

Strasbourg, 8 December 2010

ECRML (2010) 8

#### EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES

#### **APPLICATION OF THE CHARTER IN SWITZERLAND**

#### 4th monitoring cycle

- A. Report of the Committee of Experts on the Charter
- B. Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter by Switzerland

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making Recommendations for improvements in its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, established in accordance with Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to examine the real situation of the regional or minority languages in the State, to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers has adopted, in accordance with Article 15.1, an outline for the periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. The report shall be made public by the government concerned. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under its Part II and in more precise terms all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee's first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned.

The Committee's role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, with a view to obtaining a just and fair overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee submits, if necessary, a number of questions to the Party concerned on matters it considers unclear or insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an "on-the-spot" visit of a delegation of the Committee to the respective State. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. This report is submitted to the Committee of Ministers, together with suggestions for recommendations that the latter may decide to address to the State Party.

#### CONTENTS

Α.	Report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter in Switzerland		
	Chapter 1 - Background information		4
	1.1. 1.2.	The ratification of the Charter by Switzerland The work of the Committee of Experts	
	Chapter 2 - Conclusions of the Committee of Experts on how the Swiss authorities have reacted to the recommendations of the Committee of Ministers		
	Chapter 3	3 - The Committee of Experts' evaluation in respect of Part II and Part III of the Charter	6
	3.1. 3.2.	The evaluation in respect of Part II of the Charter The evaluation in respect of Part III of the Charter	
		<ul> <li>3.2.1. Preliminary remarks on the approach of the Committee of Experts in respect of Part III</li></ul>	10
	Chapter 4	Findings of the Committee of Experts in the fourth monitoring cycle	18
	Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification Appendix II: Comments by the Swiss authorities		
В.		nendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on lication of the Charter by Switzerland	23

# A. Report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter in Switzerland

adopted by the Committee of Experts on 4 June 2010 and presented to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe in accordance with Article 16 of the Charter

#### Chapter 1. Background information

#### 1.1. The ratification of the Charter by Switzerland

1. Switzerland signed the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as "the Charter") on 8 October 1993. The Federal Council decided to ratify it on 31 October 1997. Through this decision, the Charter became part of Swiss law. The Swiss authorities formally ratified it on 23 December 1997. The Charter entered into force in respect of Switzerland on 1 April 1998.

2. Article 15.1 of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports in a form prescribed by the Committee of Ministers<sup>1</sup>. The Swiss authorities presented their fourth periodical report to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe on 15 December 2009.

3. In its previous report on Switzerland, the Committee of Experts of the Charter (hereafter referred to as "the Committee of Experts") outlined particular areas where policies, legislation and practice could be improved. The Committee of Ministers took note of the report presented by the Committee of Experts and adopted recommendations, which were addressed to the Swiss authorities.

#### 1.2. The work of the Committee of Experts

4. This fourth evaluation report is based on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts from the fourth periodical report of Switzerland as well as through interviews held with representatives of the speakers of the regional or minority languages in Switzerland and governmental representatives during an on-the-spot visit (29 to 30 March 2010). The present report reflects the policies, legislation and practice prevailing at the time of the on-the-spot visit. Any changes will be taken into account in the next report of the Committee of Experts concerning Switzerland.

5. The present report focuses on the measures taken by the Swiss authorities to respond to the findings of the Committee of Experts in the third monitoring cycle and to the recommendations addressed to the Swiss authorities by the Committee of Ministers. It also aims at highlighting new issues detected by the Committee of Experts during the fourth monitoring cycle.

6. The report contains detailed observations which the Swiss authorities are urged to take into account in order to further develop their policy on regional or minority languages. The Committee of Experts has, on the basis of its detailed recommendations, also established a list of general proposals for the preparation of a fourth set of recommendations to be addressed to Switzerland by the Committee of Ministers, as provided in Article 16.4 of the Charter (Chapter 4.2. of this report).

7. The present report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 4 June 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> MIN-LANG (2002) 1 Outline for 3-yearly periodical reports as adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.

### Chapter 2 Conclusions of the Committee of Experts on how the Swiss authorities have reacted to the recommendations of the Committee of Ministers

#### Recommendation no. 1:

"ensure that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools is done in a way which has a positive impact on the protection and promotion of Romansh as a living language"

8. The Swiss authorities have taken several measures to ensure that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in school is carried out in close consultation with the Romansh-speakers. Special assistance is provided to the so-called "pioneer" municipalities, which have already introduced Rumantsch Grischun. Furthermore, a study was commissioned to evaluate the acceptance of Rumantsch Grischun as a medium of instruction, the quality of the teaching materials and the appropriate consideration of the varieties of Romansh as the oral form of the language in education. The authorities also envisage a mediation procedure for those municipalities which have not yet introduced Rumantsch Grischun (Surselva, Engadin, Val Schons, Cadi and Lumnezia). The evaluation and the mediation procedure are supported by the organisation of the Romansh-speakers, the Lia Rumantscha.

#### **Recommendation no. 2:**

"take the necessary measures to strengthen the use of Romansh in dealings with Romansh-speakers by the cantonal administration and by municipalities in which there is a German-speaking majority and a Romansh-speaking minority"

9. It is in general possible for Romansh-speakers to submit oral and written applications in Romansh, but there are not always sufficient linguistic skills in Romansh among the staff in relevant municipalities, especially regarding administrative terminology. The Lia Rumantscha provides, with financial support from the federal and cantonal authorities, linguistic advice and translations for local authorities. Pursuant to the Language Law of Graubünden, the cantonal authorities monitor whether local authorities publish their official documents also in Romansh. If this is not the case, the municipalities are asked to remedy this within a certain time.

