, and following a trend already established in recent years after the arrival of a growing number of migrants in Italy and Greece, the public discourse in many countries again focused on differentiating between refugees fleeing war or persecution and those migrants who left their country of origin due to economic circumstances. Guaranteeing a minimum of basic rights also to persons belonging to the latter category, who are very often in an irregular situation concerning their residence status, has not been sufficiently addressed and specific policy guidance on the rights of this group was largely absent. ECRI has endeavoured to fill this gap with the development of a new General Policy Recommendation (GPR) on this issue. The GPR does not seek to address member States' law and practices regarding the entry, expulsion or detention of irregularly present migrants, but aims at helping member States secure human rights to all persons within their jurisdiction irrespective of immigration or migratory status, as long as they are present there.
- 8. In the context of discussions to find an EU-wide approach towards migration, a strong difference in attitudes among member States became visible. While some countries, which had generously accepted large numbers of migrants, requested a mechanism to distribute migrants more evenly across the EU, other member States rejected such ideas. The latter states insisted on not being countries of immigration and some governments even openly stated that while

they would be prepared to receive a small number of refugees, they would only accept Christians and not Muslims. Such open discrimination on religious grounds contributed further to a growing climate of Islamophobia across the continent. The situation within the EU has also been further complicated by the fact that the Dublin agreement, which regulates certain aspects related to asylum procedures within the EU and according to which asylum seekers can be returned to the first EU member State they reached in order to apply for asylum there, was de facto suspended during the course of the year, but without any formal decision or agreement on a new mechanism. In addition, a discussion has been initiated at EU level on the possibility of allowing, in certain circumstances, differential treatment of immigrants from other EU member States in the area of social welfare.

- 9. The increase in hostile attitudes towards migrants also contributed to creating a situation in which a growing number of attacks against reception centres and other types of accommodation was carried out. Law enforcement officials in Germany, for example, also noted that while similar attacks had previously been carried out mainly by members of right-wing extremist organisations, they are now also initiated by local residents without an affiliation to a specific political organisation.
- 10. The overall situation highlights the need to combat racist violence and hate speech and implement effective integration strategies, as ECRI has always recommended. Moreover, the principle of fair distribution, for which ECRI has also advocated in the past, is a key element for the development of effective policies in this delicate area.

Islamist terror attacks

11. The deadly terrorist attacks carried out in Paris in January 2015 against the offices and staff of the satirical magazine *Charlie Hebdo* and against the kosher supermarket Hyper Cacher caused public outcry across Europe. Although the French government, as well as many others, called on the public not to engage in general stigmatisation of all Muslims, islamophobic tendencies that were already present in many countries were exacerbated further. The events in Copenhagen during the following month, in which a

discussion event entitled "Art, Blasphemy and Freedom of Expression" and shortly afterwards the city's synagogue were attacked, added further fuel to a general debate in which populist groups continued to brand Islam as incompatible with European values, in particular freedom of expression, freedom of the press and artistic freedom.

12. This islamophobic trend merged, especially during the second half of the year, with the growing anti-immigrant sentiments as a result of the ongoing influx of large numbers of migrants particularly from Muslim countries. The Islamist terror attacks in November in Paris, during which the Bataclan concert hall as well as several bars and restaurants and the national football stadium were targeted, added a further momentum to a merger of these two developments in populist rhetoric. Already in its 2014 Annual Report, ECRI pointed out that the growing trend of Islamophobia has the potential of counteracting the integration efforts made so far. In this regard, ECRI has also repeatedly emphasised the importance of its GPR No. 8 on combating racism while fighting terrorism.

Hate Speech

Despite the regrettable lack of accurate and homogeneous data regarding the extend of the use of hate speech, specific instances of antisemitic hate speech, originating inter alia also from radicalised Muslims, and islamophobic hate speech, including on the Internet and in social media, demonstrate the utmost importance that should be accorded to preventing and combating hate speech in Europe. This situation also shows the urgent need to prevent extremism and violence, as was recognised by the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers, which adopted in May 2015 the Action Plan for the fight against violent extremism and radicalisation leading to terrorism, and by the European Commission, which held its first Colloquium on Fundamental Rights, entitled "Tolerance and respect: Living better together", in October 2015. It was acknowledged on both occasions that fighting antisemitism and Islamophobia is not just a task for the Jewish and Muslim communities, but for society as a whole. ECRI has also contributed to these efforts by developing a new GPR on combating hate speech. This GPR builds on the findings and recommendations published by ECRI during its 5th monitoring cycle. It provides a large

spectrum of measures that should be taken in order to avoid the development of negative attitudes towards groups of concern to ECRI, which could hinder their integration into society and favour radicalisation.

