# ANNUAL REPORT
# ON ECRI'S ACTIVITIES

covering the period
from 1 January to 31 December 2010

COUNCIL     CONSEIL
OF EUROPE   DE L'EUROPE

# Preface

*The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) is a mechanism which was established by the first Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe member States. The decision to establish ECRI is contained in the Vienna Declaration adopted by the first Summit on 9 October 1993. On 13 June 2002, the Committee of Ministers adopted an autonomous Statute for ECRI and thus consolidated its role as an independent human rights monitoring mechanism specialised in questions relating to racism and intolerance.*

*ECRI's task is to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at the level of greater Europe and from the perspective of the protection of human rights. ECRI's action covers all necessary measures to combat violence, discrimination and prejudice faced by persons or groups of persons, on grounds of "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin.*

*ECRI's members are appointed on the basis of their in-depth knowledge in the field of combating intolerance. They should have high moral authority and recognised expertise in dealing with racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. They serve in their individual capacity, are independent and impartial in fulfilling their mandate, and do not receive any instructions from their government.*

*ECRI's statutory activities are: country-by-country monitoring; work on general themes; and relations with civil society. ECRI's strategy for constantly enhancing its activities is to take a step-by-step approach, building on the work it has already accomplished by evaluating, consolidating and extending its action.*

# Main trends

## *Introduction*

1. Each year, as an introduction to its Annual Report, ECRI outlines the main trends in the fields of racism[1], racial discrimination[2], xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance in Europe. The purpose of this exercise is to show the context in which ECRI must continue its efforts and step up its action in the future. The precise characteristics and extent of these trends, observed in the course of ECRI's various activities, vary from region to region and country to country. They are, however, sufficiently widespread to justify a special mention. Most of these trends are the result of problems that have existed for several years and have already been described by ECRI. Regrettably, the situation continues to give rise to concern and a number of important questions remain unanswered.

## *Racism and intolerance in political life*

2. Today racism and intolerance are no longer limited to the fringes of society. This is evidenced by the electoral success of extreme right-wing parties in a number of member States in 2010; the holding, on a worryingly regular basis, of referenda targeting non-citizens and religious minorities and, unfortunately, their outcome; and the increasing use of xenophobic and anti-Muslim arguments by mainstream political leaders. Legal means alone do not seem sufficient to counter this trend. More

---

[1] According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 7, racism is the belief that a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin justifies contempt for a person or a group of persons, or the notion of superiority of a person or a group of persons.

[2] According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 7, racial discrimination is any differential treatment based on a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin, which has no objective and reasonable justification.

needs to be done to fight it, such as encouraging adherence to parliamentary codes of ethics regarding the impermissibility of racist political discourse and voluntary "good practice" commitments among politicians and political parties.

### *The economic crisis*

3. ECRI, in its previous annual report, called for the careful monitoring of the direct and indirect effects of the economic crisis on historical minorities (national/ethnic, religious and linguistic) and migrants. One year on, it still seems too early to try to obtain an accurate picture, as in several countries the situation has not yet stabilised. That having been said, the crisis has brought to the fore a general problem concerning statistics and methodology. ECRI has always considered the collection of data, broken down by citizenship, national/ethnic origin, language and religion, pivotal in measuring trends in the fight against racially motivated crime and racial discrimination. How Governments can be convinced that they have to put in place appropriate procedures and how vulnerable groups can be persuaded that the appropriate collection and use of data is a tool aimed at protecting them, and not at singling them out, are largely unresolved issues.

4. That the crisis would bring cuts in public spending was unavoidable. ECRI is, nevertheless, concerned about disproportionate reductions in the budgets of national specialised bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination[3]. In ECRI's view, when assessing such bodies' needs for funding, one must bear in mind the crucial role they are called upon to play at times of economic difficulty. Particular care should, therefore, be taken not to hamstring their efforts and undermine their credibility by scaling down their staff costs and general level of financing. Preserving their effectiveness should, on the contrary, be the overriding objective.

---

[3] See ECRI's General Policy Recommendation N. 2.

*Racist violence*

5. Racist violence continued to afflict European societies during the year 2010, which began and ended with deplorable events involving extensive victimisation of migrants from sub-Saharan Africa and large-scale inter-ethnic clashes fomented by ultranationalists. For ECRI, which has been monitoring racially motivated attacks on persons and property since 1994, these incidents are indicative of a much wider problem affecting many member States. It considers that resolute action is called for by the law-enforcement authorities and the criminal-justice system in every case of aggression or incitement to aggression on grounds of "race", colour, citizenship, national/ethnic origin, religion or language.