#### **Recommendation no. 3:**

"pursue the dialogue with the representatives of the Yenish-speakers with a view to identifying the fields of Article 7 that could be applied to Yenish with the greatest possible support by the speakers"

10. The Swiss authorities have carried out regular consultations with the Yenish-speakers which have led to a project on Yenish that was proposed by the Yenish umbrella association. This project, which runs until 2010, aims at registering the vocabulary of Yenish and promoting its dissemination and use within the Yenish community. A Yenish dictionary (with translations into German, French and Italian) will be published. Furthermore, the project covers the production of a DVD in Yenish about topics related to professional, social and cultural life with a view to encouraging the use of Yenish.

#### Chapter 3. The Committee of Experts' evaluation in respect of Part II and Part III of the Charter

#### 3.1. The evaluation in respect of Part II of the Charter

11. Apart from the languages additionally covered by Part III of the Charter (Romansh, Italian in the Cantons of Graubünden and Ticino), Part II applies to French (Canton of Bern/Berne), German (cantons of Fribourg/Freiburg; Valais/Wallis; municipalities of Bosco-Gurin [Canton of Ticino] and Ederswiler [Canton of Jura]) as well as to Yenish, which is a non-territorial language.<sup>2</sup>

12. The Committee of Experts will not comment again on Articles 7.1.e, 7.2 and 7.4, as no major issues arose in these areas during the fourth monitoring cycle.

#### Article 7 - Objectives and principles

#### Paragraph 1

In respect of regional or minority languages, within the territories in which such languages are used and according to the situation of each language, the Parties shall base their policies, legislation and practice on the following objectives and principles:

a. the recognition of the regional or minority languages as an expression of cultural wealth;

#### Federal Language Law

13. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "<u>urge[d] the Swiss federal authorities to adopt</u> legislation which would ensure the practical implementation of Article 70 of the Federal Constitution".

14. According to the fourth periodical report, the Swiss Parliament adopted the Federal Law on the National Languages and Understanding between the Language Communities on 5 October 2007. The law regulates the use of the official languages (German, French, Italian) by the federal authorities and in relations with them, promotes understanding and exchanges between the language communities, supports the multilingual cantons and in particular the measures taken by the cantons of Graubünden and Ticino concerning the promotion of the Italian and Romansh languages (Article 1). For that purpose, the Swiss authorities will allocate SFr. 5 million. Furthermore, the law provides that everyone has the right to address the federal authorities in one of the official languages of Switzerland and in Romansh and to receive a reply in that language. For persons using Romansh, the reply will be formulated in the standard form of Romansh, i.e. Rumantsch Grischun (Article 6.3). The law also guarantees the right to use the four national languages (including Romansh) in the federal parliament (Article 8), within the federal administration (Article 9.1) as well as the publication of important texts and documents concerning elections and referenda in Romansh (Article 11). A regulation to execute the law will enter into force on 1 July 2010. The Committee of Experts welcomes this development.

# b. the respect of the geographical area of each regional or minority language in order to ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of the regional or minority language in question;

#### Romansh

15. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to ensure that new administrative divisions [i.e. mergers of municipalities] do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romansh, and that Romansh-medium education is still available at least to the same extent after re-organisation."

16. According to the fourth periodical report, the availability of Romansh-medium education depends on the thresholds stipulated in the Language Law of Graubünden. The law limits the autonomy of municipalities in determining the official language(s) and language(s) of instruction in schools at local level. If a traditional language community represents at least 40% (federal census) of the population, the municipality is considered "monolingual" and obliged to use that language orally and in writing in all domains of official language use. If the respective population share is at least 20%, the municipality is deemed "plurilingual" and obliged to use the traditional language "adequately" (Articles 16.2-3, 17.1-2). If the population share falls below 40% or 20% respectively, a referendum may be held with a view to declaring a "monolingual" municipality "plurilingual" (simple majority required) or a "plurilingual" municipality "German-speaking" (two-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> cf. 1<sup>st</sup> Periodical Report of Switzerland, p. 9/10

thirds majority required). However, Romansh-speaking municipalities that have merged with German-speaking municipalities before the entering-into-force of the cantonal language law in 2008 can rely on interim measures according to which the language law's provisions concerning official and school languages shall not apply. Furthermore, mechanisms exist to ensure that in the future, linguistic aspects of a merger are taken into consideration. Taken together, these provisions are intended to mitigate negative effects on the Romansh language. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that the merger of the German-speaking municipality of Ilanz with adjacent smaller Romansh-speaking municipalities might have negative repercussions for the Romansh language. The cantonal authorities are aware of the difficulties that mergers at the language border might create for Romansh and monitor the linguistic implications, in close co-operation with the umbrella organisation of the Romansh-speakers.

The Committee of Experts encourages the competent Swiss authorities to ensure that mergers of municipalities do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romansh, and that Romansh-medium education is still available at least to the same extent after any re-organisation.

#### c. the need for resolute action to promote regional or minority languages in order to safeguard them;

#### Language Law of the Canton of Graubünden

17. The Canton of Graubünden adopted a Language Law in October 2006, which entered into force on 1 January 2008. This law aims to strengthen the canton's trilingualism, increase individual, public and institutional awareness of multilingualism, improve mutual understanding between the linguistic groups, preserve and promote Romansh and Italian, and apply particular promotion measures to Romansh. As a result, the canton has increased its financial contribution to the linguistic institutions Lia Rumantscha, Pro Grigioni Italiano and Agentura da Novitads Rumantscha by 10%. The Committee of Experts welcomes this development.