Austerity measures

- The broader political context in 2015 was also characterised 14 by a continuation of austerity measures, which affected many countries, including those already struggling with the economic and social crisis. vulnerable The most groups were often disproportionately affected by cuts in the social welfare, education, healthcare and housing sectors. In several countries, this situation seemed to threaten social cohesion as a whole and inadvertently resulted in pitting different marginalised groups against each other. Declining levels of tolerance towards groups of concern to ECRI and increased xenophobia were observed as a result.
- 15. Budget cuts also affected institutions and measures put in place to prevent and combat racism and intolerance, including awareness-raising and outreach programmes, local community initiatives and support for civil society organisations engaged in working with vulnerable groups of concern to ECRI. This problem has been pointed out in several of ECRI's 5th cycle monitoring reports, was the subject of discussions during annual seminars with specialised bodies organised by ECRI, and was also further analysed in a study commissioned to look at cooperation between local authorities and equality bodies.

Specialised Bodies³

16. The situation of specialised bodies has also been affected in many countries by the general austerity measures and budget cuts. Although the tasks and the scale of the problem continued to increase, the financial and human resources have rarely been adjusted accordingly. Limited resources and expertise can also affect

12

³ Independent authorities expressly entrusted with the fight against racism, xenophobia, antisemitism, intolerance and discrimination on grounds such as ethnic origin, colour, citizenship, religion and language (racial discrimination), at national level.

specialised bodies' ability to fulfil their advisory role to legislative and executive authorities, as well as other stakeholders, which is emphasised in ECRI's GPR No. 2 on specialised bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at national level.

17. In several countries, specialised bodies do not have the resources to open or maintain regional or local offices, which could often better assist victims of discrimination as compared to centralised offices in the capital city. ECRI criticised the absence of regional and local offices in several country monitoring reports and recommended that the respective authorities provide the necessary funding to open such offices.

Under-reporting of hate crime and discrimination

18. Under-reporting of hate crime and discrimination has many causes, including lack of willingness among law enforcement bodies to investigate such cases or lack of trust among vulnerable groups in the police. In 2015, ECRI's annual seminar with specialised bodies looked, inter alia, at the role of the police in countering under-reporting and encouraging potential victims to report cases. One of the results of the difficult financial situation of specialised bodies in many countries is their limited capacity to conduct outreach and public awareness-raising activities to make more people fully aware of their rights and the available mechanisms to lodge a complaint and seek redress. Under-reporting, in turn, makes it more difficult to understand trends in the area of discrimination and place issues on the political agenda in order to build consensus in society about how best to tackle these problems.

The European Convention on Human Rights

19. Protocol No. 12, which supplements the European Convention on Human Rights by prohibiting discrimination in general, has now been ratified by 19 of the 47 member States of the Council of Europe, as compared with 18 in 2014. Malta was the latest country to ratify the Protocol in December 2015 and should be commended. ECRI will continue to recommend ratification of this instrument in the course of its country monitoring.

20. ECRI is pleased to note that its standards and country findings continue to be referred to by the European Court of Human Rights in its judgments. In 2015 the Court cited ECRI's work in the following judgments: Sargysan v. Azerbaijan (Application No. 40167/06), Grand Chamber Judgment, 16 June 2015; V.M. and others v. Belgium (Application No. 60125/11), Judgment, 7 July 2015; Perinçek v. Switzerland (Application No. 27510/8), Grand Chamber Judgment, 15 October 2015; and Balázs v. Hungary (Application No. 15529/12), Judgment, 20 October 2015.

Islamophobia

- 21. As described above, Europe witnessed growing levels of Islamophobia during the year. The fear of further terrorist attacks has been used in several countries by populist political parties to gain votes in regional or national elections. The allegation that some of the terrorists involved in the Paris attacks in November came to Europe recently from Syria via the "Balkan route" has been misused by islamophobic politicians to stir up prejudice and hatred against Muslim migrants in general. As a result, widespread mistrust towards Muslims, including those who were born in or have lived for a considerable time already in Europe, has developed. Cases of attacks against Muslim women wearing the headscarf have been reported.
- 22. Many Muslims feel unjustly under suspicion and complain about racial profiling in policing, counter-terrorism operations or border controls. Furthermore, already existing stigmatisation and discrimination of Muslims in various areas of social life, such as employment, housing and access to goods and services, are exacerbated. While Muslims in general suffer from this, those who choose to lead a life in accordance with strict religious rules, for example concerning their dress code or diet, are particularly affected. In order to address this problem, ECRI has continued in its 5th monitoring cycle to draw member States' attention to its GPR No. 5 on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims.