*Public incitement to racial violence, hatred and discrimination*

6. ECRI is worried about the most extreme forms of racist ideology which publicly encourage violence, hatred and discrimination on grounds of "race", colour, national/ethnic origin, citizenship, religion and language. ECRI notes with satisfaction that today the overwhelming majority of member States provide, to one degree or another, for a criminal-law response to "hate speech". However, the relevant legislation is not always comprehensive, precise and consistent in its application. Moreover, national courts are often reluctant to consider that there is sufficient evidence for the relevant offences to be established and to apply the corresponding penalties. In addition, there is low recourse by victims to judicial remedies. Finally, ECRI has recorded situations where legislation on incitement to racial violence, hatred and discrimination has been abused by the authorities to suppress the peaceful expression of minority identities.

7. In ECRI's view, it is necessary to promote rights-awareness among the target groups, provide victims with effective assistance to seek redress and offer appropriate training to law-enforcement officers, prosecutors and judges. Reconciling protection from public incitement to

racial violence, hatred and discrimination with respect for freedom of expression should be the overarching consideration. Naturally, the criminal-law response should be supplemented by self-regulation for the media, broader complaints mechanisms and, ultimately, an approach based on a vigorous debate of the underlying issues.

8. The ever-increasing use of the Internet by racist groups for recruitment, radicalisation, command and control, as well as for the intimidation and harassment of opponents, is an issue of particular concern for ECRI. Some of the most popular sites, such as Facebook and YouTube, are now prime locations for spreading racist views, especially among young people. These views must be challenged, while being careful not to undermine freedom of expression. States as well as international organisations should reinforce dialogue with new media, service providers and social networks in the context of the fight against hate crime on the Internet.

### The vulnerable groups

9. Anti-Gypsyism is one of the most acute problems for many European societies. 2010 brought out the cross-border dimension of anti-Gypsyism with member States arguing about which one had primary responsibility for socially excluded **Roma** migrants, instead of living up to their current obligations and, in receiving States, providing minimum protection and preparing for a future without restrictions on free movement. For ECRI, anti-Gypsyism is an issue that calls for action at European and national level (in the case of migrant Roma action is needed by the receiving States and the States of origin). ECRI and its international partners have shown readiness to support attempts to find sustainable solutions. ECRI, therefore, welcomes the political will recently shown by many member States to revisit the situation as well as the various Council of Europe and European Union (EU) initiatives. It also stresses the need to create awareness among Roma communities of the contribution they can make to the success of the relevant projects/

programmes. ECRI hopes that its forthcoming General Policy Recommendation on combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma, to be published in 2011, will add further impetus to the above processes.

10. The unwelcoming attitude towards Roma arriving from Central and Eastern European countries is part of a general phenomenon; as a matter of fact, in 2010 most Council of Europe member States witnessed a marked rise in anti-migrant feeling. Its targets include second- and third-generation **migrants** and even citizens. Special hostility is reserved for **refugees and asylum-seekers** because of perceptions concerning reliance on welfare benefits and competition for jobs. Quite often, religion adds another dimension to the negative climate of opinion. ECRI has, as a result, found persisting problems of prejudice against **Muslims**, often expressed in debates about "values". Islamophobia inevitably materialises in widespread discrimination in everyday life and in the contacts with the authorities.

11. The fight against xenophobia and intolerance has always been seen as a key part of ECRI's mandate. Monitoring the **integration** of migrants and persons with a migration background continued, therefore, to be an important focus of ECRI's work in 2010. ECRI has observed that, during the economic downturn, member States' attention increasingly focuses on migration policies. However, ECRI believes that no migration policy can be successfully planned without taking into consideration the impact of integration policies. And no integration policy can produce the required result if it does not guarantee equal and non-discriminatory access of non-nationals to most rights and opportunities; if it does not offer them a real chance for positive interaction with nationals; and if it does not encourage their active participation in the life of the host society.

12. ECRI recalls in this connection that 2010 was the year when the "multiculturalism model" was brought into question because it allegedly fosters, instead of reducing, differences between communities. Its critics seem to be

mainly influenced by the perception that immigrant Muslim groups aim at creating a parallel society, as opposed to integrating. ECRI stresses that, in order to avoid the emergence of parallel societies caused either by the majority's exclusion of vulnerable groups or the self isolation of such groups, Governments should promote intercultural contact, dialogue and cooperation. ECRI, moreover, recognises that "cultural otherness" risks developing into a new form of intolerance if it implies that certain communities are so different from each other that they cannot live together. For ECRI, ideologies based on the incompatibility between national/ethnic or religious groups present the same degree of danger to social cohesion as those based on "racial" superiority. The answer to the current debate on multiculturalism is strict adherence to a common set of principles, including non-discrimination and tolerance. Member States should seek to ensure respect for these in both the public and the private sphere.