#### Yenish

18. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "<u>encourage[d] the competent Swiss</u> <u>authorities to pursue their dialogue with the Yenish-speakers with a view to identifying the fields of Article 7</u> <u>that could be applied to Yenish</u>." Furthermore, the Committee of Ministers recommended Switzerland to "pursue the dialogue with the representatives of the Yenish-speakers with a view to identifying the fields of Article 7 that could be applied to Yenish with the greatest possible support by the speakers".

19. According to the fourth periodical report, the Swiss authorities have carried out regular consultations with the Yenish-speakers which have led to a project on Yenish that was proposed by the Yenish umbrella association. This project, which runs until 2010, aims at registering the vocabulary of Yenish and promoting its dissemination and use within the Yenish community. A Yenish dictionary (with translations into German, French and Italian) will be published. Furthermore, the project covers the production of a DVD in Yenish about topics related to professional, social and cultural life with a view to encouraging the use of Yenish. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the Yenish-speakers reiterated that the provision of stopover facilities for the travelling Yenish represented the most important precondition for the maintenance and transmission of Yenish. The use of Yenish is linked to the traditional nomadic way of life, which requires the possibility to assemble in groups at stopover facilities. According to the Yenish-speakers, some cantons do not provide such facilities.

20. The Committee of Experts encourages the competent Swiss authorities to consider the provision of stopover facilities also in the light of the protection and promotion of Yenish and to come to flexible solutions.

#### German (Municipality of Bosco-Gurin, Ticino)

21. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "underline[d] the importance of the efforts to support the local projects of language maintenance in Bosco-Gurin and stresse[d] that the authorities should take into consideration the wishes of the German-speakers in Bosco-Gurin in education."

22. The association *Walserhaus Gurin* informed the Committee of Experts of three new local projects of language maintenance. Firstly, a number of former inhabitants are expected to return to Bosco-Gurin which will create an opportunity to re-establish the local school. The association is currently carrying out preparatory work for a bilingual school (Italian-German) which would also offer lessons in the local Walser German variety. Teaching materials for the variety have been developed in co-operation with teachers. Secondly, the association will apply for support from the cantonal authorities for the production and dissemination of information material on Bosco-Gurin for teachers in Ticino. Such teaching aids are supposed to raise awareness of the linguistic identity of Bosco-Gurin as an expression of cultural wealth of

Ticino. Thirdly, the association will apply for support for the publication of a dictionary of the local variety. During the on-the-spot visit, a representative of the cantonal authorities stated that the canton would welcome these applications.

23. The Committee of Experts encourages the competent Swiss authorities to support the local projects of language maintenance in Bosco-Gurin, especially in education.

### d. the facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of regional or minority languages, in speech and writing, in public and private life;

#### Italian

24. With regard to the Italian language, the fourth periodical report states that the creation of a post of an Italian-speaking media correspondent is currently being discussed with a view to increasing media reporting about cantonal topics in the Italian language. This post could be financed with the support of interested media enterprises. The Committee of Experts would welcome more information about this initiative in the next periodical report.

#### Yenish

25. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to pursue their dialogue with the representatives of the Yenish-speakers with a view to developing radio and internet radio broadcasting in Yenish."

26. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed by representatives of the Yenish-speakers that no radio programme in Yenish exists. However, the federal authorities stated that the promotion of Yenish has been explicitly mentioned in the new Federal Law on the Promotion of Culture.

27. The Committee of Experts encourages the Swiss authorities to clarify with the representatives of the Yenish-speakers the issue of a possible presence of Yenish on radio.

#### Bilingual cantons

28. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed by NGO representatives of occasional difficulties in communicating in French with institutions of the Canton of Bern/Berne. In particular, it was pointed out that there are problems with regard to the use of French in social care facilities as the staff do not always speak French. Furthermore, the association of the German-speakers in the Canton of Fribourg/Freiburg stated that Article 6.3 of the new constitution of that canton, which provides for the official use of French or German in municipalities with a "significant traditional linguistic minority", has not yet been implemented by a cantonal language law. The association considers that as a result, the use of German by the local authorities of the city of Fribourg/Freiburg remains inconsistent.

### f. the provision of appropriate forms and means for the teaching and study of regional or minority languages at all appropriate stages;

#### Yenish

29. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to pursue their dialogue with the representatives of the Yenish-speakers with a view to producing teaching materials for use within the Yenish-speaking group."

30. With regard to the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts refers to the publication of a Yenish dictionary and a DVD for pedagogical purposes (see Article 7.1.c). The speakers have not indicated any interest in the use of Yenish in the field of public education.

### g. the provision of facilities enabling non-speakers of a regional or minority language living in the area where it is used to learn it if they so desire;

#### Italian

31. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "urged the competent Swiss authorities to provide information on how the authorities contribute to the implementation of this provision."

32. The fourth periodical report refers to private institutions offering courses in Italian in Graubünden, but also to the possibility of receiving financial support from the canton, pursuant to Article 12. f. of the language law. Contributions can be granted to municipalities, to other collectivities of public law and to private persons. The canton also provides regular annual grants to the association Pro Grigioni Italiano, inter alia, in order to safeguard and promote the Italian language and culture. The Committee of Experts welcomes this support.

#### h. the promotion of study and research on regional or minority languages at universities or equivalent institutions;

#### Yenish

33. According to the fourth periodical report, the federal authorities support research projects dealing with Yenish. In 2008, the "Institut für Kulturforschung Graubünden" published a book about Yenish culture and organised an exhibition. The Committee of Experts welcomes this support.