Antisemitism

- 23. The levels of antisemitism and antisemitic attacks in Europe have risen yet again in 2015, after they had already reached a peak in many countries during the preceding year. The Islamist terror attack against the kosher supermarket in Paris in January was the most visible example of increased hatred, threats and violence against Jewish communities in Europe.
- 24. While neo-Nazis, right-wing extremists and certain extreme left-wing groups continue to spread antisemitic hatred in nearly all European countries, radicalisation among certain parts of some Muslim communities in western Europe also continues to be a problem in this respect. Many states have offered additional protection to Jewish institutions, such as synagogues or schools, but members of Jewish communities often remain concerned about their safety in the context of religious or other community activities. Attacks against Jews who are wearing the kippa in public still occur. This situation has even led some Jewish community leaders to deem the situation so dangerous as to advise not to wear the kippa in public anymore. Jews in some countries also face other obstacles to leading a life in accordance with their religious traditions, for example when the traditional kosher slaughter of animals is banned. In this context, ECRI continued to refer to its GPR No. 9 on the fight against antisemitism.

Roma and Travellers

- 25. Most European countries, including all EU member States, have adopted national strategies, programmes and action plans for Roma integration. They typically cover various sectors of social life in which members of the Roma community continue to be marginalised, including housing, education, employment and healthcare.
- 26. While some programmes have yielded positive results in specific areas, the achievements remained, overall, largely localised and often limited to the reach of time-bound project activities. The large scale and sustainable success that is needed to bring about a fundamental and transformative change to the situation of socially excluded Roma communities is still elusive. In its 5th monitoring

cycle, ECRI looked closely at discrimination of Roma and Travellers as part of its thematic focus on integration policies. ECRI reminded authorities of its GPR No. 3 on combating racism and intolerance against Roma/Gypsies and No. 13 on combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma.

Anti-Black racism

- 27. Racial discrimination of, and racist attacks against, Black persons continue to be a problem across Europe. They not only affect Black persons who recently migrated to the continent, including from overseas territories of some member States, but also those who were born in Europe, or have lived there for a considerable time. Communities of people of African descent have existed in several European countries for many generations already. They too face the risk of being targeted by a growing trend of racism and xenophobia across the continent.
- 28. Black persons continue to face discrimination in many areas, such as the labour or housing markets, where situation testing has shown that they are often far less likely to obtain employment or rental contracts due to their skin colour. In the context of the current UN-initiated International Decade for People of African Descent, some countries, though not enough yet, have placed a stronger emphasis in their national anti-discrimination programmes on preventing and combating anti-Black racism. In this field, ECRI has, for example, emphasised its GPR No. 11 on combating racism and racial discrimination in policing.

Historical ethnic minorities

- 29. The situation of historical ethnic minorities, often also referred to as national minorities, differs largely from country to country, depending on the political approach towards such minorities, which is often tied to longstanding conceptions of national identity. Furthermore, the approach can also vary within a given country, depending on the minority group, its size, location and the nature of its links, if any, to neighbouring countries.
- 30. In many cases, structural obstacles to better integration of historical ethnic minorities persist and social integration policies are

needed, especially in cases where discrimination exists. Relevant areas include the field of education, where ECRI noted in several member States that better teacher training and improved textbooks are necessary. It is also noteworthy that in some countries, historical ethnic minorities are still viewed primarily from a security perspective, which constitutes in itself an additional obstacle to the better integration of such minorities into a country's society.

Homo- and Transphobia

- 31. The situation concerning discrimination of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender (LGBT) persons varies considerably across the continent. While some countries adopted new legislation in 2015 to grant additional rights to LGBT persons, such as providing for the possibility of registered same-sex partnerships or marriages, other countries refused to consider any progress on the legal situation of LGBT persons.
- 32. Homo-and transphobic hatred continues to be spread on the Internet. In several countries, LGBT persons and in particular LGBT rights activists and organisations have become the victims of violent attacks. Homo- and transphobia is especially prevalent in countries where cultural diversity has not yet become a widely accepted and appreciated concept. In some countries, laws restrict the public expression of homosexuality.
- 33. ECRI, in its 5th monitoring cycle, has, inter alia, focused on homo/transphobic hate speech and violence. The development of policies to combat discrimination against LGBT persons and promote tolerance has also figured as a country-specific issue.

ECRI's activities in 2015

1. Country-by-country approach

- 1. ECRI's statutory activities comprise firstly country monitoring work. ECRI closely examines the situation in each of the member States of the Council of Europe and draws up suggestions and proposals as to how the problems it has identified might be overcome. The aim is to formulate helpful and well-founded recommendations, which may assist governments in taking concrete and practical steps to counter racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance.
- 2. ECRI's reports are first sent in draft form to the member States concerned for confidential dialogue. Their contents are reviewed in the light of the national authorities' comments. They are then finally adopted and transmitted to the governments of the member States concerned, through the intermediary of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.
- ECRI's country-by-country approach concerns all Council of Europe member States on an equal footing. The reports for the first round were completed in late 1998. From January 1999 to the end of December 2002, ECRI worked on the second round of its country-by-country approach. From January 2003 to the end of December 2007, ECRI worked on the third round of its country-by-country approach. ECRI started its fourth round of reporting in 2008. This round differs from the previous ones in that it introduced the interim follow-up mechanism: ECRI priority implementation for requested gu recommendations and asked the member State concerned to provide information in this connection within two years from publication of the report. In 2015, ECRI published its conclusions on the implementation of the recommendations it had made in reports published in 2012, namely on Andorra, Croatia, Denmark, Iceland, Italy, Latvia, Luxembourg, Montenegro, Sweden and Ukraine.