13. In this context, ECRI considers it important to recall that societies that wish to promote attitudes based on equality and tolerance among their most recent members should be seen as sharing these goals themselves. This is not the case when some persons' adherence to the fundamental values of our societies is indirectly or openly called into question, solely because of their background. ECRI wishes to recall that this sometimes happens without supporting evidence, since the authorities do not have at their disposal any real means of testing such adherence.

14. Similarly, ECRI recognises that speaking the host country's language is essential for a successful integration process. However, procedures such as using linguistic tests prior to immigration, especially for family reunification, as an indirect tool of restricting immigration are, in ECRI's view, counterproductive.

15. As ECRI has repeatedly stated, integration is a two-way process, based on mutual recognition, which bears no relation to assimilation. That migrants and persons

with a migration background feel empowered to make certain demands related to the preservation of distinct group identities is a sign of successful integration. Many of these demands must be accepted because they are in accordance with the law, while others can be reasonably accommodated**.** Dealing with the majority's reactions, which sometimes take the form of racism and intolerance, should be seen as part of democratic States' responsibilities.

16. The above-mentioned anti-migrant events that marked the beginning of 2010 have also served as a painful reminder that **racism based on skin-colour** persists. The same is true of **antisemitism**, which is increasingly related to events in the Middle East. Finally, ECRI should signal a number of acts targeting members of other **religious minorities**, including Christians[4].

17 As already underlined in the past, ECRI is aware of the specific characteristics of the different types of racism and racial discrimination that exist in Europe today and considers that special measures might be required to deal with some of them. However, ECRI believes that parallel actions, whose paths never cross, entail the risk of spreading efforts too thinly and wasting limited public funds. Instead, there is a need for overarching strategies which comprise measures to improve awareness of the different manifestations of discrimination, including indirect and institutional discrimination. Authorities should thoroughly involve civil society stakeholders in the design, implementation and evaluation of these strategies, including the setting of targets and indicators.

---

[4] ECRI's policy is to rely on the self-identification - as Christians or members of other communities - of the persons concerned.

***Racism and racial discrimination in employment***

18. The areas in which racism and racial discrimination manifest themselves are many, including law-enforcement and the fight against terrorism, education, sport, health, housing and access to goods and services. In 2010 ECRI closely monitored these phenomena in the field of employment, establishing a working group entrusted with the task of preparing a General Policy Recommendation on the issue. This is a topical question also in light of the current economic crisis, in the course of which Governments have taken measures to preserve the employment of citizens and long terms residents.

***Member States' response to racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance***

19. In 2010 there have been improvements in the response of Governments to racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. As a result, an increasing number of member States have comprehensive criminal, civil and administrative legislation and an independent "specialised body" to combat the above phenomena, as ECRI advises in its General Policy Recommendations Nos 2 and 7.

20. However, ECRI considers that additional action is needed for the correct application of the relevant national rules. It is necessary to train those entrusted with applying them, inform potential victims of their rights and provide appropriate assistance to those who try to obtain redress. These tasks are assigned, among others, to the specialised bodies.

21. ECRI is concerned, in this connection, about initiatives taken in many member States to reform such bodies with a view to creating a single institution for combating all forms of discrimination or safeguarding human rights in general. While such initiatives are not objectionable in

themselves, ECRI considers that it is important to ensure that they do not result in loss of expertise and/or dilution of the message. Moreover, the enlargement of the mandate of a specialised body should go hand in hand with the allocation of additional funds. Finally, ECRI wishes to recall that giving Ombudspersons the duty to combat racism and racial discrimination is not always the most effective solution, as quite often these officials lack competence to examine complaints concerning the private sector.

22. An area where additional efforts are clearly needed is that of policing. Contrary to the advice provided by ECRI in its General Policy Recommendation No. 11, very few member States have created independent police complaints mechanisms.

### *The European Convention on Human Rights*

23. The problems posed by the ratification of Protocol No. 12, which supplements the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) by prohibiting discrimination in general, remains an issue of prime concern to ECRI. Despite its recommendations in the country-by-country monitoring reports, ECRI is disappointed to see that this Protocol has been ratified by only 18 out of the 47 member States of the Council of Europe (the last country having done so being Slovenia). It is hoped that the future accession of the EU to the ECHR could be an incentive for the ratification of the Protocol by its members States.