### i. the promotion of appropriate types of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for regional or minority languages used in identical or similar form in two or more States.

#### Italian

34. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts requested further information on concrete activities within the "Commissione culturale consultiva italo-svizzera".

35. According to the fourth periodical report, the "Commissione culturale consultiva italo-svizzera Consulta" was created in 1982 on the basis of an agreement between the Federal Council and the Italian government to promote cultural exchanges between the two countries and between Italian-speaking regions. The exchanges include measures to promote and raise awareness of the Italian language and culture, interuniversity co-operation and mutual recognition of diplomas and the cultural co-operation between Italy and Switzerland. Co-operation regarding the promotion of regional or minority languages is also carried out within the framework of the "Arge Alp" organisation. The Committee of Experts welcomes these initiatives.

#### Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to promote, by appropriate measures, mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country and in particular the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages among the objectives of education and training provided within their countries and encouragement of the mass media to pursue the same objective.

#### Romansh and Italian

36. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to provide information on measures taken by the media and in the field of education to raise the awareness among the German-speaking population of Romansh and Italian in the Canton of Graubünden."

37. Concerning the media, the Swiss Broadcasting Company SRG is charged to promote understanding and exchanges between the linguistic groups (Art. 24.1.b of the Radio and Television Law). In accordance with its license, the SRG broadcasts regional programmes which inform the German-speaking population about the other language areas. The concerns of the Italian- and Romansh-speakers are also taken into account in the SRG radio programmes. The creation of an Italian-speaking correspondent for the Italian-speaking part of Graubünden (cf. Article 7.1.d) would further promote mutual understanding.

38. In the field of education, the Canton of Graubünden produced a new school book in 2008 on regional history and geography for the fourth to the sixth grades in the three official languages. The second volume of this publication will be printed in 2010. The book, whose use by schools is obligatory, deals with linguistic and cultural diversity in the canton and provides concrete examples. Furthermore, the periodical report indicates that the canton has subsidised a week of linguistic exchanges for German-speaking and Italian-speaking schools, with a total of 202 pupils taking part.

#### Paragraph 5

The Parties undertake to apply, mutatis mutandis, the principles listed in paragraphs 1 to 4 above to non-territorial languages. However, as far as these languages are concerned, the nature and scope of the measures to be taken to give effect to this Charter shall be determined in a flexible manner, bearing in mind the needs and wishes, and respecting the traditions and characteristics, of the groups which use the languages concerned.

39. In its evaluation of the situation of Yenish vis-à-vis Article 7 paragraphs 1-4 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts has kept in mind that those principles should be applied *mutatis mutandis*.

#### 3.2. The evaluation in respect of Part III of the Charter

3.2.1 Preliminary remarks on the approach of the Committee of Experts in respect of Part III

40. The languages covered by Part III of the Charter are Romansh, and Italian in the Cantons of Graubünden and Ticino.

41. The Committee of Experts will not comment on provisions in relation to which no major issues were raised in its previous reports and for which it did not receive any new elements requiring a revised assessment. It reserves, however, the right to evaluate the situation again at a later stage.

- 42. For Romansh, these provisions are the following:
  - Articles 8.1.a.iv; c.iii; d.iii; e.ii; f.iii; g; i
  - Articles 9.1.a.iii; b.iii; 9.2.a
  - Articles 10.1.c; 2.a; c; g; 3.b; 4.c; 5
  - Article 11.1.e.i; f.i; 3
  - Articles 12.1.a; b; c; e; f; g; h; 2; 3
  - Articles 13.1.d; 2.b
  - Article 14.a; b
- 43. For Italian in the Canton of Graubünden, these provisions are the following:
  - Articles 8.1.a.i; b.i; c.i; d.i; e.ii; f.i; g; h; i
  - Articles 9.1.a.i, ii, iii; b.i, ii, iii; c.i; c.ii; d; 2.a; 3
  - Articles 10.1.b; c; 2.a; d; f; g; 3.a; 4.a; b; c; 5
  - Articles 11.1.a.i; e.i; g; 2; 3
  - Articles 12.1.a; b; c; d; e; f; g; h; 2; 3;
  - Article 13.1.d;
  - Articles 14.a; b
- 44. For Italian in the Canton of Ticino, these provisions are the following:
  - Articles 8.1a.i; b.i; c.i; d.i; e.ii; f.i; g; h; i
  - Articles 9.1.a.i; a.ii; a.iii; b.i; b.ii; b.iii; c.i; c.ii; d; 2.a; 3
  - Articles 10.1.a.i; b; c; 2.a; b; c; d; e; f; g; 3.a; 4.a; b; c; 5
  - Articles 11.1.a.i; e.i; g; 2; 3
  - Articles 12.1.a; b; c; d; e; f; g; h; 2; 3
  - Articles 13.1.d; 2.b
  - Articles 14.a; b

3.2.2. Romansh

#### **Article 8 - Education**

#### Preliminary remarks on the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools

45. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities to intensify their dialogue with the Romansh-speakers with a view to achieving the greatest possible support for the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun as the standard written form to be taught in schools as well as building confidence in the continued protection and promotion of the regional varieties of Romansh." Furthermore, the Committee of Ministers recommended Switzerland to "ensure that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools is done in a way which has a positive impact on the protection and promotion of Romansh as a living language".