19

- 4. ECRI began its fifth round of country monitoring in 2013. This focuses on certain topics for in-depth analysis in all member States: legislative issues, hate speech, racist and homo/transphobic violence and integration policies. In addition, each report will deal with a certain number of topics specific to each country. These will address any other major "racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism or intolerance" issues in the country concerned. Interim recommendations not implemented or only partially implemented during the fourth cycle will be followed-up as well. Finally, under its mandate to monitor intolerance against vulnerable groups, ECRI may address discrimination against LGBT communities in the section on country-specific issues.
- 5. In order to obtain as full a picture as possible, a contact visit is organised before the drafting of each new report. The visits provide an opportunity for ECRI Rapporteurs to meet officials from the various ministries and public authorities dealing with issues within ECRI's remit. They also allow Rapporteurs to meet representatives of NGOs working in the field, as well as independent experts and other persons concerned by the fight against racism and intolerance.
- 6. In 2015, ECRI published fifth round country monitoring reports on Albania, Austria, the Czech Republic, Estonia, Greece, Hungary, Norway and Poland.
- 7. All reports published in 2015 have been translated into the national language(s) of the country concerned and steps have been taken to ensure that they are circulated as widely as possible among stakeholders at domestic level.
- 8. ECRI's reports received considerable media coverage. Reactions to these reports show how topical the issues discussed therein are and how urgent it is to ensure follow-up to their recommendations.
- 9. In 2015 ECRI carried out eleven contact visits in Armenia, Azerbaijan, Cyprus, France, Georgia, Italy, Lithuania, Monaco,

20

"the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", Turkey and the United Kingdom.

10. To be able to maintain this rhythm of visits and the quality of the work which is expected of it under its Statute, ECRI needs a Secretariat with sufficient resources and expertise.

2. Work on general themes

General Policy Recommendations

- 11. ECRI's General Policy Recommendations, the second part of its statutory activities, are addressed to the governments of all member States; they cover important areas of current concern in the fight against racism and intolerance. They are intended to serve as guidelines for policy-makers when drawing up national strategies, programmes and projects.
- 12. In December 2015 ECRI adopted its General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 15 on combating hate speech. It also made good progress towards the adoption of GPR No. 16, which concerns safeguarding irregularly present migrants from discrimination. Final adoption of this GPR is expected in March 2016.

3. Relations with civil society

- 13. Combating racism and intolerance can only be effective if the message filters down to society in general. Awareness-raising and a communication strategy are, therefore, essential. ECRI attaches great importance to this third part of its statutory activities.
- 14. ECRI participated in and contributed to events organised by civil society, such as a sounding forum organised by the German Foundation "Remembrance, Responsibility and the Future" on an interdisciplinary research and action project entitled "Facing Prejudice European Initiative on Antisemitism and Antitziganisme in several European countries" in Berlin in

January 2015 and a symposium on the role of state institutions in overcoming anti-gypsyism in Europe organised by the Open Society Foundation and the Schwarzkopf Stiftung Young Europe in December 2015. ECRI participated in a summer school on human rights organised by the Conference of European Churches, in Hagaberg, Sweden, in May 2015 and a conference on advancing freedom of religion or belief for all in Halki, Turkey in September 2015. With regard to co-operation with academic institutions, ECRI attended a symposium on racism and intolerance organised by the University of Osaka, Japan and an international expert conference on the new Venice Commission/ODIHR guidelines - potentials in civic education and awareness-raising soft (institutional) law on FORB (freedom of religion or belief) at the University of Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium. ECRI also participated in a G20 Summit parallel event, the 2015 G20 Interfaith Summit on Religion, Harmony and Sustainable Development, which took place in November in Istanbul, Turkey.

Organisation of national round tables in member States

- 15. As an important tool to facilitate dialogue between state and non-state actors on issues related to the fight against racism and intolerance, ECRI organises national round tables following the publication of its country-specific monitoring reports. These events are addressed to various actors in civil society as well as to government officials in order to discuss jointly how best to promote the implementation of ECRI's recommendations.
- 16. Three round tables were organised in 2015. The first took place in Finland on 7 May and was organised in co-operation with the Finnish Non-Discrimination Ombudsman. A second round table was organised in Belgium on 1 July, in co-operation with the Belgian Inter-federal Centre for Equal Opportunities. A third round table was organised in Romania on 29 September, in co-operation with the National Council for Combating Discrimination of Romania. These events brought more visibility to ECRI's work and ensured greater impact for its recommendations in Belgium, Finland and Romania.