24. ECRI notes with satisfaction that its standards and country-by-country monitoring reports are increasingly referred to by the European Court of Human Rights in its judgements. In 2010 the Court referred to ECRI's work in the following judgements: Kuric and Others v. Slovenia, Tanase v. Moldova and  Oršuš and Others v. Croatia.

# ECRI's activities in 2010

## 1. Country-by-country approach

1.   ECRI's statutory activities comprise firstly country-by-country monitoring work. ECRI closely examines the situation in each of the member States of the Council of Europe and draws up suggestions and proposals as to how the problems it has identified might be overcome. The aim is to formulate helpful and well-founded recommendations, which may assist Governments in taking concrete and practical steps to counter racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance.

2.   ECRI's reports are first sent in draft form to the member States concerned for confidential dialogue. Their contents are reviewed in the light of the national authorities' comments. They are then finally adopted and transmitted to the Governments of the member States concerned, through the intermediary of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.

3.   ECRI's country-by-country approach concerns all Council of Europe member States on an equal footing. The reports for the first cycle were completed in late 1998. From January 1999 to the end of December 2002, ECRI worked on the second round of its country-by-country approach. From January 2003 to the end of December 2007, ECRI worked on the third round of its country-by-country approach.

4.   At the beginning of 2008, ECRI started a new monitoring cycle (2008-2012). The fourth-round reports focus on the implementation of the principal recommendations addressed to Governments in the third round. They examine whether and how these have been followed up by the authorities. They evaluate how effective Government policies are and analyse new developments. Confidential dialogue has been strengthened for the fourth monitoring cycle. In addition, a new interim follow-up mechanism has been introduced: ECRI requests priority

implementation for three specific recommendations and asks the member State concerned to provide information in this connection within two years from publication of the report.

5.   In order to obtain as full a picture as possible, a contact visit is organised before the drafting of each new report. The visits provide an opportunity for ECRI Rapporteurs to meet officials from the various ministries and public authorities dealing with issues within ECRI's remit.  They also give Rapporteurs the opportunity to meet representatives of NGOs working in the field, as well as independent experts and other persons concerned by the fight against racism and intolerance.

6.   In 2010 ECRI published eight reports of the fourth monitoring cycle. The reports on Albania, Austria, Estonia and United Kingdom were published on 2 March 2010 and the reports on France, Georgia, Poland and "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" on 15 June 2010.

7.   The publication and effective dissemination of ECRI's country-by-country reports is an important stage in the ongoing, active dialogue between ECRI and the member States' authorities. The common aim is that recommendations should be as constructive and useful as possible. More regular contacts, through the new interim follow-up procedure, will assist countries in fine-tuning their response.

8.   All reports published in 2010 have been translated into the national language(s) of the country concerned and steps have been taken to ensure that they are circulated as widely as possible among stakeholders at domestic level.

9.   ECRI's reports received considerable media coverage. A press release is issued and widely distributed whenever a report is published. It serves as a basis for articles in the press and broadcasts.

10. In 2010 ECRI carried out nine contact visits in Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cyprus, Italy, Lithuania, Monaco, Serbia and Spain.

11. To be able to maintain this rhythm of visits (concluding the fourth cycle as planned) and the quality of the work which is expected of it under its Statute, ECRI needs a Secretariat with sufficient resources and expertise.

## 2. Work on general themes

*General Policy Recommendations*

12. ECRI's General Policy Recommendations, the second part of its statutory activities, are addressed to the Governments of all member States; they cover important areas of current concern in the fight against racism and intolerance. They are intended to serve as guidelines for policy-makers when drawing up national strategies, programmes and projects.

13. In 2010 ECRI made good progress towards the adoption of two new General Policy Recommendations. The first, which is expected to be published in the first semester of 2011 concerns anti-Gypsyism, while the second deals with racism and racial discrimination in employment.

## 3. Relations with civil society

14. Combating racism and intolerance can only be effective if the message filters down to society in general. Awareness-raising and a communication strategy are, therefore, essential. ECRI attaches great importance to this third part of its statutory activities. In 2002, it adopted a programme of action to consolidate its work in this field, which involves, among other things, organising Round Tables in member States and strengthening co-operation with other interested parties such as NGOs, the media and the youth sector.

*National specialised bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination*

15. National specialised bodies are strategic partners for ECRI. In 2010 a number of these bodies were consulted in the course of a study on the impact of the economic crisis on racism and racial discrimination. In addition, a questionnaire was prepared in order to collect specific information from national specialised bodies on racism and racial discrimination in employment in their countries.

*ECRI's contribution to international NGOs' meetings*

16. ECRI members participate in and contribute to a number of events organised by international NGOs. In 2010 ECRI contributed to the Strategic Congress of the European Network's Against Racism (ENAR) and to the XIV European Annual Conference of the International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association (ILGA-Europe).