46. According to the fourth periodical report, the Swiss authorities have taken several measures to ensure that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools is carried out in close consultation with the Romansh-speakers. Special assistance is provided to the so-called "pioneer" municipalities, which have already introduced Rumantsch Grischun. Furthermore, the authorities commissioned a study to evaluate the acceptance of Rumantsch Grischun as a medium of instruction, the quality of the teaching materials and the appropriate consideration of the varieties of Romansh as the oral form of the language in education. The evaluation was carried out on the basis of surveys among parents, teachers, pupils and school authorities. The cantonal authorities also envisage a mediation procedure for those municipalities which have not yet introduced Rumantsch Grischun (Surselva, Engadin, Val Schons, Cadi and Lumnezia). The evaluation and the mediation procedure are supported by the organisation of the Romansh-speakers, the Lia Rumantscha.

47. The Committee of Experts encourages the competent Swiss authorities to continue their dialogue with the Romansh-speakers with a view to achieving the greatest possible support for the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun as the standard written form to be taught in schools as well as building confidence in the continued protection and promotion of the regional varieties of Romansh. It stresses that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun should be done in a way which has a positive impact on the protection and promotion of Romansh as a living language.

#### Paragraph 1

With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:

...

b. i. to make available primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages;

48. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled. Nevertheless, it "encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to provide, in the next periodical report, information concerning the impact of *Frühenglisch* [early teaching of English in primary school] on the teaching of Romansh."

49. According to the information obtained during the on-the-spot visit, *Frühenglisch* has not yet been introduced in primary school. The possible implications that this education model will have for the teaching of Romansh are unclear at this stage. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the Romansh-speakers stated that an integrated approach should be considered for the teaching of English, building on Romansh. The Committee of Experts requests the competent Swiss authorities to submit further information about this in the next periodical report.

### h to provide the basic and further training of the teachers required to implement those of paragraphs a to g accepted by the Party;

50. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled.

51. During the on-the-spot visit, however, the Committee of Experts was informed that the reorganisation of teacher training for primary education (shift from secondary to tertiary level) has led to a significant decline in the number of students preparing a teaching degree in Romansh. Projections show that there will be a shortage of Romansh-teachers in the future. Also for teachers in secondary education, a shortage may arise in the future if the relevant chairs at the universities of Fribourg/Freiburg and Zürich are discontinued.

52. While considering the undertaking still fulfilled at present, the Committee of Experts encourages the cantonal authorities to look into the issue as a matter of priority and to explore possible solutions for the future.

#### Article 9 - Judicial authorities

#### Paragraph 1

The Parties undertake, in respect of those judicial districts in which the number of residents using the regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below, according to the situation of each of these languages and on condition that the use of the facilities afforded by the present paragraph is not considered by the judge to hamper the proper administration of justice:

#### In criminal proceedings:

а. ...

ii. to guarantee the accused the right to use his/her regional or minority language;

#### In civil proceedings:

b. ...

ii. to allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use his or her regional or minority language without thereby incurring additional expense; - if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations;

#### In proceedings before courts concerning administrative matters:

с. ...

*ii.* to allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use his or her regional or minority language without thereby incurring additional expense;

53. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking only formally fulfilled. It "<u>urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities to take the necessary measures to ensure that the formal possibility to</u> <u>use Romansh in court proceedings is implemented in practice</u>."

54. According to the fourth periodical report, the cantonal authorities have translated a considerable number of legal texts into Romansh over the last years. This has led to an administrative-legal terminology of good quality. However, Romansh-speakers are usually not specifically encouraged to use their language before judicial authorities and the Committee of Experts has received no information on any use of Romansh by accused or litigants in court proceedings.

55. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that the speakers, and also lawyers, usually prefer to speak German. It was also pointed out that lawyers are exclusively trained in German and are not prepared for using Romansh in the legal domain. Representatives of the speakers stressed the need for additional training courses for Romansh-speaking lawyers.

56. The Committee of Experts considers these undertakings only formally fulfilled. It recalls<sup>3</sup> that their fulfilment requires a certain degree of practical implementation, beyond the mere existence of the relevant provisions in the domestic legislation. The Committee of Experts therefore encourages the competent Swiss authorities to clarify, in co-operation with the speakers of Romansh, how the formal possibility of using Romansh in proceedings before judicial authorities can be efficiently implemented in practice.

#### Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to make available in the regional or minority languages the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of these languages, unless they are otherwise provided.

57. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled at cantonal level, but only partly fulfilled at federal level. It "<u>urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities at federal level to provide for the translation of legal texts necessary to further facilitate the use of Romansh before courts.</u>"

58. According to the fourth periodical report, the statute book of Graubünden (Bündner Rechtsbuch) has been translated entirely into Rumantsch Grischun. The Lia Rumantscha is currently clarifying with the cantonal and federal authorities which important national statutory texts still need to be translated into Rumantsch Grischun. Also, the new federal codes of civil and criminal procedure, which will enter into force in 2011, require immediate translation.

59. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled at cantonal level. At federal level, the undertaking remains partly fulfilled at present.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Cf. 3<sup>rd</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts *on Hungary*, paragraph 107; 2<sup>nd</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts *on Germany*, paragraph 120

#### Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services

#### **State Administration**

#### Paragraph 1

Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:

#### a. i. to ensure that the administrative authorities use the regional or minority languages;

60. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking partly fulfilled. It encouraged the competent Swiss authorities to take the necessary structural measures to encourage the use of Romansh in the relations of the speakers with the cantonal authorities.

61. According to the fourth periodical report, the new cantonal language law contains in its Article 3 an explicit obligation of the cantonal authorities to use Romansh when being addressed in Romansh. Romansh must also be used when communicating with municipalities where Romansh is the official language. The cantonal authorities made available specific information and templates (model texts, forms) on the intranet in 2009 in order to facilitate the implementation of the new legislative provisions. Romansh is also present on the cantonal website.

62. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled.

### b. to make available widely used administrative texts and forms for the population in the regional or minority languages or in bilingual versions;

63. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking partly fulfilled regarding the cantonal authorities and not fulfilled concerning the federal authorities. It "urge[d] the Swiss authorities concerned to make available widely used administrative texts and forms for the population in Romansh or in bilingual versions and to report about the measures taken in the next periodical report."

64. According to the fourth periodical report, the cantonal authorities made available specific information and templates (model texts, forms) on the intranet in 2009. Romansh is also present on the cantonal website. The cantonal authorities do not intend to translate all forms into Romansh, but rather decide case by case and in the light of actual needs. As for the federal authorities, the Committee of Experts has not been made aware of the existence of any administrative texts or forms in Romansh.

65. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled regarding the cantonal authorities and not fulfilled concerning the federal authorities.

#### Local and regional authorities

66. In the third monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended Switzerland to "take the necessary measures to strengthen the use of Romansh in dealings with Romansh-speakers by the cantonal administration and by municipalities in which there is a German-speaking majority and a Romansh-speaking minority".

#### Paragraph 2

...

In respect of the local and regional authorities on whose territory the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages is such as to justify the measures specified below, the Parties undertake to allow and/or encourage:

b. the possibility for users of regional or minority languages to submit oral or written applications in these languages;

67. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled concerning the local authorities and partly fulfilled regarding the cantonal authorities. It "encourage[d] the competent Swiss authorities to take positive measures so that Romansh-speakers may in practice submit applications in Romansh when dealing with the cantonal authorities."

68. According to the information obtained during the on-the-spot visit, Romansh-speakers submit oral and written applications in Romansh. According to Article 17 of the new cantonal language law, municipalities with Romansh as an official language are obliged to make adequate use of Romansh in administrative proceedings. However, there are not always sufficient linguistic skills in Romansh among the staff in relevant municipalities, especially regarding administrative terminology. During the on-the-spot visit, the cantonal authorities agreed that there is a need for specific language training for the administrative staff in municipalities with Romansh as an official language as well as in bilingual municipalities.

69. The Committee of Experts nevertheless considers this undertaking fulfilled.

#### d. the publication by local authorities of their official documents also in the relevant regional or minority languages;

70. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking partly fulfilled.

71. The fourth periodical report states that, pursuant to the cantonal language law, the cantonal authorities monitor whether local authorities publish their official documents also in Romansh. Where this is not the case, the municipalities will be asked to remedy this within a certain time.

72. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled.

### e. the use by regional authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;

73. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking not fulfilled. It "urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities to take the necessary measures to encourage the use of Romansh in debates in the cantonal parliament."

74. Members of the cantonal parliament now have, according to the new cantonal language law, the right to use one of the official languages of the canton and to request translations of motions into that language (see Article 4). Romansh-speakers made it clear that at present there is no demand for simultaneous interpretation because no wishes were expressed so far to use Romansh in parliamentary debates.

75. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking formally fulfilled.

### f. the use by local authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;

76. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking partly fulfilled. It "urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities to promote the actual use of Romansh by local authorities in the Romansh-speaking area in debates in their assemblies."

77. According to the fourth periodical report, the cantonal authorities monitor the use of Romansh in local assemblies. If deficits exist, the local authorities are urged to use Romansh in local assemblies in conformity with the language law. In practice, however, this concerns only local councils of municipalities with a large Romansh-speaking majority. As far as other municipalities are concerned, no measures have been taken to actively encourage the use of Romansh in debates of local councils.

78. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking partly fulfilled.

#### Paragraph 4

With a view to putting into effect those provisions of paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 accepted by them, the Parties undertake to take one or more of the following measures:

#### a. translation or interpretation as may be required;

79. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking partly fulfilled because it had found that the translation capacity at the cantonal level was clearly insufficient. It "urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities to strengthen the cantonal translation service and to provide for linguistic training of local officials, where necessary."

80. According to the fourth periodical report, it is still too early to determine whether the implementation of the language law will create the need for additional posts in the cantonal translation service for Romansh. As regards the staff of local authorities, the *Lia Rumantscha* provides, with financial support from the federal and cantonal authorities, linguistic advice and translations.

81. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking partly fulfilled.

#### Article 11 - Media

#### Paragraph 1

...

The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:

a to the extent that radio and television carry out a public service mission:

iii to make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer programmes in the regional or minority languages;

b. i. to encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one radio station in the regional or minority languages;

82. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered undertaking a.iii fulfilled and undertaking b.i not fulfilled.

83. The private broadcasters *Radio Engiadina* and *Radio Grischa* are required to have regard to the interests of the Romansh-speakers within appropriate limits and to co-operate with the Lia Rumantscha, which exerts a monitoring function regarding the broadcasting time in Romansh. There is a certain offer of radio programmes in Romansh by the two private broadcasters in Graubünden. In addition, the newly-created public service station *Radio Rumantsch* provides a 24-hour daily broadcasting service in Romansh, which is also available on the internet. In view of the Committee of Experts, there is a substantial offer of radio broadcasting in Romansh.

с. ...

### ii. to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of television programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;

84. In the third evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking not fulfilled. It "urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of programmes in Romansh by private television companies."

85. According to the fourth periodical report, no new measures regarding the implementation of this provision have been taken during the last years.

86. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking not fulfilled.