Communication strategy

17. Activities such as the publication of ECRI's country reports, country visits, its seminar with national Specialised Bodies, and its round tables in Belgium, Finland and Romania attracted considerable media attention.

4. Cooperation with national Specialised Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination

- 18. National Specialised Bodies are strategic partners for ECRI. A seminar of national Specialised Bodies was held from 28-29 May 2015 in Strasbourg on "The role of national Specialised Bodies in addressing underreporting discrimination and hate crime". The seminar discussed the contribution that Specialised Bodies can make to overcoming barriers to the reporting of discrimination and examples of partnerships between specialised bodies, NGOs, the judiciary and police in this connection. Representatives of national Ombudspersons and specialised bodies participated in the seminar, as well as representatives of European and international intergovernmental organisations, NGOs, networks and professional groups.
- 19. In addition, ECRI's Chair participated, as a panellist, in the Annual General Meeting of the European network of equality bodies, organised in Brussels in October 2015.

5. Other activities

- 20. ECRI participated in and contributed to many events as part of its co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations, which are described under the relevant section below.
- 21. Moreover, ECRI actively participated in events organised by national authorities, such as a conference entitled "Hate Speech: The paths of racism", organised by the Greek Ministry of Justice, Transparency and Human Rights in Athens in June

2015. It also participated in a round table for national judges held in Madrid in October 2015 and an international conference on hate crimes and discrimination, organised by the hate crime prosecutor of Barcelona in December 2015.

22. At its 68th plenary session on 8-11 December, ECRI held elections to the posts of Chair, two Vice-Chairs and two Bureau members. The elections were held in accordance with Articles 6 and 7 of ECRI's Rules of Procedure. The following persons were elected: Mr Christian Ahlund (member in respect of Sweden) was elected Chair for two years: Mr Jean-Paul Lehners (member in respect of Luxembourg) was elected 1st Vice-Chair for one year; Mr Miroslaw Wyrzykowski (member in respect of Poland) was elected 2nd Vice-Chair for the same term. Ms Barbara John (member in respect of Germany) and Mr Daniel Thürer (member in respect of Switzerland) were elected Bureau members for two years. Their terms of office begin on 1 January 2016. At its 66th plenary on 18-20 March, ECRI held elections to the post of a Bureau member. The elections were held in accordance with Articles 6 and 7 of ECRI's Rules of Procedure. Mr Šarūnas Liekis (member in respect of Lithuania) was elected. His term of office began on 21 March 2015. Moreover, ECRI held elections for the post of a member of the working group on relations with civil society and specialised bodies. Ms Eva Smith (member in respect of Denmark) was elected. Her term of office started on 19 March 2015.

Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations

Council of Europe

- 1. In 2015, ECRI continued its co-operation with other Council of Europe monitoring bodies. ECRI's Vice-Chair addressed the Committee of Experts (COMEX) of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (ECRML) on 17 March, on the occasion of its 50th meeting.
- 2. The Parliamentary Assembly (PACE) and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe (the Congress) are represented at ECRI's plenary meetings and contribute to its work. In October 2015, ECRI presented its draft General Policy Recommendation No. 16 concerning safeguarding irregularly present migrants from discrimination to the Congress. ECRI also participated in a hearing held by the PACE Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination in April 2015, on preventing and combating neo-racism. ECRI holds regular exchanges of views with the Commissioner for Human Rights and his Office.
- 3. ECRI attended a high-level conference on hate speech in May 2015, organised in the framework of the Belgian Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers, entitled "Tolerance Trumps Hate". It also participated in the follow-up and evaluation of the "No hate speech movement", held in September 2015.
- 4. In December 2015, ECRI participated in a seminar organised in Bratislava by the Ministry of Justice of the Slovak Republic, with the participation of the European Governmental Focal Points Network, entitled "National Action Plans as effective tools for the promotion and protection of human rights of LGBT people".

5. In general, ECRI is regularly updated on the work of other Council of Europe bodies dealing with issues related to racism and intolerance. ECRI's Secretariat provides these bodies with information on ECRI's activities.

United Nations

6. In September 2015, ECRI participated in a "Meeting on the Role of Religious Leaders from the European Region on Preventing Incitement that could lead to Atrocity Crimes", organised by the United Nations Office on Genocide Prevention and the Responsibility to Protect and the Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation, in Treviso, Italy.

Universal Periodic Review (UPR)

7. In 2015, ECRI contributed to the 23rd, 24th and 25th sessions of the Universal Periodical Review with its country reports.

UN Conventions

8. ECRI reports make regular reference to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD). ECRI also calls upon states that have not yet made a declaration under Article 14 of ICERD, enabling individuals and groups of individuals to file petitions before the UN Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), to do so.

Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)

9. ECRI is regularly invited to participate in various meetings organised by the OHCHR and to submit contributions based on its monitoring and thematic work. Similarly OHCHR staff members are regularly invited to ECRI's events.