*Organisation of national Round Tables in member States*

17. As an important tool to facilitate dialogue between state and non-state actors on issues related to the fight against racism and intolerance, ECRI organises national Round Tables following the publication of its country-specific monitoring reports. These events are addressed to various actors in civil society as well as to Government officials in order to discuss jointly how best to promote the implementation of ECRI's recommendations.

18. In May 2010 a national Round Table took place in Berlin, following the publication of the 4th country report on Germany in 2009. It was co-organised with the German Institute for Human Rights and examined the following issues: 1) legislative and institutional framework on combating racial discrimination, 2) preventing and responding effectively to racism and 3) integration. Participants also discussed the follow-up to be given to ECRI's recommendations.

*Communication strategy*

19. In 2010 ECRI continued improving its communication strategy. A video interview with the Chair of ECRI, presenting ECRI's activities and work, was produced in co-operation with the Council of Europe's Directorate of Communication and will be posted on ECRI's website.

20. In 2010 ECRI's Secretariat identified 414 articles in the national media concerning ECRI and the results of its activities. The Secretariat prepared "press reviews" providing an account of these articles and of 24 interviews given by ECRI representatives.

## 4. Statement

21. On 24 August 2010 ECRI released a statement on the situation of Roma migrants in France. ECRI expressed its deep concern about political speech and governmental action stigmatising Roma migrants. ECRI called on the French authorities "to combat the racist attitudes and hostility harboured by the majority population vis-à-vis this community".

## 5. Other activities

22. A study on the impact of the economic crisis on racism and racial discrimination was produced by an external consultant, Mr Jean-Michel Belorgey, and submitted to ECRI. In addition, ECRI commissioned a study on racism and racial discrimination in employment. The aim is to review the implementation of existing European non-discrimination standards and, on that basis, to highlight legal and practical problems on which further guidance by ECRI is required. In addition, the study should present a selection of good practices in fighting racism and racial discrimination and promoting equality in employment in both the public and the private sector, highlighting models that could be examined further by ECRI. An external consultant, Ms Geraldine Scullion, elaborated an outline of the study.

23. At its 53th plenary session on 7-10 December 2010, ECRI held elections to the posts of two Vice-Chairs and a Bureau member. Mr Christian Ahlund (member in respect of Sweden) was re-elected 1st Vice-Chair for one year and Ms Vasilika Hysi (member in respect of Albania) was re-elected 2nd Vice-Chair for the same term. Mr Lauri Hannikainen (member in respect of Finland) was elected member of the Bureau for two years. They assumed their functions on 1 January 2011.

# Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations

**Council of Europe**

1.   ECRI is regularly updated on the work of other Council of Europe bodies dealing with issues related to racism and intolerance. ECRI's Secretariat provides these bodies with information on ECRI's activities.

2.   In 2010 ECRI continued its close co-operation with the Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. The Parliamentary Assembly and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe are represented at ECRI's plenary meetings and contribute to its work. On 8 July 2010 ECRI's Chair participated in a expert workshop organised by the Commissioner for Human Rights on effective and independent structures for promoting equality. On the occasion of the 60th anniversary of the European Convention on Human Rights, ECRI's Chair participated in a round table on the human rights mechanisms of the Council of Europe, together with the Chairs/Presidents of all relevant monitoring bodies.

**United Nations**

*Universal Periodic Review*

3.   In 2010 ECRI contributed to the 10th and 11th Universal Periodical Reviews with its country reports.

*UN Conventions*

4.   ECRI reports make regular reference to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) and other relevant United Nations treaties such as the International Convention on

the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, reinforcing their monitoring bodies' findings or calling for their ratification. ECRI also calls upon States that have not yet made a declaration under Article 14 of ICERD, enabling individuals and groups of individuals to file petitions before the Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, to do so.

*Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)*

5. ECRI is regularly invited to participate in various meetings organised by the OHCHR and submit contributions based on its monitoring and thematic work. In May 2010 ECRI participated in and contributed to the international workshop on Enhancing Cooperation between Regional and International Mechanisms for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights in Geneva. ECRI also participated in and contributed to the third session of the Forum on Minority Issues organised by the UN Human Rights Council in Geneva in December 2010. In addition, ECRI contributed to an OHCHR validation meeting on technical guidance for the development of national action plans against racial discrimination and the Council of Europe paper entitled Relevant Council of Europe's Standards and Policies on the Prohibition and Prevention of Hate Speech, which was submitted to the OHCHR in preparation of a series of expert workshops to be organised on the prohibition of incitement to national, racial or religious hatred.