#### 3.2.3. Italian

#### A. Canton of Graubünden

#### Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services

#### Paragraph 1

Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:"

#### a. i. to ensure that the administrative authorities use the regional or minority languages;

87. In the 3<sup>rd</sup> monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled concerning the federal authorities. The undertaking was considered partly fulfilled with respect to the cantonal authorities because Italian was not always used when communicating with municipalities, regional associations and schools in the Italian-speaking area. The Committee of Experts encouraged the "cantonal authorities to systematically use Italian when communicating orally or in writing with Italian-speaking local authorities and citizens".

88. The new cantonal language law contains in its Article 3 an explicit obligation of the cantonal authorities to use Italian when being addressed in Italian. Italian must also be used when communicating with municipalities where Italian is the official language. According to the fourth periodical report, the website of the canton is now available in the three official languages (www.gr.ch). Furthermore, the cultural service (section Promotion of Languages) of the canton intends to open an intranet with advice and tools in relation to the application of trilingualism. Representatives of the Italian-speakers informed the Committee of Experts during the on-the-spot visit that until now only two-thirds of the cantonal forms are translated into Italian.

89. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled.

#### Paragraph 2

In respect of the local and regional authorities on whose territory the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages is such as to justify the measures specified below, the Parties undertake to allow and/or encourage:

•••

e. the use by regional authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;

90. In the 3<sup>rd</sup> evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking not fulfilled and "<u>urge[d] the competent Swiss authorities to take the necessary measures to encourage the use of Italian in debates in the cantonal parliament.</u>"

91. Members of the cantonal parliament now have, according to the new cantonal language law, the right to use one of the official languages of the canton and to request translations of motions into that language (see Article 4). There is no demand for simultaneous interpretation because no wishes were expressed so far to use Italian in parliamentary debates.

92. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking formally fulfilled.

#### Article 13 – Economic and social life

#### Paragraph 2

With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake, in so far as the public authorities are competent, within the territory in which the regional or minority languages are used, and as far as this is reasonably possible:

•••

b in the economic and social sectors directly under their control (public sector), to organise activities to promote the use of regional or minority languages;

93. In the previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that the website of the cantonal hospital in Chur (www.ksgr.ch) is not available in Italian and that in one case the emergency service could not provide assistance in Italian. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking fulfilled, but encourages the cantonal authorities to look into these matters.

#### B. Canton of Ticino

94. In the third monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts considered that the Canton of Ticino fulfilled all undertakings regarding the Italian language. According to the information received during the fourth monitoring cycle, the situation has not changed.

#### Chapter 4 Findings of the Committee of Experts in the fourth monitoring cycle

A. The Committee of Experts expresses its gratitude to the Swiss authorities for their exemplary and smooth co-operation in the fourth monitoring cycle, in particular with respect to the organisation of the on-the-spot visit. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts wishes to thank the Swiss authorities for having responded in the periodical report to all requests for information by the Committee of Experts. Switzerland has taken some significant steps to improve the situation of the regional or minority languages spoken on its territory. Particular mention needs to be made of the adoption of the federal language law and of the entry into force of Graubünden's cantonal language law which significantly improves the legislative protection of Romansh and Italian in Graubünden. The Committee of Experts welcomes the fact that in respect of all languages, by far the majority of undertakings chosen by Switzerland are now fulfilled.

B. The Swiss federal authorities and the associations representing the speakers of Yenish remain committed to protecting and promoting it. The Swiss authorities have carried out regular consultations with the Yenish-speakers which led to a project on Yenish that was proposed by the Yenish umbrella association. This project aims at registering the vocabulary of Yenish and promoting its dissemination and use within the Yenish community.

C. The provision of education in Romansh remains good. Rumantsch Grischun is gradually being introduced in schools and the necessary new teaching materials are being produced. The canton's strategy, which is supported by Lia Rumantscha, has so far been endorsed at regional and local level by a significant number of municipalities. However, a considerable number of Romansh municipalities still show strong reservations towards the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun due to fears that this might be to the detriment of the local varieties. The cantonal authorities envisage a mediation procedure for those municipalities which have not yet introduced Rumantsch Grischun. The reorganisation of teacher training for primary education has led to a significant decline in the number of students preparing a teaching degree in Romansh. Projections show that there will be a shortage of Romansh-teachers in the future. Also for teachers in secondary education, a shortage may arise in the future if the relevant university chairs are discontinued.

D. The lack of a tradition to use Romansh in legal proceedings is the main reason why it is not used in practice before courts. There do not seem to be any initiatives to change this tradition. The translation of the cantonal statute book into Rumantsch Grischun provides a basis for developing Romansh as a working language before courts, but additional measures are needed to encourage the use of Romansh before courts.

E. According to the new cantonal language law, the cantonal authorities are obliged to use Romansh in communications with Romansh-speaking citizens and municipalities with Romansh as an official language. The situation is fairly good at local level, where Romansh is regularly used in dealings of citizens with the administration and is also used as an internal working language of some local authorities. However, additional language training is needed for the administrative staff of municipalities with Romansh as an official language. The merger of municipalities presents particular challenges in maintaining the use of Romansh in local administrations.

F. The amount of Romansh language radio broadcasting is exemplary mainly due to the offers of the public broadcasters. There is a reasonable offer of television programmes, taking into consideration the overall size of the Romansh-speaking community.

G. Awareness of the presence of the Italian language in Graubünden is low throughout Switzerland. In the past, the cantonal authorities did not always use Italian when communicating with Italian-speaking local authorities, but the new cantonal language law should improve the situation. The overall situation of the Italian language in Graubünden remains good, however. At local and regional level, Italian is well-established in education, administration and the judiciary.