- 10. In November 2015, ECRI's Chair attended as a panellist at a high level event organised in the context of the International Decade for People of African Descent in New York, entitled "Confronting the Silence: Perspectives and Dialogue on Structural Racism against people of African Descent Worldwide".
- 11. At its 68th plenary meeting in December 2015, ECRI held an exchange of views with Ms Mireille Fanon Mendes-France, Chairperson of the United Nations Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent, and Mr Momodou Malcolm Jallow, Vice-Chair of the European Network against Racism.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)

12. ECRI has a close working relationship with UNHCR, facilitated by the UNHCR Representation to the European Institutions in Strasbourg. ECRI regularly receives input from UNHCR concerning its country visits, round tables and various legal issues.

Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)

13. ECRI and the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) continued to involve each other in their conferences and meetings. OSCE/ODIHR is systematically invited to and attends ECRI's national round tables and ECRI contributes regularly to OSCE/ODIHR meetings. Highlights of this regular co-operation in 2015 were: ECRI's participation in an OSCE Consultative Meeting on Responding to Antisemitic Hate Crime, which took place in Vienna in April 2015, and the Adviser on Combating Anti-Semitism, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department of the OSCE/ODIHR attended ECRI's seminar with national specialised bodies held in Strasbourg in May 2015.

14. OSCE/ODIHR and ECRI continue to attach particular importance to the fight against hate crime, an area of common interest also in the context of ECRI's fifth monitoring cycle, which focuses inter alia on hate speech and racist violence. The two bodies co-operate and benefit from each other's expertise and initiatives in this area: ECRI's country reports and General Policy Recommendations and ODIHR's compilation of data in annual reports entitled Hate Crimes in the OSCE Region – Incidents and Responses.

European Union

European Commission

- 15. The Directorate of Equality and the Directorate of Fundamental Rights and Union Citizenship of the Directorate General Justice of the European Commission and ECRI's Secretariat keep each other informed of important developments in their work and exchange information on subjects of common interest. ECRI held an exchange of views with Ms Salla Saastamoinen, Director for Equality, Directorate General Justice and Consumers of the European Commission on 17 June 2015.
- 16. ECRI participated as a keynote speaker on the topic of hate speech in a connected world in the first European Commission Colloquium on Fundamental Rights dedicated to "Tolerance and respect: preventing and combating antisemitic and anti-Muslim hatred in Europe" held in Brussels on 1-2 October 2015.

Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA)

17. Cooperation between ECRI and FRA continued in 2015. ECRI's reports make regular reference to FRA's work. Moreover, ECRI consulted FRA on its two forthcoming general policy recommendations, on combating and preventing hate speech and on discrimination against irregular migrants. ECRI continued to provide inputs to the preparation of FRA's annual report. Throughout the year ECRI participated actively in several

28

events organised by FRA, such as a working party held in Riga in March 2015 on improving recording and encouraging reporting of hate crime and a workshop on communication strategies to promote respect and non-discrimination organised in Vienna in December 2015.

Joint statement

18. ECRI, FRA and the OSCE/ODIHR issued a statement on 21 March to mark the international day for the elimination of the racial discrimination, urging the reinforcement of values threatened by hate speech.

Appendix I4

ECRI's membership

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Christian ÅHLUND	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Jovan ANANIEV	"the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"	5 February 2018
Mr Gabriel BALAYAN	Armenia	7 July 2020
Ms Raluca BESTELIU	Romania	31 December 2017
Mr Sinisa BJEKOVIC	Montenegro	9 December 2018
Mr Thomas BÜCHEL	Liechtenstein	27 May 2019
Mr Patrice DAVOST	Monaco	6 December 2020
Mr Régis de GOUTTES	France	16 September 2019
Ms María ELOSEGUI ITXASO	Spain	31 December 2017
Mr Vitaliano ESPOSITO	Italy	31 December 2017

⁴ All tables in this appendix reflect the situation on 31 December 2015.

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Michael FARRELL	Ireland	23 November 2016
Mr Gilberto FELICI	San Marino	11 June 2018
Mr Fernando FERREIRA RAMOS	Portugal	31 December 2017
Ms Domenica GHIDEI BIIDU	Netherlands	7 October 2020
Ms Nadejda HRIPTIEVSCHI	Moldova	15 September 2018
Ms Vasilika HYSI	Albania	31 December 2017
Mr Rovshan ISMAYILOV	Azerbaijan	31 December 2017
Mr Dalibor JÍLEK	Czech Republic	31 December 2017
Ms Barbara JOHN	Germany	31 December 2017
Mr Imre JUHÁSZ	Hungary	31 December 2017
Mr Baldur KRISTJÁNSSON	Iceland	31 December 2017
Ms Kristine KRUMA	Latvia	12 June 2017
Ms Mojca KUCLER DOLINAR	Slovenia	31 December 2017