*United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)*

6. ECRI's Secretariat and the UNHCR's Liaison Office in the Council of Europe keep each other informed of important developments. ECRI takes into account information transmitted by the UNHCR in the preparation of its country-by-country reports. During its 53rd plenary meeting ECRI held an exchange of views with the Regional Representative of UNHCR for Central Europe.

## Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)

7.   The special mechanism for bi-lateral co-operation set up by ECRI and OSCE/ODIHR to ensure complementarity between the recommendations made by ECRI and ODIHR's Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department continued to be in operation in 2010. On 21 July 2010 ECRI's Chair sent a letter to ODIHR's Director pointing to selected recommendations contained in ECRI's most recent country monitoring reports, the implementation of which could be supported by ODIHR's Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department. Identified areas of co-operation include legislation, law enforcement, data collection, the fight against antisemitism, combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims, freedom of religion or belief, training and support of civil society, and intercultural and inter-religious education.

8.   ECRI and ODIHR continued to involve each other in their conferences and meetings. For example, ECRI's Chair moderated one of the sessions of ODIHR's meeting on Incitement to Hatred vs. Freedom of Expression: Challenges of combating hate crimes motivated by hate on the Internet, held in Warsaw on 22 March 2010. ECRI participated in the OSCE High Level Conference on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination held in Astana on 29-30 June 2010. During the OSCE Review Conference organised in Warsaw on 30 September-8 October 2010, the Executive Secretary to ECRI chaired the session on intolerance against migrants. ECRI also contributed to the third meeting of the OSCE Contact Group with Mediterranean Partners for Cooperation.

**European Union**

*European Commission*

9. The Directorate General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities of the European Commission and ECRI's Secretariat keep each other informed of important developments in their work and exchange information on subjects of common interest. A representative of the European Commission participated as an observer in ECRI's 51st and 52nd plenary meetings.

10. ECRI attended the IVth Equality Summit on "Equality and Diversity in Employment" organised by the Belgian Presidency of the Council of the EU with the support of the European Commission in Brussels on 15-16 November 2010.

*Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA)*

11. Cooperation between ECRI and the EU Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA) continued in 2010. This included exchange of information and participation in events. In particular, ECRI attended a FRA meeting on Racism and Ethnic Discrimination in Sport and Positive Initiatives to Combat It.

**Joint Statement**

12. In order to give greater visibility to and strengthen their message, ECRI, ODIHR and FRA made a joint statement on the occasion of the International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination on 21 March 2010. ODIHR's Director, FRA's Director and ECRI's Chair condemned manifestations of racism and xenophobia, with a particular focus on the Internet. They called upon authorities, civil society and the Internet industry to take an active role in addressing the issue of hate on the Internet and develop and implement effective complaints response mechanisms while respecting freedom of expression.

# Appendix I[5]

## Membership of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance

| Name | Member in respect of | Term of office expires |
|------|---------------------|------------------------|
| Mr Christian ÅHLUND | Sweden | 25 May 2015 |
| Mr Levan ALEXIDZE | Georgia | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Elena ANDREEVSKA | "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" | 6 February 2013 |
| Mr Mazhar BARI | Ireland | 8 November 2011 |
| Ms Raluca BESTELIU | Romania | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Abdel Hamid BEYUKI | Spain | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Sinisa BJEKOVIC | Montenegro | 10 December 2013 |
| Mr Thomas BÜCHEL | Liechtenstein | 19 May 2014 |
| Mr Tonio ELLUL | Malta | 18 November 2014 |
| Mr Vitaliano ESPOSITO | Italy | 1 January 2013 |

[5] All tables in this appendix reflect the situation as of 31 December 2010.

| Name | Member in respect of | Term of office expires |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Mr Gilberto FELICI | San Marino | 12 June 2013 |
| Mr Fernando FERREIRA RAMOS | Portugal | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Ivan GARVALOV | Bulgaria | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Lauri HANNIKAINEN | Finland | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Michael HEAD | United Kingdom | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Gudrun HOLGERSEN | Norway | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Vasilika HYSI | Albania | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Rovshan ISMAYILOV | Azerbaijan | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Dalibor JÍLEK | Czech Republic | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Barbara JOHN | Germany | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Jenö KALTENBACH | Hungary | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Vigen KOCHARYAN | Armenia | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Baldur KRISTJÁNSSON | Iceland | 1 January 2013 |