H. In respect of the Italian language, the Canton of Ticino fulfils all the undertakings chosen from the Charter in the fields of education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life and transfrontier exchanges.

The Swiss government was invited to comment on the content of this report in accordance with Article 16.3 of the Charter. The comments received are attached in Appendix II.

On the basis of this report and its findings the Committee of Experts submitted its proposals to the Committee of Ministers for recommendations to be addressed to Switzerland. At the same time it emphasised the need for the Swiss authorities to take into account, in addition to these general recommendations, the more detailed observations contained in the body of the report.

At its 1101st meeting on 8 December 2010, the Committee of Ministers adopted its Recommendation addressed to Switzerland, which is set out in Part B of this document.

#### Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification

#### SWITZERLAND

#### Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 23 December 1997 - Or. Fr.

The Swiss Federal Council declares, in accordance with Article 3, paragraph 1, of the Charter, that in Switzerland Romansh and Italian are the less widely used official languages to which the following paragraphs chosen in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, of the Charter, shall apply:

#### a. Romansh

Article 8: (education) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iv), b (i), c (iii), d (iii), e (ii), f (iii), g, h, i Article 9 (judicial authorities) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (ii), a (iii), b (ii), b (iii), c (ii) Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a Paragraph 3 Article 10 (administrative authorities and public services) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b, c Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g Paragraph 3, sub-paragraph b Paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs a, c Paragraph 5 Article 11 (media) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), b (i), c (ii), e (i), f (i) Paragraph 3 Article 12 (cultural activities and facilities) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, e, f, g, h Paragraph 2 Paragraph 3 Article 13 (economic and social life) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraph d Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph b Article 14 (transfrontier exchanges) Sub-paragraph a Sub-paragraph b b. Italian Article 8 (education) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), a (iv), b (i), c (ii), c (ii), d (i), d (iii), e (ii), f (i), f (iii), g, h, i Article 9 (iudicial authorities) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), a (ii), a (iii), b (i), b (ii), b (iii), c (i), c (ii), d Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a Paragraph 3 Article 10 (administrative authorities and public services) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b, c Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g Paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b Paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs a, b, c Paragraph 5

<u>Article 11</u> (media) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), e (i), g Paragraph 2 Paragraph 3

<u>Article 12</u> (cultural activities and facilities) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g, h Paragraph 2 Paragraph 3

<u>Article 13</u> (economic and social life) Paragraph 1, sub-paragraph d Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph b

<u>Article 14</u> (transfrontier exchanges) Sub-paragraph a Sub-paragraph b.

Period covered: 01/04/98 -The preceding statement concerns Article(s): 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 2, 3, 8, 9

#### Appendix II: Comments by the Swiss authorities

We enclose below our comments on the committee of experts' report concerning the 4th periodical report on the application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages by Switzerland.

After reading the report carefully, we have chosen not to adopt a formal position but would like to make a few comments.

We agree with the various points mentioned. These points will be taken into account for the current 3-year period. Targeted efforts to follow the committee of experts' recommendations will be undertaken and these will be detailed and documented in the next periodical report by Switzerland.

The Ticino authorities wish to provide a few clarifications regarding the particular situation in Bosco-Gurin. Socio-economic conditions in the village of Bosco-Gurin and the substantial decline of the Walser population have provided the backdrop for the slow, inexorable disappearance of the Gurin German language and culture. Some efforts to protect and promote this language and culture have nevertheless been made. The little ethnographic museum – supported by Ticino canton – is centred on the Gurin German language and develops initiatives with other Walser associations: plans for a partial dictionary (containing Gurin German nouns), an online glossary created by dialectology students from Zurich University (http://web.ticino.com/walser) and the Zurich-based "Schweizerisches Idiotikon" dictionary (www.idiotikon.ch). Alongside these initiatives, the Interreg IIIb project is aimed at studying the transition from a pre-industrial society to a more competitive and sustainable post-industrial one. The Interreg project seeks to give the Walser a major opportunity to discover the values that underpin their identity, culture and the environment in which they live. The canton of Ticino has accordingly supported this initiative (http://www.walser-alps.eu/kontakt-it/projekt-walser-alps).

In addition to these comments, we wish to make a couple of "technical" points:

- In paragraph 55: "Representatives of the speakers stressed the need for additional training courses for Romansh-speaking lawyers". → It should be pointed out that the "representatives of the speakers" are not representatives of the cantonal authorities.
- In paragraph 83: "[...]In addition, the newly-created public service station *Radio Rumantsch* provides a 24-hour daily broadcasting service in Romansh". → It is not the radio station that is new but the 24-hour service it provides.

We would be grateful if you could take note of this information.

Federal Department of the Interior Federal Office of Culture Section culture and society

## B. Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter by Switzerland

### COUNCIL OF EUROPE

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS

#### Recommendation RecChL(2010)7 of the Committee of Ministers on the application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages by Switzerland

(Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 8 December 2010 at the 1101st meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Having regard to the instrument of ratification submitted by Switzerland on 23 December 1997;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts on the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Switzerland;

Having taken note of the comments made by the Swiss authorities on the contents of the Committee of Experts' report;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Switzerland in its fourth periodical report, supplementary information provided by the Swiss authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Switzerland and the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit,

Recommends that the authorities of Switzerland take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. ensure that the introduction of Rumantsch Grischun in schools is carried out in a way which is sensitive to the protection and promotion of Romansh as a living language;

2. organise language training in Romansh for administrative staff.