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Volodymyr KULYK	Ukraine	10 December 2018
Mr Gün KUT	Turkey	31 December 2017
Ms Renee LAIVIERA	Malta	17 November 2019
Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS	Luxembourg	8 February 2016
Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS	Lithuania	31 December 2017
Ms Ülle MADISE	Estonia	31 December 2017
Ms Maria Daniella MAROUDA	Greece	4 November 2020
Mr Andreas PASCHALIDES	Cyprus	31 December 2017
Ms Vesna RAKIC- VODINELIC	Serbia	6 November 2017
Mr Predrag RAOSAVLJEVIC	Bosnia and Herzegovina	10 December 2018
Mr Jacint RIBERAYGUA CAELLES	Andorra	26 September 2016
Mr François SANT'ANGELO	Belgium	31 December 2017
Mr Gerald SCHÖPFER	Austria	27 February 2020

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Tena ŠIMONOVIĆ EINWALTER	Croatia	1 July 2019
Ms Eva SMITH ASMUSSEN	Denmark	31 December 2017
Mr Sergey SOKOLOVSKIY	Russian Federation	31 December 2017
Mr Aslak SYSE	Norway	31 December 2017
Mr Daniel THÜRER	Switzerland	31 December 2018
Ms Reetta TOIVANEN	Finland	1 July 2019
Mr George TUGUSHI	Georgia	31 December 2017
Mr Michal VAŠEČKA	Slovakia	31 December 2017
Mr Blagoy VIDIN	Bulgaria	31 December 2017
Mr Michael WHINE	United Kingdom	17 September 2018
Mr Mirosław WYRZYKOWSKI	Poland	2 May 2017

Deputies to ECRI members

Name	Deputy in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Doris ANGST	Switzerland	31 December 2018
Ms Cecilia CARDOGNA	San Marino	11 June 2018
Mr Patrick CHARLIER	Belgium	31 December 2017
Mr Stanislav DANIEL	Slovakia	31 December 2017
Mr Saša GAJIN	Serbia	6 November 2017
Ms Carolina HADJIATHANASIOU- SHIAMPTANI	Cyprus	31 December 2017
Ms Dženana HADŽIOMEROVIĆ	Bosnia and Herzegovina	10 December 2018
Ms Ketevan KHUTSISHVILI	Georgia	31 December 2017
Madame Renée KOERING-JOULIN	France	16 septembre 2019
Mr Oleksiy KRESIN	Ukraine	10 December 2018
Mr Paul Aarre LAPPALAINEN	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Alexis MARQUET	Monaco	6 December 2020
Ms Carmen QUESADA ALCALÁ	Spain	31 December 2017
Ms Anna RASTAS	Finland	1 July 2019

Observers to ECRI

Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

Mr Boriss CILEVIČS Mr Pierre-Yves LE BORGN'

Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe

Ms Sherma BATSON

Holy See

Mr Jean-Pierre MACHELON

European Commission

Ms Pia LINDHOLM Ms Linda Maria RAVO

Mexico

Ms Alexandra HAAS PACIUC

ECRI's Bureau

Mr Christian AHLUND Chair member in respect of Sweden

Ms Barbara JOHN Vice-Chair member in respect of Germany

Mr Mirosław WYRZYKOWSKI Vice-Chair member in respect of Poland

Mr Siniša BJEKOVIC Bureau member member in respect of Montenegro

Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS Bureau member member in respect of Luxembourg

Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS Bureau member member in respect of Lithuania

Mr Daniel THÜRER Bureau member member in respect of Switzerland

Appendix II⁵

ECRI's Secretariat

Mr Stephanos STAVROS, Executive Secretary to ECRI

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 30 62

Mr Pierre MASSON, Programme Adviser

Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 30 08

Mr Stefano VALENTI, External Relations Officer

Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 43 28

Ms Camilla TESSENYI, Lawyer

Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 30 29

Mr Thobias BERGMANN, Programme Adviser

Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 46 19

Mr Wolfram BECHTEL, Lawyer

Tel: + 33 (0) 3 90 21 58 44

Mr Denis ROTH-FICHET, Lawyer

Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 56 27

Ms Sophie KURT TORUN, Researcher/Project Officer

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 35 28

Ms Paula ECK-WALTERS, Documentalist

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 33 99

Ms Sylvia LEHMANN, Assistant

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 29 64

Ms Maya RASMUSSEN, Assistant

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 24 02

⁵ This appendix reflects the situation on 31 December 2015.