| Name | Member in respect of | Term of office expires |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Mr Gün KUT | Turkey | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Marc LEYENBERGER | France | 22 April 2014 |
| Mr Petro MARTINENKO | Ukraine | 1 July 2014 |
| Mr Arvydas Virgilijus MATULIONIS | Lithuania | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Krzysztof MOTYKA | Poland | 2 May 2012 |
| Mr Nils MUIZNIEKS | Latvia | 20 April 2015 |
| Mr Mart NUTT | Estonia | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Dejan PALIĆ | Croatia | 1 July 2014 |
| Mr Andreas PASCHALIDES | Cyprus | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Stelios E. PERRAKIS | Greece | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Tibor PICHLER | Slovakia | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Alenka PUHAR | Slovenia | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Vesna RAKIC-VODINELIC | Serbia | 7 November 2012 |

| Name | Member in respect of | Term of office expires |
|---|---|---|
| Mr Jacint RIBERAYGUA CAELLES | Andorra | 27 September 2011 |
| Mr Albert RODESCH | Luxembourg | 12 July 2011 |
| Mr Jean-Charles SACOTTE | Monaco | 7 December 2015 |
| Mr François SANT'ANGELO | Belgium | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Gerald SCHÖPFER | Austria | 1 March 2015 |
| Ms Eva SMITH ASMUSSEN | Denmark | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Winnie SORGDRAGER | Netherlands | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Felix STANEVSKIY | Russian Federation | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Daniel THÜRER | Switzerland | 1 January 2014 |
| Mr Victor VOLCINSCHI | Moldova | 18 September 2013 |
| Vacant seat | Bosnia and Herzegovina | |

## Deputies to the members of ECRI

| Name | Deputy in respect of | Term of office expires |
|------|----------------------|------------------------|
| Mr Pedro AGUILERA CORTES | Spain | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Doris ANGST | Switzerland | 1 January 2014 |
| Ms Cecilia CARDOGNA | San Marino | 12 June 2013 |
| Mr Patrick CHARLIER | Belgium | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Régis DE GOUTTES | France | 22 April 2014 |
| Mr Saša GAJIN | Serbia | 7 November 2012 |
| Ms Carolina HADJIATHANASIOU | Cyprus | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Ketevan KHUTSISHVILI | Georgia | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Paul Aarre LAPPALAINEN | Sweden | 25 May 2015 |
| Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS | Lithuania | 1 January 2013 |
| Mr Tony McDERMOTTROE | Ireland | 8 November 2011 |
| Mr Antonio MURA | Italy | 1 January 2013 |
| Ms Merja PENTIKÄINEN | Finland | 1 January 2013 |

**Observers**

*Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe*
Mr Boriss CILEVICS
Ms Sophia GIANNAKA
Mr Denis MacSHANE

*Holy See*
Mr Jean-Pierre MACHELON

*European Commission*
Mr Alvaro OLIVEIRA

# ECRI's Bureau

Mr Nils MUIZNIEKS
Chair
member in respect of Latvia

Mr Christian ÅHLUND
Vice-Chair
member in respect of Sweden

Ms Vasilika HYSI
Vice-Chair
member in respect of Albania

Mr Stelios PERRAKIS
Bureau member
member in respect of Greece

Mr Jean-Charles SACOTTE
Bureau member
member in respect of Monaco

Mr François SANT'ANGELO
Bureau member
member in respect of Belgium

Ms Eva SMITH ASMUSSEN
Bureau member
member in respect of Denmark

# Appendix II[6]

## Secretariat of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance

**Mr Stephanos STAVROS**, Executive Secretary to ECRI
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 30 62

**Mr Stefano VALENTI**, External Relations Officer
Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 43 28

**Ms Sarah BURTON**, Lawyer
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 90 21 53 72

**Ms Aline USANASE**, Lawyer
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 23 17

**Ms Camilla TESSENYI**, Lawyer
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 30 29

**Ms Francesca MONTAGNA**, Lawyer
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 33 25

**Ms Paula ECK-WALTERS**, Documentalist
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 33 99

**Ms Sylvia LEHMANN**, Assistant
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 29 64

**Ms Irida VARFI-BOEHRER**, Assistant
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 31 57

**Ms Martine FREY**, Assistant
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 38 90

---

[6] This appendix reflects the situation as of 31 December 2010.

**Address Secretariat**
Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs
Council of Europe
67075 STRASBOURG CEDEX
France

**E-mail Secretariat:** combat.racism@coe.int

**Fax Secretariat**: +33 (0) 3 88 41 39 87

# Appendix III

## Meetings held by ECRI in 2010

### Plenary sessions

- 28-30 April 2010
- 22-25 June 2010
- 7-10 December 2010

### Meetings of CBC Working Groups

- CBC 1:   17 September
  and 6 December 2010
- CBC 2:   21 June 2010
- CBC 3:   21 June 2010
- CBC 4:   21 January 2010
- CBC 5:   21 June 2010
- CBC 6:   21 June
  and 6 December 2010
- CBC 7:   16 September 2010
- CBC 8:   11 January 2010
- CBC 9:   2 February 2010
- CBC ad hoc: 6 December 2010

### National Round-Table

- Germany : 12 May 2010

### Bureau meetings

- 27 April 2010
- 21 June 2010
- 6 December 2010

### Meetings of the Working Group on relations with civil society

- 27 April 2010
- 21 June 2010
- 6 December 2010

### Meetings of the Working group on racial discrimination in employment

- 5 March 2010
- 17 December 2010

### Meetings of the Working group on anti-Gypsyism

- 11 March 2010
20 September 2010

**Contact Visits**

- Bosnia and Herzegovina:  7-12 March 2010
- Spain:  21-26 March 2010
- Armenia:  22-26 March 2010
- Monaco:  6-9 April 2010
- Cyprus:  12-17 September 2010
- Azerbaijan:  26 September - 1 October 2010
- Serbia:  3-8 October 2010
- Italy:  21-26 November 2010
- Lithuania:  21-26 November 2010

# Appendix IV

## List of publications

- ECRI in brief (Strasbourg, April 2009)

- An introduction to the work of ECRI  (Strasbourg, April 2009)

- ECRI and its programme of activities (Strasbourg, September 2005)

- Legal measures to combat racism and intolerance in the member States of the Council of Europe (Strasbourg, January 1998 and revised versions)

- Combating racism and intolerance: a basket of good practices (Strasbourg, 1996)

- Examples of "Good practices": Specialised bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at national level (Strasbourg, January 2006)

- Examples of "Good practices" to fight against racism and intolerance in the European media (Strasbourg, April 2000)

- Practical examples in combating Racism and Intolerance against Roma/Gypsies (Strasbourg, October 2001)

- Legal instruments for combating racism on Internet (Strasbourg, August 2000)

- Compilation of ECRI's General Policy Recommendations (Strasbourg, September 2009)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°1: Combating racism, xenophobia antisemitism and intolerance (Strasbourg, 4 October 1996)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°2: Specialised bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at national level (Strasbourg, 13 June 1997)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°3: combating racism and intolerance against Roma/Gypsies (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°4: National surveys on the experience and perception of discrimination and racism from the point of view of potential victims (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°5: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims (Strasbourg, 27 April 2000)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°6: Combating t he dissemination of racist, xenophobic and antisemitic material via the Internet (Strasbourg, 15 December 2000)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°7: National legislation to combat racism and racial discrimination (Strasbourg, 13 December 2002)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°8: Combating racism while fighting terrorism (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°9: The fight against antisemitism (Strasbourg, 9 September 2004)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°10: Combating racism and racial discrimination in and through school education (Strasbourg, 21 March 2007)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°11: Combating racism and racial discrimination in policing (Strasbourg, 4 October 2007)

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation N°12: Combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport (Strasbourg, 19 March 2009)

- ECRI's country-by-country approach:

  → First round:

  - Volume I (Strasbourg, September 1997)
  - Volume II (Strasbourg, March 1998)
  - Volume III (Strasbourg, 15 June 1998)
  - Volume IV (Strasbourg, 26 January 1999)
  - Volume V (Strasbourg, 13 March 1999)
  - Volume VI (Strasbourg, 24 May 1999)
  - Volume VII (Strasbourg, 9 November 1999)

  → Second round:

  - Albania (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
  - Andorra (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
  - Armenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
  - Austria (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
  - Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
  - Belgium (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
  - Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
  - Croatia (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
  - Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
  - Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
  - Denmark (Strasbourg, 3 March 2001)
  - Estonia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
  - Finland (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
  - France (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
  - Georgia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
  - Germany (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
  - Greece (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
  - Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
  - Iceland (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
  - Ireland (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
  - Italy (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
  - Latvia (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)

- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- The Netherlands (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 4 November 2002)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 4 November 2003)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Compilation of second round reports (Strasbourg, February 2004)

→ Third round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)

- Estonia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Moldova (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Netherland (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)

→ Fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)

■ Texts of international instruments relevant to the work of ECRI (Strasbourg, October 1999)

■ Activities of the Council of Europe with relevance to combating racism and intolerance (Strasbourg, February 2004)

■ Proceedings of the Seminar "Combating racism while respecting freedom of expression" – 16-17 November 2006 (Strasbourg, July 2007)

■ "Ethnic" statistics and data protection in the Council of Europe countries, by Patrick Simon, *Institut National d'Etudes Démographiques* (Strasbourg, November 2007)