Secretariat's address

Directorate General II - Democracy Directorate of Human Dignity and Equality Council of Europe 67075 STRASBOURG CEDEX France

E-mail Secretariat: ecri@coe.int

Appendix III

Meetings held by ECRI in 2015

Plenary sessions

- 18-20 March 2015
- 16-19 June 2015
- 8-11 December 2015

Meetings of the Working Group on relations with civil society and specialised bodies

- 20 February 2015
- 17 March 2015
- 15 June 2015
- 2 October 2015
- 7 December 2015

Meetings of the Working Group on Hate Speech

- 27 February 2015
- 17 April 2015
- 1 June 2015
- 16 June 2015
- 5 October 2015
- 7 December 2015

Bureau meetings

- 17 March 2015
- 15 June 2015
- 7 December 2015

Meetings of the Working Group on Irregular Migrants

- 21 January 2015
- 17 March 2015
- 4 May 2015
- 12 November 2015

National round tables

Helsinki: 7 May 2015

Brussels: 1 July 2015

Bucharest: 29 September 2015

Seminar with national Specialised Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination on "The role of national Specialised Bodies in addressing underreporting of discrimination and hate crime"

• 28-29 May 2015

Meetings of CBC Working Groups

Preparation of contact visits:

Andorra:
 Armenia:
 Azerbaijan:
 Cyprus:
 Iceland:
 Italy:
 7 December 2015
 15 June 2015
 22 January 2015
 13 November 2015
 15 June 2015

 "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia":

of Macedonia": 31 July 2015
• Turkey: 17 July 2015
• United Kingdom: 31 August 2015

Amendments:

Austria: 18 March 2015 Azerbaijan: 8 December 2015 • Cyprus: 8 December 2015 • Czech Republic: 18 March 2015 • Estonia: 18 March 2015 • France: 16 June 2015 Georgia: 16 June 2015 Italy: 8 December 2015 · Lithuania: 9 December 2015 Monaco: 17 June 2015

 "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia": 8 December 2015

.....

Interim follow-up:

• Finland: 11 December 2015 Ireland: 17 June 2015 Liechtenstein: 16 June 2015 Malta: 10 December 2015 · Republic of Moldova: 10 December 2015 Netherlands: 10 December 2015 9 December 2015 Portugal: Russian Federation: 11 December 2015 San Marino: 10 December 2015

Contact Visits

· Armenia: 7-11 September 2015 Azerbaijan: 1-5 June 2015 • Cyprus: 20-24 April 2015 • France: 23-27 March 2015 · Georgia: 23-27 March 2015 13-18 September 2015 Italy: Lithuania: 23-27 February 2015 Monaco: 25-27 March 2015 • "The former Yugoslav Republic

of Macedonia":

• Turkey:

Turkey: 2-6 November 2015United Kingdom: 2-6 November 2015

21-25 September 2015

Appendix IV

List of publications⁶

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.1: Combating racism, xenophobia antisemitism and intolerance (Strasbourg, 4 October 1996)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.2: Specialised bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at national level (Strasbourg, 13 June 1997)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.3: combating racism and intolerance against Roma/Gypsies (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.4: National surveys on the experience and perception of discrimination and racism from the point of view of potential victims (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.5: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims (Strasbourg, 27 April 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.6: Combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and antisemitic material via the Internet (Strasbourg, 15 December 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.7: National legislation to combat racism and racial discrimination (Strasbourg, 13 December 2002)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.8: Combating racism while fighting terrorism (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.9: The fight against antisemitism (Strasbourg, 9 September 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.10: Combating racism and racial discrimination in and through school education (Strasbourg, 21 March 2007)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.11: Combating racism and racial discrimination in policing (Strasbourg, 4 October 2007)

⁶ Publications that are out of date no longer figure on this list.

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.12: Combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport (Strasbourg, 19 March 2009)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.13: Combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma (Strasbourg, 19 September 2011)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.14: Combating racism and racial discrimination in employment (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- ECRI's country-by-country approach:

First round:

- Volume I (Strasbourg, September 1997)
- Volume II (Strasbourg, March 1998)
- Volume III (Strasbourg, 15 June 1998)
- Volume IV (Strasbourg, 26 January 1999)
- Volume V (Strasbourg, 13 March 1999)
- Volume VI (Strasbourg, 24 May 1999)
- Volume VII (Strasbourg, 9 November 1999)

Second round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 3 March 2001)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- France (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)

- Ireland (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- The Netherlands (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 4 November 2002)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 4 November 2003)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Compilation of second round reports (Strasbourg, February 2004)

Third round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)

- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Netherland (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)

Fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 9 February 2011)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 13 September 2011)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)

- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)

→ Follow-up recommendations fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- France (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 October 2013)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)

- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)

Fifth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Austria (13 October 2015)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Czech Republic (13 October 2015)
- Estonia (13 October 2015)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Greece (24 February 2015)
- Hungary (9 June 2015)
- Norway (24 February 2015)
- Poland (9 June 2015)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Proceedings of the Seminar "Combating racism while respecting freedom of expression",
 - 16 -17 November 2006 (Strasbourg, July 2007)
- "Ethnic" statistics and data protection in the Council of Europe countries, by Patrick Simon, *Institut National d'Etudes* Démographiques (Strasbourg, November 2007)
- "Cooperation for effectiveness: Local authorities and national specialised bodies combating racism and intolerance" ECRI study by Niall Crowley (Strasbourg, May 2015)